

1 Friday, 8 December 2017

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning.

4 Mr MacAulay.

5 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, my Lady.

6 The next witness is an applicant. He wants to  
7 remain anonymous and he wants to use the name "Bill"  
8 when giving his evidence.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 Good morning, Bill.

11 "BILL" (affirmed)

12 LADY SMITH: Do sit down and make yourself comfortable.

13 A. Thank you.

14 LADY SMITH: If you line yourself up with the microphone you  
15 will find it easier to make yourself heard.

16 A. Right.

17 LADY SMITH: I don't know what you have brought with you --  
18 it may be documents we have already got and you will see  
19 them coming up on the screen.

20 A. Yes, it was just the statement that I had and I just  
21 jotted down a few notes, that was all; is that all  
22 right?

23 LADY SMITH: That's fine. Your statement is also in that  
24 red folder and Mr MacAulay may refer you to it.

25 Make yourself comfortable in any way with the

1 documents you have brought.

2 A. Thank you.

3 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay, when you are ready.

4 Questions from MR MacAULAY

5 MR MacAULAY: My Lady.

6 Good morning, Bill.

7 A. Good morning.

8 Q. For a time frame, I don't need your date of birth, but  
9 I need to ask you to confirm your year of birth. Can  
10 I ask you to confirm that you were born in 1959?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. I'm going to ask you some questions. Can I just say to  
13 you, particularly in relation to things like dates, if  
14 you can't remember, just say you can't remember. The  
15 other side of that coin is that if there is something  
16 you do remember today that you didn't remember when you  
17 gave your statement to us, then feel free to tell us.

18 A. Okay.

19 Q. The first thing I want to do is to look at your  
20 statement. It is in the red folder in front of you.  
21 I'm going to give the reference for the purposes of the  
22 transcript and that is WIT.001.001.2496. Could I ask  
23 you to turn to the last page. Can you confirm, Bill,  
24 that you have signed the statement?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Looking to the last paragraph of the statement, do you  
2 say:

3 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
4 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry"?

5 Is that correct?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Likewise do you go on to say:

8 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
9 statement are true"?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. We know from records that you were admitted first of all  
12 to Bellevue in Rutherglen on [REDACTED] 1960. I know you  
13 don't remember that because you were very, very young.  
14 Having spent some time there, you were then admitted to  
15 Smyllum on [REDACTED] 1961 when you were aged about 2.  
16 Does that accord with your own understanding of the  
17 dates?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. When you were admitted to Smyllum, I think you were  
20 admitted along with an older brother and an older  
21 sister; is that your understanding?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do you have any recollection at all of life before care?

24 A. No.

25 Q. But do you have some understanding from what you have

1           been told as to what the situation was particularly in  
2           relation to your parents?

3           A.   Yes.   Because I was just 10 months old, it is obvious  
4           that I wouldn't remember anything from that young age.  
5           But what I have gleaned through different information  
6           from various sources is that I knew that my mother and  
7           father were together for a number of years where they  
8           had my older sister and brother and then myself.  But  
9           that was back in the 1950s, the late 1950s, 1955  
10          onwards.  So it wasn't really a sort of multicultural  
11          society that we have nowadays --

12          Q.   You are mentioning that because your father was Indian  
13          and your mother was Scottish?

14          A.   Yes.  So, at that time, that was probably seen as  
15          something well out of the ordinary, to put it mildly,  
16          I would have thought.  So therefore, even at the time  
17          that they were together, my understanding was that they  
18          didn't live together.  So they had to see each other  
19          kind of separately.  So I think it was -- my own birth  
20          mother was the one who was instrumental in looking after  
21          us in our very early formative years, certainly until  
22          I was 10 months old.  Then, of course, I think there was  
23          issues -- once I met some of the family 30 years later,  
24          I think there was issues around sort of racial  
25          tendencies and so on towards my mum and probably towards

1 my dad.

2 Therefore, when my mum took ill and was  
3 hospitalised, I think that that was the family's  
4 opportunity to sort of progress, look, you are not able  
5 to look after the children just now while you are in  
6 hospital and I think it would be better if they were  
7 maybe put into care on a temporary basis, and I think my  
8 mother eventually agreed to that. Because I think the  
9 family, certainly my grandmother, from what I can  
10 understand, was a very matriarchal figure and I think  
11 she pushed my mum to actually put us into care.

12 I think that's what my mum did with the view that  
13 she would hopefully get us back, but as I say, as we go  
14 on further, that didn't actually happen.

15 So that is my understanding that I have gleaned from  
16 various sources.

17 Q. Thank you. I think I can understand that you will not  
18 have had any memories of Bellevue.

19 A. No.

20 Q. Did you understand subsequently that you were moved from  
21 Bellevue to Smyllum because Bellevue was about to close?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Just running ahead a little bit, am I right in thinking  
24 that you were at Smyllum then from about the age of 2  
25 until the age of 6?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. So there was a period of about four years or  
3 thereabouts. When you came to leave Smyllum, was it to  
4 be discharged to foster care?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Certainly I have seen a date which is [REDACTED] 1965; would  
7 that seem right to you?
- 8 A. Possibly, yes. What I found quite strange was I managed  
9 to get some records from the Social Work Department, but  
10 it was very, very limited in what I got. But the  
11 information I got came from the Smyllum register and  
12 they have me admitted there -- I think it was [REDACTED]  
13 [REDACTED] 1961.
- 14 Q. I think I put to you it was [REDACTED] 1961.
- 15 A. But funnily enough they didn't have a discharge date so  
16 there's no discharge date from any of the records that  
17 I could see. So I'm assuming when you are saying  
18 [REDACTED] 1965 then that must have been -- because I knew  
19 I was 6.
- 20 Q. So 1965 looks right. Can I say that's a date I have  
21 taken from a social work record that we have had access  
22 to; it's not from the Smyllum records.
- 23 A. Oh right.
- 24 Q. You are right in saying that the Smyllum registers, on  
25 quite a number of occasions, don't indicate the

1 discharge dates.

2 A. It just says "discharge date" and it is left blank.

3 Q. Yes, indeed. What's your first recollection, Bill, of  
4 being in Smyllum?

5 A. I think the first recollection, if I'm being honest, it  
6 is very, very difficult when you go back to those early  
7 formative years. I just remember that I was just never  
8 happy. I just -- a lot of things I have said in my  
9 statement is all around my thinking at the time in  
10 looking back. There's only certain instances that jump  
11 out because from my perspective they were horrible for  
12 that age, but that's because those three things are  
13 instances that happened and have remained with me, so  
14 therefore they are hard to eradicate. Whereas the  
15 normal day-to-day life I can't comprehend a lot of that.

16 All I know is that I didn't -- I don't remember any  
17 structure, I don't remember anything about breakfast,  
18 dinner, lunch, anything like that. I don't remember  
19 like sort of getting up at a certain time, going to bed  
20 at a certain time.

21 I actually don't remember a lot about being inside  
22 Smyllum home. The only time I remember is when I'm  
23 getting up in the morning and going to bed at night.  
24 That's the only time I remember. Then the rest of it is  
25 all outside where I have got memories of just playing

1 out in the fields and climbing trees and all these kind  
2 of things.

3 Q. I will look at the things that you do remember in  
4 a moment or two. But can I ask you this: do you have  
5 any recollection of where you were within the home?

6 A. No. I just knew that I was in a place to stay and it  
7 was a huge, huge building and it was just loads of --  
8 a lot of children there. I didn't really understand why  
9 I was there, but I was there. Occasionally sometimes  
10 somebody would say to me that -- one of the workers or  
11 the nuns would say I was an orphan, maybe I had asked  
12 a question, why am I here, but I remember the word  
13 "orphan" and being told I was an orphan.

14 Q. Yes, okay. What about the dormitory then, your sleeping  
15 area? Do you have any recollection of that?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. What's your recollection of the dormitory?

18 A. I just remember the dormitories being -- it was big and  
19 it was cold and it was just hard floors and the beds  
20 were steel. I just remember a line of beds down one  
21 wall, down another wall, and that's all I remember.

22 Q. It was a dormitory for boys though, only boys?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You do tell us in your statement that you do remember  
25 the boy Sammy Carr in that he was in your dormitory.



1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Were you a friend of his?

3 A. Yes. Sammy Carr is the one person that I have always  
4 remembered. I have remembered some other names but he  
5 is the one that kind of stayed with me, from a memory  
6 perspective. I don't know if it was because he was  
7 blond. He was blond and very, very pale where I was  
8 dark haired and sort of dark skinned and I always  
9 thought I wonder if that was the sort of -- why we  
10 became friends because we were sort of opposites in  
11 looks. I don't know. But he is the one person that  
12 I do remember and he was in my dormitory.

13 Q. I will ask you about him in a little while. But one  
14 thing I do want to pick up with you, Bill, is what you  
15 say in your statement about your main memory of being  
16 outside. You say you remember eating grass, you have  
17 a recollection of that?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Can you help me with that?

20 A. I just remember I was always hungry but I don't remember  
21 food. I don't. I mean it is hard to believe and  
22 comprehend, but I have got two sons and when they were  
23 preschool from my age, 2 to 5, they've got memories,  
24 they've got some memories but they've got nice memories.  
25 They know about different things like food and going out

1 and going to nursery and different kind of things. So  
2 they have got sort of memories even of everyday things  
3 whereas I can't remember anything like that.

4 Q. That's one thing you do remember, eating grass?

5 A. I do remember eating grass.

6 Q. Because you were hungry?

7 A. Because I was hungry and I remember being out in the  
8 fields and there was -- at that time I wouldn't have  
9 called them cowpats -- I know that they're cowpats now  
10 because I'm older, but I would just saw it as dirt or  
11 animal droppings or whatever the case may be, but  
12 I would be out in the fields and there would be dock  
13 leaves and things and I would just be eating that.

14 Q. What about the people that were looking after you? We  
15 know the nuns ran the place; do you have a recollection  
16 of particular nuns?

17 A. First of all I need to correct you a wee bit because we  
18 weren't actually looked after. I don't believe we were  
19 looked after. The word "looked after" is meaningless to  
20 me. That's the first thing.

21 Secondly, I just remember people and only because of  
22 maybe sort of bad memories. So that's why I remember  
23 Sister EAC by name and another worker that  
24 I remember by name.

25 Q. You mention her in your statement.

1 A. Yes. But as I say, I don't -- that's the only reason  
2 why I remember that. I remember [REDACTED] BAC the [REDACTED],  
3 and just because I seen him going about, but as I said  
4 in my statement, I just stayed away from him for some  
5 reason, I didn't want anything to do with him. But  
6 I can't follow it through and think why did I want to  
7 stay away from him; all I knew was I had a fear of him  
8 specifically and of a certain nun and of a certain  
9 worker, but that's --

10 Q. In relation to the nun, Sister [REDACTED] EAC, who you mention  
11 in your statement, what you say in your statement is  
12 that:

13 "[You] always thought she was evil. She was always  
14 shouting and screaming. She was a horrible person."

15 That's your overall view of her?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is that right?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Was that your view of her throughout your time at  
20 Smyllum?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. I will come back to what may have happened involving her  
23 but let's go back to Sammy Carr and your memories of  
24 him. I think you do remember him as a friend and you do  
25 remember playing with him during your time there.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. You do tell us in your statement about a particular  
3 morning when you are trying to wake him up; can you just  
4 explain that to me, Bill?

5 A. Yes, it was just -- it was just a vivid memory that  
6 I have that -- we were all just to get up in the morning  
7 and everybody got up and Sammy didn't. I just remember  
8 trying to wake him up and he wouldn't wake up.

9 But it was -- the reason why I was trying to wake  
10 him up is that he would get into trouble because as soon  
11 as we were told to get up, everybody had to get up right  
12 away, no questions asked. You couldn't just go back to  
13 sleep again, you had to get up.

14 So that is -- it is just a memory that I have about  
15 Sammy and then I went on to ask about: why is he not  
16 getting up, what's happened? Then, just as it says in  
17 my statement, he wouldn't get up, and they came in and  
18 we were just all asked to leave.

19 Q. When you say "they", can you remember who came in?

20 A. It was either nuns or workers. Because at that age the  
21 workers and the nuns were of similar standing to me,  
22 except for the uniform. So that was the only -- the  
23 only way I could differentiate between them.

24 Q. Then what was the next thing you heard about Sammy?

25 A. The next thing -- we had heard various stories but I was

1 told that he had got up to go to the toilet through the  
2 night and he had been bitten by a rat or the rat's got  
3 him and I just found it all quite bizarre, but I had no  
4 understanding or thought process at that time to think,  
5 well, how could that happen, and weigh up the pros and  
6 cons. I wasn't able to do that so I could only remember  
7 what I was told.

8 Q. But there was a rat featured in the story about  
9 Sammy Carr?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. We know that Sammy Carr died in June 1964, so you would  
12 be aged about 5 at that time.

13 A. Mm.

14 Q. But I think you also say you remember a small white  
15 coffin.

16 A. Mm.

17 Q. You have some recollection of that?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Was there some service? Were you at a service? Can you  
20 remember that?

21 A. What surprises me the most about a lot of this was this  
22 was a religious order and yet I didn't really know what  
23 a church was. I can't remember the inside of a church,  
24 I can't remember praying or being asked to pray or going  
25 over prayers.

1           The only time I remember some kind of holy place, if  
2           you like, which may have been the inside of a church,  
3           which was the white coffin and I remember being there  
4           and looking at the white coffin and I just found it  
5           quite kind of strange and eerie because I didn't really  
6           know what death was, nobody had kind of explained to me  
7           that when you -- you know when you live, you die, you  
8           know, eventually, or whatever. So I couldn't understand  
9           this white box that I was looking at.

10        Q. Can I ask you a little bit about visits? Did you  
11        receive any visitors that you can remember, family  
12        visitors, when you were at Smyllum?

13        A. No.

14        Q. You already mentioned about being told you were  
15        an orphan, but were you told anything else about your  
16        family?

17        A. No.

18        Q. You do tell us in this statement what you were being  
19        told and you say:

20                "I remember the nuns telling us we were orphans and  
21                we were dirty because we were of mixed race."

22                Do you remember something like that being said to  
23                you?

24        A. Yes. I remember being -- I remember just being treated  
25        like a nonentity, you know, "I don't know why you are

1 here, just go away". I don't have any recollection of  
2 any kind of positive interaction, any kind of love and  
3 affection, not that they had to do that, but I didn't  
4 feel any positive interaction at all with any of the  
5 workers and nuns that were there -- apart from one and  
6 I think I mentioned it in my statement. There was  
7 a Sister [REDACTED] BAE who I remember as -- seemed to be  
8 a very nice person. I didn't have any -- I didn't feel  
9 threatened by her for whatever reason. I just saw her  
10 as a kind of nice kind of mummy-type role.

11 From memory I think she was quite a big lady and  
12 just small and I just remember her being quite nice.  
13 I didn't have a lot of dealings with her but I wasn't  
14 frightened of her whereas the other ones I came into  
15 contact with, I was frightened of them.

16 Q. Moving on through the years and when you did meet up  
17 with your mother and developed a relationship with her,  
18 did she tell you something about what she had done on  
19 one occasion in relation to Bellevue?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What did she tell you?

22 A. I just want to put this in perspective first of all so  
23 that people can get a sort of idea about what my mother  
24 was like. When I found my mother she was very, very  
25 manic-depressive and she had been confined to bed for

1           about 10 years.

2           Q.   What age were you then?

3           A.   I was 30.   Just turned 30.   So she had been confined to  
4           bed for about 10 years at that time and she was ill.  
5           She was a sad-looking soul when I first met her.   And  
6           then -- it was like meeting up with a stranger and then  
7           trying to have some kind of relationship with that  
8           person who was your -- I knew that she was my birth  
9           mother, but I didn't see her as my mother when I first  
10          met her because it had been 30 years.

11                  But what I did find as I started to build up  
12          a relationship with my mum, there was no reason to doubt  
13          her.   She had nothing to prove by telling me anything or  
14          not telling me anything.   So, when I asked her about  
15          when we were put into care, she was able to give me some  
16          information around that, about what happened with the  
17          family and us getting put into care which I mentioned  
18          earlier.   But she did -- I did ask the question, "Why  
19          did you never come to try and find us?" and she said,  
20          "But I did".

21                  That's when she told me she went to Bellevue to see  
22          if she could see us again and look to see maybe if she  
23          could get us back but what she was told quite  
24          categorically was that we weren't there and that we had  
25          been adopted out.   Because of the word "adoption", my



1 mum took the view, well, I can't go anywhere with this  
2 because if they have been adopted out, then at that time  
3 probably there would have been no chance of her being  
4 able to get any information as to our whereabouts.

5 What the nuns didn't tell her was we were  
6 transferred to Smyllum, so we were in local authority  
7 care. So it would have been much easier for my mother,  
8 if she really wanted to, to try and track us down or  
9 trace us and have some kind of relationship.

10 I've got no reason to doubt my mother telling me  
11 that because she wouldn't gain anything from lying about  
12 it. So that's why I firmly believe that the nuns didn't  
13 tell her what had actually happened and what that has  
14 done has robbed me of a relationship with my mother for  
15 all those years. So ...

16 Q. What was your own belief over the years, particularly  
17 when you were in care and then in foster care, as to  
18 your mother, as to whether she was alive or whatever?  
19 Did you have any belief over these years as to what the  
20 position would be?

21 A. When I was growing up I always sort of dreamt and  
22 fantasised what my mum would be like, you know? Was she  
23 somebody who was well-off, rich, a beautiful-looking  
24 lady, doing really well, was she not that well off, was  
25 she struggling, was she having problems? So you grew up

1 with all these kind of images of what your mother would  
2 be like. It is difficult. We tried at different times  
3 through growing up to contact the Social Work Department  
4 and asking them about our parents but we just never got  
5 any information.

6 So just now I have instructed Birthlink, who are  
7 an organisation here in Edinburgh, and they are going to  
8 progress trying to track down a lot of our records, my  
9 brother and my sister, because we were in care from the  
10 age of -- well, I was 10 months until I was 17. I have  
11 seen the files that social workers went through when  
12 I have been speaking to them, so I know there's files  
13 but they just -- I have done SAR requests and so on with  
14 different Social Work Departments and it just comes back  
15 saying they haven't got any information, which I really  
16 have to doubt.

17 So they are going to progress to see if they can get  
18 more information about, if the social worker knew the  
19 whereabouts of my mother and the whereabouts of my  
20 father.

21 Q. I'm jumping ahead a bit, but since you have raised  
22 this -- since we are looking at this particular point,  
23 if we turn to page 16 of your statement, just moving  
24 ahead quite a distance -- that's at 2511, at  
25 paragraph 105 -- you are setting out there what I think

1           you have just told us that:

2                    "My mum told me that she tried to find us but the  
3           nuns at Bellevue had told her that we had been adopted  
4           out and they could not give her any information. I have  
5           no reason to disbelieve my mum."

6                    That's your position but you then go on to say:

7                    "We also found out that the Social Work Department  
8           knew that my mum lived five miles from our house in all  
9           the time I was growing up in Rutherglen. She lived in  
10          Maryhill. The Social Work Department knew my mum was  
11          alive the whole time we were in care and we were never  
12          told."

13          A. Yeah, I think what I mean by that is that I'm of the  
14          assumption that they knew that my mum was alive and well  
15          because I have taken the view that -- what I'm trying to  
16          do is pin down that that was actually a fact.

17          Q. But you were in contact with the social work people  
18          throughout your time in care?

19          A. Yes.

20          Q. And you were never told --

21          A. Never told.

22          Q. -- that your mother was alive?

23          A. Mm.

24          Q. On that basis if they knew, you say:

25                    "That is the biggest cruelty."

1           A. Yeah. I mean that's the -- if you look at the  
2 commonsense approach here -- and even from a layman's  
3 terms, if you have got a department, a Social Work  
4 Department that have got responsibility for looked-after  
5 children, they must have information on relatives, for  
6 whatever the case may be, whether it is -- if it was  
7 neglect, abuse whatever. They have that information or  
8 we wouldn't have been put into care in the first place.

9           So records started when I was 10 months or before.  
10 So when I went into care there must have been  
11 information: well, why has **ABK** come into care? He has  
12 come into care because he has got a mother and a father  
13 and one is **██████████** and one is **██████████**. It is not rocket  
14 science.

15           So there's information there that was available to  
16 the Social Work Department. For whatever reason, it  
17 wasn't shared with me. That should have been shared.  
18 So I'm of the belief that it hasn't been and because of  
19 that I have lost that relationship with my mother that  
20 I could have had.

21          Q. Can I then -- we have jumped ahead a bit but can I go  
22 back to when you were at Smyllum and you do tell us  
23 about one particular incident when you were taken out of  
24 Smyllum by potential foster carers and that wasn't  
25 a particularly pleasant experience.

- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about that?
- 3 A. It was just horrible.
- 4 Q. It wasn't just yourself, your brother and sister were  
5 taken out as well?
- 6 A. I think it was my brother. I can't remember if my  
7 sister -- it is a bit cloudy but I know that my brother  
8 was certainly with me. One, I didn't know why we were  
9 going away. We were just suddenly taken away from the  
10 home and the home, for all intents and purposes, was my  
11 home, so therefore we were just getting taken away and  
12 I don't remember getting any explanation as to why I was  
13 getting moved or why I was going to this place.
- 14 But the whole time I was there it was just  
15 a horrible experience. It was just -- I don't remember  
16 anybody sitting down and saying, right, we are going to  
17 send you here because you are in a home just now, you  
18 need to be in looked-after accommodation, we need to try  
19 and get you supportive sort of parents to maybe look  
20 after you and give you a kind of family unit. Nothing.  
21 So I was just in this place and then it just wasn't  
22 happy. There was drinking and violence and different  
23 things and that's all I can remember.
- 24 Q. Do you know how long you were there for?
- 25 A. I think it was a weekend. I think it was over the

1 course of a weekend.

2 Q. I think what you tell us in your statement is you were  
3 taken back by the man and the woman involved when it was  
4 dark, so you have got some recollection of that and what  
5 that involved.

6 A. Mm. Well, because of another incident that happened,  
7 the dark was horrible for me. I hated darkness and  
8 I just remember being dropped off and just left there  
9 and I was hitting the door trying to get in and there  
10 was nobody there. I remember saying to my brother,  
11 "What are we going to do?" and he was trying to calm me  
12 down and I was just hysterical for -- I mean, for God's  
13 sake, I was 3 or 4 and that was a big, open place  
14 anyway, there was no lights or -- so if it was dark, it  
15 was dark. So it was just horrible and if just felt like  
16 ages before eventually -- I think it was a bus run or  
17 something they had all been on -- came back. But I just  
18 got abuse for being hysterical and for being probably  
19 a bit of a pansy or something but ...

20 Q. Were you distressed?

21 A. Oh yeah.

22 Q. Were you shown any sympathy by any adults?

23 A. None. None whatsoever.

24 Q. I now want to ask you a little bit about abuse that you  
25 suffered at Smyllum. I want to begin by just asking you

1           about bed-wetting because I understand from what you  
2           have told us in your statement that that was something  
3           that you did suffer from while at Smyllum; is that  
4           right?

5           A. Yes.

6           Q. Can you tell me what the position was then if you wet  
7           the bed?

8           A. Well, I just know that bed-wetting was a no-no because  
9           I know that some of the boys were persistent bed-wetters  
10          and they were always getting sort of told off or  
11          punished or whatever the case may be.

12                 I mean the bed-wetting -- I mean I was a prolific  
13          bed-wetter until the age of 9. So even when we was in  
14          foster care, I suffered bed-wetting for quite some time.  
15          So it was kind of endemic. I don't know if it was  
16          because of the environment we were in, whether it was  
17          because it was freezing cold at night and maybe you  
18          weren't allowed to go and use the toilet at certain  
19          times. I don't know. But from -- my memory was that  
20          I just wet the bed but I don't personally remember it  
21          being a big problem for me in getting abuse from the  
22          nuns around the actual bed-wetting part of it. I just  
23          knew that it was something that I did and it was maybe  
24          just fear or whatever.

25          Q. Did you see other boys being punished for bed-wetting?

1 A. No. Only from what they have told me. What I want to  
2 do, I want to make sure that what I am saying is as  
3 accurate as I can make it and I am not one to make up  
4 stories about other people. I didn't specifically see  
5 people getting hit for bed-wetting. So I'm not going to  
6 lie about that, but I think it was only things that they  
7 had maybe told me.

8 Q. But you do tell us about being pulled out of bed one  
9 night by either [ACF] or Sister [EAC]  
10 [ACF] being the layperson who was involved.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. You have some recollection of that happening?

13 A. Oh yes.

14 Q. Was that in connection with bed-wetting?

15 A. It may well have been. It is just that I don't know for  
16 absolute certain but -- I just know that we were playing  
17 around, whether it was pillow fights or something, but  
18 we were all carrying on and they heard somebody was  
19 coming and they were all jumping back into bed and  
20 I didn't get back in time. That's what I remember.  
21 Then of course I get -- started getting hit and then  
22 thrown out in the fire escape.

23 Q. I will come back to that; I think that's a different  
24 point you are making.

25 But in relation to possibly bed-wetting, do you



1 remember being dragged to the toilets?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. That's something you tell us about.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. That was either Sister **EAC** or **ACF** I don't  
6 think you are able to tell us which one it was.

7 A. I can't be absolutely accurate.

8 Q. Why were you being dragged to the toilets?

9 A. It may well have been because of bed-wetting but I just  
10 know what the outcome was.

11 Q. What was the outcome?

12 A. The outcome was when I was taken to the toilet and it  
13 was -- the toilets were bare and very dark and dank and  
14 kind of -- and I just remember her just pushing me down  
15 into the toilet as if, right, are you going to do the  
16 toilet or are you not, and I just remember I kept just  
17 getting pushed by my shoulders into the toilet and  
18 I just -- I was hysterical and I just thought I was  
19 going to disappear down the toilet for some reason.

20 I'm trying to remember what age -- I'm thinking, was  
21 I 3, was I 2, was I 4? I can't remember, but it was  
22 definitely -- certainly in those years.

23 She just -- I just remember her, this chain flushing  
24 and the water all coming up. I don't know, but that's  
25 what I remember.

1 Q. But then you went on to talk about an incident where you  
2 were having a pillow fight in the dormitory and you  
3 heard someone coming.

4 A. Mm.

5 Q. I think the other children ran to their beds. What  
6 about you, what happened to you?

7 A. As I said earlier, I didn't get there in time. This  
8 particular memory is the most difficult one because  
9 I think it is the one that had a huge impact and I just  
10 remember being hit, abused, whatever, and just heading  
11 for this door and just being put outside.

12 Q. Before we come to that, can you remember who was  
13 involved with you at that point?

14 A. It was either Sister **EAC** or **ACF**

15 Q. Were you being hit with something?

16 A. I thought it was like a coat hanger or something wooden.

17 Q. Where were you being hit?

18 A. In the dormitory.

19 Q. On your body, which part of your body? Can you  
20 remember?

21 A. I can't remember. I just remember my arms going up.  
22 That's all I can remember, but then the biggest part of  
23 it is getting put out onto the fire escape.

24 Q. And what happened then? You were put out on the fire  
25 escape and were you left there?

1 A. I was left there and it was pitch black and I knew it  
2 was a fire escape.

3 Q. Was the door to the fire escape closed?

4 A. Yes. So they closed it. Put me out and closed it and  
5 then just left me there. I don't know how long it was.  
6 But I don't remember getting back in. So I don't know  
7 how it ended. Did I -- I just remember being out there  
8 for what seemed like forever.

9 Q. Were you distressed? Can you remember that?

10 A. "Distressed"? Sorry, but I think that's  
11 an understatement.

12 Q. You tell me how you felt.

13 A. It was just awful. It was just awful. But I think it  
14 was just because -- it was a big fire escape and I know  
15 I just kept seeing this man, somebody coming up towards  
16 me, constantly, somebody coming up the stairs.

17 So, the impact of that has been -- when I was in  
18 foster care, I couldn't go to the toilet on my own with  
19 the dark, I had to have lights on, I had to have night  
20 lights, you know even -- so my foster carer would need  
21 to be at the bottom of the stairs for me to walk up the  
22 stairs with all the lights on and then wait for me to  
23 come back down the stairs. I just couldn't do anything  
24 when it was really dark.

25 I mean, even in your adult life, you know, if I was

1 out and I was suddenly on my own and I was walking in  
2 the dark, I would be constantly looking behind me all  
3 the time. It is just a -- so that has had a huge  
4 impact.

5 Q. What you tell us in your statement in relation to these  
6 incidents you have been telling us about is that you  
7 have had nightmares about these incidents.

8 A. Yes. There's three instances -- and I know, like from  
9 being in foster care and also being a foster carer  
10 myself, I know a lot of children who come from neglect  
11 and abuse and horrible backgrounds and, you know, it is  
12 a horrible thing but those particular instances --  
13 I know there's children been through worse than myself,  
14 but those couple of instances have just stood in my  
15 memory and I can't eradicate them. They have just  
16 always been there.

17 Q. Looking at the time more generally, putting aside these  
18 particular incidents, do you have any recollection of  
19 other aspects of cruelty, if you like, towards you by  
20 either -- by the people you have mentioned,  
21 Sister **EAC** and **ACF**

22 A. No. The instances that I have raised are the ones that  
23 I know happened and how they have impacted me. Other  
24 ones I don't want to make assumptions around because I'm  
25 not 100 per cent sure. So I just know that living in

1 Smyllum was not a happy place and there was no joy.  
2 There was no -- I mean the first time I found out that  
3 there was a birthday was when I went to foster carers.  
4 Now I was 6 and I didn't know there was such a thing as  
5 a birthday. I don't know what a Christmas was. Who was  
6 Santa Claus? Now --

7 Q. There was no celebration?

8 A. There was nothing. So therefore how could you have  
9 happy memories of somewhere where there weren't any?  
10 When I look at my own two sons, they knew about Santa  
11 when they were 2 and 3, you know? It was part of  
12 growing up. Part of the whole loveliness about  
13 Christmas. I didn't know there was a Christmas or  
14 a birthday or celebrations or anything like that.

15 So to me that's actually quite telling that if you  
16 can't remember anything like that when you are 6 coming  
17 up for 7, I think you've got a problem. So as I say,  
18 I didn't have happy times at all.

19 Q. You have told us, I think, that apart from the nun,  
20 Sister BAE, that you mentioned, so far as the  
21 other nuns were concerned your position was you were  
22 frightened of them?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Do you know why?

25 A. I think I know why I was frightened because I never

1           stayed in doors, because in doors was where  
2           predominantly the Sisters and the workers were. So  
3           I didn't venture in doors unless I had to. So therefore  
4           it stands to reason I would stop myself from going into  
5           the home, so I stayed outside.

6           Q. What I'm asking you is: do you know why you were  
7           frightened of these people?

8           A. No, I just know I was frightened. I mean, I think if  
9           you are aged 2, 3, and 4, you can't justify why you have  
10          got feelings or a thought process as to why you are not  
11          going to do anything, or why you feel frightened: you  
12          don't know; you just know. At that age I just knew that  
13          I was frightened. There's maybe things I blocked out  
14          that I can't remember, but as I say, it was just a case  
15          of they were the three things that I know definitely  
16          happened to me; the rest of the time I was just  
17          an unhappy person.

18          Q. Did you have much contact with your older brother and  
19          older sister when you were at Smyllum?

20          A. No. I don't remember seeing much of my brother.  
21          I think I might have been quite lucky in a sense.  
22          I think I fell below the radar, fell under the radar  
23          because -- even from a punishment perspective as well,  
24          because I think I was in what you would call  
25          kindergarten, the nursery, and I was sort of in the

1 nursery area, I would think. So maybe I was maybe lucky  
2 a wee bit -- although luck's not the right word,  
3 I suppose -- but things maybe could have been worse but  
4 my brother and my sister, because they were older,  
5 I think they were in another part of the home. So  
6 I didn't have much interaction or dealings with my  
7 brother and my sister very much.

8 Q. Do you remember going to school at Smyllum?

9 A. No. I remember a classroom vaguely but that's all.  
10 I don't remember anything else. The first time  
11 I remember school properly was when I went into foster  
12 care.

13 Q. You do tell us in your statement that your brother and  
14 your sister had bad experiences at Smyllum. Is that  
15 because that's what you have learned from them?

16 A. Yes. The only one I would share is the one where my  
17 brother was with me and when we went to Mr and  
18 Mrs **AGP**. That's one I shared with **JAA**, but the  
19 other ones is things that have happened to them and it  
20 is their right to tell their story.

21 Q. Can I then take you, Bill, to the point when you left  
22 Smyllum. I think we have already established that that  
23 was in 1965 when you were 6 years of age.

24 In leaving Smyllum, you tell us that it was a place  
25 you hated because you were in fear all the time. But

1           you went into foster care after that; is that correct?

2           A. Yes.

3           Q. I don't propose to look at the detail of the time you  
4           spent in foster care because we are not looking at that  
5           at this stage, but you tell us, I think, you remained in  
6           foster care until you were about 14; is that about  
7           right?

8           A. Yes.

9           Q. You then went to a home called Campbell House Children's  
10          Home in Cullen?

11          A. Yes.

12          Q. You were there for one and a half years or so?

13          A. Yes, about that.

14          Q. Which would take you up to about the ages of 15 or 16.

15          A. Yes, just under 16.

16          Q. You then went to another hostel called Glengowan Boy's  
17          Hostel in Pollokshields?

18          A. Yes.

19          Q. You were there until I think you were 17; is that right?

20          A. Mm.

21          Q. Again we are not looking at the detail of your stay  
22          there, but you came across a priest there, I think, that  
23          has helped you.

24          A. Yes.

25          Q. Can you tell me a little bit about that?



1       A. Yes. He, his name is Father John, but he was quite  
2       a young priest and he was not -- he had not long been  
3       ordained I think at the time, just a few years, and this  
4       was one of his first kind of jobs, if you like, that he  
5       was given. What he did was he looked after about six or  
6       seven boys from the age group of maybe 13/14 to 17.

7       I think the most they could hold was about 12 boys.

8                But I just found him to be quite a good guidance for  
9       me. I could go and talk to him about things and he  
10      never resisted or, you know, pooh-poohed me in saying,  
11      och, away you go, and all that, but he always had  
12      a listening ear.

13               What I wanted to try and get across today is -- and  
14      I am glad you raised it -- although there was a culture  
15      of evil around the sort of religious orders at the time,  
16      there are good people in this world that work for the  
17      religious orders and from my own experience he was one  
18      of them.

19               He was a very decent person and he did a lot to try  
20      and help me with some of the issues I had at the time.  
21      In fact, I'm just coming back from Dublin two weeks ago  
22      where I was over seeing him, so we have kept in touch  
23      for about 30-odd years.

24      Q. He was a Vincentian priest?

25      A. Yes.

1 Q. Can I then look at the position in relation to your life  
2 after care? Again, without looking at the detail of  
3 that, but you, I think, came to a point when you were  
4 living in a bedsit, I think, in the Queen's Park area of  
5 Glasgow.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Around about that time I think you met your wife; is  
8 that correct?

9 A. No, it was a good few years after.

10 Q. But that was life-changing for you?

11 A. Yes. Well, from the age of about 17 you were -- there  
12 was no support network. Social work and places like  
13 that didn't -- they weren't there to look after you once  
14 you got to 17 or 18 because you were then an adult,  
15 classified as an adult and therefore anything they could  
16 do to help was just stopped, if you like. There was no  
17 continuing care after care, leaving care, anything like  
18 that; it was just, you are on your own.

19 So from about 17 I was on my own and it was one of  
20 the darkest places I have been in because there wasn't  
21 anybody to go to. I didn't have a family, I didn't have  
22 a network that I could go to, so I just had to do a lot  
23 on my own, but, it was scary.

24 But at the same time there was two -- I came  
25 across -- I came to a fork in the road where I would

1           either have to go down one road where it would be, you  
2           know, the worst move ever, you know, getting into drugs  
3           and drink and all those different things and just not  
4           caring about anybody and just not living life really.  
5           Or go the other way and try and do something with your  
6           life. So I chose to go the other way and try and do  
7           something with my life and that's what I have been  
8           doing.

9           But, as I say, that's from 17 to 20 years. It was  
10          a difficult, difficult time but I managed to get through  
11          it and then, of course, as you say, when I met my wife,  
12          ██████████, that kind of changed a lot.

13         Q. What age were you then?

14         A. I was 23. 23, 24.

15         Q. I think you tell us although you left school with no  
16          qualifications you went to night school --

17         A. Yes.

18         Q. -- and you did get a diploma in management and got a job  
19          with the Department of ██████████ and effectively  
20          worked your way up, is that right --

21         A. Yes.

22         Q. -- to a senior position?

23         A. Yes.

24         Q. You have told us already about seeking to trace your  
25          mother and that's something you did when you were about

1           30. As you have said, one of the biggest cruelties you  
2           feel is that you weren't told about her existence,  
3           basically.

4           A. Yeah.

5           Q. Is that right?

6           A. Yeah. I mean, to me it is kind of -- it is fundamental.  
7           You know, your family is your family and you should  
8           never be denied that. I mean, I have taken in kids who  
9           have come from really bad backgrounds -- neglect, drug  
10          abuse and so on and so forth -- but they have got birth  
11          parents and I actively promote contact with the birth  
12          parents as long as there is no risk to the child. But  
13          I will promote that, you know, they have to keep in  
14          touch with their birth parents and keep those roots and  
15          build up relationships and to me that's key.

16                 I was denied that. I'm not saying that if I would  
17          have met my mother earlier that it would have had a big  
18          impact on me from a positive perspective, but what it  
19          would have done is it would have given me a choice and  
20          it would have let me have options to explore, whereas  
21          I was denied that. I can't forgive that, I'm afraid.

22          Q. When you went into foster care, did you go into foster  
23          care with your brother and sister?

24          A. Yes.

25          Q. In relation to that relationship, how has that

1 relationship been over the years?

2 A. With my brother and my sister?

3 Q. Yes.

4 A. Difficult. It's been difficult. I think when we were  
5 in the home, as I said earlier, we never really had much  
6 interaction with each other. Then we went into foster  
7 care we were suddenly in a family unit where we spent  
8 a lot of time together at a young age, JAA and  
9 ██████████, but we had never really built up any  
10 relationship before that, to all intents and purposes.  
11 So it was like we were strangers again a wee bit in  
12 a sense. I knew that I was the wee brother and I had  
13 an older brother and sister but we never really bonded,  
14 I don't think, from earlier years so I think as we grew  
15 up from the foster care we had to discover each other  
16 and try and build up kind of some kind of relationship.

17 But then even as we started to do that, when ██████████  
18 got moved, she got moved just when she turned 16 and she  
19 got put into a convent, which was just the worst thing  
20 that could ever have happened, but that's what did  
21 happen. Then JAA and I went ██████████ to our home ██████████  
22 there.

23 So -- and then we kind of separated after that and  
24 so I would say that for a lot of time we kind of became  
25 estranged. We didn't see a lot of each other as we were

- 1 in different parts of the country. So it has had  
2 an impact on our relations.
- 3 Q. I think you tell us that's a relationship, particularly  
4 with your brother, that you have been building up --
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. -- in more recent times?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. But your sister unfortunately has had quite a difficult  
9 time; is that right?
- 10 A. My sister is the one -- I have sent in her evidence  
11 along with mine and my brother's, but my sister's is  
12 really powerful and it is very, very sad.
- 13 Q. She had a difficult time?
- 14 A. Yes. She was the oldest so she remembers an awful lot  
15 more because she was in Smyllum until the age of 9. She  
16 can actually remember Bellevue, when I was 10 months and  
17 she was 2 coming up for 3. She can remember that, so  
18 [REDACTED] has got a whole -- she suffered a lot, but she  
19 remembers a lot and the impact on her has been  
20 catastrophic, really.
- 21 Q. And I don't think, because of her position, that she's  
22 able to come and speak directly to the Inquiry.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Is that right?
- 25 A. Yes. I mean, my sister has been in a residential care

1 home for about -- it must be over 15 years. It is a sad  
2 indictment of -- she was very, very clever, she was  
3 educated to degree standard, so she wasn't an idiot, and  
4 she was doing really well, but she just had loads of  
5 issues about her past and saw many psychiatrists,  
6 counsellors, going in and out of therapy, all sorts of  
7 things, and eventually she couldn't cope with it.  
8 I think it just -- it kind of destroyed her, I would  
9 say.

10 Q. In relation to your own position, as you have told us,  
11 you did rise to a senior position in the Civil Service  
12 but you do believe, I think, that you would have even  
13 gone further up but for your experience of care; is that  
14 what you think?

15 A. Yes, the thing about growing up in the working  
16 environment, see, is that you feel you have to prove  
17 yourself all the time. It is exhausting. So therefore  
18 whenever I was -- it was an identity crisis, I think,  
19 and whether you belonged anywhere.

20 If you grow up and you don't have any supportive  
21 network and you don't have somebody saying to you, "Look  
22 you are doing okay, you can fail and it is fine, you can  
23 learn from it", but if you don't have anything like that  
24 in your life then it is very, very difficult to stay  
25 strong and to stay motivated.

1           Therefore, you know everything that I did within my  
2           job, whether it be ██████████ manager, ██████ manager, all  
3           these different roles, I had to keep proving to myself  
4           that I could do this and was I worthy of being able to  
5           do that. Even when I went up for promotion interviews  
6           I would come out and say, I never got that because I was  
7           rubbish, and I never, ever came out of anything with  
8           a positive attitude thinking -- I would always think the  
9           worst.

10           Whereas my two sons are at the level that I'm at  
11           when I retired and they are only 30. Now I'm a great  
12           believer that they are doing well because (1) they are  
13           putting the work in themselves but (2) they have had  
14           that support and that self-esteem building and  
15           confidence from me and my wife. So they've grown up in  
16           that kind of environment where, yeah, it is good to do  
17           well and to do as much as you can. So I think I was  
18           kind of held back a wee bit just through my own  
19           self-belief, if you like. So, yeah, you are right,  
20           I think I could have maybe went -- the only good thing  
21           out of it was I retired at 56 and not many people can  
22           say that.

23           Q. Lucky you!

24           A. That's a good thing that came out of it, but I think  
25           I probably could have done better.



1 Q. Well, you provide us with some other information in your  
2 statement, Bill, and I want to take you to that and  
3 that's on page 22 at paragraph 140. What you say is  
4 this:

5 "I wouldn't necessarily expect to get love and  
6 affection in Smyllum or Bellevue, but fundamentally,  
7 there should have been a basic standard of care."

8 Do you see that?

9 A. Mm.

10 Q. Is that your position?

11 A. Most definitely.

12 Q. You say:

13 "There should have been more responsibility and more  
14 accountability, as there was none when I was there."

15 That's your position on that?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. You have touched upon this already -- and I think it is  
18 possible that seems to be close to your heart, Bill --  
19 and that is the need for a support structure when  
20 a person leaves care. Can you just elaborate upon that  
21 for me because I think this is part of your own  
22 experience also as a foster carer?

23 A. Well, it was my experience as being brought up in care.  
24 Where it has kind of more come home to me is with my  
25 wife and I being foster carers. We got into foster

1           caring by accident. It wasn't a sort of life-long  
2           ambition for me to be a foster carer, it just so  
3           happened that one of my sons' school friends, they were  
4           in foster care and it had broken down and he was getting  
5           moved and my son came in and asked me would I look after  
6           his pal and I said, but we are not foster carers. What  
7           we were was we took in -- we looked after children with  
8           learning disabilities. So we used to do respite for  
9           parents who just needed a break so we would maybe take  
10          some children just for a weekend and things like that,  
11          but we still had to go through the Adoption and  
12          Fostering Panel, so we had went through that anyway.

13                 Therefore, when my son asked me about taking one of  
14                 his friends, we said, well, we can ask the Social Work  
15                 Department and see what they think, so we did and, of  
16                 course, he came to stay with us and that's how we kind  
17                 of got into the fostering side of it.

18                 So where I found it difficult was that there's no  
19                 consistency of approach across -- say, for example,  
20                 across Scotland. It is something -- there could be  
21                 different things getting done in different places in  
22                 Scotland, like Glasgow, Edinburgh and so on. So there's  
23                 not a consistency of approach across fostering or  
24                 adoption.

25                 But one of the things I found quite difficult is

1 that you know a lot of people, especially other foster  
2 carers, they kind of choose what age group suits them,  
3 for whatever reason, which is fine. A lot of people  
4 might want under 10s. Some people might want 11 to 15  
5 or very, very rarely willing to take 16 and above.  
6 Especially 11 to 15, they are difficult because they are  
7 into their teenage years, so therefore it gets more  
8 difficult and more challenging. Therefore that's why in  
9 some instances there is a shortage of carers for those  
10 age groups. But fundamentally once they get to 16 they  
11 are abandoned or they are kind of -- they are promoted  
12 or the social work try to move them on to independent  
13 living, but moving them onto independent living at 16/17  
14 when they are not ready.

15 Q. You have had an experience of that directly, have you  
16 not?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Are you happy to give us some insight into that?

19 A. What happened was we had sisters, [REDACTED] and [REDACTED], and  
20 they came to live with us. [REDACTED] was 5 and her sister  
21 was 11.

22 When they came, they came in an emergency. They  
23 came straight from hospital, I can't remember, but they  
24 came straight on a Friday night and they came with two  
25 social workers and the social workers arrived at my

1 door, came in with the two children. [REDACTED], who was 5,  
2 was hanging onto [REDACTED] leg, her sister, wouldn't let  
3 her go, but what they were doing was splitting them.

4 So what they said to me is, right, [REDACTED] is to stay  
5 here and [REDACTED] is to go somewhere else, and I'm looking  
6 at this situation in front of me and saying, well,  
7 you've got two sisters here, one is just devastated at  
8 being moved away from her home environment, and you are  
9 going to split them up again? So I just said, well, why  
10 don't you keep them here, let them stay here for one  
11 overnight, and then you can think about moving them on.  
12 But I knew that as soon as I got two of them in the one  
13 house with us, they wouldn't move them.

14 Q. Did they?

15 A. So they didn't. So I have had [REDACTED] since she was 5 --  
16 and she is 18 -- and [REDACTED] is now 23 and she's working  
17 and living in [REDACTED] now. But when she got to the  
18 age of 17 or 18, I was getting what they call "leaving  
19 care" contacting us and trying to promote [REDACTED] into  
20 independent living and moving on and giving her details  
21 about being on the waiting list for council houses. I'm  
22 just sitting thinking, well, she can stay here for as  
23 long as she likes because we are down as what they are  
24 called permanent placement, so if children come to us  
25 the idea is we would keep them for as long as they want

1 to be with us.

2 Q. What happened in relation to --

3 A. What happened in relation to [REDACTED] was leaving care got  
4 involved and we changed from being foster carers for  
5 [REDACTED] to leaving care support, which -- but the very  
6 nature of that, what leaving care means is that for  
7 example -- say for, example, [REDACTED] wanted to move on in  
8 independent living we could say, well, don't just move  
9 straight into a flat or into a council house or  
10 whatever, I said, you can go to supported carers, you  
11 can go there and they help you budget and do cooking and  
12 you come in and kind of fend for yourself, and they are  
13 just there to sort of try and give you that  
14 independence, like in a halfway house. I said, that  
15 would be quite good. I think that works fine if they  
16 move them into that kind of accommodation but what they  
17 did was they changed our -- what we were for [REDACTED] as  
18 foster carers to leaving care. So we brought [REDACTED] up  
19 for all these years as a foster child and then we would  
20 have to literally say, well, look, you are not a foster  
21 child, you are still in the same house, we still love  
22 you, but we are not going to cook for you now, you will  
23 need to cook for yourself and you will need to learn to  
24 budget, and her sister was still in the house, and it  
25 just didn't make any sense. It didn't work as far as

1 I was concerned. I think there is a place for it, but  
2 they call it "continuous care" now, I think, and I have  
3 been looking up the Children's Act and they have changed  
4 it from 2014 where they call it "continuous care".

5 But they don't call it continuous care in Glasgow  
6 because when I looked up the actual Children's Act there  
7 is nothing in it about leaving care in the actual  
8 legislation. It is just part of Glasgow Social Work  
9 Department/Social Services that have leaving care.

10 I checked and Edinburgh doesn't have leaving care  
11 services as such. So there is different things going on  
12 both in England and in Wales and in Scotland, so there's  
13 no consistency of approach. Therefore, I would like to  
14 see more of that up to the age of 21. The more I'm  
15 starting to look at it, supporting children right up to  
16 that age and if not ...

17 I really worried about [REDACTED] because [REDACTED] had  
18 a learning disability and she went to a special needs  
19 school so, you know, I'm sure protecting her as much as  
20 I can so that as she gets older they are not just going  
21 to try and fob her off into some kind of leaving care  
22 and into independent living, so we have applied for  
23 guardianship. So we are doing guardianship through the  
24 Court of Session and we want to do that for [REDACTED] because  
25 she is vulnerable. So, as I say, those are the kind of

1 things across the social care that should be getting  
2 looked at, that consistency.

3 Q. You do provide us with that sort of account in your  
4 statement, but just to finish off in relation to the  
5 older child, I think she did go out into a flat, but you  
6 brought her back effectively.

7 A. What happened was we got her -- she moved into  
8 independent accommodation but the difficulty was that  
9 [REDACTED] had two strikes and she was out. For example, if  
10 they offered her a house on the waiting list and she  
11 didn't take it, then she would have one more chance and  
12 then she would be off the waiting list. So, the areas  
13 that they can offer are not the greatest of areas, as  
14 you can understand, because of the shortage of housing,  
15 and especially as a single young person, they are not at  
16 the top of their priority list. So therefore when she  
17 was offered accommodation she really felt she had to  
18 take it or she would be off the list.

19 Q. What age was she then?

20 A. She was 19, just coming up for 20. But I mean we helped  
21 her move in and got her all set up and everything. She  
22 got a grant from leaving care to get some furniture and  
23 all that. That was all good, quite positive.

24 But the area she was in she was surrounded by what  
25 you would call like drug dens, where there was people

1 taking drugs in the house next door and drinking and all  
2 these kind of things. So I had the council down to  
3 check on her and all that kind of stuff and they knew  
4 about the sort of neighbours that were there, but they  
5 didn't want to lose [REDACTED] as a tenant because she was  
6 a good tenant and she paid all other bills and didn't  
7 have any arrears. But it was dangerous and it was  
8 a safety issue. So I said to the council, if you can't  
9 move her, I need to take her out of there because it is  
10 not safe. Because she worked in the town and she was  
11 coming home at 1 am and, you know, it was just -- it was  
12 a dangerous environment to be in. So anyway we took her  
13 back and she stayed with us just as part of our family,  
14 no social work involvement. So she stayed with us for  
15 another six or seven months until she --

16 Q. The message I think you are giving us in relation to  
17 children in foster care is that there has to be some  
18 system to protect them when the foster care arrangement  
19 comes to an end.

20 A. Yes. I think they are looking at it, but it is not  
21 cohesive. It is kind of a rubber band over everything.  
22 There's obviously funding issues and resourcing issues  
23 and I can understand all of that, but I wish they would  
24 just stop saying person centred, child centred. There's  
25 all these lovely, lovely key messages but underneath it,



1 is it actually happening? You know, I would just like  
2 to see some kind of proof of that. That there's  
3 something that if people -- it is all right for people  
4 to say what they are going to do but they have to act on  
5 it and if they don't act on it the words are  
6 meaningless.

7 Q. You are a fan of unannounced visits by social workers to  
8 foster parents.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You tell us about that in your statement and that's  
11 something you would encourage should happen?

12 A. Absolutely. Because when you look at a lot of the  
13 headlines that you see now, and you look at what  
14 happened in Smyllum Home and these other places,  
15 actually it is not that much different nowadays, which  
16 is actually really sad.

17 Because we would have thought we would have learned  
18 lessons from all the things that happened in the 1950s,  
19 1960s and 1970s, but we haven't really. They are still  
20 the headline cases that come up, where they fall through  
21 the net, where there has been misjudgement.

22 I don't for one minute advocate that the Social Work  
23 Department are wrong or they do things wrong. There's  
24 mistakes gets made and that's normal that mistakes get  
25 made, but there doesn't seem to be anything put in place

1 to try and ensure it doesn't happen. They say that  
2 things will be put in place, but are they really, you  
3 know? There are cases that I have heard about and  
4 I think: how could that possibly happen in this day and  
5 age and technology and digital and everything we have  
6 got and there are still children at risk, at serious  
7 risk. There's something not right about that. Children  
8 should be the ones that are the most protected ever and  
9 it is still causing issues, it is still causing  
10 problems.

11 Q. One of the points you make is that social workers really  
12 need to make more of an effort to speak to the children.

13 A. Yes. I think what happens is -- and I have come from  
14 public sector, I know resourcing, budgets, you know,  
15 and, you know, you have got to cut costs, I know all  
16 that, and it is fundamentally important and it makes  
17 common sense for a business. But if you are going to  
18 invest the time in foster care or adoption or whatever,  
19 that costs money. There's training, there's preparation  
20 groups, there's assessments, all these things going on.  
21 Sometimes things might not be spotted because if you  
22 are -- if I'm doing -- I will sometimes join up with the  
23 social work to do assessment groups and do some of the  
24 training with social workers for newly approved foster  
25 carers. Sometimes I can get a sense when I'm listening

1 to them that there's something not quite right or I feel  
2 there's a red flag somewhere. But it is a feeling.  
3 I can't prove it but I just feel it.

4 Therefore, sometimes when people do get -- come out  
5 the other end and do become carers there still has to be  
6 checks in place. There still has to be -- the same way  
7 there is with homes, or whatever the place is in social  
8 care, within a care environment there has to be checks.  
9 Because if there's no checks, then that's when things  
10 fall through the net and that's when the papers get the  
11 stories.

12 So to me, I proactively ask the social workers --  
13 when they come to our house for a meeting or anything,  
14 I will say, we are just going to go away now and you can  
15 talk to the children, you can talk to the girls, you can  
16 talk to them on their own. I say to the girls, I'm just  
17 going to leave youse and if you want to say anything,  
18 say whatever you need to say.

19 I also encourage independent people that they can go  
20 and speak to because there are things getting missed.  
21 If you don't do unannounced visits then you are not  
22 going to get the red flags, you are not going to see  
23 them, and that's -- and it might just be one unannounced  
24 visit that could actually make a difference and maybe  
25 have preventative measures for something worse happening

1 further down the line.

2 So I am not saying foster carers are not good  
3 carers, of course they are, but all I'm just saying is  
4 there needs to be -- I would have thought religious  
5 orders and everything were fantastic or great. Well,  
6 were they? No, because there were no checks done. It  
7 is the same position I'm taking.

8 Q. Thank you for these very helpful, thought-provoking  
9 comments.

10 A. Sure.

11 Q. Can I take you back, finally, to Smyllum itself. I can  
12 say to you that the Inquiry has spoken to some nuns who  
13 may have been at Smyllum over the period that you and  
14 members of your family were at Smyllum. The message  
15 that the Inquiry has received from them is that children  
16 at Smyllum were well cared for and they were shown  
17 kindness and it was a happy environment. What's your  
18 response to that?

19 A. Is it actually worth a response? If I was to respond,  
20 I would totally refute that. From my own experience  
21 that wasn't the case. I think sometimes it is all very  
22 well for religious orders to, you know, say, we are  
23 really sorry for what happened and that this should  
24 never have happened, we apologise. That's meaningless,  
25 that doesn't mean anything. Anybody can say, oh, I'm

1           sorry about that, or, that was tragic, or, that should  
2           never have happened. But it did. From my understanding  
3           and my own experience -- and I think until -- apologies  
4           are not good enough; some people have to be held  
5           accountability. There is an accountability in  
6           everything that we do, whether it be with your family,  
7           parenting, work, college, anything. There's  
8           accountability isn't there? So there has to be  
9           accountability no matter where you are and the religious  
10          orders should not be treated any different.

11                 I'm not advocating -- I'm not interested in money,  
12                 and compensation. Not interested. What I do want is  
13                 somebody just to say that, yeah, you were wrong, that  
14                 should never have happened, and you are to blame, you  
15                 know, and be accountable.

16                 There are firms, organisations that -- damages are  
17                 given against them and they have to pay damages, right?  
18                 One of the things I would like to see is religious  
19                 orders, if they are found to be culpable, then pay  
20                 damages, you know, and pay it into the community, where  
21                 people need it, and they could do some good with it.

22                 The Sisters of Charity is a very rich organisation,  
23                 as a lot of them are, and compensation is not going to  
24                 change anything for individuals. But damages will hurt  
25                 them and if there's damages can be taken against orders,

1 the same way as an organisation, BT, anybody, if they  
2 are deemed to do something wrong, then they are fined  
3 and they have got to pay damages. Why are religious  
4 orders any different? So that's personally what I would  
5 like to see -- whether that will ever happen of  
6 course -- but that's my view.

7 MR MacAULAY: Bill, thank you for that and for coming here  
8 to give your evidence to the Inquiry.

9 I can say, my Lady, that I haven't received any  
10 written questions for Bill and I don't know if there are  
11 to be any other questions.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Are there any outstanding  
13 applications for questions of for this witness? No.

14 Bill, there are no more questions for you but before  
15 I let you go can I thank you very much for coming along  
16 to give your evidence today, not just about your time in  
17 care, but for what you have been able to share with us  
18 about your time as a foster parent and your thoughts  
19 about life after care, it's really helpful. I'm now  
20 able to let you go.

21 A. All right. Thank you very much.

22 (The witness withdrew)

23 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, perhaps I can suggest we can adjourn  
24 now until about 11.45 am when the next witness is due to  
25 give evidence.

1 LADY SMITH: Yes, I think that will be in order. It makes  
2 sense. So we will pause now for the morning break and  
3 sit again at 11.45 am.

4 (11.25 am)

5 (A short break)

6 (11.50 am)

7 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

8 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, the next witness is an applicant  
9 witness who wants to remain anonymous and I understand  
10 that she has recently decided that she wants to use the  
11 name "Margaret" when giving her evidence.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

13 Good morning, Margaret. Would you take the oath,  
14 please.

15 "MARGARET" (sworn)

16 LADY SMITH: Do sit down and make yourself comfortable. Now  
17 if you keep yourself near that microphone, you will find  
18 it really easy to make yourself heard.

19 A. A bit closer?

20 LADY SMITH: Maybe a little bit closer.

21 A. There?

22 LADY SMITH: That's good, thank you.

23 Mr MacAulay.

24 Questions from MR MacAULAY

25 MR MacAULAY: My Lady.

1 Hello, Margaret. I don't want to know your date of  
2 birth, but to get a time frame I need to get you to  
3 confirm your year of birth. Am I right in saying you  
4 were born in 1936?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You provided the Inquiry with a statement. It is in the  
7 red folder in front of you and I will ask you to look at  
8 it in a moment. Before we do that, can I just say this  
9 to you: I will be asking you questions and it is quite  
10 often the case that, particularly with regard to dates,  
11 witnesses can't remember dates and so on. So if that's  
12 the position, just say so, just say you can't remember  
13 that. Likewise, if something comes to your mind that  
14 you hadn't thought of before that might be relevant to  
15 us, then feel free to tell us about it.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. I now just want to look quickly at your statement. I'm  
18 going to give a reference number for the transcript; it  
19 is WIT.001.01.0765. I want to take you to the very last  
20 page of the statement, Margaret, at page 0785, again for  
21 the transcript, but it is internal page 21.

22 A. I am getting there. I'm getting there, sorry. I'm  
23 there, yes.

24 Q. Good. Can I ask you to confirm that you have signed  
25 this statement?



1 A. Yes.

2 Q. If we look at the last paragraph, paragraph 121, do you  
3 tell us:  
4 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
5 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry"?  
6 Is that the case?  
7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You go on to say:  
9 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
10 statement to be true."  
11 Is that right?  
12 A. I do, yes.

13 Q. We know from records that we have seen, Margaret, that  
14 you were admitted to Smyllum on [REDACTED] 1946.  
15 A. No.

16 Q. When do you think you were admitted?  
17 A. It was in -- my mother died [REDACTED] -- it would be around  
18 about -- let me see -- 1945. It was around about  
19 [REDACTED] time. I'm not really sure of the date.

20 Q. Do you look to that date because that's close to when  
21 your mother died?  
22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Can we leave the date when you went to Smyllum aside for  
24 a moment and just look at the position of your life  
25 before you went to Smyllum. Do you understand me?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. What can you tell me about your life before you went to  
3 Smyllum?
- 4 A. Well, I was a bit of a tomboy. I was lively,  
5 intelligent at school and I was just a normal, happy  
6 child.
- 7 Q. You have happy memories of the time before you went into  
8 care?
- 9 A. Yes. But not a great deal; I was 9. But yeah.
- 10 Q. Whatever the exact date may have been, you were about  
11 9 years of age when you went into care?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. You tell us in your statement that your mother died in  
14 [REDACTED] 1945.
- 15 A. Yes, I have got that -- I have got a record of that.
- 16 Q. Do you want to tell us about the circumstances  
17 surrounding that and how --
- 18 A. Prior to going in? Well, my mother was bedridden for  
19 some time with a heart condition. I normally would come  
20 in from school happy, jump into bed beside her, and just  
21 cuddle in and tell her what I had been doing. This  
22 day -- another day when I came in, I did the usual  
23 running up and -- but when I -- this time I ran in but  
24 she was lying in the bed dead.
- 25 Q. And that obviously was a terrible time for you.

- 1 A. I remember that vividly, yeah.
- 2 Q. In your statement you tell us about your father and you  
3 are not particularly complimentary of him.
- 4 A. No, not at all. I don't remember any one loving -- he  
5 just -- I just don't feel anything for -- even now  
6 I just ... He did a really horrible thing putting us  
7 away so soon after my mother's death.
- 8 Q. And that's what happened. Can you remember how that  
9 happened, where he took you to before you went to  
10 Smyllum?
- 11 A. You mean in my --
- 12 Q. I think you were taken to the social services place.
- 13 A. Yes, prior to being taken away.
- 14 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. We used to go down to -- it is where you got handouts  
16 for clothes and shoes and we were going down there this  
17 day for what I thought was the usual, you know, handout.  
18 But it wasn't. We were taken back upstairs and put into  
19 this big black car with blacked-out windows and we were  
20 just taken away.
- 21 Q. Was it your father that took you to the --
- 22 A. Yes. He didn't come up, he just stayed down there, but  
23 we didn't know where we were going.
- 24 Q. When you talk about "we", that's yourself, your older  
25 brother and there was also an older sister; is that

- 1 right?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. But so far as going into care would be concerned, was  
4 that yourself and your brother?
- 5 A. Well, yes, my sister was there as well but she didn't go  
6 in -- she had actually left school and she was put there  
7 as a helper.
- 8 LADY SMITH: So that was an older sister?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 LADY SMITH: An older sister and an older brother?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 MR MacAULAY: So far as the brother is concerned, we don't  
13 need to know his name, but he was about two years older  
14 than you; would that be correct?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. I think the sister was perhaps about four years older or  
17 round about.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Was it then in this car that you went to Smyllum?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Do you remember arriving at Smyllum?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. You don't?
- 24 A. I don't.
- 25 Q. What's your first memory of Smyllum?

1 A. I just don't know. I just know that we were taken there  
2 and then we were separated and then there's so much that  
3 I don't remember. But I know we had been taken and our  
4 own clothes taken away and the Smyllum Home --

5 LADY SMITH: Margaret I know it is difficult to remember,  
6 but can you try and get that microphone to help you  
7 because it is important that we can all hear everything  
8 that you have got to tell us.

9 A. Will I go forward a bit?

10 LADY SMITH: If you can. Don't get uncomfortable but --

11 A. Right. Is that better?

12 LADY SMITH: It might move down a wee bit. It is perhaps  
13 too high for you.

14 (Pause)

15 A. Thank you.

16 LADY SMITH: I think it is going to pick your voice up  
17 better there, thank you.

18 MR MacAULAY: I think what you were telling us, Margaret, is  
19 what you do remember is being separated from your  
20 brother in particular; is that right?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And your sister went somewhere else as well?

23 A. Yes. We were just in different places.

24 Q. What about yourself? Do you know where you went early  
25 on when you were at Smyllum? By that I mean did you go

1 to a dormitory or what was the position?

2 A. I hope you don't think I'm just saying, but there's so  
3 much I don't remember. It was dark, so it would have  
4 been immediately -- having been changed and that,  
5 I would would've been taken up to a dormitory.

6 Q. If I take you to your statement, which might help you --  
7 and this is on page 4 of the statement that's in front  
8 of you. You may want -- well, it is actually on the  
9 screen there. It is paragraph 22, if you look at the  
10 screen in front of you.

11 What you tell us --

12 A. I remember that bit, yes. But that wasn't the time  
13 I went in. I could explain it, as it was later.

14 Q. Thinking back --

15 A. Yes, it's as it says in my statement: it was a long room  
16 with just beds down the sides and beds down the middle.

17 Q. You thought, looking back, that there was perhaps around  
18 30 beds in that dormitory?

19 A. I would think so, yeah.

20 Q. Did you stay in that dormitory throughout your whole  
21 time at Smyllum or did you move to anywhere else?

22 A. Yes, I did. It was in what I call it the turret -- no,  
23 it wasn't, sorry. You are asking me --

24 Q. If you stayed in the one place or did you move to  
25 another room during your time there.

1 A. Yes, sorry. Yes, I went up into the turret, as I call  
2 it.

3 Q. Was that a smaller area?

4 A. It was a smaller -- yes.

5 Q. I should perhaps ask you about this: what age were you  
6 when you left Smyllum?

7 A. I was 14 and a half.

8 Q. Would that mean that you left, what, in about 1950?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Around about then?

11 A. It was [REDACTED] 1950.

12 Q. So you were there from the age of 9 to about 14 and  
13 a half; is that it?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. So quite a number of years. Do I understand from what  
16 you have been saying to me, Margaret, that although you  
17 do remember some things, that a lot you don't remember?

18 A. Yes. Honestly, there isn't -- there is a lot I don't  
19 remember.

20 Q. Well --

21 LADY SMITH: Can I just reassure you, Margaret -- and  
22 Mr MacAulay has made this clear to you already -- that's  
23 quite all right. It is perfectly understandable that  
24 after all this time you won't have clear memories. But  
25 just whatever you can remember, we are interested in it.

- 1           It doesn't matter if your memories come in the wrong  
2           order, if that makes sense to you.
- 3       A.   Yes, it does.
- 4       LADY SMITH:   So no need to apologise, just whatever you can  
5           tell us.   You go ahead.
- 6       MR MacAULAY:   Are you able to tell us in your own words, as  
7           best you can, what your life was like at Smyllum?
- 8       A.   Hell.   I don't remember any one person's name and  
9           I don't remember one face of anyone.   I'm trying to ...
- 10      Q.   Can I try and help you.   You describe life there as  
11         "hell".   Are you able to elaborate upon that for me and  
12         give me some understanding as to what you mean?
- 13      A.   The first thing I really remember was crying and crying  
14         for my sister.   And she was put into what they called  
15         tweenies -- there's the nursery, the tweenies and then  
16         you go into the boys or the girls.   They did give in and  
17         I was allowed to see her, but only the once.   There was  
18         a nice fire up there.   Yeah.
- 19      Q.   So you do remember crying and crying because you missed  
20         your sister and --
- 21      A.   And my brother, but he was in another part, and so --  
22         well, so was [REDACTED], and we were in different parts of  
23         the girls' side.
- 24      Q.   And throughout your time at Smyllum, in the years that  
25         you were there, did you see very much of your brother,



1           for example?

2       A. Yes, we did. What used to happen was my brother was  
3           helping at the little farm that we had -- that they had.  
4           He used to bring round the pony trap and the milk. And  
5           what he would do -- the pony knew where to go, he would  
6           gee it up, and he would come around that way and he  
7           would come through and there was a little wooded area  
8           just beside the nursery. He would bring for me to  
9           eat -- probably him as well -- and it was cow cake and  
10          treacle, which were fed to the animals.

11       Q. Did you look forward to getting that?

12       A. Yeah, I looked forward to seeing him.

13       Q. And what about the food?

14       A. Well, I ate it. I don't have any recollection of saying  
15          that it was bad or it how it tasted; I was hungry.

16       Q. Do you know why you were hungry?

17       A. We obviously didn't get enough to eat.

18       Q. Do you have any recollection of what the food in Smyllum  
19          itself was like?

20       A. I remember it was always porridge in the morning. The  
21          main meals, I don't really know. One thing I do  
22          remember is at Easter we got one egg, one whole egg at  
23          Easter. At Christmas we would get a piece of slab cake.

24       LADY SMITH: At the time you went into Smyllum, there would  
25          still have been rationing, wouldn't there, post war?

1 A. Yes. There would be.

2 MR MacAULAY: In your statement you mention the name of

3 a particular nun and that's Sister [BAF]

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. She is someone you do remember?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What can you tell us about her?

8 A. She was -- she was [REDACTED]

9 [REDACTED] But she was the

10 one that -- she was the worst one to me.

11 Q. Was she in charge of your group?

12 A. Yes, she was in charge of the girls.

13 Q. Of the girls?

14 A. Yes, the girls. She would say things like, "Don't you

15 ever smile? Don't you ever cry?" and I wouldn't,

16 I wouldn't cry, not in front, but I would go somewhere

17 quiet. Yeah.

18 Q. Did they say anything else to you that you can remember?

19 A. That I didn't have a brother and a sister there, that

20 I was brought up -- I was -- yeah, picked up off the

21 streets. That's vivid, yeah.

22 Q. Do you remember any of the other nuns that were --

23 A. There was Sister Patricia.

24 Q. You tell us --

25 A. She was lovely. I'm not saying that they were all bad,

1 but there weren't many nuns there. I can only remember  
2 three or four. Some of them -- I don't remember their  
3 names.

4 LADY SMITH: Is that the Sister Patricia that was in the  
5 kitchen?

6 A. Yes, and she was lovely.

7 MR MacAULAY: Now --

8 A. The other nun I remember is maybe jumping --

9 Q. That's okay carry on.

10 A. I don't remember her name, but I remember what she did.

11 Q. Do you want to tell us about that now?

12 A. I used to have, in the winter, hacks in every joint in  
13 my fingers and on my feet I had chilblains. And I went  
14 to the nun that does the first aid, or whatever, and I'd  
15 seen her and she told me to come back. I don't know  
16 what for, but anyway this was me going back to her, and  
17 she said to me, why didn't you come before, I said,  
18 Sister, I did. She had a cane with a silver top and  
19 she -- that's the one thing I remember being -- she hit  
20 me on the head about three or four times with that and  
21 put iodine in every joint.

22 Q. The hitting on the head, did that cause you injuries?

23 A. No, it -- obviously, I had a few lumps, but no it  
24 didn't, it was -- needless to say, I didn't go back.

25 Q. Do you know what age you were there at that time?

1 A. Do you know, I honestly don't. I don't remember.  
2 I remember times but I can't explain the time and the  
3 dates. I don't know. It's all so -- I think I have got  
4 a wee bit lost there.

5 Q. It is okay. I asked you about age and, as I have said  
6 before, age is very difficult and if you don't remember,  
7 just tell me that.

8 But you have told us there about an episode where  
9 the nun who might have been a nurse, but at least looked  
10 after children when something was wrong, hit you on the  
11 head several times with this cane. That's an example of  
12 something physical being done to you. What other  
13 recollections, if any, do you have of that sort of  
14 thing, being beaten or something physical happening to  
15 you?

16 A. I just -- I honestly just -- I just don't remember but  
17 I must have been quite beaten because I was threatened  
18 with being moved to St Charles' in Carstairs.

19 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about that, Margaret, that  
20 sort of threat?

21 A. That threat made me give in.

22 Q. Who threatened you?

23 A. Sorry?

24 Q. Who threatened you? Who was it that threatened you?

25 A. Sister BAF

- 1 Q. And what did you know about St Charles'?
- 2 A. It was just -- everybody knew about St Charles' and it  
3 was a -- even -- a horrible, horrible place. I then  
4 found out that St Charles' was where difficult children  
5 went and mentally subnormal.
- 6 Q. So this threat that Sister BAF made to you, was this  
7 made once, more than once, can you remember?
- 8 A. I only remember once. But obviously I didn't go but  
9 I was put down to the laundry -- not the laundry, the  
10 nursery to look after the children, but mainly to work.  
11 I never got out of that punishment, I was there until  
12 I left.
- 13 Q. I will come back to that if I may, Margaret. But can  
14 I ask you about something else that you tell us about in  
15 your statement. You do tell us that during the daytime  
16 when you were dressed you used to wet yourself.
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Can you perhaps tell me what happened then?
- 19 A. The one thing to say in the winter was we never got  
20 changed once -- we only got changed once a week, which  
21 meant that I was always in urine during the winter. My  
22 legs, they would be sore and --
- 23 Q. Is that because --
- 24 A. I was never, ever -- I was going to say challenged about  
25 it by the nuns. They never noticed that I was wetting

- 1           myself.
- 2           Q. Did that -- because of that did you develop redness
- 3           between your legs?
- 4           A. Yes, yes.
- 5           Q. And did you --
- 6           A. I also had boils, one just on the outer side of my knee,
- 7           and I can remember I could hardly walk. It was painful
- 8           but nothing was done -- or at least I didn't go for
- 9           anything.
- 10          Q. But that's something that you do remember about wetting
- 11          yourself and did that happen more than once?
- 12          A. Oh, yes, every day.
- 13          Q. One of the things you tell us also in your statement is
- 14          that you have blanked away some of the things that
- 15          happened to you; is that right?
- 16          A. That is so true.
- 17          Q. What you tell us, I think, is you have done that
- 18          because, as you tell us in the statement, things were so
- 19          horrible.
- 20          A. Yes, they were. As I say, I rebelled but that was that,
- 21          I just gave in after that and I was put to the nursery
- 22          to work as a punishment.
- 23          Q. You have told us about the Easter egg you got at Easter.
- 24          Can I ask you about Christmas? Did you get anything on
- 25          Christmas Day?

- 1 A. A slab of cake. We didn't get any -- yes, we did  
2 once -- scarves were handed in by whoever and it was  
3 just the odd wool being knitted, just the plain wool.  
4 We got it Christmas Day and it was taken away on  
5 Boxing Day and we didn't see it again.
- 6 Q. Do you know what happened to the scarf?
- 7 A. No, I don't.
- 8 Q. One of the things you do tell us again about  
9 Sister [BAF] is that she was constantly putting you  
10 down.
- 11 A. Oh yeah, definitely.
- 12 Q. Was that something that happened throughout your time at  
13 Smyllum?
- 14 A. Yes -- no, when I was put to the nursery there wasn't  
15 much contact with Sister [BAF]. Because I never played  
16 with anyone -- I was going down there before school,  
17 changing the babies and scrubbing or whatever. I would  
18 go to school, come back at night, and I would go and  
19 have what one would call a snack and what it was was two  
20 pieces of bread together with something in the middle,  
21 probably lard or that, and it came in this big old dirty  
22 tea chest and that's what we had. Yes.
- 23 Q. But looking to Sister [BAF] and what she said to you,  
24 one of the things you tell us in your statement is that  
25 she said things like, "You're worthless".

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Did she say that to you?
- 3 A. Yes. It was all that. She did say things like that,  
4 "You are worthless, nobody would love you or where ..."
- 5 Q. Were you hurt by these comments?
- 6 A. Yes, yes. Aye, I was. But I never ever experienced any  
7 compassion, any love, nothing there.
- 8 Q. From anyone in Smyllum?
- 9 A. Right. All my time there.
- 10 Q. You tell us a little bit about what the procedure was  
11 when you came to change your clothes and you have told  
12 us already that was once a week that happened. Are you  
13 able to help me on that? Can you tell me a little bit  
14 about what you had to do when you came to change your  
15 clothes on a weekly basis?
- 16 A. We went down into, again, the dungeon, which was because  
17 the windows were down at street level, more or less, and  
18 so it was like a dungeon, and it was cold because even  
19 in the summer it was cold. We got changed there and  
20 then we were just in the chemise and praying after -- we  
21 were down quite a long time praying and when we got up  
22 off our knees the flooring was imprinted concrete. Oh,  
23 it was so sore when we got up, yeah.
- 24 Q. But when you were praying, were you praying for  
25 a particular purpose?



1 A. I was praying for someone to take me out of here, that's  
2 what I used to -- every night I dreamt -- not dreamt,  
3 I would say to someone, come and take me out of here.  
4 But not my father.

5 Q. It might be obvious, but was that because you were so  
6 unhappy there?

7 A. Yes. Yes, I was.

8 Q. You tell us in your statement that in relation to the  
9 changing of clothing that if something was missing --

10 A. Yeah, ironically I mean -- it was fear like that. If it  
11 was missing it wasn't your fault, but they would -- you  
12 would be in trouble if there was something missing. And  
13 you had no control over that.

14 Q. Was this something missing of the clothes you were going  
15 to be given for the following week?

16 A. Yes and it was that fear every time we were going down  
17 there to get changed. That fear was with you.

18 Q. What you say in the statement, you couldn't help it but  
19 if you were missing something, you would be hit for it.

20 But I think --

21 A. Yeah, I would --

22 Q. You don't remember that?

23 A. No, I don't. But the times when I say that I know  
24 I must have been, but I don't remember.

25 Q. You have a fear that if something was missing then

1 something might happen?

2 A. It's irrational, isn't it?

3 Q. It depends on what did happen, of course, and you just  
4 can't remember.

5 Do you remember the incident that happened when the  
6 Mother Superior was leaving Smyllum and something  
7 happened to you? Can you tell me about that incident?

8 A. Actually, that was quite interesting -- in fact it was  
9 a bit on the funny side.

10 LADY SMITH: Did you say it is a bit on the funny side? I'm  
11 losing you again because of the microphone.

12 A. Sorry. I will sit up. Is that all right?

13 MR MacAULAY: That's fine.

14 LADY SMITH: That's good.

15 A. I have lost where I was.

16 MR MacAULAY: So I was asking you about the time when the  
17 Mother Superior was leaving and you did something.

18 A. Myself and another girl -- I don't know her name, can't  
19 remember her face, but I said to her, let's go and see  
20 Mother Superior, now she's leaving thank goodness, let's  
21 go and see her coming. Now, with the big headdresses  
22 that they wore and the light was behind them and the way  
23 they would come round, it looked as though she was  
24 coming straight at us, with the big -- anyway, I just  
25 said to the girl, run, and in that area it was like --

1           there was no windows and there was pillars. Well  
2           I misjudged the pillars and I split my head open.

3       Q.    So you ran into the pillar?

4       A.    Yes I ran into the pillar and I had to go and get some  
5           help because it had to be stitched. I have still got  
6           the lump here. But anyway, when I was asked what was  
7           I doing there, I said we were so sorry that  
8           Mother Superior was leaving that --

9       Q.    That sounds like a white lie, was it?

10      A.    Yeah. With a wee bit of black in it as well. I said we  
11       were so sorry she was leaving we had to see her one more  
12       time. I got a holy medal. Someone stole it. I was in  
13       trouble because someone stole it.

14      Q.    Do you know what happened because you were in trouble?

15      A.    I was in trouble because I didn't have it, but somebody  
16       had stolen it.

17      Q.    What happened then when you were in trouble and it was  
18       stolen? Did something happen involving Sister BAF  
19       that you can remember?

20      A.    I really don't know but it had to be something.  
21       Punishment would come from that. No, not really  
22       punishment, no, because I was telling the story,  
23       wasn't I?

24      Q.    Well, the next thing I want to ask you about is your  
25       limp because you did develop a limp, I think, when you

- 1           were at Smyllum.
- 2           A. Yes.
- 3           Q. Can you help me with that? Why was that?
- 4           A. Yes, I developed a limp, had no pain with it.
- 5           Ironically, I was taken down to the local hospital --
- 6           but that's unheard of at times -- x-rayed, doctors said
- 7           they could not see anything, but put me into a plaster
- 8           cast. I was taken to the -- what we call the wee
- 9           infirmary and I thought to myself, oh that's good,
- 10          because I had to go back to -- for a walking plaster the
- 11          next day. And what a lovely feeling that was. There
- 12          was a fire, there was plenty of drinks and what have
- 13          you. So when I went and got the other plaster on
- 14          I thought, that's good because I will be -- they sent me
- 15          straight back to the nursery, doing the same things.
- 16          Q. Can I ask you about the food? We have already talked
- 17          about the cow cake that your brother brought for you,
- 18          but the food itself that you had in the orphanage, can
- 19          you remember what that was like? You have told us about
- 20          the bread; what about other aspects of it?
- 21          A. No, I don't remember.
- 22          Q. Did you have to eat it?
- 23          A. Yes.
- 24          Q. Do you have a recollection of having to eat the food?
- 25          A. Do you mean more or less being encouraged or forced?

- 1 Q. Do you have any recollection of them saying you had to  
2 eat it and, if you didn't, something would happen?
- 3 A. No, I didn't experience that.
- 4 Q. You have mentioned on a number of occasions, Margaret,  
5 having to work in the nursery. Again, can I ask you if  
6 you can remember what age you were when you had --
- 7 A. That's what I can't remember because time I don't  
8 remember. I don't remember time.
- 9 Q. Can you then tell us what it involved, what work you had  
10 to do?
- 11 A. I was there cleaning, you know scrubbing floors,  
12 cleaning and helping to look after the children as well  
13 and it was so sad watching them.
- 14 Q. These are the little children?
- 15 A. Yeah. There was one wee boy that I loved so much and he  
16 had a prolapsed rectum and I must have seen someone  
17 putting it back in and I learnt how to do that and  
18 I would put it in for him, yeah.
- 19 Q. Were these children that spent quite some time sitting  
20 on their potties?
- 21 A. Yes, and that would be one of the effects. Yes, they  
22 were there just round the big guarded fire and -- yeah.
- 23 Q. But this particular little boy that you got attracted  
24 to --
- 25 A. That's the only thing I felt sad about was leaving him

1           because he wasn't the prettiest of children and he  
2           didn't get much attention.

3       Q.   You have said, I think, that going to work at the  
4           nursery was a punishment.

5       A.   Yes.

6       Q.   Who punished you in that way?

7       A.   Sister BAF

8       Q.   Do you know what it was for?

9       A.   My behaviour. I think it was my general behaviour.  
10           I was obviously a problem. When I was -- that was  
11           a punishment, that was where I was sent, to work in the  
12           nursery.

13       Q.   I think you told us already even after school you would  
14           go to the nursery to work; is that correct?

15       A.   Yes.

16       Q.   And in the morning before school, would you get up to go  
17           to work in the nursery?

18       A.   Yes, went to school, came back, had that snack, then  
19           went back down. Then after that I went straight to bed.  
20           I never joined in anything with the other children  
21           because I was never there; I was just down --

22       Q.   What sort of work did you have to do in the nursery?

23       A.   The general cleaning, and I remember more so the  
24           scrubbing of the floors, and the children, you know,  
25           sitting around in these potties. Nobody loved them.

- 1 Q. Was there a nun in charge of the nursery?
- 2 A. Yes, there was. There had to be. But I don't recollect  
3 at all.
- 4 Q. You tell us a little bit in your statement about  
5 an incident involving a nun in the nursery that  
6 involved --
- 7 A. Oh yes.
- 8 Q. What was that about?
- 9 A. I really don't know I just know I was in trouble. In  
10 the nursery the cots had little wheels on them, well, by  
11 the time we had finished all these cots are in one  
12 corner because she was chasing me and -- well, I was  
13 running and she was chasing me and all the cots were in  
14 the corner. Now I don't remember but I'm pretty sure  
15 I would have been taken to task for that. I am sure  
16 I would have been beaten.
- 17 Q. You don't have a recollection of being caught or what  
18 happened?
- 19 A. No, and I don't know what it was I had been doing.
- 20 Q. I have asked you about Christmas, but what about your  
21 birthday? Was there anything happening on your  
22 birthday?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Did anything ever happen on any birthday you had?
- 25 A. No.

- 1 Q. Did you know it was your birthday?
- 2 A. I would think I did.
- 3 Q. You have told us already a little bit about the food at  
4 Smyllum. What about the nuns? Do you know what sort of  
5 food they got?
- 6 A. Yes. Where we were watching for the Mother Superior who  
7 was leaving, that was going round into the nuns'  
8 accommodation, and the lovely smell of food coming from  
9 there, oh -- and we were just given probably slops, you  
10 know, nothing appetising. But I don't know what it was,  
11 I can't remember.
- 12 Q. But it smelt nice?
- 13 A. The nuns' meal?
- 14 Q. Yes.
- 15 A. Oh yes, it did, but ours ...
- 16 Q. The milk, you call it "sour milk". You mention that in  
17 your statement.
- 18 A. Yes. I wasn't -- it wasn't sour milk, I believe it  
19 was --
- 20 Q. Buttermilk? Is that what you thought it was?
- 21 A. Yeah, I think it is a sour milk anyway, but it wasn't --  
22 I'm trying to explain myself --
- 23 Q. It wasn't milk that had become sour, but it was  
24 something that tasted like sour milk?
- 25 A. Yes, and we did have to drink it.



- 1 Q. So far as bathing was concerned, can you tell me what  
2 the procedure was in relation to having a bath?
- 3 A. It was like queueing up. The water was never changed.  
4 So therefore there was quite a few of us had gone in and  
5 I think the one that came out at the end must have been  
6 dirtier before they went in.
- 7 Q. But by the end what was the water like?
- 8 A. It was very hot to begin with but whoever was going in  
9 at the latter end, it was cold.
- 10 Q. You do tell us, Margaret, in your own statement a little  
11 bit about your brother's experience at Smyllum.  
12 I assume that's because he told you about that; is that  
13 the case?
- 14 A. Yeah.
- 15 Q. I don't think he is able now to come to the Inquiry.
- 16 A. The thing is he suffered from Alzheimer's and he was  
17 saying not to go -- don't put me in a home, don't put me  
18 in a home, and it turns out that that home was Smyllum  
19 and that is where he dreaded going, so in his mind he  
20 was back in Smyllum.
- 21 Q. But what did he tell you about his experience at  
22 Smyllum?
- 23 A. Well, he was a bed-wetter and they were so cruel to  
24 them. They would waken them up to go to the toilet and  
25 most times they already would have been wet and the

1 protectors were the very thick rubber covers and urine  
2 would be in the wrinkles, you know what I mean? So when  
3 you came back you had to go straight back into that and  
4 he has scars on his back from sores from that.

5 Q. Did he tell you what they had to do with the sheets?

6 A. Yes. They paraded them with the sheets over them and  
7 the boys were prompted to ridicule them. They came last  
8 for everything. They were called fish. They were the  
9 fish.

10 Q. Carry on.

11 A. And that went on until he left. It was horrible what  
12 they did. They did that on the girls' side.

13 Q. I was going to ask you about that.

14 A. But I don't remember anyone on the girls' side having  
15 that done. I haven't seen it.

16 Q. So you have no recollection of it?

17 A. No. It would have gone on.

18 Q. Can I ask you a little bit about schooling, Margaret.

19 We understand there was an in-house school at Smyllum  
20 and there was also the local secondary school. Do you  
21 remember going to the in-house school at Smyllum?

22 A. Yes, briefly, but I wasn't there long before I was into  
23 the secondary school.

24 Q. I think you were rather intelligent; is that correct?

25 A. Well, I don't wish to boast but, yes. I was really very

1           intelligent.

2       Q. You have already told us about the problem you had with

3           your hands and hacks on your hands. Was there

4           a particular teacher who tried to help you with that?

5       A. Oh yes, she was lovely. Either she or her mother

6           knitted fingerless gloves --

7       Q. Yes.

8       A. -- and I put them on and we got back to the orphanage,

9           I was asked, "Where did you get them?" I said that my

10          teacher or her mother knitted them for me. She took

11          them away and I never got them back.

12       Q. Who was that?

13       A. Sister BAF

14       Q. Did she tell you why she was taking them away?

15       A. No.

16       Q. The other thing you do tell us about is when showers

17          were introduced at St Mary's School and what happened on

18          one occasion.

19       A. Well, I would not say maybe brainwashed, but everything

20          was about how your body is vile, this that and the

21          other. But the only thing I came to the conclusion is

22          they would be talking about themselves because they were

23          female. But anyway. They introduced to have a shower

24          after PE and the teacher helped dry your back. Well,

25          I objected quite strongly because that was exposing my

1 body and it was not on. So anyway I gave in eventually  
2 and she did it and when I got back later on someone had  
3 told that I had let the teacher dry my back and I was in  
4 trouble, but what the trouble was, it had to be knocked  
5 about, it had to be. You don't get off with what they  
6 are normally doing.

7 So I think the thing that really hurt me the most  
8 about being -- going down to the -- what I call the  
9 outside school -- was that we were marched down there,  
10 we had the most awful clothes on, and we would go into  
11 school and we would see the mothers and the fathers  
12 coming and talking about their holidays, they had the  
13 nice wee pieces and that was hard. That was hard to  
14 bear. I think we would have been better staying in  
15 Smyllum than going out there with that.

16 Q. Can I ask you a little bit about visits by other people  
17 to you at Smyllum? Did your father visit you when you  
18 were at Smyllum?

19 A. Yes. Not very often but, yes, he did. We would all  
20 three, my brother as well, go into this room and what  
21 would happen then, [REDACTED] and myself were -- had to go  
22 back, but he took my sister, [REDACTED], he took her out  
23 and went to the pictures and things like that.

24 I asked my brother that -- not long before he became  
25 ill, because sometimes you think to yourself well, is it

1           really -- you sometimes think, maybe is it true.  
2           Anyway, I asked him that and he said, yes, we were sent  
3           back and that was awful.

4           Q.   What about the corporation?  Because you had been placed  
5           there by Dundee Corporation, did someone from the  
6           corporation come to visit you as well?  Do you remember?

7           A.   Yes, not very often.  But, yes, the inspector, we would  
8           say, called, but we were well warned.

9           Q.   What were you warned?

10          A.   Warned if we said anything that was detrimental, we  
11          would be in trouble.

12          Q.   Who gave you that warning?

13          A.   Well, the nun.  The nuns.

14          Q.   Did you ever say anything bad about Smyllum to the  
15          inspector?

16          A.   No and I have never talked about any of that until this  
17          past little while.

18          Q.   You do have I think good memories of the Lanimer Day  
19          festival in Lanark.

20          A.   Oh yes, I do.  It is funny actually -- I was actually --  
21          they have the float, the school float, and I was chosen  
22          to go on the float.  I couldn't believe it.  A bit of  
23          fame at last, maybe.  I don't know.  As it turned out,  
24          I was the [REDACTED], and I was so proud standing up  
25          there.

1 Q. But I think you came across a lady who was rather good  
2 to you; is that right?

3 A. It was that teacher that had the gloves for me and  
4 obviously we had to go for sort of trying on the  
5 costumes and that sort of thing and when I saw their  
6 lovely underwear and what I had, I tell you -- but  
7 anyway the mother said to me, "Would you like to come  
8 back, Margaret, and have a wee visit?" I said, yeah,  
9 I would love that. They wouldn't allow it.

10 Q. The orphanage wouldn't allow it?

11 A. Yes, they wouldn't allow it.

12 Q. Did you ask them why they wouldn't allow it?

13 A. You don't ask.

14 Q. I wonder now, Margaret, if I can take you on to your  
15 life after Smyllum? Can we move on to that period of  
16 your life?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. I think you told us already you were coming up to about  
19 15 when you left Smyllum and that would have been about  
20 1950.

21 A. Yes.

22 LADY SMITH: Margaret, it would suit us to take the lunch  
23 break at this stage and it might be comfortable for you  
24 to do that; would that be all right?

25 A. That would be fine.

1 LADY SMITH: We will stop now and sit again at 2 o'clock.

2 Thank you.

3 (12.50 pm)

4 (The luncheon adjournment)

5 (2.00 pm)

6 LADY SMITH: Just get yourself comfortable -- yes, the

7 chairs do roll around a little bit.

8 A. Is that all right?

9 LADY SMITH: That's great.

10 Good afternoon, Margaret; are you ready to resume

11 questioning?

12 A. Yes.

13 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

14 MR MacAULAY: Good afternoon, Margaret.

15 I was moving to ask you about life after care, it is

16 the sort of third chapter of your evidence, if you like.

17 I think you have already indicated that you were coming

18 up for 15 when you left Smyllum; is that right?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You tell us you went to live with someone you refer to

21 as your Auntie [REDACTED] in Dundee; is that correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Was she --

24 A. She wasn't my true aunt but, yes, I called her aunt.

25 Q. Your father was living there as well?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. You give us some information about schooling and then  
3 your early working time, if you like. But it seems from  
4 what you have told us that your father died about  
5 6 months or so after you left Smyllum.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. After that you moved around a bit from different  
8 relatives; is that a fair summary of what happened?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. But you joined the army --

11 A. I did.

12 Q. -- when you were 18? How did you find the army?

13 A. Well, I fitted in because I was used to discipline  
14 during life, so the army suited me fine.

15 Q. How long did you spend in the army?

16 A. Three years.

17 Q. And did you then go into nursing?

18 A. Yes. That was mental handicap.

19 Q. And I think you were married and you moved [REDACTED]  
20 [REDACTED]

21 A. Yes, I moved a lot. Yes, we went down south.

22 Q. But you eventually ended up coming back to Scotland?

23 A. I did; the marriage broke down.

24 Q. You had some involvement in the construction industry,  
25 is that right, in building houses?



1 A. Not physically! But I would buy a plot of land, engage  
2 the architect. I didn't do any of the building, but  
3 I arranged it all, yes.

4 Q. You do tell us a little bit about and in particular  
5 about your brother and the impact being at Smyllum had  
6 on him.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You tell us in particular that he went back to Smyllum  
9 on one occasion.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Why did he go back?

12 A. He didn't particularly set out to go back there. He was  
13 a long-distance lorry driver and he went past the sign  
14 for Lanark, so he decided to turn around and look for  
15 this helper that was in Smyllum, **BAC** And  
16 he was looking to not just say hello, he was looking for  
17 him. But he didn't find him, so in some ways he said he  
18 was glad because he would have done something to him.

19 Q. Had you yourself come across **BAC** during your  
20 time at Smyllum?

21 A. No because the males and females were separate.

22 Q. But did you understand from your brother that he had  
23 some sort of bad experience that involved

24 **BAC**

25 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. Did he tell you what that was?
- 2 A. Just -- one of them was football. There were the home,  
3 whatever, helpers and then there were the -- och, you  
4 know what I mean, do you?
- 5 Q. Yes --
- 6 A. The --
- 7 LADY SMITH: We are talking about your brother and football  
8 and [REDACTED] BAC and there were other helpers you  
9 were saying.
- 10 A. Yes, and I was going to say "the inmates" but that's  
11 not --
- 12 LADY SMITH: That's okay.
- 13 MR MacAULAY: The other residents.
- 14 LADY SMITH: We know what you mean, the other children.
- 15 A. Yes. Sorry about that. And they had the football  
16 boots, you know, proper football boots, but my brother  
17 would go -- bare feet and they would deliberately go for  
18 them. My brother sustained quite a big cut and, you  
19 know, they just took him out there to just, you know,  
20 beat him up or ridicule him or whatever.
- 21 MR MacAULAY: In any event, [REDACTED] BAC, according to  
22 what your brother led you believe, had maltreated him  
23 and he wanted to see him about that?
- 24 A. He did, yes.
- 25 Q. What about yourself, Margaret? What do you think the

- 1 impact of having been at Smyllum has been on you?
- 2 A. I would say that there's always that fear that something  
3 is going to happen. Don't know what but -- or I'm going  
4 to lose something or somebody and you always seem  
5 lonely. You just ... I'm not morbid -- I'm not -- but  
6 it is just a feeling that you have that ... you just  
7 want to belong. I have got a good family.
- 8 Q. But I think you have been diagnosed as suffering from  
9 post-traumatic stress disorder; is that correct?
- 10 A. Yes, but I have just -- [REDACTED] will probably tell you  
11 better than I will -- I have just gone for an assessment  
12 for the trauma centre [REDACTED] sorry.  
13 She has said that it is post-traumatic stress disorder  
14 complex. That's normally in relation to people like  
15 myself, child abuse, and that's one of the things that  
16 you could suffer from.
- 17 Q. You have provided us with some details in your  
18 statement, Margaret, I'm not going to take you through  
19 it. We can read that. But I think you tell us that you  
20 don't think about Smyllum unless something triggers  
21 that; is that correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. But sometimes something does trigger it then and you  
24 think about Smyllum?
- 25 A. Yes. It's mainly Christmas. I believe that's -- around

1           about that time that we were put into Smyllum. But  
2           I believe there's records that are showing something  
3           different.

4       Q. We are relying on your own recollection and that's fine.

5           Can I then just take you to the last little bit of  
6           your statement? It is the last page we looked at  
7           earlier this morning. If you could go back to the last  
8           page of your statement, page 21, if you could look at  
9           that.

10       A. It's here.

11       Q. You tell us at paragraph 118 that you felt that you had  
12       to speak to us; that's the Inquiry. Why did you think  
13       you had to speak to us?

14       A. I feel as though that -- I feel as though I'm doing  
15       something with regard to the Catholic Church.

16       Q. In fact you go on to say that:

17           "What I'm saying is being recorded and will go down  
18           in the annals."

19           And that is the case. Your voice has been heard by  
20           the Inquiry. You also say something else -- and it is  
21           nice for us to read this -- that you would like a good  
22           ending for the Inquiry. What do you mean by that?

23       A. Satisfaction, I would say. Also, I think it would help  
24       in a feeling of -- not peace, but not as bad as we felt  
25       over the years. It would just be that wee bit better.

1 MR MacAULAY: Okay, Margaret. Well, I don't propose to ask  
2 you any more questions. Thank you very much indeed for  
3 coming and telling us about your own experiences.

4 My Lady, no written questions have been submitted  
5 and I don't know if there are to be any questions.

6 LADY SMITH: Could I check whether there are any outstanding  
7 applications for questions? No, I'm not seeing or  
8 hearing any.

9 Margaret, thank you so much for coming along today  
10 and sharing your experiences from such a long time ago.  
11 It is incredibly valuable to us and the picture that we  
12 are gathering and trying to put together about Smyllum  
13 that you have done that. I am very grateful and I'm now  
14 able to let you and your wonderful family leave and let  
15 you go with our thanks.

16 A. Thank you.

17 (The witness withdrew)

18 LADY SMITH: Yes, Mr MacAulay.

19 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, the next witness is an applicant. He  
20 wants to remain anonymous and he wants to be known as  
21 "Billy" in giving his evidence.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Good afternoon, Billy. Would you  
23 take the oath, please.

24 "BILLY" (sworn)

25 LADY SMITH: Please sit down and make yourself comfortable.

1 That microphone will help you to be heard without  
2 hopefully you having to make much effort.

3 Mr MacAulay.

4 Questions from MR MacAULAY

5 MR MacAULAY: My Lady.

6 Hello, Billy. Before we go on, can I just confirm  
7 your year of birth. I don't want your date of birth but  
8 I need your year of birth so I can get a time frame for  
9 your evidence.

10 A. 19 -- sorry.

11 Q. You tell me?

12 A. 1945.

13 Q. Thank you. Before I ask you questions, which will be  
14 based on the statement you have provided to the Inquiry,  
15 can I just say to you that if there are questions I ask  
16 and it is about a date, for example, but in any event  
17 you can't remember, just tell me you can't remember and  
18 that's not a problem. This isn't a memory test. You  
19 understand that? The other side of that coin is if  
20 there's something you now remember and you didn't put in  
21 your statement, then feel free to tell us.

22 A. That's fine.

23 Q. Can we then look at your statement, Billy. I will give  
24 the reference so we have it in the transcript. It is  
25 WIT.001.001.2058. Where I want you to go is to the last

- 1 page at page 2074.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Can you confirm for me that you have signed the  
4 statement?
- 5 A. Yes, I did.
- 6 Q. The last two sentences, can I just look at these with  
7 you. Do you say first of all:  
8 "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
9 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry"?  
10 Is that correct?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. You also say:  
13 "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
14 statement are true."  
15 Is that also --
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. I'm going to ask you questions in particular about your  
18 time at Smyllum. You talk about that in the statement.  
19 The date that -- the records tell us you went to Smyllum  
20 on [REDACTED] 1949. Does that fit in with your own  
21 general --
- 22 A. I have no recollection. I don't know when I went there,  
23 actually. I know I was quite young when I went there, a  
24 toddler.
- 25 Q. If that date is correct, you must have been about 3 or

1           4 --

2       A. Yes, about that.

3       Q. -- because you were born in 1945.

4       A. Yes, about 3 year old.

5       Q. Do you know when you left Smyllum? Can you remember?

6       A. I think it was 1959.

7       Q. Again, according to the records, the date appears to be

8           1958, when you were about 13 or thereabouts. Do you

9           think it may be a bit later than that?

10      A. Probably a bit later. I can't remember. I know it was

11           between -- 1959, it could have been ... I'm not too

12           sure.

13      Q. Do you think you were 13 or 14 when you came to leave?

14      A. I was going on 14, I think.

15      Q. But do you remember much about life before you went to

16           Smyllum?

17      A. No.

18      Q. But when you went to Smyllum, did you go with any other

19           brothers or sisters?

20      A. I had an older sister, a year older than me, and my

21           older brother. My brother was about three years older

22           than me. But I was never, ever told by the orphanage

23           that I had a brother, that I had any relatives there for

24           years, up until the age of about eight year old, when

25           I discovered, finally discovered, that I had a sister,



1 an older sister, and an older brother. But there was  
2 never any communication between my sisters and my  
3 brother. I never knew they were there. I didn't even  
4 know who they were. In fact, I talked to them -- well,  
5 you weren't allowed to talk to them, but if I got  
6 an opportunity, but to me they were just people who were  
7 around the orphanage. As I say, it wasn't until I was  
8 8 year old that I discovered they were my sister and  
9 elder brother.

10 Q. Do you have any recollection of actually going to  
11 Smyllum?

12 A. No.

13 Q. What's your first -- have you got a first memory of  
14 being at Smyllum?

15 A. The first memory I vaguely remember is getting taken in,  
16 going through the big main hall with the nuns into the  
17 toddler section. Then I distinctly remember a big  
18 rocking horse and they sat me on that while they  
19 discussed what they were going to do with me. My  
20 family, myself and my sisters, and that's all  
21 I remember.

22 Q. What you do tell us in your statement, Billy, is that so  
23 far as the set up at Smyllum was concerned, it was  
24 divided into different units?

25 A. Yes, you had a different section. You had your toddler

1 sections then you had the small boys' section and then  
2 you had the older boys' section.

3 The toddler section consisted of probably -- it  
4 would probably be bairns from ... up to about my age,  
5 three year old up to five year old. Then from five year  
6 old upwards, once you went to the school -- because  
7 everyone in the orphanage was self-contained, ie you had  
8 the school within the orphanage, so like  
9 a self-contained village.

10 From five year olds to seven year olds, once you  
11 turned 7 you went to the older boys' section. Now you  
12 had to also a toddler section for young girls, the same;  
13 they were in a different part of the orphanage. So you  
14 never actually seen that side of the orphanage, the  
15 other toddler side.

16 Q. So you would have started on the toddler section and  
17 then you would have moved into the --

18 A. Up to five year old and then five year old up to the  
19 middle. It was five year old to seven year old. Then  
20 once you turned seven year old you were moved to the big  
21 boys' section.

22 Q. So far as the period prior to you moving to the big  
23 boys' section, before you were 7, do you have much of  
24 a memory of that?

25 A. Yeah.

- 1 Q. Do you have any memory of that?
- 2 A. Yeah, I remember all the rooms were all connected with  
3 corridors, ie you could go along a corridor and it would  
4 take you down to the chapel, where the chapel was, and  
5 then the other parts of the building. It was all  
6 basically joined together, the corridors.
- 7 That's when the first -- the first abuse was when  
8 I was 7 year old. I distinctly remember going down to  
9 confession, because you went to confession quite a lot  
10 on the Fridays and you had your benediction on the  
11 Friday and then on the Sundays -- it was the normal  
12 routine every week you had Mass and all of that. That  
13 was a normal routine every Friday, Saturday and Sunday.
- 14 Q. Can I just stop you there, Billy, because I want to take  
15 things gradually.
- 16 A. Oh right, sorry.
- 17 Q. Don't worry. When you were moved to the bigger boys'  
18 section when you were about 7 years of age, was there  
19 a particular part of the building then that you would be  
20 sleeping in?
- 21 A. Yes. There was a big dormitory. Again, it was all  
22 divided into separate dormitories. You've got that many  
23 children, so obviously you had about two or three  
24 dormitories in the one building.
- 25 Q. Did you then -- at that time were you in a dormitory

1 with other boys?

2 A. Yeah, I was in a dormitory with about maybe 100 other  
3 boys.

4 Q. But the 100 wouldn't be in the one dormitory, they would  
5 be spread in different --

6 A. Yeah, they were quite big dormitories.

7 Q. Did that section of the building have a name?

8 A. I don't know the name.

9 Q. You don't remember?

10 A. I don't remember if it had a name, no.

11 Q. Before we look at anything about abuse -- I know you  
12 want to talk about that -- but I just want to look at  
13 some aspects of the routine if you like. For example,  
14 let's begin with washing and bathing. Can you tell me  
15 a little bit how that was organised?

16 A. Yes. In the dormitories you actually had the washing  
17 area, where you were washing and thing in the morning  
18 and then you get -- they'd get you out of bed early in  
19 the morning. They'd all go around the site and we'd  
20 wash our face and then your clothes would be laid out on  
21 the bed by the staff. It was a matter of getting  
22 yourself washed, change into your clothes, and then go  
23 down for breakfast and that.

24 Q. When you had to have a bath, because I think you tell us  
25 in your statement you had a bath every Saturday --

1 A. You never got a bath.

2 Q. What happened?

3 A. It used to remind you of a sheep dip. What it was, it  
4 was a big trough, split up in sections, constant hot  
5 water. Now, you could imagine 100 bairns standing there  
6 waiting to get in. It is just a matter of -- you had  
7 2 seconds: you were in, back out again, and then  
8 somebody else was put in and back out again. One lot  
9 went in, another lot went out, and the nuns just stood  
10 there and, you know, just total humiliation.

11 LADY SMITH: How many boys would be in this trough at the  
12 same time?

13 A. You are talking about 50 boys at a time, ma'am.

14 LADY SMITH: 50 boys going to have their bath?

15 A. Yes, in different sections, sectioned off in cubicles.  
16 The trough was actually solid granite. If you went in  
17 it and you slipped in it, you'd end up grazing yourself  
18 or cutting yourself.

19 What the nuns done was they just went, right, in you  
20 go, and you used to fight to get in first because they  
21 gave you dry underpants to go into the shower, not that  
22 we had a shower, then you had 2 seconds, you just sat  
23 down, went like that (indicates), out you get, next lot  
24 went in, and you just changed over -- you handed your  
25 underpants to another lad who took over and this is

1           what -- it was like a conveyor belt.

2       Q.   Just looking at the boys queueing up then for the bath,  
3           would there be different age groups?

4       A.   Yes, there would be.   Yes, there was.

5       Q.   So, if you started --

6       A.   Eight year old up to 14, 15 year old.

7       Q.   So even when you came to leave later on, were you still  
8           following the same process for having a bath?

9       A.   Yes, same process.   Every Saturday, the same process.

10      Q.   Would the nuns be watching?

11      A.   Yes, they are watching.

12      Q.   You also mention that when you were drying yourself the  
13           towel, I think, would be passed from one boy to boy.

14      A.   That is right, from boy to boy, yes.

15      Q.   Can I now ask you about the food at Smyllum.   What can  
16           you tell me about that?

17      A.   Well, I remember mealtime -- breakfast time was  
18           porridge.   Every morning was porridge.   That's about all  
19           you got.   What they put it in resembles a dog bowl,  
20           a silver bowl.   I remember it looked like a dog bowl.  
21           I don't ever remember seeing cups, plates, maybe  
22           a spoon.   That's about it, that's all you seen.

23           Again that was routinely, you queued up for that.  
24           Told when to sit down, told when to eat, told when to  
25           finish, and then that was you, everybody out.

- 1 Q. Did you have to eat your food?
- 2 A. You had no choice.
- 3 Q. What if you couldn't --
- 4 A. Because if you didn't eat it, that was you, they just
- 5 took it off you and you were sent away. You had two
- 6 choices: take it or leave it.
- 7 Q. You also tell us a little bit about school. Now, we
- 8 understand that there was an in-house school at Smyllum
- 9 for primary school.
- 10 A. Yes, the primary school -- again, there were different
- 11 sections of the primary school. The secondary school
- 12 was actually up until the age 13/14, I think. Then they
- 13 move you to -- there was a school outside the orphanage,
- 14 a public school, just as you walked in the main --
- 15 driveway, the main gates to the right, there was
- 16 a public school there for when you turned 14.
- 17 But up to the age of 14 you were taught in the
- 18 orphanage itself. That was a joke because you never
- 19 learnt nothing in this school.
- 20 Q. Who were the teachers? Were they lay teachers?
- 21 A. I think they had one civilian teacher there and again
- 22 she couldn't handle us because we used to lark about.
- 23 You never really learnt anything.
- 24 Q. But you do tell us, I think, that in connection with
- 25 having trips and excursions, that there was a trip to

1           Aberfoyle.

2           A. That is right.

3           Q. And that's something you enjoyed?

4           A. Yes, I looked forward to that because you got a wee bit  
5           of freedom and, you know, you got that freedom to walk  
6           about and don't get chastised for doing something and we  
7           enjoyed it. I looked forward to these trips.

8           Q. Just talking about freedom, as you got older, and became  
9           a young teenager, did you get more freedom?

10          A. Yes, when you turned about 13/14 you were allowed out  
11          unsupervised into Lanark itself to the pictures.  
12          Obviously, they gave you the money to pay for the  
13          pictures and things like that. You got an hour, or  
14          depending on how long the film was for, then you would  
15          likely wander about the town for a wee while and then we  
16          all came back together in a group. We were always out  
17          in a group with one -- I think one female was in charge  
18          of you.

19                 Again, you got your wee bit of freedom then. That's  
20          the only time you ever got your freedom -- apart from  
21          the trips, the school trips and that -- I call it  
22          a holiday trip -- to Aberfoyle. That was the only time  
23          you got that enjoyment.

24          Q. What about birthdays then? Were birthdays celebrated?

25          A. Non-existent. If you had a birthday in, for example,



1 November, December, January, you were lumped in. Now  
2 I used to think when I left the orphanage that my  
3 birthday was [REDACTED]. I always assumed that because  
4 I think my dad lost the certificate, the birth  
5 certificate. I know that. So I just assumed -- I was  
6 told my birthday was [REDACTED], but it wasn't, it was  
7 [REDACTED].

8 You never, ever had celebrations. What they done  
9 was they allocated you an uncle and aunty, you never  
10 knew who these people were. You used to sit and write  
11 letters to people and the nuns would pass the letters  
12 on. You never, ever met them. But birthdays,  
13 non-existent.

14 Q. You did say I think -- I caught this in what you said  
15 about your birthday -- is that there was this practice  
16 where by they would lump together over a two-month  
17 period, let's say, the birthdays that covered that  
18 period and have, what, a celebration in one day was it?

19 A. No. Nothing at all. That was it. Never had  
20 a birthday, no card, no nothing. Again, you depended on  
21 getting a present from your adopted aunty and uncle.  
22 Again, that was organised. You had to sit in one big  
23 room, open your presents and then that was it. You  
24 played a wee while and then they took your presents off  
25 you.

1 Q. Are you talking there about what happened at  
2 Christmastime?

3 A. Yeah, Christmastime was the same.

4 Q. Did you ever run away when you were at Smyllum?

5 A. No. No, no, no --

6 Q. Did you know of people who ran away?

7 A. Not to my knowledge, no.

8 Q. Did you think about running away?

9 A. No, it was just too vast a place. Imagine a big  
10 village -- although ... There were three entrances out  
11 of the orphanage itself: you had your main gate, you had  
12 your field, there was a big gate up there, and then you  
13 had the gate by the orchard. These gates are always  
14 locked. So, you never had any thoughts of running away.  
15 Where exactly would you go?

16 Q. In relation then to visits, did any family visit you  
17 when you were --

18 A. I used to get my dad used to come and visit us, maybe  
19 once a fortnight. It would all depends. Sometimes he  
20 would turn up, sometimes he wouldn't. Again, that was  
21 all in, like, the big main building, the front of the  
22 building, where you all congregated there. So you never  
23 got any privacy or anything like that. All the bairns  
24 were lumped in the one room and all the parents that  
25 came to visit -- again, you had no privacy or nothing.

1           You only got maybe half an hour and that was it.

2       Q.   You mention your father; what about your mother, did she

3           visit you at all?

4       A.   No.

5       Q.   Social worker? Do you remember a social worker coming

6           to see you?

7       A.   No, none at all.

8       Q.   You have mentioned that when you went into Smyllum you

9           understood that you had a brother and a sister there; is

10          that right?

11       A.   That is right.

12       Q.   Was it one brother and a sister?

13       A.   I found out my older sister, AAP, was there as well,

14          so I had two older sisters and one older brother.

15       Q.   Can I just understand, over the years then that you were

16          there and they were there, what sort of contact you had?

17       A.   No. I never knew they existed. I wasn't told until

18          I was maybe 10 year old when I first knew. To me they

19          were just other bairns. I was never told I had brothers

20          and sisters in the orphanage. You are divided. Where

21          the school was there as like a big massive square. When

22          the girls came out, they came out different doors, the

23          boys came out different doors, and although there was no

24          line there, you imagined a line there, and you couldn't

25          cross that imagined line. You would get a telling off

1 for -- don't talk to the girls.

2 Q. When you realised that you had a sister there, for  
3 example, did you make contact with her?

4 A. Yeah, I did. I would try and sneak over the line and  
5 speak to them at school break times.

6 Q. You tell us in your statement, Billy, about an incident  
7 when you slipped in the toilet and you had something of  
8 an accident.

9 A. Yeah that was -- well, what they done, they had  
10 an outside toilet that -- if you can imagine the big  
11 cubicles. They were like massive -- not concrete, but  
12 marble edges and I was larking about and I ran and tried  
13 to slide, so as I slid, I fell, and as I went on the  
14 ground, I made contact with the big marble thing, split  
15 my eye. So I never thought anything about it until  
16 I went back into the actual building and the nuns just  
17 asked me what happened.

18 I remember getting in a car with one nun, driving up  
19 the big driveway at the back gate, and going to some  
20 sort of building. It certainly wasn't a hospital, but  
21 all they done was put something on my eye and that was  
22 it.

23 Q. So you got some treatment for it?

24 A. I got some treatment but I was never -- it was actually  
25 split. It was cut. All they done was get a bandage on

1           it and that was it. I never had no recollection of  
2           going to hospital.

3           Q. Did you see a doctor?

4           A. No, just a nurse, I think it was.

5           Q. I now want, Billy, to ask you about some abuse that you  
6           suffered when you were at Smyllum. I think in  
7           particular you suffered some sexual abuse; is that  
8           correct?

9           A. Yes.

10          Q. Can you tell me what age you were when that started?

11          A. 7 year old.

12          Q. Can you perhaps just tell us in your own words what  
13          happened when this happened to you?

14          A. The first time was when I transferred over from the  
15          young boys into the older boys and this guy was in  
16          charge of taking us down from the dormitories into the  
17          chapel. I first distinctly remember him because I was  
18          slightly late coming downstairs and I distinctly  
19          remember seeing this person standing there and he says,  
20          "Who are you? Where are you going?" I told him who  
21          I was and in the big boys and that's when after that the  
22          abuse started.

23          Q. Can I ask you about this person? Who was this person?

24          A. He was obviously been in the orphanage but he was about  
25          15/16 year old. What they do is they employ them --

1 Q. Sorry?

2 A. -- as trustees to look after bairns like myself.

3 Q. He was somebody who had been there as a child --

4 A. He had been there as a child, went through the system.

5 Q. And he was being employed there as a helper?

6 A. That is right. He would organise things like that, to

7 take you down to the chapel, down to the dining hall and

8 things like that. It first started when I was

9 walking -- he came up to me and started talking to me

10 and --

11 Q. Can you tell us what happened on that first occasion?

12 A. Yes, he exposed himself and he grabbed my hand, you

13 know, to masturbate him, things like that. And other

14 times he tried to --

15 Q. Just on that first occasion: did this last for any

16 length of time?

17 A. No, it kept up quite a couple of years.

18 Q. No, the first occasion --

19 A. First occasion he done that, yes.

20 Q. Can you tell me then what happened over the next period

21 of time?

22 A. Then, again, over a period of time he would try to

23 deliberately seek me out, watch where I was going. If

24 I was going in another part of the building, he was

25 following me. He would come round another way and catch

1 me in the dormitory and again he would do it, expose  
2 himself, and then grab my hand and try to masturbate  
3 him. Other times he would grab my head and try to you  
4 know -- and I would pull away. A couple of times  
5 I would just pull away but another time he would  
6 constantly, constantly -- masturbation mostly he would  
7 try to do.

8 Q. How long did this go on to?

9 A. A good number of years.

10 Q. Can you tell me how it came to come to an end?

11 A. Well, there was one time I went to confession -- and  
12 something just made me go to confession. I don't think  
13 there was any Catholics who understand what confession  
14 is about. You confess your sins to the priest and you  
15 say what your sins are and one of the things I said  
16 was -- I mentioned this guy --

17 Q. To the priest?

18 A. To the priest, what he had done. Well, the priest got  
19 up, looked at me and he got up and he walked away and he  
20 left me about over an hour on my own. He never came  
21 back. So I walked out the confessional box -- you can  
22 imagine there is other children in the chapel sitting  
23 there and wondering what is going on. None of the  
24 nuns -- not one nun came near me to say what happened,  
25 to question me. Right.

1 Q. So what happened then?

2 A. Nothing.

3 Q. About what happened -- the priest obviously --

4 A. The priest obviously told the nuns, whoever they

5 contacted, but nobody came to speak to me.

6 Q. You told the priest what had been happening?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. He gets up and leaves you in the confessional --

9 A. Walks away, left me on my own in the confessional box

10 for well over an hour. It is a long time anyway. He

11 never came back.

12 Q. How do you know the priest told the nuns?

13 A. Because he went away and told the nuns and the nuns

14 never said nothing to me.

15 Q. But what happened then?

16 A. I don't know what happened then. This fella, the chap,

17 the guy who was the abuser, he was gone, disappeared.

18 Q. So the position was you have told the priest, you

19 suspect the priest has told the nuns, and the person who

20 was abusing you has left?

21 A. He disappeared, yes. All of a sudden, within the day he

22 was gone. I never seen him again.

23 Q. What age were you then when this happened, when you told

24 the priest about what had been happening?

25 A. About 9 year old.



- 1 Q. So the abuse you have been telling us about had been  
2 going on for about two years or so; is that right?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. You said you never saw this person again?
- 5 A. No, never saw them again.
- 6 Q. But was there some other incident --
- 7 A. There was an incident four years later after I left the  
8 orphanage --
- 9 Q. Before you left the orphanage, was there any incident,  
10 any commotion that involved you within the dormitory?
- 11 A. I distinctly remember this chap came back in the middle  
12 of the night. He came back and somehow he got into the  
13 orphanage and he came into the dormitory. He was trying  
14 to -- I think he was trying to kill me or something, I  
15 don't know what he is trying to do anything. Because of  
16 the commotion, one of the nuns started screaming. She  
17 must have heard the noise and started screaming and  
18 everybody else woke up and then the police came and they  
19 took him away.
- 20 Q. Who was this person?
- 21 A. This is the abuser.
- 22 Q. Did you see him at that time?
- 23 A. I saw him yeah.
- 24 Q. What was happening, what was he doing?
- 25 A. He was leaning over my bed and trying to strangle me.

1 Q. Was that then the last you saw of him?

2 A. That was the last I saw of him.

3 Q. What age were you then at this point in time when this

4 happened?

5 A. Probably about 9, 10 year old.

6 Q. Not long after you told the priest?

7 A. Not long after, no.

8 Q. Did the nuns ever speak to you about this --

9 A. No, not once, no.

10 Q. What about the police? Did the police --

11 A. No, never came near me.

12 Q. At any point in time?

13 A. No, nobody came near me. [REDACTED]

14 [REDACTED]

15 [REDACTED]

16 [REDACTED] This guy was never ever seen

17 again. He just disappeared, just gone.

18 Q. Can I then leave that aspect of the abuse aside and look

19 at other aspects of your life in Smyllum.

20 One thing you tell us is that if anybody did

21 something wrong then and no one admitted it, something

22 would happen; what would happen?

23 A. You would get punished for it. What they would do is

24 they would line everybody up in the big hall and you

25 stand with your hands like this (indicates).

- 1 Q. You're putting your hands to your shoulders?
- 2 A. To your shoulders and, if you moved, they come along  
3 with a big wooden ruler, which was quite a heavy ruler,  
4 and would just whack you on the knuckles.
- 5 Q. Who did that?
- 6 A. The nuns.
- 7 Q. But any particular nun or nuns?
- 8 A. No, they would all do it. There would be two or three  
9 nuns going up the line. If you imagine a couple of  
10 hundred boys lined up just for nothing because something  
11 went wrong or somebody done something and everybody got  
12 the blame for the same thing. You were all punished for  
13 the same thing, even though you hadn't done nothing.  
14 Then they would line you up in rows and walk up and down  
15 and, if you moved, just whack you on the knuckles.
- 16 Q. Were you whacked?
- 17 A. Quite a few times because you were mischievous then.  
18 You used to have a laugh and a joke with it, giggle and  
19 talk, and then if they caught you, they just whacked  
20 you.
- 21 Q. How long would this --
- 22 A. You would stand for a couple of hours.
- 23 Q. How often did this happen?
- 24 A. Quite periodically, I think. If somebody misbehaved or  
25 something went wrong or if somebody had done something

1 and the nuns found out then, as I say, everybody would  
2 get punished.

3 Q. You are remaining anonymous, so I don't want to know  
4 your name, but when you were at Smyllum, how were you  
5 addressed? Were you addressed by your name?

6 A. No.

7 Q. First name or second name?

8 A. No.

9 Q. How were you addressed?

10 A. Number.

11 Q. Do you remember your number?

12 A. Yeah, [REDACTED]

13 Q. If a nun wanted to speak to you, what would she say to  
14 you?

15 A. "Number [REDACTED]"

16 Q. What about other children?

17 A. Everybody had numbers. They were not called -- nobody  
18 was ever called by their first name or last name.

19 Q. If the nuns weren't there, would you call --

20 A. Aye, if the nuns weren't there, obviously, you knew  
21 everybody's name. You would speak to your pals or  
22 friend, you made a lot of friends and that, your pals,  
23 yeah, you would call each other by their first name.

24 Q. But if you were speaking to your pals and the nuns were  
25 there --

- 1 A. No, you were too feart to say their name.
- 2 Q. If you did use someone's name, did anything happen?
- 3 What would happen?
- 4 A. I have never, ever heard anybody mention names in front
- 5 of the nuns. You just couldn't do that. You wouldn't
- 6 do that because of the risk of getting punished.
- 7 Q. You have mentioned the sort of, if I can call it that,
- 8 the mass punishment process. Are you able to tell me
- 9 generally over your time in Smyllum what else happened
- 10 to you from the point of view of punishment or physical
- 11 abuse?
- 12 A. Because you are abused and that, obviously I developed
- 13 a stutter, and you can see sometimes I get anxious. It
- 14 is still there. If you wet the bed -- if the end result
- 15 was wetting the bed and that, what the nuns would do,
- 16 they would stand -- make you stand beside your bed, pull
- 17 your bedding down, and let everybody else come over and
- 18 have a look at your bed. Then they would take the sheet
- 19 off the bed and you would have to hold the sheet in your
- 20 hand and until everybody looked or that was in your
- 21 dormitory looked and giggled and made a fool of you.
- 22 You were standing in tears and the nuns would just
- 23 laugh: look at this, look at that. "Pee-the-bed",
- 24 that's what they called you, "Pee-the-bed", things like
- 25 that.

1           You were stood there maybe half an hour, until  
2           everybody had a good look. You know, total humiliation.

3       Q. Did you from time to time wet the bed?

4       A. Yes because of what happened to me, because of the  
5           abuse. They say I developed a stutter because of it.

6       Q. Before the abuse had you not been wetting the bed?

7       A. No.

8       Q. So after you started wetting the bed you have indicated  
9           what would happen then.

10      A. Yes.

11      Q. What about the bed sheets? What would happen to the bed  
12           sheets that had been wet?

13      A. The bed sheets -- as far as I know, the nuns took them  
14           away after that.

15      Q. Did you see if any other children wet the bed?

16      A. Not to my knowledge, no.

17      Q. One thing you say in your statement, Billy, is that  
18           after the person who abused you left Smyllum, that abuse  
19           from the nuns continued?

20      A. It did.

21      Q. What sort of abuse?

22      A. Punishment. What they made you do is get up in the  
23           morning -- now where the school was -- the dorm was,  
24           there was quite a big staircase, quite a wide staircase,  
25           and they give you a wee brush and you'd start off at the

1 top of the staircase and you had to brush all the  
2 stairs. Imagine at a young age that's quite scary, it  
3 is eerie and quiet and they make you go -- if you didn't  
4 do it right, they make you go back up again and start  
5 again until you actually done it properly. Two or three  
6 times, just for fun, they would make you do it several  
7 times.

8 Q. Were you hit by nuns?

9 A. Yes, again the ruler. They used to smack you and hit  
10 you on the hands. Put your hands out -- and you  
11 sometimes put your hands out like that (indicates) in  
12 front of you --

13 Q. You are putting them out in front of you, across --

14 A. -- and whack you on the hands --

15 Q. For what reason?

16 A. For no reason, just as a punishment. Because you  
17 weren't doing it quick enough or you weren't doing it  
18 the way they wanted for you to do it.

19 Q. I think one thing you tell us about is the use of  
20 knuckles on the head; is that something that happened to  
21 you?

22 A. Yeah, quite a few times.

23 Q. Do you know why that was being done?

24 A. Again, just for sheer punishment, sheer enjoyment, and  
25 sheer -- that's what the nuns done, they done it for

1 pure enjoyment. Because every time they done it they  
2 are just smiling, every time they are smiling all the  
3 time.

4 Q. Did you see that happening to other boys?

5 A. Yes, quite a few boys were getting the same as me. You  
6 were not individually -- sometimes you were individually  
7 singled out, sometimes you weren't. Again, you were all  
8 in a group lined up in that big hall and all lined up  
9 and then, as I say, they paced up and down the line, and  
10 just whacked you whenever they felt like it. If they  
11 caught you laughing, giggling or talking, they'd just  
12 come up to you and whack you behind you.

13 Q. Was there any particular nun that dealt with you more  
14 than others?

15 A. I can't -- I think there was one nun, a Sister AFK,  
16 I think that was her name. She was a right vicious one  
17 that one. Sadistic, I would say. She enjoyed it. She  
18 enjoyed what she was doing.

19 Q. Okay. You have told us about what happened at the  
20 confessional when you told the priest about the abuse  
21 you had been suffering. Apart from that, did you tell  
22 anyone else?

23 A. No, I never even told my own (inaudible) I told nothing.  
24 I felt I didn't want to, you know, put him in  
25 a position. But I did speak to my sister years later



1 and she said, you should have told them. What they  
2 would have done, I don't know what they would have done.  
3 I don't know.

4 Q. You tell us in your statement Billy that you left  
5 Smyllum at about the age of 13.

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. Is that your recollection?

8 A. It would be about that, yeah.

9 Q. How would you describe the environment at Smyllum over  
10 the period that you spent there in your childhood?

11 A. Well, sometimes you had good times, sometimes you had  
12 bad times. There are one or two nuns that were  
13 really -- one in particular, she's obviously passed on  
14 and passed away now, Sister EAA. She was the only  
15 decent nun there. She would treat you -- she would call  
16 you by your first name. That was the only one  
17 I remember.

18 I was quite athletic, I was always running in the  
19 races and going to Lanark -- I think on Lanimer Day in  
20 Lanark they used to have a big annual gala thing there  
21 every year. Because I was quite athletic and fast at  
22 running I used to keep representing the orphanage for  
23 the boys, like. I used to win a few prizes, but again  
24 they took the prizes off you. You won them, but they  
25 took them off you. The nuns kept confiscating them.

- 1 Q. Generally, if you were to sum up your time at Smyllum,  
2 how would you sum it up?
- 3 A. As I said, there are some good times and really, really  
4 bad times. Really, really dark times, I must admit. As  
5 I say, the only time you got a wee bit of freedom to  
6 enjoy yourself was the school trip and other things,  
7 your annual trip to the gala day, and your freedom when  
8 you were old enough to go to the pictures. That was  
9 all.
- 10 In a nutshell it was horrendous. The way we were  
11 treated -- I mean, I wouldn't treat a dog like that.  
12 To, be honest with you. There was no compassion. They  
13 had no compassion whatsoever.
- 14 Q. Were you shown any affection, any love?
- 15 A. No, none at all. None at all. I mean I don't -- as  
16 I say, I never knew my mother up until the age of 21,  
17 I never ever met her until the age of 21. My father, he  
18 was just totally distant.
- 19 Q. I'm talking about when you were within Smyllum, were you  
20 shown --
- 21 A. In Smyllum, no, nothing. Just no compassion. No --  
22 nothing at all. No feeling. They never showed their  
23 feelings, the nuns.
- 24 Q. Can I just look at the position, Billy, after you left  
25 Smyllum, after you left care. I think what you tell us

1 in your statement you went home with your sister to stay  
2 with your father; is that right?

3 A. That is right.

4 Q. After you left school what you ended up doing was  
5 joining the army.

6 A. That's right, yeah.

7 Q. You spent quite a long time in the army.

8 A. Yeah, 20 years.

9 Q. In particular, I think you spent time in [REDACTED]

10 [REDACTED] is that right?

11 A. Yeah. I did 6 months in [REDACTED] and 3 years in [REDACTED]

12 [REDACTED].

13 Q. Were these tours at a time --

14 A. Yeah, horrific.

15 Q. -- things were not great in [REDACTED]?

16 A. Yeah, pretty dodgy.

17 Q. The stammer you mentioned to us, did that persist in  
18 your adult life?

19 A. Yeah, for a wee while, until I started learning to take  
20 breathing exercises and I -- gradually my stammer went  
21 away. And there are times when I do get stressed out,  
22 the stammer -- if I do get stressed out, then I start --  
23 like today, or remembering things, it does, you know --  
24 the stammer is still there.

25 Q. Sorry, carry on.

1 A. Sorry, I did learn the breathing exercises because in  
2 the army you had to give commands and it was quite  
3 embarrassing trying to give commands when you are  
4 stammering or doing your jaw movements. It was quite  
5 embarrassing. So I learnt. I learnt breathing  
6 exercises and controlling it. So I did control it.

7 Q. Can I take you to your statement -- there is  
8 particularly a paragraph I want to ask you about and it  
9 is page 14 of your statement, if you have that. In  
10 paragraph 72 what you say there is that:

11 "I still feel a sense of rejection because of what  
12 happened to me at Smyllum."

13 Is that the case?

14 A. Yeah, it is.

15 Q. What is it in particular about what happened at Smyllum  
16 that gives you this sense of rejection?

17 A. Relationships and things like that, having relationships  
18 and, you know, getting rejected, rejections. I just  
19 couldn't handle rejections. If I done something in the  
20 army, like I done a course, and if you didn't do too  
21 well, or sometimes you done well, other thing you didn't  
22 do too well, I just felt rejected. I felt it was all to  
23 do with rejection way back in my time at the orphanage.

24 Q. You go on to say --

25 A. Sorry.

- 1 Q. Carry on.
- 2 A. It had an adverse affect on me that way. You know I did  
3 feel a lot of things: why am I here? You have these  
4 thoughts: why am I here sometimes? You know, I did  
5 eventually develop PTSD, which -- again, it is probably  
6 related to my time in the orphanage although I still  
7 deny it and that, in myself, I still deny that that's  
8 part of it but I am now realising that probably was part  
9 of it and that caused my PTSD --
- 10 Q. You tell us in that same paragraph, Billy, if you read  
11 on:
- 12 "After the person who was abusing [you] left and the  
13 nuns were picking on me I felt isolated and was always  
14 being treated differently by them."
- 15 Was that the position?
- 16 A. Yes, that was definitely the conclusion because this --  
17 again, I just felt shunned by nuns. Apart from that one  
18 particular nun, the rest of them totally shunned me,  
19 treated me like it is your fault. I know for years  
20 I believed that. I believed it was my fault, you know.
- 21 They tell you that when you go to confession --  
22 I can't remember the Latin word for you, you go to  
23 confession, "Through my fault, through my fault" --  
24 sorry, can I take a break?
- 25 Q. Would you like a break?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. It is close to time when we might normally have a  
3 break --

4 LADY SMITH: We would normally have a break about now  
5 anyway; would that work for you?

6 A. Yes, I get stressed out. Sorry.

7 LADY SMITH: We can take five minutes now. It would be  
8 helpful to all of us and the stenographers can have  
9 a break as well then. Shall we do that?

10 A. Yes.

11 LADY SMITH: Very well.

12 (2.56 pm)

13 (A short break)

14 (3.05 pm)

15 LADY SMITH: Are you okay to continue now, Billy?

16 A. Yeah I am fine.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18 Mr MacAulay.

19 MR MacAULAY: Yes my Lady.

20 You will be pleased to hear, Billy, that I haven't  
21 got far to go. Some good news for you.

22 A. You had me worried there!

23 Q. You tell me in your statement that you still have  
24 flashbacks from things at Smyllum.

25 A. Yes and [REDACTED], particularly to

1 [REDACTED].

2 Q. But if we leave [REDACTED] aside, so far as  
3 Smyllum is concerned, I think what you tell us is the  
4 priest incident in particular is something that comes  
5 back to mind.

6 A. Yeah, it does.

7 Q. You did tell us before the break that you -- that you  
8 were finally diagnosed with PTSD; is that correct?

9 A. Yes in 1997.

10 Q. Was that related to --

11 A. I think I now realise -- I think as well a lot of my  
12 anger comes from it as well and I think I need to get  
13 this off my chest, the anger issue. And also it is  
14 causing me again anger that's related -- there's a  
15 connection to anger and PTSD and also anger to what  
16 happened to me in the orphanage and nobody will listen.

17 Basically doubting nobody would listen to what I was  
18 saying. I think that's part of my anger as well,  
19 I think.

20 Q. You tell us, I think, that you have sought some  
21 treatment and you saw a psychiatrist in [REDACTED] for  
22 a while.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. But you stopped seeing the psychiatrist?

25 A. No, no, I have thought about that and I stopped because

1           they had appointments and cutbacks and -- I actually  
2           have an appointment -- I just have an appointment the  
3           now and they told us there is one in January because the  
4           psychologist has been off having a baby for a year or  
5           so. She is now back on her books so hopefully by  
6           January I should be getting another appointment to see  
7           the psychologist.

8           Q. Can I take you to one paragraph in your statement that  
9           I want to ask you about. It is on page 12 and it is  
10          paragraph 64. What you tell us there, Billy, is that:

11                   "A few years ago, maybe around 2007, I decided to  
12                   contact the police."

13                   Can I just ask you about that. You reckon it was  
14                   2007 first of all that you made this contact?

15          A. It might have been, I can't remember exactly what year  
16           it was, but I know in particular it was involving, what  
17           do you call him, Jack McConnell. My sister contacted  
18           the gentleman who passed away, a guy called -- I think  
19           it is Docherty his name was.

20          Q. Frank Docherty?

21          A. Frank Docherty. That's the man who actually contacted  
22           my sister, who contacted me, and told me about  
23           Jack McConnell. Once I spoke to Frank Docherty --  
24           before he passed away, I spoke to Frank and he was  
25           telling me that Jack McConnell was looking into this



1 abuse in Lanark. That's why I decided then, I says  
2 well -- and I says, I was in Smyllum; he was obviously  
3 at Smyllum as well he told me. Anyway we got into  
4 conversation and he says, why don't you contact the  
5 police, so I did phone the police.

6 The police weren't very forthcoming but anyway --

7 Q. Was it the police in Lanark that you made contact with?

8 A. The police in Lanark got back to me and they said that  
9 they were aware of this **HAV** guy. They knew, well  
10 aware what he had done, and he says, you weren't the  
11 only one. I was quite shocked when -- and I says to  
12 him, well, you know -- so I says to him, "I wasn't the  
13 only one who got that abuse?" And they says other  
14 children in the orphanage.

15 I then contacted Lanark Council to have a meeting  
16 with them and they refused my thing, the call for  
17 a meeting. Again, they weren't very forthcoming. Then  
18 I found out later that **HAV** had passed away, so  
19 again the police obviously knew that.

20 Q. The person you call **HAV** he was the abuser, he was  
21 the person who abused you?

22 A. Aye, and the police were aware of him, they knew what he  
23 had done. He had a history.

24 Q. And when you contacted the police, you were reporting  
25 that abuse --

1 A. I reported it, yes. I reported it when I was there and  
2 I told the police his name, gave his name, and they did  
3 say, well, we do know about him and we are well aware of  
4 him, but he has passed away now.

5 Q. Was that really the end of that?

6 A. No. Then they got back in touch with me again and, you  
7 know, and that's when I -- again, I asked them again and  
8 says what about -- I knew about the Inquiry. And it  
9 took me a wee while to get my courage up to contact the  
10 Inquiry.

11 Q. That was more recently that you made contact prior to  
12 coming to the Inquiry?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Can I then go back to page 16 of your statement, Billy.  
15 It is paragraph 82 I want you to look at. What you say  
16 there is:

17 "The nuns at Smyllum just weren't human."

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. "They had no feelings and showed no compassion or love.  
20 They are robots. They have never admitted they were  
21 wrong and they still don't admit it."

22 A. I've already mentioned that to you Colin, I recall.  
23 I did state to you the nuns never showed any compassion  
24 or any feelings. They were just like -- if I -- I can't  
25 compare it to (inaudible) -- but you're just a number,

1 basically.

2 I was saying there was only one, one nun, in all the  
3 nuns, that showed compassion but the rest of them just  
4 had no human feelings whatsoever and I just felt, you  
5 know, why? I realise now why.

6 You know, compassion doesn't cost much to show; to  
7 show another human being compassion, it's not a hard  
8 thing, to show somebody -- it took me a long time to  
9 show compassion to people and I think there should be  
10 more -- people should show compassion, and be  
11 understanding, you know?

12 But there's nothing like that -- I'm sorry -- but  
13 there's nothing like that from these people.

14 Q. And your hopes for this Inquiry, Billy, then, if you  
15 read on at paragraph 84, can you tell us what you hope  
16 for us?

17 A. To be aware that abuse has been going and to stop it.  
18 From what I've been hearing, it's still going on. So  
19 where do we go? How do we stop it? How do we stop the  
20 rot? How do we stop people like these nuns, who say  
21 "I'm no longer a Daughter of Charity but we're  
22 Sisters of Charity", these must -- I mean, they bleat  
23 about this and they bleat about that, and they're sorry  
24 and all that; sorry for what? Half of them weren't even  
25 alive then in the 70s and 80s, but they seem to forget

1           that in the early 40s, 50s, people like myself, we  
2           suffered. Where is the compassion? It is all very well  
3           saying sorry.

4       Q. And one other thing you say at 85 is that:

5                 "I also hope that the Catholic Church can hold their  
6           hands up and admit that abuse did take place and  
7           apologise".

8       A. Well, I do. I do. Maybe I should go right to the top,  
9           His Holiness. I don't know. Maybe he has looked at  
10          this, maybe he has looked in here. These things have  
11          been going on for centuries, as far as back as we can  
12          remember. Right? The nuns should publicly apologise.  
13          They should apologise. It is all very well them going  
14          to their papers and saying this and saying that, they  
15          feel sorry, they'll do it over, sorry for this and sorry  
16          for that, and one minute they're sitting on 6 million  
17          assets. It's not about the money, it is about they need  
18          to think and apologise to us. Not only to me, right?

19                 They say they're not aware that abuse went on.  
20          Well, wait a minute, these nuns that are bleating about  
21          they were not aware the abuse went on, they weren't  
22          around when I was in the orphanage, so how -- in God's  
23          sake, how do they know? An apology, that's what we're  
24          asking for.

25       Q. Well, very well Billy, thank you for that.

1 A. Thank you Colin.

2 Q. Thank you for coming.

3 A. No, thank you.

4 Q. Thank you for coming to give your evidence.

5 A. I thank you for listening to me.

6 Q. That's not a problem, and my Lady I can say that no  
7 written questions have been submitted and I don't know  
8 if there is to be any questions.

9 LADY SMITH: Can I check whether there are any outstanding  
10 applications? No.

11 Billy, thank you very much for coming along today to  
12 share your memories with us. It's very important to the  
13 work of the Inquiry that we are able to gather evidence  
14 such as yours. I'm sure it can't have been easy for you  
15 putting it together and coming here today, but I do  
16 appreciate you having done so.

17 A. I appreciate it, I wanted to tell my side of the story  
18 and hopefully other people will come forward and do the  
19 same thing.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you for that.

21 A. Thank you.

22 LADY SMITH: I'm able to let you go now. Thank you.

23 Does that complete the evidence for this week,  
24 Mr MacAulay?

25 MR MacAULAY: I think that's probably an actual point at

1           which to stop, my Lady.

2       LADY SMITH:   So we start again on Monday I think at  
3           10 o'clock, yes?

4       MR MacAULAY:   On Monday we have three witnesses who will be  
5           giving oral evidence and depending on what time is  
6           available we may also read in a statement.

7       LADY SMITH:   Next week we sit on Monday, we sit on Tuesday  
8           and on Friday.

9       MR MacAULAY:   If necessary.

10      LADY SMITH:   If necessary, depending on what progress we  
11           make on Monday and Tuesday.

12      MR MacAULAY:   There is a reasonable chance we shall finish  
13           the evidence on Tuesday, but if not --

14      LADY SMITH:   We have Friday available.   But whatever happens  
15           we will not be sitting on Wednesday or Thursday  
16           and I hope that helps other people make arrangements in  
17           their working life next week.

18                    Thank you very much.   I'm going to adjourn now until  
19           10 o'clock on Monday morning.

20      (3.20 pm)

21                    (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am on Monday,

22   11 December 2017)

23

24

25

I N D E X

PAGE

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

"BILL" (affirmed) .....1

    Questions from MR MacAULAY .....2

"MARGARET" (sworn) .....55

    Questions from MR MacAULAY .....55

"BILLY" (sworn) .....93

    Questions from MR MacAULAY .....94

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5
- 6
- 7
- 8
- 9
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25



- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4
- 5