

Wednesday, 16 September 2020

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

(10.00 am)

LADY SMITH: Good morning. Today we resume some evidence in person. I'm delighted to be able to proceed almost as normal. Mr MacAulay, I think our witness is here. Is that right?

MR MACAULAY: Yes, good morning, my Lady. That's right. This witness is Professor Marjory-Ann Denoon Harper.

LADY SMITH: Thank you.

Professor Harper, if you could manage to raise your right-hand -- if you want to put the file on the table behind you? Yes. If you would raise your right-hand please and repeat after me?

MARJORY-ANN DENOON HARPER (sworn)

Questioned by MR MACAULAY

Just before I turn to the matter of your evidence, can I thank you for being prepared to come here? I hope that seeing the precautions that we've taken have reassured you that we really have tried to think of everything to help ensure people's safety, but if you have any worries or any questions about our procedures, please don't hesitate to ask anyone, including me. I may not be the person that has got the best answer but I will know who does.

A Thank you.

1 LADY SMITH: With those preliminaries over, let me hand you  
2 over to Mr MacAulay and he will explain what happens  
3 next.

4 A Thank you.

5 MR MACAULAY: Hello, Marjory. Your full name is Marjory-Ann  
6 Denoon Harper. Is that right?

7 A That is correct.

8 Q And you have in front of you a red folder, and I did  
9 notice that you brought with you a yellow folder. In  
10 the red folder you will find the lengthy report to which  
11 you are a contributor, and as far as the yellow folder  
12 is concerned, is that another copy of the report?

13 A It is.

14 Q Then you may find it easier for yourself to work off the  
15 yellow folder, if you have made annotations to the  
16 document.

17 A I have some annotations.

18 Q So would that be easier for you?

19 A Probably.

20 Q Perhaps we will just remove the red folder to get it out  
21 of your way.

22 Now, Marjory, I want to begin by looking at your CV,  
23 and even though -- just to test the system, I will  
24 perhaps try and have that on the screen in front of you,  
25 and the number, the reference is INQ-101.

1                   So it is there?

2           A    Yes.

3           Q    Can we see, just looking at the heading, "Educational  
4                   Background and Qualifications", looking to your  
5                   university education, that was spent at Aberdeen  
6                   University?

7           A    That is correct.

8           Q    And having graduated in history, did you go on to carry  
9                   out a Ph.D with the title, "Immigration from the North  
10                  East of Scotland, 1830-1880"?

11          A    That's correct.

12          Q    And I will come back to that in a few moments, but so  
13                  far as membership of professional bodies is concerned,  
14                  you set that out in the next section, and can we see,  
15                  for example, you are a fellow of the Royal Historical  
16                  Society?

17          A    Yes.

18          Q    And throughout your employment history you give us some  
19                  information, but so far as the present is concerned, are  
20                  you, and have you been since 2010, a Professor of  
21                  History at the University of Aberdeen?

22          A    That is correct, and I'm also currently a senior  
23                  researcher at the Centre for History at the University  
24                  of the Highlands and Islands.

25          Q    And just looking at what you describe as your, "Current

1           and recent responsibilities", I'm just focusing on the  
2           most recent of those actually, 2019 and on-going, you  
3           are involved with a collaboration with the National  
4           Library of Australia in an oral history funded project.  
5           Can you tell me a little bit about that?

6           A    It's been suspended because of the COVID 19 crisis, but  
7           it came about because I had communication with an oral  
8           historian in South Australia, a man called Rob Linn, who  
9           has been working on oral history for many decades, and  
10          in 2015 I went to Australia and gave a public lecture at  
11          the National Library of Australia under the auspices of  
12          their oral history unit, and I think it was on the back  
13          of that I was asked to get involved with this project  
14          which is funded, really, by the National Library of  
15          Australia, but in collaboration with the researcher whom  
16          I have mentioned.

17          Q    But is that a broader thing than migration, or is it  
18          focusing on migration?

19          A    It focuses on migration.

20          Q    And you set out some other information in that section.

21                Then looking at your selected bibliography, you have  
22          co-authored a book. Is that right? And what was the  
23          title of the book?

24          A    "Migration and Empire".

25          Q    And was that co-authored with Professor Constantine who

1 is coming to give evidence?

2 A It was.

3 Q And you then provide some further information in  
4 relation to what you have published.

5 Major forthcoming and recent publications that  
6 include -- and if we move down the list -- "Testimonies  
7 of Transition, an Oral History of Scottish Emigration",  
8 about to be published as an audio book. Can you just  
9 give me a little bit of background into that piece of  
10 work?

11 A Since 2005 I have been conducting interviews with  
12 migrants and returned migrants, and in 2018 I turned  
13 those interviews, or used those interviews as the basis  
14 for a conventional book with the title, "Testimonies of  
15 Transition". The interviews account for about 110  
16 individuals. I have used most of those in the book, but  
17 having published that book, and having used the  
18 interviews for a number of public lectures, it became  
19 increasingly evident to me that because it was an  
20 audible research project, it really deserved to be  
21 published as an audio book. The interviewees deserved to  
22 have their voices heard as well as read about, so I  
23 managed to obtain a grant from the Strathmartine Trust  
24 to work with the BBC to turn the conventional written  
25 book into an audio book which is currently in press with

1           audible books. It isn't published yet but it is in  
2           press.

3           Q   And the migrants who made contributions -- had they been  
4           to particular countries?

5           A   I approached the research by contacting my various  
6           networks, publicising what I was doing through my  
7           various networks which were mainly in North America and  
8           the Antipodes, so most of my interviews come from those  
9           countries but I have also sourced interviewees from  
10          Africa, Asia and South America.

11          Q   And do I take it from what you have said that this  
12          project goes back to 2005?

13          A   Very minimally in 2005. That's when I began to collect  
14          interviews, but it was really only as I moved more and  
15          more into the 20th century part of my work that I  
16          realised there was huge potential for recording and  
17          analysing the experiences of people who had emigrated,  
18          initially in the inter-war period, but of course they  
19          mostly -- well, all passed away by now, but increasingly  
20          from the 1950s and 1960s when there was a big upsurge in  
21          emigration so most of my interviewees are from that  
22          post-war period.

23          Q   But are you looking at adults who emigrated or children  
24          who were migrated or both?

25          A   The people whom I have interviewed have all been adults.

1           The youngest was 26 at the time of interview. The  
2           oldest was 100. So they were all adults, as I say, at  
3           the time of interview, but some of them had emigrated as  
4           children.

5           Q   And as children were they children, as we understand  
6           them, child migrants, to be namely children left without  
7           parents, for example?

8           A   No. They were all children who emigrated as members of  
9           families with one exception who was a sea evacuee.

10          Q   And as we go down the list, I think four items from the  
11          bottom you have a piece of work, "Moving and Moving On".

12          A   My screen has gone blank.

13          Q   Oh, has it? (Pause)

14                I will just perhaps carry on reading. You probably  
15          remember what it is. It is a piece of work with the  
16          title, "Moving Out and Moving On, Emigration From  
17          Scotland to Australia in the 20th Century". That was  
18          a piece of work you did in 2017. Was the focus there on  
19          adults or children or both?

20          A   Both.

21          Q   You also have a piece of work with the title, "The  
22          evolution of emigrant child travel to New Zealand in the  
23          19th and 20th century", and that was a piece of work you  
24          produced in 2016?

25          LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay, I think if we wait a moment

1 I think we may be able to sort out this screen. (Pause)

2 A It has come back on. It just came back on in the middle  
3 of your last question.

4 LADY SMITH: Ah. Right.

5 A And on the correct page.

6 LADY SMITH: Yes. If we could check it at the break time  
7 that would be good. Let us know if there are any  
8 further problems and, if necessary, we will all go off  
9 and let the --

10 MR MACAULAY: Sorry, I was talking about your piece of work  
11 that focused on New Zealand. Again, was that to do with  
12 emigration generally as opposed to child migration in  
13 particular.

14 A Yes. It was to do with emigration generally. It was  
15 based on a fellowship that I held, a short-term  
16 fellowship, what was called a, "Caird Fellowship", with  
17 the National Maritime Museum in Greenwich so I was able  
18 to utilise archives from that depository and then deploy  
19 those in the writing of that article, along with  
20 a number of other archival articles.

21 Q I was intrigued by the --

22 A The screen has gone off again I'm afraid. It has come  
23 on again.

24 LADY SMITH: I think we will have to sort this. Marjory, I  
25 will go off the bench, we will get you back into the



1 witness space and allow free access to the screen. We  
2 will see if this can be sorted out.

3 (10.12 am)

4 (A short break)

5 (10.22 am)

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you to the technicians who have attended  
7 to the screen. We are hoping that the connection is now  
8 tight enough that you won't have any further problems  
9 but do let me know if there are any.

10 A Yes.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

12 Mr MacAulay?

13 MR MACAULAY: I had moved on to look at the piece of work  
14 that's at the bottom of the page with the title,  
15 "Initiatives, Impediments and Identities: Scottish  
16 Emigration in the 20th Century", and I was intrigued by  
17 the title. What was that covering?

18 A It covers the reasons why Scots emigrated, the attitudes  
19 towards emigration that were manifested in particularly  
20 the public domain, that refers to the, "Impediments",  
21 and the identity section of the title refers to the way  
22 in which Scots perceived themselves when they were  
23 overseas, and how they were perceived by those among  
24 whom they settled.

25 Q And the period you are covering here? The 20th century,

1 but is there a particular part of the 20th century?

2 A As much of the 20th century as the sources allowed me to  
3 investigate, so pretty much the whole of the century,  
4 but of course, as a historian, it is always easier to  
5 examine and analyse periods that are further away from  
6 one's own lifetime.

7 Q And the next contribution on page 3 of the document, the  
8 very top of the page, "Migrants and Migration", which  
9 seems to be a contribution to a book known as, "The  
10 Encyclopaedia of Migration". Is that a book or a series  
11 of volumes?

12 A It's one large encyclopaedia of -- I believe it is.  
13 I don't think I have ever seen the finished product, so  
14 I couldn't be sure about that. All I remember about  
15 doing that, writing that entry, was that there was quite  
16 a severe word restriction, so to write about migrants  
17 and migration within a word limit was quite challenging,  
18 but I'm afraid I can't remember very much about that.  
19 It was some time ago.

20 Q And you then have other reference to some other older,  
21 significant publications, including, for example, second  
22 in the list, "Emigrant Homecomings: The Return Movement  
23 of Emigrants". Is that focusing on those who emigrated  
24 but who came back to live in this country?

25 A That is correct. At the time when that book was

1 published and -- I'm afraid the screen has gone off  
2 again, and it's back.

3 LADY SMITH: It's back.

4 MR MACAULAY: Yes, but we will need it to be consistent as  
5 we go through the ...

6 A It's back again, so ...

7 LADY SMITH: Let's bear with it, and it can perhaps -- if  
8 there are any other difficulties, have an overhaul at  
9 the break that we will take at 11 o'clock.

10 MR MACAULAY: So, sorry, you were going on to tell us  
11 what --

12 A Yes. That publication arose from a conference that I  
13 organised in 2001 and at that time very little attention  
14 had been paid to return migration, although we know that  
15 around a third of people who emigrated from Scotland  
16 ultimately returned to the country, so it did seem to be  
17 an aspect of the phenomenon that was worth pursuing, so  
18 we pursued it first of all in a conference and then in  
19 the volume that I edited, and as you see from the title,  
20 it covered quite a long period, 1600-2000, so there was  
21 a range of chapters in that book.

22 Q And we will be looking, as we move on, to what is  
23 referred to as, "Juvenile migration". Did you come  
24 across, in this piece of work, people who had been  
25 emigrated as juveniles and who had come back to

1 Scotland?

2 A As far as I recollect, none of the chapters in that  
3 book, and none of the contributors wrote about child or  
4 juvenile migration. The nearest that would come to that  
5 sort of study would have been, I think, a chapter by  
6 Alistair Thomson called -- and again I can't remember  
7 the exact title, but it was to do with return migration  
8 from Australia, but I do not think there was anything  
9 specifically about child or juvenile migration.

10 Q The final piece of work I want to focus on for present  
11 purposes is the second-last in the list, and that's,  
12 "Emigration from Scotland Between the Wars: Opportunity  
13 or Exile?" And does the title identify what was being  
14 investigated in that piece of work?

15 A It does, and there is a chapter in that book that  
16 includes a lot of material on child and juvenile  
17 migration.

18 Q And we can read the rest of what you present in your CV  
19 ourselves, particularly in relation to your public  
20 lectures and conferences, broadcasting and so on. What  
21 I want to go back to, actually, is your Ph.D thesis that  
22 you have told us about that was completed in 1983, and  
23 was it that that, as it were, gave you an appetite for  
24 looking at this whole issue of migration?

25 A It went back further than that, in fact, to when I was

1           an undergraduate in my third year of undergraduate study  
2           I was given an opportunity by an excellent lecturer and  
3           tutor, a man by the name of Donald Witherington, to  
4           write an essay on a subject of my own choice, and I  
5           wrote about emigration, I think it was probably Highland  
6           emigration, I then thought, well, I would like to do  
7           this for doctoral study and I chose the north east of  
8           Scotland because that area had not been studied, and  
9           there was a very rich vein of source material in  
10          Aberdeen University library in that the library holds  
11          a complete run of the local newspaper, the Aberdeen  
12          Journal, from its origins in the late 1740s right  
13          through to the present, so I made that the basis of my  
14          research and the interest snowballed, as I progressed,  
15          so from that basis I branched out from the north east to  
16          the whole of Scotland and into earlier and later  
17          periods, so from the initial 1830-1880 focus I began to  
18          look earlier and later, and I did that in my teaching as  
19          well as my research.

20         Q    And I think it is the case that you were allowed access  
21             to records held on behalf of Barnardo's. Is that right?

22         A    That is correct, and also Quarriers. The Barnardo  
23             archive -- and again, this is going back a long time so  
24             my memory may have faded -- but I do remember going to  
25             the University of Liverpool and being given access under

1 strict conditions, I mean the records were embargoed,  
2 but being given access on condition that I anonymised  
3 anything I would say I was writing about. The way in  
4 which I became aware of the Barnardo's story and the  
5 Quarriers story was indeed through the Aberdeen Journal.  
6 As I say, that was the baseline source for everything  
7 that I did, and it allowed me to -- I was able to use  
8 that source as a springboard to identify other relevant  
9 source materials, and that's how I became alerted to the  
10 Quarrier and the Barnardo material, and would you like  
11 me to speak about Quarriers as well?

12 Q Because I think you were also allowed access to  
13 Quarriers records?

14 A I was given amazing access to Quarriers material. In  
15 the late 1980s -- no. I think -- my Ph.D was finished  
16 in 1983, so I don't think, and again I'm not sure  
17 because my memory doesn't serve me correctly on this,  
18 but I don't think I had access to Quarriers materials  
19 when I was writing the Ph.D but by the time I turned the  
20 Ph.D into a book which was published in 1988 I had been  
21 given access to those original files, and I then  
22 revisited Quarriers for subsequent research, and at that  
23 time the honorary archivist was Bill Dunbar who made me  
24 extremely welcome and gave me actually unfettered access  
25 to the materials, and I simply used my discretion about

1 the material that I then put into the public domain.

2 If there was sensitive material I anonymised it. If  
3 the material had been in the public press, for example  
4 a criminal case which was reported in the press, I did  
5 use the names of the individuals, so there are, I think,  
6 a couple of cases where there had been criminal  
7 convictions of parents and the children had been taken  
8 to Quarriers, and it was all in the public domain, where  
9 I did identify those individuals, but not if the  
10 material was not already in the public domain.

11 Q But was your focus in looking at the Barnardo's records  
12 and the Quarriers records on migration?

13 A Yes.

14 Q Can I then move on to look at the work that you and your  
15 colleagues have done for this Inquiry? In your yellow  
16 folder I think you have the complete report that has  
17 been produced. I will put that on the screen. It's at  
18 INQ-42. We are looking at the front page with the  
19 title, "Child Abuse and Scottish Children Sent Overseas  
20 Through Child Migration Schemes". If we scroll down can  
21 we see reference to yourself and also Professors  
22 Constantine and Professor Lynch.

23 Now, as I understand it, your primary contribution  
24 to this report is an appendix, Appendix 1, that  
25 addresses juvenile migration. Is that right?

1 A That is correct.

2 Q In relation to the -- if I can refer to it as, "The main  
3 report", I think Professor Constantine is the primary  
4 author of that report. Did you have any -- make any  
5 contributions to that report, whether in discussions or  
6 other forms of correspondence?

7 A Yes I did. I investigated some of the smaller  
8 institutions which either did or may have migrated  
9 children such as the Aberlour orphanage, the Whinwell  
10 home, Emma Stirling's refuge, and institutions like the  
11 Oakbank School in Aberdeen and tried to investigate  
12 others where there was no real evidence, I just came to  
13 a dead end, so it was really, I think, supplying  
14 Professor Constantine particularly with my findings. I  
15 mean, Professor Constantine and I have worked together,  
16 as you know, on Migration and Empire so we were used to  
17 exchanging information, so I would write up material on  
18 those smaller institutions and supply it to him and he  
19 would incorporate it into his own findings.

20 Q So far as your own major contribution is concerned,  
21 that's Appendix 1 with the title, "Juvenile Migration",  
22 and again, if I could put that on the screen, it is the  
23 same number, but it is at page 286?

24 A It appears to be page 294.

25 Q Yes. I think we will get there. It is 286 of the Nuix



1 document and 278 of the document itself?

2 LADY SMITH: 278 of the document?

3 MR MACAULAY: 278 of the document but what's referred to as  
4 the Nuix page is 286.

5 LADY SMITH: 278.

6 MR MACAULAY: 278 of the document. We now have it on the  
7 screen. If we scroll down just to the bottom, yes,  
8 further down, and down, just I want to see the -- so we  
9 have two numbers, 278 and 286.

10 Now, can I just understand before we look at the  
11 aspects of the text, the sources that you used in the  
12 construction of this index? We know about your own  
13 background expertise now, and presumably you rely on  
14 that, but what other sources did you use?

15 A Can I preface that by recording my immense gratitude to  
16 Andressa Gadda for supplying me and my colleagues with  
17 materials relevant to our investigations? I have never  
18 enjoyed such immense and consistent support in terms of  
19 providing research materials in my entire career, so I  
20 really would like to record that.

21 LADY SMITH: Marjory, can I thank you enormously for that?  
22 Because I do know she has worked dreadfully hard on  
23 this, and utterly committed her energies to it. I will  
24 pass on those compliments to her. She's not in the room  
25 today, she is in the building today but I will see that

1 she hears what you said. Thank you.

2 A So on the basis of that, the materials that I used in  
3 researching this part of the Inquiry would have included  
4 documents sent by -- supplied by local authorities, by  
5 sending institutions, by institutions which focused  
6 primarily on migration, but also by institutions for  
7 which migration was a tangential part of their  
8 activities, and I think these come out in the footnotes.  
9 I mean, smaller organisations like Barwell, the Scouts.  
10 There was no -- I mean, there is a reference, I include  
11 a section on Canadian Pacific Scheme, it was not  
12 possible to obtain records from Canadian Pacific, so we  
13 don't know very much about that Scheme.

14 One of the larger repositories was that of the  
15 Cossar scheme from the National Records of Scotland. I  
16 also made use of material relating to the Flock House  
17 Scheme in New Zealand that I sourced when I was in  
18 New Zealand in the Hocken Library in Dunedin. Salvation  
19 Army archives, as is well known, the bulk of the  
20 material relating to migration undertaken by the  
21 Salvation Army was destroyed in The Blitz, so we are  
22 very limited in what we can access there. There is some  
23 material, I think some parallel material in overseas  
24 archives of the Salvation Army, but I think the remit of  
25 the Inquiry did not extend to requiring those documents

1 to be submitted, so we did not obtain anything from  
2 overseas repositories.

3 YMCA material, if I recollect correctly, I accessed  
4 in Edinburgh. Copies of the magazine, that sort of  
5 thing, and for the reformatories my recollection is that  
6 Andressa supplied me with documents. She certainly  
7 supplied me with documents on all these institutions.

8 Q You have mentioned a number of sources there -- the  
9 National Records of Scotland material, I think that  
10 material generally comes from very large voluminous  
11 folders. Is that right?

12 A That is correct.

13 Q Hundreds of pages on occasions?

14 A Yes, and not always legible.

15 Q No, so you would have to extract the relevant material  
16 from that sort of source.

17 A Yes. I would say that a lot of this work is like the  
18 iceberg with nine tenths going on below the surface. It  
19 is the -- even the transcribing of material, and then  
20 analysing it as a stage two process, because with some  
21 of it, it isn't possible to evaluate it just by looking  
22 at it. You actually have to transcribe it first.

23 Q The responses by those who were involved either to  
24 a greater or lesser extent to emigrant migration, for  
25 example the Section 21 response by Barnardo's or

1           Quarriers, did you find these helpful documents?

2           A    Yes I did. Voluminous, sometimes dauntingly voluminous,  
3           and yes, I think immensely helpful, both the documents  
4           themselves and the Section 21 responses.

5                    The only qualification I would make to that, and  
6           perhaps that's an unfair term to use, I would have liked  
7           to have seen again, just to satisfy myself from my own  
8           research back in the 1980s was spot on, was the  
9           references I had called out then to material in the  
10          Aberlour journals which refer to children who were sent  
11          to Canada before 1900, but I understand that the  
12          Aberlour Childcare Trust doesn't have a permanent  
13          archivist and is under considerable pressure so they  
14          were not willing for me to revisit, I think, their  
15          headquarters in Stirling and look again at that  
16          material, so I always like to corroborate what I do if  
17          I haven't visited it for a long time, and I did want to  
18          go back and check, for example, the year numbers and the  
19          page numbers of those specific references, not least  
20          because they did refer to unhappy experiences, or  
21          implied unhappy experiences, but I am relying for those  
22          references on my original research and the publication  
23          resulting from my original research which was the  
24          article, "Halfway to heaven or hell on earth, juvenile  
25          migrants".

1 Q We perhaps haven't touched on this but did you also,  
2 then, in the past have the chance to look at the  
3 Aberlour archives?

4 A I did. I think in 1994. No. It must have been earlier  
5 than that because I used it in an article published in  
6 1992 which was based on a conference paper I gave in  
7 Guelph in Canada in 1989 so it must have been the late  
8 1980s.

9 Q And as we are looking at the page on the screen, the  
10 first footnote at 1406, "Alan Gill, Likely Lads and  
11 Lasses: Youth Migration to Australia 1911-1983". Is  
12 that a book?

13 A Yes.

14 Q There are a number of books, I think, that you reference  
15 in the footnotes --

16 A Yes.

17 Q -- that you also had regard to?

18 A Yes indeed. I rely very heavily on secondary sources as  
19 well, and that goes right back to when I first started  
20 to become interested in child and juvenile migration  
21 which was a part, just simply a part of the wider  
22 migration work, so I was relying on works like "Children  
23 of the Empire", by Gillian Wagner and, "Barnardo's", by  
24 Gillian Wagner as well, and then Phyllis Harrison, "The  
25 Home Children", Joy Parr's book on child migrants to

1 Canada, Kenneth Bagnall's book, "The Little Emigrants",  
2 and then later on the books that began to make a more  
3 focused study of problematic issues.

4 Q Can we just look at definitions because the focus for  
5 you in Appendix 1 is on juvenile migration and we need  
6 to distinguish that for these purposes from child  
7 migration. Can you just elaborate upon that for me?

8 A We decided that we would define the juveniles as those  
9 who had got beyond -- got to the school leaving age and  
10 beyond, and of course that was a moveable story because  
11 the school leaving age was 13 from 1872, 14 from 1883,  
12 15 from 1947 and 16 from 1972, so it was a constantly  
13 shifting definition.

14 Q And that in itself makes it difficult.

15 A Yes.

16 Q And who were these juvenile migrants?

17 A Some of them were juveniles who were people in need,  
18 from deprived backgrounds who were migrated from  
19 institutions, but many of them had families, came from  
20 conventional families, and were, one could say, I think,  
21 migrated by their parents because their parents felt  
22 that there were better opportunities overseas in terms  
23 of employment, advancement and life in general, and this  
24 itself was part of a, I think, a wider backdrop of  
25 a belief that emigration was a positive experience. I

1 referred earlier to the one interviewee who was a sea  
2 evacuee and he later went on to have a complete career  
3 overseas, well, early career overseas, and when I asked  
4 him about his reasons for migrating as an adult, he  
5 said, well, the perception was, to quote, "Abroad was  
6 where it all happened", and I think there was that sense  
7 in Scotland and in the UK at large that particularly in  
8 the interwar years in Scotland, and the deprivation of  
9 the interwar years, better opportunities were to be had  
10 overseas. If you wind the clock back to the 19th  
11 century and the more confident imperialism of that era,  
12 there was still a perception, or there was in that  
13 earlier period, a perception that emigration was  
14 advantageous because of the enthusiasm for empire, so  
15 I think what I'm saying there is in the earlier period  
16 in which I have looked at juvenile migration, there was  
17 a great optimism about the opportunities. By the 1920s  
18 and the 1930s it was more geared towards pessimism about  
19 Scotland's future and, really, well, life can't be any  
20 worse. Life might be better overseas.

21 Q And you mentioned a little while ago that some of these  
22 juvenile migrants were children who were in need or  
23 deprived, but many were not, and if you look at an  
24 organisation like the Big Brother Movement, for example,  
25 do they -- were they involved in juvenile migration,

1 both in connection with children who were in need but  
2 also children who had been put forward by parents?

3 A I think primarily those who had been put forward by  
4 parents. It was not seen as a scheme for rescuing needy  
5 children. It was seen as a scheme for, first and  
6 foremost, giving new -- giving better opportunities to  
7 those who already were well set in life, and it is,  
8 again, all part of a context of, I suppose, what in the  
9 19th century, late 19th century, would have been called,  
10 "Muscular christianity", but by the early 20th century  
11 had secularised, but still had this aura of adventure --  
12 Kiplingesque-type adventure -- so, for example, the  
13 public schools had migration schemes, or school tours of  
14 the empire, and the idea there was that boys in  
15 particular, but girls as well, having gone on these  
16 tours, would be inspired in their adult lives to go out  
17 and support the empire and contribute to its  
18 continuance, so there are a number of schemes like that.  
19 So that was the background context, I think a context of  
20 enthusiasm about emigration, belief that emigration  
21 worked.

22 LADY SMITH: Marjory, one small detail. I fully understand  
23 that your definition of, "Juvenile", at the lower end is  
24 a child who has reached school leaving age, so if  
25 a person was being migrated at the age of 15, say, in



1           1947 they would be a juvenile. Have you regarded our  
2           cut-off of 18 years old as the top end of the juvenile  
3           category or have you gone beyond that?

4           A I have gone beyond that where the evidence has indicated  
5           that institutions, at least in theory, continued to  
6           supervise those juveniles, until they were 21 sometimes.

7           LADY SMITH: I thought that was right because it seems that  
8           references to some older -- we might say, "Children or  
9           young people" -- are made. Thank you.

10          MR MACAULAY: I think what you are saying there is that a  
11          child might have been migrated at the age of 14 as a  
12          juvenile when that was the school leaving age, but there  
13          would be an aftercare provision until perhaps the child  
14          reached 18, 19, 20, depending on the circumstances.

15          A Yes. Yes, and depending on institution, I think.

16          Q Yes, and talking about institutions, the paragraph is  
17          actually on the screen, paragraph 2.3, where you  
18          identify a number of organisations that, to varying  
19          extent, were involved in juvenile migration, and you  
20          mentioned, for example -- you have mentioned this  
21          before, the Barwell Boys' Scheme, the Big Brother  
22          Movement, and so on, but just focusing on that, were  
23          there particular organisations who were more heavily  
24          involved than others? And can you identify these for  
25          us?

1 A Undoubtedly there were, and looking at that list, the  
2 Cossar Farms was a significant employer.

3 Q Was that purely Scottish?

4 A Yes. It was, and purely geared at boys who were in need  
5 and deprived of opportunity, not necessarily deprived of  
6 a normal home life, but certainly deprived as Cossar  
7 perceived it of opportunity, but they were taken from  
8 all over Scotland, even though Cossar's training farm  
9 was near Paisley.

10 Q Local authorities you mentioned. What involvement did  
11 local authorities have in this form of migration?

12 A Relatively minor, as far as I can make out from the  
13 material I have been sent. They tended to give over  
14 responsibility -- well, maybe not responsibility, but to  
15 give over the organisation of migration to the voluntary  
16 societies. I mean, the responsibility would still  
17 reside with local authorities, as I think the case of  
18 one of the Aberlour boys indicates, where Lanark County  
19 Council was involved, and so was Aberlour and so was the  
20 Scottish Home Department, but my sense is that while  
21 local authorities sanctioned overseas migration they  
22 were, as I say in 2.4, not actively -- generally not  
23 actively involved with the arrangements for migration  
24 and resettlement.

25 Q And I think the next section focus on numbers, and, in

1 particular, the number was 1900. In the period pre-1900  
2 there was juvenile migration being carried out,  
3 particularly, I think, by Quarriers. Is that right?

4 A That is correct, from the foundation of Quarriers in  
5 1872 onwards, yes.

6 Q And I think Barnardo's, the Barnardo's juvenile  
7 migration at that time would not really be directed  
8 towards Scotland because they didn't have a place in  
9 Scotland?

10 A That's correct.

11 Q Although it is possible Scottish boys went to Barnados  
12 homes in England?

13 A Yes, that would be the case, and I think that was what  
14 I was looking for when I went down to the Barnardo's  
15 archives in Liverpool many years ago. I did find  
16 examples of that but I couldn't quantify them.

17 LADY SMITH: Marjory, why did local authorities not get  
18 involved directly in child migration in the way that  
19 voluntary societies did?

20 A I'm not sure but my speculation is that the voluntary  
21 societies had cornered the market from quite an early  
22 stage in, really, the 1860s and 1870s when there was an  
23 upsurge of interest in philanthropic endeavour, but  
24 historically I think there had always been a difference  
25 between England and Scotland in the attitude of, for

1           example, in England the Boards of Guardians took a more  
2           active role in sanctioning or restricting child  
3           migration in a way that the Poor Law authorities in  
4           Scotland did not, and I'm not sure why that was the  
5           case, other than that they were less interventionist,  
6           the local authorities, and because the voluntary  
7           societies were already up and running and operating, it  
8           was easy to put the implementation of schemes on to  
9           them, but that's speculation.

10       LADY SMITH: I can see that, and it would mean, of course,  
11           that the local authorities didn't have to apply funds to  
12           that activity, if it was being looked after by somebody  
13           else.

14       A    Indeed.

15       LADY SMITH: And they felt they could trust the voluntary  
16           societies.

17       A    Yes. I think that is the case.

18       LADY SMITH: Thank you.

19       MR MACAULAY: You mentioned the philanthropic organisations.  
20           Before the state became involved in providing finance,  
21           and that was, I think, the Empire Settlement Act of  
22           1922, did these organisations really depend on their own  
23           funds, whether bequests or gifts, to finance this form  
24           of migration?

25       A    That is how they raised money. They adopted slightly

1 different tactics in doing that. For example, Quarriers  
2 and Annie MacPherson relied on free will offerings on  
3 alerting potential supporters and subscribers through  
4 their annual reports and really, I think, touching the  
5 heartstrings of those who would be then persuaded to  
6 give, whereas organisations like Barnardo's were more  
7 pro-active in what I would call, "Can rattling", going  
8 out and presenting the need to potential subscribers.

9 Q And then if we turn to the table on the following page  
10 where you set out an estimate of the number of juveniles  
11 migrated from 1900 and 1972, this is all 20th century.  
12 We have a list. When we look at Aberlour in comparison  
13 to, for example, Cossar Farms, it is a very low number,  
14 65 against 1,200.

15 A That, again, goes back to the very origins of Aberlour  
16 and its attitude towards migration. I think migration  
17 was always a tangential additional part of its work. It  
18 was primarily interested in rehabilitating its inmates  
19 in Scotland, and of course, as an Episcopalian  
20 institution it received fewer children than the -- well,  
21 Presbyterian or Baptist. Quarrier was a Baptist.

22 Q Quarriers, if we look at your list, you have gone for  
23 a number of 342 for this period. Is that right?

24 A Well, it is speculative. As one of the most challenging  
25 elements of the whole project has been to identify

1 numbers. We simply do not know, but on the basis --  
2 with some institutions we have been able to do a rough  
3 head count, so that with the Children's Overseas  
4 Reception Board, for instance, or Cossar, we know the  
5 numbers more or less, but with others it's much more  
6 speculative, and with a number of them it's been really  
7 taking the overall number we think went from the UK and  
8 then saying, well, Scotland had been 10 per cent of the  
9 UK's population so we will give 10 per cent of that  
10 number for the Scottish element, but it is -- I'm very  
11 hesitant about saying anything definitive about numbers.

12 Q It looks like a very definitive number, 342. Is that  
13 based on your own research into Quarriers? And indeed  
14 the Quarriers Section 21 response?

15 A I cannot remember for sure what it's based on. It is  
16 certainly based on conversations with Stephen  
17 Constantine and evaluation of the material that was sent  
18 to us under Section 21, but at this stage a year on from  
19 writing it I'm afraid I can't remember.

20 Q In any event the total for this period, 1900-1972, comes  
21 to something over 7,000. Is that right?

22 A That would be -- that's our estimate on ropery  
23 evidence -- well, evidence that is ropery to some extent.

24 Q You have already, I think, touched on the origins and  
25 development of juvenile migration, but I think what you

1           begin by telling us is that it had a punitive background  
2           to begin with. Is that right?

3           A    Yes.

4           Q    These children were being punished.

5           A    Yes, and that goes back to earlier centuries. For  
6           example, the 1740s in Aberdeen when the way that the  
7           local authority dealt with the potential for -- well,  
8           vagrancy or potential vagrancy was to virtually kidnap  
9           children or youths or adults from the city and put them  
10          on ships and ship them across the Atlantic. The most  
11          famous example is the case of Peter Williamson, and he  
12          is famous because he came back and wrote a book that  
13          named and shamed the magistrates that had sanctioned  
14          that activity, so that was Aberdeen magistrates' novel  
15          way of dealing with vagrancy in the 1740s. If you move  
16          on to, say, the 1820s you have punitive attitudes  
17          towards migrating children and juveniles, particularly  
18          juveniles, to deal with delinquency or potential  
19          delinquency, and it was only really by the 1860s that  
20          the attitude began to change to one of rehabilitation  
21          rather than punishment.

22          Q    And opportunity.

23          A    And opportunity.

24          Q    And so far as that was concerned, is that what people at  
25          Quarrier gets involved?

1 A Yes. Quarrier's own background led him into that  
2 philanthropic rescue work.

3 Q And in the 1900s and into the early 20th century was the  
4 prime target for migration, including juvenile  
5 migration, Canada?

6 A Yes. Until the 1920s. Quarrier -- there was  
7 a three-year period when Quarrier suspended emigration  
8 to Canada because he took offence at the Ontario Act  
9 which required more stringent conditions to be imposed  
10 on the children who -- the arrangements for sending  
11 children, but the focus was primarily Canada until after  
12 the First World War.

13 Q Yes. I think the Act was based on what was probably  
14 known as the Doyle report.

15 A That's correct.

16 Q And I think Quarrier took umbrage in that he thought  
17 this shouldn't apply to him?

18 A That is correct. Quarrier pointed out that his own  
19 institution had not been criticised under -- by Doyle or  
20 by the legislators in Ontario, but the new regulations  
21 were to apply to all institutions, and that's why he  
22 took umbrage, but that was in 1897 and I think Quarrier  
23 died in 1903, and soon after his death emigration was  
24 resumed.

25 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay, it's now 11 o'clock. Would that





1 Q But in fact it also served to address juvenile  
2 migration.

3 A It did. I mean, the purpose behind the Empire  
4 Settlement Act was partly to cement an empire that  
5 appears to be beginning to crumble, to reinforce that  
6 empire by encouraging British settlement in the four  
7 Dominions, particularly three of them, and also to head  
8 off the possibility of social unrest in the UK in the  
9 aftermath of the First World War in the post-war  
10 recession.

11 Q We have actually put on the screen, you will see it in  
12 front of you, and the reference is LEG-001.001.1300 and  
13 as we look at section 1, subsection 1, we are given the  
14 purpose, namely to formulate and co-operate in carrying  
15 out agreed schemes for affording joint assistance to  
16 suitable persons in the United Kingdom who intend to  
17 settle in any part of His Majesty's overseas dominion,  
18 so that's the thinking behind it, and if we look at  
19 subsection -- section 1.2(a):

20 "An agreed scheme under this Act may be either (a) a  
21 development or a land settlement scheme; or (b),  
22 "A scheme for facilitating a settlement or migration to  
23 any part of His Majesty's Overseas Dominions by  
24 assistance with passages, initial allowances, training  
25 or otherwise".

1 A Yes.

2 Q So quite a broad purpose?

3 A Very broad, and it allowed existing organisations to  
4 access funding, public funding that had previously been  
5 unavailable but it also allowed new participants to join  
6 in.

7 Q So someone like Quarriers who had other sources for  
8 funds could nevertheless take advantage of this  
9 particular legislation.

10 A That is correct.

11 Q And towards the bottom, can we see that in the first  
12 instance, that the scheme was to not last beyond  
13 a period of 15 years after the passing of the Act?

14 A That is correct. The Act was renewed at 15-year  
15 intervals, later becoming the Empire and Commonwealth  
16 Settlement Act, and it did not finally pass off the  
17 statute book until 1972, so it was a half century.

18 Q Yes. I think it was reenacted in 1957 which was 15  
19 years on. Well, it must have been a period before that,  
20 but certainly there was a reenactment in 1957, and then  
21 there was a five-year period, so 1962 and '67 and '72.

22 A Yes.

23 Q And just looking to the figures, then, if you turn to  
24 1301, the next page, we are told that the expenses of  
25 the scheme was to be paid out of monies provided by

1 Parliament, and then the limits are mentioned, and, in  
2 particular, can we see that after the passing of the Act  
3 the cap is £3 million, as you mentioned earlier.

4 A That's correct. The government found that the full  
5 amount of money available was never really accessed.  
6 The Empire Settlement Act did not attract the interest  
7 that they had expected.

8 Q Now, you also mention already the Bondfield report and  
9 that report, I think, meant eventually that from 1924,  
10 I think, onwards, only children of 14 and above could be  
11 emigrated to Canada.

12 A Correct.

13 Q And what was the thinking behind that?

14 A Margaret Bondfield had been sent out at the head of  
15 a delegation to investigate child and juvenile migration  
16 following the suicide of some of the children -- or  
17 those who were -- they were known at the time as, "Home  
18 boys", in Canada, and to investigate conditions in  
19 connection with that, I think.

20 Q Now, I think the way that you have structured your  
21 report is that in section 4 and onwards, that you look  
22 at individual organisations alphabetically.

23 A Correct.

24 Q So you start by looking at Aberlour, and as far as  
25 Aberlour is concerned, you have already mentioned,

1 Marjory, that you had access in the past to Aberlour  
2 records.

3 A That is correct.

4 Q Can you just give me some insight as to how that came  
5 about?

6 A Again, I seem to remember that I was alerted to the  
7 existence of a migration scheme at Aberlour through  
8 something I would have read in the Aberdeen Journal, and  
9 I would have investigated the existence of archival  
10 record, and I have, somewhere in my files,  
11 correspondence with the Aberlour Childcare Trust in  
12 which I arranged a visit to their Stirling headquarters  
13 and accessed not case files but the journal, the  
14 published journal of the orphanage for the pre-1900  
15 period. At that stage I wasn't working on post-1900  
16 issues.

17 Q And looking to your table for the post-1900 period, you  
18 are projecting a number of about 65 juvenile migrants  
19 from Aberlour.

20 A That would have been based on evidence supplied in the  
21 Section 21 response.

22 Q And as far as funding is concerned, would the 1922 Act  
23 have played a part in that funding?

24 A It is possible that it did. I don't recall it being  
25 mentioned, but it would -- there would have been --

1 eligible.

2 Q And in relation to, then, to the selection of the  
3 children who went, what were you able to discover on  
4 that front?

5 A It seems that Aberlour participated in migration schemes  
6 as opportunities arose rather than as part of a planned  
7 and consistent policy, so that, you know, we have  
8 reference, for example, to the Canadian Pacific Railway,  
9 Canadian Pacific Scheme, reunion Scheme, and 1927, the  
10 Orphanage Magazine referring to a visit by  
11 a colonization agent leading to six boys being sent  
12 under this Canadian Pacific Scheme in parties of boy  
13 Scouts, but we don't -- it was the Canadian Pacific  
14 Scheme that I wasn't able to find out any more about,  
15 because I think that would have meant going to the  
16 Canadian Pacific archives and there wasn't a possibility  
17 to do that, but sometimes children were sent at the  
18 behest of parents because there were relatives already  
19 over there, so that was much more an individual  
20 arrangement.

21 Q Now, you mentioned the Section 21 response. Perhaps we  
22 can just look at that quickly with you. It as at  
23 ABE-001.008.7700. It may be in .. the Nuix number is  
24 ABE-001.008.7699, and if we turn on to ... yes. That's  
25 the section I want to look at. "Policies and

1           Procedures". Now, you talk about this in your report as  
2           to what policies and procedures there may have been in  
3           place, and are you relying on this information in what  
4           you have said in the report?

5           A    That's correct.

6           Q    I think at paragraph 4.2.

7           A    That is correct.

8           Q    And essentially what you are saying, that the historic  
9           records do not contain evidence of formal policies and  
10          procedures regarding migration.

11          A    That is correct.

12          Q    And is that confirmed in what was represented in the  
13          Section 21 response?

14          A    Yes.

15          Q    As we read the last sentence in that paragraph can we  
16          see that it is suggested the expectation is that the  
17          organisation's policies and procedures were in  
18          accordance with good practice during this period?

19          A    Yes. I annotated the following sentence where it is  
20          also stated that the keeping of only limited records was  
21          consistent with practice of the period. My annotation  
22          was that I felt that was a little disingenuous, because  
23          other organisations did keep fairly voluminous records,  
24          but of course the Aberlour orphanage was a small  
25          institution.

1 Q Quarriers I think do say they kept voluminous records?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And Barnardo's?

4 A I'm less familiar with Barnardo's because I haven't been  
5 to the archive since my visit to Liverpool many decades  
6 ago, and I skim-read most of what was sent by the  
7 Inquiry because Professor Constantine and Professor  
8 Lynch were dealing more with that side of things.

9 Q But if we just -- since we have this on the screen where  
10 we -- it's also represented on behalf of Aberlour that  
11 a review of the organisation's ledger book for the  
12 period shows that no child under 14 was discharged to  
13 a destination outwith the UK except as part of a family  
14 group.

15 A That would be my understanding as well. Yes.

16 LADY SMITH: And I think you noted earlier that even after  
17 the introduction of the rule for Canada, that a child  
18 had to be at least 14 to be migrated if the child was  
19 travelling in a family that included at least one child  
20 of that age or more, they could be migrated?

21 A Yes.

22 LADY SMITH: Or in a group, I suppose they wouldn't  
23 necessarily have had to be with parents.

24 A Yes.

25 MR MACAULAY: And as far as selection is concerned, you say



1 at 4.4:

2 "It's not clear from the records what criteria was  
3 used for selection".

4 Do you mean by that how was a boy, or if, indeed,  
5 a girl, if a girl was to be picked, selected to be  
6 migrated?

7 A Yes. Again, it is not clear from the records. My guess  
8 is that it was as opportunities arose, possibly --  
9 I don't think Aberlour was pro-active in looking for  
10 emigration options, but, for example, when colonization  
11 agents visited, I suspect that the visit of a  
12 colonization agent was more at the behest of perhaps the  
13 Canadian government, the Federal Government's emigration  
14 agent based in Scotland looking for opportunities rather  
15 than Aberlour itself looking for the opportunities, but  
16 I have no evidence to support that. It is simply that  
17 there is a lack of evidence from the Aberlour response  
18 and anything I have seen at Aberlour that they actively  
19 promoted emigration. They responded, but they didn't  
20 actively promote.

21 Q And in relation to a child's willingness to be migrated,  
22 I think you touch upon this, I think, in 4.6, if a child  
23 did not want to be migrated, or if a parent didn't want  
24 a child to be migrated, what were you able to ascertain  
25 from the material you have seen?

1       A    From some of the case histories which were supplied to  
2            us it does seem that parental wishes and the wishes of  
3            the children were adhered to, and if there was  
4            opposition to migration it did not take place.  
5            Sometimes Aberlour expressed disappointment that a child  
6            had said, "No, I don't want to go", but they wouldn't  
7            not have forced them.

8       Q    I think how you put it was refusals were generally  
9            honoured.

10      A    Yes.

11      Q    You have a quote there at footnote 1434 which I think is  
12            taken from a child's file, and it is:

13                    "I regret to say that the boy I had in mind ...  
14                    after giving the proposition careful thought, has  
15                    decided that he would not like to go overseas at his  
16                    present age of 15".

17                    He felt the tug of family ties, so that's an example  
18                    of the boy essentially deciding not to go off his own  
19                    bat?

20      A    That's correct, and that's what I had in mind when I  
21            said I felt Aberlour was disappointed, sometimes, when  
22            the migration did not come into effect but they would  
23            not have forced it through.

24      Q    In relation to aftercare, you touch upon that in the  
25            next paragraph. What did you find there?

1 A That the references were very general. As I say in that  
2 paragraph 4.7 in [REDACTED] 1927, the six boys sent to Canada  
3 under the Canadian Pacific Scheme are carefully looked  
4 after on the other side, materially and spiritually, and  
5 have every chance of doing well, but that is all we are  
6 told. We don't know the nature of the care. We are  
7 just not told anything further.

8 LADY SMITH: Marjory, you see where, in 4.7, you tell me  
9 that the inspector of the British Immigration  
10 Colonization Organisation organised inspections every  
11 two months, and that's through which Aberlour sent boys,  
12 is there any indication of Aberlour analysing these  
13 Inspection Reports, seeing them, asking any questions  
14 about them?

15 A Not in the evidence I have seen, and as may come up  
16 later, the British Immigration and Colonisation  
17 Association was a questionable organisation, but there  
18 is no evidence that I have come across in Aberlour  
19 records that this was queried.

20 LADY SMITH: Is there even any evidence of Aberlour  
21 receiving reports, written reports?

22 A No. Not as far as I'm aware.

23 MR MACAULAY: I think you tell us that at the end of that  
24 paragraph and on the following page, that none of the  
25 case files we have seen contains formal reports of

1 inspections of placements or assessments of progress.

2 A That is correct.

3 Q Now, I think you also point us to some materials that  
4 indicate that some children were unhappy in their new  
5 lives. At 4.8, and this is in the Journal, you quote --  
6 I think that may be a letter? Is that a letter you  
7 quote from?

8 A Yes. That is correct. The quote that begins, "They  
9 left us with rather heavy hearts" --

10 Q Yes?

11 A -- I think that is not in the magazine itself, it is  
12 just the Journal reporting, rather than a letter. The  
13 letters come further down in the other quotes.

14 Q And so then if we look at 4.9 I think there you are  
15 referring to two letters of two migrants who wrote of  
16 hardships, loneliness and the desire to return to  
17 Scotland?

18 A That's correct. These are the materials that I accessed  
19 on my visit to Aberlour Childcare Trust decades ago, and  
20 which I was not able to recheck this past year, but  
21 I have no reason to think that they are inaccurate. I  
22 mean, it was mainly I wanted to check page numbers.

23 Q And this paragraph ends by:

24 "Tell the lads if they can live at home to do so, if  
25 not they should come here"?

1 A Yes.

2 Q And the next quote from a letter you have described as  
3 being unequivocally negative, can you just look at that  
4 and tell me why you come to that view?

5 A It's fairly explicit in the first sentence:

6 "If people patiently bore at home the hardships they  
7 have to bear here, and if they worked half as hard at  
8 home as they have to do now, they would be far better  
9 off than they are here".

10 One can almost sense the anguish, I think, coming  
11 through in that sentence. The rest of the letter is  
12 about -- well, more practical issues, clothing being  
13 expensive, being poor, plenty food but rough food,  
14 everybody trying to save money, "They don't seem to care  
15 how they do it", but there is a sense also of  
16 resignation, "However, here I am and I mean to make the  
17 best of it", but I think the bitterness comes through in  
18 the final sentence, "If I ever set my foot on the soil  
19 of the old country I shall say no more Canada for me",  
20 but of course the prospect of that person being able to  
21 come back to Scotland would likely have been fairly  
22 minimal.

23 Q And you give us an example in the following paragraph,  
24 in fact, of a boy who was sent to New Zealand, and  
25 I think what is called the Flock House Scheme?

1 A That's correct.

2 Q And the description, "Flock House", I think refers to  
3 the farm that children were sent to?

4 A That's correct.

5 Q And he would appear to have been the age of 14, one of a  
6 party of 28 boys who left for New Zealand in [REDACTED]  
7 1931. Is that right?

8 A Yes.

9 Q The rest of the party of 28, do you know where they were  
10 from?

11 A Could have been from anywhere in the UK.

12 Q And the letter that you had regard to here, I think it's  
13 a letter that was from this boy's sister to the [REDACTED]  
14 of Aberlour. Is that correct?

15 A That's correct. Yes.

16 Q And I will put the actual letter on the screen, in fact.  
17 It's at ABE-001.008.8305 and I think the Nuix number is  
18 ABE-4. There we have it. It begins by saying, "Dear  
19 BCK [REDACTED]", who I think was in charge?

20 A Yes. I think he was the [REDACTED] at the time.

21 Q And it is undated but it reads:

22 "You will be very surprised to hear from me as it is  
23 now almost five years since I left the orphanage".

24 Do we take it from that that the writer, the sister  
25 of the boy had herself been at Aberlour?

1 A Yes, and I think from the case file there were three  
2 siblings, well, according to my note, my entry, there  
3 were three siblings admitted in 1925.

4 Q And does this tell us, really, at a glance, that when  
5 the boy was sent to New Zealand, that he was separated  
6 at least from this sibling?

7 A That would be the implication. Yes. But he went  
8 under -- it seems he went under the specific Flock House  
9 Scheme.

10 Q And the essential query in the letter is to see whether  
11 or not BCK has any information about the  
12 whereabouts of the brother.

13 A That's correct.

14 Q And she says that she has written to him for the past  
15 year and has had no answer. Do you see that?

16 A I see that. Yes.

17 Q And then the next paragraph:

18 "My brother sent a letter to somebody here and I got  
19 a hold of it but that was about a year ago. In it, he  
20 said that the boys from Flock House were walking the  
21 streets and it would be his turn next".

22 So that's clearly caused the sister to have some  
23 concern.

24 A Yes. I mean, much of this, the interpretation of  
25 letters like this, is speculative, it is trying to fill

1 in gaps for which we have very little information, but  
2 that sentence would imply that she had considerable  
3 concern.

4 Q But do we know what the end of that story is?

5 A No. We assume, as I go on to say, that he had fallen  
6 foul of the economic depression that had hit  
7 New Zealand. We have no copy of a reply to the letter,  
8 reply to his sister's letter in the case file. We have  
9 no indication that Aberlour made enquiries about the  
10 boy's whereabouts. We simply do not know any more about  
11 that.

12 Q So that suggests that possibly a negative experience,  
13 but you also, at paragraph 4.11, highlight, albeit  
14 vicariously, a positive experience, and that is in  
15 connection with an individual who says he had not  
16 regretted -- who had told people that he hadn't  
17 regretted the fact that he had migrated.

18 A Indeed. As I say, it is a vicarious commendation of  
19 Aberlour, because the letter came in 2012 from  
20 a relative saying that the boy, as an adult, had not  
21 regretted anything that had happened in his childhood,  
22 enjoyed the -- his upbringing, and was -- those who -- I  
23 mean, my experience of -- from looking at other  
24 institutions as well, is those who got in touch with the  
25 institution were those who had had positive experiences.



1           If they were negative experiences they were unlikely to  
2           get in touch.

3           Q    You go on over a number of paragraphs, actually, to  
4           provide us an account about a particular boy who was  
5           sent to Kenya and -- from Aberlour.

6           A    That's correct.

7           Q    Were many sent to Kenya?

8           A    No. I think this was as a result of a particular  
9           approach by this settlor in Kenya, [REDACTED] who  
10          wanted to have apprentices on his estate. He had  
11          a philanthropic agenda, and had -- I don't know anything  
12          about [REDACTED] other than what came out in the boy's  
13          case files.

14          Q    And the case file you have mentioned, it is a fairly  
15          lengthy file of 154 pages.

16          A    Yes it is.

17          Q    But this is a boy who was admitted to Aberlour when he  
18          was aged six and he was migrated to an orphanage -- from  
19          the orphanage to Canada at the age of 15 in 1951?

20          A    Yes, to Kenya, yes.

21          Q    And what then happened? Because this ran into real  
22          difficulty, this arrangement?

23          A    Yes. He did not fulfil the expectations of the farmer,  
24          Mr [REDACTED]. It seems he stirred up difficulties on  
25          the farm and he ultimately returned to Scotland. We are

1 not quite clear under what auspices. I think in the  
2 comment from Lanarkshire children's department under  
3 paragraph 4.12, the final sentence of that comment from  
4 the manager of the children's department:

5 "I think you will agree that the proposal is a wise  
6 precaution in these days of doubt and mistrust as to the  
7 good intentions of benefactors or the like".

8 The subtext there I think may be a suspicion that  
9 problems might arise so there was a need for oversight.

10 Q Yes. Indeed, you go on to tell us that this boy's  
11 character was known before he was sent?

12 A Yes.

13 Q And he was described in letters as being truculent,  
14 dishonest, lazy and insubordinate, and that sort of  
15 material was not disclosed by Aberlour, I think is the  
16 point you are making?

17 A The point that I was trying to make, really, was my  
18 speculation is that Aberlour may have withheld  
19 information from Lanarkshire County Council and/or the  
20 Scottish Home Department about the potential problems  
21 surrounding this boy's migration, and, again,  
22 speculatively, if he had been a problem case at  
23 Aberlour, it was maybe a case of wanting to export  
24 a problem, but that's my speculation. I have no  
25 evidence to back that up, other than reading between the

1 lines on the case file.

2 Q If we look at paragraph 4.16 you there quote from the  
3 letter by the Lanarkshire Council's children officer to  
4 the Warden in March 1952, and you say that implied that  
5 Aberlour had withheld relevant information from that  
6 department as well?

7 A It is an implication rather than an outright accusation  
8 against Aberlour.

9 Q So in relation to aftercare generally, what are we able  
10 to ascertain either from the records you saw when you  
11 went to Aberlour or from any other information that you  
12 have looked at?

13 A Nothing. Nothing substantive I think.

14 Q And is that down to the fact that, clearly, there are no  
15 records to indicate how children who left Aberlour were  
16 cared for?

17 A The records in the case -- the case files include  
18 material generally up to the migration, a lot of  
19 administrative material, letters going backwards and  
20 forwards, but nothing that indicates what happened once  
21 the child had left the institution, other than these  
22 general comments about they are doing well and every  
23 care is taken of them, which appeared in the  
24 publications, but we don't know any details.

25 Q But we have looked at the letter from the sister, that

1           sort of correspondence that raises questions about how  
2           a child is making progress?

3       A    Yes.  So a lot of what I have come up with in my entry  
4           on Aberlour is my interpretation from relatively meagre  
5           evidence.

6       LADY SMITH:  Marjory, something I heard during our case  
7           study on Aberlour that wasn't to do with child migration  
8           but about children leaving the home was that typically  
9           a child would have very short notice of the fact that  
10          they were being sent away and their time at Aberlour had  
11          finished.  There was one stark case in which it was  
12          hardly more than a day or so the child was told.  Did  
13          you pick up anything from the records about how much  
14          notice of the date of migration children were getting at  
15          Aberlour?

16       A    No.  Not on -- in connection with migration, because  
17           they generally, with migration, had to wait until there  
18           would be a particular sailing, or a particular  
19           organisation had a party going, so I think that would  
20           have been the reason why there might have been more of a  
21           delay.  With children who were being put out generally  
22           to domestic service or farm service at the area around  
23           Aberlour it could just be done at a day's notice.  
24           I don't think it was the policy of Aberlour to have  
25           a breathing space before the child was migrated.

1 I think it was to do with practical issues.

2 LADY SMITH: Right, and nothing that indicated precisely  
3 when the child would be told that, "You are being  
4 migrated on Monday 13 November", or whatever?

5 A No. Nothing in the records to indicate that.

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

7 MR MACAULAY: Can we then move on to the -- and we are  
8 moving on alphabetically, as you indicated, to a scheme  
9 known as the Barwell Boys Scheme? You tell us that  
10 information on this scheme is limited. Can you just  
11 give us some information as to what you understand the  
12 scheme to have been about?

13 A I think most of my information about the Barwell Boys  
14 Scheme probably came from Australian archival websites  
15 and secondary sources. I have done no original research  
16 into Barwell. It was -- as I say, I haven't looked at  
17 any primary sources but it was instituted after the  
18 First World War in 1922 by the Premier of South  
19 Australia whose name was Barwell, and his aim was to  
20 bring 6,000 juveniles, teenagers, to fill the places of  
21 men who had been killed in the war, so it wasn't  
22 particularly targeted at those who had been deprived of  
23 a normal home life or who were juveniles in need --

24 Q Sorry, so do you say it may not have been directed,  
25 then, towards children who were in care?

1       A   No. Not particularly. No. I think not. Despite the  
2       title, "Boys' Scheme", women were eligible, young women  
3       aged 18-21, whereas for the males it was from age 15 to  
4       18, and the child did have to -- sorry -- the juvenile  
5       did have to make a written declaration of his or her  
6       wish to come under the control of Barwell. Paragraph  
7       5.2, when the boys arrived, they were accommodated in  
8       a former Destitute Asylum which must have been an  
9       unpleasant -- or potentially an unpleasant experience  
10      for those who had come from sheltered backgrounds,  
11      I would imagine, and again I'm speculating, but it does  
12      say they were assigned to farmers within 48 hours of  
13      arrival. We don't know much about selection, but there  
14      were complaints about the selection process, and the  
15      initial scheme was modified after 1925 with reduced  
16      numbers, changed conditions of apprenticeship, and  
17      I think better arrangements for the payment of wages.

18      Q   Do I understand from what you are saying, that there was  
19      this initial scheme from 1922-1925, then there was some  
20      modification, and then I think it was up and running  
21      again to some extent from 1927 onwards?

22      A   Yes. Again, I'm working here only from secondary  
23      sources, so I have no primary evidence to corroborate  
24      what I'm saying because it is based on the South  
25      Australian material.

1 Q But you do say that you think there were 1,557 British  
2 juveniles had gone to Australia under this scheme?

3 A Yes, but again, difficult to know the number of Scots,  
4 and again, that figure would have come from my  
5 investigations in the South Australian archival --

6 Q But do I take it from what you have said that these  
7 juvenile migrants were being sent from families?

8 A Yes. I believe so.

9 Q We then come to the Big Brother Movement that we've  
10 already touched upon in passing, and you tell us in the  
11 paragraph 6.1 that this was -- this scheme was founded  
12 in London in July 1925 by a Melbourne businessman and  
13 politician, Richard Linton, and what the purpose was.  
14 What was the purpose of the scheme?

15 A To -- it was an imperialist scheme to bring white  
16 juvenile immigrants to Australia, and the backdrop to  
17 that in the 1920s was the increasing fear in Australian  
18 political and public circles that the Commonwealth of  
19 Australia might be overrun by Asian influences. There  
20 was a particular fear of the Chinese and various  
21 legislation that disadvantaged the Chinese, so it was  
22 part of the White Australia Policy that went on until  
23 the early 1970s, the idea that bringing in juveniles, to  
24 use a quote from a different institution and an earlier  
25 period, this is a Barnardo's quote, "that the juveniles

1           and children were the bricks with which the Empire would  
2           be built". I think it was a continuation of that sort of  
3           philosophy, so that was the idea behind it.

4           Q    If I could put this document on the screen, it is  
5           LEG-001.006.3991 and that also may be LEG-184. Let's  
6           just stay where we are at 4027. This is, I think, an  
7           NRS file that's dealing with this particular scheme, but  
8           can we see that it certainly had Royal backing with the  
9           Duke of Gloucester being the patron, and the movement  
10          explained, the Big Brother Movement, a voluntary  
11          organisation, was formed in 1925 for the purpose of  
12          fostering migration of youths to Australia and big  
13          brothering them in the true sense and meaning of the  
14          words until the age of at least 21. Do you see that?

15          A    That's correct. Yes.

16          Q    And it is nonsectarian, I think we are told, and if we  
17          move on to the next page, page 4028, and if we move down  
18          to the heading, "The Big Brothers", we are told that the  
19          Big Brothers are men who fully realise their imperial  
20          duties and they undertake the work entailed because they  
21          realise that they could serve the Empire in no better  
22          manner, I think that touches upon what you said, that it  
23          was very much driven by imperialistic thinking?

24          A    -- that is correct. Yes, and again, referring to  
25          something I mentioned earlier about the whole ethos and



1           attitude towards emigration within British society at  
2           large. I mean, in this period we see public schools  
3           particularly, but schools generally, state schools too,  
4           enthusing about Empire opportunities -- the curriculum  
5           included a lot of textbooks about geography, history,  
6           literature textbooks that celebrated Empire, so it was  
7           part of a wider backdrop.

8           Q   And if we move on to the next page, 4289, we will get  
9           some information about the Little Brothers, and we read  
10          there that the opportunity to become little brothers is  
11          open to lads between the ages of 16 and 17 years,  
12          provided that they are able to bring a letter from their  
13          headmaster showing that they have reached a standard of  
14          education equal at least to boys of their own age and  
15          giving a report on their character at school, so that's  
16          the selection process, if you like.

17          A   Yes, and I think that indicates it wasn't a scheme that  
18          was targeted on juveniles in need.

19          Q   Yes, and are you able to say that -- would any child who  
20          had been passed between care in Scotland would have been  
21          caught up in this scheme?

22          A   In theory, yes, that would have been possible. I think  
23          it's less likely. My impression of the Big Brother  
24          scheme is that it is -- I was going to say, "elitist".  
25          Perhaps that's not quite the right term because I'm

1           aware of boys who went out from more humble backgrounds,  
2           but I think there would have been boys who went with the  
3           approbation of parents and schools rather than from  
4           institutional care.

5       LADY SMITH: I think we may seem some indication of that in  
6           the next paragraph Marjory:

7                     "The lads are accepted from any class of society  
8           but they must conform to a type. The type is that of  
9           a..."

10                                 (Pause for technical issue)

11       LADY SMITH: Thank you. We are all right now Mr MacAulay.  
12           Carry on.

13       MR MACAULAY: Yes. I wanted to look at numbers at paragraph  
14           6.5 and within a fairly short period of time I think we  
15           see that 1515 were recruited in the period 1926-1929,  
16           and overall, then, how many juvenile migrants were  
17           caught up in this scheme?

18       A   As I go on to say, the depression of the '30s caused  
19           numbers to drop off, but in the interwar period it seems  
20           that there were about 2000, and then after the war it  
21           revived again, approximately 5000 youths between 1947  
22           and 1971, and a small number to Tasmania, 1950-'64.  
23           Again, I think there is no -- there was no rigorous  
24           recordkeeping of numbers, so to some extent the numbers  
25           are speculative.

1 Q But it seems to have been fairly successful in enticing  
2 juvenile migrants to go to Australia?

3 A Yes. I think it was a movement that achieved an  
4 element -- a fairly strong element of credibility, and  
5 that would be confirmed to some extent by a recent  
6 communication I have had with a former Little Brother  
7 who was part of that Australian National Library Project  
8 that you mentioned at the beginning, somebody who did  
9 succeed very well and spoke approvingly of the scheme  
10 but said at the same time, well, it very much depended  
11 on the household to which you were sent.

12 Q Do you say in the report that it was well-advertised in  
13 this country?

14 A Yes.

15 Q And, for example, you give an example of the Stornaway  
16 Gazette even carrying an advert for this project.

17 A Yes. It was well known, even in small provincial  
18 newspapers.

19 Q At paragraph 6.7 you make mention of an undated memo, it  
20 was thought maybe from 1950s, from Australia House where  
21 the memo, after the quote says:

22 "The movement had excellent publicity in Scotland  
23 with the result of 50 percent of the recent applications  
24 have come from there".

25 Then you go on to say;

1           "The memo continued, no approach for recruitment  
2           is made to local authorities but occasionally there  
3           are applications from orphanages"?

4       A    Yes.  That is the only evidence I have, refers to  
5           orphanages is in that memo.  I don't recall seeing in  
6           the institutional records that I have looked at  
7           a reference to the Big Brother Movement in respect of  
8           any of those institutions, but again, that would imply,  
9           I think, that the -- in that case the -- it was the  
10          orphanages that were being pro-active rather than the  
11          Big Brother Movement seeking to recruit from orphanages.

12       Q    Yes, but you also refer in 6.8 to documents that have  
13           been submitted to this Inquiry by local authorities that  
14           do contain some references to juveniles who were  
15           migrated through the scheme.  That's in 6.8.

16       A    Yes.

17       Q    So, for example, you give an example of a 17 year old  
18           boy in the care of Edinburgh City Council who had the  
19           chance to go to Australia under this scheme.  Is that  
20           correct?

21       A    That's correct.  Again, I don't know anything about the  
22           background of the boy or the application, but my  
23           speculation would be that the initiative possibly came  
24           from the boy who had heard about it on the grapevine or  
25           from relatives who had seen it advertised in the press.

1           Again, I have no evidence, but my sense is that the Big  
2           Brother Movement didn't proactively go into institutions  
3           or Local Government organisations and ask for recruits.

4           Q   You give another example about -- I think it is  
5           Kirkcaldy where a children's committee agreed that  
6           a boarded out boy, and who had expressed a wish to  
7           emigrate, would leave under the scheme?

8           A   Yes, and in both those cases the boy -- well, certainly  
9           in the second case the boy expressed a wish to emigrate,  
10          in the first case the boy had the chance to go to  
11          Australia. The wording suggests to me that the  
12          initiative was coming from the individuals.

13          Q   And is that the same point you make in 6.9, that the  
14          Secretary of State consented to the emigration to  
15          Australia under the auspices of a scheme of a 16 year  
16          old orphan who was in the care of Perth and Kinross  
17          Council?

18          A   Yes, because according to the record the boy has, for  
19          some time, expressed a desire to go to Australia.

20          Q   So we would see these examples of children who were in  
21          care who nevertheless were caught up in the Scheme?

22          A   Yes. I feel that they would have been a minority.

23          Q   You mention in the final paragraph in this section of  
24          evidence that was laid before a previous Inquiry by  
25          a person who had been -- at a children's home in

1           Aberdeen before going to Dhurringile in Australia, is  
2           that right?

3           A    That's correct.

4           Q    But he went there under the auspices of the Big Brother  
5           Scheme.

6           A    Yes.  So it -- this is from evidence laid before the  
7           House of Commons Select Committee on Health in 1998, his  
8           statement.  Yes.  As I say it is inconsistent with the  
9           normal practice of the Big Brother Movement which was to  
10          migrate juveniles and not children, so there is an  
11          anomaly there.

12          Q    Yes, because he was only 12, over 12 when he went.

13          A    Yes.

14          Q    And as far as Scottish numbers are concerned, then, do  
15          you have any sense as to how many Scottish children  
16          might have gone under the Scheme?

17          A    Can I refer back to the beginning of the report?

18          Q    Is that 6.5?  Paragraph 6.5?

19          A    That's a general number is it, I think?  From the UK?  
20          I was looking at the numbers at the beginning of my --

21          Q    You are looking at the table?

22          A    The table.  Yes.  I think we came to the assessment of  
23          700 on the basis that, again -- this is going back to  
24          6.5 on the Big Brother entry -- accepting 2000 as the  
25          interwar total, adding 5000 post-war which have

1 a possibly minimum total of 7000, so I think we just  
2 went on the basis -- took a percentage of that.

3 Q At least we have some instances of children in local  
4 authority care, clear instances who went under the  
5 Scheme?

6 A That's correct.

7 Q And were there difficulties encountered by some of those  
8 who were migrated under the Scheme?

9 A Yes. I think there were. As I mentioned a few minutes  
10 ago I think it very much depended on the individual  
11 arrangements. It would have been relatively easy for  
12 a Big Brother to renege on his responsibilities once the  
13 juvenile had arrived. Equally, it would be easy for the  
14 Little Brother to not keep in touch with the Big Brother  
15 as the Scheme expected, and I'm not sure that the  
16 arrangements were sufficiently rigorous to ensure that  
17 those links were maintained.

18 Q In paragraph 6.10 you look at minutes of an AGM of the  
19 Big Brother Movement in Tasmania in 1961 where there are  
20 narrated difficulties associated with isolation,  
21 inadequate preparation and poor supervision and various  
22 proposals were being looked at to resolve these  
23 difficulties.

24 A Yes. My annotation there is that the BBM, Big Brother  
25 Movement, seemed to have learned from its mistakes and

1 to be aware of potential problems by that stage, but of  
2 course the implication is what -- these problems could  
3 still have arisen in the earlier period when boys were  
4 being migrated.

5 Q One of the proposals here was to group the Little  
6 Brothers more closely together. Is that what was  
7 proposed?

8 A Yes, in order to overcome the problems of isolation and  
9 loneliness, and of course those problems of isolation  
10 and loneliness were issues that recurred in the  
11 reminiscences and correspondence of migrated children  
12 across the decades and across the locations.

13 Q Can we then move on to the next organisation you look  
14 at, and that's at section 7 of the report, and that's  
15 the Boy Scouts Association. Indeed. You tell us that  
16 there were several juvenile migration schemes promoted  
17 by the Boy Scouts. Can you just give us some  
18 background to that?

19 A Scouting was an international movement, and, therefore,  
20 was tailor-made, if you like, for migration because it  
21 had established itself in a number of countries, not  
22 least of the -- well, in the Dominions, and it had this  
23 international network, so that if -- as I think we  
24 looked at in the case of Aberlour, the boys who went  
25 under the Canadian Pacific Scheme were also linked up



1 with the Boy Scouts. Again, I haven't done any primary  
2 research into the Boy Scout movement. What I'm relying  
3 on here is secondary evidence -- Tammy Proctor's book,  
4 "On my Honour: Guides and Scouts and Interwar Britain",  
5 so I don't really have a great deal of knowledge about  
6 that other than to be aware of the significance of  
7 networking.

8 Q But the Boy Scout association, you tell us, did  
9 establish a migration department.

10 A Yes it did.

11 Q And I think you thought that more than 5000 Scouts  
12 emigrated between 1923 and 1939, mostly to Australia.

13 A Yes, and that would have come from a secondary source,  
14 one of the secondary sources. The footnotes will  
15 indicate which.

16 Q But an organisation like the Boy Scouts, were they  
17 essentially a facilitator? By that I mean they would be  
18 sending these boys to particular establishments that  
19 they did not run, or was it different to that?

20 A I believe it is the former, what you have just  
21 indicated, that they were facilitating migration.

22 Q So how would they select the targeted -- would it be  
23 farms or what was the situation?

24 A In terms of selecting boys at this end?

25 Q No, in terms of selecting where the boys would go?

1 A Oh. I don't know. I'm sorry.

2 Q But I think you tell us that 16 boys from Aberlour were  
3 included in three parties of Boy Scouts that were sent  
4 to Canada under the Canada Pacific Scheme, so that  
5 particular Scheme was used in Canada to accommodate the  
6 boys that were being sent.

7 A Yes, but the problem there is we don't know anything  
8 about the Canadian Pacific Scheme. I mean, I suspect it  
9 was a land Scheme, as most of these schemes were,  
10 because the emphasis was very much on land settlement  
11 and getting boys to settle on farms, and from its outset  
12 the Canadian Pacific Railway had been very keen on  
13 populating the line of its tracks. It owned vast  
14 swathes of land, so -- but in the absence of evidence,  
15 I cannot be definitive about that.

16 Q I mean, in the main, in relation to both Canada and  
17 Australia when juvenile migrants, whether they were  
18 boys -- if they were boys -- essentially were sent to do  
19 farmwork?

20 A Yes.

21 Q Girls to do domestic work?

22 A That's correct.

23 Q And that in itself, if you look at the overall picture,  
24 did that cause problems, because some boys did not want  
25 to do farm work?

1 A Exactly, and I think in the previous -- I think it was  
2 the previous study of the -- yes, of the Big Brother  
3 Movement, it said that one of the problems was lads  
4 coming from large cities in the UK going to Tasmania and  
5 finding not -- I think not only the isolation difficult  
6 but also the rural nature of much of the environment, so  
7 yes, there were difficulties caused by a mismatch of  
8 supply and demand.

9 Q And do we see that this is a general picture, not  
10 just -- looking at one particular organisation,  
11 generally some boys who went and were designated to go  
12 to do farm work were attracted by the big cities?

13 A That would have been correct, yes. I mean, the  
14 expectation was certainly, as you said, that boys would  
15 go to farm work, girls would go to domestic service, and  
16 I think in most instances over many decades and many  
17 institutions there was no encouragement to the  
18 individuals to raise their eyes beyond those options.  
19 Some of them did manage to do it, and enter into  
20 professions, but I think they were the exceptions and  
21 they were the exceptions who were celebrated. I mean,  
22 I think there is a comment somewhere later, I think it  
23 might be in relation to Quarriers about, "None of us  
24 became Prime Minister of Canada as we had been told we  
25 might", but if those who did succeed in life beyond the

1           farm and the household were celebrated in the Journal  
2           but generally I think the advice to the children and  
3           juveniles was that this was a good outcome to be in farm  
4           service or domestic service.

5           I mean, always with the carrot for the farm workers  
6           that they might own their own farm in due course, which  
7           was a wider promise that was made to emigrants  
8           throughout the 19th and early 20th centuries, not just  
9           to juveniles.

10          Q    That would be a carrot, but the reality is that many of  
11            them would be working as farm labourers, not as farm  
12            owners.

13          A    Indeed, yes. Yes.

14          Q    And would it be against that background, then, that the  
15            cities would become attractive where different forms of  
16            work would be available?

17          A    That is correct, and that was a source of disquiet in  
18            the host countries because of the influx of --  
19            particularly in Canada, I think -- of, in the depression  
20            years, of these individuals to the cities and towns  
21            where there was a fear that they would become public  
22            charges.

23          Q    But we always have to bear in mind that when these  
24            juvenile migrants were being sent from this country the  
25            thinking at that time was that they were going there in

1 the main for a life working for somebody else at a farm.

2 A That's correct.

3 Q Did some of the organisations, Barnardo's, for example,  
4 do their policies change? Do they get more enlightened  
5 as to how they would direct the juvenile migrants?

6 Maybe we will come to that later on?

7 A I'm not sure.

8 Q We've moved away from the Boy Scouts, and I think you  
9 thought that, perhaps, post-war some 400 children from  
10 Scotland left under this movement.

11 A I guess that was our speculation there. I think, as I  
12 said at the end of that entry on 7.5, at 7.4, rather,  
13 again, it relates to England, to Baden-Powell going to  
14 Eynsham Hall, but he said the difficulty is to get boys  
15 to come with the intent of migrating for training. That  
16 is due to the objection of parents to their boys going  
17 off into the unknown, even though, through general  
18 unemployment they are not wage earners. My annotation  
19 there was that that sentence to me suggests that they  
20 were shoehorned into something that they didn't  
21 necessarily want to do.

22 Q And that reminds us that this movement really covered  
23 boys from different sources, some possibly in care like  
24 in Aberlour, but many who were not.

25 A Yes. Boys from all sorts of backgrounds. I mean, my

1           understanding is that a lot of the institutions would  
2           encourage membership of organisations like the Boy  
3           Scouts so that it would be a natural kind of part of the  
4           networking.

5           Q    And I think you tell us at the end of this particular  
6           section that there is no real clarity as to how boys  
7           were, in fact, selected, or screened, or whether,  
8           indeed, to what extent consent was obtained,  
9           particularly from those boys who may not have had  
10          parents?

11          A    That's correct. Yes. I think that's why I haven't been  
12          able to answer your questions about the Boy Scouts very  
13          crisply.

14          Q    Well, let's move on to the next section then, section 8,  
15          and here you identify an organisation known as the  
16          British Immigration and Colonization Association. Can  
17          you just tell me about this particular organisation?

18          A    Again, it was to encourage and sponsor emigration to  
19          Canada of youths, male youths from farming families. It  
20          was eligible for funding under the Empire Settlement  
21          Act. Those who were recruited by it were offered free  
22          passages, training and then work on farms in Canada.  
23          The hope was that they would -- well, the carrot was  
24          that they would hopefully eventually become farm owners,  
25          but as you have indicated, that was often a remote

1 possibility. In being given accreditation as a British  
2 juvenile immigration society, the British Immigration  
3 and Colonization Association was required to establish  
4 a hostel for boys and that hostel would act as  
5 a distribution home. Well, that was not a novelty  
6 because many of these institutions, as you know, did  
7 have distribution homes, Quarriers, Barnardo's, Annie  
8 MacPherson and so on and they opened a hostel in  
9 Montreal in 1924. Again, the indication, there are  
10 links with other institutions, organisations, they  
11 rented that building from the Canadian Pacific Railway,  
12 so, I mean, that's just a passing comment but, you know,  
13 it is bringing up, again, an organisation that we've  
14 heard of but don't know a lot about in another context,  
15 and they had a training farm elsewhere in the province  
16 of Quebec, and the boys were placed on farms in various  
17 locations in that part of eastern Canada, Ontario and  
18 Quebec.

19 Q Was this organisation essentially dealing with boys only  
20 or were there girls as well?

21 A My understanding is that it was boys. Yeah.

22 Q I just want to know what inspired its formation? Do you  
23 know why it came into being at all?

24 A I think the clue might be in the word, "colonization".  
25 I think it's part and parcel of issues that we have

1           already discussed about imperialism, but of course, by  
2           the 1920s it is a more defensive imperialism than  
3           a celebratory imperialism that you got back in the  
4           1880s. I think it's part of the -- this wider backdrop  
5           of trying to preserve the British Empire when it seemed  
6           to be potentially crumbling.

7           Q    But we've seen in other schemes there were particular  
8           individuals who were the driving force -- the Barwell  
9           Scheme, for example. Was there a particular individual  
10          or individuals who were the driving force behind the  
11          formation of this particular Scheme?

12          A    I'm not sure. I mean, the one name that comes up, and  
13          will come up, I think, later in your questioning, will  
14          be Dr George Carter Cossar. He was the Scottish agent  
15          of the British Immigration and Colonization Association,  
16          so I think it's worth flagging up his involvement.  
17          Other names occur, but not any one that stands out,  
18          whose head is higher above the parapet, I think, than  
19          others. I'm just trying to refresh my memory on this.

20          Q    We will look at Mr Cossar in a moment, but this Scheme  
21          seems to have been fairly successful, at least looking  
22          to the numbers, from a numbers perspective. You tell us  
23          in 8.2 that BICA migrated approximately 5500 boys to  
24          Canada, mostly between 1924 and 1931. Very few after  
25          that?



1 A That's correct.

2 Q They have made quite a significant contribution?

3 A Numerically, yes.

4 Q Numerically.

5 A Yes.

6 Q We will come back to other aspects of it in a moment,  
7 but you have suggested that possibly, again, 10 percent,  
8 550, might have been boys from Scotland?

9 A We have no other evidence on which to base that  
10 assumption than just percentage of the population.

11 Q And I suppose we've already mentioned, the connection  
12 with George Cossar who was essentially dealing with  
13 Scottish boys would perhaps provide some evidence to  
14 support the notion that a significant number of Scottish  
15 boys would have been caught up in the Scheme?

16 A Yes. I think that would be my basis for --

17 Q And in his role as agent, by that I mean Dr Cossar's  
18 role as agent, what did that imply?

19 A It seems that he arranged the migration of boys who  
20 could finance their own way, boys from well-off  
21 families, and, I mean, his main focus in his own work  
22 was on New Brunswick, but under the BICA Scheme he could  
23 extend his influence by arranging placements in other  
24 Canadian provinces, and he went to Canada, he  
25 accompanied a party in 1924 and he went to the hostel in

1 Montreal, and there were trainees from his Craigiellin,  
2 Paisley farm already at that hostel, and according to  
3 the record, from the Library and Archives Canada, 12  
4 self-funded boys joined those Craigiellin recruits at  
5 the hostel with a view to being placed out on farms, and  
6 his farm in Lower Gaagetown, in New Brunswick was being  
7 used by BICA as a reception centre, and that was  
8 something that actually expanded into a bigger reception  
9 centre later in the 1920s.

10 Q So there was a clear -- there was a very close  
11 connection between Dr Cossar and this particular  
12 organisation?

13 A Yes. I think so.

14 Q At 8.4 you are able to identify from Canadian  
15 Immigration Department files that a list of 47 boys  
16 migrated from the Aberdeen Lads' Club --

17 A Correct.

18 Q -- in 1928 and 1929. Again, that was by BICA?

19 A That is correct.

20 Q Do you know how that came about? Do you have any  
21 evidence?

22 A I don't think I have direct evidence, but, again,  
23 I think it's part of the wider networking amongst these  
24 individuals, I think possibly Dr Cossar or other  
25 officials of BICA knew the director of the Lads' Club,

1 private conversations, recommendations, but I can't say.  
2 The evidence on which that point, 8.4 is based, is  
3 a list supplied by Library and Archives Canada which  
4 listed a number of boys and the schemes under which they  
5 migrated.

6 Q I don't know with your Aberdeen connections whether you  
7 can tell us anything at all about the Aberdeen Lads'  
8 Club?

9 A Not much more than that it was, as many lads clubs were  
10 and are, I think, possibly, I don't know if they still  
11 are, but were organisations to provide recreational and  
12 educational facilities for poor boys. I suppose  
13 a development of the kind of thing that the Aberdeen  
14 industrial school had begun in the 1830s to keep  
15 children off the streets and keep them away from -- head  
16 off the potential of delinquency, so just a -- yes, a --

17 Q The focus being on recreation rather than in-house care,  
18 so to speak?

19 A Oh yes. Yes. It would be something they would go to  
20 after school.

21 Q Yes. Now, looking, then, to the BICA aftercare  
22 arrangements, you do tell us about that, and that they  
23 had undertaken to give aftercare to all boys for three  
24 years from the date of their arrival in Canada, but  
25 there is evidence of concern over these arrangements.

1 Can you just elaborate on that for me?

2 A This is based on a memorandum in December 1925 by George  
3 Bogue Smart who was the long-term supervisor of juvenile  
4 immigration in Canada, and his correspondence over the  
5 previous six months with two directors of the BICA, and  
6 he was concerned that the prolonged residence at the  
7 Montreal hostel was a nefarious influence, it was  
8 undesirable, both for those who were there for a long  
9 time and new boys who arrived, and as well as drawing  
10 attention to the number of boys at the hostel, he was  
11 concerned about the number who had simply disappeared,  
12 and he said there should be more attention given to the  
13 selection of candidates for migration and he talked  
14 about boys who refused to work on farms and to chronic  
15 bedwetting which, as we know, is an example of stress.

16 Now, this was -- I mean, George Bogue Smart would  
17 have been supportive of juvenile migration, but had  
18 a remit to make sure that it was conducted properly, so  
19 he was being fairly critical of the way in which BICA  
20 was organising its affairs.

21 Q The absolute refusal to work on farms, which I think  
22 harks back to what we discussed a little while ago, are  
23 we looking here at boys who had had no farm training in  
24 advance?

25 A That would have been the case, yes.

1 Q There were also some issues about placement  
2 arrangements?

3 A On whether they would have had farm training in advance,  
4 if they had just gone out under the auspices of BICA, I  
5 do not know of any arrangements for training, but if  
6 they had been under the umbrella of some place like the  
7 Cossar Farms in Paisley there might have been a modicum  
8 of training, but we don't have the evidence.

9 Q Does it perhaps suggest that the refusal to work on  
10 farms might have been driven by the fact that these were  
11 boys who were from the urban areas rather than rural  
12 areas?

13 A Yes. I would think so.

14 Q Then if we look at the placement arrangements, again,  
15 I think Bogue Smart has something to say about that.  
16 What were his views on that?

17 A Perhaps they were understated. He talked about  
18 occasional misplacements, employment agreements not  
19 being completed within a reasonable time of the boys  
20 being placed and delays in answering correspondence, and  
21 again, I think that all has echoes of other institutions  
22 going back over an earlier period when arrangements  
23 about indenture were not always set in place at an  
24 appropriate period, and then interestingly he notes  
25 about disagreement within the organisation, so it sounds

1           like there was fighting in-house, that's added to delay  
2           in dealing with follow-up correspondence resulting from  
3           our inspectional work.

4           Now, the issue here, I think, was that Canada, Bogue  
5           Smart and the Canadian authorities could only recommend,  
6           they could not require modifications and improvements,  
7           so he said, you know, his recommendation was that BICA  
8           should not be permitted to bring any more boys to Canada  
9           until there is evidence that the boys under their  
10          supervision at present are receiving satisfactory care  
11          and he further recommended the distributing hostel be  
12          moved to a rural environment and Cossar should take  
13          personal responsibility for placing and supervising boys  
14          he had sent to Canada. I think the key word there is,  
15          "Recommendation".

16         Q    And it would appear also to be the case that BICA seemed  
17               to blame Cossar, or Cossar boys for the trouble that  
18               boys were getting into, effectively?

19         A    Yes. I think that would be correct.

20         Q    But these would have been boys, nevertheless, that would  
21               have been sent to Canada under the BICA Scheme?

22         A    Yes.

23         Q    Albeit Cossar may have been involved in the process.

24         A    I think that is correct. I mean, Cossar -- the Canadian  
25               immigration authorities commented on Cossar, and I can't

1 give you the exact quote because I don't have it in  
2 front of me but it was something along the lines, this  
3 is from the 1920s, of him being well meaning and  
4 enterprising, but he does not know how to go about it.

5 Q I think you actually mention that in the section dealing  
6 with Cossar.

7 A Right. Okay.

8 Q Now, in 8.7 you again raise concerns by the Canadian  
9 Immigration Department about the BICA selection  
10 practices and outcomes including for Scottish juvenile  
11 migrants, and, in particular, that had caused  
12 undesirable publicity. Now, you go on to give the  
13 example of a Scottish 16 year old who had been placed  
14 with a bachelor farmer and you describe the conditions.  
15 He wasn't abused but he was placed amidst dilapidation  
16 and filth that was almost indescribable, and he became  
17 ill. Is that --

18 A That's correct. This is information from Library and  
19 Archives Canada files of the time, so it is primarily  
20 source material.

21 Q And he died, actually.

22 A Yes.

23 Q The quote goes on to say:

24 "His death was not due to the filth of the home, but  
25 any respectable official of a society that would place

1 a boy in the surroundings in which this Scottish boy was  
2 placed deserves to be advertised rather than advertising  
3 the department"?

4 A Yes.

5 Q In other words, the public deserve to know about this  
6 treatment?

7 A Yes. The official deserved to be called out.

8 Q The other example you give is another Scottish BICA  
9 recruit who committed suicide. Do we have any  
10 information as to from where this boy was recruited  
11 from?

12 A No. I'm afraid not.

13 Q But he was in Canada for about two months and I think he  
14 █████ himself at the farm where he had been working. Is  
15 that right?

16 A That's correct. He had been employed for three weeks at  
17 that farm.

18 Q And at 8.9 you again focus upon concerns about BICA's  
19 selection of placements. The quote that you have there  
20 at footnote 1514, where is that taken from?

21 A The Canadian Department of Immigration and Colonization.  
22 It is an unidentified author but it is a memo generated  
23 by that department.

24 Q And what do we take from this?

25 A That sufficient safeguards had not been developed in



1 terms of selecting homes, so the reports coming into the  
2 department indicate weaknesses along this line. Some  
3 homes that are totally unsuited for British boys, and  
4 I think, again, it is the question of whether the  
5 individual was suited to be an emigrant, and whether  
6 emigration was a suitable outlet. It is part of the  
7 wider question, because all the measures -- well, the  
8 memo goes on to say, "There are several things more  
9 important than wages, so the boy could be given the  
10 required wage but matters of food, cleanliness, moral  
11 character are more important. I mention this so that  
12 due care may be taken to avoid placing boys in  
13 unsatisfactory homes. We must never forget that neither  
14 government or any emigration society is responsible for  
15 keeping a farmer in help if that farmer does not offer  
16 suitable living and working conditions", so the two  
17 things I took out of that were that there had been clear  
18 problems which gave rise to the memorandum, but also the  
19 implication was that the BICA Scheme seemed to be  
20 tailored for farmers who wanted cheap labour rather than  
21 tailored to the advantages and opportunities it was  
22 going to give the recruits. It is back to the 19th  
23 century ethos of providing cheap labour for Canadian  
24 farms.

25 Q And in the following paragraph you say that the BICA was

1           claimed had, "A peculiar system or lack of system for  
2           keeping their books and records", and again, I think it  
3           is another memo, I think, that you are quoting from  
4           there, and it goes on to say that the affairs of the  
5           BICA were in a very unhealthy condition, and the office  
6           being poorly managed. Is this to do with the keeping of  
7           records and the finances of the organisation?

8           A    I think it -- yes. Finances and general management, but  
9           I think the implication of the memo is particularly  
10          about financial dealings.

11         LADY SMITH: This sounds as though they have got to the  
12          stage that they are going to have to wind up, doesn't  
13          it.

14         A    It does.

15         LADY SMITH: 1930 is their -- the talk here is trying to  
16          ensure not taking on liability for past debts, but only  
17          looking to the future.

18         A    And by then the crash had happened, the depression was  
19          beginning to bite, so there were all sorts of external  
20          issues putting pressure on them.

21         MR MACAULAY: And if we move on in your report at paragraphs  
22          8.11 and 8.12 can we see that there are now concerns  
23          being expressed in Scotland about the way in which the  
24          BICA is operating?

25         A    That's correct. Yes. Particularly from the Aberdeen

1 Lads' Club.

2 Q As far as the Aberdeen Lads' Club is concerned, were  
3 there particular concerns about the aftercare that was  
4 being provided by this organisation?

5 A Yes. I think that comes out in 8.12, the meeting  
6 between the president of the Lads' Club, the secretary  
7 and Ann MacDonald, the Canadian government agent based  
8 in Inverness. There were generally either two or three  
9 Federal Government agents representing Canada in  
10 Scotland, and Ann MacDonald, unusually -- it was very  
11 unusual to have a female federal immigration officer, so  
12 she was based in Inverness but with responsibility for  
13 the Aberdeen area, and it says that a report of the  
14 meeting was transmitted to the immigration department in  
15 Canada. Munro had requested it to discuss procedure to  
16 be adopted in the spring of 1830 dealing with  
17 applications received from members of the Lads' Club who  
18 wished to go to Canada. In previous years the club had  
19 put forward the majority of their boys under BICA's  
20 Scheme, but when Munro and Ogden had gone to Canada in  
21 spring 1929 to investigate conditions they were both  
22 dissatisfied, not only with the hostel at Montreal  
23 but -- it goes on to say more than dissatisfied with  
24 placement and aftercare.

25 Q I think we noted earlier that the Aberdeen Lads' Club in

1           1928 and '29 had migrated 47 boys to Canada, but had  
2           there been other groups of migrated boys through the  
3           auspices of that particular club?

4           A    The evidence I have is for the 47 boys. That came from  
5           the Canadian list, but it is possible. I haven't  
6           managed to trace anything. The boys -- the problem  
7           seems to have been that the boys disappeared into the  
8           woodwork with no records being kept.

9           Q    Now, as far as Ann MacDonald was concerned, did she then  
10          get involved in carrying out some investigation into the  
11          BICA operations?

12          A    Yes. In 1928 in a response to enquiries from parents,  
13          she had asked her superiors in London for information  
14          about the manner in which boys going out under BICA were  
15          received and how they were treated, and she wanted  
16          a report on that hostel in Montreal, and she didn't  
17          really get much satisfaction. The reply from the London  
18          office said that the department was, "Perfectly  
19          satisfied with the manner in which the society in Canada  
20          deals with the boys", but that's London. That's the  
21          office in Trafalgar Square speaking about something that  
22          was happening in Montreal without anybody on the ground.

23          Q    Was that contradicted by the Aberdeen Lads' Club  
24          information?

25          A    Yes. The Lads' Club representatives said procedures

1           were not being carried out satisfactorily, and, well,  
2           the example is the cases of three boys whose  
3           circumstances after they arrived had been subject to an  
4           Inquiry by the department of immigration, because the  
5           boys hadn't gone to the farmers to whom they had been  
6           allocated, and went on to say that all the information  
7           procured by Anne MacDonald was -- that had clearly shown  
8           placement was mishandled, but nothing further had been  
9           heard since July 1929.

10          Q    And towards the bottom of that page, page 16, Anne  
11           MacDonald, is she giving this expression of regret on  
12           behalf of -- what? The Canadian authorities, "... could  
13           only regret very much that the present position has  
14           arisen with respect to the Lads' Club"?

15          A    Yes. I think she was apologising in an embarrassed way  
16           for what had gone wrong, embarrassed because she didn't  
17           have the authority to really do anything about it. It's  
18           not the only example of Anne MacDonald being frustrated  
19           with her superiors, particularly in Ottawa. An anecdote  
20           from earlier when she was trying to promote emigration  
21           from the north of Scotland, and she was on a tour around  
22           Caithness, she said that she had done quite well talking  
23           to farmers, but she couldn't persuade farmers' wives  
24           because she had no literature and the department would  
25           not supply her with literature because they were being

1            increasingly parsimonious and I think that might be  
2            a clue to the Department of Immigration's tardiness, or  
3            partial investigation of these claims. By this stage  
4            they were increasingly parsimonious about the financial  
5            support they gave to immigration.

6            Q    And if we look at your final paragraph in this section,  
7            8.17, you point out that a list of the Aberdeen Lads'  
8            Club migrants was held by the Canadian immigration  
9            department files, and includes the addresses of their  
10           placements in Canada, but there is also within it a memo  
11           from Anne MacDonald. Is that right?

12           A    Yes. That's correct.

13           Q    And what does she say in the memo?

14           A    She explained that she hadn't obtained the Canadian  
15           addresses of the boys from BICA, but from Frank Hogden  
16           who was the secretary of the Lads' Club in Aberdeen, and  
17           she said:

18                  "I think this is the reason why the officials of the  
19           Lads' Club in Aberdeen complained so strongly against  
20           the lack of aftercare".

21                  That BICA had been slack in its recordkeeping, and  
22           their concern was expressed by Canadian immigration  
23           officials about the number of BICA recruits who were  
24           living in cities and not on farms, and whether there was  
25           adequate reporting, BICA did not necessarily report on

1 boys who left the Scheme, and it goes on:

2 "It seems of the 47 Lads' Club members who had  
3 migrated under BICA's auspices, three returned  
4 voluntarily, two had been returned as stowaways, two had  
5 been deported and one had been sent home as, 'unsuitable  
6 for farm service'".

7 Q That's quite telling.

8 A It's quite telling and quite directly critical.

9 Q Overall then, when you look at the overall picture in  
10 relation to this particular Scheme which was  
11 significantly involved in emigration, what is the  
12 general picture?

13 A I think of all the institutions I have looked at this  
14 Scheme of British Immigration and Colonization  
15 Association comes out with probably one of the most  
16 negative reputations. It seems to have attracted  
17 particular problems, or engendered particular problems.

18 Q Then moving on to section 9, again, just doing this in  
19 an alphabetical way, you are looking here at a Scheme  
20 run by the Canadian Pacific Railway. That in itself  
21 almost suggests that the migrants would be working on  
22 the railway, but that's -- I don't think, is the essence  
23 of it?

24 A No. I don't think so. As I mentioned earlier, the  
25 Canadian Pacific Railway had vast tracts of land which

1           it wanted to populate, and in this period, in fact, from  
2           the origins of the railway onwards, there were CPR  
3           agents operating in Scotland in the same way that the  
4           federal Canadian government agents operated, trying to  
5           recruit settlers for the land, and offering  
6           three-quarter sections to recruits who were willing to  
7           take up those sections.

8           Q    So do I take it from what you have said that there are  
9           individuals representing the Canadian Pacific Railway  
10          who would come to Scotland and -- what? Go to a place  
11          like Aberlour, for example --

12          A    Yes.

13          Q    -- to see whether or not a boy or boys would wish to go  
14          to Canada to work?

15          A    Yes. What they generally did was -- I mean, they were  
16          employees of the company, they would be sent not only to  
17          Scotland but to the whole of the UK and beyond and they  
18          would generally try to capitalise on the networking  
19          that -- the networks they had with booking agents.  
20          Those are the individuals who booked the actual tickets,  
21          and they would often hold lectures in booking agents'  
22          offices in quite remote places, so they were partly  
23          working alongside the Federal Government agents, partly  
24          working in competition with them. There was a range of  
25          recruitment agents came to Scotland in the late 19th and



1           early 20th centuries, some of whom were based here like  
2           Anne MacDonald and her predecessors. They were civil  
3           servants, I mean, they were moved around different  
4           locations like pieces on a chessboard, so there were the  
5           Federal Government agents. There were the occasion  
6           special agents, if you like, for example, Gaelic  
7           speakers who would be sent up to do a particular  
8           recruitment campaign in the Highlands, and then there  
9           would be agents of the Canadian Pacific and the Canadian  
10          National Railway companies who were each trying to  
11          recruit settlers for their lands. Certainly, I think if  
12          you are talking in terms of competition, the CNR and the  
13          CPR would have been in competition, but yes, the agent  
14          of the CPR would make use of whatever contacts and  
15          networks they had in the areas which they visited to  
16          promote their schemes, and it may well have been that,  
17          you know, for example, the booking agent in Elgin who  
18          I think was a man called John Sinclair might have said,  
19          well, you might think about going to Aberlour orphanage,  
20          they might have some children or juveniles willing to  
21          go. That's speculation on my part, but that was the way  
22          it operated. It was by word of mouth recommendations and  
23          networks and contacts.

24         Q       Well, in fact, I think you tell us that six boys were  
25                migrated from Aberlour in 1927 under this particular

1           Scheme, and I think you touched on this already, that  
2           was prompted by a visit by a colonization agent. Now,  
3           is that a Canadian --

4           A    Yes.

5           Q    -- representative? And presumably who went to the  
6           orphanage and was able to persuade Aberlour and the boys  
7           to migrate?

8           A    That's very likely. The strategy was normally to  
9           deliver an illustrated lecture, a lecture illustrated by  
10          what, in that era, would have been lantern slides, and  
11          to display colourful posters of life on the farm in  
12          Canada, and if you have ever seen any of these posters  
13          you will know that the sky is always blue, the crops are  
14          always prolific, and even the hens look like they have  
15          been scrubbed. Everything is perfect.

16          Q    So far as the evidence is available, for example, in  
17          relation to selection, and matters like consent,  
18          placement and aftercare, was there any evidence that  
19          gave you any insight into how that -- these issues were  
20          addressed, under this particular Scheme?

21          A    No, because I don't know enough about it. My more  
22          general background knowledge would have -- would suggest  
23          that once selected, the recruits would have been  
24          required to undergo a medical, and subject to that would  
25          have been accepted or rejected.

1 Q So far as the Aberlour boys are concerned, I think there  
2 was some information in the magazine as to how these  
3 boys had got on.

4 A Yes, but it was very general, I think. It simply said  
5 the -- yeah, fragmentary evidence about placement and  
6 aftercare from the magazine, it was recorded in 1927:

7 "The boys are carefully looked after on the other  
8 side, materially and spiritually and have every chance  
9 of doing well".

10 Q At least the Warden seems to have visited the boys?

11 A That's correct. He visited in 1928, the boys working on  
12 farms, and in 1929 he reported that within a short time  
13 of arriving the migrants who had been sent out that year  
14 were settled on farms within a few miles of each other.  
15 Now that's quite important because in a lot of cases  
16 that didn't happen, and that would have potentially  
17 mitigated the feeling of isolation and loneliness.

18 Q I think you tell us also that altogether 16 boys from  
19 Aberlour went out in three separate groups under the  
20 Scheme?

21 A Yes.

22 Q But they went out -- they were also Boy Scouts. Is  
23 that --

24 A Yes.

25 Q So they were included in the total number of Boy Scouts

1           who were migrated?

2           A    Yes.

3           Q    But the message here seems to be relatively positive?

4           A    Seems to be, yes.  Yes.

5           Q    That's in relation to Aberlour.  What do we know of any  
6                other boys who may have been migrated under this  
7                particular Scheme?

8           A    Nothing.  I don't know.  I haven't -- I had not come  
9                across it until I saw the Aberlour evidence, other than  
10              being aware of the general recruitment under the CPR.

11          Q    So we don't know, for example, if boys from other  
12                orphanages may have been approached or -- under this  
13                Scheme?

14          A    I couldn't say I'm afraid.  I think it is likely because  
15                why would they just go to Aberlour?  But it's not --  
16                well, if it is recorded I haven't seen any evidence of  
17                that.

18          Q    The next organisation you look at at section 10 is one  
19                known as the Children's Overseas Reception Board, CORB,  
20                and that was an organisation, you tell us, that was  
21                created in June 1940 in order to evacuate children to  
22                the Dominions during the Second World War, and we heard  
23                something about this before, but I think you tell us  
24                here that a number of trips took place until, I think,  
25                two ships were torpedoed?

1 A That's correct. I mean, it was the torpedoing of the  
2 City of Benares that brought the Scheme to a premature  
3 end.

4 Q But this Scheme was an evacuation Scheme?

5 A Yes. It was a variant on the internal evacuation  
6 Scheme.

7 Q But was a consequence of the Scheme, nevertheless, that  
8 children who went, for example, to Canada or to  
9 New Zealand, some did have bad experiences.

10 A That's correct, in terms of isolation and difficulty in  
11 adjustment.

12 There were also, I think I have come across more  
13 evidence of difficulties amongst those who returned who  
14 found it difficult to readjust to life back with their  
15 parents and their siblings because of the period for  
16 which they had been aware which was generally much  
17 longer than internal evacuation arrangements, and the  
18 fact that these children had matured into adolescents,  
19 they had grown up when they were aware, they had grown  
20 apart from parents and siblings whom they had never  
21 seen, and some of the evidence I have seen of this, and  
22 I think probably not -- I don't think I have put it into  
23 this report, but I have worked on this in a different  
24 capacity, is that there was resentment among those who  
25 had stayed at home that these adolescents came back and

1           complained about conditions in Scotland or the UK when  
2           they had escaped the war and, you know, they came back  
3           to a situation of rationing and uniformness of British  
4           society and said, well, life was much better in Canada,  
5           Australia or New Zealand, and the siblings and parents  
6           would say, well, you had the better opportunities, we  
7           had to stay here and put up with it.

8           Q    Yes. Of course, but if children, young children were  
9           sent away in 1940 and didn't get back until 1945 or  
10          thereabouts, that means they are five years away from  
11          home, and that's a long time.

12          A    Yes. I mean, the readjustment was hugely difficult,  
13          I think. I think that was underestimated. Again, of  
14          course, the creation of the sea evacuation Scheme was  
15          a knee jerk reaction to the fear of invasion, so I  
16          suppose when we are looking at these sorts of issues, if  
17          we try and put ourselves in the context of the time, and  
18          that very, very real fear of invasion, if parents could  
19          get on to that sort of Scheme, or with some of them who  
20          were self-funding, which is more the case with the  
21          United States Scheme, they were going to grab at that  
22          opportunity. It is easy, I think, with hindsight, to  
23          think, well, that was a terrible thing to do, but, I  
24          mean, there was a very real fear that there was going to  
25          be an invasion, but of course Krysty Page,

1           retrospectively, commented on the problems of the CORB  
2           Scheme.

3           Q   You do mention that, but looking to the children that  
4           went, and I'm really focusing here on children who were  
5           living in family, and this was arranged by their parents  
6           to put them into care, no doubt, in other countries,  
7           essentially foster-type care?

8           A   That's correct. Usually with people whom they knew, or  
9           with whom they had connections. I mentioned earlier the  
10          interviewee who went out as a sea evacuee to the  
11          United States, and he had an interesting experience. It  
12          was a private arrangement. The people to whom he was  
13          sent were acquaintances of his family, and he said  
14          initially he was treated very well, sent to the best  
15          schools and well looked after. The agenda behind that,  
16          he told me, he didn't know at the time, was because the  
17          foster parent wanted to advance his career in American  
18          politics, I think possibly to become governor of the  
19          state, I can't remember the details. When that didn't  
20          happen the foster parents lost interest in the sea  
21          evacuee and he was sent to a different school. He  
22          wasn't unhappier, but he just wondered why there had  
23          been this change, why they no longer paraded him in  
24          front of their friends and acquaintances, but I think it  
25          is a telling insight into what could happen, and the

1 hidden agendas of some of the carers.

2 Q One point that -- I will take this point before we  
3 adjourn for lunch -- is that in footnote 1544 on page  
4 312, you tell us that Dr Cossar was escorting sea  
5 evacuees to Canada on one of the ships which was  
6 torpedoed and he died two years later as a result of  
7 exposure and heart strain suffered during that incident  
8 so he survived the sinking of the ship but he died as  
9 a consequence?

10 A Yes, and I -- that indicates to me that Cossar's  
11 intentions were benevolent, and the New Brunswick  
12 newspaper, talking about him being involved in the  
13 secret rescue of more than 200 Jewish children from Nazi  
14 Germany which I hadn't known about before, his  
15 intentions were benevolent, but some of the  
16 implementation was flawed, and I think that would be the  
17 case with the Children's Overseas Reception Board as  
18 well, the intentions were good but the implementation  
19 was flawed, and I think that comes out in Krysty Page's  
20 retrospective observations which indicated some of the  
21 problems.

22 LADY SMITH: Is that a good point to break then? Marjory,  
23 thank you very much. We will stop now for the lunch  
24 break and I will sit again at 2 o'clock if you are ready  
25 then. Thank you.



1 (1.00 pm)

2 (A short break)

3 (2.00 pm)

4 LADY SMITH: Welcome back Marjory. If you are ready, I will  
5 invite Mr MacAulay to continue.

6 A Thank you.

7 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay?

8 MR MACAULAY: My Lady.

9 Can we now move on to section 11 of your report,  
10 Marjory, and here you are looking at the Church of  
11 Scotland Committee on Social Services. Now, we do know  
12 that that particular committee did play a particular  
13 role in relation to child migration, and we will look at  
14 that later, but focusing on juvenile migration, you tell  
15 us that the committee, as a committee, was a member of  
16 the Council of Voluntary Organisations for Child  
17 Emigration. Do you see that? CVOCE. Can you just help  
18 me with that? I don't think we've come across the  
19 council before. What was this organisation?

20 A I think it was a -- I think this is dealt with in the  
21 main report.

22 Q It is.

23 A It was a consortium of organisations that were involved  
24 in child migration and which shared information and,  
25 presumably, best practice and had discussions about

1 policy making.

2 Q And I think it's right to say that the Church of  
3 Scotland did not become involved in migration until  
4 after the Second World War.

5 A I think that is correct, yes.

6 Q But you have set out here that the -- it funded the  
7 migration of 83 children to Dhurringile Farm School in  
8 Victoria. Is that correct?

9 A Yes.

10 Q And most of these by and large, the greatest majority,  
11 were child migrants?

12 A Yes, so it's not particularly relevant to the juveniles.  
13 It's actually very difficult to disentangle what the  
14 Church of Scotland was doing, vis-à-vis other  
15 organisations. There is an unclear papertrail, but it  
16 is clear that there were overlapping enterprises, as  
17 I think comes up later in this section, Cossar appears  
18 once more.

19 Q Yes, but of the 63, 83, rather, went to the same farm  
20 school?

21 A Mm-hmm.

22 Q And the Cornton Vale training farm, was an an  
23 establishment run by the Church of Scotland?

24 A Yes. It establishes a training farm at Cornton Vale  
25 near Stirling in 1907 intending for it to be

1 a rehabilitation centre for destitute men, that is  
2 adults, and this was at the same times as the Committee  
3 on Social Work became licensed as an emigration agency,  
4 so there is, I think, the potential for some sort of  
5 overlap and mix there. Assisted emigration did take  
6 place beginning in 1910 from Cornton Vale to Canada and  
7 later to Australia, and as I have said in the report it  
8 probably accounted for about 40 men up to -- between  
9 1910 and the outbreak of the First World War but it was  
10 then able to take advantage of funding under the Empire  
11 Settlement Act and that allowed it to expand its remit  
12 to include the admission of younger males, well, still  
13 virtually adults, aged 18-26 with a view to their  
14 emigration.

15 Q The connection with Dr Cossar was that he was, I think  
16 you tell us, a member of the Cornton Vale local  
17 committee?

18 A Yes.

19 Q And just look at the connection between the two. I think  
20 when Dr Cossar began to slow down his operations, he  
21 sold his farm at Craigiellinn to the Church of Scotland.

22 A That's correct. It's just another example of the sort  
23 of networking that went on for which we don't have very  
24 tangible evidence, we just get clues every now and then.

25 Q Can we then look at the scheme Cossar set up? That's in

1 section 12 of your report, and you tell us there at the  
2 beginning that the Scheme was set up by Dr George Carter  
3 Cossar, and you give him his dates, 1880-1942, and of  
4 course 1942 is when his ship was torpedoed in crossing  
5 the Atlantic. Was it 1940?

6 A It was in 1940 and he died of heart failure two years  
7 later, I think, as a consequence.

8 Q But this was a programme, you tell us, for juveniles who  
9 were from deprived backgrounds?

10 A That's correct, so it is very distinctively so, unlike  
11 some of the other organisations we've been looking at  
12 today.

13 Q How did it operate? How did Dr Cossar recruit  
14 juveniles?

15 A He -- before the First World War he had opened a home  
16 for boys in Glasgow in connection with the Church of  
17 Scotland's Committee on Social Work. I think he was  
18 not -- in some ways molded in the -- coming out of the  
19 same mold as somebody like Quarrier although not with  
20 the same deprived background as Quarrier, I think he was  
21 a genuine philanthropist who had an interest in the  
22 welfare and the rehabilitation of boys from deprived  
23 backgrounds, particularly from the city of Glasgow and  
24 particularly from the Irish Catholic background, but he  
25 recruited from all over the -- all over Scotland, and he

1           did so partly by advertising what he was doing through  
2           newspapers, through writing to local authorities, I  
3           believe.

4           Q    And was he a philanthropist?

5           A    Yes.

6           Q    Was he a medical doctor?

7           A    Yes he was.

8           Q    The training farm at Todhill was that, as it were,  
9           a residential --

10          A    That's correct. This was in Ayrshire at Kilwinning, and  
11          the objective was to instruct boys in farming skills and  
12          then place them in farm service, either at home or  
13          primarily abroad.

14          Q    And were children sent abroad, I think particularly to  
15          Canada from Todhill?

16          A    Yes, particularly, I think probably almost  
17          exclusively -- well, I think exclusively to New  
18          Brunswick which is where Cossar had his particular  
19          interest.

20          Q    And you go on to tell us that he purchased Craigiellinn  
21          estate at Gleniffer Braes, Paisley, for £2,000 in 1922.

22          A    That is correct.

23          Q    And in today's money that is approaching £80,000. And  
24          the purpose of this purchase?

25          A    To quote from his own circulus, "it was for the purpose

1           mainly of affording to city boys of the poorer classes  
2           some experience in farming and gardening with a view to  
3           testing their suitability for migration as farm workers  
4           to His Majesty's overseas dominions", so very much the  
5           ethos of colonization, of populating the dominions with  
6           farm workers, the sort of issues we've been looking at  
7           earlier.

8           Q    And by now he already owned the large farm at Lower  
9           Gagetown in New Brunswick?

10          A    That's correct.

11          Q    Can I put this on the screen for you?  It's  
12                SGV-0010081938.  This is a brochure of some sort in  
13                connection with Craigielinn Boys Farm, and here we have  
14                a picture of the building.  Fairly substantial building  
15                from the photograph.

16          A    Yes.

17          Q    We were given some information about the council.  If we  
18                move on to the next page, 1939, we see here that this  
19                is -- this report -- sorry, 1940 which we have on the  
20                screen in fact, this is a report by the council to the  
21                first meeting of Craigielinn Boys Farm Association on 21  
22                December 1923.  That gives us a timeframe when this  
23                establishment may have opened up.

24          A    That's correct.  Post Empire Settlement Act, the Empire  
25                Settlement Act having been passed in May 1922.

1 Q And if we move on to page 1943, I don't propose to dwell  
2 on this for any length of time, but we are looking at  
3 extracts from letters from boys who have gone overseas,  
4 and I think we take it that these are boys who were sent  
5 by Cossar?

6 A That's correct.

7 Q And they are really positive messages from the other  
8 boys. For example, if we look at the second column, the  
9 second letter:

10 "Victoria, the farmer we are working with is one of  
11 the farmers we can work for. We are treated as two of  
12 the family, and we like them very well".

13 We can spend time looking at these, but these are  
14 positive messages, and, finally, if we look at the last  
15 page, 1953, we are getting a photograph there of the New  
16 Brunswick farm. It's not a very clear photograph but  
17 again it looks like a fairly significant building.

18 A It does. Yes. The letters, of course, could be  
19 interpreted as being a little disingenuous because they  
20 were promotional materials intended to raise funds, to  
21 solicit funds.

22 Q Now, we've already touched on the fact that he also  
23 acted as an agent for the BICA, but if you look at the  
24 quote that you have taken, I think, from the document  
25 we've just been looking at, can you just go through that

1           for us as to what his purpose was? Have you got that in  
2           front of you? Paragraph 12.2.

3       A    Yes I have. Shall I just carry on before it comes on  
4           the screen?

5       Q    Yes, just carry on if you have it in front of you?

6       A    So, as I say, he was dealing with male juveniles from  
7           deprived backgrounds, particularly in Glasgow and  
8           particularly with a focus on Irish Catholics because he  
9           felt their plight had been largely ignored. He did  
10          extend his recruitment field to the whole of Scotland,  
11          occasionally operating in England and very much an  
12          imperialist agenda that echoed those of the other  
13          organisations, and as he says in the extract that I have  
14          quoted, which is from documents in the National Records  
15          of Scotland, it is from that first Annual General  
16          Meeting of the association, he wanted to remove boys at  
17          an impressionable age from conditions and environments  
18          which were deleterious to them, and to give them the  
19          opportunity to flourish in overseas locations by  
20          separating them from their earlier associations. He  
21          felt there was a dual agenda and a dual outcome, because  
22          he wasn't only -- he felt he wasn't only helping  
23          individuals, but he was helping build-up the Empire, or  
24          as he put it, the Commonwealth, on which -- he said:  
25                 "The prosperity and existence of these islands



1 depends".

2 I think, there are, there are very many echoes of  
3 other individuals such as Quarrier and Barnardo in an  
4 earlier era who said that their mission was to act in  
5 loco parentis, but also in in terms of putting  
6 a transatlantic divide between their recruits and their  
7 early associations which these individuals are judged to  
8 be deleterious to their interests.

9 Q Now, he was advertising his wares, so to speak, but --  
10 and circulating, in particular, local authorities, but  
11 you tell us in your report, Marjory, that not all were  
12 persuaded -- this is at 12.5 -- that this was a route to  
13 take.

14 A Indeed. Yes. There is a slight error, I think, in --  
15 well, this is in the original, he was called -- referred  
16 to as, "JC Cossar", but I'm pretty sure it was the same  
17 individual, the children's committee of Edinburgh Parish  
18 Council considered a letter from Cossar in Glasgow  
19 advocating a Scheme to migrate 20 young children aged  
20 8-14 to Winnipeg. Now that's the only reference I had  
21 come across to Western Canada. I mean, Barnardo had  
22 interest in Western Canada and so did some others  
23 involved in child migration but I have never otherwise  
24 encountered Cossar being interested in that. The child  
25 migrants were to be in, "Perfectly good health, they

1           were to be put in foster homes in Manitoba, would come  
2           under the guardianship of the dominion's commissioners  
3           of immigration who would inspect periodically as to  
4           their care and protection of their interests", but the  
5           children's committee of Edinburgh Parish Council were  
6           not convinced. They felt that the Scheme should not be  
7           entertained, and that decision was subsequently ratified  
8           by the Parish Council and I haven't heard any more about  
9           that Manitoba Scheme and I don't think it got off the  
10          ground.

11         Q   And in relation to the reasons why the committee did not  
12           go along with this, were able to ascertain what the  
13           reasoning was?

14         A   I wasn't able to ascertain by direct statement, but  
15           I think the implication was that there was inadequate  
16           accountability.

17         Q   On the other hand, if we look at the Parish Council  
18           minutes of Aberdeen City and Kirriemuir, there is  
19           evidence there that some boys were trained and sent to  
20           New Brunswick from that council.

21         A   Yes, and I think that speaks to the random nature of  
22           whether boys were sent or not, whether -- how boys were  
23           recruited. I think a lot of it depended on the whim or  
24           the persuasiveness of -- well, the whim of those who  
25           listened to Cossar's representations and the

1           effectiveness with which Cossar managed to put across  
2           those representations.

3       Q    And a great deal of his marketing was successful?

4       A    Yes.

5       Q    And you tell us that, for example, I think Quarriers and  
6           indeed the YMCA were attracted to his Scheme?

7       A    Yes, and, again, that's another example of networking.  
8           All these people knew each other.

9       Q    In 12.8 you make the point that two of the four  
10          Quarriers boys that had gone were Cossar boys and were  
11          deported later on?

12      A    Yes. I think Claude Winters, the superintendent at  
13          Fairknowe Home operated by Quarriers was keen to  
14          distance himself from the Cossar element in those who  
15          were sent out.

16      Q    Now in relation, then, to selecting the boys who would  
17          be migrated, did you get any insight into how that was  
18          managed?

19      A    I'm trying to find the relevant paragraph here.

20      Q    Well, it is paragraph 12.10 I think, I think I should  
21          point out, in fact, they would see how the boys were  
22          doing, how they were doing at Craigiellinn and that, in  
23          itself, would feed into the selection process, I would  
24          imagine.

25      A    Yes. I think there would be a filtering process of

1 identifying boys who it was felt would make good  
2 colonists and those who would not.

3 Q And you tell us that at least initially Cossar's work  
4 was well-received in Canada?

5 A Yes. George Bogue Smart in 1913, reporting on the farm  
6 at Lower Gagetown, commended it and said it was  
7 advantageous to Canada and deserving of encouragement.  
8 We come across Bogue Smart earlier and he had a long  
9 career as an inspector of juvenile immigration agencies.

10 Q But then I think there was some deterioration in how the  
11 Scheme was being looked at, and I think, in particular,  
12 that some boys were delinquent and involved in criminal  
13 behaviour.

14 A Yes. I mean, Smart's report in 1913 may have been  
15 triggered, as I have said, by petitions sent to the  
16 immigration authorities in Ottawa by some of the  
17 citizens of Gagetown alleging that crimes had been  
18 committed by boys migrated by Cossar, and they say, "And  
19 others".

20 Q And you also provide some information about a former  
21 employee, a former matron, who made some criticisms in  
22 the way in which the farm at Lower Gagetown was being  
23 managed by its managers?

24 A Indeed. This was in 1924, a person by the name of  
25 Margaret Waugh who wrote to the Chief Medical Officer in

1           Fredericton, the capital of New Brunswick, highlighting  
2           a catalogue of problems, and particularly questioning  
3           the suitability of the superintendents, a Mr and  
4           Mrs Meiklejohn, and they had been in charge of the farm  
5           at that stage for 14 or 15 years, and she went on to say  
6           that the house was cold, the boys rose at 5 in the  
7           morning with no light, they had a stable lamp on the  
8           table in the evening, no proper sanitary arrangements,  
9           no water closet, single lavatory, was only to be used by  
10          the superintendents, and they held the key to it, so  
11          they effectively could lock it up, only water was from  
12          a tap in the kitchen, no bathroom, no means of bodily  
13          washing, no tanks, no boilers, no hot water system.  
14          Boys obliged to carry water from the kitchen, but then,  
15          if it does not suit Mrs Meiklejohn when they come for  
16          water or food to give it they do not get either until  
17          she is ready to do so, and although there was an  
18          obligation to feed and clothe the boys, Margaret Waugh  
19          said:

20                 "They are neither well fed nor properly clad. They  
21                 get neither butter nor milk and no meat except once in  
22                 a while. What they got to eat was meal and water and  
23                 bread, stewed apple cooked without sugar that  
24                 constituted their diet. There was nothing to work with  
25                 or cook with but the boys had to do their own cooking

1           and washing without implements. A boy aged about 16 was  
2           cooking for the whole farm, it seems, and Margaret Waugh  
3           had witnessed an incident where there was no bread and  
4           the boy had been ordered to make scones and halfway  
5           through the process she wanted to use the oven herself  
6           so she removed these half-baked scones and ordered the  
7           boys to eat them partially cooked and Margaret Waugh  
8           went on to say that Mrs Meiklejohn was in poor health,  
9           she appeared to be suffering from asthma or consumption,  
10          and did not pay attention to her own personal hygiene",  
11          which of course was putting the boys themselves at risk.  
12          They were supposed to receive \$10 a month and remain  
13          a year on the farm at the end of which they were to be  
14          out of debt and trained for farm work but they never  
15          seemed to be free of debt, and this was partly because  
16          the Meiklejohns were, apparently, raking in money from  
17          them. They were never out of debt to the Meiklejohns  
18          and were still -- the boys appeared to be in great fear  
19          of Mr and Mrs Meiklejohn. Mr Meiklejohn had said to  
20          Margaret Waugh that the boys were, "Liars and thieves  
21          taken out of reformatories and gutters", but George  
22          Bogue Smart had found some of Margaret Waugh's  
23          complaints substantiated and he did advise Cossar to  
24          renovate the buildings and improve procedure. I don't  
25          recall George Bogue Smart saying anything about the

1 Meiklejohns.

2 Q Although they left.

3 A They did leave, yes.

4 Q Not long after that because I think you tell us that in  
5 1927 a new management team was installed, but that  
6 particular management team admitted, I think, that the  
7 aftercare was not what it should have been.

8 A That's correct. The successors to the Meiklejohns, John  
9 Jackson and his wife, were unsatisfactory in other ways  
10 because it seems that Jackson was more interested in the  
11 breeding of shorthorn cattle than in looking after the  
12 boys. Being at Gagetown was a means to an end. The  
13 manager of the BICA spoke highly of Jackson, but we have  
14 reason to question the integrity of the BICA from what  
15 we've discussed earlier. Jackson was criticised as  
16 a superintendent by the Canadian Immigration Department  
17 for being more concerned with farm management and  
18 agricultural experiments than with the boys' welfare,  
19 and as you have pointed out, he paid allegedly lax  
20 attention to selecting employers for the boys and also  
21 to their aftercare, and Jackson himself did admit that  
22 pressure of time sometimes prevented him checking the  
23 references. It wasn't feasible, sometimes, to visit  
24 homes in advance, almost never afterwards, and that is  
25 unless trouble arose, so they were engaging in crisis

1 management, and there was no proper -- no clear  
2 procedure regarding indenture so that wages would be  
3 paid regularly, no clear procedure about answering the  
4 boys' enquiries, and no clear procedure about even  
5 keeping track of them which is an issue that has arisen  
6 in some of the other institutions as well, and it seems  
7 that this deficient inspection was partly addressed by  
8 the appointment of somebody called Captain Clingo about  
9 whom I have managed to find nothing. He was appointed  
10 in 1930 by which time, of course, migration was  
11 dwindling because of the onset of the depression, but  
12 John Jackson claimed that the work was complicated  
13 because the Cossar recruits were boys, "... who had  
14 knocked about Glasgow for two or three years after  
15 leaving school", resented the regulations about their  
16 wages being waived, and tended to find their own  
17 situations, so the implication is they were difficult to  
18 deal with. Just one point there, there is just a typo,  
19 "Waving", of wages, should have an I in it.

20 Q So within the period of 1913 when Bogue Smart was  
21 complimentary, and wanting to encourage Cossar's work,  
22 by 1930 he is scathing in a report on how the place is  
23 being managed?

24 A That's correct.

25 Q And, indeed, he focuses on a particular point, and that



1 is that in many cases the boys were being exploited by  
2 their employers.

3 A That's correct. The employers being more interested in  
4 furthering their own careers.

5 Q And just pick up this point that you mention in  
6 paragraph 12.14, what's said is that all over the  
7 country, that boys had been found undertaking road work  
8 for employers who gave none of the lads earnings, and,  
9 of course, that's within the context of boys who were  
10 being exposed to be -- being sent out for farmwork?

11 A That's correct.

12 Q When they were doing different sort of work which is  
13 road work?

14 A Yes.

15 Q Now I think we see in Quarriers, that Quarriers would  
16 make it a condition -- and we will see this when we come  
17 to Quarriers -- that when the boys went to the farms to  
18 work, they were not to do --

19 A Correct. Yes.

20 Q So there is a clear contrast there in how the boys in  
21 Quarriers were being managed in comparison to the Cossar  
22 boys?

23 A That would be a fair point, and I wonder if it has to do  
24 partly with the location. Quarriers operated primarily  
25 in Ontario, in southern Ontario, and had been doing so

1           since the 1870s, and, I suppose we could say, were  
2           learning from experience over those decades. Cossar's  
3           operations started later. I think there was less  
4           accountability, less rigour in the oversight of Cossar's  
5           enterprise which may have been due to him having  
6           suddenly having large numbers by the mid-1920s, may have  
7           been due, as I say, to the province being less  
8           experienced in receiving and handling these sort of  
9           immigrants.

10          Q    Then you go on to tell us, Marjory, that the farm was  
11               eventually taken over by the New Brunswick province, and  
12               became a provincial training centre, and that was,  
13               I think, in 1932. That's, I think, what you say in  
14               paragraph 1215?

15          A    Yes. That's correct.

16          Q    But Cossar still continued in his migration work?

17          A    He did. What's not clear, I think, is the extent to  
18               which Cossar was accountable, either within New  
19               Brunswick, but more particularly to his Council of  
20               Management in Scotland. It says from 1926-31 the work  
21               was subsidised and directed by a Council of Management  
22               in Scotland assisted by a Canadian committee, but to  
23               what extent he was really carefully supervised and made  
24               accountable to that isn't clear.

25          Q    You mentioned in 12.16 that there was some increasing

1           tension between Cossar and the Canadian immigration  
2           authorities and in particular in connection with the  
3           criteria on which boys were judged fit for immigration,  
4           and that Cossar knowingly selected delinquent boys who  
5           were medically unfit and I think 40 problem cases were  
6           cited. Is that --

7           A    Yes.

8           Q    Do we see there that there is a quote from a boy's  
9           mother:

10                    "He had the choice of going to Canada or going to  
11           jail and he chose to go to Canada under Dr Cossar's  
12           Scheme".

13           A    And that would relate back to what the citizens of  
14           Gagetown complained about in -- was it 1913.

15           Q    And you tell us in the final sentence that in 1931, 20  
16           boys were sent back to Scotland and then we have the  
17           comment you mentioned before, 1933, Murphy commented  
18           that Cossar, "... means well but does not know how to go  
19           about it".

20           A    Yes, and from what I have read of Cossar, and I have  
21           read a lot about Cossar, I have written about Cossar in  
22           a number of articles, I would think that's a fair  
23           judgment of his attitude and actions.

24           Q    And you make reference in 12.17 to a particular instance  
25           where a boy was pressurised into signing a contract, and

1           then just moving on, then, to 12.18, and look at some of  
2           the numbers that you mentioned, you say that by 1913 the  
3           farm at Lower Gagetown had received 250 boys, and by  
4           1922 this had risen to 800, and by 31 October 1928  
5           a total of over a thousand boys had received training at  
6           Craigielinn of whom 734 had been sent overseas, with  
7           most going to Canada but some to Australia and a few to  
8           New Zealand. Is that right?

9           A    That's correct.

10          Q    This notion of regulations and minimum height  
11           requirements, that had quite an effect, didn't it, on  
12           juvenile migration?

13          A    Yes it did, and from the perspective of Cossar and his  
14           ilk, it inhibited them because many of the recruits whom  
15           they wished to send would have not been eligible under  
16           those new regulations. I think Cossar having handed  
17           over the Gagetown enterprise to the provincial  
18           government in the late 1920s was then, well, more than  
19           irritated by the restrictions that were put upon his  
20           activities as a result.

21          Q    And I think the height limit was boys over -- was it  
22           five foot four inches?

23          A    I think it was.

24          Q    You set it out there?

25          A    It is in my report. I think that rings a bell.

1 LADY SMITH: Was it not just five foot? As low as five  
2 foot?

3 MR MACAULAY: It may have gone -- we can check that.

4 LADY SMITH: 16.12, the footnote. The Canadian regulations  
5 imposed from 1928 included the enforcement of a minimum  
6 height requirement of five feet, and the point I think  
7 you are making is that it was felt that for urban  
8 children from this country at a disadvantage because  
9 they were poorly nourished and foot five might have been  
10 quite tall for a child from Glasgow, for instance.

11 A Yes, and of course this was the era in Glasgow when  
12 there were huge problems with diseases like rickets and  
13 malnutrition would have caused underdevelopment.

14 MR MACAULAY: And we see that the farm was destroyed by fire  
15 in 1929.

16 A Yes.

17 Q I think that suffered the same fate, was of Emma  
18 Stirling.

19 A It was Emma Stirling's Aylsford property. I think with  
20 Emma Stirling -- I don't think the Gagetown one was  
21 arson, but with Emma Stirling's it was in 1895 she had  
22 laid charges against a local man who had allegedly  
23 impregnated a girl at the farm and against a doctor who  
24 had allegedly performed an abortion and shortly after  
25 she laid those charges her property was burned down.

1 Q In any event it was rebuilt as a different form of  
2 establishment?

3 A That's correct.

4 Q Just focus on the numbers. I think we mentioned this  
5 before, but on the table on page 288 or 280, depending  
6 what number you take, 280 I think, the Cossar Farms  
7 number for child migration, I think this is really to  
8 Canada, it is about 1200.

9 A That's correct, and I think we are on firmer ground with  
10 that statistic because of the voluminous reports of the  
11 Cossar enterprise which I have managed to consult from  
12 National Records of Scotland, so it's less speculative  
13 than some of the others.

14 Q Do we assume that these would all be Scots?

15 A No. Vast majority would have been, but as I mentioned  
16 in one of the points earlier, he did occasionally  
17 recruit from England, and my recollection is that the  
18 Isle of Man was a place from which he recruited. I may  
19 be wrong about that but somehow the Isle of Man sticks  
20 in my mind.

21 Q Would the majority of them have gone through his  
22 Scottish establishment?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Can we now move on to the next section, section 13, and  
25 here you have a Scheme with the title, "The Dreadnought

1           Scheme", named after the intention to build  
2           a dreadnought battleship?

3           A    Yes.

4           Q    Can you just give us some background into how this  
5           Scheme came into being?

6           A    Okay. Well, there was a campaign in Australia in 1903  
7           in New South Wales to raise money to fund construction  
8           of war ships to protect Australian imperial interests in  
9           the Pacific, particularly to construct a dreadnought  
10          battleship for the Royal Navy, but in the event the --  
11          that didn't develop, the money was diverted to other  
12          purposes, including funding the immigration of young men  
13          from the UK to be trained as rural workers, and that  
14          would actually fit in with protecting Empire interests.  
15          It would come under the same umbrella, as it were,  
16          because populating Australia with young white males was  
17          seen as boosting, bolstering the Empire.

18          Q    Who ran the Scheme then? It's called, "The dreadnought  
19          Scheme", but who actually ran it?

20          A    A trust called the Dreadnought Trust entered into an  
21          agreement in 1910 with the New South Wales government,  
22          and that was the foundation of the Scheme, the objective  
23          of which was to bring out British city boys aged between  
24          16 and 19 and, once again, the requirement was that you  
25          should be of good character and physique, so physically

1           and morally --

2           Q    Are we talking here really about boys of that age who  
3           were not in care in Scotland?

4           A    That's correct.  Not in care.

5           Q    But in any event, and I perhaps should ask you, were  
6           they being brought under the Scheme to do farm work or  
7           different types of work?

8           A    Farm work.  The idea was that they would be trained as  
9           rural workers on farms in New South Wales.

10          Q    And you estimate that as far as Scotland was concerned,  
11          the Scottish participation in this Scheme was about 280  
12          juvenile boys?

13          A    Yes.  That would be our estimate.

14          Q    Do you know what the sources for the boys were?

15          A    General advertising, I think, in much the way that  
16          Barwell, Big Brother, some of these other enterprises  
17          that we've already looked at, in the way that they  
18          recruited.  The applicants were selected by Commonwealth  
19          immigration officers in London, but I think the  
20          applications themselves would have been generated by  
21          general advertising and word of mouth.

22          Q    And would this Scheme also be covered by the 1922 Act?

23          A    Yes.

24          Q    But we see from what you say that it did -- or the  
25          recruits, rather, encountered serious problems and



1 exploitation in Australia. Is that right?

2 A That's correct. You are referring here, I think, to  
3 paragraph 13.4?

4 Q Yes. 13.4.

5 A Yes. 13.4. Research guide that the National Archives  
6 of Australia produced does say that the majority of  
7 dreadnought recruits encountered these serious problems  
8 for various reasons. The backgrounds from which they  
9 came, I don't mean deprived, I mean that they came from  
10 urban areas rather than rural areas, the isolation to  
11 which they were exposed once they arrived, and their  
12 immaturity which the Scheme -- of which the Scheme did  
13 not take account when it was selecting them, as I say,  
14 it isn't clear how selection took place, how selection  
15 was monitored, nor is it clear how aftercare was  
16 monitored, but this research guide indicates, or states,  
17 rather, that they suffered loneliness, homesickness,  
18 culture shock and what the guide referred to as, "Pommy  
19 bashing", being singled out for bullying because of  
20 their ethnicity. There were deaths, deaths by accident.  
21 Many of them returned to Britain, especially during the  
22 depression, and there were several suicides.

23 Q You do tell us about one rather poignant suicide, the  
24 last sentence, just before committing suicide this  
25 particular person handed to a friend a sum of £7 to be

1           paid to the immigration department as the last  
2           installment of his passage money sum.

3       A   Yes. Yes. Which indicates that that had been praying  
4           on his mind, I think.

5       Q   Again, just to focus on this point, these were boys,  
6           young men, of the ages you have mentioned from urban  
7           areas being asked to work in rural areas?

8       A   That's correct.

9       Q   And these were the consequences.

10      A   Yes.

11      Q   The Flock House Scheme we touched upon earlier, named  
12           after the Flock House farm. You touch upon next, 14.1.  
13           Can you just give us some information about this  
14           particular Scheme?

15      A   This was launched between the wars, so it was launched  
16           in 1924, and it was aimed at funding emigration to  
17           New Zealand of the juvenile offspring, that is not  
18           children, but the juvenile offspring of British seamen  
19           who had died or been injured in the war, and these boys  
20           were to be trained, well, and later girls, to be trained  
21           in farm work and the ultimate objective was to set them  
22           on their own property, so it wasn't that they should  
23           spend a lifetime in farm service, they were to be  
24           trained to be independent farmers, and the orchestrater  
25           of the Scheme was a Scot who was an emigrant himself, he

1           was a politician, a man called Edwin Newman, and it was  
2           funded from the marketing of New Zealand wool. The  
3           Flock House Scheme is a shorthand term, it has got  
4           a much longer title. It was supported by 10 percent of  
5           New Zealand's wool growers, that's about -- just over  
6           2,500, or 2,600 individuals. Again, there is a Royal  
7           patronage, as there was in a number of other schemes,  
8           the patron was the Prince of Wales, and once again the  
9           Scouts appear, Lord Baden-Powell approved of the Scheme.  
10          Boys were selected by a London Advisory Committee, so it  
11          is a nationwide Scheme. The original remit was to  
12          identify suitable boys aged between 15 and 17, and once  
13          again the requirements were good character, good health,  
14          good temperament and the desire to learn and to pursue  
15          the occupation of farmers.

16         Q    You indicate in your table that you thought perhaps over  
17               70 juvenile migrants went from Scotland. Would these  
18               have been individuals who may have a parent alive, and  
19               not being in care, or would some of them be in care?

20         A    Some of them could have been in care but my anecdotal  
21               evidence, including an article that was in the local  
22               newspaper in Aberdeen a few years ago, was that they  
23               came from ordinary conventional family homes.

24         Q    I think this is another Scheme that suffered during the  
25               depression years, and although it briefly survived,

1           revived, it came to an end in about 19 -- in the 1950s.

2           A    That's correct, and I think some of the evidence, or  
3           suggestive evidence of it suffering during the  
4           depression years, or the suffering of those who went out  
5           under it is the boy whom we dealt with earlier who went  
6           from Aberlour of whom little more -- nothing was heard  
7           and his sister was trying to get in touch with him, and  
8           it seems that it may have been the depression that  
9           caused him to potentially be on the streets.

10          Q    Of course that answers my previous question in relation  
11          to children in care, because he, of course, was in care,  
12          and he was -- and the sister was referring to the  
13          comment that -- boys walking the streets.

14          A    Yes. I think just on that point about what generated  
15          the interest in schemes, going back to Aberlour, I think  
16          the Flock House Scheme was there, it was  
17          well-advertised, there was an awareness that boys were  
18          going out under it. I think an organisation like  
19          Aberlour probably took advantage of an opportunity to  
20          send a boy under a Scheme, the Scheme that was there  
21          primarily for other purposes.

22          Q    Well, let's move on, then, to section 15, and I think  
23          you have pulled together a number of different  
24          societies, or associations here. You have got the Girls  
25          Friendly Society, the British Women's Immigration

1 Association and other female migration societies, and up  
2 until now we've really been focusing on boys. Can you  
3 just give me some insight into these organisations?

4 A Part of the development of interest in philanthropic  
5 emigration in the second half of the 19th century turned  
6 the spotlight on what were called, "disadvantaged  
7 women", beginning -- Maria Rye will be somebody who is  
8 familiar to you in the main reports, a child  
9 emigrationist but she began her work with a body --  
10 forming a body called the Female Middleclass Emigration  
11 Society, but most of the work that was focused on female  
12 emigration was directed at working class women, and  
13 young girls, and there were a number of small  
14 organisations, but the one that became the big umbrella  
15 organisation, the sort of -- incorporated smaller  
16 societies, was the British Women's Emigration  
17 Association. It was a UK-wide organisation that, as I  
18 say, included the supervision of juveniles in its remit,  
19 and embraced smaller bodies like the Aberdeen Ladies  
20 Union. The Girls Friendly Society which heads this  
21 section, that wasn't really concerned primarily with  
22 emigration but like the YMCA and like the Boy Scouts it  
23 had an international network because it was established  
24 initially to assist girls travelling to cities in  
25 Britain with getting employment, and then it extended

1 its remit to the Empire and it advocated and facilitated  
2 emigration of working class girls, but it was mainly an  
3 English-based organisation. It was an Anglican  
4 organisation. It worked in close co-operation with the  
5 Mothers Union, to worked with Anglican Missionary and  
6 Emigration societies so the GFS didn't have a great deal  
7 of impact in Scotland but the British Women's Emigration  
8 Association had more impact because it kind of oversaw  
9 these small organisations, these small societies, and  
10 I have mentioned the Aberdeen Ladies' Union, well, the  
11 Aberdeen Ladies' Union, well, it sent 400 girls  
12 overseas, mainly to Canada but also to Australia and the  
13 United States between 1883 and 1914, but it was loosely  
14 supervised by the BWEA and there have been other  
15 organisations in the same situation.

16 Q And do I take it from paragraph 15.2 that the Countess  
17 of Aberdeen was involved with the BWEA?

18 A Yes. I mean, just by virtue of the Aberdeen Ladies  
19 Union being one of the societies that came under BWEA  
20 auspices. I mean, the Countess of Aberdeen was  
21 a redoubtable woman but she also was an example of this  
22 networking again, because she knew William Quarrier, she  
23 knew Thomas Barnardo. When she was making, I think, her  
24 first trip, transatlantic trip in 1890, she talked about  
25 encountering on the boat on the way across a group of

1 girls who were being escorted across to the home at  
2 Niagra on the Lake under the auspices of Maria Rye. She  
3 then met Annie MacPherson, I think, when she was in  
4 Canada. She just knew all these people, so it's part of  
5 this late Victorian network of evangelical philanthropy.

6 Q You tell us then that a number of Scots were migrated,  
7 particularly through this organisation, and I think in  
8 your table you have estimated perhaps 200 Scots. Would  
9 these Scots then have been Scottish girls who had  
10 parents in this country, or with parents but in care?  
11 What would the division be?

12 A My understanding is looking -- the organisation about  
13 which I know most is the Aberdeen Ladies Union, and  
14 these were not girls in care, but they were girls  
15 employed in occupations which Lady Aberdeen and her  
16 associates considered unsuitable occupations --  
17 shopworkers, fishhouse workers, in other words, jobs  
18 that were not domestic service jobs were they were  
19 supervised by their employers.

20 Q But what, then, did they go to do in Canada?

21 A Domestic service.

22 Q Do we know how these migrants prospered?

23 A We only know from the reports of the patron who visited  
24 some of them on her trip in 1890 and by some of the  
25 letters that were sent back that she chose to publish in

1 her estate magazine, so like the correspondence of other  
2 sending organisations it was highly selective and  
3 therefore very favourable, but I think we can  
4 occasionally read between the lines as in the case of  
5 one who Lady Aberdeen visited in 1890. I can't remember  
6 the exact quote. I use it in the book, "Through Canada  
7 with a Kodak", it's something like, "Despite the birth  
8 of an illegitimate child she was doing well in her  
9 situation". That's not an exact quote, but there is  
10 a reading between the lines, I think, that has to be  
11 done there.

12 Q But in any event you tell us, I think, in the final  
13 paragraph that there really is a lack of accessible  
14 information on matters such as selection and, indeed,  
15 consent.

16 A Yes. That would be correct.

17 Q Now then, can we then move on to one of the larger  
18 suppliers of juvenile migrants, and that's Quarriers?  
19 You deal with Quarriers in section 16. We've already  
20 mentioned Quarriers on a number of occasions. You, of  
21 course, have had the benefit of looking at the Quarriers  
22 records, and you tell us they have voluminous records?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Can you just give us a sense or feel for what's there?  
25 For example, are there case files on each and every



1 child?

2 A That is correct. I became aware of the existence of the  
3 Quarrier material when I was working, I think I  
4 mentioned earlier this morning, on my Ph.D, I used the  
5 local newspaper as my base source, and I was alerted to  
6 Quarriers immigration work by the reproduction in the  
7 local newspaper of the annual reports of Quarriers  
8 homes, and these annual reports were called, "The  
9 narrative of facts relating to the orphan homes of  
10 Scotland and the emigration work associated with that".  
11 That's not quite the exact title, but along those lines,  
12 so I then contacted Quarriers and, as I say, I went down  
13 and looked at the published material, the annual  
14 reports, but I was also given access to the case files  
15 which were kept in the village, and I have been there  
16 three times, twice long before this Inquiry, and once in  
17 connection with this Inquiry.

18 Q And there would have been many more records but for the  
19 fact that the Canadian records were destroyed after the  
20 closure of the receiving home in Canada.

21 A Yes. That's one of the most frustrating elements of the  
22 Quarrier material, because in the Scottish record there  
23 were cross-references to the Canadian volumes, and those  
24 volumes have been destroyed.

25 Q I don't propose to look at the correspondence, but there

1 is correspondence between Mr Winters and Quarriers in  
2 connection -- when the home in Canada was closing, and  
3 I think Mr Winters suggested that he would send the  
4 records back, and I think he was told to maintain them  
5 there for aftercare purposes.

6 A I think that's correct.

7 Q So I'm -- but do we know how they came to be destroyed?

8 A There is something, I think something in the  
9 correspondence about that. I can't recall offhand. If  
10 there is, it will be in the report somewhere, but  
11 I don't -- I think they just disappeared, and I ...

12 Q As you say, it's frustrating in the sense that you are  
13 seeing the Scottish end of the picture, and perhaps some  
14 of the Canadian end as well, no doubt there was  
15 correspondence, but not the full Canadian end?

16 A That's correct.

17 Q Now, in relation to numbers, we've already perhaps  
18 touched upon this, but Quarriers, according to what you  
19 tell us in 16.2 in total housed 20,219 residents over  
20 the -- between 1872 and 1933, over 7,000 were migrated  
21 to Canada.

22 A Yes.

23 Q Now, that 7,000 would include many child migrants.

24 A Yes. The majority would have been child migrants until,  
25 I think, the 1924 ruling that only those who had reached

1 school leaving age could be --

2 Q And according to your table on page 280 or 288, if you  
3 have -- I think this is a better estimate than most, 342  
4 child migrants were migrated by Quarriers between -- I'm  
5 sorry -- juvenile migrants between 1900 and 1972?

6 A Yes. We discussed that earlier I think.

7 Q Yes, and at least part of that would be generated by the  
8 fact that in 1924 the Bloomfield report effectively cut  
9 off child migration for that -- for Canada.

10 A That's correct. Yes.

11 Q The Canadian venture itself I think you say ended in  
12 1938. Is that right?

13 A Yes.

14 LADY SMITH: Sorry, Mr MacAulay, you were suggesting  
15 that Bloomfield cut off child migration wholly in 1924,  
16 but the venture carried on until 1938. Were we talking  
17 about juveniles having been stopped in 1924 or all  
18 migration?

19 A Child migration.

20 LADY SMITH: Child migration stopped in 1924, juveniles  
21 carrying on after 1924?

22 A Yes. Until 1938.

23 LADY SMITH: Subject to the criteria that they were then  
24 imposing. Thank you.

25 MR MACAULAY: Can I put this document on the screen? This

1 is a document that has been submitted on behalf of  
2 Quarriers, and it provides numbers. It is  
3 QAR-0010078046. I will perhaps just put this to you.  
4 Quarriers have, in their Section 21 response, I think as  
5 amended, have submitted a document setting out numbers no  
6 doubt taken from their records as to when children were  
7 migrated, so for example, if we look at 1925, 26, 27, we  
8 have 46 children, 49, 67, these would all be juvenile  
9 migrants because of the effect of the Bloomfield report?

10 A Yes. That's correct.

11 Q The reason I want to draw your attention to this is that  
12 in 1938, 28 juvenile migrants were migrated, but then in  
13 1939, 17, and I think that's different to your own  
14 information in that I think you thought that juvenile  
15 migration had finished in 1938, but I think this was  
16 Quarriers just clarifying the position from their own  
17 sources.

18 A Right.

19 Q But in any event, these would be juvenile migrants?

20 A They would be, yes. To Canada, they would be juvenile  
21 migrants. I mean, by that time Fairknowe Home had  
22 ceased to exist and the children were being boarded out  
23 elsewhere.

24 Q Now, so far as juvenile migration to Australia is  
25 concerned, what involvement did Quarriers have in that?

1       A    In the period with which I'm familiar, very little.  
2            I have looked primarily at the Canadian side of things,  
3            and for the purpose of the Inquiry I think I -- my  
4            colleagues looked at the Australian side because it was  
5            dealing with children and not with juveniles.

6       Q    So if you look at the Quarriers philosophy then, what  
7            was the Quarriers philosophy in relation to juvenile  
8            migration?

9       A    A similar philosophy to that in respect of child  
10           migration that the individuals who were sent overseas  
11           were being rescued from deprived and depraved  
12           backgrounds, and being sent out to a land where there  
13           were perceived to be better opportunities. In the early  
14           days and the days when William Quarrier himself was  
15           alive, there was very much a Christian emphasis on that,  
16           a Christian ethos that the child's moral and spiritual  
17           well-being were associated with the migration fields.  
18           There was this belief in the rural idyl, the morally  
19           restorative qualities of rural Canada as opposed to the  
20           morally destructive environment of Scottish cities,  
21           particularly Glasgow.

22           As time went on, perhaps less with Quarrier but to  
23           some extent with Quarrier and certainly with a number of  
24           other institutions, the emphasis became a more  
25           imperialistic one of, again, the bricks with which the

1 Empire would be built, and in some -- again, not so much  
2 with Quarrier, but relevant as part of the general  
3 backdrop, the eugenic argument of populating the Empire  
4 with white British stock. As I say, I'm not attributing  
5 that particularly to the Quarrier enterprise, but it was  
6 part of the general belief and general background that  
7 would have informed the decisions of those at Quarriers,  
8 so it was very much with both children and juveniles the  
9 belief that the individual would be benefited by being  
10 sent overseas, and, very often, being separated from  
11 parental or other family influences back in Scotland  
12 which might be detrimental to that individual's  
13 development.

14 Q And I think you say this in your report, that emigration  
15 was so much so on the Quarriers' agenda that the  
16 application forms that were signed were also consenting  
17 to emigration?

18 A That is correct and I think I make that point in 16.5,  
19 and it was the default option for the disposal of the  
20 individual until -- well, initially anyway, prior to  
21 1910, but my reading -- I have tried to source a number  
22 of those forms to try and identify when that clause was  
23 struck out, and what I have -- the conclusion I have  
24 come to is that there was an element of chaos in that  
25 administrative element of Quarriers' work. The erasure,

1 or the inclusion of the Canada clause on the admission  
2 record seems to have been haphazard. There doesn't seem  
3 to have been a consistency about it. Sometimes it was  
4 there, sometimes it wasn't. Sometimes it was struck  
5 out. Now, whether it was struck out because a parent  
6 objected to it I don't know, but although it says prior  
7 to 1910 it is believed there was a permission consent  
8 form entitled, "Emigration Form of Agreement", and  
9 thereafter the form is amended, it's not completely  
10 foolproof, that statement.

11 Q But coming back to the Quarriers philosophy, I think you  
12 tell us this in 16.3 that there was also an element of  
13 an exit door strategy, because if you are getting  
14 children in then you have to get children out.

15 A Yes. That was very much Quarriers' argument, that he  
16 wanted always to maintain an open door to his Scottish  
17 institutions, both the Glasgow ones and the Bridge of  
18 Weir homes, and if he was going to be able to do that,  
19 however great the funding he got, there was a capacity  
20 issue, and there had to be an exit door and he saw  
21 Canada as a valid exit door, this idea of the golden  
22 bridge, as it says in Marjorie Kholi's book.

23 MR MACAULAY: My Lady, we would normally have a short break  
24 at this point.

25 LADY SMITH: That's a good point. We will just take a short

1 break now Marjory and resume your evidence after that.

2 Thank you.

3 (2.59 pm)

4 (A short break)

5 (3.15 pm)

6 LADY SMITH: If you are ready Marjory we will carry on. Is  
7 that all right?

8 A Thank you.

9 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay?

10 MR MACAULAY: Yes my Lady.

11 Now, at 16.6 you look at the selection of migrants  
12 and what were you able to gauge as to how children were  
13 selected? Or juvenile migration?

14 A The individuals were apparently solicited, volunteers  
15 were asked if they would like to go to Canada. The  
16 evidence from some children reporting back, or former  
17 children reporting back on this later is that they were  
18 not clear what this -- the implications of this report.  
19 What was the difference between going to the seaside for  
20 a day and going to Canada for a lifetime? Particularly  
21 for young children that was not clear at all. They  
22 didn't realise it was an irreversible -- well, for many,  
23 an irreversible decision, but an initial selection would  
24 be made by Quarriers, apparently after asking for  
25 volunteers. There would be a preliminary medical



1 examination by Quarriers, and I think this is emphasised  
2 in many of the annual reports, Quarriers wanted to make  
3 sure that it wasn't going to be shown in a bad odour by  
4 having recruits rejected medically, so they did their  
5 own initial screening, and then those chosen had to  
6 undergo interviews and medical examinations by the  
7 Canadian government emigration agent, the sort of  
8 individual whom I have just mentioned, but it would  
9 generally be the Glasgow-based one, and then the medical  
10 officer respectively. The medical examinations were --  
11 well, it is difficult to know how rigorous they were.  
12 There are other examples of where this is -- it is not  
13 necessarily the case that they were rigorous, but there  
14 were certainly supposed to be about three of them; the  
15 initial one by Quarriers, the government one, and then  
16 on board ship. They are examined by the ship's surgeon  
17 on the voyage in order to ensure that none would be  
18 liable for deportation when they arrived --

19 Q So there was a process there then?

20 A There was definitely a process, yes.

21 Q But in relation to records being kept in relation to  
22 consent, for example, I think you say there weren't  
23 records of any formal consent?

24 A Not of formal consent, no. The case records make  
25 occasional references to the enthusiasm or otherwise of

1 the child, or the comments made by a parent or guardian.  
2 No formal consent records.

3 Q You do, thereafter, identify a number of particular  
4 cases in relation to consent and so on arose, and  
5 I don't propose to dwell on all these, we can look at  
6 these ourselves. There is one particular case where  
7 I think the father of this -- it's perhaps 16.9. It's  
8 a case where the father's consent was not required, and  
9 I think Quarriers' position was that the father's  
10 consent was not required because the boy himself could  
11 consent. Is that -- and, indeed, they may have done so  
12 on the -- taken that view on the back of a sheriff  
13 court, on the basis of a sheriff court case. Now, of  
14 course, we are here looking at boys who would be 14 or  
15 over.

16 A Yes. Yes.

17 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay, I don't suppose you have  
18 identified that case, have you? I couldn't find it.

19 MR MACAULAY: I haven't.

20 LADY SMITH: And no doubt you would tell us, Marjory, if you  
21 have identified --

22 A I haven't identified --

23 LADY SMITH: It may be that there is no written record of  
24 it, and it is just a decision which was known about.

25 A The only place I identified it was in the reference from

1           Quarriers as it appears in the footnote, I'm afraid, my  
2           Lady.

3   LADY SMITH: It would have been interesting to know.

4   A   The point, I think, in 69 that came up to me, it  
5           suggested that any tightening of procedure was reactive  
6           rather than pro-active.

7   MR MACAULAY: Yes, and that particular boy was migrated.

8   A   Yes.

9   Q   I think you say that on page 322. Toward the top --

10   A   Oh, "██████████ was migrated this 1938". Yes.

11   Q   Then you gave your attention to a number of other cases  
12           where there seems to have been a conflict between,  
13           perhaps, the child, the parent or, indeed, a relative,  
14           but I think ultimately the impression I get from reading  
15           this material is that if Quarriers and the child wanted  
16           emigration to take place, then that's what happened?

17   A   Indeed.

18   Q   Now, Quarriers did recognise the need for aftercare.  
19           You talk about this in paragraph 16.17, and can you just  
20           take me to that? How was aftercare managed by  
21           Quarriers?

22   A   Initially vicariously, between 1782 and 1887, as I say,  
23           placement and aftercare were the responsibility of the  
24           distribution homes run by Annie MacPherson at Belleville  
25           and Galt in Ontairo and at Knowlton in Quebec.

1 Q So they were relying on her?

2 A Yes, her and her staff, really. Her associates in those  
3 institutions.

4 Q But when Fairknowe came into play --

5 A When Fairknowe came into play the responsibility for  
6 providing after-care devolved on the Fairknowe Home and  
7 its staff.

8 Q I think you draw attention to the fact that we've been  
9 informed that, or there are facts, in fact, inform to  
10 a blacklist?

11 A Yes.

12 Q So clearly there was a degree of scrutiny being carried  
13 out by Quarriers in relation to where these children  
14 should go?

15 A From an early stage, that's the case, and what is not  
16 clear is how the blacklist was compiled, what the  
17 criteria were for individuals and households being  
18 blacklisted. We simply know that there was this  
19 blacklist of households where it was said migrants  
20 should not be placed.

21 Q And I think you tell us also at 16.19 that as far as the  
22 Canadian households were -- migrants were to be placed,  
23 that sometimes appearance was a consideration.

24 A Yes, and sometimes -- yes. Physical appearance, I don't  
25 think I have -- yes. It's not in this report, but

1 I think because it was -- the example was to do with  
2 a child, but a request that went in, very much like  
3 a shopping list of requirements, the child should have  
4 blue eyes and a happy countenance and that was really  
5 the basis on which the selection was to be made, but  
6 similarly, in the example I have the quoted, "A nice,  
7 clean-cut lad".

8 Q And then looking to the employment of the migrants that  
9 were being sent out for employment, I just want to look  
10 at that aspect of it. If you could look at this  
11 document, QAR-0010093016?

12 A Yes.

13 Q This is -- I will look at this. Well, just go back  
14 a bit. I think we are there now. If you just scroll  
15 down, you will see the Quarriers name and the reference  
16 to Fairknowe, Brockville and can we see this begins:

17 "Dear sir or madam, the other side of this page  
18 gives the conditions on which we place our wards".

19 Do you see that?

20 A Yes.

21 Q And the next paragraph:

22 "New boys come from Scotland usually in March or  
23 April; girls in June or July".

24 It is giving a timeframe. Now, if we move on to the  
25 back of the document which is the next page, QAR-75,

1           this is a document which is headed, "Memorandum of  
2           conditions on which children are placed out". You will  
3           probably have seen it already but unfortunately -- it  
4           maybe because it's on the back of the document that it  
5           hasn't come on the screen, but it says, for example,  
6           a child must be provided a separate bed for its  
7           exclusive use, a separate room is most desirable, and  
8           I think that probably rings a bell with you?

9       A    Yes it does. Yes.

10       Q   And so on and so forth. Some fairly strict conditions,  
11       I think for the time, as to what the boys' rights would  
12       be.

13       A    That is correct.

14       Q    Including holidays.

15       A    Yes. To prevent exploitation.

16       Q    Yes, and the other document that did come on the screen  
17       a moment ago at QAR-0010093014, it is headed, "This  
18       indenture", and I think you recognise this document?

19       A    Yes.

20       Q    This would be the part of the contract between the boy  
21       and the employer?

22       A    That is correct.

23       Q    For example, this is dated, I think, April 1930, and do  
24       we read, as we scroll down:

25                "It is agreed that the boy be provided with proper

1 board, lodging, washing, mending and separate bed for  
2 his exclusive use, that the wages be adjusted and  
3 settled with the superintendent at least twice a year,  
4 that is in April and October".

5 The superintendent there of course is the Fairknowe  
6 superintendent?

7 A That's correct.

8 Q And perhaps we can also look to the very bottom of the  
9 document, (viii):

10 "That the boy shall regularly attend church and  
11 Sunday school".

12 (ix):

13 "That the boy shall be entitled to all statutory  
14 holidays or the equivalent in lieu thereof"?

15 A Correct.

16 Q So again, fairly careful conditions being attached to  
17 the indenture that the boy was going into?

18 A Yes, and I think that reflects the duration of  
19 Quarriers' activities in child migration, the kind of  
20 learning by experience, because in the early days there  
21 had been -- indeed, continuing into this period -- that  
22 the law was observed more in the breach than the  
23 observance sometimes, but particularly in the early  
24 years there had been numerous problems with the  
25 fulfilment of indentures, ensuring that employers met

1           their obligations, so I think the regulations were  
2           tightened up, so at least in theory, not always in  
3           practice, in practice it was a different matter because  
4           of the widespread scattering of the recruits.

5       LADY SMITH: Yes. I was interested, Marjory, to read, for  
6       example, in condition 6 that they go as far as to  
7       specify that any letter or parcel or periodical  
8       addressed to the boy must be left unopened and treated  
9       as his private property. That sounds very much like  
10      trying to meet a problem that had been identified that  
11      they realised had to be remedied.

12     A Yes, and I think there is evidence in -- looking back to  
13     earlier years, or not necessarily much earlier years but  
14     certainly in the Quarriers story of recruits who  
15     complained that their letters were opened, or  
16     intercepted. In fact, the narrative of facts did say,  
17     in the earlier years, that if a parent or member of the  
18     family back in Scotland was deemed to be unsuitable,  
19     those letters would not be delivered to the child. It  
20     was not only the Atlantic that was the barrier, the  
21     Quarriers filtered, and I think other institutions too,  
22     filtered correspondence so that children would not be  
23     influenced by those at home, so I think, my Lady, that's  
24     absolutely the case, that it is a reaction to a problem  
25     that had arisen. The other related problem was that



1           when the children, or the juveniles, particularly  
2           children, I think, were asked to write back to the homes  
3           about their experiences, they wrote those letters with  
4           the employer looking over their shoulder and more or  
5           less directing the pen, so those were not only formulaic  
6           letters, they were letters that did not necessarily  
7           express the sentiments that were genuine.

8           LADY SMITH: Thank you.

9           MR MACAULAY: Staying with employment for the moment, if you  
10          look at paragraph 16.22 you make mention of a  
11          memorandum, probably from 1930, that pointed out to  
12          employers to whom it was addressed that boys were not to  
13          be sent out to other employment such as highway work,  
14          and I think I mentioned earlier that one can perhaps  
15          contrast that to what was happening, I think, with the  
16          Cossars.

17          A    Cossars, in a different province.

18          Q    The next quote that you provide there which is taken,  
19          I think, from the same memorandum reads that:

20                 "We have been shocked to learn that there are some  
21                 moreso lacking in feeling so as to prevent our boys  
22                 getting together", and I think that's clear reflection  
23                 of the fact that there must have been some efforts to  
24                 keep Quarriers boys who were in employment from meeting  
25                 up with other Quarriers boys?

1 A Yes, I believe so. I wonder if that was -- those who  
2 advocated such separation would have argued that it was  
3 to prevent bad associations. Yes, the memorandum, as  
4 you say, says, "We've been shocked to learn", so it was  
5 imposing an extra level of cruelty.

6 Q It goes on to say, "Boys are social in their make up and  
7 no boy can attain his best when this instinct is denied  
8 freedom to operate".

9 A Correct, and the capital letters -- they were capital  
10 letters in the original, so for emphasis, I feel.

11 Q So as a threat?

12 A Yes.

13 Q I will read that:

14 "We certainly will not tolerate conditions to  
15 continue wherein a boy is deprived of such pleasures and  
16 privileges".

17 So take that at face value, it is a very positive  
18 step on the part of Fairknowe?

19 A It seems to be. Yes.

20 Q In contrast, I think, to the BICA at 16.23 you tell us  
21 that Quarriers maintained a very good papertrail  
22 relating to finances.

23 A It did. Yes.

24 Q That involved, did it, essentially saving the migrants'  
25 money so that the migrant would have the benefit of that

1 money at a later point in time?

2 A Yes. When the migrant obtained his or her majority, I  
3 believe.

4 Q You go on then to mention aftercare, and, first of all,  
5 you mentioned that there were annual visits made by  
6 staff and also if they heard on the grapevine that  
7 something was wrong, they would send out an inspector  
8 other times, and does that come out from the records?

9 A That has come out from the Section 21 response by  
10 Quarriers, but I recall reading in -- from my own  
11 reading of the narrative of facts that that was what was  
12 done, so I think I can corroborate that from the actual  
13 primary source.

14 Q We've already heard about Mr Bogue Smart. He features  
15 again in paragraph 16.25. He was the Chief Inspector of  
16 British Immigrant Children and Receiving Homes. He is  
17 complimentary, is he, of the Quarriers work?

18 A Yes. He wrote in 1912 that the cottage homes, the  
19 Bridge of Weir homes were, "Regarded as amongst the most  
20 wonderful of their kind in the world". He said that  
21 Fairknowe had been for years of great benefit to the  
22 farmers of Eastern Ontario in supplying with juvenile  
23 workers, so I think the emphasis there is on what was  
24 being done for the farmers rather than what was being  
25 done for the children. The migrants were systematically

1 visited at least once a year and encouraged to maintain  
2 a regular correspondence, I think that's  
3 a correspondence with Fairknowe. On the other hand,  
4 Quarriers admitted its migration policy wasn't always  
5 successful. The narrative of facts in 1931 said there  
6 were some disappointments and many encouragements. Then  
7 in the depression it admitted, in an era where jobs were  
8 scarce, wages were falling, that boys, youths, became  
9 dissatisfied and discouraged and many more returned to  
10 Fairknowe. From the start, the Quarriers emphasised  
11 that those who found themselves in difficulties could  
12 return to the receiving home for relocation or respite,  
13 but I think in practice the stigma associated with  
14 returning was considerable. There was a sense of having  
15 failed one returned or was returned by the employer to  
16 Fairknowe.

17 LADY SMITH: If a child did, or a juvenile, wanted to  
18 return, how would it be paid for? How could it be  
19 funded?

20 A I think it was meant to be funded by Fairknowe, but  
21 there were practical difficulties, because it was  
22 difficult for the child or the juvenile, particularly  
23 for a child, to get in touch with Fairknowe without the  
24 knowledge of the employer or the local community,  
25 because local communities tended to close ranks around

1           the employer and believe the employer, so a child in an  
2           isolated location out in the middle of rural Ontario  
3           would, in practice, find it very difficult to make it  
4           known back at Fairknowe, hundreds of miles away, that  
5           they were in difficulty, so I think, again, there is  
6           a gulf between theory and practice.

7           MR MACAULAY: But notwithstanding what -- the positive  
8           messages, at least from Mr Bogue Smart, there were still  
9           problems, one being a laxity in inspection which was  
10          evident when Claude Winters was interviewed, and it was  
11          clear from what he was saying, that although he had the  
12          names and addresses of 1,500 lads, and was in touch with  
13          over 70 of them annually, it was apparent that there  
14          were some that he was not making contact with.

15          A    That is correct. On the positive side, going back to  
16          the previous point, 16.25, by 1938 there were  
17          pre-placement and post-placement inspections carried out  
18          by Winters. I think the pre-placement visits were  
19          innovative. I mean, that was trying to ensure that  
20          children -- that juveniles were sent to appropriate  
21          households, but as you say, despite the arrangements on  
22          paper, there were still problems about lax inspection,  
23          lax aftercare, and Winters was aware of that. Quarriers  
24          was aware of that when they interviewed Winters and they  
25          wanted more personal visitation about -- sort of to look

1 at living and working conditions, leisure and church  
2 connections in line with the requirements pointed out in  
3 the document that you put up on the screen.

4 Again, I think the recommendation that Winters  
5 should organise a meeting with the older lads around  
6 Brockville and district and a community centre relates  
7 to the need for socialising and seeing others who had  
8 originated in the Bridge of Weir homes. I mean,  
9 a 120-mile radius is quite significant in the 1920s and  
10 '30s, but again, the point further down in 16.26 that  
11 homes were not visited before placement, and this ought  
12 to be done, contradict the statement in the previous  
13 paragraph that pre-placement inspections were carried  
14 out.

15 Q Although there is a clear recognition there that that  
16 was something that ought to be done?

17 A Yes. Yes.

18 Q And when a child was visited then what one understands  
19 is that the visitor would prepare an aftercare report?

20 A That is correct.

21 Q And you talk about that in 16.27 through to 16.28. If  
22 you look at 16.30, just jump ahead, there is reference  
23 there to an aftercare report on a particular individual,  
24 and there were serious allegations about that boy's  
25 sexual conduct, and the visitor begins by saying, "I did

1 not find the act to be very pleasant. Neither the boy  
2 nor employer is satisfied with the other and there would  
3 seem to be reasons on both sides", and then goes on to  
4 say, "A disturbing factor was that the boy has  
5 misbehaved in respect of two young children. No detail  
6 was given but it was manifestly in the sexual realm",  
7 yet I think nothing was done.

8 A That is correct, yes. I think there was a reluctance to  
9 admit that problems of a sexual nature occurred.

10 Q But not even the employer had done anything about it?

11 A No. Nobody had done anything about it.

12 Q There is also references here to homesickness. Again,  
13 that's a common theme, isn't it, in relation to a number  
14 of these cases we've looked at?

15 A It is a very common theme. I mean, we talked earlier  
16 about the Aberlour example of the boy whose mind kept  
17 going back to the glens of Spayside and there are  
18 numerous examples of expressed, explicitly expressed  
19 homesickness, but also implications of it.

20 Q And as we read through this part of your report, does it  
21 become evident also that Quarriers are very conscious of  
22 their reputation when it comes to what reports and what  
23 actions should be taken in connection with the migrants?

24 A Yes. I think Quarriers was very aware of the need to  
25 maintain a good reputation. That goes back to something

1 I mentioned earlier about the pre-government medical  
2 examination, the screening by Quarriers to ensure that  
3 they wouldn't be putting forward recruits who would be  
4 perceived as inadequate.

5 The other consideration I think that comes out,  
6 going back to paragraph 16.24, is that financial  
7 considerations became paramount by the depression era.  
8 This is to do with the closure of Fairknowe homes, so  
9 I'm sorry, that's slightly tangential to the question  
10 you are asking me, but Quarriers was very keen to  
11 maintain a good reputation, because despite the element  
12 of government funding for which it was eligible, it  
13 still relied very heavily on voluntary donations, and if  
14 anything were to besmirch its reputation then the bank  
15 balance would suffer.

16 Q And one matter that could have an impact on reputation  
17 would be a boy or boys either being deported or simply  
18 coming back, and that becoming public knowledge?

19 A Yes.

20 Q Was there a concern over that in the documents you have  
21 looked at?

22 A Yes there was, and I think there was a particular  
23 concern to avoid the return through deportation because  
24 that was more -- highly publicised, or likely to be  
25 publicised. I have lost the reference here, I do --



1 Q Well, I can take you to, perhaps, paragraph 16.32 where  
2 you begin to say:

3 "It seems that Quarriers' Council of Management was  
4 reluctant to see migrants return to Scotland unless it  
5 was absolutely necessary".

6 We read in the quote that the superintendent at Weir  
7 had to approve, and:

8 "We felt that once children are in Canada, Canada  
9 should retain responsibility", but in fact, as you tell  
10 us, a big number of Quarriers' migrants did return or  
11 were sent back to Scotland?

12 A That's correct.

13 Q Do you have any percentage or number that can give us  
14 some feel for that?

15 A I should have because I have looked at returns, and,  
16 again, once again, I'm afraid my mind goes blank with  
17 statistics, but it was a not inconsiderable number. I  
18 mean, I think this is one area where the experience of  
19 child and juvenile migrants differs from the wider body  
20 of migrants because, as I said first thing this morning  
21 when we were sort of setting the background for  
22 emigration, about a third of people who emigrated from  
23 Scotland returned, and there was serial migration, there  
24 was step migration, there was boomerang migration, and  
25 there was outward and return movement as a single

1 movement, but for most emigrants, they had complete  
2 autonomy and control over those decisions, whether they  
3 went, came back, or not. As this paragraph to which you  
4 have just been alluding indicates, the children had no  
5 autonomy over what they did. It was decided for them by  
6 others, even after they were of an age to make their own  
7 decisions in some cases, so there was certainly  
8 a disparity between the run-of-the-mill emigrants and  
9 the institutionalised emigrants.

10 Q If we turn to paragraph 16.34 you make reference there  
11 to, again, Quarriers' concern to avoid negative  
12 publicity, is evident from time to time in  
13 correspondence from the Fairknowe superintendent to the  
14 Council of Management, and there is an example of Claude  
15 Winters who managed Fairknowe, advising the council not  
16 to press criminal assault charges against men who had  
17 impregnated Quarriers' girls since in many circumstances  
18 nothing but publicity would result, so that's an example  
19 of being conscious of the bad publicity that could ensue  
20 from that sort of publicity.

21 A Yes, and that's in a letter from Winters to Bridge of  
22 Weir.

23 Q You mention in the report, moving on a little bit, the  
24 change in Social Work attitudes, particularly, I think,  
25 in the 1930s into the 1940s, and there being, I think,

1 a move, particularly on behalf of the Social Workers,  
2 against institutionalisation?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Did that impact on Quarriers?

5 A Yes it did. I think I mentioned this in one of the  
6 paragraphs. Yes. I think 16.36 and 16.37?

7 Q Indeed. This is in Canada but also in the United  
8 Kingdom.

9 A Yes.

10 Q There is this change. It was particularly evident,  
11 I think, in Canada, even much earlier, I think, than in  
12 the United Kingdom?

13 A Yes I think so, and it was mentioned by Quarriers as  
14 a -- to some extent an obstacle to their work, and they  
15 felt they needed to address the need to liaise  
16 ultimately with social workers. I mean, in the Scottish  
17 context, of course, in the interwar period, there was  
18 much more overt, explicit opposition to particularly  
19 child migration, I think less was said about juveniles  
20 because they were reckoned to be more responsible for  
21 themselves, but from really -- well, in the 1920s there  
22 was -- Scotland was of a divided mind. There was  
23 opposition to emigration from right across the political  
24 spectrum, from people like Sir Alfred Yarrow on the  
25 right to Wall Harrington of the Communist Party on the

1 left because of the way that it was felt to be draining  
2 Scotland of the best of its -- the flower of its  
3 population.

4 Now, institutional child and juvenile emigration  
5 would not have come into that category because they  
6 would not have been regarded as the flower of the  
7 population, it was more a version of the 19th century  
8 concept of, quote-unquote, "Shoveling out the paupers",  
9 so that was one element of the opposition but there was  
10 also opposition from the Labour Party in the UK which  
11 felt that the pursuit of emigration from institutions,  
12 particularly child migration, was simply diverting  
13 interest and diverting funds from the need -- from the  
14 provision of state welfare, so there was political  
15 opposition, and there was opposition from this emerging  
16 class of Social Workers, as I say, on both sides of the  
17 Atlantic.

18 Q But child emigration by Quarriers began to dwindle and  
19 came to an end either in 1938 or 1939.

20 A Well, the children had ended in 1924, the juveniles in  
21 the late 1930s, yes.

22 Q But there were some efforts to try and resurrect,  
23 I think you talk about that in 16.38.

24 A Yes, and it says -- I say the discussions around the  
25 possible resumption were shrouded in secrecy for reasons

1 of political and financial sensitivity, and to avoid  
2 compromising the position of Frederic Blair, who was the  
3 secretary of the Department of Immigration, he favoured  
4 a resumption but he couldn't be seen to speak out in its  
5 favour which I think was a reflection of the impact of  
6 the depression, and the likely charge that he would be  
7 encouraging the bringing into Canada of people who might  
8 become public charges, people whom Canada did not want,  
9 and Winters I have quoted at length from a letter by  
10 Winters to DJ Finlay at Quarriers in November 1937  
11 there.

12 Q But in any event the stream of child migrants, not child  
13 migrants but juvenile migrants to Canada came to an end  
14 in the late 1930s.

15 A Yes.

16 Q The last paragraph of this section, 16.46, you have  
17 pointed to some problems with the Scheme, but you also  
18 say it is important to note contemporary and subsequent  
19 endorsement of Quarriers' practices, and in particular  
20 there has been correspondence of former migrants' later  
21 life, quite depositive experiences?

22 A Yes. I'm aware that this is not a -- wouldn't be --  
23 would certainly be something that's challenged in many  
24 circles, but the evidence of that I think would be the  
25 reunion in Kingston in -- and I can't remember, I think

1           it was something like 2001 to which Anna Magnusson makes  
2           reference -- I don't know if she makes reference to it  
3           in her book but certainly -- I have looked at the  
4           transcript of her evidence and I think she made  
5           reference to it there, and some of the correspondence  
6           that came back, that comes -- less now but it used to  
7           come back to Quarriers from former children. Now, the  
8           caveat, of course, is that those who get in touch, or  
9           got in touch were those who had good experiences, and  
10          that's very possibly the small tip of the iceberg, and  
11          those who had negative experiences, at least in the --  
12          in past generations and in the past historiography of  
13          child and juvenile migration, would remain silent  
14          because the historiography and the whole ethos, until  
15          really, I think, "Lost Children of the Empire", and  
16          Margaret Humphreys' work, the whole ethos was that this  
17          was something shameful and you had to keep quiet about  
18          it. The pendulum has swung the other way of course and  
19          we do hear much more about the horrific experiences of  
20          many of these individuals in a way that much of the  
21          historiography that I consulted, of which that  
22          historiography was not aware.

23        Q     But what you do say at the very end of this section is  
24           that Quarriers has a well-established practice of  
25           responding fully to requests for information from former

1 migrants.

2 A Yes. That, I think, is based on my conversations with  
3 Bill Dunbar about the correspondence -- and this is  
4 going back to the 1990s -- about the correspondence he  
5 had with people who had been in touch about wanting to  
6 come back to Quarriers and show their families where  
7 they had been brought up, people from Canada, but again  
8 I had returned to what I said about -- you know, the  
9 caveat that I mentioned.

10 Q But at least Quarriers, as an organisation, did have  
11 records on which they could look to, to respond to such  
12 requests.

13 A Yes, and that would have made it considerably easier for  
14 them to do so than organisations like Aberlour or some  
15 of these very small institutions which simply didn't  
16 keep records, or didn't seem to.

17 Q Now, the next section in your report, Marjory, is  
18 headed, "Reformatories and industrial schools", and here  
19 focus on a number of either reformatories or industrial  
20 schools, and in fact you point out the very first  
21 industrial school in Britain was opened in Aberdeen in  
22 1841?

23 A That's correct. Could I just mention one other thing  
24 about Quarriers before we finish?

25 Q Yes of course?

1 A And it relates to 16.39 and the quote there from Winters  
2 to Finlay, and when he says:

3 "I have nothing against the Salvation Army or their  
4 good intentions", et cetera, et cetera.

5 From time to time Quarriers seemed to focus on  
6 a complaint that their work was being tarnished by the  
7 poor practice of others, and we can take that right back  
8 to that 1897 Ontario Act that we mentioned earlier, but  
9 they mentioned Barnardo's, they mentioned BICA and the  
10 Salvation Army, and I think it struck me, as I have  
11 looked through the Quarrier material, that it is often  
12 quite self righteous and points the finger at others but  
13 says, "We didn't indulge in those improper practices".  
14 That's just an observation. I can't quantify that.  
15 Sorry, I just thought I would mention that.

16 Q Thank you for that. Then moving on to reformatories and  
17 industrial schools, and you identify a number of  
18 different institutions, and leaving aside Kibble and I  
19 will come to that in a moment, really the other  
20 institutions you identify played a very minor role --

21 A Yes.

22 Q -- in juvenile migration?

23 A That's correct.

24 Q You identify, for example, Old Mill Reformatory for Boys  
25 in Aberdeen and I think you thought that there was some



1 degree of migration there, but very varied?

2 A It's anecdotal evidence so it's very difficult, again,  
3 to quantify, and it is also difficult because of the  
4 absence or the loss of records of some of these  
5 institutions. I mention Oakbank a little bit later on  
6 I think.

7 Q Oakbank is the next one you do mention, and that  
8 remained in existence until fairly recently?

9 A Yes. I consulted records at Oakbank actually in situ in  
10 either the 1980s or the 1990s. The school closed in the  
11 early 2000s and the records have been lost, so the only  
12 record that exists as far as I'm aware of the fact that  
13 children were migrated from that institution are the --  
14 is in the scrappy notes that I took and which are now in  
15 Aberdeenshire archives.

16 Q And Wellington Farm School which you also mentioned,  
17 there is a reference there to an Inspector's report for  
18 1896 that noted that:

19 "Three or four boys were emigrated every year from  
20 the school with successful results".

21 Is that really as far as it goes?

22 A That's as far as it goes.

23 Q But more involved in migration was Kibble Reformatory.

24 Is that right?

25 A That's correct.

1 Q And we have records of their involvement.

2 A Yes. Voluminous records, and --

3 Q And they have produced a detailed section 21 response to  
4 the Inquiry that I think you have seen?

5 A That's correct.

6 Q It sets out their position. Just looking at 17.12,  
7 paragraph 17.12, you say there that there are records  
8 that indicate that 120 pupils were definitely migrated  
9 from Kibble between 1899 and 1959, 81 to Canada, 38 to  
10 Australia, one to New York, and you give the range of  
11 ages, but only six migrations were recorded after 1930.  
12 Is that correct?

13 A That's correct, and that's from the Section 21 response.

14 Q You yourself haven't seen the records?

15 A I have, yes.

16 Q You have seen them?

17 A Yes. I based that point, and as a footnote, I was  
18 looking at the footnote and the footnote indicates that  
19 I based that statistic on the Section 21 response but I  
20 have looked at a lot of the Kibble records. As I say,  
21 they are very extensive. They often duplicate  
22 information, so it's quite time-consuming, consulting  
23 them.

24 Q What was the set up at Kibble? Was it a training farm  
25 or was it ...

1 A Well, the Kibble originated back in the middle of the  
2 19th century in 1841, I think a philanthropic --

3 Q It was a reformatory?

4 A Yes, it was a reformatory, and the name comes from the  
5 founder, Ms Elizabeth Kibble, and she wanted to  
6 establish an institution, as she said, for the purpose  
7 of reclaiming youthful offenders against the laws, and  
8 they got land in Paisley in 1845, the reformatory opened  
9 in 1859, it accommodated 60 boys at the time it was  
10 opened, and they had all been referred there because of  
11 a sentence imposed by a criminal court, so they were  
12 offenders. Initially, they were sourced locally from  
13 Paisley, from the Ragged and Industrial School, and then  
14 it morphed into the different name, the different  
15 institutional -- it had different institutional names as  
16 time went on.

17 Q It was an approved school --

18 A Approved school, farm school, approved school, list D  
19 school and so forth, and the school roll was about 130  
20 boys before 1950.

21 Q And insofar as juvenile migration was concerned, where  
22 were these juveniles sent?

23 A Canada primarily it seems.

24 Q But were they sent to a particular receiving centre or  
25 was there some other arrangement?

1 A Trying to remember. Sorry, I'm just looking through my  
2 notes to see if I have anything on that, but ...

3 Q I don't think you do, but it may be we can look into  
4 that. I can't remember now if Kibble in their Section  
5 21 response identify a target?

6 A I think if they had it would be in the report.

7 LADY SMITH: You do mention New Brunswick in paragraph  
8 17.17.

9 A Yes. What I'm not sure about is whether they were sent  
10 to an institution, whether it would have been an  
11 institution in New Brunswick. This is pre Cossar, of  
12 course, or whether they had identified farmers to whom  
13 they could be sent or whether they just dropped them on  
14 the quayside and hoped that they could find something.  
15 I suspect there would have been an employer but I don't  
16 think the evidence from Kibble allows me to -- allowed  
17 me to identify.

18 MR MACAULAY: Well, we can look at their report or indeed  
19 some other request if necessary, but what you do tell us  
20 is that the records -- they don't contain any direct  
21 evidence of how children were selected.

22 A That's correct.

23 Q Or any evidence for the procedures for securing consent?

24 A That's correct, and we have to infer the consent,  
25 I think, from many of the records. Sometimes they are

1           equivocal.

2           Q    I think you also say at 17.20 there is no evidence of  
3           systematic identification and scrutiny of the overseas  
4           placements to which the boys were sent.

5           A    Yes, that is correct. As I say, placement took  
6           a variety of forms and placements took a variety of  
7           forms and seemed to have been arranged on an ad hoc  
8           basis. The fact that in 1899 the secretary and chairman  
9           of Kibble liaised with the clerk of the Juvenile  
10          Emigration Delinquency Board and the Canadian government  
11          emigration agent in Glasgow to arrange the migration of  
12          the three boys suggests that the emigration agent  
13          probably had a specific employment in mind for them.  
14          It's not spelled out.

15          Q    At 17.23 you say that in relation to other reformatories  
16          really there is very little that can be reported because  
17          of the lack of information?

18          A    That is correct. I went through, I think, every  
19          reformatory in Scotland and found nothing with the  
20          exception of what's in the report.

21          MR MACAULAY: My Lady, that's 4 o'clock. I'm quite anxious  
22          to press on to try and finish. Possibly another half  
23          hour or so.

24          LADY SMITH: We can have five minutes just now. Is that all  
25          right with you Marjory, to complete your evidence we go

1 another half hour today?

2 A I'm very happy to do whatever suits everybody else.

3 LADY SMITH: That would be really helpful, but let's just  
4 have a five-minute break so that you can get a breather,  
5 as can everybody else, and we will sit again after that.  
6 Thank you.

7 (4.01 pm)

8 (A short break)

9 (4.10 pm)

10 LADY SMITH: Are you ready for us to carry on, Marjory?

11 A I am, thank you.

12 MR MACAULAY: My Lady.

13 The next section, section 18, looks at the Royal  
14 Over-Seas league, ROSL, and you tell us at 18.1 that  
15 this particular organisation was founded in London in  
16 1910 by Sir Evelyn Wrench with the objective of  
17 promoting international friendship and understanding  
18 throughout the Empire, into the Commonwealth and beyond  
19 and it amalgamated with the Patriotic League of Britons  
20 Overseas to become the Over-Seas League and it also had  
21 a base in Edinburgh from about 1927. Is that right?

22 A That's correct.

23 Q How did this organisation become involved in juvenile  
24 migration?

25 A I think by virtue of its overseas tentacles. It had

1           branches across the UK and overseas, and it didn't have  
2           institutions to care for children, but it did, like many  
3           of the other institutions we've looked at, establish  
4           a migration bureau in 1926, so the decade -- of course  
5           the 1920s was the decade which saw this huge upsurge  
6           from emigration from Scotland overall, Scot decade when  
7           the actual population of Scotland dropped  
8           inter-censually, so there were fewer people in 1931 than  
9           there had been in 1921 because there was so much  
10          emigration, so in 1926 it established a migration bureau  
11          initially to support adult emigration, but subsequently,  
12          as I say, to organise the migration of children and  
13          juveniles, but it -- the league, the ROSL as a whole,  
14          its central council, delegated the practicalities of  
15          support for child and juvenile migration to that bureau  
16          after 1928, but we don't know much about it, because no  
17          minutes of the migration bureau meetings have been  
18          located.

19         Q    Do we know that they did exist?

20         A    We know that they did exist, yes, but we don't have any  
21               evidence about what they discussed.

22         Q    And we are told that the Honorary Secretary was Cyril  
23               Bavin whose name we've already heard, between 1920 and  
24               1940, and he was a New Zealand born Australian?

25         A    That's correct, and general -- he will appear later as

1           the General Secretary of the YMCA migration department,  
2           so wearing two hats, supporting migration.

3           Q   Now then, what countries, then, or country, did the  
4           Royal Over-Seas League migrate juvenile migrants to?

5           A   New Zealand and Australia.  In 1940 Bavin was appointed  
6           Liaison Officer between -- sorry, that is to do with  
7           evacuees so that's not relevant, but it's ... I think --  
8           well, primarily New Zealand.  That's the country for  
9           which we have the evidence.

10          Q   And what were the arrangements?  If a child was to be  
11          migrated to New Zealand, would it be to foster care that  
12          that would --

13          A   Yes.  That is correct.  Paragraph 18.6, the ROSL  
14          inaugurated a scheme in 1949 for children and juveniles  
15          to send them to New Zealand with the New Zealand  
16          government's child welfare department sourcing foster  
17          homes for those individuals in the hope that, well, the  
18          expectation that they would be regarded as family  
19          members in those places.

20          Q   And how successful was this particular scheme?

21          A   We don't know really because of lack of records in  
22          making it difficult to assess their migration practices.  
23          We don't have adequate information about selection or  
24          placements.  We don't have adequate information about  
25          monitoring, but there seems to be an element of Bavin's



1 participation that was disingenuous because evidence  
2 presented to the IICSA Inquiry said that Bavin, after  
3 the war, initially indicated that the ROSL's resumption  
4 of child migration work only involved former recruits of  
5 the Children's Overseas Migration Board who wished to  
6 return to Australia, but very few of them came into that  
7 category and ROSL was told by Australian officials to  
8 stop using the Children's Overseas Reception Board  
9 designation for children who were non-CORB migrants, and  
10 it seems also from evidence to IICSA that the British  
11 government had reservations about the ROSL being  
12 approved as a sending organisation because it didn't  
13 have expertise in selection, it didn't seem to have  
14 structures to provide reports on welfare after  
15 migration, so it is difficult to evaluate its  
16 effectiveness, but those comments indicate that there  
17 were reservations about its activities.

18 We don't have, as I say, comprehensive or specific  
19 reports relating to either selection, consent, choice of  
20 destination, monitoring, or, indeed, any aspect of the  
21 care of those whom it -- whose emigration it supervised.  
22 We don't really know how potential migrants were put  
23 forward. It may have been that they were put forward by  
24 institutions in their home areas, by individuals in  
25 their home areas, and that applications were sent to

1 ROSL's migration bureau, but because of the lack of  
2 records we can't say categorically. As far as, you  
3 know, New Zealand, it appears that the applications were  
4 passed to New Zealand House for consideration, and the  
5 final decision was made by a committee that included  
6 representatives from the British and New Zealand  
7 governments and ROSL, and probably something similar  
8 with those sent to Australia, but it --

9 Q And I think you talk about this in your report, that  
10 fairly recently there was the discovery of a photograph  
11 album?

12 A Yes. That came fairly late in the day, this photograph  
13 album that was entitled, "Photographs of Children  
14 Migrating to New Zealand", and this was in a number of  
15 parties, and in a number of these cases the places of  
16 origin and the ages of the children are stated, and they  
17 do include recruits, quite a number of recruits from  
18 Scotland, various parts of Scotland, and some of them  
19 were over school leaving age and I give some examples.  
20 Sometimes the ages aren't stated, but looking at the  
21 photographs the assumption is that these were juveniles  
22 rather than children.

23 Q And did you identify, from these photographs, that there  
24 were some children there who were going to Dhurringile  
25 in Australia?

1 A Yes I did, yes.

2 Q And they were child migrants as opposed to --

3 A Yes. Two parties of boys that went to Dhurringile.

4 Q And who was doing the migrating? Was that the Royal  
5 Over-Seas League, or...

6 A It is difficult to identify. Dhurringile was  
7 a Presbyterian, Church of Scotland institution.

8 Q Yes?

9 A But because they -- the names appear in ROSL materials,  
10 it would indicate that the ROSL was certainly involved  
11 as facilitator or agent. It's not very clear, I think.

12 Q But as I have said, it's not clear at all as to how  
13 those children got into the hands of the ROSL?

14 A No. Lack of sources prevents us from being definitive  
15 about that.

16 Q Well, in the next section you look at the Salvation  
17 Army's involvement in juvenile migration. Well, perhaps  
18 just before we do that, just to remind ourselves in  
19 relation to numbers, that estimated that about 80  
20 juvenile migrants were sent by the ROSL of Scottish  
21 juvenile migrants?

22 A Yes.

23 Q Now, the Salvation Army then. If we look at its  
24 involvement, it had -- it played quite a significant  
25 role, did it, or a fairly significant role?

1 A Yes. I mean, we've estimated a thousand.

2 Q A thousand from Scotland?

3 A A thousand from Scotland, yes. Juveniles. Both boys  
4 and girls, but the Salvation Army was another  
5 institution that had a long track record in terms of  
6 supporting and implementing assisted migration schemes  
7 going back, really, to its Victorian days.

8 Q Because it was involved with families, for example. Not  
9 just children, but with the emigration of families?

10 A With the emigration of families after the First World  
11 War, with the emigration of war widows and their  
12 children and the unemployed.

13 Q And were they exclusively connected with Canada or did  
14 they migrate -- juvenile migrants to Australia or any  
15 other countries?

16 A Not exclusively Canada, no. I think late next year  
17 the -- my report I talk about Australia.

18 Q And can you tell me how they organised their processes,  
19 then? Again, did they make contact with institutions or  
20 with families, had people come to them? Can you tell me  
21 how it worked in practice?

22 A Well, from early days the Salvation Army had a migration  
23 department. In fact, 1903 it had -- it created a  
24 Migration and Settlement Department, and this was  
25 because it felt it needed to formalise its ad hoc

1 arrangements for sending people from Britain overseas  
2 because they'd already got an information service that  
3 offered advice on destinations and travelling  
4 arrangements and employment opportunities and they were  
5 focusing very much on working class emigrants so they  
6 formalised this through the Migration and Settlement  
7 Department created in 1903, and then for three decades  
8 that Migration and Settlement Department hosted lecture  
9 programmes, it would screen applicants and assist  
10 selected emigrants through a special loan fund, and then  
11 after 1922 it became eligible for funding under the  
12 Empire Settlement Act. It supervised passages. It  
13 would charter ships to send emigrants. I'm talking  
14 about Canada in this period, and they would set up  
15 labour bureaux on board these ships so that the  
16 Salvation Army offices in the UK would liaise with their  
17 counterparts in, for example, Toronto in advance of a  
18 party leaving to find out what opportunities there were  
19 for specific employment, and then operate these labour  
20 bureaux on board ships.

21 LADY SMITH: Marjory, can I just ask you to slow down? The  
22 reason why is you may not appreciate, but everything you  
23 say is being transcribed by somebody who is not in this  
24 building, and is somewhere else, and my text has  
25 stopped. I'm not quite sure whether it's a problem with

1           them catching up or not. It stopped from the  
2           question, "From early days the Salvation Army had a --  
3           sorry, your answer:

4           "From early days the Salvation Army had a migration  
5           department, in fact 19 ..."

6           And I have got nothing after that.

7           A I apologise my Lady.

8           LADY SMITH: It's not your fault. It's not ideal that  
9           I don't have somebody actually here in the room.

10          A I will slow down.

11          LADY SMITH: Try slowing down and they may catch up.  
12          Everything is being recorded, so there will be  
13          a recording for the people responsible for the  
14          transcription to catch up from the recording, but  
15          perhaps if you just talk a little more slowly it may  
16          help them. (Pause)

17          Oh, have they got a technical problem? I did  
18          wonder. Is she hearing or what? (Pause)

19          She is restarting now. Okay. (Pause)

20          Right. Let's carry on then. Yes.

21          MR MACAULAY: Good. I think the message you were portraying  
22          there, Marjory, is that it was a fairly large  
23          organisation that -- you said they chartered ships, for  
24          example.

25          A That's correct.

- 1 Q I was just going to ask you for the migrants who were  
2 left in this country, say to Canada or Australia, did  
3 they go to Salvation Army outposts? What was the set  
4 up? Where did they go?
- 5 A They would -- in terms of -- by, "Outposts", do you mean  
6 Salvation Army institutions?
- 7 Q Yes. Yes.
- 8 A They would be taken initially, I understand, to  
9 a Salvation Army hostel or receiving institution in the  
10 host country, but almost -- well, either that or they  
11 would be met by a Salvation Army officer at port of  
12 landing, and if employment had been secured, as indeed  
13 it often was because of these labour bureaux on board  
14 ship, they would then be directed immediately to that  
15 employment, so they might pass through a hostel or they  
16 might simply be met and directed by Salvation Army  
17 officers to their place of employment.
- 18 Q Would the place of employment be a farm or some other  
19 type of employment?
- 20 A Most likely a farm if we are talking about male  
21 migrants, most likely domestic service if we are talking  
22 about female migrants.
- 23 Q And just looking to general numbers for the country as  
24 a whole, in 19.3 you say that by the 1930s the Salvation  
25 Army had sent over 2000 migrants.

1 A 200,000.

2 Q 200,000 migrants, most to Canada and Australia, but that  
3 included families. We are not just talking about --

4 A Yes.

5 Q -- young migrants.

6 A That's all-encompassing.

7 Q Including, as you point out, war widows and their  
8 children.

9 A Yes. But the Salvation Army in the early 20th century  
10 advertised itself as the world's largest emigration  
11 agency in its publicity.

12 Q And so far as selection was concerned, and you look at  
13 that, it's 19.7, what were you able to ascertain in  
14 relation to how the Salvation Army would select, in  
15 particular, juvenile migrants?

16 A Well, as I say, the procedure, the policy and procedures  
17 were well-documented from an early stage in the  
18 Salvation Army's history, and I think that reflects its  
19 very highly-structured role as a kind of paramilitary  
20 sort of -- an organisation modelled on the army, so its  
21 handbook entitled, "Orders and Regulations for the  
22 Social Officers of the Salvation Army", has these two  
23 long chapters, and from 1898 chapters that included  
24 migration, and one of which dealt specifically with the  
25 migration of young people. In terms of selection the



1           army did begin, the Salvation Army did begin with this  
2           basic premise that juveniles were particularly adaptable  
3           and were particularly -- made particularly good  
4           migrants, more so than adults because they were not set  
5           in their ways, they were malleable, they were adaptable,  
6           so in making a selection the book said that general  
7           suitability was the all-important question, but it drew  
8           juveniles from all parts of the United Kingdom, from all  
9           sorts of backgrounds, and during the first year of that  
10          Scheme --

11         Q    There was a particular Scheme --

12         A    That's the 1920 Scheme, yes.

13         Q    Where you tell us that the successful applicants aged  
14           14-19 were either sent to the Salvation Army's training  
15           centre at Hadleigh, Essex, for three months' basic  
16           instruction -- is that instruction in farming work?

17         A    Primarily in farming work, yes.

18         Q    And then sent to the arranged positions on overseas  
19           farms, or in the case of Australia, New Zealand, trained  
20           on arrival at farms, and you mentioned Riverview, and I  
21           will come to Riverview in a moment, but the selection  
22           process does identify a number of principal  
23           characteristics, because -- and I think this is where I  
24           got my height of five foot four inches, but if you wore  
25           glasses that seemed to be -- it would be a non-starter

1           for this process?

2           A    That's correct, but then was that not the case with the  
3           police?

4           Q    You go on to say that meticulous financial records were  
5           kept by the Salvation Army.

6           A    Correct. Yes. I think quite a lot of the material that  
7           was supplied to us from the Salvation Army, the original  
8           documents, constituted accounts, very detailed accounts.

9           Q    And as far as aftercare was concerned, you look at that  
10          at 19.11, and you -- I think you tell us that that is  
11          described in a number of pamphlets, the most detailed  
12          description was provided by David Lamb, and he was  
13          a Scot, I think. Is that right?

14          A    Yes. He came from Brechin in Angus and he was the --

15          Q    He was the Commissioner.

16          A    -- the Commissioner and oversaw migration for many  
17          years. Now, I think his personal records were amongst  
18          those that were destroyed in The Blitz.

19          Q    He certainly was a real supporter of migration?

20          A    Very much so.

21          Q    That comes out, I think, from his work?

22          A    Yes, and an ardent imperialist.

23          Q    So in paragraph 19.11 we are told, for example, of the  
24          Salvation Army Year Book for 1925 reported that officers  
25          visited sites to which migrants would be sent, both

1           before and after the migration process, and that's,  
2           again, I think, repeated for the 1937 year?

3       A    Yes. That's correct.

4       Q    So there were processes in place.

5       A    Yes.

6       Q    To ...

7       A    Again, I think that's a reflection, as with some of the  
8           other institutions that we scrutinised, of the longevity  
9           of the institution and the ability to set processes in  
10          place more readily if we are looking at older  
11          institutions where they have possibly, possibly not,  
12          learned from experience.

13      Q    And Mr Lamb in particular seemed to be aware of the fact  
14          that there was the risk of abuse in the aftercare  
15          arrangements which drew from him the comment that:

16                 "Efficient oversight will prevent abuses".

17      A    Yes. So he was -- his ear was attuned to the  
18          possibility of abuse.

19      Q    Here in 19.14 no doubt to promote its own success, the  
20          Salvation Army was able to cite a low rate of return as  
21          proof of success.

22      A    Yes. As always we would take with a pinch of salt  
23          self-declaration of success, but it's unclear, I think,  
24          the nature of the return -- "Had been returned", implies  
25          unwilling return, possible deportation, so it is

1           unclear, but they said that 85 per cent were still  
2           employed on the land but I don't know from where they  
3           got their statistics.

4           Q   It too, I think, has been accused of exploiting  
5           children, has it not? You mention that in the next  
6           paragraph.

7           A   That's correct, yes. Of course, as a historian, what I  
8           try to do in all my work is to look for corroborative  
9           evidence and fit different parts of this evidential  
10          jigsaw together and to find information from, for  
11          example, the press about exploitation, allows me to cast  
12          a question mark on some of the self-declaration of the  
13          Salvation Army's own sources.

14          Q   Now, at 19.18 you, in respect of Canada, say,  
15          notwithstanding much of the preparatory work, there were  
16          failures.

17          A   Yes, sorry, which paragraph?

18          Q   19.18.

19          A   Yes. This didn't - this was an attempt which didn't  
20          really get off the ground. Are we talking about the 1958  
21          scheme?

22          Q   Yes.

23          A   Yes. Lots of correspondence and discussion but nothing  
24          seeming to happen.

25          Q   So then move to Australia.

1 A Yes.

2 Q I think most of the material there relates to the  
3 training, Riverview near Brisbane.

4 A Yes.

5 Q I do think we do look at that, I think, in the other  
6 report, but did that also accommodate juvenile migrants?

7 A Yes it did.

8 Q And again it was designed to train migrants for farming.

9 A Correct. They were to receive training for up to six  
10 months before being placed with a farmer, a so-called  
11 suitable farmer.

12 Q But insofar as Riverview was concerned, the number of  
13 juvenile migrants that passed through its doors was  
14 relatively small?

15 A It is indeed, yes. We're talking more about child  
16 migrants there.

17 Q And at paragraph 19.24, and we will look at this in  
18 the -- in relation to child migration, there were  
19 criticisms made, particularly, I think, in the Ross  
20 report, 1956, certainly in relation to the nature of the  
21 accommodation at Riverview, it being, I think,  
22 dilapidated.

23 A That's correct, dilapidated with inadequate facilities,  
24 and also with abuse. Food fit only for pigs. This was  
25 not -- this was in a letter, sorry, rather than the Ross

1 report, but ...

2 Q Now, so far as evidence of Scottish involvement in the  
3 Salvation Army's juvenile migration Scheme, as I  
4 understand from what you say at paragraph 19.27, there  
5 is very little evidence, in fact, and it is anecdotal.

6 A That's correct. The Salvation Army evidence submitted  
7 that it didn't think it ever had establishments in  
8 Scotland that had, as their primary or routine function  
9 the migration of children or juveniles overseas, and it  
10 is assumed that any who went weren't sent out through  
11 the UK wide schemes and although Lamb was a Scott and  
12 although Scot citadels all over Scotland, it was  
13 organised very much as a UK-wide and indeed  
14 international organisation and the training farm was at  
15 Hadleigh -- the main training farm was at Hadleigh in  
16 Essex.

17 Q But according to the figures you have produced,  
18 nevertheless there were involved at least to the extent  
19 of about 1,000, the migration of 1,000 juvenile  
20 migrants?

21 A It would seem so, yes.

22 Q The records were destroyed in The Blitz?

23 A Many of them, yes.

24 Q So that...

25 (Pause for technical issue)

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Mr MacAulay, everything was lost to  
2 the transcribers after the exchange, "Records were  
3 destroyed in The Blitz, many of them, yes, so that".

4 MR MACAULAY: So that really interfered with your ability to  
5 research.

6 A That is correct, although it might be possible if we  
7 were to consult the records in the host countries to  
8 plug some of those gaps, but, as I said this morning, it  
9 was -- I understand -- beyond the remit of this Inquiry  
10 to request records from those host nations.

11 Q But looking to the sources of the juvenile migrants that  
12 were sent overseas by the Salvation Army, although the  
13 Salvation Army had, I think, two institutions in  
14 Scotland, you mentioned those at paragraph 19.27, the  
15 one at Redheugh and also Mount Bruce and Pollokshields.  
16 None of these places seem to have been involved in  
17 migration.

18 A That would be correct.

19 Q You've got no evidence of them --

20 A No evidence of their involvement.

21 Q Very well. Could we then look at the final  
22 organisation, because it begins with a Y, so that's the  
23 YMCA. You provide us, at 20.1, with the history, and in  
24 particular it is to provide young men working in cities  
25 with opportunities for a Christian fellowship,

1 recreation and ultimately accommodation. That's the --  
2 what is said, but also is a bit like the Salvation Army,  
3 developed a sophisticated international network.

4 A That's correct, and I suppose another parallel with an  
5 English capacity would be the Girls' Friendly Society  
6 that I mentioned earlier, because of the nature of its  
7 work in assisting those who were travelling and  
8 migrating, it developed a more specific interest in  
9 migration work. It was already involved with receiving  
10 and catering for the welfare of new arrivals, it had  
11 hostels, and, you know, that led on to it establishing  
12 an emigration department in 1909 within the YMCA's  
13 World's Committee.

14 Q And I think Mr Bavin who we mentioned before, he was  
15 also involved with the YMCA?

16 A Oh, he appeared again, yes. He was General Secretary.  
17 I don't know when he began to be General Secretary, but  
18 in 1922 he was serving in that capacity and he visited  
19 Canada, Australia and New Zealand at the invitation of  
20 churches in those three dominions.

21 Q Now, I think you tell us that the YMCA had involvement  
22 in particular with Australia. Was it involved in  
23 Canada?

24 A Yes it was, but I think by the time it was most heavily  
25 involved in emigration, the focus had shifted to



1           Australia. The one thing that comes to my mind as I  
2           speak about the YMCA is a film clip that I use with my  
3           students that illustrates migration to Canada in the  
4           1920s, and it's from -- I think it's filmed in  
5           Cowdenbeath or at least the boys -- sorry -- where the  
6           migrants were embarking on the ship, but I think many of  
7           those who were migrating were unemployed miners and  
8           juveniles from areas like the deprived mining  
9           communities around Fife, and one of the banners that  
10          appears in that film is a YMCA banner, so they were very  
11          much involved in the '20s in encouraging the emigration  
12          of boys from what they called, "Blind alley  
13          occupations", or from a background of unemployment, and  
14          it was -- I mean, that film shows them going to Canada,  
15          but they were also going to -- very much to Australia as  
16          well.

17         Q    I think you tell us at 20.4 that by its own account the  
18             YMCA, by 1930, had organised the settlement of 1,500  
19             migrants in Australia, but mainly in farm work and  
20             domestic service. Does that indicate that these would  
21             be juvenile migrants?

22         A    I think they would have included juvenile migrants.  
23             They wouldn't necessarily have been juveniles. I mean,  
24             the YMCA's remit, I think, extended beyond --

25         Q    But again we are looking at that sort of occupation.

1 A Yes indeed, yes.

2 Q Can you help me with this; how did the YMCA then recruit  
3 migrants in this country?

4 A By networking with churches and para church  
5 organisations. I'm looking for the relevant paragraph  
6 in which I explain this further, and by networking with  
7 its counterparts on the other side of the Atlantic and  
8 in Australia. Sorry, which --

9 Q Well, I think 20.2 you talk about, first of all, the  
10 invitation from churches and the dominions --

11 A Oh, this is when Bavin visited.

12 Q Yes.

13 A So, yes, it was the nomination Scheme, the church  
14 nomination Scheme. This, again, the Empire Settlement  
15 Act had a bearing on that co-operative nomination Scheme  
16 because, as we saw earlier, one of the conditions of  
17 getting -- of obtaining funding under the Empire  
18 Settlement Act was that the Schemes were to be  
19 collaborative between Britain and the dominion, or  
20 dominions, so churches and charities, as I say, in the  
21 dominions, would appoint local committees. Those  
22 committees would liaise in the locality with potential  
23 employers and residents, obtain guarantees of employment  
24 and accommodation, and they would nominate eligible  
25 categories of settlers, not named settlers, but

1 categories of settlers to their government and  
2 immigration departments, and then initial recruitment  
3 would be undertaken in the UK by the counterparts or the  
4 agents of those organisations. This is where the  
5 collaboration came in.

6 Q You mention networking. I think you also indicate that  
7 there was a connection with Quarriers.

8 A Yes.

9 Q That's at 20.4, towards the end. For example, the YMCA  
10 became the sending agency for some Quarriers children,  
11 not juveniles --

12 A Yes.

13 Q -- to Burnside in 1939?

14 A Yes, and that has come from the National Archives of  
15 Australia. Yes.

16 Q And Quarriers' narrative of facts, so I think that's all  
17 I know about that. I don't know the mechanism by which  
18 it was effected. I think because the YMCA had  
19 a sophisticated sending mechanism, it became an obvious  
20 conduit for the transfer of juveniles and others from  
21 other institutions.

22 Q And how did its involvement in migration generally come  
23 to an end?

24 A Depression, I think, contributed to that. As with many  
25 other institutions the --

1 Q And in any event, come the 1950s, '60s the child  
2 migration schemes were drying up.

3 A Yes. Yes. I'm just looking through my notes to see  
4 what I said about the demise of those schemes, but, yes,  
5 they came to a natural end. I mean, in many ways, the  
6 war, the Second World War was a hinge. The depression  
7 followed by the war before the -- these institutions  
8 had -- before they felt they could get up and running  
9 again the war came along and then changed conditions  
10 after the war.

11 Q And do we know anything about what steps the YMCA took  
12 to see how juvenile migrants that had been migrated were  
13 cared for after they had been sent to the overseas  
14 country?

15 A They co-operated with the churches and parachurch  
16 organisations and I think relied heavily on them to  
17 implement the aftercare.

18 Q And perhaps finally, although I think we may have looked  
19 at this before, but the total you identify from Scotland  
20 for juvenile migrants is in the region of 500.

21 A Yes.

22 Q Is that to Canada and Australia?

23 A Yes.

24 Q Can I look quickly at this section you have in your  
25 report at section 22 that has the head, "Changes in

1 Contemporary Attitudes"? Can you just summarise for me  
2 what you are seeking to set out there?

3 A That in the -- for much of the history of these  
4 institutions there was a very firm belief that their  
5 policies were legitimate and admirable because they were  
6 addressing the practical issue of demand and supply and  
7 a perceived surplus of the particular type of migrant in  
8 Scotland and the UK and a deficit of that particular  
9 type of migrant, as long as that migrant was interested  
10 in going into farm work or domestic service in the host  
11 countries, so it was seen as a practical way to solve  
12 a perceived imbalance in supply and demand. I have  
13 already mentioned the blind alley occupations and the  
14 unemployment of the 1920s. It was felt it was  
15 a particular way to address that sort of issue, and that  
16 those in Scotland not least would benefit by being  
17 relocated to the dominions in an era when unemployment  
18 was considerable in Scotland, but there was -- and there  
19 was very little discussion in any of the documents that  
20 I have consulted of the deeper ethics of the practice of  
21 migrating young people. It was simply assumed that this  
22 was in the best interests of the child -- sorry -- of  
23 the juvenile, and, as I say, not surprisingly, the  
24 migrants' correspondence was overwhelmingly positive,  
25 although there are hints, occasional hints of problems

1           like homesickness and uncongenial placement, so we have  
2           to read between the lines there.

3           As I say, in the second paragraph of the section on  
4           changes in contemporary attitudes, the backdrop was one  
5           of imperial agendas and imperial rhetoric which, until  
6           the First World War, was a confident imperialism. After  
7           the First World War was a more defensive backfoot  
8           imperialism, a fear that the Empire was crumbling, and  
9           that something needed to be done to bolster it, and this  
10          endorsed the view that the Empire, the dominions, would  
11          be -- that it was a viable and legitimate policy to  
12          populate these dominions with what was commonly referred  
13          to as, "Good British stock", and in an Australian  
14          context in particular, that meant, as we've already  
15          discussed, white British stock because it bolstered the  
16          White Australia Policy which went on until the early  
17          1970s. As I mentioned earlier, and I mentioned here, it  
18          wasn't simply institutions that sent children overseas,  
19          it was not uncommon for parents to send adolescent  
20          children abroad unaccompanied, simply in the belief that  
21          migration would offer them a better life in another part  
22          of what was seen as a greater Britain, the Empire was  
23          seen as a greater Britain, and they might have recourse  
24          to organisations like the Big Brother Movement or the  
25          Dreadnought Scheme or the Salvation Army, depending on

1           their income level and circumstances, but they might  
2           simply send children out to relatives or acquaintances.

3           The whole ethical issue, the ethics of migrating  
4           both children and juveniles came under increasing  
5           scrutiny during the 20th century, but that's not to say  
6           that there wasn't disquiet earlier, and I came across an  
7           article in the Glasgow Herald, stinging press criticism,  
8           and this was from 1883, an article that acknowledged the  
9           benevolent motives of some of the practitioners of child  
10          and juvenile emigration, but criticised the unregulated  
11          nature of how children were shipped off by autocratic  
12          individuals who brooked no challenge to their authority.  
13          Now that was 1883, and I think they may have -- well  
14          have had in mind there Quarrier and Barnardo who were  
15          the -- at that stage -- the main practitioners, so  
16          that's quite early, but the decision-making does seem to  
17          have been arbitrary, and the ethical issues were  
18          increasingly addressed in the later period after the  
19          First World War, and, as we've said earlier, new  
20          philosophies of child care came into being and began to  
21          stress the importance of maintaining the family unit in  
22          a way that had definitely not been the case earlier. In  
23          fact, the policies of some of these institutions that  
24          migrated children, the policies of those institutions  
25          had run a coach and horses through maintaining families

1           together. They sometimes very often deliberately  
2           separated siblings so the concern in the 20th century  
3           was to maintain the family unit, concerns were raised  
4           about the damaging psychological effects of separation,  
5           separating siblings and separating children from  
6           surviving parents or family back in Scotland, and then  
7           again, as I have already mentioned, politically the  
8           movement came under attack from the British labour  
9           movement, it claimed it was a device to support existing  
10          elitist social structures and to divert attention from  
11          the need for state welfare provision, and we've talked  
12          about the Bondfield delegation and the Bondfield Report  
13          which generally endorsed the movement, but did say, of  
14          course, that these children were being sent out to  
15          Canada primarily to work, and, therefore, they should  
16          not be sent if they were below school leaving age,  
17          because one of the abuses of the child migration was  
18          that children who should have been sent to school were  
19          deprived of an education because the households to which  
20          they were sent didn't want a child, they didn't want to  
21          nurture a child within a family unit, they wanted  
22          a working pair of hands, and one of the most disquieting  
23          elements of this early movement was, for example, with  
24          Quarriers, if you -- they could send out a child at any  
25          age and the potential for disruption when that child



1 moved from being a very young child to being maybe,  
2 well, I think the cut-off was eight years old and then  
3 twelve years old, and the potential that they had from  
4 being moved from household to household -- a household  
5 that might have initially taken a child because they  
6 would get some income for it because it was very young,  
7 then got no income when it was eight and then had to pay  
8 it a wage when it was twelve, so there was a lot of  
9 disruptive practice there, so although the Bondfield  
10 Report generally endorsed the movement and didn't refer  
11 to abuse, it did recommend that state-funded migration  
12 of those, only of those over school leaving age should  
13 be allowed, and that recommendation was accepted, and  
14 then the -- as the century went on, of course, and as  
15 you will no doubt explore in your discussions with  
16 Professor Constantine, the ethos changed very much in  
17 the second half of the 20th century with the Curtis  
18 Report and then the Children Act of 1948. That's the  
19 British dimension.

20 On the Canadian -- do you wish me to continue?

21 Q Yes.

22 A On the Canadian side, the attitudes towards the juvenile  
23 migrants seem to have been ambivalent at least, and  
24 again we come back to George Bogue Smart. He argued  
25 strongly in support of the practice, this is going in an

1 address to the Kiwanis Club in Montreal in February  
2 1924, but as we've seen he was alert to problems with  
3 the movement as well, and I quote his -- I don't wish to  
4 use up your time by going through the extract from that  
5 speech at length, but he does -- his speech was reported  
6 in detail in the Montreal Gazette and he talked about  
7 juvenile immigration transcending in importance any  
8 other form of immigration in the 1920s, and he advocated  
9 it in very strong terms, but his endorsement sat  
10 uneasily and differed markedly from critical judgments  
11 made by other elements in Canadian society, notably  
12 Trade Unionists and more murkily eugenicists. Juvenile  
13 and child immigration to Canada was criticised by Trade  
14 Unionists on the grounds that cheap labour was being  
15 imported, and I think some of the evidence we have seen  
16 from the institutions that we have examined today would  
17 support that accusation, that many Canadian farmers were  
18 simply looking for cheap labour. The eugenicists, of  
19 course, argued that those who were being brought in were  
20 not deprived, they were depraved, they were degenerate  
21 and should be excluded, so there was that eugenic  
22 dimension, and then professional childcare specialists,  
23 whom we've already talked about, they were subscribing  
24 to new thinking and increasingly critical of the  
25 practice, and then with reports of suicides, not least

1           those suicides in the 1920s, there was disquiet on both  
2           sides of the Atlantic.

3           As I say, we've seen Bogue Smart's concerns about  
4           the Gagetown Farm, Cossars Farm, Canadian hostility  
5           increased in the face of the depression by the end of  
6           the decade which I think again is another reflection of  
7           how the primary concern of the recipients of many of  
8           these migrants was an economic concern, it wasn't  
9           a welfare concern.

10          The Canadian, as I say -- in terms of Quarriers, if  
11          we look at a comment by William Douglas who was  
12          a superintendent of Quarriers in 1929, he talked about  
13          an unfavourable attitude towards emigration by potential  
14          migrants and their relatives back in Scotland and the  
15          UK, and Claude Winters over in Fairknowe in Ontario  
16          attributed that reluctance and that concern to  
17          exaggerated reports about bad conditions in Canada, and  
18          Winters, as we saw to some extent when we were looking  
19          at the Quarrier material, he did try to liaise with  
20          Canadian Social Workers to try and improve the  
21          reputation, or maintain the reputation of Quarriers, and  
22          he referred to discussions about the possible resumption  
23          of the movement being politically and financially  
24          sensitive, so they had to be shrouded -- discussions had  
25          to be shrouded in secrecy, and what happened, of course,

1 in Canada was because of all these problems and host of  
2 others, the spotlight shifted to Australia where, of  
3 course, the agenda became even murkier in a later  
4 period.

5 I should perhaps mention something that didn't  
6 come -- I didn't -- well, it is tangential, I think, but  
7 I will still mention it, in 1987 a film was released  
8 called, "Heaven on Earth", and it is a Canadian film,  
9 and it is about children and teenagers who were sent  
10 from a fictional place in Wales and England to Canada  
11 and how the children adapted or not to their new  
12 surroundings. It's a film directed by a man called Alan  
13 Kroeker written by Margaret Atwood and Peter Pearson and  
14 again it is a film I use with students because it  
15 demonstrates very clearly how the fate of the individual  
16 depended very much on what one might call the luck of  
17 the draw, the location to which the child or the  
18 juvenile was sent, whether that person was well-treated  
19 or abused, but with no regulation and very often  
20 communities closing ranks against the child who  
21 complained.

22 Q Well, thank you for that insight into the changing  
23 attitudes, and the final section, then, of your report  
24 has the head, "Quality of care, evidence of abuse,  
25 deportations". Let's -- I'm conscious of the time, and

1 not to delay you too long, but records, of course, as  
2 you have already said, are very important in seeing what  
3 the quality of care might have been, where there is  
4 evidence of abuse and so on. Is that right? And that's  
5 one of the points you are making here.

6 A Yes. Records are the basis on which I have written  
7 everything that I have written about child and juvenile  
8 migration. You know, you began the day by talking about  
9 my CV. When I started to work on this, it was as an  
10 element of a much wider study of migration, and I  
11 approached the topic with a blank sheet, really, and let  
12 the evidence speak to me so that I was looking at why  
13 the movement arose, the experiences of the individuals  
14 and the legacies of that, of those experiences, and that  
15 led me to conclude that there were both good and bad  
16 experiences. It is only in more recent years as the  
17 emphasis of the historiography has shifted from the --  
18 well, has shifted more to the -- shifted from benign to  
19 critical that I have begun to scrutinise my sources in  
20 more detail, because that was not so possible, I think,  
21 when I began my work.

22 Q One of the conclusions you come to, you set it out, and  
23 this is all the information you have looked at, is that  
24 attitudes were too casual and too much was taken on  
25 trust.

1       A    Yes.  I would reiterate that.  That's my conclusion from  
2       the vast volume of evidence that I have consulted, that  
3       intentions may have been good, but too much was taken on  
4       trust.  There was a huge amount of naivete and another  
5       very important point was that resources were inadequate,  
6       and I think organisations in Scotland which sent  
7       children to Canada and Australia, I think  
8       particularly -- well, my knowledge is more of Canada --  
9       were totally unaware of the distances involved, and the  
10      impracticality of maintaining supervision and aftercare  
11      when children and juveniles were scattered across these  
12      huge distances.  I don't think they deliberately set out  
13      to create the conditions for abuse, but that's what  
14      happened, simply because they were unaware of the  
15      impossibility of keeping tabs on what the children and  
16      juveniles were experiencing.

17      Q    And you summarise for us in following paragraphs  
18      comments you have already made about selection  
19      processes, monitoring thereafter, some good, some bad  
20      practice.  I think you mentioned that in paragraph 23.4?

21      A    Yes.

22      Q    And you provide some examples, particularly in reference  
23      to Aberlour, in relation to things like loneliness and  
24      happiness and so on, and the conditions of children that  
25      were there?

1 A Yes.

2 Q Return migration you say at paragraph 23.8 might be seen  
3 as an indicator of abuse. How strong can you be in that  
4 sort of comment?

5 A I would hedge it about with caveats because of lack of  
6 evidence, but return migration within the context of  
7 emigration of juveniles from institutions would be seen  
8 in terms of the failure, or might well be seen in terms  
9 of the failure of that individual to adapt, to  
10 integrate, to assimilate to the society of the host  
11 country because the whole remit of these institutions  
12 was to migrate children as a permanent solution to  
13 problems, not to migrate them and have them come back,  
14 as would be the case with many of the migrants in the  
15 wider tapestry of migration, so abuse in the sense of  
16 what had happened to them while they were overseas that  
17 triggered their migration, whether it was through  
18 deportation or through their own volition, and abuse in  
19 the -- with the -- in the possible sense of the stigma  
20 that was attached to them, and what aftercare might be  
21 given to them when they returned.

22 Q You mentioned deportation and you provide us with  
23 a snapshot of deportations at paragraph 23.10 for the  
24 year 1933/34 that reveals that 149 juveniles had been  
25 deported back to Canada, to Britain from Canada, and of

1 course deportation implies that it is the country, tells  
2 us it is the country that is removing the individual  
3 from the country, and the point you make, one of the  
4 points you make, is that that in itself could very  
5 probably have a stigma from the perspective of the  
6 person being deported.

7 A Yes. Undoubtedly I think, and going back to our  
8 discussions earlier when we were talking about  
9 Quarriers, Quarriers' reluctance to have juveniles sent  
10 back under deportation orders because of the way that  
11 might reflect on its reputation.

12 Q Well, very well Marjory. Those are all the questions I  
13 have for you. I have had questions submitted generally  
14 for experts, but I don't think they really impact upon  
15 your evidence and I will reserve these for other  
16 witnesses.

17 A Thank you.

18 MR MACAULAY: Thank you very much indeed for all the work,  
19 impressive work that you have done on behalf of the  
20 Inquiry.

21 A Thank you for your patience with me, and I would simply  
22 say that I have been very fortunate, and I said at the  
23 beginning, with the help of Andressa, but also my  
24 colleagues, Professor Constantine and Professor Lynch.  
25 I have also been fortunate in that the detailed scrutiny



1           that's been my part of this investigation has not  
2           involved me in the harrowing evidence of people who are  
3           still alive, because I have been dealing more with the  
4           19th century and more with background information, so I  
5           have been spared much of what my colleagues have not  
6           been spared.

7           MR MACAULAY: Thank you.

8           LADY SMITH: Could I just check whether there are any  
9           outstanding applications for questions of this witness?  
10          None in the room and I'm not getting any notification of  
11          any from those who aren't in the room.

12          Marjory, before I let you go, please can I pay  
13          tribute to you, just as you have done to Andressa, the  
14          work you have done for us has been enormous, detailed,  
15          hard, I'm sure, and invaluable. It's a terrific  
16          contribution to the work I'm doing here, and I'm really,  
17          really grateful to you. Thank you for that.

18          A    Thank you my Lady. It's been a privilege.

19          LADY SMITH: Thank you. Well, I will now rise for today,  
20          and we sit again at 10 o'clock tomorrow morning. Thank  
21          you.

22          (5.09 pm)

23          (The hearing adjourned to 10 am on 17 September 2020)

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I N D E X

MARJORY-ANN DENOON HARPER (sworn) .....1  
Questioned by MR MACAULAY .....1