

Wednesday, 1 December 2021

1

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning. We carry on of course today with  
4 more evidence in relation to the provision of  
5 residential care for children at Fettes College.

6 Mr Brown, you're going to tell me what's going to happen  
7 next, I think.

8 MR BROWN: My Lady, we are going to have a live witness, who  
9 is 'Andrew'. But just to alert everyone, today is going  
10 to be a short day because of movements in other  
11 witnesses. We have a witness who has taken unwell so  
12 he's being accommodated in other ways. That's meant  
13 a rejigging of the running order so that's why today  
14 will be short so that tomorrow and Friday can be  
15 hopefully fuller days.

16 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

17 MR BROWN: So we start with a live witness and then some  
18 brief read-ins.

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you. And am I right in thinking this is  
20 the witness with the pseudonym 'Andrew'?

21 MR BROWN: That's correct, my Lady.

22 'Andrew' (affirmed)

23 A. Sorry, bear with me.

24 LADY SMITH: Just take your time, 'Andrew', there's no rush.

25 In the red folder you'll see you've got a hard copy

1 of your statement. It will also come up on screen as we  
2 look at different parts of it, so use either or neither,  
3 as you find most helpful.

4 A. (Witness nods).

5 LADY SMITH: As we're going through your evidence, 'Andrew',  
6 if you have any queries or worries, please don't  
7 hesitate to let me know. It's very important to me that  
8 you're as comfortable as you can be giving your  
9 evidence. So if it works for you, if, for instance, you  
10 wanted a break, that's fine, just let me know. All  
11 right?

12 A. Okay, will do.

13 LADY SMITH: I'll hand over to Mr Brown if that's all right  
14 and he'll take it from there. Mr Brown.

15 Questions from Mr Brown

16 MR BROWN: My Lady, thank you.

17 'Andrew', good morning again.

18 A. Good morning.

19 Q. We'll start with the statement, and I'll begin by  
20 reading its reference number into the record, which is  
21 WIT.001.0021759. This is a statement, as we see, that  
22 runs to 29 pages, and if we look at the last page, which  
23 will appear in front of you if you want to look at it on  
24 the screen for ease, the last paragraph:

25 "I have no objection to my witness statement being

1 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

2 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are  
3 true."

4 You are signature's been blacked out, but we see you  
5 signed the statement on 9 October 2018, so over three  
6 years ago.

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. Please understand, it is appreciated that we're talking  
9 about events 30, 40 years ago. This is not a memory  
10 test.

11 A. (Witness nods).

12 Q. Memory is a fickle thing for some details, but you're  
13 content, having read through the statement, that it's  
14 accurate?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Thank you. As you will understand, the statement is in  
17 evidence so we don't have to rehearse all of it  
18 solemnly. There are certain aspects that I'll touch on  
19 because obviously they relate to very unpleasant things  
20 happening to you. But we are going to hear evidence of  
21 two schools, and from your perspective, reading the  
22 matter short, there's a stark contrast between the two.  
23 At the moment we're looking at Fettes, but from your  
24 perspective, Fettes was, how would you describe it in  
25 one word?

1 A. A joy.

2 Q. Joy. In comparison --

3 A. I loved virtually every minute of it, yeah.

4 Q. Thank you. You're now 57, and we're talking about

5 events with the first school, which is New Park in

6 St Andrews --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- from roughly 1974 to perhaps 1977?

9 A. (Witness nods).

10 Q. And you then moved to Fettes, I think, as we know, in

11 the summer term of 1977, broadly until 1982, there was

12 a period where you were taken out?

13 A. I was. I was taken away because I was not being

14 studious enough and I was behaving appallingly and

15 I went to Reigate Grammar and got my O-levels and did

16 a deal with my father to go back because I desperately

17 missed it and I wanted to go back.

18 Q. So you went back?

19 A. I went back.

20 Q. Because you positively wanted to?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. Okay. We'll talk about all of that in a little more

23 detail.

24 We see on page 1, we don't need to go into the

25 detail, the background domestically, and domestically

1           your parents' marriage seems to have been troubled, put  
2           simply, because of your father's addictions?

3   A.   Yes.

4   Q.   And the view was taken, perhaps in part because of what  
5           your mother was having to manage, that you and your  
6           sisters would benefit from being in a different  
7           environment.  Is that correct?

8   A.   That's how I always understood it, yes.  My mother was  
9           very -- extremely skilful at hiding my father's issues  
10          from us while we were young children.  It became clear  
11          as we were older, but for most of our youth and  
12          adolescence, we had no clue that our father was in such  
13          difficulties.

14  Q.   Yes.  But I think from what you say you were sent to  
15          St Andrews to New Park school and your sisters went to  
16          a school nearby for girls?

17  A.   Yes.

18  Q.   But you joined not at the start of the academic year,  
19          you think, but in perhaps the summer term?

20  A.   At New Park?

21  Q.   Yes.

22  A.   I don't recall.  What I recall was the night that  
23          I arrived and it was -- it was absolutely -- you know,  
24          you could make a film of it.  It was pouring with rain  
25          and miserable and dark and so it was -- I would have

1 placed it probably in the autumn term. It had that  
2 wintery feel about it, but it may have been the summer.  
3 I don't --

4 Q. I think if we look at page 2, paragraph 9, of your  
5 statement, you say:

6 "I think I arrived at New Park in the summer term."  
7 This is the real point:  
8 "The issue was that I was the only new boy that  
9 arrived that term."

10 So you were coming into a school year of boys that  
11 was already formed?

12 A. That's right.

13 Q. If I can put it that way.

14 A. (Witness nods).

15 Q. You had no real choice in going to New Park?

16 A. No.

17 Q. It was just announced that you were going?

18 A. I remember seeing the brochure. I think -- I don't know  
19 where it was for, but I recall at that time I was at the  
20 St James Choir School in Grimsby and I sat an exam in  
21 a room, one of those strange things, you suddenly get  
22 taken to a room and sit an exam all by yourself and you  
23 never know what that was all about, and somehow I then  
24 end up at New Park. That was it. There was no great  
25 discussion or preface to it. I just -- I just went.

1 Q. Do you remember were you in any way excited or what was  
2 the emotion?

3 A. No, I wasn't excited. No. I was apprehensive because  
4 I was really going into the unknown, and even though my  
5 sisters were, relatively speaking, down the road, they  
6 may as well as have been a hundred miles away because  
7 you couldn't -- I did find ways of getting out the  
8 school, but it wasn't -- I didn't see them very often,  
9 so I felt very alone, you know. My first few terms  
10 there were very difficult. I was very, very homesick  
11 indeed.

12 Q. And you talk in the statement about the first day, you  
13 talk about it chucking it down weather-wise, and your  
14 parents are away within ten minutes?

15 A. Mm.

16 Q. Was there any effort made to welcome you into the  
17 school?

18 A. Well, I mean, people were polite and said hello, but it  
19 was all fairly abrupt and, you know, "Here's where  
20 you're going to sleep" -- I think I say in here, I mean,  
21 the matron that was there, she really -- you know, she  
22 was a typical scary, you know, wart on the chin, all of  
23 that thing. You couldn't make it up. That was quite  
24 terrifying, that was quite terrifying. So I felt as  
25 though I'd arrived and I don't want to say abandoned,

1 but there wasn't much ceremony to the whole thing. My  
2 parents probably thought, well, better get this over and  
3 done with and get him handed over and away we go, it  
4 will make it worse if we linger around, but there was no  
5 great goodbye or anything else like that.

6 Q. We know, obviously, from the statement you went into the  
7 junior school, or the junior part of New Park, and into  
8 a dorm with three bunk beds for six boys. Was there any  
9 induction of any kind in those first few days or did you  
10 simply just pick things up?

11 A. Not that I recall.

12 Q. No. What about the other boys? Were you learning the  
13 ropes from them, if I can put it that way?

14 A. Yes. But when -- I mean, I stood out because I was the  
15 new boy. That was it. So you had to find your feet  
16 pretty much yourself and do that fairly quickly. There  
17 wasn't much assistance from the other guys that were  
18 there. I mean, there was -- if anything, it was the  
19 other way around. They'd take great joy in finding  
20 anything to take the mickey out of you about.  
21 Culturally, that was the way it was.

22 Q. And that's in the junior school?

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. Okay. You do mention potentially one brighter spot,  
25 which is paragraph 13, page 3, young deputy matrons,



1           aged between 18 and 21?

2    A.   Yeah.

3    Q.   And they had a different relationship with the boys?

4    A.   Completely.

5    Q.   Less authoritarian and much more friendly?

6    A.   Yes.

7    Q.   You could laugh and joke with them?

8    A.   Yes.

9    Q.   Was that the one thing that stands out as being positive  
10       from that initial experience of New Park?

11   A.   Yes.  I mean, they were noticeably different.  I mean,  
12       they were -- they were -- I don't want to say they were  
13       like sisters, but they were -- they were just really,  
14       really nice.  They were just really kind to us and they  
15       did spend time with us, they did talk to you, they did  
16       laugh and joke with you.  They seemed interested in us  
17       and -- we were only tiny little kids, really, but they  
18       spent time with us in a positive way.  It wasn't just  
19       barking instructions at you or telling you to do your  
20       homework or whatever else it might be.  They actually  
21       just seemed to take an interest in you.

22   LADY SMITH:  You'd be just 10 years old when you started at  
23       New Park; is that right?

24   A.   Something like that, yes.

25   MR BROWN:  But in terms you've been saying matron with the

1           wart on her chin, it was out a film. What about the  
2           staff? In terms of the head, was he welcoming to any  
3           degree?

4    A. Very remote. He was very much head of the school. You  
5           really didn't speak to him very much at all. You would  
6           tend to only have an interaction with the headmaster, or  
7           for that matter his wife, if either you were in trouble  
8           about something or if -- if he was teaching a subject.  
9           I don't remember what he taught, but anyway, he did --  
10          he did do some teaching. But very remote. There was  
11          no -- no really getting -- I didn't feel there was any  
12          real engagement there at all. This was someone you saw  
13          at assembly who stood in front of the school and told  
14          you what was going on, et cetera, et cetera, and then  
15          breezed out the room. That was it.

16   Q. So there was no, so far as he's concerned, engagement,  
17          but looking to the teachers, I think you talk, for  
18          example, at paragraph 22 on page 5 -- and this is the  
19          context of, you know, when the children were being put  
20          to bed, masters would come around at that stage. They  
21          would:

22                 " ... take it in turns to go round and do 'lights  
23                 out'. The difference between them was quite remarkable.  
24                 Some of them would spend a bit of time with you chatting  
25                 and cracking jokes and others would be incredibly stern

1 and tell you to shut up, get to bed, and the lights  
2 would be out immediately. Some were very quick to  
3 publicly punish transgressions with a beating with  
4 a slipper or shoe, which certainly built fear and  
5 controlled the boys."

6 So there was no obvious structure, it was really  
7 turning on the character of the individual teacher?

8 A. Correct, yeah. I wouldn't say there was a particular  
9 culture of the school. It was really down to  
10 individuals.

11 Q. So you would learn if teacher A was on that night, you  
12 knew you might be in for a firmer time?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. If it was teacher B, it would be more relaxed?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. But it was just arbitrary?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. You didn't spend long in the junior school, you move  
19 into the senior school, which, I think, the obvious  
20 difference is bigger dorms, more boys.

21 A. Mm.

22 Q. And you explain that it's a building where some members  
23 of staff live in, but there was one teacher in  
24 particular who lived close to where you were, and this  
25 is of course material because he became your abuser?

1 A. Mm-hmm.

2 Q. Sticking to the generalities, though, you didn't really  
3 find favour -- the food was awful?

4 A. (Witness nods).

5 Q. And in terms of that, quite rigid -- you were expected  
6 to eat what you were given, come what may?

7 A. Absolutely, yeah, whether you liked it or you didn't.  
8 Whether you liked it or you didn't, that was -- and  
9 those things became really -- I mean, the source of --  
10 it sounds ridiculous now, but the source of tremendous  
11 unhappiness and stress and -- I mention in here the  
12 incident with the green tomato. I just for the life of  
13 me could not understand why I had to eat a green tomato  
14 and I refused to do it, but the response to that was we  
15 sat there virtually all day.

16 Q. I was going to ask, this is paragraph 26 on page 6. You  
17 describe it as having a stand-off?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. It's a battle of wills?

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. You're not going to eat the green tomato?

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. And the official line is: yes, you are.

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. When you talk about nearly all day, just to understand,

1 is this lunchtime meal or breakfast meal?

2 A. No, it was breakfast. We went through virtually the  
3 whole day with me sitting at the table with someone  
4 sitting there waiting for me to eat this green tomato.

5 Q. Had you seen anything like this with other pupils  
6 before, this sort of stand-off?

7 A. The honest answer is I don't remember, but -- but  
8 I wasn't the only one that would have those kind of  
9 issues. The boys got actually pretty good at making  
10 this stuff disappear. Whether it went into your pockets  
11 or whether somebody else liked salty porridge and you  
12 didn't, well, you know, they would have yours. We'd  
13 somehow muddle through it, but that was the incident  
14 where I just absolutely put my foot down and said no  
15 way.

16 Q. As we read from paragraph 26, the stand-off was only  
17 resolved because a member of the kitchen staff took pity  
18 on you?

19 A. Correct, yeah.

20 Q. And just subtly removed it?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. So once the problem was no longer visible, life could  
23 move on?

24 A. Mm. (Witness nods).

25 Q. Do you remember who from the school side was trying to

1 fight the battle of wills? Was it a teacher or --

2 A. Oh yeah. On that occasion?

3 Q. Yeah.

4 A. Absolutely, yes. Yes, it was a teacher. I remember the

5 individual's name, but ...

6 Q. 40 years on it may not matter.

7 A. (Witness nods).

8 Q. And obviously one of the important things for you was

9 friendship and in New Park you had a particular friend.

10 A. Mm.

11 Q. And the two of you, we read at paragraph 30, kept

12 yourself going, effectively.

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. In that paragraph, you conclude with an interesting

15 sentence:

16 "The pastoral support we needed came from the

17 pupils, not the staff."

18 A. That's how I felt it. I mean, my -- I think through all

19 my schooling, you know, I was fortunate enough to have

20 strong friendships and I don't know how I would have

21 fared without that. [REDACTED] in this case, I mean, we

22 were -- I think I say -- virtually -- we were

23 inseparable. We went everywhere together and spent most

24 of our days together. And we did -- all of us, not --

25 you know, we were particularly close. You got through

1           because of your pals, not because you felt as though  
2           there was anyone else particularly looking after you.  
3           You looked after each other.

4   Q.   I think we read from the statement that one of the  
5           things that you and ██████ did, though principally at  
6           your instigation, perhaps, was that you ran away often?

7   A.   Yeah, we'd just go.  I mean, that was a feature -- I did  
8           the same at Fettes.  I mean, I was just constantly ...  
9           I don't know what the right word is.  Escaping is  
10          probably too strong.  But maybe I was.  I mean, I was  
11          just -- I had a desire to go somewhere else.

12  Q.   To be away from the school?

13  A.   To be away, yeah.  So we would go.

14  Q.   Did you, if you can remember, stand out from your peers  
15          in doing that?  Or were others doing it with the same  
16          regularity that you were?

17  A.   There were some guys that ran away and never came back.  
18          I mean they did properly run away.  I used to plan that,  
19          and I think I say in here that the best I ever came with  
20          was, you know, I'm going to follow the train line from  
21          Leuchars and just head south.  That was as clever as  
22          I got it.  But it never changed anything.  But there  
23          were guys that ran away and obviously they were so  
24          unhappy they never came back.  But I never actually  
25          did -- I never did that.  But I would disappear for

1 a day, just go off with [REDACTED] and we'd just go places.

2 Escape.

3 Q. And when that happened and you came back, would there be  
4 punishment?

5 A. Oh yeah. Yes. But you'd -- I was never particularly  
6 fearful of the punishments. That was -- you know,  
7 they ... I was -- I shouldn't say that I was never  
8 fearful. I was frightened of that, but there were other  
9 things going on that I was more frightened of.

10 Q. We'll come back to that. I think in terms of  
11 punishment, you talk about this in paragraphs 48 and 49,  
12 pages 10 and 11, under the broad heading, "Discipline".  
13 This being the 1970s, corporal punishment was allowed?

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15 Q. And you say, reading from the second line of 48:

16 "It wasn't a brutal environment, but it was harsh  
17 enough to instill the fear in you that you could get  
18 beaten."

19 A. Mm.

20 Q. So there was that --

21 A. But you become accustomed to that. That's why I was  
22 hesitating about saying fearful. You are fearful but  
23 you become accustomed to it, it becomes the norm and  
24 therefore you almost lose the fear of that. Because  
25 once you've had a few beatings, you know as soon as



1           whatever is in hand how painful this is going to be and  
2           you brace yourself and you know that, well, tomorrow  
3           I'll be over it.

4   Q.   That's what I was going to ask.  Again, just like the  
5           lights out, that would turn on which teacher was  
6           involved?

7   A.   Yes.

8   Q.   Some would be hard, others would be known as pretty  
9           ineffectual beaters, fair?

10  A.   Absolutely right, yes.

11  Q.   Sometimes shorts were up, sometimes shorts were down?

12  A.   Yes.

13  Q.   As you say, it was the luck of the draw?

14  A.   (Witness nods).

15  Q.   But the fear eroded?

16  A.   You just became accustomed to it, yes.

17  Q.   Yes.  Did you ever consider that the beatings that were  
18           issued to you were, in terms of force, consequence or  
19           number of blows, over the top?

20  A.   I don't think -- I don't think I had -- I think in terms  
21           of frequency, because of my behaviour I was probably  
22           nearing the top of the medal list, but I don't think  
23           I was -- I don't think I was singled out for anything  
24           that nobody else was getting.  I think I just spent  
25           a lot of my time at both schools in quite a bit of

1 trouble and that brought the punishment, so ...

2 Q. In terms of getting into trouble, did the school,  
3 because you were in trouble a lot -- and thinking of New  
4 Park, was any effort made by staff, headmaster, matrons  
5 to talk to you about why you were getting into trouble?

6 A. (Witness shakes head). Never. I mean, nothing at all.  
7 Which, you know, as you get older and you look back on  
8 it, it strikes you as odd. But, no, there was  
9 absolutely -- I felt, at least, and you know as adults  
10 that this isn't necessarily true, but at the time I felt  
11 there was absolutely nobody I could turn to. There was  
12 nobody who was even remotely interested in having  
13 a conversation. You didn't talk about -- you just  
14 didn't talk, that was it. You were there to do as you  
15 were told, go to your lessons, do your homework and  
16 that's it. It wasn't -- there was no sitting down  
17 chatting, "How are you feeling? How is it going?"

18 Q. You were saying you couldn't talk to anyone, but the  
19 culture was not one of them wanting to talk to you  
20 either?

21 A. I'm sure if they'd been asked they would say, "Yes,  
22 well, the door is always open, you can pop in and have  
23 a chat", but that's not -- that's just lip service to  
24 it. That's not actually -- that's not culturally what  
25 the reality was on the ground. It just wasn't like

1           that.

2    Q.   Did they even ever say that?

3    A.   I don't remember anyone ever saying anything even

4           remotely approaching that to me ever.

5    Q.   That's perhaps the point, yes, you know, they would have

6           said that if they were pushed on the point, but nothing

7           was ever said?

8    A.   Nothing.

9    Q.   Because the picture you paint talked about the food,

10           you've talked about matron, you talk about mail, you

11           know, mail was clearly read?

12   A.   Yeah.

13   Q.   And if you didn't say something appropriate, it wouldn't

14           be sent, it would be returned to you?

15   A.   Yeah.

16   Q.   So communication was limited?

17   A.   It was effectively censored.  You can't write what you

18           wanted to write.  You know, you had to -- you were given

19           the paper to write on, you were given the envelope, you

20           were given the stamp.  You didn't have those things to

21           send a letter to your parents or anyone else you might

22           care to write to.  You didn't have the wherewithal to do

23           it.  And when it was provided to you, then the letters

24           went back, open.  You write the address, might put the

25           stamp on it, but you would hand it over open.

1 Q. So, in other words, the culture of communication was  
2 controlled and it was only positive things that were  
3 accepted?

4 A. Yes. You end up writing fairly bland nonsense, really.  
5 You didn't have an outlet to say what was going on.

6 Q. On page 12, paragraph 57 on to page 15, paragraph 69,  
7 you detail the abuse you suffered at the hands of  
8 a teacher, Ian Robb, who was convicted of abuse of you  
9 and two other boys.

10 A. Mm. I didn't know about the other two at the time.  
11 I mean, the best I could say is I'd been -- I suspected  
12 it, but I didn't know.

13 Q. Well, you suspected it because, as you say in the  
14 statement, you were conscious that this individual  
15 focused on you and two others?

16 A. Mm.

17 Q. And you saw the two others with him in scenarios that  
18 you perhaps perceived he'd engineered --

19 A. Correct, yes.

20 Q. -- because that's what he was doing with you?

21 A. Correct. That's right.

22 Q. You don't know as a matter of fact whether they were the  
23 other two who were involved in the prosecution?

24 A. I don't.

25 Q. But that would make sense to you because you know what

1           happened to you and similar things seemed to be  
2           happening to them?

3    A.   Yes.

4    Q.   We've talked about the junior school, brief stay there,  
5           perhaps a term, and then you're into the senior school,  
6           and Ian Robb was the master who was close to where your  
7           dormitory was?

8    A.   Mm.

9    Q.   And again, with the emphasis, I understand we're talking  
10           about events long ago, have you a sense of how quickly  
11           the abuse began once you were in the senior school?

12   A.   (Pause). Very soon after I arrived. Very soon.

13   Q.   And we don't need to go into the detail. It was regular  
14           and it persisted throughout your time at New Park?

15   A.   It was regular and?

16   Q.   Persisted throughout your time at New Park?

17   A.   Yes.

18   Q.   Once it started, it didn't stop?

19   A.   No.

20   Q.   And regular is two to three times a week?

21   A.   Yes. I mean -- yeah, it was -- it was -- yeah, it was  
22           very, very -- very regular, yeah.

23   Q.   I think what is striking is paragraph 67. It started in  
24           the middle of the night out the blue from your  
25           perspective?

1 A. (Witness nods).

2 Q. And you were physically restrained in the dormitory with  
3 other boys sleeping around you?

4 A. To this day, I can't -- it's almost -- even to me, and  
5 I went through it, it was almost unbelievable that  
6 someone would be that brazen. And I don't -- I have no  
7 explanation for why no one said anything or no one did  
8 anything. It's really completely beyond my  
9 understanding but that's -- the only explanation, if  
10 I was, you know, speculating on it, you know, possibly  
11 everyone else was absolutely terrified themselves and  
12 they were just probably grateful it wasn't happening to  
13 them, so keep your head down, guys, don't say anything.  
14 But nothing was said. And I find it hard to believe  
15 that none of my fellow pupils knew what was going on.  
16 I mean, it moved from that into -- as I think I say in  
17 here, into all the -- not all the -- but he would peel  
18 me away, he would get me alone, particularly in his --  
19 in his rooms or other places. So it started in the  
20 dormitory in plain -- I mean, it was dark, but, you  
21 know, in plain sight, but then it moved to being  
22 isolated. That was --

23 Q. To his quarters?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. The vestry of a church on one occasion?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Because you were a good singer and that was the  
3 connection initially?

4 A. Yes. He was the choir master. Again, it's almost the  
5 classic scenario, if there is such a thing. But yes,  
6 and I was very musical and sang and loved all of that,  
7 and therefore we -- because of that, because he was head  
8 of music, you know, we -- he saw a lot of me.

9 Q. And you couldn't avoid him?

10 A. I couldn't -- it was impossible.

11 Q. But it's -- the description in paragraph 57 of it  
12 starting, you're pinned down and there is a hand over  
13 your mouth?

14 A. (Witness nods).

15 Q. And you were terrified. Just looking at the ages, would  
16 you have been still 10?

17 A. Yeah. 10, maybe -- I don't -- yeah. I'd have to go  
18 through, I couldn't give you a precise -- yeah. 10 or  
19 11.

20 Q. Okay. And if we move on to paragraph 62, and I'll just  
21 read it out, it's your description of the ongoing nature  
22 of this:

23 "I genuinely spent my time fearing for my life.  
24 I lived this 24 hours a day. I knew I could wake up any  
25 night with a hand over my mouth holding me down. Every

1 single night I went to bed terrified, with days and  
2 evenings being not much better."  
3 A. (Witness nods).  
4 Q. Is that essentially, once it's begun, the way you lived  
5 at New Park?  
6 A. Yes. It was -- it was -- indescribe -- I can't describe  
7 it. It may look ridiculous, you know, when I wrote --  
8 when I said that, and it's in the statement, that is  
9 what I felt. I was -- I didn't understand and  
10 I didn't -- I'm not sure you do, unless you're  
11 particularly gifted at that age. I don't think you do  
12 understand these things. I knew what was happening was  
13 wrong and I had no -- I did not know how it would  
14 finish. I had no clue. When you're isolated and  
15 someone is physically restraining you like that, the  
16 terror is -- I mean, it's with me to this day. It's  
17 hard to describe it.  
18 Q. You've come on to something I was going to either come  
19 to now or later, which is that is still with you now.  
20 A. Mm. (Witness nods).  
21 Q. And you talked about the desire to be free at school,  
22 hence the running away, and then that was repeated at  
23 Fettes?  
24 A. Yeah.  
25 Q. Is that, to use your words, the desire to be free, all



1 going back to the experience with Robb?

2 A. Yes, it's something that -- that's part of my character  
3 now, and I have -- without any question, over the years  
4 it's caused really significant difficulties because I do  
5 have -- I do have this tendency to want to break ...  
6 (Pause). I'm not great when there's anything at all  
7 that I find constraining. I react to that in a way that  
8 is not -- is not always helpful to me or those around  
9 me. But that's -- it goes back to that. It's a -- it's  
10 a -- it's deeply ingrained in me. I do get terrified by  
11 that -- just the only word I can use is constraint.  
12 I don't mean physical constraint. Sometimes just the  
13 practicality of -- which my long-suffering wife knows,  
14 you know, the practicality of getting up and going to  
15 work, looking after the kids, all that kind of stuff.  
16 Sometimes I found that constraint really challenging,  
17 really challenging. Not because I don't want to do it  
18 and I'm fundamentally unhappy. It's this -- these  
19 events changed my character and made it very difficult  
20 for me sometimes just to get through the day.

21 LADY SMITH: It sounds as though what you're describing is  
22 not being able to countenance anyone else controlling  
23 you.

24 A. Yes, I'm not good at that. I mean, sometimes I -- I'd  
25 express it almost jokingly that I'm not very good at

1           being told what to do, but that's just making light of  
2           it. It's much deeper seated than that. And it has --  
3           you know, I have done some just odd things that  
4           bystanders would look at and think: why on earth have  
5           you done that? But it's because I will be feeling, for  
6           whatever reason, some kind of constraint around me and  
7           I'll react to that in a ...

8   LADY SMITH: You've talked quite a bit about persistent fear  
9           that this treatment engendered.

10   A. Mm.

11   LADY SMITH: Thinking back, can you remember what it was you  
12           were frightened of?

13   A. I've never -- that's a -- I've never really thought  
14           about it like that, what is it I was frightened of.

15   LADY SMITH: I don't want to put words into your mouth, but  
16           was it as simple as the next time it happened? Or was  
17           it something you've already alluded to, a fear that this  
18           would never stop?

19   A. I couldn't -- I couldn't --

20   LADY SMITH: And you didn't want it to be part of your life?

21   A. I couldn't see how this was ever going to stop. My  
22           horizon at that point was -- you know, was literally  
23           just the next day, and -- or it was, you know, end of  
24           term, get home and get away from it. But even then,  
25           even during the holidays, you'd know you were going

1 back. And it wasn't something -- to this day, I have  
2 never -- my father's passed away now, but to this day  
3 it's never something I spoke to my father or my mother  
4 about. It was just complete -- you know, it was just  
5 me. It was completely on my shoulders, the whole thing.

6 LADY SMITH: Well, it may not surprise you to know that  
7 having listened to so many people telling accounts of  
8 their childhood involving such incidents as you've  
9 described, have told me exactly the same thing.

10 A. Mm.

11 LADY SMITH: Couldn't tell their parents, for all sorts of  
12 reasons. They didn't. It's not surprising.

13 A. (Witness nods).

14 LADY SMITH: Those who somehow managed to are very much in  
15 the minority, I think. Certainly in this case study.  
16 Mr Brown, isn't that right?

17 MR BROWN: Very much so.

18 A. But your question is -- and I'll need to think about  
19 that and I will over the coming years, but your question  
20 about, you know, what was it I was frightened of.  
21 I mean, I -- I think it was -- it was not knowing what  
22 was going to happen to me, and it was -- it was the  
23 terror of just feeling completely alone with someone  
24 else abusing me. I mean, you know, it's not as though  
25 I didn't know that this was wrong. I mean, I did. But

1 I just had -- and I was powerless. I didn't feel as  
2 though I had anywhere to turn, anything -- no remedy for  
3 this at all.

4 LADY SMITH: And were you 10, 11, growing up, learning about  
5 life, and I suppose you may, part of you, have thought:  
6 well, is this it? Is this what life's like?

7 A. Yes. Yes, I did. I did. And then you also have --  
8 I also had that -- I don't know where it comes from, but  
9 lots of people have it, that feeling that, you know, you  
10 don't say anything negative about people in that kind of  
11 position of authority. They're beyond question. And  
12 you won't be believed. It's -- and then if you do say  
13 something, your fear is what -- what revenge will be  
14 exacted upon you? And it may well be that I was never  
15 actually at -- you know, my life was never in peril, but  
16 it felt like it. It's a terror beyond -- I can't get  
17 close to describing it to you. I can't, even after all  
18 these years. It was unspeakably awful.

19 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

20 MR BROWN: Thank you.

21 Moving on to the discovery of what was going on.

22 A. Mm.

23 Q. Her Ladyship alluded to the fact that you wouldn't tell  
24 your parents, and as you say at paragraph 70, they had  
25 their own problems ongoing at that stage, including the

1 fact that your sister had run away from her school and  
2 written to the press.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Did you want to protect them, do you think?

5 A. Did I want to protect who?

6 Q. Your parents, but not revealing this. Was that part of  
7 your thinking?

8 A. I don't recall ever thinking that. I ... there's a --  
9 I think it's -- I think it can be easily overlooked how  
10 powerful embarrassment can be. These are incredibly --  
11 you know, particularly at that age, these are just  
12 incredibly embarrassing things to talk about and you  
13 don't -- I certainly didn't, I'm sure, you know, some  
14 may have done, but I certainly didn't, I didn't have the  
15 wherewithal to even begin a conversation with my parents  
16 or anyone else, for that matter, about this. It's not  
17 something -- and even to this day there's some things  
18 I'm not great -- my wife will tell you this. Some  
19 people have to actually start the conversations.  
20 I won't -- I won't go on the front foot about certain  
21 things. It's just -- just not the way -- not the way  
22 I'm made. Wherever that comes from, I don't know, but  
23 certainly there was no -- there was no -- I didn't have  
24 a feeling that I was in any way protecting them. But it  
25 wasn't a conversation that I would ever in a million

1           years have initiated.

2   Q.   Thank you.  But what we do see, obviously, is you wrote  
3           it down in your diary.

4   A.   I did, yeah.

5   Q.   And you left the diary out?

6   A.   Mm.

7   Q.   Now, were you doing that consciously, do you think, in  
8           the hope that someone would find it and read it?

9   A.   I really wanted someone to find it and read it.  And it  
10          disappeared.  I mean -- so someone must have found it.  
11          Or, I don't know.  I don't know what happened to it.  
12          But I wanted someone to find it, yeah.

13  Q.   But the diary goes missing and then things happen after  
14          a period?  Do you remember how long a period?

15  A.   No, I don't.

16  Q.   No.  But suddenly out of the blue, going to your  
17          statement, paragraph 72, you're summoned to the  
18          headmaster's office and you're thinking this must be  
19          bad?

20  A.   Okay, yeah, so the diary was -- I wrote in the diary  
21          quite early on, so it wasn't as though it was, you know,  
22          diary found, two or three days later I'm hauled in.  
23          There was no connection there.  The diary -- let's say  
24          it was, you know, a term or a year prior to that.  At  
25          least that's my recollection.  And nothing had happened

1 and I never did it again. I just kind of thought, well,  
2 this is my lot.

3 I don't know, I have absolutely no idea what  
4 happened to -- suddenly I get hauled in to the  
5 headmaster's study that day. I don't know how --  
6 I don't know how it was found out. I've no idea.

7 Q. But whatever the reason, you were summoned to the  
8 headmaster's office?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. And there were two police officers in uniform there?

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. And your thought process is one of panic?

13 A. Oh, absolute blind panic. I had no -- I thought maybe  
14 my parents had been killed or something. I had no idea  
15 at all. Absolutely no idea at all. I mean, I was in  
16 a permanently terrified state already, so to go in and  
17 have two uniformed police officers standing in front of  
18 you was just -- you know. I think my knees gave way at  
19 some point. It was ridiculous.

20 Q. And as you say in the statement, the headmaster's behind  
21 his desk?

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. So the authority picture is still there?

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. But in fairness to him, he then gets up and --

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. -- takes you over to a sofa?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And it becomes momentarily a little bit more relaxed?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. It's at that point you discover what's going on, that

7 they want to speak to you about the abuse?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And I think you quote him as saying, "We're here to look

10 after you"?

11 A. Mm. (Witness nods). I remember that like it was

12 yesterday. That was -- that was the first time that

13 anyone ... (Pause). That anyone had ever said anything

14 like that. And that was -- that was the moment I --

15 I mean, I obviously had no idea what was coming, but

16 that was the moment where for the first time I actually

17 thought: gosh, this might stop. That was -- that was

18 a huge moment in my life.

19 Q. But as you say --

20 A. Mm-hmm?

21 Q. -- the police were fairly short and abrupt about it?

22 A. Oh yeah. Yes, I mean, you know, again, looking back,

23 I think it could have been handled a lot more

24 sensitively. But I -- from where I was, however

25 terrifying that was, and it was, it was -- it was the



1 beginning of the end. So I can look back at it in that  
2 positive sense. But as a -- as a method of -- as  
3 an approach of dealing with a child who is terrified  
4 beyond description, it wasn't great.

5 Q. It lasted, from what you tell us, perhaps about  
6 30 minutes.

7 A. (Witness nods).

8 Q. You answered the questions, to quote:  
9 " ... but I was totally and utterly bewildered and  
10 frightened about what was now happening around me."

11 A. Mm.

12 Q. So having felt perhaps finally this is going to stop,  
13 did the meeting with the police officers and headmaster  
14 help or not?

15 A. It helped to the point where -- in the sense that, as  
16 I say, I could -- you know, it was the first time anyone  
17 had said that to me. That was very welcome. I did have  
18 a sense that, you know, this might be the beginning of  
19 the end, but I didn't know what was -- I didn't know  
20 what was coming. (Pause). Yeah.

21 Q. Okay. But having had the meeting with the police  
22 officers, having been told, "We're here to look after  
23 you", you were in fact just sent back to class?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. With a note explaining why the headmaster had called you

1 in to explain your absence?

2 A. (Witness nods).

3 Q. As you say, no one ever spoke to you about it again?

4 A. No. No. It's quite extraordinary. Really quite  
5 extraordinary. That was -- that's my recollection,  
6 anyway. Maybe they did but I don't remember it.  
7 I remember that meeting as -- you know, like it was  
8 20 minutes ago. But I don't remember anything being  
9 said after that at all.

10 Q. Do you remember any follow-up from the school in terms  
11 of --

12 A. No.

13 Q. -- trying to ensure you're okay?

14 A. No, nothing at all. Absolutely nothing.

15 Q. Just back to your normal routine?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. But your parents removed you fairly soon after?

18 A. That's my recollection, yes.

19 Q. And that was the end of your time at New Park?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. But with your parents, did they discuss it with you?

22 A. No, not a word. Not a word. I think we probably went  
23 off to the Peebles Hydro, that was one of our favourite  
24 places, or Gleneagles or somewhere like that, and had  
25 a nice time, and then headed home. But no, there was no

1 conversation at all.

2 Q. And you say in the statement there was no support and it  
3 really wasn't discussed thereafter?

4 A. No. No, nothing.

5 Q. And so far as what happened to Robb, you know now,  
6 because the police phoned you up relatively recently?

7 A. Mm.

8 Q. Because you'd engaged with the Inquiry?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. To tell you that he'd been jailed for six months?

11 A. Mm.

12 Q. But you don't know what for?

13 A. No.

14 Q. In terms.

15 A. No. And the detail of what happened to me that's in  
16 this statement bears no relation to what is a cursory  
17 conversation with the police. There's no -- if there is  
18 a record of it, I'd be delighted to see it, but  
19 I don't -- there was no real -- there was no detail to  
20 it at all. It was -- it was ...

21 Q. Paragraph 79, page 18, you say:

22 "I didn't feel able to tell the police the full  
23 extent of what had happened to me."

24 A. No.

25 Q. "I wasn't afforded the opportunity to tell them

1 everything, but the questions they asked and the answers  
2 I gave, none of them would have left that room with  
3 an understanding of what I had been there through."  
4 A. No, they wouldn't. No, it would be impossible. There  
5 was no -- it's simply not possible for them to have  
6 understood what I had been through from ... and that was  
7 the only time we ever spoke about it. With absolutely  
8 no warning at all you get dragged into a room, and, you  
9 know, pour your heart out, well, that's just not -- it's  
10 not -- it's not going to happen. And I wasn't actually  
11 asked much.  
12 Q. About obviously we have policing in the 1970s.  
13 A. Mm.  
14 Q. Which we've talked about. But at paragraph 77 on  
15 page 17 you say:  
16 "I only became aware of what the consequences had  
17 been for Robb after I rang the Inquiry line and his  
18 details were passed to the police by Inquiry staff.  
19 I then got a phone call from the police out of the blue  
20 when I was at work."  
21 A. Mm.  
22 Q. "The female police officer said that two other boys at  
23 the school had been abused by him and he had been  
24 prosecuted in relation to the three of us. He got  
25 a six-month prison sentence. I think the information

1           could have been delivered in a slightly more sensitive  
2           way."

3           You were in your office and a police officer phones  
4           up?

5   A.   Yes.  It rocked me on my heels.  I mean, I -- you know,  
6           that's relatively recently.

7   Q.   I was going to say, the statement was given in 2018.  Is  
8           this around the same time?

9   A.   Yes.  And the thing that -- I mean, we can't -- we can't  
10          rewrite the history of any of this, but I do, I really  
11          do struggle with the damage that this has done to me and  
12          yet we had in those days a justice system that you get  
13          six months for that.  I mean, it's -- it really is  
14          a life sentence for me.  I have to cope every day.  
15          Every single day.  And you learn to cope.  I know you'll  
16          have heard this from other people I'm sure.  You learn  
17          to cope with these things, but the damage it does stays  
18          with you every single day.  So the fact that we're here  
19          whatever it is, 45, nearly, years later and I still --  
20          you know, you just have to scratch the surface and I get  
21          upset about it.  It's -- I can't quite correlate that to  
22          a six -- I know this isn't the purpose of today, but  
23          I can't correlate that to a six-month sentence.  It's  
24          almost as if these things just aren't taken seriously.

25   Q.   Or weren't taken seriously --

1 A. Weren't taken seriously, correct.

2 Q. -- then. And another example of perhaps things were not  
3 taken seriously, because having been taken away, you did  
4 go back, we see, briefly to New Park?

5 A. Mm. Which amazes me when I look back on it now.  
6 Extraordinary really.

7 Q. But you were there when your abuser was allowed to drive  
8 in and pick up his stuff?

9 A. Yes. It's just -- yes, I was. I remember that, yeah.  
10 And again, you know, the terror even then that was  
11 within me was unbearable, I mean just incredible. There  
12 right in front of you the person that, you know. It was  
13 extraordinary how these things happen, but there it is.

14 Q. The headmaster was removed. Was that as a result of  
15 what had been found out? Do you know that or is it just  
16 suspicion?

17 A. I don't -- I don't know why, but I believe it was to do  
18 with this. I believe. But I don't know.

19 Q. But the boys protested?

20 A. They did, yes. Strangely enough, despite the fact that  
21 he was very distant and, you know, et cetera, et cetera,  
22 there was -- there was -- the pupils had a regard for  
23 the headmaster. And I think --

24 Q. But was there --

25 A. Sorry. I think that there was a sense at the time -- we

1           were trying to organise sit-ins and all this kind of  
2           stuff, very 1970s. There was a sense that it was  
3           an injustice to the headmaster. On the other hand, we  
4           as adults may say, well, sorry, but you're responsible,  
5           it's on your watch, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera.  
6           But the pupils, I don't think, felt like that.

7   Q. But was it known what Robb had done, amongst the school?

8   A. It became known.

9   Q. It did become known?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And was that from the school? The school were open  
12       about it? Or did it just go around unofficially?

13 A. No, I don't think there was any comment at all from the  
14       school openly. I don't think so. I think it went --  
15       well, it may have been from me and other pupils. You  
16       know, at the end of the day, the police arrived.

17 Q. Yes. But you left New Park?

18 A. I did.

19 Q. And you went to Fettes?

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. And in terms of Fettes, you talk in your statement about  
22       really by that stage you were afraid of nothing?

23 A. (Witness nods).

24 Q. Why was that?

25 A. The terror I had -- I mean, to this day, it's -- what

1 I had been through left me with little fear of anything.  
2 I mean, I'm not saying that's necessarily a healthy  
3 thing. I mean, there's times where -- I think [REDACTED] was  
4 there once, I've had people pull knives on me -- I don't  
5 go around, by the way, getting into that kind of  
6 trouble, it's just, you know, the way you go through  
7 life, these things kind of happen sometimes.

8 But unwisely, probably, that doesn't trouble me.  
9 That sounds ridiculous, but that's not the kind of thing  
10 that will strike fear in me. Throwing myself down  
11 mountains at 100 miles an hour on skis doesn't bother  
12 me. I do daft things like that. Used to drive like  
13 a lunatic. None of that bothers me. I'm not really  
14 worried about much at all. But I put it back to the  
15 extent of the fear that I lived with day in, day out for  
16 a prolonged period left me with little fear of much  
17 else.

18 Q. So the mindset when you went into Fettes was already  
19 affected by your time at New Park?

20 A. Absolutely without question, yeah. Fettes to me was --  
21 I mean -- was freedom from all of that. I mean,  
22 I can't -- again, in the same way I struggled to  
23 describe to you the terror, I would struggle to describe  
24 the joy at being free, and that's what Fettes  
25 represented for me. That's what it gave me. It gave me



1 freedom from those years that I had suffered.

2 Q. Do you think that was because it was Fettes or do you  
3 think that would have been wherever you'd gone because  
4 it wasn't New Park?

5 A. I think it could have been anywhere. I think. My only  
6 experience was Fettes -- well, apart from briefly at  
7 Reigate Grammar when I got hauled away, but --

8 Q. Yes. Are we really talking about the liberation from  
9 the previous --

10 A. Yes, absolutely.

11 Q. -- experience?

12 A. Yes. I mean, I liked the environment, I mean everything  
13 about it, literally everything about it. I just loved  
14 the entire thing. The grounds, the buildings,  
15 everything. Absolutely everything. But it was  
16 a liberation, there's no -- it was the most wonderful  
17 experience.

18 Q. And I think, as we discussed this morning, in Edinburgh  
19 last night you were out with Fettes friends?

20 A. Yeah, we had a wonderful time. They're deep friendships  
21 that last to this day.

22 Q. In terms of what Fettes knew, because we know from  
23 documents that we've obtained, you joined Fettes in  
24 1977, I think it's clear, in term 3, so you'd be coming  
25 in in the summer term.

1 A. Mm.

2 Q. And this is into the junior school?

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. In Malcolm House?

5 A. Yeah.

6 Q. Do you have any sense from your own knowledge of how  
7 much or what Fettes knew about your background at New  
8 Park?

9 A. I have no knowledge of what they did or didn't know.  
10 I always -- I assumed -- at least I think I assumed,  
11 that they must have known something because, you know,  
12 you suddenly -- again I just land from outer space, this  
13 is the second school I've just been dropped into. You  
14 know, New Park I've landed from the moon and the same at  
15 Fettes, you know, here he is. But I assumed that some  
16 explanation of why is 'Andrew' arriving out of the blue  
17 in the summer term, it's not the usual intake. You  
18 normally arrive at autumn, don't you?

19 Q. Yeah.

20 A. Whenever it is, August, or whenever. You don't arrive  
21 in summer. So I assumed it was something, you know,  
22 that they would know, but I have no detail on that and  
23 therefore I have no idea as to what they did or didn't  
24 know.

25 Q. I think, as you know, because we've discussed this,

1 records produced by Fettes are somewhat oblique about  
2 it. The first document in your file at Fettes is "ex  
3 New Park" and the words "embroiled there" are used.  
4 That's all that's said, whatever "embroiled there" is  
5 meant to mean. Then there's another document:  
6 "New Park. Involved with second master."  
7 And then more background about you being musical,  
8 creative, a bit too casual.  
9 A. (Witness nods).  
10 Q. So there might be allusions. Whether or not things were  
11 said behind the scenes, you simply don't know?  
12 A. (Witness shakes head). Don't know.  
13 Q. But I think from what we read in the statement -- and  
14 this is paragraph 88 on page 19 -- there was much more  
15 of a support framework within Fettes to get you settled?  
16 A. Yes.  
17 Q. And there was a grace system in place?  
18 A. Yes.  
19 Q. You had two weeks' grace when you arrived which meant  
20 you couldn't get any punishments because you're learning  
21 how it works, effectively?  
22 A. Correct. I think I did manage to get punished then, but  
23 yes.  
24 Q. Were you talking there about the senior school or is  
25 this Malcolm House, the junior school?

1 A. Malcolm House as well. It was a system that went  
2 through the whole school.

3 Q. Thank you.

4 A. You were allocated -- someone was allocated to --  
5 certainly for the first couple of weeks, to look after  
6 you. You know, and it was their job. They were given  
7 a role, the master would take you and say, "Right,  
8 you've got to look after young Henry here", or whatever  
9 it was. That was your job. It was your responsibility  
10 to do that to make sure that -- and if they got into  
11 trouble for -- they did something wrong, the school  
12 would come and have a word with you. You were meant to  
13 be helping them, not leaving them floundering around by  
14 themselves.

15 Q. I think, looking at Malcolm House, which is your first  
16 taste of Fettes, the junior school, were you there for  
17 just a term before you move in to the senior school or  
18 do you think it was longer?

19 A. It felt like longer. It felt -- yeah, it certainly felt  
20 like more than a term.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. But the chronology is what it is. It may have been  
23 a term. But I certainly -- you move -- I mean, I moved  
24 into two different -- in all, in Malcolm House, I slept  
25 in three different rooms, and that would normally only

1           happen you'd move per term. So I can't quite work out  
2           why I would have -- if it was only one term I was in the  
3           junior school, why would I have moved three times.

4   Q.   Okay. But whatever the length of the stay, you liked  
5           Malcolm House. You describe it as a nice homely  
6           atmosphere?

7   A.   Yes.

8   Q.   And you are positive about the SNR [REDACTED]  
9           of the time, who we're calling FTG [REDACTED].

10  A.   Mm.

11  Q.   I think you have a list of names.

12  A.   I do.

13  Q.   FTG [REDACTED] and his wife, though, they could be firm? Is  
14           that --

15  A.   Yes, I would describe him as firm but fair. I mean,  
16           I did -- I mean, for a start, he spoke to you. That for  
17           me was new. That was genuinely a new experience, that  
18           someone would actually ask you how are you doing, what  
19           have you been up to today? Have you found the squash  
20           courts? Or whatever it is. Really just basic  
21           day-to-day conversations.

22           Malcolm House is off on -- is away from the main  
23           building, it's away from the dining hall, and I remember  
24           just even that walk from the junior school over to  
25           lunch, he would talk to you. He would have five minutes

1 chatting, and that for me was just a complete  
2 revelation. I'd never had that. Ever. That was just  
3 wonderful in many ways, yeah. But, I mean, you know, as  
4 was pretty consistent through all my time, I would --  
5 I would do things wrong and he would -- you know, he'd  
6 tell me off for that. But firm but fair is the way  
7 I would describe it.

8 Q. You've talked about the liberation of getting away from  
9 New Park.

10 A. Mm.

11 Q. And then there is revelation because the culture that  
12 you saw was so utterly different?

13 A. Yes. Yes. It was -- I can't -- I can barely summon the  
14 words to describe how dramatically -- for me,  
15 dramatically different it was. Even -- and we go back  
16 to the green tomato incident. Even the fact that  
17 I could choose what I wanted to eat at my meals.  
18 I mean, that was just absolutely fabulous and I could  
19 stuff my face with bacon rolls if I wanted to. You  
20 know? It was just -- these are the simplest things, but  
21 they were brilliant. And I could have tea or coffee.  
22 You know, I can't begin to describe to you how -- and  
23 I think we had hot chocolate. It was just fantastic.  
24 Absolutely fantastic. Almost like -- I mean, actually  
25 I treated it like a holiday camp, that's the truth. For

1 me it was like a holiday camp. I should have perhaps  
2 treated it more like a school, but for me it was just  
3 fun and games 24/7 and I was living with my best  
4 friends. I just -- those -- you know, it was -- that's  
5 how I viewed it. That's how -- it's probably why I got  
6 taken away because I just was not treating it like  
7 school. But I could not -- you know, it was that  
8 liberation for me. And that's still with me to this  
9 day. I still behave occasionally like that. In fact,  
10 my wife will probably say permanently I behave like  
11 that, but it's ...

12 Q. And you're very candid in your statement. I think one  
13 of the consistent themes of your time at Fettes was  
14 naughtiness?

15 A. Yeah, yeah.

16 Q. Sometimes more or less serious.

17 A. Yes. It was -- I don't want -- I don't think I'm bad,  
18 if that -- I'm not wicked. But Fettes, of course, is  
19 a stone's throw from the centre of Edinburgh and it's  
20 a wonderful city and I enjoyed the wonderful city to the  
21 full, even when I was 13, I was out. I'd jump in a cab  
22 and go into town.

23 My sister ended up having a -- where are we here?  
24 She had a flat on -- is it [REDACTED] somewhere over  
25 here?

1 Q. That way.

2 A. I've lost my bearings. Anyway, she had a flat. So my  
3 friends and I would leave school and go and stay with my  
4 sister for the weekend. I mean, you're not meant to do  
5 that, you're not meant to do that, but we did. And we'd  
6 just get a cab and go back to school on Monday. And  
7 occasionally we'd get caught for that and then you'd do  
8 the ridiculous thing, they'd do what they called gating  
9 and gating is basically telling you you're not allowed  
10 out. But I wasn't allowed out in the first place. This  
11 is barely a punishment at all, telling me I can't go  
12 out, because I wasn't allowed out, so you'd just go out  
13 again.

14 It was, for me, wonderful happy days, but it's just  
15 the liberation, and I couldn't stop myself. I could not  
16 stop myself. I was compulsive. But the compulsion is  
17 because of the -- of that sense of freedom that it gave  
18 me. Even though, you know, as soon as someone says,  
19 "Right, you're gated", well, I would just ring a cab.  
20 You can just ring a cab. That's all you do. That's the  
21 extraordinary thing. And go up to whatever -- what was  
22 the road at the back of Fettes? You'd just walk up  
23 through what used to be the golf course, out the back  
24 and a cab is sitting waiting for you, off you go to  
25 town.



1 LADY SMITH: East Fettes Avenue?

2 A. Could be, yeah.

3 MR BROWN: But all of this is going back to the liberation  
4 from New Park?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And did you get the sense that -- I mean, this is  
7 perhaps going back to what Fettes may have known about  
8 your background. Did you get the sense, because this is  
9 what may come out of your statement, that there was some  
10 degree of protection from your housemaster once you were  
11 in School House? They were looking out for you?

12 A. The reality is I should have been expelled. I mean,  
13 some of the things I did, you should be expelled.  
14 I mean, the only thing I didn't do was drugs. But  
15 I smoked, I drank, I womanised, I spent weekends out.  
16 I didn't steal anything. I didn't -- I don't think  
17 I ever committed a crime. But I should have been  
18 expelled, and the only explanation I have for that --  
19 and the sheer number of times I was in trouble, I did  
20 feel that -- and from the conversations that I had with  
21 my housemaster, I did feel that, for whatever reason --  
22 and that was never a conversation he and I had -- I did  
23 feel as though he had somehow taken me under his wing,  
24 you know, a project just to get me through to the date  
25 when I properly left the school, you know, without

1 getting expelled. And he did go in to bat for me with  
2 the headmaster and the headmistress. There was  
3 a headmistress for the girls, I don't know if it's still  
4 like that, but there was at that time.

5 Q. We're calling him EXM .

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. So I think he would have been known as EXM on that  
8 basis?

9 A. EXM . I mean, he struck fear -- here's the strange  
10 thing, he struck fear into some of the -- and I should  
11 say at this point my experience with Fettes, I'm well  
12 aware, will be different to others. My only explanation  
13 for that is my previous experience led me into that --  
14 those circumstances. My experience will be different to  
15 others. So there were guys who were -- who were  
16 frightened of EXM and he could be quite  
17 a disciplinarian. He didn't bother me at all. I was  
18 never frightened of EXM , not in the slightest.  
19 But I wouldn't be. I wasn't frightened of much.

20 Q. But I think you describe he had a reputation for  
21 beating?

22 A. He did.

23 Q. To use your words, if he beat you, you'd feel it for  
24 a week?

25 A. Oh my God, yes.

1 Q. And that was a known quantity?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. But so far as you were concerned, he went out to bat for  
4 you?

5 A. Yes. Yes, he did. I think there's no doubt about it,  
6 no doubt about it. And he did speak to me. I mean, you  
7 know, he was another one of those that would sit you  
8 down, I remember sitting in his study innumerable times.  
9 "Let's have a little chat, 'Andrew', shall we? How are  
10 things?"

11 Q. And that's also true of the headmaster, Chenevix-Trench?

12 A. He was very kindly -- I didn't see a lot of him --  
13 I mean, other than when I was in trouble, but yeah, he  
14 was -- I always felt he was kindly disposed to me. But  
15 actually I felt as though he was kindly disposed to  
16 a lot of the boys. I think he -- rightly or wrongly, he  
17 ran the school with quite a -- I would refer to it as  
18 quite a Bohemian approach, quite laissez-faire. We were  
19 all -- it was pretty wild in those days. I mean, it  
20 really was. I don't think the academic results in those  
21 days were anything to boast about, but it was for a lot  
22 of the guys that could tolerate the system, it was  
23 actually quite a -- quite a good place to be. And  
24 Chenevix-Trench created an atmosphere that was -- that  
25 was pretty relaxed, actually.

1 Q. You talk about, I think, he was known to drink, for  
2 example?

3 A. Yeah.

4 Q. You could see that?

5 A. Yes. On occasions he would be wandering around the  
6 grounds and he was, you know, at least two sheets to the  
7 wind, if not three.

8 Q. And I think in terms of that Bohemian, to use your word,  
9 you talk about another teacher, CBU, who brewed his  
10 own beer?

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. And you would go and drink it with him?

13 A. Yeah. Yes.

14 Q. As would other boys, I take it?

15 A. Yes. And I never -- I mean, it was a bit unusual, but  
16 I never felt that in way -- again, particularly where  
17 I had come from, I didn't find that in any way  
18 threatening. That wasn't a situation that for me at  
19 least was in any way threatening at all. He used to  
20 organise the -- we had a team and we'd go off  
21 and then once a year we'd go off on a trip  
22 during the school holidays and I went on one of those  
23 with CBU, went to Italy, and just had the most  
24 fabulous, fabulous, fabulous time. It was just -- and  
25 it was one of those things, you know, in the right sense

1        what happened on tour stayed on tour, so we were smoking  
2        and drinking and womanising and carousing, but when you  
3        got back to school, that was never mentioned. But  
4        nothing untoward happened. That was probably my first  
5        lads trip. I was probably only about 14, but the way we  
6        went to Italy and it was just wonderful.

7    LADY SMITH: How old were you when your parents took you  
8        away and sent you to, I think you said, a grammar  
9        school?

10   A. Reigate Grammar School. So I must have been -- I think  
11        that was about halfway through the forth form, so  
12        I would have been, whatever I was, 15, let's say.

13   LADY SMITH: And did you say you went back to Fettes after  
14        that? Or not?

15   A. I was so upset about being taken away. I really --  
16        I couldn't believe that had happened to me. And I said  
17        to my father, "I'm going back. I am going back. I'm  
18        not going to tolerate this in any shape or form". And  
19        he said, "Right, well, if you ..." they were O-levels in  
20        those days. "If you pass your O-levels", which I did  
21        with flying colours, he said, "If you do that, you can  
22        go back because you'll have learnt how to study  
23        properly", so I did. And the only reason I passed my  
24        O-levels with flying colours was I was desperate to get  
25        back to Fettes. And then went back and behaved

1           appallingly and flunked my highers -- well, I didn't  
2           flunk them, but I didn't get quite the grades I needed.

3   LADY SMITH: Thank you.

4   MR BROWN: You obviously enjoyed Fettes to the full.

5   A. Mm.

6   Q. And from what you're saying, and I'm not being  
7       disparaging, there was a party-like atmosphere from your  
8       perspective.

9   A. Mm.

10   Q. But as you recognise, at paragraph 101, Fettes was quite  
11       a tough environment and some parents did take their  
12       children away, "but I would say 95 per cent loved it."  
13            You go on to say:  
14            "I know that some people say their experience was  
15       brutal. We didn't have hot water until the fourth form  
16       and we had to play rugby when it was snowing."  
17            I take it, you've alluded to liking sports at New  
18       Park, was Fettes liberating on the sports side? Were  
19       you in one of the rugby teams?

20   A. Yes.

21   Q. Were you First XV ultimately?

22   A. No, no, God, I wish. I wish. No, I wasn't good enough.  
23       We had a phenomenally good rugby team. You played every  
24       day -- that's not true. You played six days a week. We  
25       didn't play on Sunday. But you had games every day.

1 Q. And you liked that?

2 A. I loved it, yeah. It was -- it was -- you know, these  
3 were my -- these were my best pals. We were just  
4 larking about all day every single day, including on the  
5 rugby pitch, or cricket, or whatever we're doing.

6 But it was, there was no question, if it wasn't for  
7 you, then it really wasn't for you, and there were boys  
8 that were there that without any question (a) including  
9 myself, which is the source of some shame, we were very  
10 unkind to. Any sign of weakness was pounced upon. It  
11 was -- I don't want to say it was Lord of the Flies, but  
12 it was survival of the fittest and it made you quite  
13 tough. I mean, I came out of New Park at least myself  
14 feeling pretty -- I'd survived. It goes back to that  
15 liberation thing. I was always going to be fine at  
16 Fettes. It was not going to trouble me in the  
17 slightest. But for others it was a struggle, there's no  
18 question about that. And if I had been their parents,  
19 I would have taken them away if I had seen how miserable  
20 they were because there were some guys -- not many, but  
21 there were some who were just thoroughly miserable. It  
22 was the wrong environment for them.

23 Q. Why was it the wrong environment for them?

24 A. You had to be quite tough. You had to be -- I mean, you  
25 know, I think I say in here, from the moment you arrive

1       you're referred to as a man, you're a new man, you're  
2       never called a boy again, ever. That's that. You had  
3       a tremendous amount of responsibility placed on your  
4       shoulders quite early on, and you sank or you swam, and  
5       I think that was -- I think that was part of -- it's  
6       probably what the school was trying to do, was actually,  
7       you know, beat you into some semblance of a man. But  
8       not everyone's like that. Not everyone reacts well to  
9       that. There are guys who are a little more sensitive,  
10      shall we say. They're not quite as roughy toughy as  
11      all the others and they won't do the things that the  
12      other guys do. And if you were weak in that way, then  
13      it could be quite merciless from the other guys, from  
14      the other pupils. It was unkind at times.

15    Q. We've heard the phrase mocking, the word mocking.

16    A. Yeah.

17    Q. Was mocking something that was understood as a pastime?

18    A. Oh, that was absolutely right through the culture, yeah.

19      Of the boys. I don't think -- I don't think the  
20      masters, I don't recall -- never really thought about  
21      it, but I don't recall the masters, I'm thinking about  
22      it now, don't recall the masters doing that, but the  
23      pupils amongst themselves, yes, that could be really  
24      quite -- quite brutal.

25    Q. And that's an example of sink or swim?



1 A. Sink or swim. I mean, our first day there, we -- one of  
2 my pals, [REDACTED] was there last night. We were --  
3 again, you just think what on earth were we doing? But  
4 the very first day, the very first day in the senior  
5 school, we get assigned to our dormitory and 20 minutes  
6 later we're in the headmaster's study. Why? Because  
7 [REDACTED] and I, I don't know what the hell possessed  
8 us, but we had got one fella's entire belongings and  
9 thrown them out the window. I mean, why would you do  
10 that? At that point we thought that was hilariously  
11 funny. Well, it clearly wasn't, not for him, and the  
12 headmaster didn't think -- we hadn't realised that  
13 window actually looked straight out onto the  
14 headmaster's study. We hadn't thought that through when  
15 we got up to that little game but we could do those kind  
16 of things.

17 That wasn't a feature -- that's one I'm admitting  
18 to, but I wasn't at the centre of that kind of culture.  
19 I was too busy having a good time myself to engage in  
20 too much of that. But I remember that vividly, we spoke  
21 about it last night with some shame.

22 Q. And I think, because you've mentioned this earlier, last  
23 night was the first time that you'd heard from your  
24 friends from Fettes --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- that Chenevix-Trench, they were aware of rumours  
2 about his behaviour?

3 A. Yes. That -- yeah, last night was the first time I'd  
4 heard that. I was completely unaware of that all the  
5 way through -- sorry. You can hear rumours and just  
6 suggestions and la la la, but there was nothing -- no  
7 pupil that I recall ever said, "This happened to me",  
8 throughout my time at Fettes. Nothing. And I didn't  
9 see anything like that at all, and I would imagine I'd  
10 be quite sensitive to it. That doesn't mean it didn't  
11 happen, it just means that I was unaware of it, but it  
12 was mentioned last night and I was surprised. I really  
13 was. I really was quite surprised at that.

14 Q. You talked about in your discussions last night talking  
15 about things with some shame.

16 A. Mm.

17 Q. Are we referring back to the treatment of perhaps the  
18 more sensitive children?

19 A. Yes. Yes. That whole -- yeah, that -- yes. You know,  
20 one guy in particular, in particular, who bizarrely we  
21 happened to meet one of his brothers down where we now  
22 live, and it transpires, which I didn't know at the  
23 time, it was this particular individual, there were four  
24 brothers. Three of them were sent to Rugby, one of them  
25 was sent to Fettes, and that poor individual, having

1           been cleaved away from his three other brothers, they  
2           were having a jolly good time down there, he was  
3           utterly, utterly, utterly miserable for his entire  
4           existence through Fettes. He was in my year and he had  
5           a really, really difficult time and he was just  
6           simply -- the only expression I can use, he just was not  
7           up to it. It was not his thing. He was not good at  
8           sports, he wasn't particularly good academically, he was  
9           awkward in his manner and his -- you know, he always  
10          looked an utter shambles. It was all these kind of  
11          things. You just put the whole thing together and that  
12          was not a good -- that's not a good thing. It's not  
13          a good way to be in that environment.

14        Q. Because he would be picked on?

15        A. He would be picked on, mercilessly for however many  
16        years, yes.

17        Q. And your phrase, for however many year, throughout his  
18        entire career.

19        A. Throughout his entire time, yes.

20        Q. Did it ever ease off for these people?

21        A. No.

22        Q. What was the level of knowledge of the staff about what  
23        was going on in that regard?

24        A. They knew that mocking was prevalent, and if they heard,  
25        you would, you know, at the very least you'd get told

1 off for that. And you might -- you might get punished  
2 for it. There was not -- I wouldn't -- my experience is  
3 I wouldn't say it was condoned. But the difficulty is  
4 that there's an awful lot of the time where it's just  
5 the boys together. You know, you're not under 24/7  
6 supervision. It's not the way it is. You know, if  
7 you're in the dormitory, there's no one there. It's --  
8 you run the place yourselves, so there was plenty of  
9 opportunity for people to be unkind without the masters  
10 actually even knowing.

11 Q. We've heard an awful lot about boys, some people  
12 described it as the boys ran the school, the teachers  
13 educated and refereed. Where would you stand on that  
14 description?

15 A. Sorry, say that again?

16 Q. We've heard a description of Fettes as being it was run  
17 by the boys, the teachers were there to educate and  
18 referee.

19 A. I think that's a pretty good description, yes. Yes.  
20 You did have a tremendous -- I mean, you know, again,  
21 I think it was all -- I suppose it was all part of the  
22 education, giving you responsibility early on. Giving  
23 you authority over other pupils. I mean, I -- you know,  
24 the system of starting at the bottom of the third form  
25 and going all the way through to the sixth form, you

1       become a prefect and how you behave, remembering what it  
2       was like to be at the bottom of the pile when you get to  
3       the top is what you're meant to do and not treat people  
4       unkindly, but it may not have -- it didn't work in every  
5       single case.

6   Q.   That was the theory?

7   A.   That was the theory.

8   Q.   But it didn't work?

9   A.   Not in every case. I mean, I think there's -- there's  
10       an awful lot of them, of my fellow pupils who are just  
11       absolutely wonderful human beings and I love them to  
12       bits, but there were some of them who were not very  
13       nice.

14  Q.   So the people with responsibility, some of prefects,  
15       would they do anything to stop mocking or would they  
16       actually encourage it?

17  A.   I think that depended on the particular year of the  
18       prefects. So when our year came through, what we  
19       referred to as the class of '82, you always refer to the  
20       year you left, so the class of '82, our cohort, actually  
21       we were -- oh God, we were all very laissez-faire and we  
22       didn't -- by the time -- other than in one or two cases.  
23       By the time we got to that stage, it had eased off quite  
24       a lot. I think we'd mellowed and calmed down a little  
25       bit in our treatment towards others. But there were

1           some prefects during my time going all through the  
2           various years that I was there that were pretty  
3           unpleasant. And they had the authority to be  
4           unpleasant. And what was meant to happen is that the  
5           prefects amongst themselves would effectively regulate  
6           themselves so that if I saw that you were overstepping  
7           the mark in any particular, that would be part of my job  
8           is to say, "Can we have a quick word and try not to do  
9           that, you're upsetting that guy" or, "You've gone too  
10          far", or whatever else it may be. So it was almost like  
11          we were meant to police ourselves.

12                 But the staff were -- you know, they were well aware  
13          of it, but you would -- it wasn't something -- I never  
14          saw it as something that was condoned. It was something  
15          that was very, very hard to stop because we had so much  
16          time by ourselves not under direct supervision.

17    Q.   Thinking of other years rather than the class of '82  
18          where you saw perhaps some of the prefects going too far  
19          and not being self-regulated by their fellow prefects,  
20          if that happened or when that happened, was there staff  
21          intervention or would the staff simply be ignorant of  
22          it?

23    A.   I don't remember an intervention, now that you ask that  
24          question. I don't remember. I mean, one particular  
25          individual, he was expelled, so I think -- I think he

1           actually eventually brought it on himself. Of all the  
2           things to do, he went into town and stole a suit.  
3           Extraordinary. And he was thrown out for that. That  
4           was the end of that. But, you know, with hindsight  
5           maybe that was just a fantastic excuse to get rid of  
6           a pretty nasty character. But his behaviour at that  
7           time, I'm not aware that there was any intervention  
8           directly -- there might have been, but I wouldn't  
9           necessarily see it. You know, you can, "[REDACTED] come  
10          here, let's have a little chat", so someone may have  
11          spoken to him but you wouldn't necessarily be aware of  
12          that.

13        Q. So reading that short, someone who you describe who  
14          could deploy nasty behaviour gets expelled because he's  
15          actually stolen something, but for the nasty behaviour  
16          in school --

17        A. No.

18        Q. -- nothing?

19        A. No.

20        Q. Okay. You talk of your time at Fettes at paragraph 102  
21          as really happy but educationally it was a disaster  
22          because you had been having so much fun, perhaps?

23        A. Mm.

24        Q. But, as we read, and you've mentioned your wife today  
25          and very positively and enthusiastically, because, put

1 short, she's been a very good thing in your life. Fair?

2 A. (Witness nods).

3 Q. You've done very well?

4 A. (Witness nods).

5 Q. Professional career notwithstanding the educational  
6 disaster?

7 A. Mm-hmm.

8 Q. Successful career.

9 A. I could dust myself down and go and repair some of the  
10 damage.

11 Q. Well, let's talk briefly about the damage. You've  
12 already alluded to it. What happened at New Park is  
13 still impacting today.

14 A. (Witness nods).

15 Q. In terms --

16 A. Every day. You live with it every day. You just learn  
17 to -- you learn to manage it. You know, I mean,  
18 45 years later, at the slightest scratch of the surface,  
19 I'll still get upset about it and you just have to live  
20 with that. There's nothing -- I really don't think  
21 there's anything that anyone can do about that. There's  
22 been a couple of -- a couple of attempts. Actually,  
23 particularly, I should say -- well, Future Pathways.  
24 I spoke at tremendous length to a really, really  
25 wonderful lady who actually really, you know, really



1 dragged me right through, in a very nice way, drag,  
2 I mean, encouraged me to talk about what had happened to  
3 me in detail that I had -- that I had never spoken about  
4 in my entire life. That was -- that was very helpful,  
5 very positive, and I'm very, very deeply, deeply  
6 grateful for that. But it will never repair -- I know  
7 that I will never ... (Pause).

8 It's a very strange thing. If you were physically  
9 injured, it would be blindingly obvious what had  
10 happened to you. But people like me that have had these  
11 things happen, you don't -- no one sees it. You carry  
12 it round and it's just part of you and nobody --  
13 nobody -- apart from in my case [REDACTED], really --  
14 understands how difficult it is sometimes just to do the  
15 simplest of things. And it will stay with me forever to  
16 the day I die. There's no repairing it.

17 And I don't say that in a -- you know, that's just  
18 a facts. That's it. I've, you know, spoken to people  
19 and I've had crisis and admitted myself -- maybe [REDACTED]  
20 admitted me, I'm not sure -- to The Priory on one  
21 occasion where I just got completely overwhelmed, just  
22 completely overwhelmed for reasons that when I look back  
23 I would struggle. We had a desperate time for -- it  
24 must have been -- I can only imagine what [REDACTED] was  
25 going through, but, you know, there was a lot going on

1 at work, we had young kids and all of that, it just  
2 overwhelmed me, just completely overwhelmed me. But  
3 that's back to that feeling of constraint, and that's  
4 how bizarre that is. That's the feeling of constraint  
5 generated by the people that love me. I mean, that's  
6 how weird -- that's how weird that is.

7 Q. Although you do talk about, because of all that you've  
8 done in the last few years, you have begun to be able to  
9 talk about it perhaps more easily?

10 A. I would never have been able to -- not long ago I would  
11 never have been able to sit here. I just couldn't.  
12 I mean, it was -- I just couldn't even get anywhere  
13 close to talking about it. I just couldn't. But I've  
14 had so many years of -- you watch the telly in a sense  
15 -- well, you know, you put it in a box and you put it  
16 over there in your mind. That is exactly what you do.  
17 You just -- you just package it all up and put it in  
18 a place in your mind and you just leave it there and you  
19 don't go there, you just don't, because when you do,  
20 it's an unstoppable emotional rollercoaster, and you  
21 just -- it overwhelms you. It completely overwhelms  
22 you.

23 But I -- you know, one of the reasons I wanted to,  
24 you know, come and speak to you is -- you know, we have  
25 to talk about these things, sooner or later, and it's

1           wonderful that this Inquiry is doing all this work  
2           because I think people need to better understand what  
3           happens to -- you know, the damage it does, how it  
4           happens, you know, et cetera, et cetera. And as part of  
5           that I have spoken to people and I can have got to the  
6           point where I can sit here without completely falling to  
7           pieces. So for me that is enormous progress from where  
8           I was. I wouldn't have been able to do that.

9           So yes, I am in a much, much, much better place than  
10          I was, but I was in a truly terrible place where  
11          I would -- if I got upset, I would just break down  
12          crying for a very long time.

13        Q. Is there anything else you'd like to add?

14        A. Just thank you for the work you're doing. And Heather,  
15          she's been fab. Thank you.

16        MR BROWN: 'Andrew', I have no further questions.

17        LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for  
18          questions?

19          'Andrew', that completes all the questions we have  
20          for you. But my thanks go to you for having engaged  
21          with us now over a number of years since first coming  
22          forward and signing your statement in 2018.

23          It's been of enormous assistance to me not just to  
24          have your evidence in your statement as obviously  
25          I have, but to hear from you today and see you for

1           myself. It really makes matters come alive and enhances  
2           the learning that I'm doing every day here, enormously.  
3           I couldn't do it without you.  
4   A.   (Witness nods).  
5   LADY SMITH: So thank you very much indeed for that.  
6   A.   Pleasure.  
7   LADY SMITH: I'm able to let you go and I hope the rest of  
8           your just day gets better and better than what we've put  
9           you through this morning.  
10   A.   Thank you very much. Just leave all this here?  
11   LADY SMITH: Yes, if you leave it, we'll tidy it up.  
12    (The witness withdrew)  
13   MR BROWN: It's simply that door, if it's held open too  
14           long.  
15   LADY SMITH: Yes, of course.  
16   MR BROWN: I think. Anyway --  
17   LADY SMITH: Time for a break?  
18   MR BROWN: I think it is.  
19   LADY SMITH: Very well. I'll rise now and we'll get back to  
20           other evidence after the break.  
21   (11.46 am)  
22    (A short break)  
23   (12.09 pm)  
24   LADY SMITH: Ms Bennie, whenever you're ready, I'm ready for  
25           you. Thank you.

1 MS BENNIE: My Lady, the first read-in bears the reference  
2 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain  
3 anonymous and she's adopted the pseudonym of 'Kirsty'.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 'Kirsty' (read)

6 MS BENNIE: "I have tried not to think about this experience  
7 over the years but when the Me Too movement came on it  
8 made me think of my experience at Fettes (1977-78). My  
9 [REDACTED] teacher was a male teacher who I understood in  
10 later years had been thrown out of a previous school.

11 For some unknown reason he was put in charge of the  
12 young boys boarding house and the young kids would talk  
13 to me in the art class about him giving them sweets and  
14 such and I used to suggest to them that they shouldn't  
15 spend time with him alone.

16 Whether or not this got back to him, he used to  
17 delight in trying to humiliate me in the [REDACTED] class  
18 where I was the only girl. He would have me read out  
19 all the most inappropriate passages in anything that we  
20 happened to be reading. He would pick on me  
21 mercilessly. You could ask any of my contemporaries  
22 from that class and I am certain that they would  
23 remember this being standard routine. I complained  
24 about him to my head of house at Arniston but I was  
25 ignored. When it came to college applications he

1 insisted on my putting a particular university on the  
2 list or he wouldn't give me a reference. His behaviour  
3 was consistently unsettling, aggressive and belittling  
4 and sadly dented my entire experience at Fettes, giving  
5 rise to an anxiety disorder that crippled me for much of  
6 my 20s."

7 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email  
8 and it's dated 16 September 2020.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 'Thomas' (read)

11 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

12 WIT-1-000000422. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain  
13 anonymous and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Thomas':

14 "My name is 'Thomas'. My year of birth is 1967.

15 I was born in 1967 and I was adopted as a baby.

16 I was sent to board at Clifton Hall School in 1974,  
17 aged 7, and gained a minor scholarship to Fettes College  
18 in 1980.

19 I arrived at Fettes aged 13. I endured the full  
20 five years there.

21 I was in Glencorse House under a teacher named

22 **FTG**. There was no comfort. The dormitories were  
23 cold and the showers were in a cold stone room. Add to  
24 this the strange atmosphere of institutionalised  
25 cruelty. I broke my wrist playing rugby when I was 15

1 and the school nurse told me that I had to take off my  
2 boots before she'd attend to me. I took off my boots  
3 one-handed in severe pain. She definitely knew I had  
4 a breakage. I can't remember her name. I remember  
5 an English teacher, Mr Reeves, once said to me, "You're  
6 not supposed to enjoy it here". It was a witty comment  
7 over a meal.

8 I was constantly tired from the lack of privacy and  
9 noise at night in dormitories in which there were up to  
10 16 beds. A boy used to come into our dormitory late and  
11 slam the door. One night someone complained so he  
12 turned on the lights and went round poking us with  
13 a broom to properly wake us up. There was no  
14 supervision by staff of the dormitory at night. Older  
15 pupils were constantly wandering in after lights out.  
16 They were not meant to but the place was a shambles  
17 under **FTG**.

18 I was constantly hungry from a lack of food and  
19 having no money to buy any more. I can't remember  
20 details of what we got for meals. I do remember that  
21 all the meals seemed to involve chips. Basically, the  
22 food was poor.

23 I was constantly depressed and quiet.

24 Abuse.

25 I very quickly became aware of a strange atmosphere

1 of literally constant verbal abuse between the pupils.  
2 This was known as mocking. As a tall person, I was  
3 given plenty of abuse of this type.

4 In my first week, I was assigned a prefect for whom  
5 I was a fag. This involved cleaning his study and other  
6 tasks. This person later loudly referred to me as  
7 a 'lazy shit'. During my first term at Fettes, I came  
8 out of this prefect's study to be confronted by a group  
9 of sixth formers. One of them, A, told me that I was  
10 'gorgeous' and groped me aggressively in front of  
11 a group of his laughing friends. This involved trying  
12 to put his hands inside my trousers and feeling my  
13 genitals. A was a pupil in Glencorse House.

14 About an hour later, I was lying in bed in  
15 a dormitory and A came in and tried to grope me under  
16 the sheets. I remember the detail of his pens falling  
17 out of his top pocket as he did this. A teacher named  
18 Michael McIntosh-Reid came in as this was happening and  
19 didn't say anything. A looked embarrassed and left. He  
20 never spoke to me again. I still don't know if  
21 Mr McIntosh-Reid had a word with him. These events were  
22 never mentioned by anyone who witnessed them. From then  
23 on, Fettes became a place to be endured, to defend  
24 myself from. I identified hugely with the sixties  
25 counterculture, rebelling against a rotten system.



1           There was a constant unpredictable bullying. One  
2 sixth former attacked a fourth former in a queue and  
3 said to us, 'That's what you'll all get'. The sixth  
4 former was also a pupil in Glencorse House. The fourth  
5 former was shaken up. Staff were not told about the  
6 attack.

7           One poor child, B, was constantly bullied by his  
8 peers. I do not know if staff were aware of this.  
9 B tried to commit suicide, but [REDACTED] much to his  
10 tormentors' delight. B recently wrote a short story  
11 about being bullied.

12           I was picked to do a cross-country run aged 13,  
13 which included running through a freezing pond while the  
14 rest of the school stood and laughed. This wasn't  
15 a punishment. It was a sporting event called the  
16 steeplechase. I think it must have been discontinued  
17 after 1981. The punishments were the notorious training  
18 runs. I couldn't even be bothered finishing the race.  
19 I just went back to the house I was in. By the summer  
20 of 1981, I had become very withdrawn and stayed away  
21 from sports, which was something we were all meant to do  
22 and I was always relatively good at - more shoving and  
23 verbal abuse. For me it was all about music now. My  
24 home life was grim too. I escaped into music.

25           At this time, my closest friend, C, was being

1 bullied by an older boy in Carrington House. C  
2 complained about this for years. He told me that the  
3 boy once made him squat for hours motionless whilst  
4 being verbally abused. In 1981, C walked out and  
5 refused to go back.

6 At I got older, the atmosphere seemed marginally  
7 less horrible. I skived whatever I could and continued  
8 to pass exams. In 1985, I reported that two third  
9 formers were bullying a contemporary, which was dealt  
10 with by the new housemaster. Parents were never told or  
11 asked about these matters. It was as if we deserved  
12 this treatment.

13 Inspections and visits.

14 There was no interest from parents or teachers in  
15 our physical or mental welfare. The idea of inspections  
16 or visits was unthinkable. Parents visited once a year.  
17 Nobody asked us about our well-being ever. There was  
18 a kind of Wild West atmosphere and the teachers seemed  
19 indifferent. As a friend of mine said: institutional  
20 abuse was the status quo.

21 Impact.

22 I have no happy memories of feeling included, loved  
23 or appreciated. I was still at a vulnerable age when  
24 I went to Fettes and was treated appallingly. Worse  
25 still, no one seemed to care. As an adult I have

1 a loathing of posh accents and am defensive often,  
2 though my life in music and my family have been a joy to  
3 me.

4 I have no objection to my witness statement being  
5 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

6 I believe the facts in this statement are true."

7 My Lady, the statement is signed and it's dated  
8 9 September 2020.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 'Robert' (read)

11 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

12 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain  
13 anonymous and he's adopted the pseudonym of 'Robert'.

14 'Robert' was a pupil of Fettes College. He was a pupil  
15 in Arniston House from January 1980 to July 1981 and  
16 a pupil in Kimmerghame House from September 1981 to July  
17 1984. His housemaster was David Orchard.

18 "In the time I was at Fettes I would say it had its  
19 issues such as bullying, which I am happy to see is now  
20 promptly addressed and stamped out. I loved my rugby at  
21 Fettes and house life for the main was okay. 80 years  
22 is a big period but in my time it was not a super-happy  
23 school but times were different compared to today, you  
24 just got on with things - and the food was dreadful!

25 I would say in closing that there was no abuse that

1 I was aware of from staff or otherwise."

2 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email  
3 and it's dated 15 September 2020.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

5 'Alistair' (read)

6 MS BENNIE: The next statement bears the reference

7 FET-000000213. My Lady, this witness wishes to remain  
8 anonymous and he's adopted the pseudonym of 'Alastair':

9 "I'm afraid my time at the school was not a happy  
10 one because of the culture of violence and abuse.  
11 Looking back, it has had a scarring impact on me. It  
12 has taken me many years to overcome the deep-seated  
13 trauma.

14 I was in Carrington House from 1984 to 1989.  
15 Cameron Cochrane was the headmaster at the time.  
16 Bob Philip was my housemaster. My prep school,  
17 Belhaven Hill, had strongly advised my parents not to  
18 send me to Fettes because of its reputation for  
19 bullying. However, one of the chaplains,  
20 Norman Drummond, lobbied my parents to send me to  
21 Fettes. The term I arrived, he left in order to become  
22 headmaster of Loretto. I have always wondered if he  
23 understood the harm he caused me. If Belhaven was  
24 aware, did he really not know? Or did securing a boy  
25 from a feeder school matter more?

1           The violence began on my first day at Fettes. We  
2 gathered for a roll call in the Carrington House square.  
3 We were lined up against the wall. I was young, my 13th  
4 birthday had been the month before. The upper sixth  
5 were on the balustrade above and walking around the  
6 square. One of them had a metal pipe and long darts  
7 made of nails and paper for flight. By blowing, he  
8 could shoot a nail at high speed into the wall. The  
9 prefect fired the nails at us, near to our head and  
10 between our legs. If we moved, we were attacked with  
11 a hockey stick. This was my first day at school. Every  
12 subsequent roll call became a moment of extreme fear,  
13 that you would be attacked and hurt. Where were the  
14 adults?

15           That first night in our dormitory we were attacked  
16 with hard objects stuck into socks. This was a pattern  
17 repeated constantly. Going to bed at night, we were  
18 always worried we would be attacked. You learned to  
19 curl up in a ball and take the beatings.

20           Every day you faced violence. For example, one of  
21 the upper sixth used to take pleasure in head-butting us  
22 to the point of headache-inducing, ear-ringing  
23 concussion. The attacks were impossible to predict and  
24 unprovoked. If you were to pass him in the corridor, he  
25 would attack you. I remember being punched in the

1           stomach and winded frequently. The agony of lying on  
2           the floor unable to breathe. I remember the bruises of  
3           hockey sticks. There were punishment runs. There was  
4           a culture of hierarchical brutality. By the end of the  
5           first term, a third of my form at Carrington was moved  
6           by their parents to a new school.

7           The saddest thing about such violence, and though it  
8           was not sexual, it was the most vicious aggression  
9           directed at young children, is how it undermines your  
10          very sense of worth. I came to believe that such things  
11          were the norm and that for whatever reason I had no  
12          value. That was my lot in life. I used to wonder if  
13          I would ever find joy in life, like other children  
14          seemed to. I had been placed by my parents in this  
15          situation - and while other parents removed their  
16          children, I was offered no such protection. I lacked  
17          the social skills to negotiate my way out of situations.  
18          I learned that my two options in life were fight or  
19          flight. I learned that I was not loved and did not  
20          deserve to be loved.

21          The violence had an impact on all of us in  
22          Carrington third form. For me, I developed very strong  
23          social anxiety. I could not go to parties in the  
24          holidays for fear of being mocked or bullied. I used to  
25          sit at home day after day avoiding contact with others.

1 My academic work suffered from the indolence caused by  
2 depression. I missed deadlines and did the bare minimum  
3 to keep up with academic studies. I was angry with  
4 others. I could not cope with social relationships.  
5 I underperformed. Other contemporaries failed their A  
6 levels, the impact blighting their long-term career  
7 prospects. I understand that others continued to have  
8 mental health problems long after we left.

9 In the long term, I have suffered until well into my  
10 40s with post-traumatic stress disorder, which only in  
11 the last couple of years has counselling allowed me to  
12 mitigate. The PTSD was less about the violence but more  
13 the deep-seated social anxiety, situations in which  
14 I had said or done the wrong thing played over and over  
15 in my head. It has had an impact on my career and how  
16 I treat others around me.

17 Only in coming to terms with my past have I had the  
18 confidence to be myself and be a better, easier person.  
19 I suffered rages that others did not deserve.  
20 I suffered continually from depression and insomnia for  
21 years. I had two failed marriages before meeting my  
22 current wife, whose deep Christian values, wisdom and  
23 strength has for the first time given me the confidence  
24 that I am deservant of love and that I can love without  
25 fear. I have experienced too the love of God.

1           I also retain a deep sense of shame. In such  
2           an atmosphere, one becomes complicit in acts of evil.  
3           I remember being part of a group that hung a noose at  
4           the end of a boy's bed because he was black. I remember  
5           not intervening when a boy was beating the shit out of  
6           a little Pakistani boy. I was aggressive towards  
7           others.

8           I have heard anecdotally that at least one boy has  
9           been traumatised by the knowledge that he was  
10          a perpetrator of violence and, as a man, felt the need  
11          to write to others to seek forgiveness. This is what  
12          a culture of violence does: there are only victims.  
13          Small boys become traumatised men.

14          I came back to Fettes for the first time in October  
15          2019. I had avoided the school because, for me, it was  
16          a place of deep unhappiness. I did not go back to my  
17          boarding house. In the run-up to the Commem dinner,  
18          I was deeply worried about how I would be treated by my  
19          contemporaries, so instilled was my sense that to them  
20          I offered no value. The experience was cathartic. And  
21          the opportunity to discuss those experiences with those  
22          friends and understand that I was not the only one who  
23          had suffered was important to me. My cohort from school  
24          were delightful, warm people and I only wish that I had  
25          known them like that all those years ago. I could see



1           that the Fettes of today was a warm and happy place.

2           I attended the chapel for the Commem service.  
3           Chapel had always felt like a safe place. I was  
4           saddened that the address though only spoke of how  
5           generations of Fettes had always supported each other.  
6           I am afraid that this felt like history as we would  
7           like, rather than history as was. They were warm words  
8           without truth. I think Fettes needs to confront its  
9           past and recognise that for some of us it was a violent  
10          and evil place which has had a profound and sad impact  
11          on our lives."

12          My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email  
13          and it's dated 17 September 2020.

14   LADY SMITH: Thank you.

15   'Susan' (read)

16   MS BENNIE: My Lady, the next statement bears the reference  
17           FET-000000213. The witness wishes to remain anonymous  
18           and has adopted the pseudonym of 'Susan':

19           "I attended Fettes College for a year in the early  
20           1980s. At that time, Arniston House did not have any  
21           capacity to provide me with a room and so I stayed with  
22           a nearby family along with a roommate. The  
23           accommodations were clean and spacious, and the host  
24           family was distant. We rarely interacted.

25           Whilst at Fettes, I struggled with cultural changes

1 and rules, especially as delivered by a master who I can  
2 only remember by his student-assigned moniker, the Tin  
3 Man, but I never felt a shred of fear, lack of safety or  
4 inappropriate conduct by any staff, instructors or  
5 fellow students.

6 The Tin Man was mean-spirited. He openly and  
7 publicly mocked my American accent, American language  
8 usage, my unfamiliarity with protocol, and he caused me  
9 to be afraid of him, but only to be afraid of potential  
10 further humiliation, not bodily harm.

11 I was part of a rebel group of students who  
12 regularly met in a clandestine fashion in large  
13 rhododendron bushes with names of African countries to  
14 smoke cigarettes and talk about everything under the  
15 sun. There were never any rumours or reports of  
16 inappropriate conduct between adults and students at the  
17 school, and I think if such a thing was happening,  
18 I believe it would have been a subject of discussion.

19 On the whole, I felt a sense of belonging and  
20 community at Fettes. I experienced order and routine  
21 that had otherwise been missing from my life. I cherish  
22 my experiences there and feel I am a more complete  
23 person for having attended.

24 I now work in animal protection and I am very  
25 sensitised to the harms that child abuse pose for

1 people, and I understand the grooming or abuse that can  
2 happen. What I witnessed as Fettes was appropriate  
3 distance and separation between pupils and adults. We  
4 lived and operated in two different spheres."

5 My Lady, this statement is in the form of an email  
6 and it's dated 15 September 2020.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

8 MS BENNIE: My Lady, that concludes the read-ins for today.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

10 MR BROWN: My Lady, as indicated, that is the end of today's  
11 evidence.

12 Tomorrow we will have further read-ins.

13 An applicant who unfortunately we had hoped would give  
14 live evidence, but isn't. There will then be a live  
15 witness, and then a particularly long read-in, which may  
16 take up most of the afternoon.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

18 That completes the evidence for today. Thank you to  
19 everybody who has attended to listen to it. I'll rise  
20 now and sit again at 10 o'clock as usual tomorrow  
21 morning. It will be different on Friday, but 10 o'clock  
22 tomorrow.

23 (12.30 pm)

24 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am  
25 on Thursday, 2 December 2021)

I N D E X

1

2

3 'Andrew' (affirmed) .....1

4       Questions from Mr Brown .....2

5 'Kirsty' (read) .....69

6 'Thomas' (read) .....70

7 'Robert' (read) .....75

8 'Alistair' (read) .....76

9 'Susan' (read) .....81

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

