

1 Tuesday, 16 January 2018

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning. We resume evidence today,
4 turning to the evidence of a number of women who worked
5 at Smyllum Orphanage during periods about which we've
6 heard from the witnesses who have given evidence so far
7 in this phase, and I'm going to turn to Mr MacAulay to
8 call the next witness.

9 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, my Lady. The next witness has
10 been granted anonymity. She is a nun, a sister, and she
11 wants to use the name "Carol Kane" and I will refer to
12 her as "Sister Carol" during the course of her evidence.
13 This is a person against whom allegations have been made
14 in the course of this inquiry and therefore it would be
15 appropriate for her to be warned in connection with her
16 right against self-incrimination.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18 "SISTER CAROL KANE" (sworn)

19 LADY SMITH: Sister Carol, please do sit down and make
20 yourself comfortable.

21 Sister Carol, before I turn to Mr MacAulay to invite
22 him to ask questions of you, there are a couple of
23 things I want to say apart from good morning and welcome
24 to the inquiry.

25 You'll remember that when you were interviewed by

1 members of the inquiry team, they explained to you that
2 although this is a public inquiry you still have a right
3 not to incriminate yourself. It was then explained to
4 you that if you told them that you were in any way
5 involved in the abuse of children, you could be asked
6 further questions about that that you were not obliged
7 to answer those questions but if you did, you needed to
8 appreciate that your answers would be recorded and they
9 could be used as evidence against you were there to be
10 any further criminal proceedings.

11 The same applies at this hearing. You continue to
12 have the right not to incriminate yourself. If in the
13 course of your answers you tell us you were involved in
14 some way in children being abused then you may be asked
15 further questions about that. You are not obliged to
16 answer any such questions, but if you do do that, they
17 will be part of the recording that is going on all the
18 time during the inquiry and available as evidence to be
19 used, if necessary, in the future in any proceedings in
20 any court, including a criminal court. Do you
21 understand that?

22 A. Yes.

23 LADY SMITH: I'm now going to turn to Mr MacAulay to invite
24 him to ask you questions.

25 A. Thank you.

1 Questions from MR MacAULAY

2 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, Sister Carol.

3 A. Good morning.

4 Q. I'll refer to you as "Sister Carol" throughout your
5 evidence. You have in front of you the statement that
6 you provided to the inquiry and it has been opened at
7 the final page. The reference, for the transcript, of
8 the beginning of the statement is WIT.003.001.1100, and
9 I am taking you to page 1140.

10 Can I ask you, sister, to confirm that you have
11 signed the statement?

12 A. Yes, I have.

13 Q. And do you say at paragraph 142:

14 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
15 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry."

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And I think that was a statement you made after you had
18 been given the warning that Lady Smith has just made
19 mention of.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Do you go on to say, sister, if you look at the
22 statement in the final sentence:

23 "I believe the facts stated in this witness
24 statement are true."

25 A. Sorry?

- 1 Q. Do you go on to say in the final sentence of your
2 statement:
- 3 "I believe the facts stated in this witness
4 statement are true."
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. I will ask you questions, sister, and if there is
7 a question I ask you about and you can't remember, just
8 say you do not remember.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And likewise if there's something that does come to mind
11 that you hadn't remembered when you gave your statement
12 then feel free to tell us if there is something of
13 importance.
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. I don't require to know your date of birth, sister,
16 but --
- 17 A. I don't mind.
- 18 Q. That's your secret, but I need to at least have the year
19 of your birth, and I think you were born in 1925.
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And without divulging too many secrets, I think you are
22 now 92 years of age; is that correct?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. You tell us in your statement that you joined the
25 Daughters of Charity of St Vincent de Paul in 1944;

- 1 is that correct?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. You have provided the inquiry with a ministry history,
4 and can I just take you to that. That's at
5 WIT.003.001.0594. That will come on the screen for you.
- 6 Do you have on the screen what I've referred to as
7 a ministry history?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Does this set out your history as a sister with the
10 Daughters of Charity?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Can we just pick up one or two points. For example, in
13 1949 to 1957 do you tell us that you were with the
14 St Vincent's Residential School in Mill Hill?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And that involved the care of children?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Just looking at that, what sort of age range of children
19 were you dealing with there?
- 20 A. They were from about 9 to 11.
- 21 Q. Boys or girls?
- 22 A. Boys.
- 23 Q. Indeed, that was your background to going to Smyllum in
24 1957; is that right?
- 25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And do you tell us that you were at Smyllum from 1957 to
2 1965?

3 A. Yes. 1964, sorry.

4 Q. I think it is 1965 we see on the document, but be that
5 as it may --

6 A. Yes, it's 1964.

7 Q. A period of about seven years then altogether?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Then you provide us with your history and what work
10 you've done after that, involving, I think, the care of
11 children in another establishment; is that right?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And finally, do you tell us that in 2004 you retired to
14 what's referred to as "general house duties"?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And you finally retired in about 2006?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. So before you went to Smyllum then, sister, can we see
19 that you did have some experience working with children?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Particularly at Mill Hill in London?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. When you first went to Smyllum, what was your role?

24 A. When I first went there, I was with the boys
25 straightaway and there were about 90 boys there at the

1 time between the ages of about 7 and 16.

2 Q. Looking to numbers, although one can't be particularly
3 precise, can I put a document to you that gives us an
4 idea as to what the numbers might have been, at least
5 in the early 1960s, and I'll put this on the screen for
6 you, sister. That is SGV.001.001.0422.

7 We're looking at a document, and you may not be
8 familiar with this document, sister, but it's described
9 to be "Particulars to be sent to the Scottish Education
10 Department by voluntary homes"; do you see that --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- at the top. We then have, effectively, a pro forma
13 document that has been filled in on behalf of Smyllum.
14 I can tell you that. Can you see in paragraph 2 that
15 the person in charge of the home at this time was
16 Sister BAF

17 A. That's right, yes.

18 Q. Perhaps we can turn over to the next page just to get
19 a date. This is 0423.

20 A. Pardon?

21 Q. It'll come up, sister. Again, it's just the lag of
22 the ... I just want to turn to this page to move
23 towards the bottom to see where Sister BAF has signed
24 and also that it is dated December 1962. Do you see
25 that? It's not very clear.

- 1 A. No, I don't see it, no.
- 2 LADY SMITH: It's right at the bottom. It looks like
3 "3 December 1962", but it's quite faint.
- 4 A. Yes, I see it.
- 5 MR MacAULAY: So what we seem to have here is a document
6 sending particulars in to the Scottish Education
7 Department about Smyllum. I understand that this
8 wouldn't be something you yourself would do, but this
9 seems to record what the position was as at
10 December 1962.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And if I can go back to the previous page, page 0422,
13 if we turn to section 7, can we see that so far as
14 numbers go -- and we can perhaps just expand that a bit
15 on that to make it clearer, if we can -- can we see that
16 under the heading "Boys", where there's totals given,
17 according to this there was 127 boys at Smyllum in 1962.
18 Do you see that? That's what is being suggested.
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And indeed there were 92 girls at that time; that's the
21 next column.
- 22 A. Mm.
- 23 Q. Therefore a total of about 219 children altogether. But
24 so far as boys concerned, can we see that there were at
25 that time certainly well over 100 boys? This is in

- 1 1962.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Coming back to your position, sister, when you went
4 there, albeit some years before that, were you in charge
5 of all the boys?
- 6 A. No, just the ones from about 8 or 9 up to nearly 16.
- 7 Q. So the younger ones then would not be part of your
8 responsibility?
- 9 A. No, no.
- 10 Q. And you reckon then, sister, that so far as you were
11 concerned there was about 90 or thereabouts altogether?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Can you give me some idea as to how the boys were being
14 accommodated at that time in 1957 when you went there?
15 Where were they located within the home?
- 16 A. Well, there was one big group that I went to, as I say,
17 with between 80 and 90 boys, between -- I can't remember
18 exactly the ages, but they were up to 16. But that was
19 one -- that was the one big group. That's the only
20 group I had anything to do with. There were other --
21 another group of boys about -- younger, little fellas,
22 but there were about 30 or something of those, but
23 I don't know much about those at all.
- 24 Q. Where were -- the boys that you had responsibility for,
25 where were they accommodated within Smyllum?

1 A. You mean where they slept?

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. Well, they had -- at that time, even before we divided
4 up, they were in dormitories over the school. About 30
5 and 30 and then -- that's the way they were. Another
6 group had 30.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. That's the way I can remember it. We got them divided
9 up into three groups.

10 Q. Again, we can look at a photograph. If I could take you
11 to a photograph then, sister. It's at DSV.001.001.4661.

12 A. Oh yes.

13 Q. This is a photograph, I think, that perhaps yourself and
14 some of your colleagues have had some --

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. -- input into --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- in order to try and identify different locations.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. We can see, if we look towards the top, there's
21 a reference to "St Anthony's" and "St Vincent's".

22 A. That's right.

23 Q. Are these the areas you're pointing out?

24 A. Yes. There were about 30 boys in both, you know, both
25 those places.

- 1 Q. Was there a third, a third --
- 2 A. There was, yes. It's very difficult to see it in that
- 3 photograph, but it's called the Sacred Heart.
- 4 Q. If we go to the top left, can we see that "Sacred Heart"
- 5 is in a little box?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And there's a yellow pointer pointing to an area. Was
- 8 that the area for the Sacred Heart?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. So these are the three areas you're looking --
- 11 A. That's right, they were the three groups.
- 12 Q. When you started, sister, what assistance, if any, did
- 13 you have in caring for the boys?
- 14 A. I just had one staff, one lady.
- 15 Q. Was her name Miss IAQ
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. So far as the boys were concerned, if there were
- 18 siblings, boy siblings, would they be in the groups?
- 19 A. No, they were divided -- according to their ages, they
- 20 were divided up into groups, but they all played
- 21 together and they went to school together. So they
- 22 did -- they were in contact all the time.
- 23 Q. So far as the reporting structure within Smyllum at that
- 24 time was concerned, can you help me with that? Did
- 25 you have somebody that you would report to?

1 A. Yes, the superior of the house.

2 Q. And when you went there first of all can you remember
3 who that was?

4 A. No, I can't. I can see her, but I can't put a name on
5 her.

6 Q. I think we did see in 1962 that a Sister **BAF** was the
7 Mother Superior.

8 A. That's right, yes.

9 Q. So at that time she would be somebody that you would
10 report to?

11 A. Yes, oh yes. We had to report everything to her.

12 Q. Was there any other Mother Superior whose name you can
13 remember during your seven-year stint?

14 A. No. I can't remember the first one at all.

15 Q. Can I just ask you about training? Did you have any
16 training in childcare --

17 A. No.

18 Q. -- prior to going to Smyllum?

19 A. No, none at all.

20 Q. But you have already told us about your experience,
21 of course, but no specific training?

22 A. No.

23 Q. And during your time at Smyllum, because I think we know
24 that some sisters went on courses, did you yourself --

25 A. I did. When I left Smyllum, I went.

- 1 Q. I see.
- 2 A. I did yes.
- 3 Q. So you did a course in childcare?
- 4 A. I did a childcare course in London.
- 5 Q. Was that a one-year course?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Did you find that beneficial?
- 8 A. I did, yes.
- 9 Q. In what way?
- 10 A. Well, it helped me to understand them better, you know,
- 11 and how to handle them better.
- 12 Q. Okay. Can you perhaps elaborate upon that?
- 13 A. Sorry?
- 14 Q. How did the course help you in that aspect of childcare?
- 15 A. Well, it just helped me to understand them better, how
- 16 to approach them and how to treat them.
- 17 Q. Do you think that would have been helpful to you had you
- 18 had that sort of training before Smyllum?
- 19 A. Definitely, yes, it would.
- 20 Q. Looking to the division of labour then between yourself
- 21 and Miss IAQ how was that organised?
- 22 A. We kept replacing each other all the time. She'd be off
- 23 at times and I'd replace her and she'd do the same for
- 24 me. We just worked it like that between us.
- 25 Q. It's apparent at this point in time you had a number of

- 1 dormitories to cater for.
- 2 A. Yes. That's right. This is before we divided up?
- 3 Q. Indeed, yes.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. I'll come to look at that very shortly. So do I take it
- 6 then between yourself and Miss IAQ you'd cover
- 7 the three dormitory areas you were responsible for?
- 8 A. That's right, yes, we would.
- 9 Q. At the time that we're talking about, before the
- 10 division we're going to look at comes into play, were
- 11 the dormitories then divided up according to age?
- 12 A. No, they weren't; they were mixed before that. It's
- 13 only when we divided them into three and had -- two
- 14 other sisters came to help me.
- 15 Q. So, for example, if I take St Anthony's before any
- 16 division took place, would you have a range of ages in
- 17 St Anthony's?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And likewise for St Joseph's and Sacred Heart?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Can I then just look at the point in time when
- 22 a division does take place, and can you help me with
- 23 that? What happened?
- 24 A. Sorry, I don't understand you.
- 25 Q. I think we've already touched upon the fact that there

1 came a point in time when you divided up the
2 responsibility.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. First of all, perhaps I can ask you, can you remember
5 when that was?

6 A. I'd say it was about two years or less, about a year and
7 a half, I would say, after I came.

8 Q. Can you tell me what happened then?

9 A. We just divided up the groups -- at that time we went
10 into age groups we just ...

11 LADY SMITH: Can I just recap because I think Mr MacAulay
12 was asking you about the age mixtures in the
13 dormitories. So when you went in 1957, is it your
14 memory that each dormitory had a mix of age groups in
15 it?

16 A. Yes, yes.

17 LADY SMITH: And are you telling me that maybe about
18 18 months or so after that, they were reorganised?

19 A. Yes.

20 LADY SMITH: And then the dormitories would be one for the
21 youngest group?

22 A. Yes.

23 LADY SMITH: One for the next group?

24 A. And one for the older boys.

25 LADY SMITH: Organised into ages?

1 A. Yes.

2 LADY SMITH: Right. And it doesn't matter exactly when, but
3 you think that must have been about 1958 or so?

4 A. Something like that.

5 LADY SMITH: 1958/1959?

6 A. Yes, or later, yes. I'm not sure about the dates.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

8 MR MacAULAY: Can I then ask you how was the responsibility
9 for each of these dormitories then broken up? For
10 example, let's take Sacred Heart: what age group are we
11 talking about?

12 A. I'd say from about 8 to around 10.

13 Q. Was there a particular sister who was in charge of
14 Sacred Heart --

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. -- during the time that you were there?

17 A. Sorry, do you want to know her name?

18 Q. Yes, please.

19 A. Sister [REDACTED] EAC

20 Q. I think we are to hear from Sister [REDACTED] EAC and
21 if she didn't start until about 1961 --

22 A. That's right, yes.

23 Q. -- that might fit in with that. So what about the other
24 two dormitories?

25 A. St Anthony's group, Sister [REDACTED] AGI was in

1 charge of that group.

2 Q. And the other groups?

3 A. I had St Vincent's.

4 Q. Was your group the older boys?

5 A. Yes. From 12 to 16. Big chaps.

6 Q. Can I just ask you a little bit about the routine over

7 the period that you were there. So far as getting up

8 in the morning would be concerned -- and let's try and

9 look at the position before and after the division -- so

10 before the division when you and Miss [redacted] IAQ were

11 essentially in charge, what were the arrangements for

12 children getting up in the morning?

13 A. Well, we just called them about half past seven, and

14 then they went to their breakfast. Usually, in my

15 group -- this is before they went into a groups, is it?

16 Q. Yes.

17 A. There were some staff, I think, in charge of each -- who

18 slept over where the boys were. There were staff

19 sleeping over there as well to be with them during the

20 night. That's the way they were.

21 Q. Then after the division, what were the arrangements?

22 A. Yes, well, each -- St Anthony's had a sister and

23 a layperson in charge. Sister [redacted] EAC was in charge of

24 her group with another lady helping her out; I don't

25 remember their names or anything. I had

1 Miss [REDACTED] IAQ who was there when I came.

2 Q. The inquiry has heard evidence, sister, about certain
3 practices that have been mentioned in connection with
4 the mornings and bed-wetting. Can I ask you about
5 that: did you experience incidences where children had
6 wet the bed?

7 A. Yes. Yes.

8 Q. And what would happen?

9 A. They just got a bath or a wash and we sent their clothes
10 to the laundry. There was no punishment or anything for
11 them.

12 Q. So there has been evidence that has been presented to
13 the inquiry which has involved children being
14 humiliated, being punished, perhaps sheets being draped
15 over their heads and cold baths, and indeed possibly
16 having to wash their sheets --

17 A. No, that didn't happen.

18 Q. At all?

19 A. No -- and I didn't see it in any group either. It's
20 only afterwards I heard that some places did that, you
21 know, I don't know -- in different parts of the
22 country. But we definitely -- I never saw anybody doing
23 that to a child.

24 Q. So throughout your seven years associated with these
25 three areas, you never saw --

- 1 A. Never, no, no. We never had that.
- 2 Q. You mentioned also, sister, that the routine would
3 involve then the children going to breakfast; is that
4 right?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Can you help me with regard to the food generally?
7 What was the food like?
- 8 A. Well, the food was -- as I think I said in my statement,
9 the food was adequate, but it left much to be desired
10 regarding variety. But they all had enough to eat.
11 They were never hungry.
- 12 Q. Can I ask you this, sister: was there any pressure put
13 on children to eat their food?
- 14 A. There wasn't, no. We had no -- at least speaking for my
15 own experience, the boys were always so active with
16 football and all the games they were doing that they
17 were always hungry and we had no problem at all about
18 getting them to eat.
- 19 Q. So again, just looking at some of the evidence that has
20 been presented to the inquiry that some of the food was
21 not attractive, lumpy porridge has been, I think,
22 a constant theme in the inquiry.
- 23 A. Yes, I know, but I never experienced that. I don't
24 remember about the porridge, but they had plenty of
25 bread and butter and jam and that kind of thing. In the

- 1 morning time they did have porridge, but I don't
2 remember about the lumpy porridge.
- 3 Q. What about the evidence that's been presented that
4 children were forced to eat food even although they
5 didn't want to?
- 6 A. No, that never happened. That's disgusting. I never
7 heard about it at all.
- 8 Q. But have you heard about that since?
- 9 A. I've only heard about it since we started these
10 questions and that, you know.
- 11 Q. It perhaps goes further because there has been evidence
12 that if a child who was being force-fed perhaps was
13 sick, that still that child would be made to eat the
14 food.
- 15 A. No, no.
- 16 Q. You say that just never --
- 17 A. No, that never happened.
- 18 Q. And you would be quite regularly, would you, in the
19 dining room?
- 20 A. Oh, I would, yes, always -- as much as I could, you
21 know, I was there. Oh yes, there was no problem, and
22 they did enjoy their food, and as I say, they had
23 plenty, they had -- you know, they were fine boys, good
24 physique, and they were able to -- they wouldn't stand
25 for it anyway; they would complain.

1 Q. And the suggestion has also been made that if food was
2 not eaten at a particular mealtime it would be there
3 at the next mealtime.

4 A. It didn't happen with us. It didn't happen with the
5 boys.

6 Q. At all?

7 A. No, at all.

8 LADY SMITH: Can I just be clear: are you saying that every
9 child cleaned the plate at every meal?

10 A. No, they didn't -- I don't think they did. I can't
11 remember about that, but I wouldn't think they did. So
12 they just, you know -- sometimes they put the food into
13 the flowerpots on the table if they didn't want it.
14 They just would do things like that, just like ordinary
15 boys.

16 LADY SMITH: Would you tolerate that, if they put the food
17 in the flowerpots?

18 A. No, we wouldn't. We would make them take it out again.

19 LADY SMITH: And then what?

20 A. That was it, we'd just throw it out. No, there was no
21 problem at all like that.

22 MR MacAULAY: So there wouldn't be something said, for
23 example, you have to eat it because there are children
24 who might be starving elsewhere in the world?

25 A. No, no.

1 Q. So that never, ever happened?

2 A. It never happened, no.

3 Q. So far as the dining areas were concerned, was there

4 a dining area that was just for the boys?

5 A. The boys had their own dining room and the girls had

6 their own in a different part of the house.

7 Q. At the time that you were there?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So the boys of different ages then would be in their

10 dining room?

11 A. No -- well, Sister [REDACTED] AGI [REDACTED] group and mine were -- we

12 had two dining rooms together. They were partitioned

13 between the two. And Sister [REDACTED] EAC [REDACTED] group had their

14 own dining room with her group.

15 Q. But was that after the division had been made?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. What about bathing and washing, sister? Can you help me

18 with that? What was the procedure?

19 A. They didn't have baths at all downstairs. We had no

20 baths, but we had about ten showers, and every afternoon

21 when they came in from school or when they were playing

22 football or whatever, they'd come in and have a lovely

23 hot shower, every day. We didn't do it when they were

24 going to bed at night-time because it was inconvenient.

25 They always went up to the -- they had hand basins and

1 that in the dormitories where they did their teeth and
2 they washed there before they went to bed and the same
3 in the morning when they got up.

4 Q. So again, the inquiry has heard evidence of bathing
5 practices and children, for example, queueing up to be
6 bathed with the water being scalding hot to start with
7 and then cold and dirty towards the end. Does that ring
8 any bells?

9 A. No, no, no. There was the showers we had all the time.

10 Q. No baths at all?

11 A. We had only one bath and that was upstairs off the
12 dormitory. That bath was used if anybody wet the bed.

13 Q. So just to be clear, are you saying that there was no
14 communal type bathing or, as it has been described --

15 A. No, no.

16 Q. -- people queueing up?

17 A. No, there was never anything like that and nobody ever
18 had -- there was no such thing as anybody going into the
19 same shower. They just had their own showers. We
20 supervised the showers. We'd be there with them and we
21 knew what was going on. So this was every day they had
22 these showers. It was marvellous, really.

23 Q. I think what I'm putting to you is not so much
24 a communal shower but a communal type bath where
25 somebody would go into the bath and be followed by other

1 children.

2 A. No, no, no.

3 Q. They --

4 A. No, they didn't do that. I'm only speaking for my own
5 group now. I don't know about other groups.

6 Q. But even before the groups, even before you had the
7 division, are you still saying that there were showers
8 and not baths?

9 A. Yes, they were, yes, they were. They were all there.
10 It was a marvellous system for that, really.

11 Q. You do provide us, sister, with other evidence about the
12 routine at Smyllum. For example, you tell us that for
13 leisure, football was a big thing with the boys; is that
14 correct?

15 A. Oh yes, yes.

16 Q. You also say that they had plenty of books to read.

17 A. They had, yes.

18 Q. And the older boys were able to go to Lanark on
19 a Saturday?

20 A. Oh yes, yes. That developed later on. It was, say,
21 from about 1961 to 1964, before I left. They used to
22 just go down on their own to Lanark, to the pictures and
23 that on a Saturday if they wanted to.

24 Q. During the night when the boys were in their beds, what
25 were the arrangements? For example, would there be

1 either a sister or a helper close to hand?

2 A. Oh yes. I had a room off the boys' dormitory and

3 Miss IAQ had a room the other end of the

4 dormitory. So we knew -- you know, we were there at

5 night-time if they needed us.

6 Q. So far as boys going to the toilet at night would be

7 concerned, was there any rule against that?

8 A. No, none at all.

9 Q. So if --

10 A. They just got up and went.

11 Q. So if there's a suggestion that there was a problem in

12 getting to the toilet at night --

13 A. There wasn't any problem really, but if they were sick

14 or anything like that, they would knock at our doors,

15 either one or the other of us, and just tell us. That

16 was the routine.

17 Q. As far as trips were concerned, I think you had at least

18 annual trips; is that right?

19 A. We did, yes.

20 Q. Did you go on these trips?

21 A. Oh, I did, yes. We went to a different place every

22 year.

23 Q. Would all the boys go on the trip?

24 A. Everybody went, the boys and girls of all ages.

25 Everybody went from Smyllum. We went to different parts

1 of Scotland, like Upper Perthshire, Aberfoyle, and all
2 those places, and every year we went to a different
3 place. There were international camps.

4 Q. How was the transport arranged then?

5 A. We went in buses.

6 Q. So the buses were hired, were they, for that?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You were asked when you gave your statement, sister,
9 about children who died during your time at Smyllum.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. One child that was put to you was a child by the name of
12 [REDACTED] that's someone you remember?

13 A. I wouldn't have remembered otherwise, but I knew that
14 when he was sick and he died, he was in my group.

15 Q. He was in your group?

16 A. He was, yes.

17 Q. What can you remember about his illness?

18 A. I didn't know much about his illness at all, but he did
19 tell me that he was -- that he had a pain and I brought
20 him immediately over to the infirmarian. We had an
21 infirmary with about six beds or so in it and he went
22 straight over, and the sister in charge of the infirmary
23 had got the doctor immediately. We had two great
24 doctors in Lanark and they were very attentive to the
25 boys and the girls, the whole lot. They'd do anything

1 for them.

2 Q. Was he quite ill then by the time he got to the

3 infirmary?

4 A. He must have been, yes, he was, but he didn't complain

5 about it at all until, you know -- I suppose ... I don't

6 know how long it was before he died after we knew about

7 it. I can't remember that.

8 Q. The other child you were asked about was Francis McColl.

9 A. Oh, yes, I remember about him very well.

10 Q. Were you on the trip that --

11 A. I was on the trip for that, yes.

12 Q. What's your recollection about that?

13 A. I'll tell you what, we were packing up for going home

14 the day it happened -- and a priest came from nearby --

15 I think we were in Aberfoyle, a priest came from

16 a parish nearby and he had golf clubs in the back of his

17 car, and he came to visit a family who was in Smyllum.

18 At that point in time, **BAC** used to take the boys for

19 golf but he only had one golf club out at a time for

20 safety's sake. Anyway, the boys were delighted,

21 of course, when they saw this car coming up with a load

22 of golf clubs in the back, so they asked this priest if

23 they could have the clubs and he did, he didn't think

24 anything about it, you see, and he gave them out ad lib.

25 One of the boys was practising his swing and Francis was

1 standing to the left of him or some time -- and it just
2 happened to this little fellow. He was a small little
3 boy, he was from Dundee, he was a lovely little quiet
4 boy -- and I can still remember -- and he hit him on the
5 side of the temple and he fell down.

6 They just told me about this when I came on. He was
7 all right, he got up and he went to his dinner. Then we
8 got the local doctor to come in and see him. He said
9 it would be all right for going home but to put him on
10 the back seat on the bus and keep him cool. So we did
11 that and he was well looked after.

12 But anyway, when he got home, we got him to the
13 infirmarian, and she got him to the doctor, of course,
14 and the next thing he was in Edinburgh Royal Infirmary.
15 That's where you went for the head, anything to do with
16 the head.

17 But then after that, I don't remember very much.
18 I know I was at his Mass and I was at the burial, but
19 I can't remember a thing about that.

20 Q. You can't remember where the burial was?

21 A. It was in a Glasgow cemetery, definitely.

22 Q. Not in Lanark?

23 A. Oh definitely not in Lanark. It was in a Glasgow
24 cemetery and I don't know if any of the family or
25 anything were there for that, but I remember that.

1 That's exactly what happened to Francis.

2 Q. I think what you tell us in your statement is that you
3 were in the vicinity of --

4 A. I was around, you know.

5 Q. But you didn't see what actually happened?

6 A. No, I didn't, but there was a chaplain with us, a
7 Father John, and he was standing there, he saw it all
8 happen, and when I came -- and the boys, of course, all
9 go round to me to tell me what happened and he told me
10 what happened, he said he saw it but he couldn't do
11 a thing about it, it happened so quickly.

12 Q. The other child you were asked about when you gave your
13 statement was Samuel Carr --

14 LADY SMITH: Just before you go to Samuel Carr, do you
15 remember anything about Francis McColl's hearing?

16 A. Yes. Yes. He had something wrong with his -- I used to
17 take him to Hail Mary's Hospital for treatment, and
18 he had some weakness at the side, the part that he was
19 hit, really, where he was hit with the golf club. But
20 I can't remember what it was. I can't remember what
21 he had.

22 LADY SMITH: Did he have a difficulty in hearing?

23 A. He did, he did. Yes.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

25 MR MacAULAY: You mentioned BAC just to go back to

1 that, and I think we understand that's

2 [REDACTED] BAC

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. -- who worked at Smyllum.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Was it [REDACTED] BAC who generally organised the golf?

7 A. And football and that. He was very good at it, yes, he
8 did.

9 Q. Was he present when this incident --

10 A. He was in the vicinity, but he wasn't standing there; it
11 was only just this priest was there and a lot of boys,
12 of course.

13 LADY SMITH: So who was supervising the boys?

14 A. They were just playing around, you know. I don't know
15 who was supervising them. I don't know. But I know
16 that afterwards, we had to -- that boy who caused the
17 accident, the other boys were calling him a murderer for
18 a good while afterwards, so we had to get him to see
19 a social worker to take him back to Dundee because
20 he was suffering there with them, you know, because of
21 that. But that's exactly what happened with Francis.

22 MR MacAULAY: Do you think then that the reason why this
23 happened was because there was a lack of supervision?

24 A. Sorry?

25 Q. Do you think that this happened at the time because

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. The other thing I want to ask you about is this, just
3 going back on something you've said, and you made it
4 clear, really, that as far as washing was concerned the
5 boys had showers --
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. -- and not baths.
- 8 A. That's right, yes.
- 9 Q. But one thing you did say, and I just wondered about
10 this, is you did say if a boy wet the bed then that boy
11 would have a bath.
- 12 A. Yes. There was one bath upstairs attached -- in the
13 dormitory, like outside the dormitory, in the wash
14 place. And they had a bath there. That was the only
15 bath we had, which was only used for a boy if they wet
16 the bed.
- 17 Q. But why was the bath used, not, for example, a shower?
- 18 A. Well, they didn't have any showers up in the bedrooms.
19 They were too far down, they were in a different part.
20 That's why they used to have them during the day.
- 21 Q. What if two or three boys wet the bed, what would happen
22 then?
- 23 A. Well, they just would get a bath.
- 24 Q. And the suggestion we've had that the bath would be
25 a cold bath, you --

- 1 A. No, there was hot water there too, yes.
- 2 Q. Would you be involved in that process?
- 3 A. No, I didn't call them very much in the morning because
- 4 I was over at Mass or else at my breakfast.
- 5 Miss [redacted] IAQ usually called them and I know what she
- 6 did, I knew the routine, so this is what happened. They
- 7 just got a bath if they wet the bed.
- 8 Q. So if there were a number of boys who wet the bed then
- 9 they would -- would they queue up for the bath or
- 10 what was the arrangement?
- 11 A. We only had about two, I'd say.
- 12 Q. Are you talking about the bigger boys?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. If we look at the three groups --
- 15 A. I'm not talking about the three groups at all; I'm just
- 16 speaking for my own group. There were only about two
- 17 boys who would wet the bed, but there was a bath, as
- 18 I say, there, up there, and that's where they used to go
- 19 to have it.
- 20 Q. Before the division then that you mentioned earlier,
- 21 sister, where you had different sisters looking after
- 22 different age groups, you had responsibility for all
- 23 these boys?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. You'd have more than two boys wetting the bed?

- 1 A. Yes, but that'd -- I'd only have one group -- I would
2 only look after one group. Somebody else would be
3 looking after the group that became Sister AGI
4 group.
- 5 Q. So would that be a layperson?
- 6 A. Yes. There was no sister in charge, you know, at that
7 point.
- 8 Q. So so far as that group would be concerned, that was
9 being looked after by the layperson --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- in the morning?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Did you understand the process to be the same that if
14 you wet the bed you'd have to have a bath?
- 15 A. That was the same thing, yes. They did, they had a bath
16 too.
- 17 Q. If a number of children wet the bed, would they require
18 to wait --
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. -- for the child in front of them to have the bath?
- 21 A. Yes, they did, yes.
- 22 Q. The other incident I was going to ask you about is in
23 connection with Samuel Carr, who we know also died when
24 he was a resident at Smyllum.
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. I don't think he was in your group.
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. Who was in charge of him?
- 4 A. Sister [REDACTED] AGI [REDACTED] had him. He wasn't very long in
5 Smyllum and I knew him quite well and he was a great --
6 the boys all loved him. He was small but he was 6 years
7 old and he was very undersized for his age. He was
8 a lovely little boy and he was with Sister [REDACTED] AGI [REDACTED]
9 Then I don't know what happened to him but I know that
10 he just got sick and he had a pain and the doctor saw
11 him and then he went into hospital and he died in
12 hospital. I don't know where he was buried or anything
13 like that. I can't remember that.
- 14 Q. Well, your statement is on the screen, sister, at the
15 moment. It's paragraph 41. You do say there:
16 "I do remember being at Sammy Carr's funeral.
17 He was buried in Lanark at St Mary's cemetery."
18 A. Did I say that? I forgot about that. I know that he --
19 his mother came to the funeral, but, yes, he was buried
20 in Lanark now I come to think of it. He had his own
21 little grave there, yes. He wasn't buried in a communal
22 grave.
- 23 Q. We may come back to that. But I think just on that
24 point, so far as you know, were there a number of
25 children buried in the cemetery at St Mary's?

- 1 A. Yes, I only knew that since this inquiry began.
- 2 Q. I see. One thing you're asked in your statement when
3 you were asked to give your statement was about manual
4 work and whether children at Smyllum did what might be
5 referred to as manual type work. What's your position
6 on that?
- 7 A. Well, after their breakfast in the morning, they all had
8 little chores to do, like sweeping the dining room or
9 just doing little jobs, nothing very much, because they
10 hadn't much time before school. And that was really the
11 only time that they did anything like that. When they
12 came home from school, they didn't do any manual work --
13 except on Saturdays, they did help with sweeping the
14 dining -- they were big rooms and they'd sweep them and
15 all that kind of thing.
- 16 Q. What about polishing floors?
- 17 A. No, we didn't have any polished floors.
- 18 Q. Peeling potatoes, is that something a child might be
19 asked to do?
- 20 A. They might have. One or two used to go into the kitchen
21 to do little jobs. I don't know what they did now,
22 I can't remember.
- 23 Q. What you say in your statement, sister, is that when
24 you were at Smyllum it was a happy place.
- 25 A. It was.

1 Q. What do you say about the evidence that this inquiry has
2 heard that it was an unhappy place for children who were
3 in fear during their time there?

4 A. No, I never experienced that, and I can't understand why
5 they said that, because it was a happy place. The
6 sisters were all happy there, the children were all
7 happy there, and they really had everything, you know.
8 They had loads, lots of -- you know, as I say, they had
9 lots of games and people, you know, coming in to see
10 them and all that kind of thing. Yes, it was a very
11 happy place and they got together for -- the
12 Variety Club of Great Britain used to come and show them
13 films every month and if there were any spare films they
14 had, they would ring us up and say, "We're coming". It
15 was marvellous. All the boys and girls got together for
16 that, so it was a happy place and I mean that.

17 Q. So far as birthdays were concerned then, how were
18 birthdays celebrated?

19 A. We didn't go in a lot for them, really. We just had
20 a little party in the group and that only started in the
21 latter years.

22 Q. Before that then, was there any acknowledgement?

23 A. Not much, I don't know. There wasn't very much about
24 it, no.

25 Q. So if there's been evidence from witnesses that

1 birthdays weren't acknowledged that may well be correct
2 evidence?

3 A. They weren't acknowledged very much, as I say, until
4 about in the 1960s.

5 LADY SMITH: Why not?

6 A. I don't know. I don't know. It's -- I don't know.

7 LADY SMITH: We've heard some people say, because of that
8 practice, it would seem they didn't know when their
9 birthday was.

10 A. Yes. I don't know. I can't remember that.

11 LADY SMITH: Don't you think that's sad?

12 A. I do. I do. But I mean -- I don't know. I can't
13 remember what happened, really, but they certainly never
14 got anything from their parents or from anybody else, no
15 greetings or anything like that.

16 MR MacAULAY: What about Christmas then?

17 A. Christmas was a great time there. Yes, they had -- none
18 of them ever went anywhere for Christmas. They stayed
19 there and we had the whole place decorated. We always
20 kind of competed with each other in the groups to have
21 the best decorations and all that and the boys used to
22 love that.

23 They used to get lots of things in from people like
24 parishes in Motherwell and Glasgow, and they got loads
25 of toys and stuff. We never had to buy anything.

1 Q. There's been a suggestion, sister -- and you may be
2 aware of this -- that if a child did get a toy or toys,
3 the toys were taken away, either very shortly
4 afterwards -- what do you say to that?

5 A. Well, the boys I had were from 12 to 16 and nobody took
6 their things from them.

7 Q. Looking at the position generally, do you know if toys
8 were --

9 A. No, I don't know.

10 Q. -- removed from children?

11 A. No, I just know about my own group. If they got
12 anything they had them and they minded them. Nobody
13 took them from them because you couldn't; they were big
14 fellas.

15 Q. What about visits from families? Was that encouraged?

16 A. It was encouraged, but very few came. Very few.

17 Q. How was it encouraged?

18 A. Well, the only way we could encourage them was by
19 welcoming them when we saw them. That was the way we
20 managed. Very, very few came that I can remember.

21 LADY SMITH: Did you discuss that with the social workers
22 responsible for the children?

23 A. Well, we saw the social workers all right, but we -- no,
24 I don't think we did, no. I can't really remember what
25 we did with them, but the social workers came -- when

1 I went there first, their visits were very few and far
2 between, but as time went on, they came on a monthly
3 basis.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 A. We just talked to them and that, but very few parents
6 ever came to see them.

7 MR MacAULAY: But your position, sister, is that parents
8 were encouraged to come?

9 A. Oh, they were encouraged yes.

10 Q. They were encouraged because of the way they would be
11 welcomed?

12 A. Yes, they were always welcomed.

13 Q. So you wouldn't accept that family members were not
14 welcome or --

15 A. No, no, I wouldn't.

16 Q. You mentioned social workers, what about other
17 inspections? Do you recall inspections being carried
18 out?

19 A. When I was writing that -- when I was talking about
20 that, the inspections, I talked about the Home Office
21 coming, but I think I mixed that up with Mill Hill.

22 Q. I see.

23 A. I think I mixed -- I think the Home Office -- I don't
24 think it was coming -- they were coming to us at that
25 point.

1 Q. So when you say --

2 A. I said that the Home Office came and inspected the

3 place, but when I thought about it afterwards, I think

4 I mixed -- I don't think they came there at all to

5 Smyllum. I think I was mixing it up with the

6 residential school in Mill Hill.

7 Q. Because you do talk in your statement over quite

8 a number of paragraphs about the Home Office

9 inspections --

10 A. That's right, I did.

11 Q. -- and feedback and so on.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. But you say that was at Mill Hill?

14 A. That was Mill Hill. It's only afterwards it dawned on

15 me that this is really -- it was Mill Hill and not in

16 Smyllum.

17 LADY SMITH: So that was the place that you had been

18 immediately before you went to Smyllum --

19 A. Yes.

20 LADY SMITH: -- in London?

21 A. Yes.

22 MR MacAULAY: You do say, and as you mentioned already, that

23 social workers or children's officers did visit, but did

24 I understand you to say that this was something that

25 happened later on rather than early on in your time at

1 Smyllum?

2 A. The social workers?

3 Q. Yes, or a children's officer.

4 A. They seemed to be coming more frequent, say, just about

5 round about the 1960s. Yes, about that time.

6 Q. And what would the arrangements then be if a children's

7 officer or social worker came to visit a particular

8 child?

9 A. The child would go over to see them in the front hall

10 in the house. The social workers didn't seem to come to

11 the groups.

12 Q. The social worker was coming to see the child?

13 A. Yes, they didn't seem to come into the groups.

14 Q. And would a sister go with the child?

15 A. Yes, they'd go over and they'd leave them with the

16 social worker.

17 Q. Did you yourself do that?

18 A. Oh yes.

19 Q. So would you leave the child with the social worker?

20 A. Yes, yes.

21 Q. How long would the social worker have with the child?

22 A. About 20 minutes or so, something like that.

23 Q. So far as keeping a record of things -- of visitors, for

24 example -- was there a book kept to record visits?

25 A. There was a book, but I don't know what happened to it.

- 1 Q. You call that a logbook?
- 2 A. Why he.
- 3 Q. Who kept the logbook?
- 4 A. That was kept by the superior of the house.
- 5 Q. Not by you then?
- 6 A. No, I had my own -- we had our own logbooks, but those
- 7 kind of visits were all -- they were recorded in the
- 8 other book the superior had. We kept it as well.
- 9 Q. What record did you keep?
- 10 A. Just to say who they were and, you know, what happened.
- 11 Q. And more generally, did you keep records in connection
- 12 with the children?
- 13 A. We just did -- everyday we'd fill in whatever happened
- 14 during the day, anything like that. That was the only
- 15 thing.
- 16 Q. And who would do that?
- 17 A. Myself. I would do it. Whoever was in charge of the
- 18 group did it.
- 19 Q. When you had the division of the groups then do I take
- 20 it you would do it for the bigger group?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. And did you understand that the other sisters would be
- 23 doing the same thing?
- 24 A. Yes, we all did the same thing. We all had our own
- 25 logbook and we'd put in what happened, anything of

- 1 interest that happened during the day.
- 2 Q. Looking to your period of about seven years then, do
- 3 I understand you to say that there would have been
- 4 a number of logbooks completed by you over that period?
- 5 A. Yes. I don't know what happened to them.
- 6 Q. Where were they kept?
- 7 A. We kept them in our own -- we all had a kind of little
- 8 office to keep things like that in, but I don't know
- 9 what happened to them.
- 10 Q. Do I take it from that that you yourself had an office,
- 11 sister?
- 12 A. Yes, a small office.
- 13 Q. Did the other two sisters --
- 14 A. Yes, they had all a place that they could keep stuff
- 15 like that.
- 16 Q. Could there be any understanding or impression that
- 17 although we had this division of the boys into these
- 18 different groups with different sisters, that you had
- 19 overall charge?
- 20 A. No. No, I hadn't. We all had -- we were all
- 21 responsible for our own groups. Once they divided up,
- 22 that was ...
- 23 Q. So there wouldn't be any suggestion in your mind then of
- 24 a child being sent to you for any form of discipline --
- 25 A. No.

1 Q. -- from another group?

2 A. No, no, never, no. Oh no.

3 Q. Just coming back to records, you've mentioned logbooks.

4 What other records do you remember keeping, if any?

5 A. That was all.

6 Q. Was there any record kept of a child's progress?

7 A. No. No.

8 Q. And looking back now, do you consider that's something

9 that possibly ought to have been kept?

10 A. Yes, it would be very different now, yes.

11 Q. But what would you know or what would you be told about

12 the history of a particular child that was being

13 admitted to, let's say, your group?

14 A. Nothing.

15 Q. Nothing?

16 A. No.

17 LADY SMITH: Didn't you want to know?

18 A. Oh yes, I did, but we weren't told at that time.

19 LADY SMITH: Did you make any effort to find out?

20 A. Well ... We did try, but we just weren't told. It was

21 a different time. That's the way things worked in those

22 days. That's the way it was. That's back in 1957 to

23 1960. But that was the way I think it was everywhere.

24 LADY SMITH: But to care for a child well, you'd need to

25 know what the background circumstances were to their

- 1 entering care, wouldn't you?
- 2 A. No, we weren't told, we weren't told.
- 3 LADY SMITH: I see. Thank you.
- 4 MR MacAULAY: Can I just ask you a little bit about siblings
5 and how siblings were managed during your time there,
6 sister. Let's take boys and girls, first of all. If
7 you had a family of boys and girls being admitted to
8 Smyllum, can you tell me what would happen your during
9 time?
- 10 A. The girls would go to the girls' side and the boys would
11 go to the boys' side. They would go over to -- the boys
12 would come over and see their sisters when they wanted
13 and the boys could go over to the girls' side. It was
14 mostly the girls coming over to see the boys, to see
15 their brothers, you know, rather than the boys going
16 over there. I don't know why, but that was the way it
17 was.
- 18 Q. And was that encouraged, that there be contact
19 between --
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. -- girls and boys?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And there has been a suggestion in the evidence in the
24 inquiry, sister, that that was not encouraged, that
25 contact between even siblings was not encouraged at

1 Smyllum.

2 A. Oh, it was. In my experience, it was encouraged, yes,
3 yes.

4 Q. And it wasn't stopped?

5 A. No, it was never stopped.

6 Q. One thing you do say in your statement, sister, is that
7 children did have personal possessions; is that right?

8 A. Sorry?

9 Q. Children had personal possessions.

10 A. Well, the thing is they had a locker beside their beds
11 if they wanted to keep anything there and they also had
12 lockers downstairs and they all had keys to their
13 lockers where they kept anything they wanted there. But
14 they did have them, yes.

15 Q. There's been a suggestion in evidence that children
16 would leave Smyllum with essentially the clothes they
17 were wearing --

18 A. It's true, yes.

19 Q. -- with no personal possessions.

20 A. That was the way -- yes. That was true. Before they
21 left, you know, we'd buy their clothes and fit them out
22 before they went to work or wherever they were going at
23 16. But they didn't have many possessions, no.
24 I suppose they just took whatever they had. But while
25 they were there they did have things and they kept them

- 1 there.
- 2 Q. When a child came to leave Smyllum, what notice did you
3 give the child?
- 4 A. They knew -- the social worker would tell them, really,
5 about that.
- 6 Q. Just to be clear then, you're saying the social worker
7 would tell them --
- 8 A. They would tell them and they would tell us and tell
9 them when they came to 16. But they knew well in time.
10 They had plenty of time to think about it, you know.
- 11 Q. But do I take it from what you're saying the onus would
12 be on the social worker --
- 13 A. Yes, the onus was on the social worker.
- 14 Q. For example, when the child left then, would it be for
15 the Social Work Department to care for the child?
- 16 A. Yes. But they wouldn't come and collect them to take
17 them to wherever they were going; we used to just see
18 them off.
- 19 LADY SMITH: Would you have any discussion with the social
20 worker about what might be best for an individual child?
- 21 A. Yes, we did, yes.
- 22 LADY SMITH: How would that happen?
- 23 A. We'd just get together and talk about where they were
24 going to go or what jobs they were going to do. Some of
25 them were going home to their own parents, back to their

1 parents.

2 LADY SMITH: What if you thought, for example, going back to
3 the parents wasn't the right thing for them? Would you
4 tell the social worker that?

5 A. We would, but the social worker knew all that. We
6 didn't know much about the parents' background at all,
7 about their parents. We weren't told anything about
8 that.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 MR MacAULAY: So I think -- and correct me if I'm wrong,
11 sister -- what you're saying is really the onus was very
12 firmly put on the social worker to arrange the care
13 after Smyllum?

14 A. They did, yes. I always remember it was a very sad time
15 when they were going away and I used to see them --
16 I used to watch them from the window going off down the
17 road and turning from Smyllum, and it was really
18 heartbreaking, you know, to see them going out into the
19 world and not having any training or much experience or
20 anything. It was -- I used to feel it was very bad.

21 They came back regularly though to see us. They
22 used to come back and stay for weekends, especially --
23 some of them would go home to their parents and they
24 would have one room. After all the space they had in
25 Smyllum, it was terribly hard on them and some of them

1 would just ask, "Could we not come back?" They missed
2 the open air, the fresh air, the fields and all that.
3 But it was a difficult time for us all when they were
4 going.

5 Q. From what you've said, though, that child wouldn't be
6 leaving with any progress type report that had been
7 prepared in advance --

8 A. No.

9 Q. -- over the child's period at Smyllum?

10 A. No, they would just have gone to St Mary's secondary
11 school in Lanark.

12 Q. When did they leave secondary school --

13 A. They went to the secondary school -- all the boys I had
14 were going there every day.

15 Q. Can I just then move on and ask you about discipline and
16 punishment at Smyllum, sister.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. First of all, was there any guidance, whether oral or
19 written, provided in connection with discipline and/or
20 punishment?

21 A. No.

22 Q. So how was that approached, how was the issue of
23 discipline approached then within Smyllum?

24 A. Well, just speaking for my own group, I used to deprive
25 them of pocket money, football, television, or whatever

1 was appropriate. You know, they felt that to be an
2 awful lot to be -- when they couldn't go to the pictures
3 or when they couldn't go to football or whatever it was.
4 That was the punishment we worked by, that is what we
5 did.

6 Q. What about other groups then?

7 A. I don't know what they did, really. They did more or
8 less -- I think they did more or less like that too, but
9 I'm not all that sure about what they did.

10 Q. Would you not have some discussions with the sisters as
11 to --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- in relation to discipline and punishment?

14 A. Yes, it was more -- you see, I don't know. You see,
15 they had different -- the big boys, the boys -- this was
16 different for them. You see, the younger boys didn't go
17 much for football or out to the cinema or anything like
18 that like the bigger boys did. I don't know what really
19 they did or how they managed it, but that's the way we
20 managed it.

21 Q. What about the time when you had overall responsibility
22 for all the boys, 90 boys?

23 A. Yes, at that time we just -- I don't know how we managed
24 it. I don't know.

25 Q. Can you remember how you managed it from the point of

1 view -- let's take the discipline of the younger boys,
2 for example the 7, 8, 9-year-olds. How were they
3 disciplined?

4 A. I don't know.

5 Q. Have you no memory of that?

6 A. No, I don't know what we did. I have no memory at all
7 of that. I don't know.

8 Q. But at that time, although I think you told us you had
9 helpers, you would be responsible?

10 A. That's right.

11 Q. If you can try your best, sister, to think about what
12 sort of discipline might be required for these younger
13 boys.

14 A. No, I can't remember.

15 Q. I can see why, with an older boy, who perhaps had pocket
16 money or wanted to watch television, that that might be
17 a disincentive to misbehaviour, but if you're looking at
18 a younger child of 7 or 8, what was the disincentive as
19 far as you can remember?

20 A. I don't know. I can't remember. I don't remember.

21 Q. But would a layperson who might be involved with the
22 younger boys have any authority to punish that child in
23 any way?

24 A. No.

25 Q. So the punishment would have to come from you?

- 1 A. Well, it would -- yes, it would have to come from me or
2 whoever it was there.
- 3 Q. Could there be other nuns then involved even though you
4 had overall responsibility?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. So it would be yourself?
- 7 A. Myself. But, no, I don't know exactly -- I don't know
8 happened at that time.
- 9 Q. So we're talking about a period from about 1957 to
10 roughly 1960-ish?
- 11 A. Yes, that's right.
- 12 Q. What about Miss [redacted] IAQ Was she authorised to
13 discipline children?
- 14 A. No. No, she didn't discipline -- she was -- no.
- 15 Q. What would she do then?
- 16 A. She'd tell me about them and we would discuss together
17 what would happen and it was to -- like, you know,
18 deprive them of pocket money or whatever it was, or
19 television.
- 20 Q. Did you ever see Miss [redacted] IAQ disciplining a child
21 in any way?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. Was a record kept of any punishments that a child was
24 given?
- 25 A. No.

1 Q. Was there a punishment book?

2 A. No.

3 Q. When you say no, perhaps you didn't keep one, but do you
4 know if one was kept?

5 A. No. There might have been one kept in the office by the
6 superior, but I don't know about that.

7 Q. Well, how would the superior know about what punishments
8 were being given out?

9 A. If there's anything serious that happened, I would take,
10 up to the time I left, I would take the boy over to
11 Sister BAF the superior at the time, and she would
12 reprimand them and, you know, talk to them and, you
13 know, tell them ... But that was all that happened.

14 Q. Did you ever see a book that might record punishments?

15 A. No. She could have it, but I didn't see it.

16 Q. So you really don't know if one was kept or not?

17 A. No, I don't.

18 LADY SMITH: Did you ever lose your temper with the boys?

19 A. I suppose I did. I don't know. I can't ... I don't
20 know.

21 LADY SMITH: Can you think what you did if you did lose your
22 temper?

23 A. I don't know. If you asked me that question 40 years
24 ago, I might be able to tell you. Now I can't remember,
25 I don't remember.

1 LADY SMITH: Right.

2 A. Sorry.

3 MR MacAULAY: You give one example in your statement,
4 sister, about boys uncoupling trains.

5 A. Oh yes. That was in Lanark, yes.

6 Q. It sounds quite a serious thing to do.

7 A. Yes, I know.

8 Q. Was that boys under your charge?

9 A. Yes. They only did it a couple of times.

10 Q. Very well. But what you tell us in your statement
11 is that that's the sort of offence that you'd require to
12 report to the superior?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Is that right?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And in relation to those particular instances you're
17 telling us about, would you go with the boys to the
18 Mother Superior?

19 A. I would go with them, yes.

20 Q. And can you tell me what happened?

21 A. As I say, she just would -- she would tell them -- you
22 know, she would reprimand them and she would try to
23 reason with them and talk to them and, you know, that
24 was all, really. But they didn't like the idea at all
25 of being told off by her.

- 1 Q. How often, can you tell me, would you, as it were, take
2 children to the Mother Superior for a dressing down, if
3 you can call it that?
- 4 A. I can't remember, sorry, I don't know. It wasn't very
5 often.
- 6 Q. Not very often?
- 7 A. Not very often, no.
- 8 Q. So do I take it then that you would handle the situation
9 yourself?
- 10 A. Yes. And just deprive them then of the usual things.
- 11 Q. Did you ever see a child being hit at Smyllum by way of
12 punishment?
- 13 A. No. I can't say I did.
- 14 Q. I include in that a slap. Did you ever see a child
15 being slapped --
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. -- by a nun or indeed a lay helper?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. I think when you were giving your statement, it was
20 suggested to yourself that you may have suggested in
21 a statement you provided earlier that there may have
22 been a slap, I think, if I can -- do you remember being
23 asked that?
- 24 A. Yes, I know, I remember that. No, I don't know why
25 I mixed that up, but -- no, I never remembered --

1 I don't remember her hitting anybody.

2 Q. Do you remember yourself ever hitting any child?

3 A. No.

4 Q. I think what was in -- I'll put this on the screen.

5 It's a statement that you provided, I think, to other

6 solicitors in July 2017. Can I just put that on the

7 screen? It's WIT.003.001.0592.

8 You're seeing the last page of the statement on the

9 screen, sister, and can you see that, although it has

10 been redacted out from what's on the screen, this is

11 a statement you signed on 14 July 2017?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Do you see that, sister?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. The paragraph that I'm interested in is at page 0588.

16 It's paragraph 56. What you say is:

17 "I never gave out any physical discipline. I never

18 laid a hand on them that I can remember. Sister BAF

19 [is the next reference] would give them a slap

20 sometimes ..."

21 So at that time, you seemed to have

22 a recollection --

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. -- of one sister slapping children.

25 A. Yes. I have no memory of it now or when I gave that ...

1 Q. Did you witness what might be described as any cruelty
2 in your time at Smyllum?

3 A. No. No.

4 Q. Have you been made aware, sister, of the nature of the
5 kind of allegations that have been made in the course of
6 the inquiry so far?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. I think I've put this to you already, that, for example,
9 it has been suggested that the environment was an
10 unhappy and tense environment. And you don't accept
11 that?

12 A. No.

13 Q. The suggestion is it was an abusive environment, that
14 there was a lot of physical and emotional abuse.

15 A. No. Not that I know about.

16 Q. What you tell us in your statement at paragraph 73 is in
17 connection with the allegations that have been made:

18 "That was the biggest shock of my life to hear
19 what was being said. I couldn't believe it."

20 A. That's right, yes, I couldn't. I was shocked when I saw
21 the list of things I was accused of. I wouldn't dream
22 of doing things that -- you wouldn't dream of doing
23 anything like that to any child. If I did, I would have
24 it on my conscience to the end of my days.

25 Q. Can I put to you certain parts of the evidence then,

1 sister, for your comment, just to let you see in
2 particular what some people have said about you. This
3 is evidence given by a man now who's happy to disclose
4 his name, William Connelly. He gave evidence to this
5 inquiry. Is that a name that means anything to you?

6 A. No, I don't remember the name at all, or the child.

7 Q. I'm not suggesting that you should. But if we then look
8 at the transcript of his evidence, I want to take you to
9 TRN.001.002.0425.

10 Can I just tell you that Mr Connelly was admitted to
11 Smyllum in [REDACTED] 1958 when he was aged perhaps 9 or
12 10. When he says here in his testimony at line
13 number 9, if you look at the screen, sister:

14 "She's a bad, bad woman."

15 Do you see that?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. There he's talking about Sister [REDACTED] EAD and that was the
18 name you then had when you were at Smyllum; is that
19 correct?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. He goes on to say:

22 "She used to hit me with a hairbrush and at first,
23 when I got hit with that hairbrush, I must have assumed
24 that she had picked it up from somewhere, but I realised
25 later on she must have carried it with her because she

1 used it on me quite a lot and on other people, so that
2 must have been her, if you will excuse the expression,
3 weapon of choice."

4 What's your reaction to that, sister?

5 A. Well, I never had a hairbrush like that, never. No,
6 I don't know -- I don't know where he got all that from.

7 Q. Is there any truth in any of that?

8 A. No, no.

9 Q. If we go back to page 0411, here he's talking -- I'll
10 wait until we get there. (Pause). Here he's talking
11 about a time when he was in St Anthony's, which --
12 I think you told us already that was Sister AGI
13 dormitory --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- and suffering from bed-wetting.

16 Do you see that at line number 11 --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- he's asked:

19 "Question: At least for some time when you were at
20 Smyllum, you did suffer from bed-wetting?

21 "Answer: Yes.

22 "Question: What would happen if you wet the bed?

23 "Answer: When they found out in the morning, the
24 first thing you got was a belting for it.

25 "Question: From whom though?

1 "Answer: It was usually from the little woman
2 I described."

3 And that's describing a lay helper:

4 "Answer: But there was also sometimes older boys in
5 charge of you, you know, when there wasn't a member of
6 staff around.

7 "Question: And would they belt you as well?

8 "Answer: They would administer punishment, yes."

9 About what that, the notion that, leaving aside the
10 lay helper, that older boys would be involved in this
11 process?

12 A. No, I don't know.

13 Q. Well, do you have any knowledge of that?

14 A. No, I haven't. It wouldn't be in my group anyway.

15 Q. This is an even younger group than yours that we're
16 looking at here.

17 A. That's what I mean. No, I don't remember. I didn't
18 know what happened in that group.

19 Q. You say that, sister, but if this sort of practice was
20 going on within Smyllum involving the boys, would you
21 not be aware of it?

22 A. Well, that's what I mean. I never heard of it. No,
23 I never heard about it, other boys being in charge.

24 Q. Okay.

25 LADY SMITH: Of course, you were not usually there in the

- 1 morning, you told us.
- 2 A. With my group, the boys -- I wouldn't have any boys like
3 that because they were all the same age and they were
4 all big boys. So there wouldn't be anybody like that
5 in the group in charge.
- 6 MR MacAULAY: But at a point in time, sister, as you've told
7 us, you were in charge of all the boys.
- 8 A. Oh yes, but that was only for a short time and
9 I can't -- I'm very vague about that, really. I can't
10 remember exactly what happened.
- 11 Q. But this witness is talking about a practice of how
12 children who wet the bed were treated. And part of the
13 practice involved physical chastisement, if I can call
14 it that.
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Now, this witness and other witnesses have talked about
17 this practice being a practice at Smyllum, and what
18 you're telling the inquiry, sister, is that you knew
19 nothing about that.
- 20 A. No, I didn't.
- 21 Q. If we move on to page 0413 in the same evidence -- it'll
22 come on the screen ... I think I said 0413. (Pause).
23 If you just bear with us, sister, until the technology
24 catches up. (Pause)
- 25 I think we're there now, sister. You'll see the

1 question is asked at the top of the page:

2 "Question: Were there other bed-wetters in the same
3 dormitory?

4 "Answer: Yes.

5 "Question: Was it the same sort of treatment?

6 "Answer: Yes, there was lots of things. People
7 sometimes had to wear their sheets like togas.

8 "Question: Did that happen to you?

9 "Answer: No.

10 "Question: Why was that done, do you know?

11 "Answer: To humiliate you. It was seen as dirty,
12 you were ... you shouldn't have been wetting your bed."

13 Again, this is an example of this sort of practice
14 where it is being alleged that steps were taken to
15 humiliate children because of the bed-wetting. What
16 do you say to that? Does that mean anything to you?

17 A. No, it doesn't. I never witnessed that. I never saw
18 that happening.

19 Q. Did you hear of it?

20 A. No.

21 Q. If you had heard of it, what you have done?

22 A. I would stop it. We wouldn't have it. I don't know why
23 they're saying those things. No, it did not happen, no.

24 Q. Do you know of any other establishment where this sort
25 of practice did happen?

1 A. Yes, I heard about it afterwards. I did hear about
2 these things happening in other places, but it certainly
3 didn't happen with us.

4 Q. When you say "other places", are you talking of other
5 places run by religious orders?

6 A. No, not really. Any places. Some things -- I'd read
7 about it more than anything else that this happened.
8 But, no, it never happened. At least -- I can only
9 speak for my own group. That did not happen. We did
10 not humiliate them like that.

11 Q. Again, sister, you keep saying that you want to draw
12 a line between your group and other groups.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. But really, if this was happening in Smyllum, surely you
15 would know about it, would you not?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Why not?

18 A. Well, we had our own group and we were responsible only
19 for our own group. I never heard about it. Anyway, if
20 it did happen, I never heard about it.

21 LADY SMITH: You seem to have a memory of reading about this
22 treatment of bed-wetters occurring in other places.

23 A. Yes.

24 LADY SMITH: Do you remember anything of the thinking behind
25 such treatment?

1 A. No. No, I don't. I felt myself it was horrible for
2 this to happen.

3 LADY SMITH: Do you know, for example, whether, where it was
4 being done, those who were doing it thought that that
5 was the way to cure children of bed-wetting?

6 A. Yes, probably, yes. I wouldn't know for sure, but
7 I think that must be what's behind it.

8 LADY SMITH: All right. What would be the reasoning then?

9 A. I don't know.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Mr MacAulay.

11 MR MacAULAY: Can I then take you to the evidence of another
12 witness. This is a witness who gave evidence last week.
13 In fact, his name now is William Whicher, but his name
14 at the time was O'Donnell. Does the name
15 William O'Donnell mean anything to you?

16 A. O'Donnell ... No, no. No.

17 Q. He was admitted to Smyllum in [REDACTED] 1957 at the age of
18 about 9 or so. In his time at Smyllum, he was in
19 Sacred Heart, St Anthony's and St Vincent's, so he spent
20 some years at Smyllum. And St Vincent's, I think you
21 told us, was your dormitory in particular.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. If I then take you to his transcript at
24 TRN.001.002.3475. (Pause)

25 Just to give the background to this, looking up to

1 the bit I'm going to ask you about, this witness is
2 talking about bed-wetting generally during his time at
3 Smyllum.

4 I think we're working off different pages, but if
5 you move back up the screen a little bit, towards the
6 bottom -- if you look to the right-hand side at
7 number 25, the question is.

8 "Question: You have mentioned Sister **EAD**
9 later: what about her, did you see her doing this?"

10 And that's to deal with bed-wetting and this witness
11 said this, sister, and can I just ask you to focus on
12 this?

13 "Answer: Oh, you didn't want Sister **EAD** looking
14 to see who wet the bed. She was quite -- she used to
15 lose her temper so quick. So what would start off is
16 just chastising, depending on the reactions of the
17 child, how far she went, you know. She seemed to --

18 "Question: Was she involved then in this inspection
19 process --

20 "Answer: Yes.

21 "Question: -- and what you've been telling us about
22 what would happen with the sheets and so on?

23 "Answer: Not in Sacred Heart she wasn't, but in the
24 older ones.

25 "Question: Apart from what you told us about the

1 sheets, was there any physical punishment?

2 "Answer: Oh yes, of course. They nearly always hit
3 you in the back of the leg. So they know that is a bare
4 part. Even when you're fully dressed you've got short
5 trousers on, so they could hit you there and it would be
6 painful, you know. I'm trying to think what else they
7 done."

8 So the suggestion there, sister, is you yourself had
9 some involvement in this inspection process and the
10 bed-wetting practices.

11 A. No, definitely not.

12 Q. So what this witness has said about you is not true?

13 A. Definitely. I don't know who he is. I never heard of
14 him. I don't know.

15 Q. I already asked you, sister, about whether children were
16 made to eat food they didn't want to eat and you said
17 that just did not happen.

18 A. No, definitely not.

19 Q. Again, sticking with this particular witness, if I can
20 take you to page 3490 of his evidence. At line number 6
21 on the left-hand side, can you see there's a question.

22 "Question: Would there be any attempt to make you
23 eat the food?

24 "Answer: Oh yes, yes. Like sometimes they would
25 force-feed you, which -- it is very hard to eat when

1 you are crying, you know, so I would be trying to do
2 that. I had a couple of beatings off Sister **EAD** --
3 I'm not talking about getting hit, I'm talking about
4 beatings -- where she just lost her rag and you just
5 curled up into a ball and let her kick you. Once she
6 broke my tooth. She has hit me so hard I fell over and
7 broke a tooth. So I had to go to school the next day
8 with a broken tooth and then wait to see the dentist."

9 And he confirms he's talking about you, sister.

10 What is your reaction to that allegation?

11 A. No, no, none of that. I did none of that. I don't know
12 why -- nothing like that happened. I don't know why --
13 they must have hated me.

14 Q. Why would they hate you?

15 A. That's what I mean to say, all this stuff. I don't
16 know. They must ... I don't know.

17 Q. If we go on a couple of pages to page 3492 --

18 A. If I broke his tooth, I would know about it. I wouldn't
19 be able to forget those things.

20 Q. When you say if you broke his tooth you'd know about
21 it --

22 A. I would.

23 Q. -- your position is it never, ever happened?

24 A. No. I would have -- I don't know. I would know if it
25 happened. You know, I forget a lot of things, but if

1 anything serious like that happened, I think I would
2 remember.

3 Q. I'm now looking at page 3492 in the actual transcript.
4 I'll just find out where we are on the screen. I think
5 you'll be wanting a break shortly. We'll just do this
6 little bit. I know you want a break very shortly.

7 (Pause)

8 If you look on the right-hand side, line number 3,
9 I think we can read the question:

10 "Question: The times that you were beaten by
11 Sister EAD and you curled up on the floor, as I think
12 you've indicated, and what you said is that she would
13 lose her temper?

14 "Answer: Yes. She had start off telling you off
15 for something, right, and then she would just lose her
16 temper."

17 And he then gives an example of when you were
18 slapping him across the face and he went into hysterical
19 laughter and you realised you were going too far.

20 Do you have any recollection of that, sister?

21 A. No, none at all.

22 Q. And he confirms that was something that happened at
23 a mealtime. He goes on to say at the bottom of the page
24 in relation to force-feeding:

25 "Answer: Sometimes she would hold the mouth and

1 talking about you, sister:

2 "Answer: She was -- she always seemed anxious to
3 get you down onto the floor. I remember being -- there
4 was one time I was actually getting hit and I was --
5 I was actually getting hit and I was amazed that -- she
6 was taking me from the washroom down to her office and
7 it was a long narrow corridor and I don't know how, but
8 I ended up on the floor -- she must have pushed me or
9 whatever."

10 There you're having a description of, again, you
11 hitting this individual child and being taken to an
12 office, and you've mentioned you did have some sort of
13 office.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Did this happen?

16 A. No, it never happened.

17 Q. And if you move on to the next page at 0426, at line
18 number 4, he says:

19 "She was kicking me all the way down to her office.
20 But she had done that regular. That was her mode: she
21 got you on the floor and kicked you."

22 That's quite a serious allegation that's being made
23 against you, sister. Is there any truth in it?

24 A. No, I never kicked a child in my life. I don't think
25 I kicked anybody in my life, really, but I definitely

1 never kicked a child.

2 Q. Perhaps the last section I'm taking from his evidence is
3 at page 0427. Can I ask you this, before I look at this
4 excerpt: before the division that you mentioned earlier
5 had taken place, was the boys' section known generally
6 as St Anthony's or did it have different names even
7 then?

8 A. I don't know. Sorry, I don't know.

9 Q. We know that after the division there was Sacred Heart,
10 St Anthony's and --

11 A. I'm very vague about that time, really.

12 Q. Okay. In any event, if we look at line number 9, this
13 witness goes on to say:

14 "Answer: Nobody ever told me this officially, but
15 I think -- because Sister EAD had an office and
16 others didn't, I think she was like in charge of the
17 boys' section, of the boys' side."

18 Insofar as that goes, that would only be then,
19 according to what you tell us, sister, up until the time
20 of the division.

21 A. Yes -- no, sorry, would you repeat that?

22 Q. The suggestion here is that the witness seems to think
23 that you were in charge of the boys' section, the boys'
24 side, and I understand from what you told us earlier you
25 were in charge of the boys' side but only up until the

1 division.

2 A. Yes, that's right. No, when we divided up, the three of
3 us were in charge of our own groups and nobody else
4 interfered.

5 Q. But he goes on to say at line 16:

6 "Answer: So I think Sister [REDACTED] EAD [REDACTED] was in charge and
7 things would be fed back to Sister [REDACTED] EAD [REDACTED] about things
8 that I had done. So she would be the one that would --
9 you know, you would get a belt in the dormitory if you
10 had wet your bed, but you knew what she saw you, you
11 were going to get it again, whether it be an hour later
12 or 2 hours, 4 hours.

13 "Question: For the same thing?

14 "Answer: For the same thing."

15 So his suggestion there is that although he might
16 get a belt in the dormitory, he would also get punished
17 subsequently by yourself once you heard about it.

18 A. No.

19 Q. That's not true?

20 A. That's not true.

21 Q. You have told us --

22 LADY SMITH: Sorry. Can I just ask you this: did you do
23 anything to try to stop the children wetting the bed?

24 A. No. No, I didn't think you could do anything --
25 I didn't anyway. I didn't do anything.

1 LADY SMITH: Nothing at all?

2 A. No.

3 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

4 MR MacAULAY: You have told us, sister, that after the

5 division then other sisters were responsible for

6 different age groups of the boys.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. One of these sisters was Sister [REDACTED] AGI

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And Sister [REDACTED] AGI has died since?

11 A. Yes, she has.

12 Q. And I think you told us she was in charge of what might

13 be called the middle group of boys.

14 A. Yes, she was.

15 Q. That age is, what, 10 to 12, that sort of age?

16 A. Yes, about that age.

17 Q. Can I just take you to this piece of evidence in

18 connection with her. This is in connection with

19 Sister [REDACTED] AGI I just want your comments on it.

20 This is a witness whose transcript I want to look at,

21 TRN.001.002.0358. He used the pseudonym "John" when he

22 gave his evidence to the inquiry.

23 This witness gave evidence that he was in Smyllum

24 over a period that spanned [REDACTED] 1958 to [REDACTED] 1961,

25 although for part of the time he was away and back. So

1 far as he was concerned, although he couldn't remember
2 the name of the boys' section, he was able to tell us
3 that Sister [REDACTED] AGI was in charge. Do you follow me?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. So that would mean this is at a time when the division
6 you've told us about has taken place.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. If I just take you to this part of his transcript and
9 ask you for your comments. Towards the bottom at line
10 number 14 he is asked:

11 "Question: Can I just look at that again with you
12 in a bit more detail. The person who was rubbing the
13 child's face into the sheet, who was that?

14 "Answer: She was a [REDACTED] woman and
15 I think her name was Ms [REDACTED] HBX one of the two."

16 Does that description mean anything to you?

17 A. No.

18 Q. "The sister also did it -- the two of them did it, not
19 just her.

20 "Question: And what sister?

21 "Answer: This is Sister [REDACTED] AGI

22 "Question: So it was one or the other who did this
23 answer?

24 "Answer: It didn't matter who did it, they did it.
25 It was like they both worked in tandem, like. She would

1 go down one side -- the [REDACTED] woman would go down
2 one side of the dormitory [moving on to page 1912] and
3 Sister [REDACTED] AGI would go down the other side. And if
4 someone was wet across there, [REDACTED] HBX as
5 we called her -- would rub his face in it over there and
6 Sister [REDACTED] AGI would rub someone's face in it on this
7 side."

8 And towards the bottom of that page at line number
9 20, he's asked:

10 "Question: How regular an occurrence was this then,
11 John?

12 "Answer: This was every day. Every day when you
13 got up, the boys that wet the bed got punished terribly
14 every single day. They never got off with it. The
15 sister never had any compassion or any understanding why
16 the boy was wetting the bed. It was nerves and it was
17 fear."

18 Do you see that?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And then just finally, moving on to the next page, 1913,
21 he's asked about physical chastisement and his answer:

22 "Answer: She would hit him as well and she would
23 slap him and grab his hair and put his face in the wet
24 bed and rub it so that his nose was probably sore and
25 all that. He would be crying and she would slap him and

1 kick him or whatever and he would be groaning and
2 greeting -- my expression -- he would be crying his eyes
3 out."

4 He goes on to say that they would be frightened.

5 That's in connection with the dormitory that was

6 being run by Sister [REDACTED] AGI Now, what is your

7 reaction to that evidence, sister?

8 A. I cannot see Sister [REDACTED] AGI doing anything like that.
9 She was very kind to the boys. I'm sure she never did
10 a thing like that. I couldn't even imagine her doing --
11 she loved them and they loved her. I'm positive if that
12 kind of thing was going on, I would have heard it
13 because it's an awful thing, you know. I never heard
14 about it. But she wouldn't have done that, I know she
15 wouldn't. She couldn't have. She was kind and she
16 wouldn't do that.

17 Q. This evidence, and other evidence, appears to suggest
18 that there was a practice --

19 A. No.

20 Q. -- within Smyllum, different dormitories, of this sort
21 of humiliating behaviour --

22 A. No.

23 Q. -- being inflicted on children.

24 A. No, definitely not.

25 Q. It could be said that if the practice was there when

1 Sister [REDACTED] AGI [REDACTED] was managing that particular dormitory,
2 that it was a practice that may have been inherited from
3 a previous time.

4 A. No, no. She wouldn't. She wouldn't do that.

5 Q. Sister, we've also heard evidence -- and we heard this
6 last week -- from two witnesses who were complimentary
7 of their time at Smyllum. I don't know if you've been
8 made aware of that or not.

9 A. Yes, I have -- of one anyway, but not two.

10 Q. We did have two to that effect. I want to take you to
11 some pieces of their evidence. The first witness, who
12 wants to be anonymous, used the pseudonym "Patrick".
13 His evidence begins at TRN.001.002.3577. That's when he
14 begins his evidence. I want to take you to a particular
15 piece of evidence that he gives on page 3601.

16 While we're waiting for that to come onto the
17 screen, this is a witness who was admitted to Smyllum in
18 [REDACTED] 1957 and left in [REDACTED] 1964. So he covered
19 your period.

20 A. Yes, he did.

21 Q. On this particular page, if I can try and work this out
22 from the screen, it's towards the top -- and can I just
23 ask you about this. He's asked the question:

24 "Question: You do tell us, and you've mentioned
25 this already, that for more serious matters you could be

1 sent to Sister [REDACTED] EAD

2 "Answer: Yes.

3 "Question: Did that happen to you?"

4 Pausing there, sister, looking to the children that
5 you were looking after, if there was a serious matter,
6 would a child be sent to you?

7 A. No. No. If he was in my group, I would know, but
8 nobody would be sent to me, no. You mean from another
9 group?

10 Q. Let's just assume from your own group, just from your
11 own group. If someone within your group did something
12 would that child be sent to you by one of the lay
13 helpers?

14 A. Oh yes. Miss [REDACTED] IAQ was the only one, but she
15 always told me anything that happened. Any punishment,
16 anything we were trying to -- like deprive them of
17 anything, we would discuss it together, if she had any
18 problems.

19 Q. If we read on then, he's asked:

20 "Question: Did that happen to you?

21 "Answer: I remember perhaps once and it did the
22 trick, I think.

23 "Question: And what happened when you --

24 "Answer: I was given the belt.

25 "Question: By Sister [REDACTED] EAD

1 "Answer: By Sister EAD and she would tell us why
2 she was giving it.

3 "Question: How was the belt administered?

4 "Answer: It was a slap on the hand.

5 "Question: Once or more than once?

6 "Answer: No more than twice.

7 "Question: You tell us in your statement belt was
8 the Lochgelly tawse?

9 "Answer: It was, yes."

10 This is a witness who was complimentary of the
11 regime and everything that happened at Smyllum, yet he's
12 giving this evidence, sister, that you gave him the
13 belt. Is that true?

14 A. No. I never had the belt -- I never had a belt and
15 I never hit him with anything. I don't know who he is.
16 I don't think -- I don't know who he is.

17 Q. I can perhaps help you on that because we have provided
18 a sort of guide as to who people who have been given
19 pseudonyms might be. I think that's at the front of
20 your folder, if perhaps that could be made available to
21 you. (Handed)

22 LADY SMITH: If you can, just have a look at it. Don't read
23 his name out. Just have a look for yourself.

24 A. Yes.

25 MR MacAULAY: You see the pseudonym "Patrick" and against

1 that there's a name given. Don't read it out, but
2 do you recognise that name?

3 A. No, I don't.

4 Q. What about the next name? Again, the pseudonym is
5 "Rondo".

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You do recognise that name?

8 A. Yes, I do.

9 LADY SMITH: Just going back to the belt, does the name "the
10 Lochgelly tawse" ring any bells with you?

11 A. Yes.

12 LADY SMITH: What was it?

13 A. It was -- I know I never used it. I never had it and
14 I don't know how the children know about it because it
15 was never used on them, as far as I know.

16 LADY SMITH: Who did have it?

17 A. The superior had it in her office.

18 LADY SMITH: Why?

19 A. I don't know. It was there. We all knew about it, but
20 I never saw it being used or heard of it being used.
21 I certainly never had it.

22 LADY SMITH: What would something like that be for?

23 A. I don't know.

24 LADY SMITH: What would its purpose be?

25 A. It was more of a threat than anything, I think. It must

1 have been like, you know -- I don't know. I know
2 I never had it and I never saw it even. I know that
3 when I was there the children never saw it, so I don't
4 know -- you see, that's how he knows about it because
5 they talked about that.

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

7 Mr MacAulay.

8 MR MacAULAY: He is saying that you gave it to him.

9 A. No, no, I did not. Definitely didn't.

10 Q. The other witness then who used the pseudonym Rondo, who
11 you know, if I can take you to a passage or two in his
12 evidence, and that's at TRN.001.002.3685.

13 While we're waiting for that to come up, sister,
14 I can again tell you that this witness was admitted to
15 Smyllum in [REDACTED] 1957 and he left in [REDACTED] 1964, so
16 again he covers your period.

17 A. Mm-hm.

18 Q. If we look then at the section I want you to look at, if
19 you just look at the top of the page, what's put to him
20 is what he said in his statement at paragraph 89:

21 "Question: While you were at Smyllum, you never
22 heard or saw any abuse by the sisters or staff against
23 any of the boys."

24 And he goes on to say:

25 "Answer: The only abuse -- it's not abuse.

1 Corporal punishment was issued, but the other abuse
2 mentioned, definitely not.

3 "Question: We've already talked about bed-wetting
4 and you did see some things?

5 "Answer: Yes.

6 "Question: I don't know if you categorise what you
7 saw as abuse or not, but there was a practice in
8 connection with bed-wetting?

9 "Answer: Yes."

10 And he had given some evidence of having witnessed
11 some practice. Then he is asked:

12 "Question: "But in relation to corporal punishment,
13 there was corporal punishment, I think you tell us.

14 "Answer: Yes.

15 "Question: Can you help me with that? What did it
16 consist of?

17 "Answer: It was the strap, just like you would get
18 in a normal school outside the home. When I went to
19 St Gregory's in Carntyne after I left the school -- and
20 also St Mary's of course -- and just the exact same
21 corporal punishment, the belt.

22 "Question: If someone misbehaved?

23 "Answer: Yes."

24 And on to the next page at 3686 moving to line
25 number 11, he's asked:

1 "Question: But then in relation to doing something
2 wrong, you tell us that you'd get the strap?

3 "Answer: Yes.

4 "Question: You tell us that the sisters carried the
5 strap with them?

6 "Answer: Yes.

7 "Question: How many sisters had a strap?

8 "Answer: I think they all had straps."

9 Now, what is your reaction to that, sister?

10 A. No, that's not true.

11 Q. If we read on at line 19:

12 "Question: When they carried them, where were they
13 carried?

14 "Answer: Up their sleeves.

15 "Question: What you tell us is if something was
16 done wrong then it would be dealt with there and then.
17 If there was a wee fight amongst the boys they would try
18 to break it up, get the boys to shake hands, et cetera,
19 but if it carried on and nobody wanted to stop, then she
20 would bring the strap out.

21 "Question: And what would happen then?

22 "Answer: You would get the strap?

23 "Question: And when you say 'get the strap', what
24 do you mean by that?

25 "Answer: Maybe one or two of the strap.

1 "Question: Where would that be?

2 "Answer: Always on the hand, always.

3 "Question: Never on any other part?

4 "Answer: Never on any part of the body. If they
5 got six with the strap then they were really, really
6 bad, but that rarely happened.

7 "Question: If we look at the sisters you had
8 dealings with, Sister **EAD** did she give out the
9 strap?

10 "Answer: Yes."

11 A. No.

12 Q. Well, he said yes:

13 "Question: Sister **AGI**

14 "Answer: Yes.

15 "Question: And what about Sister **EAC**

16 "Answer: Yes, she would give it out."

17 And so on.

18 So there's another suggestion, sister, that you,
19 leaving aside the other sisters, would also use the
20 strap.

21 A. No. We never had a strap. Definitely.

22 Q. If I can leave transcripts aside now, sister, and
23 perhaps go back to some of the comments you make in your
24 statement. You were asked some questions about a number
25 of different people. I'm not going to look at the

- 1 detail of all these individuals, sister, you'll be
2 pleased to here. Let's look at [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] for
3 example. He was someone you knew during your time at
4 Smyllum?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. You tell us in your statement that you often saw him
7 with the boys in particular --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. -- and that nothing caused you concern --
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. -- in his dealings with the boys?
- 12 A. No.
- 13 Q. Did you ever see him strike a boy?
- 14 A. No, never saw him, no, and I never got any reports on
15 the boys either about being hit or anything by him.
- 16 Q. There has been evidence in this inquiry, as I'm sure
17 you're aware, sister, that [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] could be
18 a violent and vicious man. You've heard that? You know
19 about that?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Did you see any evidence of that?
- 22 A. No. Never saw it.
- 23 Q. Did he have any authority to hit a child?
- 24 A. No, he didn't.
- 25 Q. Did any layperson have any such authority?

1 A. No, they didn't really.

2 Q. Who did?

3 A. I don't know what they did. I didn't hear of anybody

4 doing it.

5 LADY SMITH: Just a minute, what do you mean when you say

6 laypeople didn't really have any authority to discipline

7 a child? Are you accepting that maybe they did do it?

8 A. No, no, but I was thinking about the laypeople helping

9 us in the groups. They wouldn't do it; they would come

10 to you, to the sister in charge, and they would discuss

11 whatever, you know, whatever thing they were doing.

12 LADY SMITH: You've said that a few times, sister. What I'm

13 a bit puzzled about is how that really is the way it

14 worked with children who would need dealt with

15 immediately. It all sounds very measured and as if

16 people took time over deciding exactly what the

17 punishment was going to be for the transgression,

18 whatever it was, being cheeky, uncoupling trains,

19 getting out of control, but surely there were often

20 times that children had to be dealt with there and then;

21 isn't that right?

22 A. It is, but I don't remember about that. I don't know

23 what they did.

24 LADY SMITH: All right.

25 A. No, I don't. I can't ... My mind can't -- I can't just

- 1 think of all that, you know. It's beyond me.
- 2 LADY SMITH: Okay. Thank you.
- 3 MR MacAULAY: In the 1950s and into the 1960s and possibly
4 even beyond, that was an era where corporal
5 punishment -- reasonable chastisement, if you want to
6 call it that -- was acceptable.
- 7 A. That's right, yes.
- 8 Q. Therefore if a child was misbehaving, a slap or a smack
9 may not be seen as unacceptable, depending on the
10 circumstances.
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. You'd agree with that?
- 13 A. I would agree with that, yes.
- 14 Q. But do I take it from what you've said, sister -- and
15 this is what puzzles me a little bit -- that you never,
16 ever saw a child being struck in any way during your
17 seven years at Smyllum?
- 18 A. No, I didn't.
- 19 Q. So far as [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] is concerned, might you have
20 suggested at any point that if any of the bigger boys
21 were misbehaving that [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] would sort them
22 out? Would that be the sort of thing you might say?
- 23 A. Well, he used to talk to them and reason with them.
24 I know he did. He was a good man.
- 25 Q. But is it possible you might have suggested then at some

1 point that if children were misbehaving, bigger boys
2 were misbehaving, [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] would sort them out?

3 A. No. No.

4 Q. That's not something you would say?

5 A. No. No.

6 Q. I think we know that [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] Mr [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED]

7 [REDACTED]

8 A. [REDACTED]

9 Q. [REDACTED]

10 [REDACTED]

11 A. [REDACTED]

12 Q. Perhaps I should ask you this when talking about --
13 because sister, can I say to you, I think you are the
14 most further back sister, if I can put it that way,
15 that is still alive who may tell us about Smyllum.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. I think that is the case.

18 A. That is, yes.

19 Q. One of the sisters who has featured in evidence is
20 a Sister [REDACTED] BAE [REDACTED] or Sister [REDACTED] BAE [REDACTED] was she
21 a sister that you knew?

22 A. No, I didn't know her. I really replaced her.

23 Q. Was she there when you got there?

24 A. No, she had gone.

25 Q. So there was no crossover?

- 1 A. No, no.
- 2 Q. When you say you replaced her, was she then the person
3 who was in charge of the boys' side?
- 4 A. Yes. Yes.
- 5 Q. In your statement, sister, you were asked to comment on
6 a number of persons whose names are put to you. Some
7 I think you recognise, some you don't. For example,
8 Sister [REDACTED] EAC is a name you do remember.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And what you say in your statement is she was kind to
11 children.
- 12 A. Oh she was, yes.
- 13 Q. Did you ever see her strike a child?
- 14 A. No, never.
- 15 Q. Another sister you mention is Sister [REDACTED] ADG
16 is that right?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. I think you tell us that she was really more involved
19 with the girls than the boys.
- 20 A. She was, yes.
- 21 Q. Do you know how she treated the children?
- 22 A. I don't know, but I never heard anything about her.
- 23 Q. Sister [REDACTED] EAA - I think we understand, at least at
24 one point, that Sister [REDACTED] EAA was in charge of the
25 school.

1 A. She was in charge, yes, of the -- we had a primary
2 school on the premises and there were three lay teachers
3 coming in and Sister [REDACTED] EAA was in charge.

4 Q. Was there a time when Sister [REDACTED] EAA who became the
5 superior or not?

6 A. No. I don't think she did, no.

7 Q. I don't propose to go through the detail of a number of
8 allegations that have been put to you under reference to
9 different names, some names you recognise, some you do
10 not.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. But I think your position is that you do not accept any
13 of the allegations that may relate to yourself.

14 A. No, definitely not.

15 Q. In the same way as I've put allegations to you from
16 witnesses who have given evidence to this inquiry, these
17 things you say just did not happen, is that right,
18 sister?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And just coming back to [REDACTED] BAC we have heard
21 evidence from a witness who, according to his own
22 evidence, received a severe beating from [REDACTED] BAC
23 such that he had to spend some time in the infirmary.

24 A. No.

25 Q. Did you --

- 1 A. No, I would know about that.
- 2 Q. You would know about that?
- 3 A. I would know. No.
- 4 Q. So that sort of evidence you would say, it's pure
5 invention, this person has made it up?
- 6 A. I would say it is, yes.
- 7 Q. So sister, if we look at the position in the round,
8 you're aware that allegations have been made about
9 Smyllum and the regime. We've talked about bed-wetting
10 and what it has been alleged the practice
11 was: humiliation; being force-fed; being beaten quite
12 severely on occasions; and, according to some, a regime
13 or system of fear.
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. That's not your recollection in any shape or form?
- 16 A. No, it was a very happy place. As I said before, they
17 were really happy. They might forget that they were,
18 but they were happy times. We were all happy there at
19 that time. There was a lovely atmosphere.
- 20 Q. If it were to be the case, for example, that the sort of
21 bed-wetting practices that I have mentioned to you did
22 happen, would you consider that to be abuse?
- 23 A. I would, yes. Definitely. I wouldn't do -- I wouldn't
24 think of doing that to a child.
- 25 Q. Indeed.

1 A. I wouldn't, no.

2 Q. You would say that would be abuse?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And being force-fed?

5 A. I'd never do that. Never, ever.

6 Q. Would you recognise that as abuse?

7 A. I would, definitely.

8 Q. And severe beatings.

9 A. No, never.

10 Q. Would you look upon these as --

11 A. I would, yes.

12 Q. -- abuse?

13 We've already spoken about records and I just want

14 to be absolutely clear, sister, what the position is.

15 You've told us about the records that you might have

16 kept.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What you don't know now is what happened to these

19 records.

20 A. No.

21 Q. When you came to leave Smyllum in 1964, were the records

22 that you kept still there?

23 A. They were.

24 Q. Do I take it in the office you told us about?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Sister, in the conclusion to your statement you were
2 asked if you can explain why the things I've put to you,
3 that have been put to this inquiry, are being said. Are
4 you in a position to offer any explanation for that?

5 A. Well, I think I said -- I changed my mind about what
6 I said the first time, but I've changed my mind since
7 hearing about the things that happened through the
8 hearing here. And I think that the reason is that they
9 were all very hurt by things that happened to them in
10 their childhood, being taken from their parents, and as
11 they got older, they had to blame somebody for this.
12 I think that's the way -- to me, this is what it looks
13 like. Someone had to be blamed and we were the obvious
14 people who were looking after them.

15 I know -- like, the children used to say to me
16 sometimes, "If you weren't here, we wouldn't be here".
17 I think they meant by that that their parents would get
18 them back, would have them back home if we weren't
19 there, and they blamed us in a way, like if we weren't
20 there, they wouldn't be there. That's what I think has
21 brought a lot of those to say the things they have about
22 us. We were the obvious people to blame because it
23 looked to them as if we had taken them from their
24 parents. That's the way I think about it.

25 Q. It could be said as against that, just to see what your

1 reaction to this might be, sister, that if the
2 environment at Smyllum was as happy as you've said it
3 was, then that in a sense would, as it were, contradict
4 or knock down, if you like, any suggestion that somehow
5 you are to blame for their position.

6 A. Yes. I was just trying to make out why all this has
7 come about, you know, why did they bring this all up and
8 why didn't they do it long ago. 40 years ago they could
9 have complained about it. I don't know. But I think
10 that's what it is, just because they were all so hurt
11 and they kind of had to blame somebody.

12 LADY SMITH: But sister, quite a number of these witnesses
13 have been very careful to make it clear that not all the
14 nuns they encountered were abusive towards them.

15 A. Yes.

16 LADY SMITH: And that there were individuals who were kind
17 and gentle to them. They've been quite discriminating
18 in their evidence and keen to get that across. So
19 you're not talking about 50-odd people coming along and
20 all of them saying everything was terrible and everyone
21 was terrible and everybody abused me.

22 A. No.

23 LADY SMITH: So when you take account of that picture, it
24 doesn't really seem so capable of explanation as being
25 they're looking for an institution to blame wholesale

1 for them not having been brought up at home, does it?

2 A. I could be wrong, but that's the way I think about it,

3 that that might have been the cause. I don't know.

4 I don't know.

5 LADY SMITH: On a different matter, while I'm asking you

6 some questions, what happened if a child was

7 a Protestant?

8 A. We didn't have anybody coming in ...

9 LADY SMITH: You had nobody of a Protestant background?

10 A. We didn't have, as far as I know.

11 LADY SMITH: What if they were Jewish?

12 A. They would probably go to another -- to another place

13 where they could be looked after, run by Jews or

14 whatever.

15 LADY SMITH: And if not, if a child who was Jewish came into

16 Smyllum, would any effort be made to accommodate their

17 family religion?

18 A. No, I would think that that would be well discussed

19 before they would come, that they would really get them

20 into their own environment and religion before they

21 approached us. I think that was the way it worked at

22 that time.

23 LADY SMITH: You would need to, wouldn't you?

24 A. Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: Because the child would be entitled --

1 A. Yes.

2 LADY SMITH: -- to have those caring for the child to have
3 very careful regard to their own particular religious
4 background --

5 A. Yes.

6 LADY SMITH: -- if it wasn't a Catholic one.

7 A. I wasn't in a position at that time to make any of those
8 decisions. But I could imagine that, you know, that
9 they would have just brought the Catholics there.

10 LADY SMITH: I see, thank you.

11 MR MacAULAY: The final point I want to raise with you,
12 sister, and this is something you touch upon in the
13 second last paragraph of your statement, where you say:
14 "I am told that some people have told the inquiry
15 that they are still affected today by the abuse they
16 suffered in Smyllum, that they have ongoing effects of
17 what happened to them in Smyllum."

18 And you're asked whether you can explain that.
19 We have had evidence, sister, from people who talk about
20 nightmares and so on and so forth following upon their
21 experience at Smyllum. Do you have any explanation for
22 that at all?

23 A. No, I can't, no. No.

24 Q. Can I just ask you about one final thing, in fact.

25 We have heard evidence from a particular witness who

1 said that he was sexually abused by bigger boys when
2 he was at Smyllum and that in due course this conduct
3 was discovered and the boys concerned were punished and
4 the punishment involved being in the gymnasium with
5 children and nuns from Smyllum being present.

6 Do you have any recollection of that?

7 A. No.

8 Q. And that [REDACTED] BAC was involved in the punishment.

9 A. Never heard about it, no, no.

10 MR MacAULAY: Very well, sister. I have no written requests
11 for questions to be submitted, my Lady, and I don't know
12 if there are to be any questions.

13 LADY SMITH: Let me just check whether there are any other
14 applications for questions. Are there any outstanding
15 applications for questions of this witness? No.

16 Thank you very much, Sister Carol. There are no
17 more questions for you and we are able to let you go.
18 I'm sure it's been a very tiring morning. We are
19 grateful to you for coming along and I hope that you are
20 able to rest for the rest of the day.

21 A. Thank you, my Lady.

22 (The witness withdrew)

23 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, that takes us nicely up to 12.58.

24 LADY SMITH: Yes, it's almost 1 o'clock. We'll stop now for
25 the lunch break and sit again at 2 o'clock, please.

1 (12.58 pm)

2 (The lunch adjournment)

3 (2.00 pm)

4 LADY SMITH: Yes, Mr MacAulay.

5 MR MacAULAY: Good afternoon, my Lady. The next witness is
6 a witness who has been granted anonymity and wants to
7 use the name "Sister Nora O'Sullivan" in giving her
8 evidence.

9 There are no allegations against this sister, so
10 there is no need for a warning, my Lady.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

12 "SISTER NORA O'SULLIVAN" (sworn)

13 Questions from MR MacAULAY

14 LADY SMITH: Can I just check, these papers you have brought
15 with you, what are they?

16 A. It's my documents.

17 LADY SMITH: You don't need to worry about your own because
18 Mr MacAulay will direct you to the red file as and
19 that's necessary and will be putting up on the screen
20 the text that you'll be referred to as you go along as
21 well.

22 A. Would you prefer that?

23 LADY SMITH: I think rather than getting confused between
24 different documents, that's okay -- but if you've made
25 yourself a note or something that you want to refer to

- 1 at any time, we can deal with that.
- 2 A. Okay, thank you.
- 3 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.
- 4 MR MacAULAY: Good afternoon to you, sister. For your
5 evidence, I will refer to you as "Sister Nora". I want
6 to begin by looking at your statement and in particular
7 I want to take you to the last page of the statement.
8 I want to give the reference for the transcript and it's
9 WIT.003.001.0795. We're looking at page 0823. Can
10 I ask you to confirm, sister, that you have signed the
11 statement?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And do you tell us that the last paragraph that:
14 "I believe the facts stated in this witness
15 statement are true as I perceived them from my memory of
16 56 years and 44 years ago."
- 17 A. That's right.
- 18 Q. You also tell us that you have no objection to your
19 witness statement being published as part of the
20 evidence of the inquiry.
- 21 A. That's right.
- 22 Q. Sister, I don't need to know your date of birth, but
23 just to get some context can I just confirm with you
24 that your year of birth is 1938.
- 25 A. Nineteen?

1 Q. 1938.

2 A. That's right.

3 Q. And I think now you're 79; is that correct?

4 A. That's right, yes.

5 Q. You tell us, sister, that you joined the Daughters of
6 Charity of St Vincent de Paul in 1956; is that right?

7 A. That's right.

8 Q. And what I'll do is I'll put your ministry statement on
9 the screen and we can perhaps just quickly have that.
10 That's at WIT.003.001.0616.

11 A. Just explain to me what that is. Where is that from?

12 Q. This is a document that I understand has been made
13 available to us by the Daughters of Charity, setting out
14 your history as a sister --

15 A. That's okay.

16 Q. -- or at least has been put together from information
17 supplied to us and you can tell me if it's right or
18 wrong.

19 Can we see, for example, that the first entry
20 we have is:
21 "1958. St Anthony's Hatton. Care of girls"?

22 Do you see that?

23 A. That's right.

24 Q. Was that really where you began?

25 A. That's where I began.

- 1 Q. Care of girls, was that in some form of home?
- 2 A. It was, yes.
- 3 Q. What age of girls are we talking about?
- 4 A. They were from about 5 to 15.
- 5 Q. Then we see reference to Smyllum, 1958 to 1961; is that
- 6 correct?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 Q. That's what I'll be asking you about. Can we see that,
- 9 again, your ministry is described as "care of girls"?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. And you were then in the Provincial House and you did
- 12 a childcare course between 1961 and 1962.
- 13 A. That's right.
- 14 Q. You then have a period of about nine years or so in
- 15 Enfield. When you talk about a "family group home",
- 16 were you dealing with children there?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And then 1971 to 1972, you mention Heaton in Newcastle;
- 19 is that St Vincent's, Newcastle?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Are these next three entries then in connection with
- 22 being at St Vincent's in Newcastle?
- 23 A. No, not all of them, no.
- 24 Q. Which ones?
- 25 A. The first one is -- I was not in a family group home,

1 I was in leadership for the first 13 months. I thought
2 it was 1972 to 1973. I don't think I was there for
3 1971.

4 Q. Okay. But you are Sister Servant and that means you are
5 in leadership?

6 A. Yes. And I was responsible for the community and
7 just the service --

8 Q. And not the children?

9 A. Not the children -- well, I was responsible for the
10 sisters who cared for the children.

11 Q. Yes. Can we go to the time when you went to Smyllum.
12 As you've confirmed, you went to Smyllum in 1958.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And you were there for three years until 1961?

15 A. That's right.

16 Q. It was after you'd been at Smyllum that you did the
17 residential care course; is that correct?

18 A. That is correct.

19 Q. And did you find that beneficial?

20 A. Sorry, just say that again.

21 Q. Did you find the care course to be of benefit?

22 A. Oh yes, it was brilliant, yes, it was really good.

23 Q. In what way?

24 A. Every way. I suppose it just set me on a journey that
25 was, I suppose, so much more positive than I had

1 expected, first of all. It took me out of -- I suppose
2 any training that I would see myself in is withdrawal
3 from your everyday work and it's just so -- it was so
4 good, informative. It just helped me to have a whole
5 different view on childcare generally.

6 Q. You had no training, am I right in saying, before you
7 went to Smyllum?

8 A. Not formal.

9 Q. You had, I understand, been working with children, but,
10 as you've indicated, you had no formal training in
11 connection with childcare?

12 A. No formal training; family training.

13 Q. Of course when you say family training, do you mean by
14 that you'd come from a large family yourself?

15 A. That's right.

16 Q. When you went to Smyllum, can you remember who the
17 sister in charge was?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Who was that?

20 A. It was Sister BAF

21 Q. Did that change during your time at Smyllum?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Looking to the dates, if you were born in 1938 and you
24 went to Smyllum in 1958, you were quite young, 20 or so.

25 A. Yes, I was very young.

1 LADY SMITH: Was that pretty routine for nuns joining the
2 staff at Smyllum?

3 A. I'm not too sure about joining the staff, but generally
4 it would have been for the community, yes. I entered
5 when I was 18 and I had my two-year training.

6 LADY SMITH: So late teens, 20, early twenties would be a
7 pretty routine stage of your life to go there, was it?

8 A. Yes, it was, yes.

9 MR MacAULAY: And when you got to Smyllum then, just looking
10 at the set-up, am I right in thinking that there was
11 a boys' side and a girls' side?

12 A. That's right.

13 Q. That was a clear division, was it, between boys and
14 girls?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So far as you were concerned then, I think your function
17 was to be caring for girls; is that right?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Can you just help me with that then? Looking to the
20 nature of the girls you were caring for, can you give me
21 an understanding of who they were, ages and so on?

22 A. Yes. They were from about 3 to 8 or 9, is my memory of
23 it, and they were there when I arrived. I think they
24 were still there when I left.

25 Q. Well, although the ages would have changed, of course.

- 1 A. Well, naturally, yes.
- 2 Q. But I think what you say in your statement is there was
3 a group of about 12 girls.
- 4 A. There was a group of 12 girls, yes, children, young
5 children.
- 6 Q. Of the age group that you mentioned, about 3 to 8 or 9;
7 is that right?
- 8 A. Uh-huh.
- 9 Q. Can you tell me how it was that these children were
10 selected for this particular group of 12 or so?
- 11 A. Well, in Smyllum at that time I think it was all by
12 arrangement of age groups, whether they were boys or
13 girls. There was the nursery, which was separate, quite
14 separate -- it was quite big -- and then I think they
15 came from the nursery to me. I think I may have had --
16 I only remember two coming from the nursery. And
17 I think they must have come via the nursery to the unit
18 that I had.
- 19 Q. Then as they got older, even during your time, did they
20 leave the unit?
- 21 A. They did and they moved on to the other -- from what
22 I remember, I think there were three groups.
- 23 Q. Your group seems to have been quite a small group.
- 24 A. I was constantly being told it was exceptionally small.
- 25 Q. Well, if we try and get some idea as to how many girls

1 there might have been at Smyllum at around this time, if
2 you look at SGV.001.001.0422. We're looking at the
3 particulars to be sent to the Scottish Education
4 Department. We needn't look at the date, but this is
5 dated December 1962. So it's covering that particular
6 period. Can you see, if you look at section 7, that
7 according to the particulars, including children who are
8 aged 2 but not yet 5, that there were 127 boys and
9 92 girls. Do you see that?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. The 92 is for the girls?

12 A. At the bottom, yes.

13 Q. So that gives us an understanding at that time, which is
14 a couple of years -- two or three years after you were
15 there, that the numbers are of that level.

16 A. That was just one year after I left.

17 Q. That was 1962.

18 A. Mm-hm.

19 Q. And I think, as I understood you, you said you were
20 there in 1968. This is really a year -- sorry?

21 A. You said --

22 LADY SMITH: 1958. 1958 to 1961.

23 MR MacAULAY: Yes, you're right.

24 So this was for the period of the year just after
25 you left.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. But we can see that, unless there was a significant
3 change in the numbers, that we're talking about 90 or so
4 girls, of whom 12 were in your group; is that correct,
5 sister?
- 6 A. That would have been right, yes.
- 7 Q. And the others then that were not in the nursery would
8 be in the other groups?
- 9 A. The others who were -- say that again?
- 10 Q. The other girls would be -- there may have been girls in
11 the nursery, but leaving the nursery aside, the other
12 girls who were there would be in the other two groups
13 you mentioned?
- 14 A. Oh yes, they would have been, yes.
- 15 Q. In that context, it does appear that your group was
16 a very small group.
- 17 A. Yes, it was.
- 18 Q. Was there a sister who was in charge of all the girls?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Who was that?
- 21 A. I think it was [REDACTED] ADG
- 22 Q. I think you say [REDACTED] ADG in your statement.
- 23 A. Sister [REDACTED] ADG yes.
- 24 Q. How did that work then?
- 25 A. My unit seemed to be quite a distance from the others,

1 and then on the left of my group, in a little house, it
2 seemed, but in the environment, there were the young
3 boys, and then over to the left they were surrounded by
4 the three groups of girls -- there could have been two,
5 I'm not sure.

6 Q. Right, okay.

7 A. And yes, but they would have been -- and they had two
8 sisters with Sister **ADG** looking after them.

9 Q. So --

10 A. They were divided into groups, but I wouldn't be able to
11 tell you what they were like. I really don't know.

12 Q. Can you remember the names of any of the other sisters
13 who may have had some responsibility for these other
14 groups?

15 A. If I had it written down, I probably would be able to
16 tell you. I'm not great with names. I knew one of
17 them, I think, I don't think I ... Can I look?

18 Q. Yes, of course, absolutely. We're looking at that part
19 of your statement -- it's paragraph 11 onwards.

20 A. Yes, I just ...

21 Q. You do mention Sister **AGI** and Sister **EAD** but
22 they were on the boys' side.

23 A. Yes, they were. There were two younger sisters anyway,
24 and I think one left the community during the time I was
25 there, so I'm not -- I have a confusion about that.

1 Q. When you came to leave in 1961, did another sister
2 replace you?

3 A. I have no idea.

4 Q. Can I ask you to look at a photograph? It is
5 DSV.001.001.4661.

6 A. Oh yes.

7 Q. You can see this is an aerial photograph of Smyllum.
8 You tell us in your statement, sister, that to begin
9 with the group that you took over were known as "the
10 Lofties"; is that right?

11 A. That's right.

12 Q. That was changed during your time to St Theresa's?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. If we look at this plan, can you -- if you see towards
15 the bottom right, can we just go down a bit? There's
16 a box, a little box, that says "St Theresa's (Lofties)".
17 And there's a yellow line pointing to that. Is that
18 accurate?

19 A. I'm not sure. You know, when I did that, I just saw
20 it -- that's the most likely place. I think it is.

21 Q. You told us about the training you had after you had
22 been at Smyllum, but did you have any induction or any
23 form of introduction to Smyllum when you got there?

24 A. No.

25 Q. One thing you do say in your statement -- and it's

1 something I think you repeat on more than one
2 occasion -- is that your little group of children really
3 was quite a distinct and separate group within Smyllum;
4 is that right?

5 A. I thought they were.

6 Q. Apart from yourself, was there anybody else involved
7 with the group?

8 A. Oh, I had two of the girls who used to come from the
9 group, from Sister [REDACTED] ADG [REDACTED] group. They were about
10 14, going on 15, I think, and they used to come and help
11 me.

12 Q. So two older girls from Smyllum?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. So what did you see your duties, responsibilities to be
15 then at this time?

16 A. A mother, a mother figure. A friend. I was young and
17 active. What else? I was in charge of the group.

18 Q. To whom did you answer at that time?

19 A. To Sister [REDACTED] BAF [REDACTED] direct.

20 Q. What about Sister [REDACTED] ADG [REDACTED] who you mentioned also?

21 A. She was very much, you know, on the periphery for me
22 because I think Sister [REDACTED] BAF [REDACTED] was my contact person --
23 and I only depended on her to get as far as the
24 television mostly. That was what I remember anyway.

25 Q. You mentioned that children might come up from the

1 nursery to your group and you thought that might have
2 happened on one or two occasions.

3 A. Yes, I think it was about two.

4 Q. Two occasions?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And children, as they got older, would move into other
7 groups?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. So do I take it from that that generally speaking, over
10 your period of three years or so, your group remained
11 quite constant in numbers at least?

12 A. Yes. I think once it went up to 14, but it could have
13 been during that change time when the children came --
14 the few came from ... and two children also came from
15 outwith the unit into care. I only got them, you know,
16 as part of the group.

17 Q. Can I ask you a little bit about the accommodation then
18 that you had for the girls? What was the set-up?

19 A. Well, from memory, we were upstairs. It was the full
20 length of -- I thought it was that way (indicates), but
21 I haven't got a great sense of direction. There was an
22 area that had two tables and so we put them together,
23 and that was their dining room. Then they had a big
24 area which was their play area. I think on the left of
25 that was their dormitory and in the corner was my room.

1 Q. And was there just the one dormitory for all the girls?

2 A. Well, it was divided, but I don't think it was up to the
3 ceiling. I think it was that kind of a division.

4 Q. Okay. So far as -- if I can ask you a bit about some
5 aspects of the routine then. You tell us you didn't do
6 your own cooking.

7 A. No.

8 Q. The food came from the kitchen?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You ate in your section?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. The 12, or whatever number it might have been, you ate
13 in your own dining section?

14 A. We, did yes.

15 Q. I think you told us it was just the two tables that had
16 been put together to form that function; is that
17 correct?

18 A. It probably didn't happen straightaway --

19 LADY SMITH: Just to be clear, there was a big kitchen that
20 cooked the food for all the units, was there?

21 A. No, no. There were two kitchens: one was on the boys'
22 side and the other was right down on the ground floor,
23 I think, somewhere underneath us probably.

24 LADY SMITH: So did each of these kitchens cook for
25 a multiplicity of groups --

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 LADY SMITH: -- at that time?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 LADY SMITH: Because I think it maybe changed later on to
5 cooking being done --
- 6 A. In the units.
- 7 LADY SMITH: -- in the group premises.
- 8 MR MacAULAY: And so far as the food was concerned, sister,
9 what is your recollection of the standard of the food?
- 10 A. Well, my recollection was that it was a bit like home
11 because there was a garden where there were vegetables
12 and we seemed to have fresh vegetables, mince and things
13 like that -- easy food for the children is what
14 I remembered. And also I suppose it was just so much
15 like what my family had at that point in time. So it
16 wasn't a huge change for me. It was probably a huge
17 change for some of the children though.
- 18 Q. Did you find on occasion that children required to be
19 encouraged to eat their food?
- 20 A. Yes. I would say probably most. Most of the energy
21 that I would have put into the children, like in the
22 caring side of it, I often felt was to do with
23 encouraging them to eat what we had and what we got,
24 because I don't think -- well, I found that they were
25 unfamiliar with it.

- 1 Q. How would you encourage them?
- 2 A. Plead with them. You know, beg them. Tell them we were
3 going to go for a walk afterwards. And maybe just take,
4 you know, a little bit from the plate for them, just to
5 get used to it, until they -- until they did get used to
6 it, at least I think they did. But I think -- like, for
7 me, food wasn't one of the biggest issues of the
8 environment because I found that the children were
9 hungry and that they ate and that it was okay.
- 10 Q. The inquiry has heard evidence -- and I'm not suggesting
11 you yourself were directly involved in this -- there
12 were children who were forced to eat food. Did you have
13 any knowledge of that during your time at Smyllum?
- 14 A. I didn't have any knowledge of it, no. I mean, I would
15 hope that that didn't happen, but I couldn't say it
16 didn't. I don't know.
- 17 Q. The other aspect of life at Smyllum I want to ask you
18 about is bed-wetting. Were there bed-wetters within
19 your group of children?
- 20 A. I can't remember any of the bed-wetters, which I think
21 I said in the statement I found really strange. But
22 yes, there possibly was. I would know that like there'd
23 be the smell of urine from some of them from time to
24 time -- it might have been their knickers were wet or
25 something. So I didn't.

1 Q. Did you know of any practices in relation to bed-wetting
2 that might have been followed in other parts of Smyllum
3 during your time there?

4 A. I wasn't aware of them, so I don't really know.

5 Q. One suggestion the inquiry -- one of the suggestions the
6 inquiry has heard is in connection with cold baths. As
7 far as Smyllum is concerned, were you at any point aware
8 of any child who may have wet the bed having to have
9 a cold bath?

10 A. I really wasn't aware of it in Smyllum, but I had been
11 a year in Rosewell prior to entering the community, and,
12 yes, I remember not so much cold baths as washing the
13 child with cold water. But they would have been in the
14 bath, so maybe it was coldish, you know, but yes, cold.
15 And yeah, I think it was one of the things that I really
16 learned about the effects of urine on children's skin,
17 the effects of -- it burns, it burned their skin if they
18 weren't washed, and the warm water would leave the
19 smell, the hot water especially would leave the smell on
20 the children's body because they had been lying on it
21 often. That was from Rosewell that I learned that. So
22 I used to tell the children that if we didn't wash
23 ourselves properly, then they would be smelling. So I'd
24 be encouraging themselves to wash themselves anyway.

25 LADY SMITH: I don't understand that. If you used soap,

1 that will remove any residue of urine, or indeed
2 anything else on the skin, so there won't be a smell.
3 Why does the water have to be cold?
4 A. It probably didn't, but it was a practice maybe at the
5 time that I was ...
6 LADY SMITH: Of course you were very young and you hadn't
7 had your training at that time.
8 A. Well, I had some training but I didn't have my training,
9 no. I think that -- I have learned since also that cold
10 water is really helpful in those situations because it's
11 not just the water, it's the towel you use.
12 LADY SMITH: Sorry, the what?
13 A. The towel. The face towel that you would use --
14 LADY SMITH: Right.
15 A. -- and that it clears the urine. And, yes, soap would
16 be used, but that was very hard soap at the time also,
17 and if soap was left on their bodies, that would also
18 not be helpful for the children.
19 LADY SMITH: No, you wouldn't leave it on; you'd see it was
20 rinsed off, wouldn't you?
21 A. Yes, but we were encouraging children to wash themselves
22 as well. You're right, I mean, I haven't an argument
23 about it or a debate about it because I really believe
24 it in myself.
25 MR MacAULAY: I suppose the question is whether -- you tell

1 us about the cold baths at Rosewell. You're clear that
2 there were cold baths if you wet the bed at Rosewell.
3 You're clear about that?

4 A. I suppose ... I haven't reflected on that that much,
5 but it was just a training that was given me by a member
6 of the -- one of the nursing community at the time and
7 so I used it. I am not too clear whether I would put
8 some warm water into it or not, but I did wash the
9 children often in Rosewell, so in the light of that I'm
10 reflecting back. But I think what I'm wanting to say
11 is that it wasn't a huge issue with me or with the
12 children that I had, so maybe I'm reflecting on much
13 further things than that, you know, onwards rather than
14 backwards.

15 Q. We're distinguishing, I hope, between Smyllum and
16 Rosewell, and you've been telling me about Rosewell. As
17 you say in your statement:

18 "I know that in Rosewell the children did have cold
19 water baths."

20 That's what you tell us.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. You have put forward an explanation that you consider
23 might indicate why that might be, but in relation to
24 Smyllum and the children that you looked after, did they
25 have cold baths if they wet the bed?

1 A. No. I wouldn't have seen that as something that
2 happened.

3 Q. I suppose it depends on how you look on the cold baths,
4 whether you look upon it, as you've been suggesting, as
5 a way of dealing with the problem or as a punishment.

6 A. Never as a punishment. I would be clear about that.
7 I just don't understand baths -- bed-wetting as
8 a punishment generally because it wasn't something I had
9 experienced, nor something that I ever used, and
10 something -- except, you know, arguing with children who
11 were really nasty to other children about bed-wetting
12 and smelling and, you know, that was really more or less
13 what I found myself doing.

14 Q. Did you have that in Smyllum that there could be
15 children who would be nasty to other children about --

16 A. I didn't notice it with the little ones at all.
17 I suppose that's one of the reasons why I'm not too
18 clear as to whether we did have any -- and I don't
19 remember any experience of some of things that I've read
20 as happening to us with me at the time.

21 LADY SMITH: You have just referred to arguing with children
22 who were nasty to other children about bed-wetting.

23 A. In Rosewell.

24 LADY SMITH: You were being asked about Smyllum. Are you
25 talking about Rosewell here or is this Smyllum?

1 A. I was looking up at the stuff. It has nothing to do
2 with Smyllum. There was no arguing with the children in
3 Smyllum.

4 LADY SMITH: So that's something that happened in Rosewell,
5 not in Smyllum?

6 A. Yes.

7 LADY SMITH: As a matter of interest, was that you arguing
8 with the children in Rosewell?

9 A. Yes. I would be telling them that there wasn't really
10 the right thing to do and to be kind to each other.

11 LADY SMITH: Is that arguing?

12 A. Well, I'm using my language that I --

13 LADY SMITH: I'm trying to understand what you want me to
14 get from that.

15 A. I don't know what you want to get from it. I've used
16 the word, it might be out of context, so I can't really
17 take it back.

18 LADY SMITH: All right.

19 MR MacAULAY: But Rosewell, so we can understand, it was the
20 Daughters of Charity who were involved in Rosewell with
21 the children?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Whatever one might say about cold baths, what I want to
24 ask you is whether you ever saw children being paraded
25 with sheets either on their heads or round about them.

- 1 Did you ever see anything like that at Smyllum during
2 your time?
- 3 A. No, I didn't.
- 4 Q. Just staying with washing and bathing, again looking to
5 your group, how was that organised?
- 6 A. Well, we had two baths, from what I remember, and
7 I suppose getting to know the children, I learned that
8 some were getting a bit older and wanting to be a little
9 bit more independent, so I divided them and left the
10 older girls, which were probably 7 to 9, you know, to
11 have their own bath and they could bath themselves. I'm
12 assuming I did supervise them, but I don't have -- you
13 know, they washed and they dried themselves and dressed
14 themselves. So yes -- and I washed some of the younger
15 children.
- 16 Q. And I think you do tell us that children would share
17 bath water.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. What about the temperature of the water?
- 20 A. That would always be warm water.
- 21 Q. Chores, did the children in your group require to do any
22 chores or not?
- 23 A. I have no recollection of ever having to do that.
- 24 Q. Some of them were very young, of course.
- 25 A. They were, yes.

- 1 Q. But the older ones?
- 2 A. They'd probably help, maybe encouraging them to make
3 their beds, you know, little things like that, or if
4 they wanted to help themselves, help themselves in the
5 unit, yeah, I'd give them all the encouragement that
6 I could to go ahead and do it.
- 7 Q. Can I ask you this, sister: what contact did the
8 children in your quite discrete group have with other
9 children within Smyllum?
- 10 A. Mostly from school. Very little otherwise, except when
11 we went and watched the television. It was quite
12 separate and we used to do things ourselves like go out
13 for walks, you know, they could play, they had their own
14 area for play downstairs where they could play for
15 hours.
- 16 Q. Within your --
- 17 A. Within the area, yes, within -- I'm not too clear what
18 it looked like. I have no recollection, actually.
- 19 Q. The impression I get from what you've been telling us,
20 sister, and indeed from reading your statement, is you
21 were very much a discrete group of children within this
22 other large establishment that was Smyllum.
- 23 A. I think I might have seen that myself because rather
24 than -- maybe Smyllum itself didn't see me like that,
25 but I felt both -- they called them "the wee boys" and

1 "the wee girls", which were the two units -- were
2 separate to the other groups, so when they came home,
3 they had their own space. When they went to school,
4 they were from the unit to school, and I have never any
5 recollection of bringing them up to school or anything
6 like that, but maybe the two girls might have helped to
7 do that, I'm not sure, because it was up the hill.

8 Q. Can I ask you this: to your knowledge, would children in
9 your group have siblings that were in other parts of
10 Smyllum?

11 A. I'm assuming in the light of my reflections, yes, but
12 I didn't really know at the time.

13 Q. So where does that take us in connection with, let's
14 say, arranging contact between --

15 A. There wasn't. Except I am assuming that it did happen
16 in school though because they would have been near each
17 other and meeting each other, but I wasn't aware of it.

18 Q. And you're assuming, I think, there that any siblings
19 might have been at the primary school rather than
20 secondary school?

21 A. Oh yes.

22 Q. Children did go to the secondary school, of course.
23 Children did go from Smyllum to the secondary school?

24 A. They did, yes.

25 Q. But I think, looking at what you've been telling us

1 about your group, because of the ages, those that were
2 going to school would be going to the primary school?

3 A. They all went to Smyllum school, yes.

4 Q. And those that were preschool, what would happen about
5 them?

6 A. I had them during the day. There were only three or
7 four, possibly, even then.

8 Q. If they had siblings at the primary school, there really
9 would be no scope for contact?

10 A. No. There was no contact.

11 Q. So far as birthdays would be concerned, sister, can you
12 tell me about that? To what extent, if at all, were
13 birthdays celebrated?

14 A. No. Well, birthdays weren't celebrated with cards and
15 presents, but -- I liked birthdays, so I used to ask
16 Sister HBP if I could have a sponge cake for the
17 birthdays and I used to stick a candle in the middle and
18 we'd all sing "Happy Birthday".

19 Q. So you'd do that, you'd celebrate birthdays to that
20 extent?

21 A. Oh yes.

22 Q. But no cards or presents?

23 A. Not that I'm aware of.

24 Q. And Christmas?

25 A. Oh, Christmas was different, yes. Christmas was the

1 time when the children went to Glasgow for an outing.
2 It's the only time in the year they did have the outing
3 that I was aware of, other than the holiday. So --
4 I suppose I was helped to divide them the first time
5 into three groups, so I had about five, four or five
6 each time. And we went into Glasgow.

7 All I remember is that I got the money to get to
8 Glasgow, but then I was given money by people who felt
9 sorry for us, basically, and who thought the children
10 were lovely and then we went to this -- I don't remember
11 the name of the shop or anything, but the fifth floor is
12 all I remember, up on the top floor, and it was just
13 full of toys and stuff.

14 They used to just spend all the time that they
15 needed there. After the first time out when I realised
16 that it was there, we went there straightaway each time
17 because they played with lots of the stuff -- they could
18 sit on tricycles and cycle around and they also got
19 chosen then to buy their own presents.

20 Q. Were presents then bought for the children?

21 A. They chose them and we bought them.

22 Q. Again, we're looking at your own discrete group when
23 you're telling us about this?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Would they keep the presents after Christmas?

1 A. Oh yes, yes. They would be little presents, you know,
2 like colouring books and crayons and stories, if they
3 took a fancy to a book, and a little doll. They weren't
4 big presents from what I remember, anyway.

5 Q. In your statement, sister, you talk about the death of
6 the boy we know to be Francis McColl. Were you on that
7 trip when that boy had an accident?

8 A. On that trip? No, that was a holiday, the holiday trip.
9 Was that his name, Francis McColl? I don't know the
10 child's name.

11 Q. I'm looking at your statement on paragraph 57. You
12 begin by saying:

13 "It was 1960 or 1961 in Aberfoyle. My memory of
14 it is that two of the priests from Lanark came and
15 played golf with the lads."

16 Are you talking about an incident where a child was
17 hit?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. I think we know separately that that was Francis McColl,
20 who was clearly not in your group. I just wondered, if
21 you were on that trip, what were you doing on that trip
22 with your group?

23 A. We were enjoying the holiday.

24 Q. Was the whole --

25 A. The whole -- I think we had something like three buses

1 that went all at the same time. We went to Aberfoyle
2 and it was an army camp, it had been an army camp,
3 I think.

4 Q. But you're aware that there was an incident then
5 involving --

6 A. Oh yes.

7 Q. Did you witness the incident?

8 A. No, I didn't witness, but I was in the hearing of it,
9 from my memory, anyway. I was conscious of a child
10 being hit by one of the priests who came to show them
11 how to play golf and I was interested in golf myself,
12 but I wasn't able to leave the children so I wasn't that
13 near -- in fact, I couldn't see because it was quite
14 a distance over, like it was a huge area of play area.

15 Q. I was interested in your reference to priests because do
16 you say that there were priests involved at this point
17 in time?

18 A. I'm assuming that there was because -- I think it was
19 two priests, but I'm not sure about that. Then if
20 I didn't say two priests, I thought it was two that came
21 out for the day to enjoy the time with the children.

22 Q. Do you know what involvement, if any, they had in the
23 golfing that was going on?

24 A. I thought it was the priest was showing some of the boys
25 how to play golf and that the child came from behind and

1 as he hit the stick, it hit the child's head and he
2 dropped.

3 Q. I think what you're suggesting is that you thought it
4 was the priest who used the golf club.

5 A. I did.

6 Q. Can I ask you a little bit, sister, about what you say
7 in paragraph 61 of your statement, where clearly you've
8 had some discussion with the person taking the statement
9 about children from Smyllum having unmarked graves.

10 A. Mm-hm.

11 Q. And you go on to say that:

12 "I found it incredible that anyone would talk about
13 mass graves."

14 Do you see that? I just want to understand what you
15 meant by that.

16 A. Where did I say they don't talk about ...

17 Q. Paragraph 61. Just take a chance to read that.

18 A. I didn't know about children and unmarked graves in
19 Smyllum. I didn't know about that until the inquiry.

20 I did grow up knowing -- an awareness of a paupers'
21 grave at home, and then I felt it was wrong and unfair
22 and unjust for the statements that came out about
23 Smyllum and the mass graves. So, yes, I didn't think
24 that was right.

25 Q. Just so I can understand, what didn't you think was

- 1 right?
- 2 A. That that should have been said because I wouldn't have
3 thought it was true.
- 4 Q. So you don't accept -- I think what you're saying is,
5 and correct me if I'm wrong, you don't believe there was
6 a mass grave, whatever that may mean, at St Mary's
7 cemetery near Smyllum?
- 8 A. Well, yes, because I had witnessed mass graves in
9 Ethiopia.
- 10 Q. A mass grave, I think you're postulating, is when you
11 put a number of bodies into the same place at the same
12 time; is that correct?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. And that's not being suggested?
- 15 A. That's not only when they die -- we've had it more
16 recently as well on television that bodies are picked
17 up, put together, and then put into a mass grave without
18 any knowledge of really who's there, more or less, and
19 I did witness that.
- 20 Q. Do you know if we have any knowledge of where any
21 children buried at the cemetery may be? They may be
22 there, but can we identify where they are to your
23 knowledge?
- 24 A. I'm assuming that they must because -- well, as far as
25 I'm aware, nobody can die without a doctor certifying

1 the death. I wouldn't know if that was -- I wouldn't
2 imagine that it was any different in the 1960s -- 1950s
3 and 1960s than it is now and that they all had -- they
4 were named people and there would be some record
5 somewhere of them dying.

6 Q. And where they're buried?

7 A. Of course.

8 Q. Can we leave that then and look at what you tell us in
9 your statement about visitors coming to Smyllum. Did
10 you have much experience of that, visitors coming to see
11 the children in your group?

12 A. In my group there was only one time we had a visit from
13 a mother and a grandmother to see one of the little
14 girls, yes. I just assumed they were coming to take her
15 home and it didn't happen.

16 Q. When you say you assumed, did someone suggest --

17 A. No, no, I assumed it.

18 Q. It was just an assumption you made?

19 A. Yes, I thought it was just the natural thing for a child
20 with parents coming, but they came to visit and there
21 didn't seem to be any kind of communication with me
22 anyway about them coming, first of all, and then about
23 them arriving and about them leaving. They just went
24 off and said cheerio to the little girl and didn't
25 appear again and I think it was -- because they didn't

- 1 come again was what I was really confused about,
2 I think.
- 3 Q. So that was the only recollection you have of families
4 coming to visit?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. You also look at the question of inspections. Were
7 there any inspections by any authority carried out
8 during your time?
- 9 A. I was never aware of inspections.
- 10 Q. When you talk about the checking being done by members
11 of the community, that's something you say at
12 paragraph 67 of your statement, what do you mean by
13 that?
- 14 A. Well, I suppose I must have been on the terrace or on
15 the area in the front and I watched children coming into
16 Smyllum. It would be Sister BAF that would be
17 meeting them with whoever they came with. The children
18 then were taken to wherever they were supposed to be.
19 So that was the time that I found that I had got two
20 different children, two different times, but two
21 children that came and were given to me.
- 22 Q. And these are the admissions you already mentioned?
- 23 A. That was the only admission that I would be aware of.
- 24 Q. And so far as that would be concerned, sister, would you
25 be given any information about their background?

1 A. Absolutely none.

2 Q. And what about the children you already had in your
3 care? Did you have any means of finding out information
4 about them?

5 A. I think maybe at the time I wasn't really aware that
6 I needed it. It was after my training that I became
7 aware of that and that changed. But, yes, I didn't have
8 it at the time. I had no record of the children
9 having -- I had no records at all.

10 LADY SMITH: What was it you were taught subsequently about
11 the value of understanding a child's background prior to
12 care?

13 A. Everything. Just knowing that I'd need a record, first
14 of all, and of course, following on from Smyllum, I was
15 attached to organisations that already -- it was up and
16 running and I suppose it would become a natural thing
17 when I admitted children into care that I knew before
18 they came who they were and all their details, as much
19 as we had.

20 LADY SMITH: So would those details include the reasons why
21 they were coming into care?

22 A. Yes.

23 LADY SMITH: Did that help?

24 A. Tremendously.

25 LADY SMITH: In what way?

1 A. Well, about health, about siblings, because they've got
2 siblings of course always, and I always had a family
3 rather than a lot of individual children because there
4 were many children who had no siblings at that point
5 that came particularly into the environment that I'm
6 talking about. And also, I knew that they were young,
7 very young often as well, and there were things that
8 I knew about them.

9 I can just give one example. I knew a child whose
10 parent had tried to starve herself so she would lose the
11 baby. Things like that along the way were really
12 incredibly helpful because then we could work with the
13 reason why there might be outbursts or grabbing food
14 constantly and eating it themselves and things like
15 that. Anything that would kind of show that there was
16 a direction towards needing the child to get extra help.

17 LADY SMITH: And I suppose if, for example, a child had come
18 into care following not only the death of their mother
19 but the circumstances being that they had found their
20 mother dead, you would know that you had a particularly
21 acute type of grief to handle.

22 A. Absolutely, yes.

23 LADY SMITH: And if you weren't told, you wouldn't know that
24 that was something that had to be accommodated in
25 handling that child.

1 A. Absolutely, all the time. It was so important to have
2 details.

3 LADY SMITH: But at Smyllum you didn't know anything about
4 the background?

5 A. No. I used to ask Sister [BAF] about it, you
6 know: where did they come from, why were they here, how
7 did they come, how do their parents let them come? All
8 that kind of thing.

9 LADY SMITH: But you weren't being shown any recorded
10 reasons, forms that were carefully completed, to help in
11 caring for the children in the light of their
12 background? Nothing like that?

13 A. No -- and I never thought to ask.

14 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

15 MR MacAULAY: As I think you've told us already, sister,
16 a child in your care may have had a sibling in another
17 part of the building.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And you wouldn't know about that?

20 A. I wouldn't know about that.

21 Q. Had you known about it, is it the sort of situation
22 where you might have made an arrangement for the
23 children to meet each other?

24 A. Oh yes. We had a great environment to be able to
25 accommodate that as well, so yes.

1 Q. Another aspect of this is the review of a child's care
2 while in care. Was there any system whereby, on an
3 ongoing basis, a child in your care, that that child's
4 care was being reviewed?

5 A. No.

6 Q. Again, looking to your training, do you consider that's
7 something that should have been there?

8 A. Oh absolutely, yes. I mean, that was just a natural
9 process regularly from then on.

10 Q. Again, we've looked at this already, but what you tell
11 us in your statement at paragraph 70 is that siblings
12 really were separated immediately on admission to
13 Smyllum.

14 A. Yes, that's what I think anyway. I didn't get two
15 siblings ever.

16 Q. You've mentioned this already, and I'll just pick this
17 up with you, it's in paragraph 74. You say:

18 "None of the children in my unit were discharged
19 from Smyllum while I was there."

20 A. Mm-hm.

21 Q. But do I take it that they still -- children may have
22 moved on from your unit but into another unit?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. But what you don't know is whether they ever left
25 Smyllum at all?

1 A. No, I don't. But I was only three years there.

2 MR MacAULAY: Yes. The next section of your -- my Lady, I'm
3 looking at the time. I'm about to talk about discipline
4 and punishment.

5 LADY SMITH: It might be a sensible point to have an
6 afternoon break.

7 Sister, we always take a break in the middle of the
8 afternoon and it looks like a convenient point to do so
9 now if that would suit you.

10 A. Yes, it would, actually.

11 LADY SMITH: We'll adjourn now.

12 (2.55 pm)

13 (A short break)

14 (3.10 pm)

15 LADY SMITH: Are you comfortable?

16 A. Yes, thank you.

17 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

18 MR MacAULAY: My Lady.

19 Sister, I want to look at the part of your statement
20 beginning at paragraph 75 where you talk about
21 discipline and punishment. Just focusing on your own
22 group, first of all, in relation to discipline and
23 punishment, what was the practice?

24 A. I didn't have any punishment. I didn't really -- there
25 was no need for punishment. I wasn't really that ...

1 They were just, you know, little children, like --
2 they're so willing to be your friend that they would
3 really -- I mean, if they did have differences, I'd just
4 be saying, "Be kind to each other", or, "Be helpful",
5 or, "Look after each other". I didn't really see any
6 need. I think I was more like their big sister,
7 I suppose, in some ways, you know.

8 Q. And did that approach work with the children that
9 you were looking after?

10 A. Yes. It was so easy.

11 Q. I think again, as I understand it, from what you've been
12 telling us, your contact with the bigger children, boys
13 or girls, was relatively limited; is that right?

14 A. I was never in touch about with the boys.

15 Q. What about the older girls?

16 A. Yes, I was, because, as I said, they were given
17 a television and we didn't have any, and -- I hadn't
18 actually grown up with a television anyway, so I was
19 really keen and I had to go always and ask can we come
20 into the television room. It was really their playroom,
21 but the seats were all put out for the television. So
22 I used to try and find out when things were on, about
23 5-ish in the evening, and ask to come along then and be
24 with them.

25 Q. But in relation to the boys, for example, did you know

1 or see anything in connection with how boys might have
2 been disciplined while you were at Smyllum?

3 A. I didn't see, no.

4 Q. Did you ever see a child, boy or girl, being hit when
5 you were at Smyllum?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Did you have the opportunity of that?

8 A. I don't suppose I had much.

9 Q. Pardon?

10 A. I don't think I had much.

11 Q. And why do you say that?

12 A. Because I -- well, life was busy and I had my own
13 responsibilities, so other than hearing what we each did
14 or a funny story or something like that, I never --
15 I only once -- and I think I just got lost in the whole
16 of Smyllum and I found myself in the playground of the
17 older boys, I think it was -- I don't ever remember
18 anything about the little boys -- and I saw on the side,
19 it was a kind of the corner stairs section, and in the
20 middle of it was a kitchen that you could access from
21 the yard and I thought that was something I'd never seen
22 before, I thought it was kind of magical, really. But
23 other than that, I never had any contact with any of the
24 boys at any time.

25 Q. Do I understand then, sister, that really you were very

- 1 much based in your own section, your own unit --
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. -- throughout your time at Smyllum?
- 4 A. Yes, because we were all busy. I mean, we couldn't
- 5 afford not to because there would be no supervision of
- 6 the children and no connection much with the children if
- 7 we weren't in our own groups. That's the way I saw it,
- 8 anyway.
- 9 Q. How did you sense the environment then at Smyllum
- 10 generally? Did you have any sense of --
- 11 A. I thought it was lovely. But -- like, I was young and
- 12 interested in everybody and everything, and I just
- 13 thought it was ... Well, I suppose I never thought, to
- 14 be quite honest, at that point in time. That was the
- 15 thing. I never reflected on what it was like other than
- 16 it was happy. It was, for me, easy and enjoyable and
- 17 rewarding and we were a very happy, large community as
- 18 well and we had a number of young women around, so we
- 19 had a lot of interaction with each other as well.
- 20 Q. If I take your own section, from what you're saying,
- 21 I think you thought that to be a happy environment;
- 22 is that right?
- 23 A. Oh yes.
- 24 Q. But what about Smyllum as a whole? Did you get any
- 25 sense of what the environment was like?

1 A. I thought it was -- I didn't think, is what I'm saying,
2 from the beginning. So on reflection since I would say
3 that I thought it was really a lovely place to be.

4 Q. One of the things you say in your statement at
5 paragraph 76 -- because we've heard evidence in the
6 inquiry about fear and intimidation and humiliation and
7 so on.

8 A. Mm-hm.

9 Q. One of the points you make is: that if it was that bad,
10 why did the children not run away?

11 A. Mm-hm.

12 Q. But were you aware of children running away during your
13 time?

14 A. No, but I must have heard about it. I did hear about it
15 after. This is on reflection -- this is like a life
16 reflection, 60 years or so ago, and so, yes --

17 LADY SMITH: I think Mr MacAulay was asking at the time you
18 were at Smyllum, were you aware of any children running
19 away?

20 A. I never heard of a child running away and I think that
21 was what I was asking -- that was the question.

22 LADY SMITH: While you were there you didn't know of that
23 happening?

24 A. No.

25 MR MacAULAY: But what you say here is: that if it was that

- 1 bad, why did the children not run away?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. The suggestion there is that to run away might be an
4 explanation for a bad environment. Is that --
- 5 A. Well, of course it is. I mean, over the years I've seen
6 many a child pack their bags and move out for a few
7 hours or a week or whenever, especially if it was in
8 environments that I was in later, yes, there could have
9 been children who were so unhappy that they didn't come
10 home from school or they went out down the drainpipe at
11 night, all the kind of things that children do when
12 they're not happy or they're upset.
- 13 Q. And you see that sort of behaviour as a reaction to some
14 degree of unhappiness and upset?
- 15 A. Yes. Oh, absolutely, yes.
- 16 Q. How in your opinion should such children be managed
17 then?
- 18 A. Well, in 1958 to 1961, I wouldn't have been aware of it,
19 I think. If one of my children -- if that happened to
20 one of the little ones, I'd have been really upset.
- 21 Q. And when the child came back?
- 22 A. I think they need a lot of love and attention and
23 explaining -- like communication was a big aspect,
24 I suppose, of how we didn't communicate kind of with the
25 sense of equality with children at the time. So, yes,

1 I mean, that would not have happened in the family group
2 homes that I led later.

3 Q. You say that you did not use any kind of corporal
4 punishment --

5 A. That's right.

6 Q. -- for your children; is that right?

7 A. That is right. I didn't need to.

8 Q. That's the question I was going to ask you.

9 A. Sorry.

10 Q. You didn't need to because -- why not?

11 A. Because younger girls maybe -- I'm assuming it's younger
12 girls but that mightn't be so. But you know, they just
13 want you to be their friend and they come round much
14 more easily than -- generally, that was my experience,
15 but that was where I'm talking about, the 1950s into the
16 1960s.

17 We were like 12 children to one adult. That's
18 another aspect of it. You didn't have a number of other
19 people to go to to explain why they were unhappy or ...
20 et cetera. So there was no such thing as punishment.

21 I used to think it was because there was so much
22 fresh air and we went often for walks up and down the
23 back road especially because it was so full of trees and
24 animals and it was just so refreshing. Also, in the
25 winter, even, like we had so much space. On many an

1 evening we played skipping for maybe any length of
2 time -- I couldn't remember the length of time, but it
3 seemed like an evening of skipping.

4 Q. When you say "we" are you talking about you and your
5 little group of young children?

6 A. And the girls, yes, the whole lot. Yes, we would play
7 or they would have ludo or play with their dolls and
8 especially, I think, house was a big thing of the era as
9 well, playing house. It wouldn't be maybe so much -- it
10 certainly wouldn't be today much, but on average that
11 was one of the things that the girls, the children that
12 I had, really loved, and they would set up their little
13 areas so I used to turn the tables over and chairs and
14 put sheets up and they could have different houses and
15 things like that.

16 Q. So you've told us then, sister, how you managed to keep
17 the children in your unit under control, if I can use
18 that description, but did you see other sisters
19 disciplining other children within Smyllum?

20 A. I didn't ever see sisters disciplining ever.
21 I suppose -- I don't know if I'm meant to say this, but
22 we didn't really have that much -- you know, by the time
23 they came home in the evening, by the time they've had
24 their tea, by the time they've watched television, by
25 the time -- I would assume the older ones had homework

1 to do, and bedtime -- I just couldn't see how there was
2 hours and hours of that kind of thing happening.
3 I think that's in the light of what I've had to speak to
4 in the inquiry.

5 Q. Okay. One of the things you do tell us though is that
6 there was an incident where there was some punching
7 going on and that you did hear --

8 A. No, I didn't hear; I saw.

9 Q. I'm sorry.

10 A. Did I say that?

11 Q. No, you did see, I think. I think you say it was girls
12 who were punching each other. You say:

13 "I did hear twice that, [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED],

14 [REDACTED] 'will sort them out'."

15 A. No, no, that was different. That's not the same place,
16 is it? Sorry.

17 Q. Perhaps I've confused you. I'm looking at
18 paragraph 1978.

19 A. Yes. The television was -- you know, when it came
20 to ... I must have been asked a specific question,
21 I think. I'm not sure.

22 Q. I'll just read this out to you, sister, and then ask you
23 a couple of questions about it. You begin by saying:

24 "I didn't see other sisters disciplining the
25 children."

1 We've talked about that:

2 "I know one night that the television went off
3 because three older girls were punching each other.
4 I did hear twice that, [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED]
5 [REDACTED] 'will sort them out'. That meant the big lads
6 and they were wild. I think it was Sister [REDACTED] EAD [REDACTED] who
7 said that. She was in her mid-30s and had all these big
8 lads."

9 I just want to ask you about that. First of all,
10 did you hear Sister [REDACTED] EAD [REDACTED] using an expression like,
11 [REDACTED] BAC [REDACTED] will sort them out"?

12 A. Yes, I think I did.

13 Q. What did you understand by that?

14 A. Well, just, you know, she had all these big lads and,
15 yes, naturally, like -- well, if he sorted them out, she
16 would only have to do a little bit of it, she didn't
17 have to do it all by herself. And I just felt that, oh
18 well, at least she had some support.

19 Q. But what did you understand "sorting them out" meant?

20 A. Well, "sorting them out", you know, it's an expression.

21 Q. It is an expression and I just wondered what you took
22 from it.

23 A. Well, that they would be told off, I suppose, is what
24 I would have thought at the time -- a bit like my
25 brothers.

1 Q. So you're talking about a verbal chastisement as opposed
2 to anything physical?

3 A. I would have thought so. I did, yes. I never thought
4 of what I've heard since then, you know, that there was
5 punishment like with the pool stick and people thrown
6 down the stairs and those kind of things.

7 Q. Did you think perhaps that there'd be some degree of
8 corporal punishment, if I can use that particular
9 description?

10 A. I wouldn't have thought about it.

11 Q. You go on to say that Mr BAC was somebody that you
12 yourself were not particularly happy with.

13 A. That's right.

14 Q. Why was that?

15 A. I didn't like him.

16 Q. Was there a reason for that?

17 A. Yes, I was 20 and I think he thought he was in charge of
18 me as well.

19 Q. Right. How did that manifest itself?

20 A. By him telling me -- I went up the garden one evening
21 and I was about to ... I think I probably had taken
22 some fruit, strawberries, some fruit, anyway, and
23 I heard this voice, "Hi, you", something to the effect,
24 "what do you think you're up to here?" Something like
25 that. I just told him it was my garden as well as his

1 and I got lost quickly after that because I thought
2 maybe I'll be in trouble myself by [REDACTED] BAC complaining
3 that I was up there. I think, I'm not sure. But I know
4 I didn't like him. I didn't like his -- as
5 a 20-year-old, like, you know, you either like people or
6 you don't.

7 Q. Were you frightened of him?

8 A. No. But the other gentleman that was in the garden,
9 [REDACTED] he was really gentle
10 with the children.

11 I mean, I suppose I didn't really see him
12 communicating with the children and because he didn't
13 communicate with the children he didn't communicate with
14 me, but I wasn't afraid of him.

15 LADY SMITH: Just going back to what you said about [REDACTED] BAC
16 you didn't finish your sentence. You said, "[You]
17 didn't like his --" His what?

18 A. His attitude.

19 LADY SMITH: You said you knew didn't like him -- you didn't
20 like his attitude?

21 A. I think it's his attitude. I didn't like the way he
22 spoke to me. Maybe that's what it was. Like I thought
23 I was ...

24 LADY SMITH: Like he could tell you what to do?

25 A. Yes.

1 MR MacAULAY: As you pointed out yourself, you were perhaps
2 a 20/21-year-old at this time, young, a young person.

3 A. Yes, and he must have been fairly young as well.

4 I suppose maybe a bit like my brothers, you know.

5 I have four brothers, so I was used to finding my place
6 in the family, so I saw him much the same way as anybody
7 else. And I suppose I saw the difference of the two
8 men: one who was interested in the children as well as
9 myself; and one who only, you know, was there to order
10 people about, maybe. I think I felt that --

11 Q. To what, other?

12 A. To order people about. I felt that he could do that.

13 Q. Well, he was ordering you about; did you hear him
14 ordering children about?

15 A. I didn't, no. I couldn't say I ever did because
16 I didn't have access to the boys, you see. And I didn't
17 see any of the boys helping in the garden, but I was
18 only that once was I ever lost in it, as much as
19 anything. I wanted to see what the place was like.

20 Q. You tell us in your statement, sister, that you did not
21 have a punishment book for your section.

22 A. That's right.

23 Q. And indeed you were never asked to have one?

24 A. That's right.

25 Q. Indeed, from what you have said, was there a need to

- 1 have one?
- 2 A. No, but I found out that it was helpful to have one
- 3 later.
- 4 Q. Yes, because you could have recorded certain events?
- 5 A. Yes. I suppose interesting things, like the stony(?)
- 6 punishment. I wasn't looking at it as a punishment book
- 7 as punishment -- I much later -- punishment books came
- 8 into an obligation in childcare.
- 9 Q. You say it was later than about the 1960s?
- 10 A. It would have been probably after 1964 anyway.
- 11 Q. In any event during your time at Smyllum --
- 12 A. It wasn't in either of the homes that I did my
- 13 placement, which I thought was interesting, during my
- 14 training.
- 15 Q. In any event, and not there in Smyllum up until 1963
- 16 when you left?
- 17 A. It was only 1961 when --
- 18 Q. 1961, sorry.
- 19 A. Yes. No, it wasn't. At least I wasn't aware that it
- 20 was there. It wasn't in our unit.
- 21 Q. You were also asked some general questions about abuse
- 22 and I think essentially what you're saying is that you
- 23 never saw or heard of anything that you considered to be
- 24 abuse of children.
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. You go on to say that in a way you were outside the
2 bigger scene at Smyllum; do you see that?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Is that how you considered yourself?
- 5 A. Well, for the kind of things that I was being asked
6 in relation to abuse, I saw myself, yes.
- 7 Q. A number of allegations were raised with you that have
8 been directed against a number of individuals, including
9 [REDACTED] BAC
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. If you look at paragraph 87 onwards in your statement.
12 I don't want to dwell on this because, sister, your
13 position is that in relation, for example, to the
14 laypeople, you've got no evidence to help us in how they
15 dealt with any child at Smyllum. Is that correct?
- 16 A. I didn't know of any laypeople being there.
- 17 Q. Well, [REDACTED] BAC was a layperson.
- 18 A. [REDACTED]
- 19 Q. I think in relation to other individuals,
20 [REDACTED] IAQ you never knew of her.
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Do I understand from your own position in relation to
23 your unit, apart from the two girls you mentioned, the
24 older girls, you didn't have a lay helper of any kind at
25 any point in time?

- 1 A. No, not that I remember anyway -- and I think I would
2 have remembered.
- 3 Q. You're also asked about allegations that have been made
4 against a number of sisters, some you knew and I think
5 some you did not; is that right?
- 6 A. That's right, yes.
- 7 Q. For example, Sister [REDACTED] ADG you knew her.
- 8 A. Mm-hm.
- 9 Q. You mentioned Sister [REDACTED] AFU who you didn't know.
- 10 A. Mm-hm.
- 11 Q. You've already mentioned Sister [REDACTED] HBP Was she
12 a cook?
- 13 A. She was the kitchen sister, yes.
- 14 Q. For the girls?
- 15 A. For the girls.
- 16 Q. Was she there for the whole period you were there?
- 17 A. I think she was, from what I remember.
- 18 Q. Do I take it from that she wouldn't be in charge of
19 a group, it would simply be the kitchen?
- 20 A. No. I was aware that -- we never had access to the
21 kitchen other than, you know, the open space to collect
22 food.
- 23 Q. You were asked about Sister [REDACTED] AGI at paragraph 100
24 and you did know Sister [REDACTED] AGI
- 25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. I think we understand that she had responsibility for
2 a group of boys.
- 3 A. Sister [EAD] was in charge and I think she was -- I'd
4 say [AGI] was around my own age at the time. She
5 was young and lively and funny and Scottish.
- 6 Q. But when you say Sister [AGI] was in charge --
- 7 A. No, she wasn't in charge.
- 8 Q. I meant Sister [EAD] rather. In charge of what?
- 9 A. The boys' side.
- 10 Q. Okay. What did you see the relationship between
11 Sister [AGI] and Sister [EAD] to be?
- 12 A. That she helped -- she had a group, but [EAD] was
13 probably in charge of the group as well. Yes,
14 Sister [AGI] was ...
- 15 Q. As you say, Sister [AGI] was of your own
16 generation, is that --
- 17 A. Yes, I'd say she was. Can I just ask [REDACTED]
- 18 Q. No, it doesn't matter.
- 19 A. Okay.
- 20 Q. You mentioned Sister [EAD] Did you have much to do
21 with Sister [EAD]
- 22 A. Nothing to do with in relation to the boys, except, you
23 know, when she came over one evening and she said
24 that -- she came over, we'd meet up in the community
25 sitting room, and she came in and she just said she'd

1 been playing pool with the lads. I thought that that
2 was great.

3 Q. Can I then take you, sister, to paragraph 118 of your
4 statement. That's a paragraph where a number of
5 allegations, really based upon evidence provided to the
6 inquiry, have been put to you: being slapped, punched,
7 kicked, punished for bed-wetting, and so on and so
8 forth. Your position is that you saw none of that when
9 you were at Smyllum.

10 A. I didn't see any of it.

11 Q. Would you consider the sort of things that are set out
12 there to be abuse?

13 A. Oh yes. Yes, of course. Yes. Punched and kicked? You
14 know, we had heavy habits on, so kicking would have been
15 very hard work.

16 Punched for bed-wetting? I can't comment on it
17 because I never saw it.

18 Force-feeding of children sounds awful. I also have
19 real difficulty with food generally, so I would really
20 have been very angry about that.

21 And placing a child under the doctor nun's breast,
22 I thought that was hilarious because it would be hard
23 work getting anywhere near her breast.

24 Serving inedible food and making a child eat their
25 vomit. I just felt it was -- it actually nearly made me

1 sick that day I read it.

2 Locking children in cupboards. There were very few
3 cupboards that I saw around, but it could have happened;
4 I'm not saying it didn't happen.

5 If any of those things did happen, genuinely,
6 I think it is -- of course it's abuse.

7 Q. Thank you.

8 LADY SMITH: You mentioned your habits a few moments ago;
9 what did you wear on your feet?

10 A. Shoes. Just shoes like I have today.

11 LADY SMITH: May I see them?

12 A. Something like that (indicates), maybe not as nice.

13 LADY SMITH: Did anybody wear boots?

14 A. No, we'd never have the opportunity of wearing boots.

15 No.

16 LADY SMITH: Or footwear with laces?

17 A. All our shoes would have been laced --

18 LADY SMITH: They'd all be lacing shoes?

19 A. I would imagine so, yes. I don't think we had
20 anything -- certainly in 1958 to 1961, I don't think
21 we would have, no.

22 MR MacAULAY: I think the shoes you showed us looked quite
23 modern, sister.

24 A. They happen to be children's! They're nice.

25 Q. Can I go back then to the issue of records, because I've

1 asked you some questions about records already. I just
2 want to be clear exactly what your position is and what
3 records, if any, you kept in connection with the
4 children under your care. Did you keep any written
5 records?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Were you asked to keep any written records?

8 A. No.

9 Q. Do you know if written records were kept in connection
10 with any of the children under your care?

11 A. I don't know, but I'm assuming not -- except, on
12 reflection, I remembered Sister **FAM** writing bits down
13 when we'd go up to her, so I assume that was a record --

14 Q. A medical type record?

15 A. Yes, it must have been, yes.

16 Q. So that's something that you do remember?

17 A. Oh yes, I remembered her writing stuff.

18 Q. Perhaps before I look at your closing thoughts, we've
19 heard some evidence in the inquiry about the use of
20 a strap.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Can you help with that? Do you know if a strap was used
23 by any nun during your time at Smyllum?

24 A. I just wouldn't have -- I have never ... The only time
25 I've ever heard of straps is when I was in school. And

1 I never heard of it being used in Smyllum. I could
2 never imagine Sister [REDACTED] EAA who was the headteacher,
3 having that. I'm not sure. I don't know.

4 Q. Well, sister, in your closing thoughts you provide us
5 with your closing thoughts, and in particular whether
6 you think -- as to why children who had been at Smyllum
7 have now come forward and made the kind of allegations
8 that we've discussed.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Have you any thoughts on that?

11 A. I still -- I mean, I'd stand by what I said because
12 I think I really feel like there's -- well, some of them
13 haven't grown up, I've thought, since I've read it
14 preparing for here. We all have things -- I'm not
15 talking about myself -- that we would like not to have
16 happened to us, whether it's as a child or young adult
17 or a teenager or an adult. So I just feel very strongly
18 about the -- that they were taken from their homes with
19 no reference to ... (Pause)

20 Q. I see you're upset.

21 LADY SMITH: Do you want a break out of the hearing room or
22 do you want to just draw breath here for a few moments?
23 You're happy to be here?

24 A. Thank you.

25 LADY SMITH: Let me know when you're ready to resume.

1 (Pause)

2 A. I think I'm all right now. Thank you.

3 MR MacAULAY: Do you want to continue? You were providing
4 us with your own explanation as to why you think these
5 allegations are being made now.

6 A. Well, I just feel that having reflected on how they came
7 into care, that it was -- most of the children, it
8 seemed, came from the city -- from Glasgow, I'm
9 assuming -- it could have been Edinburgh or some smaller
10 towns -- and that they were just kind of -- they
11 wouldn't have understood what was happening to them and
12 they were brought to Smyllum.

13 I'm assuming that they must have been really
14 neglected, but it could have been because of alcoholism
15 and other kinds of things that I meet every day now and
16 that -- like they had no resources to get over that.
17 Like I said, I wouldn't have been that aware of it with
18 the younger children, so their recovery mightn't have
19 even happened.

20 They ran around the streets, I would have said, as
21 well, because they loved their freedom. They had no --
22 a bit like the bed-wetting. I would say most of them
23 just weren't potty trained as a starter and they had no
24 boundaries, so there was very little for them to have,
25 you know, at the early stages of what maybe most of us

1 have had or many of us have had or all of us have had.
2 I feel that that was an awful impoverishment and some
3 could never get over that -- and I meet it today in
4 people who are 40, 50 and 60, men and women.

5 So, yes, I just feel it's no different in the sense
6 that -- and that they had no family then ever coming to
7 see them, which I still can never understand. Maybe the
8 authorities like never asked questions -- they never
9 asked questions of us either, it would seem. They
10 certainly didn't come to me. I suppose I learned all
11 those things in the early three years that changed
12 everything for them and some of them have never got over
13 it and never had enough help maybe to -- you know,
14 emotional help, a bit like when I said, like the
15 children didn't have much ... my children even.

16 I was there and 12 children would be looking for
17 love and, you know, to have a hug and just basic things
18 in life and I don't know how much I did that, first of
19 all, but then their family never kind of gave it back to
20 them either. They were left without any kind of
21 possibility of the different stages of growing up.

22 We talk about children cleaning and stuff like that
23 and those would have been the kind of things that
24 enabled them to communicate with each other and with
25 adults in the environment that they were living in,

1 which was Smyllum, but that would not have been seen as
2 something good, you know? All those kind of things.
3 I just feel that is it any wonder we're picking up the
4 pieces today.

5 Q. It's how you jump from that into -- of course you have
6 said Smyllum was a happy place --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- and these witnesses are saying it wasn't a happy
9 place.

10 A. I know.

11 Q. And not only that, that there were practices there were
12 abusive and it's that that I think I'm asking you --

13 A. Also they never mentioned the responsibilities their
14 parents had, starting with their parents, then the
15 authorities, and us.

16 LADY SMITH: Sister, some of the parents were dead and some
17 of the parents were hospitalised with TB.

18 A. Yes.

19 LADY SMITH: It's difficult to exercise your responsibility
20 for your children in those circumstances, isn't it?

21 A. Of course it is, yes. I'm aware of that, but I just
22 wanted to say that initially they were taken from --
23 whether it was aunts or uncles or parents or friends,
24 but they weren't on the street on their own or in their
25 homes on their own. So, yes, I agree with you. I mean,

1 that is the reality.

2 I didn't meet much of it after 1961, except families
3 whose parent, one parent, might have died. But, yes,
4 I agree with you about the illnesses that people had and
5 also the environments that they had, where they were
6 living and who was helping them just to grow and
7 develop. Yes, all those things.

8 MR MacAULAY: Very well, sister. If I can then move from
9 Smyllum, if you're up to it, and go to St Vincent's.
10 I think you were also, as you told us earlier, at
11 St Vincent's in Newcastle for a period of time. Are you
12 up to doing that?

13 A. I'm up to doing it. I don't know why it should be in
14 Scotland though!

15 MR MacAULAY: That's another point!

16 LADY SMITH: We're not suggesting it is, but there is a
17 particular reason why we are interested in it. Please
18 bear with us.

19 MR MacAULAY: I think you clarified before that you were at
20 St Vincent's from [REDACTED] 1972 to [REDACTED] 1973.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Just over a year, in fact.

23 A. That's all, 13 months.

24 Q. What role did you have there?

25 A. I was Sister Servant.

- 1 Q. So you were essentially in charge of the home?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Can you just give me some information about what sort of
4 establishment St Vincent's was?
- 5 A. Yes. It was a children's home and on the right, as you
6 went in -- there wasn't a huge amount of land, but on
7 the right as you went in there was a place called
8 Seaton House, and then there was the main house. There
9 was also a house where the bishop lived at the far end
10 side -- the far side, the right-hand side, but up the
11 road a bit, but in the complex.
- 12 There were -- Seaton House had definitely got
13 a sister in it and then there were two sisters in the
14 other two groups that were in the main house.
- 15 Q. So you had three groups altogether?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. A much smaller institution to Smyllum?
- 18 A. Oh yes.
- 19 Q. Can you tell me roughly what the population of children
20 was?
- 21 A. 50ish, around that kind of -- 45 to 50 maybe.
- 22 Q. Boys and girls?
- 23 A. Boys and girls, families.
- 24 Q. Age groups?
- 25 A. I don't ever remember a 4-year-old there, so I would

1 have said school age onwards.

2 Q. I think you do mention in your statement some of the
3 sisters who were there during your time. That's at
4 paragraph 127. You say there was a Sister AFJ
5 a Sister Evelyn Warnock, and a Sister Marie Byrne;
6 is that correct?

7 A. Marie Byrne, yes.

8 Q. These were the sisters involved in childcare during your
9 time?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. But there were other sisters there who had other
12 responsibilities?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Again, I think you have been -- it has been put to you
15 some allegations relating to St Vincent's and indeed
16 some would appear to predate the time that you were
17 there; is that correct?

18 A. Yes, some seemed to be, yes.

19 Q. In any event, during your time at St Vincent's, did
20 you have any knowledge of there being any abuse of any
21 kind within the home?

22 A. No, I didn't.

23 Q. Would that be the sort of thing you would become aware
24 of if there had been?

25 A. Oh yes.

- 1 Q. Let's say physical abuse?
- 2 A. Oh absolutely, yes. I mean, 12 years on, I was quite
3 a different woman than I was 12 years before.
- 4 Q. Well, you had a good degree of experience behind you by
5 then.
- 6 A. I did, yes.
- 7 Q. But looking to your responsibilities as the Sister
8 Servant, what did that involve?
- 9 A. It involved communicating with the sisters and visiting
10 them, engaging with them, but also Marie was new, she
11 came either a day before me or around that time -- a day
12 before me I think she arrived -- and took over
13 Seaton House. She had little or no experience of
14 childcare. She had teenage care all right, but not
15 childcare, and hostel care and things like that.
- 16 So I suppose of the three units, I would have been
17 much more involved with Marie and supporting her and
18 supervising her as well.
- 19 Q. Were the units divided by age?
- 20 A. No, no, no.
- 21 Q. You said there were family units?
- 22 A. Yes. They were just children that came into care -- and
23 of course they belonged to families in Newcastle, so
24 there was movement, there was quite a bit of movement,
25 coming and going. It wasn't only -- like, we weren't

1 the ... We were in charge of it but we didn't run it.

2 How can I say that? You know what I mean?

3 Q. The sisters on the ground were running the home; is that
4 right.

5 A. Yes. The Catholic Care was in charge of it.

6 Q. And would you have some dealings then with
7 Catholic Care?

8 A. Oh yes. A lot.

9 Q. Can you give me some understanding of that? What would
10 that involve?

11 A. I would attend all the care conferences. That would be
12 what I would be wanting to do myself as well, but I just
13 would have done that. And, you know, children who --
14 difficult children, maybe particularly, if they were
15 having problems at school, I'd go to school if I thought
16 it was appropriate. And also, yes, there were a few
17 difficult children -- maybe particularly, I suppose
18 I would highlight the children in Seaton because they
19 had lost -- I replaced somebody, so the person in charge
20 they had lost. They also had -- who I'm assuming had
21 some direction with them.

22 Then they also -- and then they had Marie, although
23 they wouldn't have known that Marie was new, new in the
24 environment, new in childcare, so I also ... Am I not
25 clear now about this?

- 1 Q. Sorry to interrupt you, you've been telling us about
2 your relationship with Catholic Care.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. But looking then to the running of the establishment, as
5 I understand it, you would have regular contact with the
6 nuns who ran the units?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. What about the children within the units?
- 9 A. I met them all the time, every day -- well, not all the
10 time, but you know, they knew me and I knew them, and
11 I'd been meeting them going off to school and meeting
12 them maybe coming back. If they were playing outside,
13 yes, we'd -- yes, all that kind of thing.
- 14 Q. I think I've already put to you that there have been
15 allegations made, but your position is you never saw any
16 what you might describe as abuse during this period?
- 17 A. No, I didn't.
- 18 Q. Did you see any what I would call corporal punishment
19 being meted out by anyone?
- 20 A. I didn't.
- 21 Q. Did you see a child being hit at any point?
- 22 A. I didn't. But I mightn't have been that involved with
23 all --
- 24 Q. I follow that, yes. I just want your evidence on that.
- 25 A. No.

- 1 Q. And if you had, if you had seen --
- 2 A. If I had, I think I would have been participating in
- 3 what was going on -- and I did speak to some of the
- 4 children from time to time, particularly if they were
- 5 playing up and I know one of the -- I was asked about
- 6 one of the children, the [REDACTED] family children. So yes,
- 7 I had fair dealings with maybe -- I'm not too sure which
- 8 of them because I'm not good at names, but I know that
- 9 they were disruptive. They were children and they were
- 10 wild and they didn't really have any boundaries much and
- 11 they were forever moving out of any boundary, which was
- 12 like climbing trees and things like that, you know. So
- 13 I was constantly talking to them about our
- 14 responsibility towards the environment, et cetera.
- 15 Q. One thing I do want to ask you about is about a trainee
- 16 priest called Bernard Traynor. Did you come across
- 17 Bernard Traynor during your time at St Vincent's?
- 18 A. My memory of it is that I didn't come across him
- 19 particularly during that year, but I did come across him
- 20 because I was -- as you saw, I was there in a family
- 21 group. I was in charge of another house in the city
- 22 that was also Catholic Care. So, yes, I did -- like,
- 23 I met the students, kind of met with them and kind of
- 24 befriended them and wanted to know what they were doing
- 25 and how they were doing it. So yes, insofar as he was

1 a student with the students, I knew him.

2 Q. But not at St Vincent's itself?

3 A. No.

4 Q. If we go to your ministry history document,
5 WIT.003.001.0616 -- this is what we looked at earlier on
6 in your evidence, sister.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. I think we've been really looking at the period
9 1972/1973.

10 A. Only.

11 Q. Only, indeed. It may be the information here is not
12 correct, but the next period that is set out is 1973 to
13 1979.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. It says Heaton, but that wasn't St Vincent's?

16 A. No.

17 Q. That was another establishment?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And was it there, that establishment, that you met
20 Bernard Traynor?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Was he at that time a trainee priest?

23 A. Yes, he was, yes.

24 Q. What was the name of the home, can you remember?

25 A. Just give me a minute -- Simonside.

- 1 Q. You say, if you go back to your statement, that:
- 2 "St Vincent's did have student priests who came once
- 3 a week or maybe once a month."
- 4 Can you see that? This is at paragraph 145 of your
- 5 statement.
- 6 A. Yes, I think I need to see that. I've got it here.
- 7 Q. From what you tell us, this appeared to be a pilot
- 8 scheme --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. -- to introduce men to childcare so the children would
- 11 have male and female role models. Can you help me with
- 12 that? What was this all about?
- 13 A. That was what I saw it to be, a pilot scheme. It was
- 14 meant to be a scheme where men in their 20s, early 20s,
- 15 would kind of maybe adopt a group, as it were, and then
- 16 they would come once a week or -- I'm not sure whether
- 17 it was once a week or once a month, to be quite honest.
- 18 They were free from the seminary to come for that day,
- 19 but they never lived in, they always -- there was
- 20 a house -- the offices of Catholic Care had provision
- 21 for them and they used to go off there in the evenings,
- 22 in the evening that they came.
- 23 It was also always a Saturday, I think. So we were
- 24 asked to take them.
- 25 Q. By whom?

1 A. By Catholic Care. So it was maybe church-centred
2 in that sense. So I was very clear that I wanted to
3 know who was coming and with who was with who,
4 et cetera, but that didn't happen until I left,
5 I thought it didn't happen anyway. I'm not too sure
6 whether it happened -- whether that was up and running
7 in the 13 months that I was in St Vincent's or not.

8 Q. But it was up and running when you went to Simonside?

9 A. No, I had a temporary time where there was nobody
10 covering Simonside and I covered it and I asked for
11 a student.

12 Q. Can I ask you this, sister: insofar as the student
13 priest or priests interacted with children, what
14 supervision would there be?

15 A. They would always have -- I always had two staff, so
16 there would always be staff or myself with them. Always
17 in my memory.

18 Q. Are you talking now about Simonside?

19 A. I'm talking about Simonside; I can't talk about
20 St Vincent's.

21 Q. Very well, sister. These are all the questions that
22 I have for you. Thank you.

23 A. Thank you.

24 MR MacAULAY: Thank you very much indeed for being with me.

25 My Lady, no written requests for questions have been

1 submitted and I don't know if there are to be any
2 questions.

3 LADY SMITH: Let me check if there are any outstanding
4 applications. Are there any applications for questions?
5 No? Shaking of heads.

6 Sister, thank you very much for coming along today
7 to assist us with your evidence about your time at
8 Smyllum and indeed at St Vincent's, which is not in
9 Scotland. But that was helpful anyway. I'm now able to
10 let you go. I'm sorry it's a little bit later than you
11 expected to get away, but these things happen.

12 A. Yes. Thank you very much.

13 (The witness withdrew)

14 LADY SMITH: Before we go any further, I would like to
15 mention that you may have noticed that the last witness
16 did make reference to the surname of a family that were
17 in St Vincent's. That name is actually protected by one
18 of my restriction orders and so it cannot be mentioned
19 outside the hearing room. I'm sure people appreciate
20 that, but it's important that that's remembered.

21 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, the next witness is here, but I'm
22 looking to the time. It's 4.05 and the stenographers
23 have had a particularly long day.

24 LADY SMITH: Yes, they have.

25 MR MacAULAY: I have confirmed with the next witness that

1 she is available for tomorrow morning. My inclination
2 would be to adjourn until tomorrow morning. The
3 alternative would be to start, but I suspect we would
4 probably have to give the stenographers a break.

5 LADY SMITH: I think your plan is the best way forward,
6 Mr MacAulay. I don't think it's realistic to get this
7 evidence properly under way today given the demands on
8 everybody concerned.

9 MR MacAULAY: The only other possibility, my Lady, is if
10 there's a possibility we might start a little bit
11 earlier tomorrow, let's say 9.45.

12 LADY SMITH: I'm happy to do that if that is convenient to
13 everybody else.

14 MR MacAULAY: There seems to be a general agreement and
15 nodding of heads, my Lady.

16 LADY SMITH: That will give us some flexibility and, if
17 necessary, we can shave 10 or 15 minutes off the lunch
18 break to catch up. But we can take that one step at
19 a time.

20 (4.05 pm)

21 (The inquiry adjourned until 9.45 am
22 on Wednesday 17 January 2018)

23

24

25

I N D E X

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

"SISTER CAROL KANE" (sworn)1

 Questions from MR MacAULAY3

"SISTER NORA O'SULLIVAN" (sworn)99

 Questions from MR MacAULAY99