

1 Friday, 3 December 2021

2 (8.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning and welcome to all the early
4 birds. Thank you for being able to get here so soon.

5 I see we seem to have a link in place, Mr Brown; is
6 that right?

7 MR BROWN: My Lady, we do. This is 'Claire'. We've tested
8 the system. There is a slight lag potentially, but we
9 can hear and see and vice versa.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

11 'Claire', good morning, or good evening, I should
12 say to you because I think it's probably about 7 o'clock
13 in its evening with you. Is that right?

14 THE WITNESS: Yes, that's correct.

15 LADY SMITH: Thank you for joining us over the link. I can
16 see you very clearly. I'm told that you're seeing us
17 clearly and I hope that's right, and I can hear you
18 clearly.

19 THE WITNESS: Yes.

20 LADY SMITH: If you have any problems with the link, please
21 let us know as soon as possible so that we can try and
22 sort it out.

23 Before we turn to your evidence I'd like to begin
24 with you taking an oath, please.

25

1 'Claire' (sworn)

2 LADY SMITH: Now, 'Claire', I'll hand over to Mr Brown in

3 a moment. I know giving evidence to an Inquiry isn't

4 straightforward, it isn't the easiest thing to do, and

5 I know that giving it over a videolink when you don't

6 have us physically with you to provide the support that

7 we'd like to afford can make it harder. So if you have

8 any questions or if you want a break, please let me

9 know. Whatever works for you works for me, all right?

10 A. Okay, thank you. Can I just make one observation.

11 LADY SMITH: Please do.

12 A. You're very small on my screen and then I have a big

13 image with the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry details. Is

14 that how it's supposed to be in case you're sharing

15 documents?

16 LADY SMITH: Yes, because we will be, I hope, enabling you

17 to see your statement when we're referring to it on the

18 screen.

19 A. Okay, that's fine.

20 LADY SMITH: I think you've seen quite enough of me,

21 'Claire'. If it bothers you, we could turn it around.

22 A. No, no, I was just checking that's the way it should be.

23 That's good.

24 LADY SMITH: You should see now that your statement's coming

25 up.

1 A. Yes, that's correct.

2 LADY SMITH: Good.

3 Mr Brown.

4 Questions from Mr Brown

5 MR BROWN: My Lady, thank you.

6 'Claire', good evening again. You have your

7 statement, I think you have a paper copy as well that

8 you've printed out; is that correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. If we can begin with that, and forgive me as I read its

11 reference number into the record, it's WIT-1-000000499,

12 we see this is a statement that runs to 39 pages and on

13 the last page we see that you signed it on 9 November

14 2020, correct?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. And your last paragraph reads:

17 "I have no objection to my witness statement being

18 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

19 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

20 true."

21 One thing about that, obviously, we're dealing with

22 events in your statement going back quarter of a century

23 plus. Memory, would you agree, can be a fickle thing?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Thank you. You are obviously being called 'Claire'

1 today because you're afforded anonymity. You will
2 understand that a number of people are mentioned in your
3 statement. They, likewise, broadly have anonymity too,
4 so other names will be used. Do you have a list of the
5 other names that are being used?

6 A. The pseudonyms?

7 Q. Yes.

8 A. No.

9 Q. Right, okay. If you just go with me, I'll probably lead
10 you on that.

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. Great, thank you.

13 Obviously this part of the Inquiry is involved with
14 Fettes school and we know that you went to Fettes from
15 1990 to 1993.

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. And that was when you were between the ages of 10 and
18 13?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Because you're now 41.

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. You mention other schools and we will talk about them
23 too for the comparative purpose, but also just to see
24 whether some things were done in those schools better or
25 worse. And obviously we'll also talk about the impact

1 of what you're talking about in the statement and your
2 thoughts about improving things for children now. And
3 should we understand that you work in teaching?

4 A. I used to. My background's in teaching. I'm not
5 currently in teaching. I'm now in education design.

6 Q. I see. But you've had experience of being a teacher?

7 A. 20 years of teaching, yeah.

8 Q. What did you teach?

9 A. Languages, English, French and some Italian.

10 Q. Okay. And presumably you saw the life from the other
11 side and sometimes difficult pupils?

12 A. I did, although I have to say I've predominantly taught
13 adults, so I taught children briefly, high school, but
14 predominantly I've taught adults.

15 Q. Going back to your background, and we don't need to
16 labour it, your background in terms of languages,
17 perhaps that's relevant. You had experience of a number
18 of languages growing up?

19 A. Yes, that's correct. My father's Swiss from Geneva so
20 I grew up bilingual speaking French and English. My
21 mother's from Edinburgh.

22 Q. In fact, as I think you say in your statement, when you
23 came back to Edinburgh, having been brought up, in part
24 at least, abroad, English was perhaps not your first
25 language and that was something that had to be worked on

1 to get you up to speed?

2 A. Yeah, that's correct. So when I went to St George's in
3 Primary 3, a few sounds in English I didn't pronounce
4 well so they offered me extra support in pronunciation
5 and also my handwriting, which was very French.

6 Q. Okay. But we see from page 2, paragraph 5, that your
7 family had a very strong link to Fettes, and that's
8 through your mother and your grandfather?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. You make the point in paragraph 6:
11 "The decision for me to go to Fettes was made by my
12 mum before I even existed."

13 A. Yeah, it was always the plan that we would all go to
14 Fettes.

15 Q. So, really, there was no choice in the matter so far as
16 you were concerned; it was happening?

17 A. It was happening and it was something that I didn't
18 even -- Fettes was like a family. We were there all the
19 time on the grounds. People from Fettes visiting our
20 house in Edinburgh. On my mother's side of the family
21 it was talked about all the time and my grandfather,
22 having gone there as a pupil and taught there [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED] it was in our blood.

24 Q. And it mattered tremendously to your mother?

25 A. Absolutely.

1 Q. It was her life?

2 A. It was her life and it was very dear to me and my
3 brothers.

4 Q. And that was something that was inculcated by your
5 mother to you and your brothers, in other words it was
6 passed down?

7 A. It was. And also my grandparents, when we'd visit
8 Edinburgh. And like I said, we'd meet other Old
9 Fettesian families and it was part of our circle of
10 friends and tea parties at my grandmother's house and
11 pupils and other housemasters would visit my
12 grandfather, so it was very much part of our life.

13 Q. You've mentioned you have two brothers and the same
14 process was expected of them?

15 A. Absolutely.

16 Q. And for them. You talked very passingly about your
17 grandfather. He had retired, I think we've heard, in
18 the 1970s, so he had been long gone from Fettes by the
19 time you started.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. But he had talked to you about Fettes in the past and
22 I think the picture of it was quite a hard school?

23 A. I guess so, but it was the image that was painted of
24 that era, that's what happened in private schools, that
25 there was far more discipline, it was a boys' school, it

1 definitely was -- it was just the culture, I guess, that
2 was expected of the era. That's how I saw it. I never
3 expected that that would still be going on.

4 Q. No. But we would understand you come back to Scotland
5 in 1987, but you're too young, obviously, at that stage
6 to start at Fettes so instead you went to St George's?

7 A. Yes, correct.

8 Q. And I think from what you say, both before and after
9 your time at Fettes, the three years you spent there,
10 St George's you view positively?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And we'll come back to that. Given your experiences,
13 had you had the choice, would you have ever gone to
14 Fettes?

15 A. It's hard to say because it was just in my psyche that
16 I would always go to Fettes and I was excited to go,
17 I couldn't wait to go because my brothers were there and
18 it was in the family and I loved the grounds and I was
19 excited to go.

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. I didn't question it.

22 Q. You didn't question it. Okay, we'll come back to that.

23 At paragraph 21 on page 5 you talk about going to
24 Fettes. You've just said you were excited, but you
25 found the teachers at Fettes were:

1 " ... not as maternal or as warm as they had been at
2 St George's. There were a lot more male teachers at
3 Fettes so maybe I put it down to that. There were fewer
4 female teachers. Fettes struck me as more traditional
5 and old school ..."

6 But you thought that was normal?

7 A. Yes. I also compared it to Switzerland, where there
8 were no uniforms, it's far more laid-back and quite
9 maternal, so for me Fettes was just -- that was the
10 private school old culture that I expected.

11 Q. Do you remember thinking at the time: this is better or
12 actually I would prefer to be in the culture that I'd
13 had in Switzerland or perhaps St George's?

14 A. Yeah, I think I would have. I think any child would
15 like the maternal touch. But I didn't question it.
16 I just ... I just accepted it and just knowing I was at
17 Fettes and making friends and my brothers were there,
18 I just didn't think about it.

19 Q. It was what was expected of you, is that fair?

20 A. Yeah. Yes.

21 Q. Because the three years you spent there were the junior
22 school; is that right?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You never went into the senior school?

25 A. No.

1 Q. And the junior school, we would understand, you talk
2 about the layout, and we don't need to go back over
3 that, is a distinct part with its own headmaster,
4 effectively, who was called the warden; is that right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. When you arrived, do you remember, was there any
7 settling-in period that was prepared by the school to
8 try and make your easing into the school experience
9 better?

10 A. Not that I remember. All I remember my first day was
11 seeing some familiar faces of children that I'd done the
12 entrance exam with. I remember it was a sunny day,
13 being shuffled into the assembly room, which was the
14 first room when we entered Inverleith House on the left
15 after the cloakroom, and that's -- I don't remember --
16 we were standing up and I do remember feeling faint
17 because it was hot and stuffy, but I don't remember
18 anything special happening that day.

19 Q. Do you think that was the best way to approach
20 a 10-year-old starting a new school? Or could it have
21 been done better, do you think?

22 A. No. Thinking about what my children get today and
23 orientation almost six months before, a year before, and
24 half days at the beginning and easing in, I think it
25 could have been done better.

1 Q. But I think, moving on to paragraph 39 on page 9, one of
2 the things you did think was better was the standard of
3 education was relatively high, you say.

4 A. Yes, and I think that's what I was always told. You
5 know, Fettes is the best school, it has the best
6 results, all the future leaders go there. My
7 grandfather always said how wonderful it was. My uncles
8 went there. That's what I heard.

9 Q. But then you go on to say:

10 "Fettes struck me as being very hung up on its
11 reputation and being seen as the best school whereas
12 St George's had a more modest approach but consistently
13 had better A-level and higher results. There was a love
14 of learning and teaching at St George's and they
15 achieved better results through the environment that
16 they had there and the teaching staff."

17 So is that a comparison you make, having then gone
18 back to St George's and reflected?

19 A. Yes, correct. So when I went to St George's I was still
20 in touch at the time with some pupils from Fettes and
21 actually started realising when I looked at the results
22 from the GCSEs and highers, certainly the year I looked,
23 that St George's actually performed better but no pomp
24 and ceremony was ever made about this. Nothing was
25 mentioned in assembly at St George's or any kind of

1 bragging about it, whereas at Fettes I think we were
2 often told -- and also the advertising that would be put
3 out was often about outstanding education and the best
4 school in Scotland and the top results. And it struck
5 me as a difference.

6 Q. You talk about the reputation. That's obviously, from
7 what you've just said, the school has a view of its own
8 reputation. But in fairness, given the family
9 connection, did your mother have that view of Fettes?
10 Is that the sort of thing she would have said?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Because she seems to have been very tied up with it?

13 A. I think certainly, and my grandfather as well, that it
14 was just the best school that got the best results and
15 it was the best.

16 Q. Okay. You have just talked about St George's and the
17 approach to exam results and the word that was going
18 through my mind, and it's your word, is it was much more
19 humble?

20 A. It was very much -- St George's, I felt, was about
21 bringing out in a child a love of learning and bringing
22 them on a journey of what they were interested in,
23 whereas at Fettes the feeling I got was they wanted to
24 pump out outstanding results in order to boost their
25 reputation. It wasn't so much about the student and

1 what's in their best interest in terms of learning.

2 Q. If we go on to paragraph 49 on page 11, this is another
3 comparison that you make:

4 "I never had any chores to do at Fettes. That was
5 something that struck me as a difference between Fettes
6 and St George's."

7 What were you thinking of?

8 A. So at St George's we had to lay the table, put all the
9 glasses, the cutlery, we had to clear it up and we had
10 to thank the dinner ladies.

11 At Fettes that wasn't the case and I do recall once
12 a boy being very rude to one of the dinner ladies and
13 there was never any appreciation for the helping staff,
14 no thanking them, no setting the table. There was
15 nothing to sort of make us humble or appreciative of the
16 privilege that we had. And in fact going to Fettes,
17 which, you know, now looking back is extremely expensive
18 and most can't afford it, it didn't cross my mind at
19 Fettes, whereas at St George's I think I was made more
20 aware of the privilege of the education I was being
21 given.

22 Q. We see that you describe:

23 "My step-mum, who lives in Switzerland, always said
24 that we were such brats when we went to Fettes ... "

25 Was she right?

1 A. Looking back, I think she probably was. She came into
2 our lives in 1989, so I would have just been going to
3 Fettes just the following year and my brothers were
4 already there, and it did strike her that we did no
5 chores, we -- she said we did behave like brats and we
6 thought we were the best. And she noticed the
7 difference in me when I went to St George's. She did
8 note that.

9 Q. Okay. Obviously we've heard a lot from Fettes and other
10 schools about fagging. Now, you never experienced
11 fagging.

12 A. No.

13 Q. Something you discussed with your brothers, who may have
14 experienced, because they're older?

15 A. I didn't see a lot of my brothers. I mean, they were in
16 the senior school and we had long days, so I really
17 didn't see much of them at all. But fagging was
18 something that I'd heard about probably through my
19 mother, probably my grandfather had mentioned it. It
20 was talked about, just not even rumours, just matter of
21 fact at school and that was something that would happen
22 when we went to senior school. I was just aware of it
23 from very early on. It was just common chit-chat
24 discussion. It wasn't disturbing to talk about. It was
25 just almost an expectation.

1 Q. So it wasn't something that troubled you?

2 A. No.

3 Q. But we would understand -- and I'm sorry, I should have

4 made this point earlier -- you were a day pupil?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And you were always a day pupil, save for a week when

7 you boarded because your parents were, I think, abroad?

8 A. Yes, correct.

9 Q. And you talk about that on page 12, paragraph 53

10 onwards.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. You've mentioned it previously. That was not

13 an experience that you enjoyed?

14 A. No. That stayed with me. It was a very, very traumatic

15 experience.

16 Q. I think, in fairness, to put that in context, were

17 things happening in your parents' lives, they were

18 breaking up?

19 A. My parents broke up when I was two, but I think because

20 I would spend holidays with my father and term time with

21 my mother, that was distressing in itself, leaving

22 a parent numerous times throughout the year for quite

23 a period of time. So separation was already an issue

24 for me. So then having the one week boarding without

25 either parent was ... it just exacerbated the whole

1 thing.

2 Q. Sorry, my mistake, obviously they were divorced. But

3 you talk about you were finding separation in toto, not

4 just the boarding separation, but separation from one or

5 the other, hard at that stage?

6 A. Yes. And I think -- yes. And always had. I mean,

7 I think any child who has to leave their parent for long

8 periods of time, it's not -- it's difficult.

9 Q. You talk about the housemistress who dealt with you at

10 that time and she is someone we will call FGA, okay?

11 A. Okay.

12 Q. And you mentioned FGA, who was a teacher and

13 she was the teacher who met you when I think you were

14 taken to Inverleith House to stay?

15 A. Not even she met me at the front door where I was

16 dropped off every day, yeah, Inverleith House, it wasn't

17 even the boarding part of Inverleith House, she just

18 either happened to be at the door when I arrived or --

19 I'm not sure why she was there. But I do recall her

20 being there at the entrance by the cloakroom and

21 physically pulling me away from my mum and telling me to

22 just move along and telling my mum to go and the faster

23 she went, the better it would be for me.

24 Q. Did you find that helpful?

25 A. No, it was extremely distressing. I recall crying and

1 calling out for my mum and pulling my arms for my mum
2 and being pulled away.

3 Q. And you go on to say:

4 "I remember unpacking and just feeling miserable."
5 And your thoughts at that stage even got as far
6 as -- you say:

7 "This is the one time where I remember having
8 self-harming or suicidal thoughts."
9 It was that level of unhappiness?

10 A. Yeah, I remember unpacking my things and just feeling
11 an overwhelming feeling of sadness and pointlessness.
12 And then throughout that week I do remember just I look
13 back, walking around in a cloud of black darkness and
14 sadness and I remember looking at the top of the stairs
15 once thinking if I threw myself down them, my mum would
16 come back.

17 Q. Although I think as we go on, and we can read this in
18 the statement, a number of teachers were in fact kind
19 and helpful?

20 A. Correct. I mean, I think I was crying all the time.
21 Mr Glen was kind. Sorry, he was the housemaster.

22 Q. Mm-hmm.

23 A. And then there was my French teacher and she was kind
24 enough to allow my brother to come and visit.

25 Q. But I think --

1 A. I remember I'd be in French class just crying.

2 Q. And I think to sum it up, if we could go to paragraph 60
3 on page 13:

4 "I remember it was such a sad awful time. I can't
5 say that was because of the school. I think it was
6 a mix of my parents' divorce and separation issues but,
7 looking at the care that children get now and how
8 St George's was, I think that not much was done to
9 comfort me. I was ten years old and really missing my
10 mum but almost nothing was done and I was just to get on
11 with it."

12 A. I think that's accurate, that -- I'm sure other
13 children, probably the boarders, would have felt the
14 same at the beginning and felt homesick. And I imagine
15 that little was done to help them too, but I can't
16 comment on that. But I did feel that very little was
17 done to comfort me or help me. Yeah, when I compare to
18 St George's when I went back in 1993, the amount of
19 support and help I got and knowing I could go to someone
20 just to cry on their shoulder; I didn't get that.

21 Q. That's only three years on from your experience of
22 a week's boarding.

23 A. Yeah.

24 Q. By 1993, were you told when you got back to St George's,
25 you know, "If you have problems, this is the person you

1 can talk to"? Was it as blunt as that?

2 A. I think -- I can't remember whether there was a specific
3 person to go to. There was the nurse and I would go to
4 her crying almost daily. But then there was a lovely
5 English teacher and nearly all the teachers said, "You
6 can always come to us", and there was one teacher in
7 particular who always had her door open and said, "Come
8 back any time", she was always there and I would
9 regularly go there and -- and other pupils as well.
10 I don't recall there being a counsellor, anyone
11 professional there, but all the teachers -- I felt
12 I could go to all of them and there was always somewhere
13 I could go.

14 Q. That's St George's. How about Fettes?

15 A. That's at St George's.

16 Q. Yes, and how was Fettes in comparison?

17 A. At Fettes I don't recall ever being told who we could go
18 to or where to go. I don't recall there being a nurse.
19 I went to the sanatorium twice, which was in the senior
20 school, and once it was because I had a fish bone stuck
21 in my throat and I was basically told to just sit there
22 and wait and I waited and waited, I think I was there
23 two or three hours with the fish bone stuck in my
24 throat, and in the end I managed to look in the mirror,
25 with a pair of tweezers I found I pulled it out from

1 behind my tonsils on my own. There was very little --
2 I don't even remember the nurse, what she looked like or
3 if it was a female.

4 The other time I went was for a rubella test.
5 I remember we were all really scared to go as girls, we
6 were 12, and we were spiked with a razor. Again, I just
7 remember lining up and that being done.

8 At Inverleith House, nothing, I don't recall ever
9 being told this is who you go to. I don't recall matron
10 at the boarding school, ever seeing her, although
11 I might have to maybe give sheets, but there was nowhere
12 I could go. I think the person I would have gone to was
13 my French teacher and she was the one who was kind
14 enough when I was really homesick. But again it felt
15 very awkward, as any child who's a bit shy of adults, it
16 was really when I was at breaking point that I think
17 I went to her.

18 Q. Okay. So one school seems to have been more thoughtful,
19 at least, about what we would now think of as pastoral
20 care?

21 A. (Witness nods). Absolutely, most definitely.

22 Q. But from what your statement reveals, you were made
23 a prefect. You seem to have been doing well at Fettes.

24 A. Yeah. I was a good pupil, I got good grades, I was in
25 the highest division for every subject. I was made

1 prefect. Yeah, I think I was a good pupil.

2 Q. You talk about discipline, we can read that. Discipline

3 really didn't feature in terms of any corporal

4 punishment in the junior school?

5 A. No.

6 Q. But discipline became a factor for your entire family

7 because of events involving your brother?

8 A. Yes, that's correct.

9 Q. Putting the matter short, because it is not something

10 that we are looking at, you will understand, but he was

11 expelled for drug-taking; is that correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And, put simply, that, would you agree, changed your

14 life?

15 A. Yes. Definitely.

16 Q. Because your mother took ill against that decision and

17 fought very hard against it?

18 A. I'm not sure I would say she took hard to the decision.

19 She took hard to the treatment that he was put through.

20 Q. She was very unhappy that he was expelled.

21 A. She was unhappy that he was expelled, but from what

22 I understand from what she's told me, it was more the

23 treatment that he was put through when he was accused of

24 what he did.

25 Q. I think, in fairness, your brother wants nothing to do

1 with this Inquiry.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. He doesn't want to rake up the past.

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. But your mother -- and we know from the statement she's

6 given, you'll be aware that she gave a statement, and

7 a long statement --

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. -- spent years fighting against Fettes and the way she

10 saw their treatment of your brother.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And that had a significant impact on you?

13 A. It did. I think, as I say in my statement, it might not

14 seem a long time for an adult, but for me if I look back

15 at my teenage years, it was absolutely consumed by what

16 we refer to as the Fettes case.

17 Q. And it consumed your childhood, but that's because your

18 mother was consumed with her fight?

19 A. Yes. I think for my mum, her world came crashing down.

20 Everything she believed in and was dear to her was

21 pulled away from under her feet.

22 Q. Because from what we've heard from her and from what

23 you've been saying, she had lived and breathed Fettes,

24 she had been brought up as a child there, it was

25 everything to her?

1 A. It was everything to her, correct.

2 Q. And we know, for example, that she complained to her MP,
3 she complained to the police, but you would understand
4 that the treatment of your brother, nothing was ever
5 taken further in relation to that? There were
6 complaints made, but they came to nought?

7 A. I'm not sure. I can't comment on that.

8 Q. All right. What you can say is it didn't resolve?

9 A. There was -- it resolved in 1997, as I recall, where we
10 got an apology from Fettes.

11 Q. But what I mean by that is it didn't resolve -- this all
12 started happening in 1992, 1993?

13 A. It certainly didn't resolve then, no, it went on for
14 a long time after.

15 Q. And it went on through your teenage years?

16 A. Absolutely, right through until 1997 when I'd left
17 Edinburgh.

18 Q. Yes. It became extremely polarised?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. The press were involved?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Your mother went to the press, I think, on a number of
23 occasions?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Did you speak to the press through her?

1 A. I might have. I have to say, it's all a bit of a blur
2 and I do remember a journalist in our house. I can't
3 say for sure, but I might have.

4 Q. And so far as you were concerned, you were caught up in
5 all this, did your view of Fettes change before you
6 left?

7 A. Look, I was very influenced by my mother, obviously.
8 I was young. So whatever she would have said,
9 I probably would have taken it as truth. Looking back
10 now, I mean, I loved St George's but I didn't question
11 going to Fettes because it's what my mother wanted, was
12 expected. So then I didn't question leaving Fettes and
13 going back to St George's. I always thought she had my
14 best interests, so that's what was happening.

15 Q. You obviously --

16 A. I look at it now and think I preferred St George's
17 anyway, but would I have wanted to stay at Fettes? Yes,
18 at the time I would have.

19 Q. But is that because of the upbringing you had had, the
20 expectations you had been given of Fettes, Fettes was
21 everything?

22 A. Yeah, absolutely, and I was really wanting to just get
23 to senior school. Inverleith House seemed a bit like
24 a taster and I wasn't quite there yet because everything
25 I'd heard about was the senior school and I was just

1 wanting to get there and be part of that.

2 Q. I think at one stage in your statement the words you

3 used are "I felt empty" when you left Fettes?

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. But that should be understood in the context of how you

6 had been brought up to look at Fettes and to expect what

7 Fettes would be?

8 A. Yes. It was a huge part of our family identity, so

9 having Fettes taken away and -- we had keys to the pool

10 and it was part of our family. It was like losing

11 a sense of identity or losing a part of our body, to be

12 rejected and I can't even explain the feeling when it's

13 been everything you've known, my earliest memories are

14 running on the Queen's Lawn and Founders' Day and

15 endless celebrations there and to suddenly not feel

16 welcome there and being expelled and ostracised was

17 devastating.

18 Q. But the reality, from your statement, seems to be you

19 had a better time at St George's before and after?

20 A. Yes, true. It really is just the family history and the

21 connection and identifying with the school.

22 Q. With hindsight, do you think the family connection and

23 the push for Fettes was unhelpful to you?

24 A. Looking back now as a mother, yes. And for my own

25 children, I don't prescribe to elitist schools such as

1 Fettes here in Australia so it has changed my mind and
2 is definitely not how I would bring up my children.

3 Q. If you had a choice, if you could go back to age 7 when
4 you come to the UK, now would you say actually: thanks
5 very much, I hear what you say, but I'd rather go
6 somewhere else?

7 A. If you could remove the bloodline of Fettes, yes, but
8 you can't separate the two. It was so much part of our
9 blood that I couldn't ever make that decision.

10 Q. Okay. You talked about being expelled. Would you agree
11 there might be an argument to whether that's the right
12 word?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Whatever happened, there was a complete breakdown of
15 relations between your mum and the school?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. And you were part of the fallout from that?

18 A. Yes, and I do feel it was unfair towards me that
19 I wasn't given a choice. It was basically you either --
20 my mother had to stop complaining or withdraw her
21 children, like I was a victim of that argument.

22 Q. And the complaints didn't stop and they rolled on, as
23 we'll come back to, throughout your teenage years, all
24 your time at school, wherever it was?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. You mentioned the pool, and obviously you talk about
2 your swimming teacher in part of your statement. We
3 should understand that that's a gentleman you knew from
4 before joining Fettes because you'd used the pool?
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. Had he taught you to swim?
7 A. Yes. My mum did say that she -- he used to, when we
8 would go there on weekends, that he would -- not
9 official teaching lessons, like I don't think there was
10 money exchanged and an official timetable, but if he was
11 there and I was at the pool with my mother, he would
12 teach me to swim.
13 Q. And you would see him and his wife sitting with their,
14 I think as you say at paragraph 88, with their --
15 A. Sandwiches and a flask of tea, yeah. Very often.
16 Q. And you describe him, but I think the one thing that
17 seems to be agreed is that in water he was very able?
18 He could swim?
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. You go on, because this is obviously an issue that
21 concerns you, you say at paragraph 89:
22 "From as early as I can remember, I remember [the
23 swimming teacher] tickling me and nibbling my ears, my
24 throat and my neck."
25 And your mum would be sitting there as he did this?

1 A. Yes, I recall she would be either swimming laps or
2 sometimes sitting on the side on the bench.

3 Q. Did you understand at that stage that that was just what
4 happened, there was no concern when this was happening
5 when your mum's there when you're learning to swim?

6 A. Yes, I think as a child you're taught -- well, I was
7 taught respect adults, don't make a fuss, and I didn't
8 like it and I didn't want him to tickle me and nibble my
9 ears and do what he was doing, but as a child I just
10 didn't know what else to do and thought, oh, well, just
11 try and get away. He's a family friend and just be
12 polite and don't make a fuss.

13 Q. Should we understand that this would happen as part of
14 games, I think we've heard mention from other sources of
15 this was a game called sharks where he would chase
16 children?

17 A. Yeah, it was almost every -- every lesson. There would
18 be sort of free time, game time at the end.

19 Q. And that's when this would happen?

20 A. Yes, he would jump in the pool.

21 Q. And engage with the children in a more relaxed fashion?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. But a fashion that made you feel uncomfortable?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. But we should understand, from what you say in your

1 statement, that your mum was present when this was
2 happening to begin with before you were a pupil?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And it didn't trouble her?

5 A. You'd have to ask her, but I'd say not.

6 Q. Well, she was there and she didn't intervene is perhaps
7 the inference one can draw.

8 A. Yes.

9 LADY SMITH: How old were you at this time?

10 A. Before I started -- before I started at Fettes when we
11 would be at the pool? I recall from when I was four or
12 five, but my mother has told me that as young as two he
13 would give me swimming lessons or help me to learn to
14 swim.

15 LADY SMITH: Can you remember how old you were when you had
16 learnt to swim, if I can put it that way?

17 A. They weren't official swimming lessons so I think he
18 would -- I remember when I was four he would just sort
19 of hold me by the waist and get me to kick and do the
20 arms, but it was never full laps or -- I mainly recall
21 that he was holding me a lot.

22 LADY SMITH: Okay.

23 Mr Brown?

24 MR BROWN: But I think you came back fully to Edinburgh in
25 1987; is that right?

1 A. That's right. So we would come -- yeah, we would come
2 back for holidays. We did move back in 1984 for about
3 a year and then we came back in 1987.

4 Q. Hence the three years at St George's before you moved on
5 to Fettes?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. But as I think you say, you had concerns, you told your
8 mother at the time, but nothing was done?

9 A. No, I don't think I told her at the time. I don't
10 recall telling her at the time that I was concerned
11 about it. It wasn't until much later on that I told
12 her.

13 Q. But we know, I think, that you told the warden of your
14 anxieties?

15 A. About the swimming teacher?

16 Q. Yeah.

17 A. It was -- we were on a school excursion, so what
18 I recall is we were talking with other pupils on
19 a school excursion and we were somewhere in a forest as
20 I recall, there were a group of us, girls and boys, and
21 one of the teachers, the Latin teacher, overheard us
22 talking. I remember him saying, "Is this true what
23 you're talking about?" and we all said yes, and then the
24 following day or week in assembly we were called to the
25 warden and we were asked if this was true, what was

1 happening in the pool, and then the next thing we heard
2 in assembly a few days later, perhaps, was that the
3 swimming teacher would no longer be getting in the pool
4 with us.

5 Q. I think we have records which confirm that there was
6 a meeting with -- you would be a second year girl by
7 this stage; is that correct?

8 A. I must have been. I have a very mild recollection of
9 that.

10 Q. All right. If we have records from Fettes saying that
11 there was a meeting with second form girls in September
12 of 1992 --

13 A. That would -- yes.

14 Q. -- and a decision was taken that he was no longer to do
15 this, that fits with your recollection?

16 A. Yes. I do remember we were called in and I do remember
17 that we were told he would no longer be getting in the
18 pool. And I remember that the way it was found out was
19 not by any of us officially going to anyone, it was
20 overheard by one of the teachers.

21 Q. Okay, but followed up from that was a meeting, you went
22 to speak to the warden, I think.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Sorry, that's the point I make. You spoke to the warden
25 and action was taken.

1 A. Yeah, he called us into his office and action was taken.
2 Q. And thereafter it stopped?
3 A. He stopped getting in the pool but he got very angry.
4 He was furious about it and he would shout and say,
5 "I can't even get in my pool any more", he was angry.
6 It didn't stop him trying to come into the changing
7 rooms and he did still find ways to touch me. So he
8 would have the hose and if I was walking on the side --
9 on one occasion I remember distinctly him pulling my
10 swimming costume from the front right forwards so he
11 could see down it and putting a hose down. And on
12 another occasion I was on another boy's shoulders and by
13 the side of the pool the swimming master was able to
14 grab my costume from the back and pull it right back and
15 put a hose down. And as I say in my statement, another
16 occasion, this was before he was banned from getting in
17 the pool, he did touch my breasts under water.
18 Q. Okay. That's obviously all in the statement.
19 A. Yes.
20 Q. Please understand we have seen and will read it again.
21 But just as a matter of fact, there was no formal
22 complaint made beyond speaking to the warden in --
23 A. No.
24 Q. -- any time of when you were at Fettes?
25 A. Not as far as I know.

1 Q. Okay. That's one of the passages, obviously, you talk
2 about in your statement under the heading of abuse at
3 Fettes. One of the other things that you -- this is now
4 page 25 -- you'll see a heading there, and that's
5 someone we will call for today's purposes ████████,
6 okay?

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. And this concerns a boat trip.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Which causes you some concerns now?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. I think, to be clear, from your statement, you weren't
13 on the boat trip?

14 A. No.

15 Q. So these are all things that have been reported to you?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Whether they are true or not, you don't know?

18 A. True.

19 Q. And there's one particular girl that you mention
20 something happening to, so would you agree she would be
21 the person who would be best placed to say whether what
22 you're talking about was accurate or not?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. We have sight of her police statement, because there
25 were a number of investigations, you will understand.

1 One in 2015 when the police made a number of enquiries
2 at some length about complaints about Fettes, correct?
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. We have her statement and would it surprise you that she
5 doesn't remember anything untoward happening on that
6 boat trip?
7 A. I'm not sure which of the three girls you're referring
8 to, but there are definitely two in there where that
9 wouldn't surprise me.
10 Q. All right. But, oddly, one of the girls remembers you
11 were on the boat trip.
12 A. Okay, that's very strange. I was most definitely not on
13 that boat trip.
14 Q. Well, it's a divergence of opinion, obviously.
15 A. Yes.
16 LADY SMITH: And this all took place a long time ago.
17 A. Yes. I mean, do you have any records of -- from Fettes
18 of who was on the boat trip?
19 MR BROWN: We have records of people on the boat trip who
20 spoke to the police.
21 A. Okay.
22 LADY SMITH: From what you remember, did this boat trip take
23 place during a period you were a pupil at Fettes?
24 A. Yes. It was in my final year. As I recall it, it was
25 something for the final year of junior school and

1 I remember being very disappointed that I wasn't on the
2 boat trip. I was hoping to go.

3 LADY SMITH: So that's, what, about 28 years ago?

4 A. Yes.

5 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

6 A. 1992, 1993.

7 MR BROWN: Okay. Was this, do you remember, during the
8 initial stages of the difficulties that your mother was
9 having with Fettes over your brother?

10 A. It could have been, yes.

11 Q. Okay. At that stage, presumably, life was more
12 pressured for you because of what was going on to your
13 brother and your mother's response to it?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Were you at that stage engaging in part of the fight on
16 behalf of your brother?

17 A. I wanted to keep my friends, I wanted to stay at Fettes.
18 I would have defended my brother if people said things
19 about him, but in the junior school, apart from those
20 who had older siblings in the senior school, there
21 wasn't much contact or context, and as far as
22 I remember, I still had my friends right up until the
23 end when I left.

24 Q. Okay. There's a description from one of the police
25 statements that you and your friends were going around

1 with yellow notebooks taking notes of what was going on
2 in those last months at school. Does that ring true?
3 A. I don't recall that.
4 Q. Okay. Going back to the statement at page 25 and
5 paragraph 112, there was mention of a particular teacher
6 who's featured and we're calling her FGA, if you
7 recall.
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. This is the same teacher who was unhelpful when you were
10 boarding, correct?
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. And from what you say about her involvement, she picked
13 on you?
14 A. She certainly picked on me on the occasion I describe in
15 my statement, yes. About the story writing.
16 Q. Yes. When was that, just to be clear?
17 A. How was that in terms of how did that feel?
18 Q. No, no, when was that?
19 A. That would have been earlier than 1992. I think I would
20 have been possibly 11, maybe a bit younger. And to
21 clarify, I don't think she picked on me, I think she
22 picked on the stories she felt were bad and she focused
23 on the bad ones rather than the good ones.
24 Q. Okay. It's just at paragraph 113 you say:
25 "FGA picked on me."

1 A. Yeah, not for the story incident, but on other occasions
2 she would pick on me.

3 Q. Right. I just was wondering whether that was in any way
4 connected with the difficulties your mother was having
5 with the school and the battle that was beginning or was
6 that wholly distinct?

7 A. This was before any of that happened.

8 Q. Yes.

9 A. As I recall it, the story incident, when she was writing
10 that poem, it was before anything had happened.

11 LADY SMITH: Can you help me understand how you knew that
12 what FGA had done was select the stories which she
13 thought were the poorer ones, the bad ones, as you call
14 them?

15 A. Yes. As I recall, we each had separate classes
16 for the three classes we had, and I remember writing the
17 story. And like I said, I wrote it about pirates and
18 I did it phonetically as the pirates were speaking.
19 Then I recall being in a larger room with all three
20 classes combined and I remember her saying, "I'm going
21 to read out the three worst stories", and mine was one
22 of the three.

23 LADY SMITH: And you think she was telling you that those
24 were the three that were most badly written as opposed
25 to those were the three stories telling disturbing

1 events or a disturbing account of something somebody
2 imagined? Do you see what I mean? I just wondered --
3 A. I definitely felt that it was those that were badly
4 written and she'd actually -- I recall her writing on my
5 paper crossing out all the words -- for example, I'd
6 written boy boiye to try and phonetically emphasise
7 a pirate's accent and she'd scored it out red and
8 everywhere where I had done that had scored it out in
9 red saying that that was incorrect and wrong and not the
10 right way to write and I recall her reading out the
11 story and trying to encourage others to laugh and make
12 fun of it. And I do recall children feeling awkward
13 about laughing and then being encouraged to do so.
14 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
15 MR BROWN: That's the story episode, but going over the
16 page on to page 26, then more generally you felt she was
17 picking on you?
18 A. Yes. I think she'd pick on me in class. She was
19 just -- I was scared of her. She was very strict.
20 Snappy. I remember saying, "Can I go to the toilet?"
21 and she'd say, "I don't know, can you?" Things like
22 that.
23 Q. But you felt she picked on a certain type of girl?
24 A. Yes. I did feel -- so there were a couple of girls who
25 were also my friends who really liked her, and I did

1 feel she was kinder to them. They tended to be a bit
2 chubbier.

3 Q. Anything else about FGA ?

4 A. In terms of her treatment?

5 Q. Yeah.

6 A. Well, like I say in my statement there, I heard stories
7 from older girls about when she was -- she was
8 housemistress of the boarding school before, and
9 I believe she was housemistress when my brothers started
10 there and they started as boarders. And the general
11 consensus that I heard was that she wasn't kind.

12 Q. Okay. Presumably in all the schools you went to there
13 were what would be perceived as good or bad or
14 indifferent teachers; everyone would have a reputation
15 of some kind?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Some were kinder, some were less so?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Presumably when you taught children, they may have had
20 a view of you, you would have had a reputation amongst
21 the children that you taught?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And presumably at Fettes and with other schools there is
24 a great deal of talk between pupils --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- about such things?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Whether they're true or not you don't know, but you can

4 talk about your experiences of this individual?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And you consider that was abusive behaviour?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Okay, thank you. Thinking about the relationships

9 between pupils, presumably with 10- to 13-year-old

10 girls, people will be in favour, out of favour. It's

11 a bit like a rollercoaster. Friendships will be great

12 and then they'll plunge and not be great. Is that

13 a fair assessment?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Thinking of childhood. And there will be allegations

16 and nastiness from one side and then it will come back

17 from the other and then the sides will change and

18 there'll be further nastiness. That's just the nature

19 of children at that age. Fair?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. But I think you talk about writing a letter to the

22 headmaster of the school?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. This is towards the end of your time at Fettes, and you

25 were unhappy about a number of things; is that correct?

1 A. Yes. I don't recall a lot from that time. I do think
2 my mum told me to write the letter and I would have been
3 influenced by her. I don't remember the contents of the
4 letter much, other than feeling unhappy about things
5 that were being said about my brother and things that
6 were getting hard for me with friendships. But I don't
7 have a great recollection of what I wrote.

8 Q. I think we may have a copy of the letter from material
9 provided by the school. Could we look, please, briefly
10 and see if this works, the technology works. This is
11 FET-000000-290. If we could go to page 8. Can you see
12 that?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Obviously personal details have been redacted. This is
15 a letter dated 25 May 1993 and it's to the headmaster.
16 Is that right?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. What you're complaining about in the first full
19 paragraph after the introduction:

20 "Yesterday after lunch I was playing tennis against
21 the wall at the side of Inverleith House when a group of
22 boys walked past me and blocked my way. I kindly asked
23 them to move. One of them, which happened to be ...
24 made a remark about me leaving the school although
25 I hadn't told them I was leaving Fettes. I fail to

1 understand what it had to do with me asking them to
2 move."

3 Moving on to the next page. It then goes on at some
4 length talking about the way these boys, the group, were
5 treating you.

6 A. Mm-hmm.

7 Q. I appreciate this is a long time ago. Does any of this
8 come back to you when you see it?

9 A. (Pause). No.

10 Q. Okay. It goes on, and rather than labouring through it,
11 I think it's fair to say that there was a great deal of
12 complaint about what other people are saying to you,
13 what you are saying to them, various levels of
14 unkindness, but if we go to page 14, we see that that
15 begins, full paragraph: The next morning your friend and
16 yourself were called into Mr Alexander's office and were
17 informed that a parent had complained about you treating
18 her daughter unfairly and she'd gone home crying the
19 night before:

20 "We were then lectured and told to write down why we
21 were so mean to her. I find it very unfair as I'd gone
22 home crying many times and never once complained and
23 then one remark on the girl and I was put through the
24 unfairness of being accused of bullying by Mr Alexander
25 and forced to be her friend. Mr Alexander said: you

1 will be her friend. I would like to state the fact that
2 [your friend] and I had to go through a 35-minute
3 lecture when another girl only got ten minutes' talk and
4 [the girl that's complaining about you] was seen as the
5 victim [REDACTED]. Mr Alexander didn't
6 seem to care or understand."

7 So you were unhappy about a number of things there.

8 A. Mm.

9 Q. And you're complaining about it to the school because
10 you say:

11 "I think it is my duty as a prefect to inform you
12 that a form of bullying has been going on in Inverleith
13 House."

14 A. Yes. I don't remember writing this letter, but that's
15 what I wrote.

16 Q. Okay. And then you go on to say, final page:

17 "I would also like you to know that I thought I was
18 very unfairly treated last year and although life is
19 often unfair, I do not think I should have been lectured
20 and not listened to. When this unfairness happened to
21 me I felt a huge lump of anger inside me and really felt
22 like telling a member of staff my feelings and I'm very
23 happy to be able to follow up an incident which has
24 happened to me again. What am I supposed to tell people
25 when they ask me why I'm leaving. I do not understand

1 why people are bothered by this. Yours sincerely."

2 And then:

3 "PS If you're going to inform Mr Alexander, please

4 ask him not to mention anything publicly as many people

5 will guess what it is about and I'll be called

6 a grasser."

7 A couple of things from that. This is in the months

8 before you actually left Fettes and during the currency

9 of your mother's anger at the school's treatment of your

10 brother?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Were pressures being raised for you, from what we read

13 there, by other children?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And you weren't particularly happy about it?

16 A. No.

17 Q. You mention not wanting to be a grasser. Was that the

18 culture at Fettes?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You didn't talk or complain?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Was that different from St George's?

23 A. I think to a certain extent amongst children at that age

24 you don't tell on other -- on your peers. But I don't

25 think that extends to mistreatment by adults, for

1 example. So at St George's, I imagine -- I mean,
2 I can't recall, but looking at my children at this age
3 now, I get a lot of that, "No, I can't tell on them,
4 I can't say, I don't want to be a dobber" or whatever
5 they call it now. So I think to a certain extent the
6 age. Yeah, that's all I can say.

7 Q. Okay. But I think we know from your statement that the
8 fallout from this was that you were called to go and
9 speak to Mr Alexander in assembly and that upset you?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And matters then went from bad to worse because your two
12 friends went with you and how would you describe their
13 behaviour when Mr Alexander was wanting to speak to you?

14 A. So they both came with me and then they were forbidden
15 from coming into his office. And then one of the girls,
16 I recall, physically tried to come in and stop [REDACTED]
17 [REDACTED] from blocking her and it was physical. I was
18 already pushed in the office then and my friend was
19 pushed back physically and then the door shut and she
20 was slapped.

21 Q. Who by?

22 A. The [REDACTED]

23 Q. Okay.

24 A. I can say her name but I thought I shouldn't.

25 Q. No, no, she also has a pseudonym but I think we can just

1 call her the [REDACTED] or if you want to use a name,
2 she's known as FGT [REDACTED].
3 A. Okay.
4 Q. Your friend, I think, is called for today's purposes
5 'Betty'.
6 A. Okay.
7 Q. This is a friend who, I think, has been with you through
8 thick and thin since, or certainly in the period of your
9 teens?
10 A. Yes, on and off, yes.
11 Q. You're still in contact with her, she's still your
12 friend?
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. Okay. She was the one who started to get physical
15 trying to push into the room when she was told not to.
16 I think that's what you said?
17 A. Yeah. I wanted her in the room with me and I can't say
18 who got physical first, but she was insisting on being
19 in the room with me.
20 Q. And you were 13 at the time?
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. Having been a teacher, would you understand a teacher's
23 frustration at that sort of behaviour?
24 A. I can understand frustration, but I can't support how it
25 was handled.

1 Q. Okay. But I think that what happened was you had your
2 meeting with Mr Alexander?

3 A. There wasn't much choice given in the matter and I don't
4 think it was a fair position for me to be put in as
5 a 13-year-old girl, to be alone in a room with
6 a housemaster and the [REDACTED]

7 Q. Well, was the [REDACTED] not there as a second person to
8 be --

9 A. It was definitely not any form of comfort for me, and
10 I think as a child at 13 I had every right for the door
11 to be left open or someone there with me.

12 Q. Okay. But the end result of this is the meeting ends,
13 you leave. Is your friend still there waiting outside?

14 A. I can't recall fully. I remember running to the toilets
15 or to the shower and I remember my two friends, there
16 was 'Betty' and there was another girl, I don't know
17 what her pseudonym is.

18 Q. It's all right, she doesn't have one. Just call her the
19 other girl.

20 A. The other girl. And then we all left. They said come
21 on -- I was crying and shaking in the bathroom, they
22 said: come on, let's take you home and go home, and so
23 we signed out and we walked back to my house.

24 Q. And I don't think you or the other two girls -- and I'm
25 sorry, I'm wrong, she does have a pseudonym, she's

1 called 'Stephanie', I don't think either you, 'Betty' or
2 'Stephanie' ever went back to the school?

3 A. Not as a pupil. I do recall going back to say goodbye.

4 Q. But I think at that point, all three of you, the
5 decision is made that you're not going back by your
6 mothers or parents?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. And you would then have a summer in Edinburgh and you
9 returned to St George's and practically life became
10 better day to day because you're going to a school that
11 perhaps suited you better?

12 A. Not quite. So I went off to my father pretty quickly,
13 so I went off to Switzerland and spent the longer summer
14 with him, and then we went on a nice trip overseas to
15 the United States. I remember being very happy to just
16 be away from everything, away from Edinburgh. And
17 I remember being very sad flying back and coming back
18 and starting at St George's.

19 Q. But I think what we then go into, albeit St George's,
20 from what you've been saying, was, as you saw it,
21 a humbler, more interested school -- would that be one
22 way of describing it?

23 A. Yes. So once I settled in, I was very happy.

24 Q. But, and there is a but to this, looking to page 28, the
25 fight against Fettes that your mother's waging goes on

1 throughout all your time at school and that had impact
2 on you?

3 A. Yes, it did. There were some pupils at St George's who
4 had their brothers at Fettes, so that caused tension.
5 And then as I became older and we would go to pubs in
6 the city or balls, the private school circle is quite
7 tight so everybody knew everything and my family was
8 seen as causing trouble.

9 Q. I think if we look at paragraph 123, you say:

10 "It took up all of my teenage years. Five years to
11 my mum would have been nothing but five years to
12 a teenager when it's your entire teenage years is
13 horrible."

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. "It went on from when I was 13 to when I was 17 and it
16 took up my entire teenage years. Edinburgh at the time
17 was very small minded and gossipy especially in the
18 circles of the private schools and it was just toxic."

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. Again with hindsight, do you wish the battle had not
21 been waged?

22 A. I think about that often. I find that one hard to
23 answer because I think my mother did what she thought
24 was best for her child. I wonder what I would have
25 done, and if I felt my child was mistreated, I want

1 to believe I would have done the same thing. But
2 selfishly from my point of view, I wish I hadn't had to
3 have all that.

4 Q. Part of that was reporting to the police on a number of
5 occasions; is that correct?

6 A. So when I was 13, when the three of us, 'Stephanie',
7 'Betty' and I left, then another time, which I do not
8 recall, but I must have in 1998 in Cambridge. I have
9 very vague recollection. And then another time in 2015,
10 which I still don't know the context of that, but I was
11 contacted by the police.

12 Q. So we should understand from that that your mother's
13 response to the meeting with the warden was to call the
14 police?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And the police became involved?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. But I think we would understand there was no follow-up
19 or there was no prosecution or anything of that nature?

20 A. No, not as far as I know.

21 Q. Okay. But then the police become involved in 1998. How
22 do you understand that happened?

23 A. From my understanding, there was -- there were press
24 releases in Edinburgh about the battle between my family
25 and Fettes. I'd left Edinburgh by then. And then, as

1 I understand it, one of the -- [REDACTED] Board
2 of Governors of Fettes had identified me through my
3 mother. And there was an article about the swimming
4 teacher, as I recall, and then as I recall, the police
5 in Cambridge contacted me to give a statement.
6 Q. Acting on behalf of the police in Scotland?
7 A. As I understand it, yes.
8 Q. Okay. You say in your statement that when you spoke to
9 the police in 1993, you didn't mention or make any
10 complaint about the swimming teacher at that point.
11 A. No.
12 Q. But you do make the complaint to the police about the
13 swimming teacher when you speak to them in 1998?
14 A. Yes. I think they contacted me about the swimming
15 teacher, as far as I understand.
16 Q. Okay. And who had told them about the swimming teacher?
17 A. As I understand it, [REDACTED] the Board of
18 Governors of Fettes, [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED] contacted the police and I believe
20 my mother raised the issue. I'm not sure.
21 Q. Well, that's what I was wondering. Is this because your
22 mother has raised the issue of the swimming teacher as
23 part of the fight with the school?
24 A. Possibly. I can't say for sure.
25 Q. Okay. And you gave a statement to the police. Just out

1 of interest, was your mother present when the police
2 were there?

3 A. I can't remember. I don't even remember giving the
4 statement.

5 Q. Okay. Well, you'll be unsurprised to learn we have
6 a copy of the statement because there's a huge paper
7 trail. So we've got that, and obviously you said
8 various things to the police at that stage which we can
9 read.

10 But the net effect of speaking to the police was,
11 I think, that there was no prosecution?

12 A. No. As far as I understand there was -- it was deemed
13 insufficient evidence.

14 Q. Okay. What about 2015?

15 A. That is just a mystery to me to this day. I was
16 visiting my father and out of the blue I got a phone
17 call from Fettes police asking me if I would give
18 another statement. And when I asked how this had come
19 about, I was told that another pupil had given my name.
20 That's all I know.

21 Q. Okay. Did you want to have that matter re-raised in
22 2015?

23 A. I felt indifferent to it, to be honest. If it was going
24 to help and I was asked to give a statement, then
25 I didn't want to say no.

1 Q. Okay. We're looking at this part of the evidence and
2 it's mentioned in your statement on page 36 on to
3 page 37, I think you say in paragraph 164 at the top of
4 page 37:

5 "I gave another statement when I was back in Sydney
6 and although I can't remember giving the statement in
7 1998, when I gave my statement in 2015 I was told by
8 Kevin that it was almost word for word what I had said
9 in 1998."

10 A. That's what he told me. He said it was very similar.

11 Q. Yes.

12 LADY SMITH: And Kevin was the name of the police officer
13 that spoke to you; is that right?

14 A. As I recall it, that was his name.

15 MR BROWN: You go on to say:

16 "In 2015 I was told by Kevin that [the swimming
17 teacher] had been called in by the police and he had
18 used his right to remain silent and hadn't said
19 anything."

20 A. That's what I was told.

21 Q. Is it possible that recollection is wrong?

22 A. As I recall, he said that there was a following up
23 months after I'd given the statement or -- it must have
24 been months and just said he was updating me on the case
25 and that -- I'm not sure what the pseudonym is for the

1 swimming teacher. He'd been called in and had retained
2 his right to remain silent and said nothing.

3 Q. All right. You go on to say that you were told that the
4 decision had been taken that nothing was to come of the
5 police enquiry?

6 A. Yeah, as I was told by Kevin that the decision was made
7 that it would be unacceptable and criminal behaviour by
8 today's standards but that things were different back
9 then.

10 Q. All right. And I think you describe him as being
11 disappointed, is that your recollection?

12 A. Yes, that's my recollection.

13 Q. Okay. I think we know in fact that the swimming teacher
14 did respond to an interview and it ran for an hour and
15 40 minutes, so it would appear there's been some
16 misinformation there, if nothing else.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. But that's your recollection, clearly?

19 A. I clearly remember being told he'd retained his right to
20 remain silent.

21 Q. Okay, thank you.

22 But looking at the rest of the statement in terms of
23 how things progressed, I mean, again, I put this short,
24 life, as you said in your letter to the warden back in
25 1993, is not always easy and that's true of the rest of

1 your life, but you've obviously succeeded. You've had
2 a career in teaching, you now doing educational work.
3 Life has progressed well?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. But has this issue ever left you, the issue of your time
6 at Fettes ever left you?

7 A. No, I don't think so. I think -- I haven't been back to
8 Edinburgh since 2003. It's very hard for me to even
9 imagine going back to Edinburgh. I think it's -- it's
10 affected me deeply, not just -- not just with Fettes,
11 but I guess with just all the teenage years lost and the
12 endless battle and the just bad memories, a bad feeling,
13 and I can't ever see myself living in Edinburgh or
14 Scotland.

15 Q. You talk on pages 34 and 35 about the impact and
16 obviously we can read all the different impacts, but you
17 say in paragraph 153:

18 "When I left Fettes I was just a wreck. When I was
19 13 I started smoking and engaging in risky behaviour.
20 I look back and I'm horrified at how I was."

21 A. Yeah. I look back -- and my son's now 14, and I see how
22 different he is to how I was behaving at 13, 14, and
23 I do remember parents at St George's saying I was bad
24 news and that it was because my parents were divorced,
25 supposedly, that I was getting my ears pierced and

1 wearing short skirts and wanting to have boyfriends
2 and -- I look back now and I realise I was looking for
3 thrills or feeling empty or I wasn't -- I wasn't well.
4 Q. And from what you've said, the ensuing four years didn't
5 help?
6 A. Definitely didn't help. I was very happy when I was at
7 St George's and during the day, but it would be hard if
8 we were at balls with mixed schools or later on going to
9 the Haymarket and then being in night clubs and pubs and
10 there would be Fettesians there. I recall even later
11 when I was at university I worked in a fashion store and
12 some Old Fettesians call came in and made comments. It
13 carried on.
14 Q. It followed you?
15 A. Yeah.
16 Q. But you say at paragraph 154, and I made passing
17 reference to this earlier:
18 "I felt empty after Fettes. When I was at Fettes
19 I felt complete. It was what I was supposed to do, it
20 was the family school and it was lovely. Then I felt
21 there was an emptiness and I wanted to fill that
22 emptiness in some way until I met my husband."
23 So the emptiness was resolved, but it's just --
24 I come back to this. You say it was the family school
25 and it was lovely, but from what you're saying, it

1 wasn't lovely.

2 A. I have happy memories of friends and hockey matches --

3 I think I was happy at Fettes. There was a lot going

4 on, but when everyone is in it together, there's

5 a solidarity and a closeness your friends and you all

6 just -- it was the culture and I would have stayed.

7 Q. Even though St George's before and after was better?

8 A. Well, I wouldn't have known the after, had I stayed.

9 But in hindsight, yes, but I was very happy at my time

10 while I was there at Fettes.

11 Q. And I think we see that as a result of what you endured

12 in the 1990s, you've had counselling?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And you find reassurance from the counselling, as you

15 set out in paragraph 158?

16 A. Yes. I think one of the big things that I've had

17 counselling for is an unrealistic pressure I put on

18 myself to be a high achiever and need to achieve and

19 excel and get recognition for my achievements.

20 Q. Where does that come from, do you think?

21 A. I do feel that being asked to leave Fettes, I felt

22 a huge sense of rejection. I was a very good pupil at

23 Fettes. I got excellent grades. I was made a prefect.

24 I had -- I was popular. I had good friends. And the

25 sense of rejection was extremely hurtful and I think

1 that's left a huge mark on me where afterwards I felt --
2 I remember at St George's just not feeling so confident
3 in my academic ability. I remember developing little
4 tics and nervousness. It stripped away some confidence
5 in me. And then I just felt a need to just excel almost
6 to prove myself. I felt like I'd been rejected from
7 Fettes and they didn't care.

8 Q. Looking to the future, though, and we've touched upon
9 this perhaps a little already, and this is lessons to be
10 learned, page 37 to 38, obviously you've talked about
11 your experience of your children and visits six months
12 in advance. On that practical everyday level, schools
13 are now a great deal more welcoming.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Than you endured.

16 A. Absolutely.

17 Q. And you say, paragraph 167:

18 "Lessons can be learned from what is in place now,
19 certainly from schools in Australia, where there is
20 a formal system in place for child protection. Children
21 know, and are told, from a very young age what their
22 rights are and where to seek help."

23 Can you tell us about that?

24 A. So my children, I'm not sure if it's the same now in
25 Scotland, but children here from the beginning, and it's

1 pasted into their book, about their rights as children.
2 Children's global rights. There's rules outlined from
3 very early on about what's expected of them but then
4 what's expected of the adults taking care of them, where
5 to go for help, where the counsellors are. There's
6 well-being classes. There's -- people come in and there
7 are whole courses. My daughter's going on a camp
8 in January all about wellness and support and who to go
9 to. There's just a lot more in place and I think from
10 a very young age they're told -- they're empowered
11 I think is the word I'm looking for, where when I was
12 a child it was very much you're the child, obey the
13 adult, be seen and not heard, do as you're told.
14 Children nowadays, at least here, are told that they
15 have their rights and that adults are there to care for
16 them and be trusted.

17 Q. But as I think you say, they're told what, as well as
18 their rights are, their responsibilities, what is
19 expected of them?

20 A. Yes. So, I think in the example of my children it is
21 and it says you are expected to listen and be kind to
22 others and there are classroom rules drawn out and it
23 says in exchange, you know, that we will respect you.
24 They're also told that no one's allowed to touch them,
25 yelled at, that that's not okay and where to go. If

1 they're not happy with their teacher or if something
2 happens, whether it's with a peer or another adult.

3 Q. So there is transparency, which is a word that I think
4 is important to you?

5 A. Mm-hmm.

6 Q. And openness and clarity?

7 A. Yes. And it's discussed and with the swimming teacher
8 incident, sometimes I question was it wrong? Was it
9 just fooling around and then the way I answer that
10 question is would I be okay if someone was doing that to
11 my child and the answer is absolutely not.

12 Q. But what is stark is we're in a different world to the
13 world you were in in the early 1990s where would you say
14 at Fettes you knew what you shouldn't do but everything
15 else that you've just been describing was lacking?

16 A. Absolutely. We were never told what was not okay. We
17 were never told that adults could be wrong. We were
18 never told where to go if we had a problem. Who to go
19 to. There was no access, as I recall, of a phone or
20 anywhere we could go to independently and feel safe if
21 we wanted to call someone. Nothing.

22 Q. Does it feel remarkable, given the world you inhabit now
23 through your children but also from your own knowledge,
24 that these things weren't self-evident in the 1990s?

25 A. Do you mean do I find it remarkable that they weren't

1 there?

2 Q. Yes.

3 A. I do. Yes. I don't think the 1990s was particularly

4 backwards. I recall that we would learn about Childline

5 and things about child -- but I had no idea what it was

6 really for and as a child of that age I wouldn't have

7 known where to go for protection.

8 Q. It was a very different world?

9 A. Yeah.

10 MR BROWN: 'Claire' thank you very much indeed. Is there

11 anything else you would like to add?

12 A. No.

13 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for

14 questions?

15 'Claire', that completes the questions we have for

16 you. Thank you so much for helping us with your

17 evidence, which we have, obviously, in written form in

18 your statement and which you have now been able to make

19 come alive in talking to us over the link today. It's

20 of enormous assistance to me to have heard from you in

21 person. It certainly assists my learning and moving

22 forward to looking back over all the evidence that I've

23 heard about Fettes and seeing where it fits in the

24 overall picture, that's really helpful.

25 Thank you for letting us disturb your evening, and

1 I hope you can now relax in the remainder of it as we
2 leave the link. Thank you.
3 A. Thank you.
4 (The witness withdrew)
5 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.
6 MR BROWN: My Lady, that would be an appropriate time to
7 break and we should have a live witness at 10 o'clock.
8 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.
9 (9.38 am)
10 (A short break)
11 (10.06 am)
12 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.
13 MR BROWN: My Lady, the next witness is 'Betty'.
14 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
15 MR BROWN: I should say while we're getting the witness,
16 depending on time there's a read-in which we might move
17 onto after 'Betty' and then break, then have the next
18 witness perhaps at 12.
19 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. Yes, because 'Betty's'
20 statement isn't too long.
21 MR BROWN: No.
22 LADY SMITH: That makes sense.
23 'Betty' (affirmed)
24 LADY SMITH: That red folder has a hard copy of your
25 statement in it. You'll also see your statement coming

1 up on screen as we refer to parts of it that we may want
2 to discuss. Use either or neither, whichever works best
3 for you.

4 And generally, 'Betty', as you go through your
5 evidence, if you have any concerns or questions, please
6 don't hesitate to ask. It's very important to me that
7 we do what we can to make you as comfortable as
8 possible, so if it works for you, it will work for me.
9 Likewise, if you want a break at any time, that's
10 absolutely fine. Do remember that.

11 A. (Witness nods).

12 LADY SMITH: And if you're ready, I'll hand over to
13 Mr Brown, who will take it from there. Okay?

14 A. Okay.

15 LADY SMITH: Thanks.

16 Mr Brown.

17 Questions from Mr Brown

18 MR BROWN: 'Betty', hello again.

19 A. Hello.

20 Q. Her Ladyship has referred to the statement. You'll see
21 at the bottom of page 1 it's got a reference number and
22 that repeats through every page. I have to read it into
23 the record. It's WIT-1-000000415 and that having been
24 done let's look at it more properly. We see it runs to
25 28 pages and you signed it on 3 September last year.

1 Correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And the last paragraph reads:

4 "I have no objection to my witness statement being

5 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

6 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

7 true."

8 And that's correct, you'll have read through it?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And been happy with its contents?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Although I think, would you agree, you're talking about

13 events over a quarter of a century ago. Sometimes

14 memory going back that far may not be the easiest.

15 Would you agree?

16 A. I would agree.

17 Q. I think, for example, we know, and we'll come to this,

18 you gave a number of police statements, one in 1998, one

19 in 2015. Would your memory, do you think, have been

20 better back in 1998?

21 A. Oh, absolutely. I was distinctly aware every time

22 I spoke to the police that there were elements that

23 I couldn't remember, and even from having given this

24 statement to yourselves, you know, I'm aware of the fact

25 that even now there's been a -- I guess like a sort of

1 memory exorcism.

2 LADY SMITH: Can I just assure you, 'Betty', I am well used
3 to this and I don't expect you to be able to get
4 100 per cent in a memory test. Equally, I understand
5 that what may have been your memory a year ago could
6 have changed as you've thought more about it. I will
7 not think that reflects badly on you, all right?

8 A. I don't think my memory's changed as such. It's just
9 sort of the details are less clear.

10 LADY SMITH: It happens.

11 A. Okay, thank you.

12 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

13 MR BROWN: Thank you very much, my Lady.

14 One of the other things that I think comes across in
15 your statement, you're reporting things that others have
16 told you, is that fair?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. That, I suppose, we would all know, can be a dangerous
19 pastime because whether what we're told is right or
20 wrong, we don't know. You'd agree with that?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. I say that because we know that you were -- and I think
23 at the beginning of your statement there should be
24 a list of pseudonyms.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Do you have that?

2 A. Yes, I do.

3 Q. And I think you'll see there's a pseudonym for a witness

4 called 'Claire'.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Or, rather, the pseudonym is 'Claire', and 'Claire' is

7 a good friend of yours and has been since school?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. That's correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And are you still in touch with 'Claire'?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And her mum?

14 A. Yes. Not so much, but yes.

15 Q. Was 'Claire' your closest friend at school? At Fettes,

16 that is?

17 A. Was she my closest friends? (Pause). There were sort

18 of three of us that sort of were close friends. Was one

19 more than the other at the time? No. Now, yes, but --

20 Q. I think the other one we see from the list is

21 'Stephanie'.

22 A. That would be correct, yeah.

23 Q. And presumably, thinking back to childhood, friends and

24 the relationships would fluctuate?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. It would be better at some times, fall-outs, making up,
2 et cetera. That's the nature of childhood?

3 A. That's the nature of life. The other thing to note is
4 that both 'Claire' and 'Stephanie' were day pupils and
5 I was a boarder, so I had a whole other life with the
6 people that I lived with.

7 Q. And I want to talk about that. Let's go to the
8 beginning of the statement. You're now 41, born in 1980
9 and you were at Fettes, amongst a number of schools, and
10 we'll touch on all of them. You were at Fettes between
11 1991 and 1993?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. We see from your background of life before boarding
14 school, again the details I don't wish to go into, but
15 it wasn't perhaps the most straightforward or easy?

16 A. It wasn't ideal.

17 Q. No. You moved to Scotland, I think, when you were nine?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. With your mum?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And you went to a day school in Edinburgh for about
22 a year? Is that right?

23 A. It was over a year and a half, yeah.

24 Q. Before you went to Fettes?

25 A. That's correct.

1 Q. That was the point.

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. You have a sibling who you had a difficult relationship
4 with. Is that -- or you tell me.

5 A. That's correct.

6 Q. And it's just that one of the points you make in
7 paragraph 4 is you were sent to Fettes in part because
8 it was felt it would give you a safer environment?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And do you remember what your emotion was about going to
11 Fettes?

12 A. Excitement.

13 Q. What did you know of Fettes?

14 A. What did I know of Fettes? I think -- oh, I don't know
15 how far back it was. I think it was my
16 great-great-grandfather had gone there. I guess I sort
17 of felt that it was in some way an honour to go.

18 Q. Mm-hmm.

19 A. I think in Ireland my brother had been at a boarding
20 school and while he hadn't enjoyed it, I think in my
21 mind I was excited at the prospect. I'd read lots of
22 children's books about boarding schools and I think
23 I had a bit of a kind of a -- I guess a ... a fanciful
24 idea of what it would be.

25 Q. A bit rose tinted?

1 A. Indeed.

2 Q. Was that Mallory Towers or something similar?

3 A. It was indeed.

4 Q. Not, I confess, that I've read it, but I've heard enough

5 people talking about it. And we would understand that

6 your time at Fettes was exclusively in the junior

7 school?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And that's Inverleith House; is that right?

10 A. The first term that I was there it was still called the

11 junior school and then when the new year started

12 in September it was then renamed Inverleith House.

13 Q. Just in terms of practicalities, you were excited, you

14 have an image of what you're going into, and you joined

15 in the summer term of 1991.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. So this is obviously joining a year group, first of

18 three years in the junior school, which has already, to

19 an extent, coalesced because they've been together for

20 two terms. Is that right?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Was that hard?

23 A. Yes. Yes, I guess it's challenging being anywhere

24 where -- it sort of felt like being thrown into

25 a country where I don't speak the language is probably

1 the best way I can liken it, so --

2 LADY SMITH: If it was the beginning of the summer term

3 1991, you would have been still just 10 years old but

4 your birthday would be shortly after that, nearly 11?

5 A. Nearly 11, yeah.

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

7 MR BROWN: And to continue the analogy, did anyone help you

8 translate?

9 A. Yeah, absolutely. I mean, my peers, the people that

10 I shared a room with, the people in my class. Yeah.

11 I guess with a school like Fettes, they have all of

12 these sort of old language, like I didn't know what prep

13 meant and -- you know, you just learn as you go along

14 and people guide you along. Most of the pupils were the

15 support in that situation.

16 Q. Okay, but that's obviously from your peers.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Other girls.

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. And boys?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. What about the school itself, the staff? Was there

23 a system to ease your passage into the school?

24 A. Not that I remember.

25 Q. It's just you say at paragraph 10, page 3:

1 "When I arrived at Fettes it was nerve-wracking and
2 strange."

3 You didn't know what to expect and what to do.

4 "I was a bit wild compared to some of the pupils so
5 it took me a while to conform to the way that the school
6 liked everyone to be."

7 But from what you've just said, that's a learning or
8 a conforming that you picked up just by being there and
9 from learning from your peers?

10 A. I mean, I guess in terms of just sort of, you know,
11 people that I could ask questions and the people that
12 would, you know, if I was not doing the right thing or
13 going the wrong way, it was my peers that would keep me
14 right. I think in terms of from a disciplinary point of
15 view or just from an academic point of view there was
16 very sort of strict -- I guess a strict atmosphere that
17 meant that I had to behave in a particular way and if
18 I didn't, I was let know that I wasn't.

19 Q. And did you let know your displeasure? Because from
20 what you're saying, this was different?

21 A. No, I didn't let my -- no, not at that point. I think
22 I just -- I think I was a bit -- yeah, I just had to --
23 to figure it out. I just -- I don't remember vocalising
24 my displeasure.

25 Q. Okay. So you, to use that cliché, knuckled down and got

1 on with it?

2 A. Yes, yes. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. Looking at page 5 of your statement in

4 paragraph 22, because we can obviously read all the

5 details of your impression of the food and washing and

6 so forth, the food you thought was good?

7 A. Yes, I did.

8 Q. You'll be surprised to learn we have mixed views of

9 school food. But going on to 22 and the school itself:

10 "You moved from room to room for subjects. Some

11 teachers were great and others were tyrants. I really

12 enjoyed the sciences and sport. You were given lines

13 occasionally and I remember people being shouted at

14 a fair bit but I think that was fairly standard at the

15 time."

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. There are certain aspect to that, looking at it, good

18 teachers, bad teachers. You went on, obviously, to

19 a number of schools. Presumably that was the norm at

20 schools, there were teachers you would know to be

21 sympathetic, those that you would know to be more

22 discipline-minded, good, bad?

23 A. I think given my experience of different schools I would

24 definitely say that the Fettes was the most -- I'm not

25 sure which word to use, but I would say that are

1 children got shouted at more at Fettes than any other
2 school that I went to.

3 Q. And again, just let's cover that now. You went to four?
4 A. Yes.

5 Q. The day school for a year and a half prior to Fettes,
6 then St George's, then --

7 A. No, I went to the day school first, then I went to
8 Fettes, then I went to Strathallan, then I went to
9 St George's and then I went to Kilgraston.

10 Q. I missed out Strathallan, so five.
11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And of the five, Fettes stands --

13 A. Fettes is definitely the one that children got shouted
14 at most.

15 Q. By just some teachers or was the ethos in toto rather
16 more disciplined, if I can put it that way?

17 A. The ethos was more disciplined, but it wasn't -- it
18 wasn't that -- not all teachers shouted. There were
19 definitely some very good teachers there, I would say.
20 But there was a large proportion that were severe. And
21 cold.

22 Q. And cold. We'll come back to the differences between
23 the schools in a little while.

24 Academically you talk at 23 and 24 on page 6 about
25 your progress and some subjects obviously, like

1 everyone, were better than others, but one of the things
2 that clearly makes you cross is the way you were treated
3 about French because you were good at French but you
4 were kept in a lower class; is that right?

5 A. Yeah. Yeah.

6 Q. And you felt that that was because of factors that you
7 didn't think were appropriate?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Can you tell us about that?

10 A. Well, it's -- I think because the school that I'd been
11 to previously was, I guess, less focused on academic
12 standards in comparison to Fettes, and so when I went
13 there I guess they would have considered me a little bit
14 behind so I was naturally then when you go into first
15 form they would split the year into two groups and that
16 year it had been decided that it would be for English
17 and so I was naturally put in 2B -- sorry, 1B. But it
18 became very clear that I was -- I was very capable and
19 when -- when I asked and my mother asked for me to be
20 put with 1A because the sort of standard of education
21 and the level that they were going to was more befitting
22 my capability, I was told that there wasn't room, but
23 what I was allowed to do is I was allowed to join
24 an extra Latin class, which the exceptional students
25 from 1A were allowed to attend. So I was the only

1 person from 1B that was allowed to attend that class.

2 Then when it came to second year, the thing that
3 divided the classes was French and I was put in 2B but
4 right from the word go I was coming first because we
5 were tested pretty much weekly and we'd all know what
6 each other's results were and we were always put on
7 a league table, essentially, and I was always first.
8 Again we asked for me to be put with my -- to be put in
9 2A, but I was continually refused.

10 There were two twin girls in my class who arrived in
11 second form and they were in 2B initially and they
12 always came sort of fifth and sixth, fifth equal, and
13 they got put into the first set, into 2A. And so when
14 my mum asked about that, why is that, she was told that
15 I was useful in 2B because I was influential and I made
16 others work and I brought up the standard.

17 Q. Now, were you influential, do you think, making others
18 work?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You were well-considered, or considered as a good thing
21 for others?

22 A. Yes. Not always, you know. I was a kid.

23 Q. Yeah.

24 A. I was bossy. And I think when I was engaged I would
25 demand that other pupils were engaged as well.

1 Q. Yes. I think we agreed that a word that might describe
2 you was forthright.
3 A. That would be the diplomatic way of putting it.
4 Q. Even then. Even then?
5 A. Even then.
6 Q. All right. Still?
7 A. I'd like to think so.
8 Q. But did you think it was an injustice?
9 A. I did.
10 Q. And did you complain about that?
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. Your mother obviously asked, but did you complain to
13 staff?
14 A. Yeah, I think everyone was aware that I wasn't happy
15 with being held back. And it was then when
16 Mr Alexander, the headmaster of the junior school, had
17 made it clear that I wouldn't be put up and that yet
18 others who weren't performing as well as myself were
19 being put up, it was decided that I wouldn't continue my
20 education after the summer term of second year -- second
21 form.
22 Q. All right. We'll come on to tensions with Mr Alexander
23 later.
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. But I think your feeling, as we read it from the

1 statement, is that the school was more interested in the
2 business side, if I can put it that way, the fear of
3 losing two fees rather than one. Did you take it that
4 way then or is that something you've thought about
5 since?

6 A. No, that was my understanding of the situation then.

7 Q. Right. You then talk about healthcare and clearly
8 there's a matron who you liked?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Mrs Allan, who was kind?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And I think in that regard you talk on page 9 in
13 paragraph 39 she was lovely. You make the point that in
14 terms of development, as all the girls in your year
15 would be, they would all be growing up, your puberty
16 would be starting, you were one of the first, if not the
17 first, and she handled that very sensitively?

18 A. Yes. Yes, the only one who handled it sensitively.

19 Q. Yes. You describe her as:

20 " ... a decent woman who cared about children and
21 although she could be tough, she was also kind."

22 But I think, as we know from your statement, the
23 issue of periods and the swimming baths was an issue
24 that you found difficult?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Put simply, because you met resistance from the swimming
2 teacher, who was dubious, if I can put it that way --
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. -- if people said, "I've got a period, I can't go
5 swimming"?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Did that resolve, that you remember, that particular
8 issue?
9 A. I think after she intervened I wasn't -- I wasn't --
10 comment was not passed again. I felt that there was ...
11 things were different afterwards, I guess, and the way
12 that I was treated was different, but there was nothing
13 overt that was said, you know, after the point where she
14 intervened.
15 Q. Okay. I can show you a document which we've got from
16 Fettes which may be of passing interest. It's FET321 at
17 page 12. You'll see this is Fettes College notepaper,
18 the date is 10 October 1991, so this will be the first
19 term of your first full year at Fettes, in other words
20 going into class 1; is that correct? You joined in the
21 summer of 1991 and this would be in your first full year
22 when you were in class one. Is that correct?
23 A. This would have been when I was in first form?
24 Q. Yes.
25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And you can see that this is "Off changing
2 slips/periods" and it reads:

3 "I have been in the very bad habit lately of
4 accepting a girl's word that she could not swim because
5 she had her period. To a certain extent, I did this to
6 avoid embarrassment on the girl's part, not being
7 accustomed to giving details of her personal hygiene to
8 a male (no matter how old). When such an event
9 occurred, I marked the pupil as present in my register
10 and placed a small p at the side.

11 Unfortunately I had occasion recently to record
12 a girl with periods in three weeks out of four. Whilst
13 I realise that such an event is possible, if it did
14 occur, it would require further investigation from the
15 medical officer. On the other hand, it may have been
16 used as an excuse to avoid swimming and to take
17 advantage of my easy approach to this matter.

18 In order to avoid any event of this nature
19 occurring, could those girls with periods and who use
20 sanitary towels please be given a note to this effect
21 from their matron. From Monday, 14 October I will be
22 strictly implementing the system of swim or provide
23 an off changing slip.

24 I would be glad to hear any opinions that any
25 housemistress has regarding this matter."

1 And that's from the swimming teacher. Do you think
2 that would fit time-wise with things resolving?
3 A. So this was written by Mr Stein?
4 Q. Yes.
5 A. Would this fit in the right time frame? Ah. (Pause).
6 I'm pretty sure that I -- I'm pretty sure I started my
7 period in the summer term of 1992, so this is prior to
8 me.
9 Q. All right.
10 A. I could be wrong. I can remember which -- I can
11 remember when it happened, I can remember which dorm
12 room I was in, I can remember discussing it with my
13 peers and I can remember that it was summer term because
14 I can remember running across the sports fields during
15 the summer when it occurred. So this would be a few
16 months before that. This would have been the October
17 before. So I don't think this relates to me. I'm
18 pretty certain that I was in -- I'm pretty certain
19 I was ... (Pause). I'm pretty certain I was in the
20 first form, the summer term of first form. I think.
21 Q. The detail may not matter. What it does demonstrate,
22 I suppose, is that there are tensions on both sides from
23 your perspective but it would appear he recognises
24 there's a degree of embarrassment about it and he's
25 devolving to the housemistresses.

1 A. Mm. I don't remember anyone having a note from a matron
2 to be excused from swimming.

3 Q. All right.

4 A. I don't know if that was ever implemented. It can't
5 have been implemented because it wasn't occurring.

6 Q. Okay, thank you. But he is one of two people you talk
7 about under the heading of abuse in your statement.

8 A. Mm.

9 Q. The swimming teacher. And obviously we have the full
10 detail of what you say about that in your statement and
11 you make the point that it wasn't so much you he was
12 involved with, it was other girls?

13 A. Mm.

14 Q. And you mention two in particular, who are referred
15 to -- this is paragraph 45, you give the names, which
16 are blacked out for obvious reasons.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Both of them were yet to develop. The distinction
19 I think you draw is that you were developing?

20 A. (Witness nods).

21 Q. And therefore he wouldn't do this to you?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And:

24 "I think also it used to happen to [another girl] as
25 well but she began to develop ... so he lost interest.

1 I think it also happened to [a fourth girl]."

2 In relation to the conduct you describe, did you

3 complain about that?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. To whom?

6 A. I can't remember specifically who we complained to

7 because we -- a bunch -- a few of us were asked to speak

8 to Mr Alexander in his office and he'd been made aware

9 that our conversation had been overheard. I think it

10 was Mrs Allan, the matron, who'd overheard us talking

11 about it and then had taken it to Mr Alexander.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. I think -- I think that's what's -- what occurred.

14 Q. I think, if I may, if we could refer you briefly to the

15 1998 statement you gave to the police.

16 A. (Witness nods).

17 Q. Which is PSS360. We'll see, just to confirm the date,

18 take it from us this is your statement despite all the

19 details being taken out, and it's given at 2.40 on 29 of

20 I think it may be March 1998. It goes into your

21 personal details and confirms at the foot, just to

22 reassure you it's you, it says, last four lines:

23 "I was a pupil at Fettes College from April 1991 to

24 approximately May or June 1993. I went there when I was

25 10 and left when I was 12. I was a full-time boarder

1 for all of my time."

2 Okay?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. And you talk over the next page about friends and at the

5 foot of the second page -- sorry, it's page 3, the way

6 it's been scanned in there's blanks, we see at the

7 bottom:

8 "Our swimming teacher was Mr Stein. He was huge

9 like a penguin, very tall, very fat, very bald, wore

10 glasses to do the register. He was awkward on land but

11 a brilliant swimmer."

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. That rings bells?

14 A. Yes, it does.

15 Q. "The boys didn't like him at all, but to begin we was

16 kinder to the girls."

17 Do you see that at the bottom?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Would he shout at the boys, going back to your point

20 about teachers shouting?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Over the page you start off by saying -- there's

23 a correction, I think, which you would understand -- do

24 you remember this, when the police allowed you to read

25 it back, they would say if there's any bits you don't

1 agree with, you can correct them and we seem to have
2 a correction which has been initialled, would that be
3 right? First line. Because the word "we" has been
4 scored out and replaced with "I".
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. And you said:
7 "I liked him a lot, but didn't like what he did.
8 I don't think the others did."
9 Correct?
10 A. The others did like what he did. I think that's what
11 I meant by that.
12 Q. Yes.
13 LADY SMITH: It could alternatively have been the others
14 didn't like him. Do you see what I mean?
15 A. Potentially, yeah. I'm not sure. I don't remember what
16 I meant. I'm sorry.
17 LADY SMITH: What's your memory now?
18 A. Sorry?
19 LADY SMITH: What's your memory now?
20 A. My memory of Mr Stein is of someone who --
21 LADY SMITH: No, sorry for interrupting. It's simply your
22 memory of how others regarded him, as in did they like
23 him or did they not like him?
24 A. I'm trying to sort of explain, to put it in context what
25 I mean, so therefore then what my assumption is of what

1 other people think.

2 LADY SMITH: Okay.

3 A. Mr Stein had a way of being very hot and very cold and

4 very hard and then suddenly very soft. So therefore

5 then when he was kind, it felt more. It ... so the ones

6 that he was kind to felt special, and I think there were

7 folk that felt special in his presence and others that

8 absolutely didn't. Overall, was he liked? That's

9 really -- a really complicated question. I don't know

10 how to answer that. We were children and we, I guess,

11 were ... (Pause). I think we thought that we had to

12 like him.

13 LADY SMITH: Okay.

14 A. Whether we did or not, I'm not certain.

15 LADY SMITH: Okay, thank you.

16 Mr Brown.

17 MR BROWN: I think, just returning to this statement, what

18 you do say is, and this is talking about what he would

19 do, go down to the foot of that page, please, and

20 I think it's nine lines up:

21 "No one really liked it. We felt awkward and didn't

22 really know what to do, but giggled and laughed about

23 it."

24 This is, I think, reading matters short from what

25 you say in the statement, he would tickle people, we've

1 heard about the game "sharks" from a number of -- he
2 would chase people in the water and catch them; is that
3 correct?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. But I think you also say he would threaten to come into
6 the changing room.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Now, one of the things you say in your statement to the
9 Inquiry is that he would positively come into the
10 changing room when the girls were naked.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Is that a memory you're clear about? Because it's not
13 mentioned in 1998.

14 A. No, it's not, you're right, it's not. I have a distinct
15 memory of him breaching the threshold -- not that there
16 particularly was a threshold, it was kind of where the
17 wall stopped essentially.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. I have a clear memory of being in the shower and naked
20 and seeing him and him seeing me. I wouldn't say that
21 it was necessarily every time that he would take it that
22 far, but it was every time he would threaten to.

23 Q. I see. I think if we go on to page 7 of this document,
24 and this is what we were perhaps talking about, there
25 comes a stage where you and others go and speak to

1 Mr Alexander about it.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. How that came about, someone may have overheard you

4 talking but there's no doubt that you went and spoke to

5 Mr Alexander?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. I think we see, if we go to page 7, I think it's the

8 seventh line down:

9 "I was aware that she was one of the girls who were

10 openly involved. She, me [and then there's reference to

11 'Stephanie' and a different girl and maybe another girl]

12 decided to go and see Mr Alexander, the headmaster of

13 the junior school, Inverleith, and we told him about the

14 kissing and nibbling and grabbing. I don't know if we

15 mentioned the hose. I think this would have been the

16 summer term of the first form."

17 So that would be 1991? Sorry, that would be 1992?

18 A. I think this would have been the summer term of the

19 first form. I think that contradicts my statement that

20 I've given to the Inquiry because my memory is of being

21 in his office and it being fairly dark outside, which

22 would suggest that it was an autumn or a spring term.

23 What was the question, I'm sorry?

24 Q. I think on the basis of that analysis, if that's end of

25 first year, that would be summer 1992?

1 A. Summer of 1992.

2 Q. Just to look at the same document, 321, page 22, which
3 is a report to the governors by the headmaster, this is
4 later on, it gives a summary of his dealings. We see
5 under September of 1992 -- when we get to it. (Pause).

6 I think we see, second entry down:
7 "September 92.
8 Andrew Alexander, housemaster of Inverleith,
9 received some complaints from second form girls about WS
10 [William Stein]. He saw him about these and sent me
11 a report dated 17 September 1992.

12 I saw WS on 29/9/92 when I stressed to him that it
13 was essential there were no grounds for complaints with
14 regards to his dealings with girls. The guidelines he
15 had agreed with A.S.A [Mr Alexander] were to apply in
16 both senior school and Inverleith. He assured me he
17 would take the greatest care with regard to the
18 situation."

19 And I think that would fit in, that in your final
20 year at Fettes --

21 A. Say that again, sorry?

22 Q. I think that would confirm, this being a note from the
23 beginning of your final year in Fettes?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. So the term after your meeting with Mr Alexander, that,

1 from your statement, if you bear with me, is when
2 Mr Stein stopped getting in the pool.
3 A. Yes, that would make sense. He stopped getting in the
4 pool with us.
5 Q. But got crosser, from what you say in the statement.
6 A. A lot crosser.
7 Q. But I think it makes the point, if nothing else, that
8 having gone to Mr Alexander, action was taken?
9 A. Action was taken, yeah, I'd grant you that. I don't
10 think the right actions were taken.
11 Q. I don't think that was my question.
12 A. No, it wasn't.
13 Q. Could we go back, please, to the statement, which is
14 PSS360. This is a statement to the police in 1998. I'm
15 right in saying that in relation to Mr Stein this was
16 the first time you had complained about him to the
17 police?
18 A. In 1998? Yes.
19 Q. Because we know, and we'll come onto this fairly shortly
20 and briefly, that you were spoken to by the police
21 shortly after you left Fettes --
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. -- in 1993 but you didn't mention it then?
24 A. No.
25 Q. No.

1 A. It wasn't relevant then.

2 Q. It wasn't relevant then?

3 A. It wasn't relevant to what we were talking to the police

4 about in --

5 Q. No, indeed, that was a separate matter and we'll come

6 back to that.

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. You go on to say in the statement that obviously this

9 was something that was talked about with your friend

10 'Claire' and her mother.

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. In 1997.

13 A. Yeah.

14 Q. And at that stage we would understand there was

15 an ongoing battle, if I can put it that way, between the

16 mother and Fettes?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Which stemmed from events not connected with you --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. -- but 'Claire's' brother?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And I take it you'd be well aware of that, you would

23 live through that too?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Hearing about it from your friend?

1 A. To some degree.

2 Q. Yeah. But I think for completeness if we go to page 9

3 and seventh line:

4 "About a month, six weeks ago [the name is blacked

5 out but it's 'Claire's' mum] phoned me and told me that

6 because Fettes had failed to acknowledge her letter she

7 had contacted [REDACTED] She asked me if I would

8 speak to the journalist, tell him what I knew.

9 I agreed."

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. Were things pretty tense at that time, so far as you

12 could see, as between 'Claire's' mum and the school?

13 A. I didn't know the detail of what was going on between

14 the family and the school. I was aware that there were

15 some things happening. Does that answer your question?

16 Q. Yes. But 'Claire's' mum is engaging the press.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Asking you to speak to the press.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You do so?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And then the police become involved. Do you know how

23 the police became involved?

24 A. No. No, I don't. I don't think -- no. I can -- I have

25 assumptions.

1 Q. Well, we're perhaps more interested in whether you knew
2 or not. The answer seems to be no?

3 A. No.

4 Q. Okay. At the end of your statement at page 11, I'm just
5 interested in one paragraph, which is, if we go down,
6 stop there, you see the words saying:

7 "I don't blame [and the name is Stein] for his
8 actions. I don't believe he knew that what he was doing
9 was wrong. I blame Fettes College for not making it
10 understood that that sort of behaviour was
11 unacceptable."

12 Do you remember saying that to the police?

13 A. I'm not surprised that I said that. Do I remember
14 saying it? Not specifically. It doesn't surprise me.
15 It was 1998. I think we have a better understanding
16 these days about, you know, what an individual's
17 responsible for in terms of their actions and their
18 behaviour.

19 Q. I appreciate that. So from what you're saying in 1998,
20 the world's view of things, including yours, was
21 different?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. But having reflected on it -- it's simply because
24 obviously in your statement there isn't perhaps the same
25 charity towards Mr Stein.

1 A. I think -- ah, it's difficult to say at the time.
2 I think maybe I was also influenced by my own mother's
3 opinion at the time. I think to a certain degree she
4 felt a little bit sorry for him. He was an old man that
5 was now having his -- his -- his reputation put under
6 scrutiny, and I think to a certain degree there was
7 an element of feeling uncomfortable about that. But
8 then I think now in terms of my understanding, I don't
9 feel that he deserves to be protected from his own
10 behaviour, especially in light of the impact it's had
11 upon the people who were victims to that behaviour.
12 Q. I was coming to that. You weren't, from what your
13 statement says and from what you've confirmed, someone
14 he was particularly interested in, but there were
15 others, that's the point?
16 A. Yes. I mean, you know, we were all there and we were
17 all a victim to his behaviour to a certain degree, but
18 there was more specific behaviour that specific people
19 were subjected to.
20 Q. Okay. And I think, as we know and you reflect in your
21 statement, you gave a statement to the police in 1998.
22 A. (Witness nods).
23 Q. And then again you were approached in 2015?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. For a further statement?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Again, same question: why, if you know, did the police
3 approach you in 2015?

4 A. I don't know. I don't know. I have a recollection of
5 being told, I'm not sure who by, it might have been the
6 police, that there was concerns with the person who had
7 been conducting that investigation.

8 Q. Well, you mention that, if we can go to your statement,
9 please, page 24, paragraph 93. At the bottom you say:
10 "I'm not sure why but around 1997 [I think it was
11 1998] ... I was contacted by the police and asked to
12 give a statement."
13 If we move on over the page:
14 " ... I have been told that the man that ran that
15 investigation [that's the 1990s' investigation] was
16 subsequently fired for corruption ..."
17 Et cetera. Who told you that?

18 A. I don't remember to be honest with you. It could have
19 been the police. It could have -- I guess it could have
20 been 'Iona'. I might have read it in a paper if it came
21 up. I can't specifically say how I came to know that in
22 my mind.

23 Q. Whether it's right or not?

24 A. Whether it's right or not.

25 Q. If I can tell you that --

1 A. I think I've been fairly vague in saying that I don't
2 know if it's hearsay or truth.

3 Q. It might have been 'Iona', 'Claire's' mum.

4 A. Might have been.

5 Q. Yes. Because can I take it she wasn't happy with the
6 result of the 1998 police investigation because it
7 didn't go anywhere, did it?

8 A. None of us were happy.

9 Q. Right. I was asking about 'Iona', though.

10 A. I know that she was not happy as well.

11 Q. And you weren't happy, 'Claire' wasn't happy?

12 A. No, no.

13 Q. And just for your information, investigations would
14 suggest that is entirely wrong, the allegation that the
15 police officer was fired for corruption.

16 A. Oh good.

17 Q. Yes. But then you were contacted again by the police,
18 you give another statement, and again in 2015 you become
19 aware that no further action was taken?

20 A. Sorry, can you say that again for me?

21 Q. In 2015, there's another police inquiry and no further
22 action was taken?

23 A. My understanding is that no further -- I never heard
24 from the police directly that -- other than to --
25 I think occasionally they would email me to ask me if

1 I had contact with a particular pupil so that they could
2 make contact with them. But I don't remember receiving
3 anything to -- that formed any kind of conclusion to the
4 situation.

5 Q. All right. Obviously you've just said in relation to
6 1998 'Iona', 'Claire' and you weren't happy with the
7 outcome. Was that the same in 2015?

8 A. I wasn't surprised. I've tried not to let this uh ...
9 I've tried not to let this govern my existence in any
10 way, so I've tried not to give over much emotion to it
11 as an adult. I wasn't surprised. I guess I could say
12 that I was cynically disappointed. I think there's
13 a certain level of frustration that comes with knowing
14 what the truth is and then for it to just be ignored.

15 Q. Okay. You talk in your statement, just changing tack,
16 about another gentleman who, as we'll see from this,
17 we're calling CKP .

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. This part of your statement, paragraph 52, 53, talks
20 about events on a boat.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And names a particular individual and something
23 happening to her.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. First things first, you weren't on the boat?

1 A. No, I wasn't.

2 Q. So this is an example where you're repeating what you've
3 been told by others?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Who told you this, if I may ask?

6 A. The girl in question.

7 Q. Did you discuss it with 'Claire' and 'Iona'?

8 A. I don't remember if we did discuss it at the time or
9 not.

10 Q. All right. But would you agree the best person to talk
11 about what happened on the boat would be the girl in
12 question?

13 A. It would be all the children in question that were on
14 the boat.

15 Q. The police inquiry in 2015, we would understand, was
16 quite a major one. Are you aware of that?

17 A. No, not really.

18 Q. All right.

19 A. No.

20 Q. I think, as we will hear in relation to another witness,
21 the police spoke to a number of the children in your
22 year from that year group.

23 A. Okay.

24 Q. Including the girl on the boat.

25 A. Okay.

1 Q. And didn't find evidence --

2 A. Okay.

3 Q. -- to support what's there. Obviously you have

4 a recollection of speaking to the girl and her saying

5 something different?

6 A. Mm.

7 Q. Okay.

8 A. I do.

9 Q. Moving on to the wider picture at Fettes, and we've

10 talked about it in some respects, 54, school culture:

11 "It is difficult to put into words [you say] but

12 there was always a sexualised element to the school."

13 Is that the junior school you're talking about?

14 A. Both.

15 Q. Your experience of the senior school wasn't material in

16 the sense you weren't there, but was that something you

17 picked up while you were at the junior school, that

18 there was a sexualised element that you could have

19 experienced?

20 A. There was a lot of sexual activity occurring at a young

21 age and I remember it being discussed in the junior

22 school that, you know, that when you went to the senior

23 school there was a lot of people in third year losing

24 their virginity.

25 Q. Did you get any sense the school was aware of that?

1 A. No.

2 Q. Or was anything being done to address --

3 A. No.

4 Q. Presumably they wouldn't if they didn't know about it.

5 A. True.

6 Q. Was this, do you think, talk or reality?

7 A. I know from themselves of two people when they did

8 eventually go into third year, it was soon after that

9 they lost their virginity. I don't know if it was

10 happening to many others.

11 Q. But it was something that you were aware of and it

12 concerns you now?

13 A. Yeah, it does. Yeah.

14 Q. Your final year at Fettes obviously is the year that

15 you're not getting promoted to the class you want to in

16 French.

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. There are tensions there. And you said that that

19 ultimately was a factor in your mother deciding that you

20 wouldn't carry on with Fettes?

21 A. Yeah.

22 Q. I think from what we see of your statement -- and sorry,

23 it's very full in the statement so we don't need to

24 touch on it at great length -- there was a further

25 problem with Mr Alexander, who we know wanted at one

1 stage to speak to 'Claire' and I think, putting it
2 short, you and another girl were very concerned about
3 her --
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. -- and wouldn't let her be left alone?
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. Is that correct?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. That seems to have been, from what you say, quite
10 a tense moment?
11 A. Yeah, it was.
12 Q. Mr Alexander and [REDACTED] wanted to speak to
13 'Claire', you and the other girl didn't want that to
14 happen?
15 A. Oh, I didn't have a problem with him speaking to her.
16 I had a problem with him keeping her alone in a room
17 when she was in a distressed state. That's not what
18 'Claire' wanted. It didn't seem right. 'Claire' was
19 very distressed. 'Claire' wanted support, she wanted us
20 there and that was being denied.
21 Q. Again, with the benefit of hindsight, was that handled
22 well by anyone who was there?
23 A. No. No. I was thinking about this last night,
24 actually, what would be different now, and what would be
25 different is that we'd have mobile phones, you know, and

1 we'd be able to right now offer you evidence of it
2 occurring, but that isn't possible and wasn't possible.
3 But it was very poorly handled.

4 Q. You now work, obviously, in a job where you have to deal
5 with the general public sometimes at their worst.

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. Do you have any sympathy for the teacher involved facing
8 you and the friend being determined not to let 'Claire'
9 be on her own?

10 A. Do I have any sympathy for him?

11 Q. In the sense he is a teacher trying to speak to a pupil
12 and there's two other pupils who won't go away?

13 A. No, I don't have any sympathy for him, no. I think that
14 it was wrong to essentially hold a child against their
15 will.

16 Q. All right.

17 A. And that's basically what it came down to. It was also
18 I think if a child is to get into that level of
19 distress, I don't think that it's appropriate to labour
20 the point.

21 Q. Okay. By this stage I think we know very well from
22 a variety of sources that there were very real tensions
23 between 'Claire's' family, her mother in particular.

24 A. Mm.

25 Q. Because 'Claire's' brother had been expelled?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And that was taken very badly by 'Claire's' mum?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Because of her long connection with the school and she

5 was very, very angry?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Did you see that anger?

8 A. (Pause). 'Iona's' not someone who displays anger, so

9 I think anger would be the wrong word to describe what

10 I may have -- may have seen. I was aware of her

11 frustration.

12 Q. Can we agree she's determined?

13 A. She is a determined person.

14 Q. Because we know, from 'Claire' if nothing else, that for

15 the next four or five years, from 1993 up to 1998,

16 including the police, that there was an ongoing battle,

17 if I can describe it that way, between 'Iona' and the

18 school. You'd be aware of that, I take it?

19 A. I was aware that there was ongoing something or others,

20 but I had no detail of it. It was -- I mean, yeah, for

21 obvious reasons these things are kept within the

22 confines of the people involved. I wasn't involved.

23 But I was aware of it -- its existence.

24 Q. Well, you were certainly involved and the public were

25 involved because 'Iona' went to the press and asked you

1 to speak to a journalist.

2 A. Yes. I spoke about the things that I was involved in.

3 Q. Right, okay. My point is simply it went on for a number

4 of years?

5 A. It did, yeah.

6 Q. And from your perspective, and it's your perspective I'm

7 interested in, 'Claire' is a good friend, has remained

8 a good friend, what was the impact on 'Claire' of all

9 this?

10 A. (Pause). I think what was challenging for 'Claire' was

11 that this had all started because of something that had

12 occurred with her brother.

13 Q. Yes.

14 A. And I think she felt very much caught in the crossfire.

15 I think it was then very challenging because what had

16 occurred to her brother was completely unacceptable as

17 well, and what he'd done in the first place to get him

18 into that situation is kind of irrelevant. It never

19 merited him being treated the way that he was.

20 In terms of how that impacted 'Claire', she felt

21 very misrepresented and ostracised by the school.

22 I think as a family they'd felt very much part of the --

23 part of the establishment, and I guess it had been

24 a very sort of -- a sudden and rude expulsion from the

25 whole culture, and I think that was challenging for all

1 of them.

2 The fact that it continued on for such a long time,
3 has no doubt taken its toll on all of them for various
4 reasons. I think overall 'Claire' has a similar,
5 I guess, approach that I do, that what occurred was
6 wrong and the fact that nothing was ever done about it
7 is really hard to accept.

8 Q. Moving back to you, though, and page 19 of your
9 statement, you were due to leave Fettes at the end of
10 second form. Had that decision been taken --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- because of the academic issues?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. But I think, as we see, because of the meeting you had
15 or the experience you had when 'Claire' was being spoken
16 to by Mr Alexander, you, 'Claire' and the other girl
17 left the school?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And actually didn't go back?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Were you pleased --

22 A. I don't know if the other girl, 'Stephanie', went back
23 or not. I can't remember.

24 Q. Okay. What was your emotion on not going back? Were
25 you pleased?

1 A. Was I pleased? I was confused. I was confused, I was
2 relieved. (Pause). Pleased is not the right word. No,
3 I wasn't pleased.

4 Q. Okay. Confused is a better one?

5 A. Confused is a better word.

6 Q. Thank you. But you then move on, as you corrected me,
7 to three more schools.

8 A. Mm.

9 Q. Strathallan, where you describe it as a bit more
10 military and worked everyone really hard.

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. Do you say that critically or that's just the way it
13 was?

14 A. I mean, when I sort of talk about it being sort of
15 military, it was just ... there was less individuality
16 and everything just appeared much more regimented. The
17 teachers were kinder. So in terms of being worked
18 really hard, I mean the days were very long. I think
19 you had to be there at, like, 8.15 in the morning and
20 you couldn't leave before 8 pm at night. It was hard
21 work.

22 Q. But it was less shouty than Fettes?

23 A. It was a lot less shouty.

24 Q. In terms of the pastoral side, were there people you
25 could speak to, do you remember?

1 A. No. No, I remember when I went to Strathallan I was
2 assigned to a house and I think there was only three day
3 pupils in that house and we had a little room which was
4 our room where we did our prep and stuff like that, but
5 I don't remember the housemistress ever taking any time
6 for us or having much involvement.

7 Q. All right. Sorry, I think in fairness to you what
8 I should have said to make more sense of this is that
9 your mother moved to Perthshire, so you were a day pupil
10 at Strathallan?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So the dynamic is wholly different, you're no longer
13 boarding?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. But you were there for only a term and then you moved to
16 St George's?

17 A. Yeah.

18 Q. Why the move?

19 A. I think after what had happened at Fettes, I think
20 I was -- yeah, I just felt really lost. It was -- yeah,
21 everything was very confusing. I had a lot of, I guess,
22 sort of unresolved feelings and I couldn't settle and
23 I was very unhappy. Yeah, I guess I just felt really
24 out of place and lost there in a way that I wanted to at
25 least return to Edinburgh, to somewhere that was

1 familiar. 'Claire' was at St George's and I've just --
2 I think I needed familiarity.

3 Q. And was St George's from your perspective happier?

4 A. Again, you know, it had a different set of challenges.
5 I was still unsettled and it also meant a very long
6 commute. I think initially I was boarding but then that
7 didn't work out and then I was a day pupil, but the
8 commute was very long, and then I think after a while it
9 just made practical sense for me to go to a school
10 closer to home.

11 Q. Was it simply too much, too long a day?

12 A. Yeah.

13 Q. Did you get a sense, though, that St George's as
14 compared with Fettes was a school where there was
15 greater interest in the individual pupil? Or not?

16 A. Compared to where?

17 Q. Fettes.

18 A. It was bigger, the classes were bigger. The year groups
19 were bigger. I think what was in the -- Inverleith
20 House at Fettes was quite small in comparison to other
21 schools, so I guess there was a bit more room for
22 individuality to a certain degree. But it's hard for me
23 to compare because I was there that much longer so I was
24 a lot more familiar with that environment than I was
25 either Strathallan or St George's.

1 Q. Yes. And then you went to Kilgraston.
2 A. And then I went to Kilgraston.
3 Q. Which, as you say, was a Catholic boarding school?
4 A. Yeah.
5 Q. Run by nuns at that stage?
6 A. It wasn't run by nuns, no.
7 Q. They'd gone, had they?
8 A. They existed on the grounds --
9 Q. But they weren't teaching?
10 A. No.
11 Q. But it was, as you describe it, close-minded and
12 sheltered?
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. Did it suit you?
15 A. No.
16 Q. How long did you last there?
17 A. Ah, I think I was there for three years, thereabouts.
18 Maybe more. Maybe less.
19 LADY SMITH: I think in your statement you say 1994 to 1996.
20 A. There you go, okay.
21 MR BROWN: Thank you.
22 A. Yeah, okay, two and a bit.
23 LADY SMITH: It depends when in 1994 you started and when in
24 1996 you left.
25 A. Yeah.

1 MR BROWN: I'm just interested, you've talked about Fettes
2 being more rigid, it's the shoutiest school.
3 A. Mm.
4 Q. And there was little provision, it would appear from
5 what you were saying, in 1991 to 1993, for pastoral
6 care. For example, when you arrived at the school,
7 you're picking things up from the pupils.
8 Going to Kilgraston, three years later, did you
9 notice any difference in approach by that school? Had
10 things changed at all?
11 A. Not that I'm aware of.
12 Q. It wasn't any more thought-through about a girl starting
13 a new school, settling them in? That's my point.
14 A. No. Not that I'm aware of, no. Not that I can think
15 of. Again, I can just -- yeah, you just get thrown and
16 have to get on with it is my memory of it.
17 Q. I appreciate you're older, perhaps very much more grown
18 up, but there was no assistance, just as there'd been no
19 assistance at Fettes for a new pupil joining?
20 A. Not that I can remember.
21 Q. Do you think there should have been?
22 A. Yes.
23 Q. Because obviously one of the factors of this Inquiry is
24 to think how things might be done better.
25 A. Mm.

1 Q. And you talk about that at page 26 and 27. You're
2 obviously in that part of your statement talking about
3 the need for proper investigations, and I think we've
4 talked about that already. But you make the point that
5 schools, looking at paragraph 99:
6 "It's difficult with these establishments because
7 they are so obsessed by their reputations that they will
8 hide anything that they feel will put the school into
9 disrepute."
10 A. (Witness nods).
11 Q. Is that a view that you felt then or is that something
12 that you've reflected on and has focused in your mind?
13 A. Did I think that at the time? I think I was distinctly
14 aware that Fettes was very concerned with its
15 reputation. They were very openly concerned with their
16 reputation. I don't remember at the time wondering why
17 it wasn't investigated. And it was confusing at the
18 time because, you know, while we knew it was wrong, we
19 weren't sure if it was wrong. And when we spoke to
20 Mr Alexander about it, if it had been investigated at
21 the time, they would have statements of all of those
22 girls that went to his office that day, but we don't
23 have those now, which is unfortunate.
24 Q. Though action was taken, as you've seen, in the sense
25 that he stopped going into the water. I know that you

1 talk about there being, you know, developments because
2 of that, but something was at least done, it would
3 appear.

4 A. Mm.

5 Q. Albeit you, I think, wouldn't say that it actually
6 achieved the result you wanted.

7 A. No.

8 Q. Fair?

9 A. Mm-hmm.

10 Q. Okay. But reputation is something that concerns you and
11 is that something that we should be concerned about, the
12 Inquiry?

13 A. (Pause). I don't have a problem with places or things
14 or establishments having a reputation as long as it's
15 true.

16 Q. Would you agree there has to be openness so you can see
17 whether it is true or not?

18 A. Absolutely, absolutely. Transparency's vital.

19 Q. Yes.

20 A. But --

21 Q. And I think linked in with that, we see at
22 paragraph 101, you want independence or you worry about
23 the independence that independent schools have because
24 it would appear you have an anxiety that inspections may
25 not reveal an accurate picture?

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. Why do you have that concern?

3 A. I think it's very easy to clean up an act, you know, for
4 a period of time. I think it's all very -- it's also
5 very easy to make it clear to children to speak only
6 about specific things and not about others.

7 Q. Do you have experience of that?

8 A. I can remember there being a time where inspectors came
9 to the school and I can't remember where they were from
10 or what it was related to, but I can remember us all
11 being very distinctly told to, you know, be careful what
12 we said and to be careful how we behaved and to make
13 sure that everything was -- was kept in a way that it
14 wasn't normally.

15 Q. Okay. And I think you have concerns about the way the
16 police operate? Or did operate in the past.

17 A. (Witness nods). Well, I mean, I have concerns based on
18 the fact that I don't really have knowledge of what was
19 done previously or what the outcomes of things were.
20 I sort of now think that I should have been made aware
21 of those things, but I guess I'm also aware of the fact
22 that I could have pursued information.

23 Q. But if I can respond to that, would you like police to
24 come back? That should be a matter of routine, to tell
25 you what's going on?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And that's something that you felt was lacking?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. In your experience?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Okay. 'Betty', thank you very much. Is there more you
7 want to say?

8 A. (Pause). I hope that my -- the statement that I've
9 already made is comprehensive enough to establish the
10 facts of what occurred and what my experiences were.
11 I think in terms of trying to understand the impact that
12 that's had, it's a hard thing to try to -- to nut down.

13 My experiences at Fettes were formative,
14 significantly so, through so many different parts of my
15 life, and I feel sad about that. I hope that in some
16 way that this can lead to some level of satisfaction for
17 those that have not -- not -- not had the satisfaction
18 that they potentially should have in terms of when
19 things go wrong, they should be dealt with properly at
20 the time and apologies go a long way.

21 MR BROWN: As I said at the beginning, your statement is
22 very full and we have it and it's read and understood
23 and will be read again. But thank you for that. I have
24 no further questions.

25 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Are there any outstanding

1 applications for questions of 'Betty'?

2 'Betty', those are all the questions for you. Thank

3 you very much for engaging with the Inquiry as carefully

4 and fully as you have done. As Mr Brown said, we've got

5 your written statement, which is part of your evidence.

6 It's really helpful and it's been even more helpful to

7 see you and hear you today talking further about the

8 matters explored in your statement and indeed beyond

9 that.

10 You're absolutely right that you've helped to add to

11 the picture that I'm getting of Fettes and that's really

12 important so I'm grateful to you for your help and I'm

13 able to let you go. I hope on a Friday you're able to

14 have a restful time for the rest of today. Thank you.

15 A. Thank you.

16 (The witness withdrew)

17 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

18 MR BROWN: My Lady, we started at about 10 past so I think

19 the next phase, if we just stick with it, will take

20 about 15, perhaps 20 minutes and then break, and have

21 the live witness at 12 if that works.

22 LADY SMITH: Very well, let's do that.

23 MR BROWN: I should say that this is a read-in of a witness

24 who is one of the other, for context, girls referred to

25 in 'Betty's' statement as being someone who was picked

1 on.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

3 When you're ready, Ms Bennie.

4 'Beth' (read)

5 MS BENNIE: Thank you, my Lady. The statement bears the

6 reference FET-000000213. My Lady, the statement is in

7 the form of an email and it's dated 15 September 2020.

8 The witness wishes to remain anonymous and she's adopted

9 the pseudonym of 'Beth':

10 "I have previously taken part in the Police Scotland

11 enquiry and whilst I am not keen to have difficult

12 conversations again, I am keen to share my memories

13 related to my time at Fettes, in the years 1991 to 1998,

14 which include extremely positive interactions with all

15 teachers including those under inquiry, either now or in

16 the past.

17 I would appreciate the opportunity to support the

18 Inquiry with my experiences, none of which support the

19 Inquiry, assuming it is related to what I was involved

20 in several years ago and asked to give my statement to

21 Police Scotland."

22 My Lady, it's proposed to read in this witness.

23 'Beth' gave two statements in on the police, the first

24 in 1998 and the second in 2015 and it's proposed to read

25 in the statements.

1 LADY SMITH: So the first one is 1998.

2 MS BENNIE: Yes, my Lady, and that statement bears the
3 reference PSS-000000311. My Lady, that's a statement
4 which 'Beth' gave to DC Richards on 6 April 1998 at
5 St Leonard's police station and it reads:

6 "I live at home with my family when I'm not boarding
7 at Fettes College. I started boarding in the fifth form
8 when I was 15 when I was doing my GCSEs. I did however
9 stay at the school until after prep both during junior
10 and senior school prior to boarding, leaving at
11 7 o'clock in junior school and 9 o'clock in senior.
12 Prior to that from the age of 3 I was a student at
13 another school in Edinburgh.

14 When I started at Fettes College in January 1992
15 when I was 11, my schoolmates were already there. The
16 school is mixed and first year divided into 1A and 1B.
17 I was in 1B with other pupils including 'Betty' and
18 'Stephanie' and six other boys.

19 In form 1A was other pupils including 'Claire'.

20 I started swimming lessons as soon as I started at
21 the school. We had one lesson a week, either a Friday
22 or a Monday last lesson before tea. Our instructor was
23 Mr Stein, who was well-built, quite old, maybe in his
24 early 60s, grey haired and quite tall. The lessons were
25 quite structured with Mr Stein being poolside

1 instructing us. After the lesson we were allowed about
2 five minutes or so free time during which we played
3 games, sometimes mats were taken out.

4 I can remember asking him to throw me in, which he
5 did to others too, including the boys.

6 Verbally he was probably more strict with the boys
7 than with the girls.

8 We could elect to have activities during the week,
9 either squash, horse riding or pool mania during junior
10 school. Pool mania sessions lasted for about
11 45 minutes. We played sharks and stuff like that.
12 Mr Stein would supervise and sometimes had lanes set up
13 for those who wanted to train. Sometimes he got into
14 the pool to swim ahead.

15 I liked him and thought he was a good teacher.
16 I have never seen him do anything or say anything which
17 I was uncomfortable with. I have never had anyone tell
18 me about anything he had done or said to them which
19 I would see was wrong.

20 The changing room doors, both boys and girls, were
21 locked while we were changing for the swim as the school
22 was also used for outsiders. I can remember that he
23 used to unlock the doors when we were in there, which
24 made us shout and get a bit excited, but he never came
25 in.

1 I have heard that Mr Stein was giving 'Claire'
2 private diving lessons just recently, but I can't
3 remember who told me. I think it's unlikely, as she was
4 a day pupil herself and I think people would have known
5 if she had had these lessons.

6 The first I learned about the allegations made
7 against Mr Stein was phoning home after the newspaper
8 article which I didn't see and my mum telling me. After
9 that, two friends said that their parents had been
10 contacted by the newspaper and another said that she'd
11 been interviewed by the police. I think these
12 allegations are ridiculous. He never tried anything
13 with me and I wasn't aware that he had favourites.
14 I can see that people would think it funny with the
15 throwing in, the opening the shower room door and the
16 way he spoke differently to the girls than the boys,
17 just in tone. He used to shout at the boys.

18 I have no complaint about Mr Stein. He was popular
19 with the swimmers, both boys and girls. I don't believe
20 what I've heard about him. I can identify Mr Stein."

21 My Lady, the next statement bears the reference
22 PSS-000000369. My Lady, it's a statement of 'Beth'. It
23 was given to a police officer DC McGraw on 8 October
24 2015:

25 "I work as an executive assistant and have done so

1 for 14 months. I am from Edinburgh and that is where my
2 family live. You, DC Wells, contacted me by email
3 initially a couple of weeks ago. I phoned you back as
4 I wondered what you wanted to speak to me about. You
5 said it was an enquiry in relation to Fettes School that
6 you wanted to talk to me about. I think you said you
7 had information from a third party that you wanted to
8 talk to me about.

9 We then communicated by email after another
10 telephone conversation to arrange a Skype interview.

11 I didn't have any connections to Fettes School. It
12 was just the school my parents chose for me and my
13 brother to go to. I started at Fettes when I was
14 10 years old. I started halfway through the term
15 in January 1991. I was a day pupil initially up until
16 5th form when I was 15 or 16 years old. I started to
17 board as it was primarily a boarding school and was
18 catered for the boarders, plus school finished at
19 9 o'clock. Also a lot of activities took place at the
20 weekend. I was happy to board.

21 I thoroughly enjoyed my time at Fettes School and
22 I'm grateful to my parents for sending me there. It has
23 given me a solid education and opened doors in relation
24 to employment. It gave me a foundation of stability and
25 human nature.

1 I don't really remember speaking to a police officer
2 about of in relation to my time at Fettes. You,
3 DC Wells, have asked me if I had any concerns relating
4 to my time at school or any particular teachers.
5 I didn't.

6 I do remember a scandal at school which was in the
7 newspaper. I remember it was in relation to Mr Stein
8 and that there was something sexually inappropriate
9 which he had done in relation to another pupil
10 apparently.

11 'Claire' was a pupil in my year at school. She was
12 a classmate. She may have been a friend at the time,
13 but she wasn't at the school that long as she had to
14 leave. She had to leave as her brother was involved in
15 some sort of scandal and her mum was on some sort of
16 witch hunt against the school. Her brother was caught
17 taking drugs. This was in the newspaper as well.
18 I recall her mum trying to befriend other parents in
19 relation to this scandal. I'm sure she tried to
20 befriend 'Stephanie's' mum.

21 I would say they weren't a usual match as
22 'Stephanie's' mum was friendly, polite and decent.
23 'Claire's' mum was a bit of a battleaxe and a cold
24 person. 'Claire's' mum wasn't very welcoming like
25 'Stephanie's' mum. I didn't know 'Claire's' mum very

1 well.

2 When 'Claire' left school, that was the end of our
3 friendship. I don't think I've spoken to her since
4 then. I remember 'Claire' was a strong individual and
5 a bit of a ringleader. She always had a bit of a posse
6 with her. I didn't have any issues particularly with
7 her. As I started mid term, it took me a couple of
8 months to settle in. I remember the girls putting my
9 clothes in the shower and my shoes in the drain, but
10 I can't remember specific names. We all ended up
11 speaking and getting on fine.

12 'Claire' was particularly friendly with 'Betty' and
13 'Stephanie'. 'Betty' and 'Stephanie' left the school
14 around the same time as 'Claire'. I remember thinking
15 at the time that the reason they all left must have been
16 related. It was like a domino effect. 'Stephanie' was
17 a follower of 'Claire', as she was a quiet girl.
18 'Betty' was a dominant girl and nobody messed with her.

19 Mr Stein was a friendly teacher and a jovial
20 character. He reminded me of an uncle figure. He was
21 funny and welcoming. Boarding schools can be a steal
22 environment so when you have someone like him you warm
23 to them.

24 I can't understand why people would want to bring
25 this up again. I thought whatever issues 'Claire's' mum

1 had with the school or her family had, they would just
2 have let go of it.

3 Mr Stein treated us all, boys and girls, the same.
4 He was a swimming teacher. There may have been other
5 swimming teachers but I only remember him. He was
6 an older man. He was quite heavy set. I don't think he
7 had much hair. When I was 10 I thought he was 100. He
8 was older than my mum and dad at the time. He had no
9 hair on his legs. He wore shorts, flip flops and
10 a t-shirt. He had a whistle which he blew a lot.

11 He was probably one of the louder teachers. He
12 would shout if you were running late. We only saw him
13 once or twice a week. I gave up swimming as soon as
14 I could as I didn't enjoy it. I would have been in the
15 senior school when I gave up swimming. I don't remember
16 seeing Mr Stein out of the swimming pool area.

17 I remember feeling awkward in the swimming pool when
18 I had my period. It was at the time our bodies were
19 changing and I remember not knowing whether I could go
20 swimming or not. I think I spoke to the matron about
21 it, but I don't remember Mr Stein making an issue of
22 girls having their periods. I think it was the house
23 matron who gave us excusal slips if we had a period.
24 I don't remember him speaking to girls who were on their
25 periods.

1 I remember him when we were in the changing rooms or
2 showers telling us to hurry up and he would stick his
3 head in the changing rooms but not around the partition.
4 It was enough for us girls to get a move on. I don't
5 remember him ever being in the changing room. I don't
6 even remember him being in the changing room when we
7 were fully clothed.

8 He treated the boys and the girls the same although
9 he probably had a soft spot for the girls. I mean he
10 would let us go first in the races, for example.
11 Nothing inappropriate.

12 He taught us life-saving, how to swim, and he
13 allowed us a free swims during which we played games.
14 Sharks was one of the games. He would chase us under
15 the water or one of the boys would be it. The person
16 who was the shark was he and they would grab your legs
17 and waist and try to pull you under. It wasn't to cause
18 you harm. It was sometimes scary in a childhood game
19 way. I don't remember if the girls were ever he.

20 I don't remember him touching me in any way which
21 was inappropriate. I don't think he touched any other
22 girl or boy in an inappropriate manner. I don't
23 remember any talk at the time of Mr Stein doing anything
24 to any girl or boy that they didn't like.

25 I remember the girls screaming when we thought he

1 was going to come into the changing room, but he never
2 did.

3 I think Mr Stein was at the school as a swimming
4 teacher in the time that I was. In saying that, though,
5 I wasn't swimming myself in senior school. I only
6 attended the pool in senior school for galas. When
7 a gala was on, he would be there from a lifeguard
8 perspective and the parents or other teachers would be
9 there. I don't think parents or other teachers would
10 have been there for normal lessons.

11 I remember a stockroom by the pool with hoops in it,
12 for example. I don't remember him using this equipment.
13 I remember him using a hose to spray people. I don't
14 think I ever got sprayed with the hose but I don't
15 remember. I don't remember him picking on any
16 particular student, let alone 'Claire'. I can't really
17 remember 'Claire' being in the pool. One girl stands
18 out, I recall, as being shy in her swimsuit.

19 If anything happened at school which I didn't like,
20 I probably would have spoken to my tutor. She would be
21 the person I would have confided in. I don't remember
22 having to speak to her.

23 You had asked me (DC Wells) if I recall the Board of
24 Governors. I'm aware there was a board but I don't
25 recall their names or what they did.

1 I went on school trips when I was at school. There
2 were lots of sports tours. I went on hockey and
3 lacrosse tours. I can't remember going on any boat
4 trips. I was never invited on anybody's yacht. I don't
5 recall any boat trips on yachts.

6 There was few small scandals during my time at the
7 school in relation to drinking. Whenever any privileged
8 child behaves badly this would hit the newspapers. The
9 only bigger scandals were in relation to 'Claire's'
10 older brother and the drugs scandal and Mr Stein.

11 I now carry out the role of [REDACTED]
12 [REDACTED] and so have this connection to the school.
13 I've been doing this about three years. I was asked by
14 [REDACTED] I was asked by
15 her and I was glad to do it. I don't interact with the
16 school. I write a report twice a year in relation to
17 what is happening [REDACTED] in the region.

18 I am the youngest by far and the majority of members
19 are older men.

20 You asked me if I remember CKP [REDACTED] and I vaguely
21 remember the name but I don't know why.

22 I don't remember anyone in particular being on their
23 own with Mr Stein. I wouldn't have worried being on my
24 own with Mr Stein.

25 You have read this statement over to me and it is

1 a true and accurate account.

2 If I had any issues at all in relation to Mr Stein,

3 I would tell you."

4 My Lady, that concludes the read-in.

5 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. So we'll take the break

6 now, Mr Brown?

7 MR BROWN: My Lady, yes, and then if we can start at 12.00

8 with 'William', who is a WebEx witness. He should have

9 been a live witness but other factors intervened but

10 he's helpfully joining us by WebEx.

11 LADY SMITH: Good. Until 12 o'clock then, thank you.

12 (11.40 am)

13 (A short break)

14 (12.00 pm)

15 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

16 MR BROWN: My Lady, good afternoon. Keeping to time. The

17 next witness is 'William', who is connected to us, we

18 can see him, I don't think he can currently see us, but

19 he is ready to go and the system is working.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

21 'William', good afternoon.

22 THE WITNESS: Good afternoon.

23 LADY SMITH: Thank you for joining us over the WebEx link.

24 I'm Lady Smith and I'm chairing the Scottish Child Abuse

25 Inquiry here in Edinburgh and we're ready to go on to

1 your evidence, which we will begin very shortly.

2 First of all, please, could I ask you to take the

3 oath to tell the truth.

4 'William' (sworn)

5 LADY SMITH: Just a couple of preliminaries, 'William'.

6 First, obviously, if there's any problem with the link

7 at your end, please let us know immediately and we'll do

8 what we can to sort it out.

9 But perhaps more importantly, I want you to be as

10 comfortable as you can when giving your evidence, so if

11 you have any questions, if you need a break, any worries

12 at all, do let me know. Whatever works for you works

13 for me, because I do appreciate that giving evidence to

14 this Inquiry is not a straightforward matter and asking

15 you to discuss personal details as may arise in your

16 evidence can be difficult. So you lead, you tell me

17 what will work for you if you have any worries.

18 If you're ready, I'll hand over to Mr Brown, and I'm

19 hoping the link's also enabling 'William' to see his

20 statement. Is it?

21 MR BROWN: I think so.

22 LADY SMITH: Good. Thank you.

23 Questions from Mr Brown

24 MR BROWN: 'William', hello again. Can you see your

25 statement on the screen?

1 A. I can, thank you.

2 Q. Good. And I think you have got a paper copy as well --

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. -- you printed out. Okay. We see that that statement,

5 which has a reference number WIT-1-000000321, runs to

6 12 pages. Looking at that last page, you signed it on

7 11 February last year?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Correct?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. We see that the last paragraph reads:

12 "I have no objection to my witness statement being

13 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

14 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are

15 true."

16 That's obviously recognising you're talking of

17 events in the late 1970s into the 1980s, so a long time

18 ago, but you read this statement and you were content

19 that it was accurate?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Great. Please understand this is not a memory test.

22 Going back to your childhood. But we are very

23 interested in what you say in the statement and we won't

24 have to rehearse all of it, but we will obviously talk

25 about a number of themes that you bring out in it, okay?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. One of those, just to get it set out at the outset, is
3 you are very keen not to name anybody. You explain why,
4 but I think it would be of interest for you to explain
5 to her Ladyship why you're not interested in naming
6 anyone who might have done things to you when you were
7 at school.

8 A. Yeah, okay. That is correct. I think on one level --
9 so there are people I could name and the principal
10 people I could name are the housemaster. I don't think
11 there's any value in naming him because he must be in
12 his late 70s or 80s, if indeed he's still alive.
13 I don't think there's any value in dragging him into the
14 Inquiry.

15 I could name the two principal perpetrators, there
16 are a number of others as well I could name, but they
17 were in a way victims as well because there were no
18 boundaries at the school, or insufficient boundaries at
19 the school.

20 I really want to emphasise, which may be not in the
21 statement, I do not for a second condone what they did
22 or think they shouldn't have done it or think that is in
23 any way an excuse, because it isn't and what they did
24 was not right, and frankly any sane person would have
25 not needed to be told that. But I'm not sure what

1 purpose is served by dragging them individually into
2 account for what happened when they were 17 years old
3 a long time ago.

4 What's more important to me is that the school
5 itself recognises fully what was going on behind the
6 fences back then, and it confronts that and it deals
7 with it.

8 Q. Thank you. With all of that in mind, and may I stress
9 understood, let's go back to the beginning. You're now
10 52. You were born in 1969, lived in rural Scotland, but
11 the view was taken by your parents that after your
12 primary education at the local primary school, your
13 parents thought you should go to Fettes because there
14 really wasn't an adequate provision for you where you
15 lived; that's correct?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Why was Fettes selected, do you remember?

18 A. I don't know. I wasn't part of the decision-making
19 process. I think they looked at a few schools through
20 the sort of Central Belt of Scotland. I don't know why
21 they picked Fettes.

22 Q. Had you visited Fettes before you started?

23 A. No, I hadn't. They had, but I hadn't.

24 Q. What, if anything, did you know of Fettes before your
25 first day?

1 A. Nothing, really.

2 Q. Okay. And I'm sorry just to keep going back
3 to September 1979 and day 1, can you remember what will
4 your emotions were before you got there?

5 A. Before I got there I was -- I didn't really know what to
6 expect. It was kind of like, you know, I was a bit
7 nervous. My mum and dad drove away, I was pretty upset.
8 There were a few days in particular, the first couple of
9 weeks, were very difficult.

10 Q. We would understand that you are going into what was
11 then the Fettes Junior School, which was called
12 Malcolm House; is that correct?

13 A. Yes. Yes.

14 Q. And we understand that it's a discrete building where
15 you've got one building with classrooms and another
16 where the head of the junior school would live in a flat
17 with his family and some dormitory provision for the
18 boys. Does that ring true?

19 A. Yes. So there was a house that he lived in and there
20 were two rooms in that house that were made into dorms
21 with six in each room, and actually in the second year
22 they stuffed two beds up in the little turret place as
23 well, so there were 14 of us essentially living in the
24 headmaster's house with the headmaster and that building
25 is connected to the school by a corridor but essentially

1 it's separate standalone building.

2 Q. And a lot of the boys in the junior school would be day

3 boys at that stage, the number of boarders was probably

4 fewer than day; is that right?

5 A. I think that's right. And also there were some boys who

6 were staying with families in Edinburgh, that was also

7 the arrangement. So essentially they were boarding out

8 of the school with a family in the city somewhere.

9 Q. Okay. Thinking back to that first day, your parents

10 take you into the school, drop you off, presumably with

11 a trunk or a great deal of kit.

12 A. (Witness nods).

13 Q. Who met you? Do you remember?

14 A. I think it was the headmaster of the junior school and

15 his wife met us.

16 Q. Was there any formal effort to give you an induction

17 into what you were now going to experience? Do you

18 remember what provision there was to settle you in?

19 A. I don't really remember. I don't thinking there was

20 much. I can't really remember. I think we arrived

21 a day before everybody else, the new starters. I think

22 there were three of us. And we arrived a day before

23 everybody else. And yeah, we must have been shown where

24 the dining hall was and how that sort of stuff worked

25 and where the classroom was. I can't really remember

1 that detail.

2 Q. But you say that you were really homesick. Was any

3 effort made to address that? By the school?

4 A. No.

5 Q. What about your fellow pupils, the other new starts?

6 A. Yeah, I mean, some felt it a bit more than others and

7 you just had to sort of get on with it and people were

8 going to be okay and blah blah blah. You know, we were

9 ten-year-olds talking amongst ourselves and, yeah, that

10 was -- you just needed to get used to it.

11 Q. What about how this new big school operated? Presumably

12 it's a world away from your primary school?

13 A. Yeah, it's a world away from the primary school.

14 I mean, it was different, but the junior school then, it

15 was a bit smaller than I think it is now and it was

16 quite separated from the rest of the school. So it

17 still felt like quite a small school. There were five

18 classes across -- there were two classes of, I think,

19 probably about 20 in year 1 and then there was a sort

20 of -- there were three year 2 classes but one of those

21 classes was only really used for kids who were going to

22 be there for three years. Because some of them, either

23 for academic purposes or because they were quite young,

24 were kept in the junior school for three years, and

25 so -- but, you know, it was five classes, so, I don't

1 know, 100 kids? It felt like a relatively small place
2 and it was separated by the rugby pitches from the
3 senior school so you never really had anything to do
4 with the senior school other than at meal times when we
5 went to the dining hall and we would get there before
6 the senior school so we didn't really see them there
7 either.

8 Q. Okay. One perhaps left field question, thinking of
9 dining when you were at the junior school, do you
10 remember, did the teachers drink?

11 A. Teachers would not have drunk alcohol in the dining hall
12 with the kids. There was a place in the dining hall,
13 a teacher's common room, that we were -- we couldn't go
14 near. That was absolutely only for the teachers, so
15 I think at times the teachers would drink in there. And
16 I think there used to be a bit of a joke about Friday
17 night, the teachers would go there to the common room
18 for a drink and so on. But the teachers would not,
19 categorically would not drink in front of the kids in
20 the dining hall.

21 Q. Okay, thank you. In terms of the junior school, from
22 what you're saying there is no formal induction, as we
23 might now understand it. But you're -- sorry, carry on.

24 A. No, I don't remember a formal induction. Like I say,
25 obviously we were shown where the classrooms were and we

1 must have been shown where the dining hall was and so
2 on, but beyond that, I don't remember anything.

3 Q. And you're picking things up, one takes it, from other
4 pupils who are showing you the ropes?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Do you remember, was there a grace period where you were
7 allowed to learn the rules and for that period you were
8 free from punishment?

9 A. I don't -- I don't remember a grace period. Equally, if
10 I'm honest, I don't -- it wasn't that complicated.

11 Q. Okay.

12 A. I mean, you know, you knew what time you had to get up.
13 There was a thing, a piece of paper on the back of the
14 door in the dorm: rise, wash, brush teeth, brush hair,
15 7.15. 7.30 go to breakfast. I mean, these things are
16 not complicated, so after day 1 we kind of knew what we
17 had to go, we knew where we had to be. Lessons started
18 at 9 o'clock and we'd go through at whatever time before
19 9.00, I can't remember when, and the teachers would set
20 homework and we knew where we sat in the evenings to do
21 homework and the teachers would run through the
22 timetable for the week and sports and this and that and
23 the other. I mean, it was -- it wasn't complicated.

24 Q. Thank you. Thinking to the junior school, do you
25 remember if there were any teachers you were warned of

1 by fellow pupils?

2 A. I am aware, and I've become aware since my interviews,
3 that there is a lot of chat around a particular teacher.
4 I know who that teacher is. Because that teacher was
5 there when I was there, and then he emigrated to South
6 Africa. If we're talking about the teacher who
7 emigrated to South Africa. I know who that was. I can
8 name them if you want.

9 Q. No, please don't.

10 A. I wasn't aware of any -- I wasn't aware of anything to
11 do with that teacher and nobody said anything to me
12 about that teacher.

13 Q. Thank you. And I think in terms of the overlap, it was
14 simply that first term?

15 A. I can't remember. It was some time in the -- probably
16 some time in the first year. I can't remember if it was
17 the first term or when he went, but he was definitely
18 there for a period when I was there.

19 Q. Did he teach you?

20 A. Then he went to South Africa and all we understood was
21 he'd moved to South Africa.

22 Q. Did he teach you?

23 A. I think he did, yeah.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. I think he taught me [REDACTED] but honestly, I can't -- no,

1 he wouldn't have taught me [REDACTED] But he did teach me.

2 Q. Okay, thank you. In terms of the junior school, if you

3 had a problem, who would you go and speak to?

4 A. I don't know. It depends what your problem is. If your

5 problem was an academic problem, you would speak to the

6 teacher. If the problem was any other sort of problem,

7 then -- well, if it was a medical problem, you'd go and

8 speak to the housemaster's wife -- the headmaster's

9 wife, sorry, Mrs [REDACTED] They were the -- yeah,

10 academic, go there. Medical, go there. Any other

11 problem, you know. But I don't know who you'd speak to.

12 Q. So there was no provision, for example, thinking back to

13 being homesick, there was no one you were told to, if

14 you were feeling unhappy or worried about something,

15 come and talk to X?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Did you ever have such a person, thinking to the

18 totality of your time at Fettes, who you could go and

19 speak to?

20 A. No.

21 Q. There was never provision shared with you: here's who

22 you can go and unload on if you're not feeling happy?

23 A. No.

24 Q. And is that something that you think was a failing?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Okay. You spent how many years in the junior school?

2 A. Two.

3 Q. And in terms of what you're going on to talk about,

4 which is abuse, was that a time that you considered

5 abusive or was it easier?

6 A. It was easier in the junior school because the abuse

7 that I experienced, bullying, was by pupils, not by

8 teachers, and in the junior school we -- they weren't

9 there when I was in the junior school, the people who

10 would make my life uncomfortable. They were already in

11 the senior school, and there wasn't anyone in the junior

12 school really doing that stuff. You know, there'd be

13 name calling and what have you and bits and pieces that

14 went on, but it was low level and it was -- not to

15 excuse any of it, but it wasn't -- I don't see it as

16 a systemic problem and I don't -- other than being

17 wrenched away from home, I don't remember problems with

18 my time in the junior school other than the fact that

19 I'm just a long way from home and it's all a bit of

20 a wrench.

21 Q. Thanks. But then we move on to the senior school and

22 you're allocated a house.

23 A. (Witness nods).

24 Q. Which house?

25 A. Kimmerghame.

1 Q. And was that something you had any choice in?

2 A. I can't remember. Again I think there was some choice,
3 but I don't think I had much consultation with it.
4 I think my parents may have had something to do with it
5 and you could express a preference in the application
6 process for a boarding house and I went to Kimmerghame.
7 I wasn't, I don't think, consulted on it, but it was
8 what it was.

9 Q. Thinking back to that last summer term before you go
10 into the senior school in 1981. From the junior school
11 perspective, we know there are a number of different
12 houses at Fettes. As a junior school pupil, were there
13 houses you wanted to avoid? Did houses have
14 a reputation that you were aware of?

15 A. No. I think everybody wanted to go to Glencorse.
16 I don't really know why that was. I think, you know, to
17 do with the housemaster and -- I don't know what.
18 Everybody wanted to go there but there wasn't a kind of,
19 "Don't go to that one, that's a bad one", it was just
20 the popular one seemed to be Glencorse.

21 Q. But you go to Kimmerghame, and again this is moving into
22 a quite different environment, presumably, as compared
23 with the junior school?

24 A. Mm-hmm.

25 Q. Which is small, contained. You're now in a much bigger

1 house, bigger dorms, bigger boys, and a much wider age
2 range.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Was that daunting?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And was any effort made by the school when you moved
7 into the senior world and the life of a house, to say,
8 "Welcome to the house, this is how it operates. Any
9 problems ..." I know the answer to this one obviously
10 in terms of any problems because there was no one you
11 were told to go and speak to, but was an effort made to
12 ease your passage into the senior school?

13 A. So again, yeah, you arrived a day or possibly two days
14 before everybody else. I can't remember, but we
15 definitely arrived at least one day before everybody
16 else. So all the new joiners in the third form were at
17 the school and, you know, there were seven of us in the
18 house, so we could get to know one another before
19 everybody else arrived. And again you're shown the
20 ropes, you're explained how the day works, the timetable
21 of the day and so on. For most of them they were coming
22 in from somewhere else, not coming up from the junior
23 school, and so, you know, where's the dining hall, where
24 do you go for sports and so on. We must have been shown
25 all of that stuff, yeah, so that you knew where you were

1 supposed to be and when, which notice board to look at
2 for games and this and that and the other, so all of
3 that stuff happened. And I remember the first night we
4 sat in the -- they used to call the junior common room
5 and the housemaster gave us some sort of talk about the
6 school. I can't remember all the detail of what he
7 said, but the thing that I do remember, that has stuck
8 with me and is in the statement, is this comment about,
9 "When you come to the senior school, we call you men and
10 we expect you to behave like men", and this thing of
11 calling you men, that's what they did. From that moment
12 on, you weren't boys. It wasn't, "Now, boys, come on,
13 we need to go there", it was like, "Now, men, come on,
14 we're going here", so collectively you were men.

15 That I recall from the first night and I didn't
16 think anything of it at the time, but I look back on it
17 now and think that is indicative of the broader mindset
18 that allowed the sort of things to happen that happened.

19 Q. Just to remind us, you were 12 when you went into the
20 senior school?

21 A. I was 12, yeah.

22 Q. You say in your statement that in your dorm, thinking
23 back to that first night, there are new starts like you
24 and there's a prefect or a senior boy allocated to the
25 room. Were they helpful or unhelpful, that senior?

1 A. So the senior boy wouldn't have been there the first
2 night, he would have only come back when everybody else
3 came back, so the first night we would have just been
4 the four of us. But that senior prefect was not
5 unhelpful. He was fine as an individual. He was fine
6 and I never had any particular difficulties with him.
7 He would have been in his last year, but through that
8 year I had no particular difficulties with him.

9 Q. But I think from what your statement overall reveals,
10 there is a very clear hierarchy in the senior school?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. With the senior boys obviously being superior to -- and
13 I say that neutrally -- the junior boys. And that would
14 be reflected in having to do chores for senior boys?

15 A. Fagging, yeah.

16 Q. Fagging.

17 A. So we were all assigned to a prefect and you had to do
18 whatever the prefect asked to you do.

19 Q. And presumably that would turn on which prefect you got,
20 what sort of experience you had?

21 A. I think so, yes.

22 Q. What was your experience?

23 A. Well, I don't think -- yes, one's experience would be
24 very much dictated by the individual one was allocated
25 to.

1 Q. And how was your experience?

2 A. My experience actually was okay in the third form. The
3 guy I was allocated to was, you know, a nice bloke.
4 I had to get him routinely, like pretty much every day,
5 had to get him a roll and a sausage in the roll for his
6 breakfast because, you know, he couldn't be fagged to
7 get up for breakfast so I'd go and get my breakfast and
8 then I'd leave the dining hall and then go back in to go
9 and get essentially a second meal, pick up a roll and
10 a couple of sausages and stick them in the roll and then
11 slip that into my jacket pocket and walk back to the
12 house with this roll in my jacket pocket. I had to do
13 the odd bits and pieces for him, but that was the bulk
14 of my chores.

15 Q. Did you see others with rather more onerous tasks given
16 to them?

17 A. Some people had to clean rugby boots that were just
18 utterly caked in mud and so on and I don't know what
19 else. I mean, it was -- yeah. Different things for
20 different people.

21 Q. But did that cause you any concern, overall, not just
22 your experience, but seeing what happened to other
23 people, or was it just accepted as that was the way it
24 was?

25 A. It's just the way it was.

1 Q. Was it abused?

2 A. Was it abused? I mean, putting aside having to run
3 around and do errands for somebody just four years older
4 than you, is that right or not, I don't think it was --
5 people should have cleaned their own rugby boots,
6 frankly. People should do their own stuff.

7 I don't think anybody was taken advantage of more
8 than anybody else particularly, or I don't think there
9 was any sort of physical or emotional or sexual abuse
10 directly resulting from the fagging system.

11 Q. Thank you.

12 A. Not that I saw.

13 Q. Okay. That's obviously interaction between boys and
14 boys, and we'll come onto the bullying as between boys
15 and boys that you talk about in your statement. But
16 just again to understand, you have a housemaster. Was
17 there a house tutor as well?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. A matron?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. How much day-to-day interaction did you have with staff
22 members?

23 A. Outside the classroom or games --

24 Q. Can I put it to you --

25 A. -- you more or less lived your entire life without

1 interacting with any staff members.

2 Q. One way it's been described by another witness was

3 teachers educated and refereed and that was pretty much

4 it. That sounds a similar description to what you've

5 just said.

6 A. Absolutely, yeah. You'd turn up to the classrooms and

7 the teachers would be there, and set homework. You'd

8 turn up for games and the teachers would be there and

9 they'd coach or referee. And outside of that you could

10 go all day and not see them.

11 Q. That's obviously looking at the life you lived in

12 Kimmerghame House. Was Kimmerghame any different from

13 the other houses?

14 A. No, I think they were all -- all the same.

15 Q. Again just looking at the number of houses, you've

16 talked about Glencorse. Glencorse was the one that

17 people wanted to go into for whatever reason. You

18 mentioned the housemaster.

19 A. (Witness nods).

20 Q. Did particular houses have reputations for being tougher

21 than others?

22 A. I don't know. I don't think so, but I can't really

23 remember. I sometimes used to think that there was

24 people in Kimmerghame who didn't seem to -- there didn't

25 seem to be quite the same idiots, for want of a better

1 word, in other houses, and sometimes I'd think life
2 would be easier in another house. But I'm not --
3 I don't know that to be true. But I think -- there was
4 no one house where you were like, oh, yeah, that's just
5 for -- that's the madhouse. You didn't quite think
6 about it like that, I think. The regimes were similar
7 in all of them and the engagement, or lack of, of the
8 housemasters was the same across them, that was the way
9 it worked.

10 Q. So from what you're saying, the lack of engagement day
11 to day, senior boys would be controlling junior boys?

12 A. Absolutely, the senior boys would -- the senior boys
13 were in charge. They were the prefects and they ran the
14 show. They were in charge.

15 Q. And that was official, but then presumably as well as
16 the official, there would be unofficial, and that's
17 thinking of hierarchy and bullying?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Because you say at paragraph 21, and this is presumably
20 talking about Kimmerghame, your experience:

21 "Bullying was rife, absolutely endemic, and was
22 a constant background to my time in Fettes."

23 A. Yes. Certainly up to and including the fifth form. So
24 for my first three years, bullying was endemic and it
25 would come down to a few people in particular and that's

1 why the sixth form was better than the previous three
2 because the perpetrators had left the school. But the
3 prefects were not going to intervene with stuff like
4 that. There wasn't -- I don't think they saw it as
5 their role.

6 So, you know, if a fifth former was beating up
7 a third former, a prefect's not going to get engaged.
8 Certainly not if there's no blood or anything like that.
9 You know, if it's dead arms and dead legs and flushing
10 head down the loo, they're not going to get involved.

11 Q. Do you remember them ever getting involved if there
12 wasn't blood?

13 A. No. I mean, to be clear, I talk in the statement this
14 was where it happened, there was a place called area and
15 you had to go to area twice a day for roll call.
16 Prefects did the roll call, not the housemaster. The
17 housemaster sometimes would turn up, by which I mean not
18 even once a week, but sometimes would turn up.

19 But at times in area, and this was -- one of the
20 prefects when I was in third form, he was a good hockey
21 player and he would wander round with a hockey stick and
22 a hockey ball and we were all lined up around the walls
23 of area and we would have to stand there and he would
24 throw the ball up and then he would whack it with the
25 hockey stick and it would go in some direction and you'd

1 have to duck and get out of the way so it didn't hit
2 you. That -- I mean, I used to be terrified when he was
3 in one of those moods and was intent on doing that, and
4 everyone else would -- the other prefects would stand
5 around and laugh because they weren't standing up
6 against the wall and it was -- it was kind of sport and
7 people were a little bit like this is funny and
8 terrifying at the same time and it was like, oh, it's
9 one of those.

10 So prefects could be the perpetrators of the
11 violence as much as everybody else.

12 Q. And how much do you think the staff were aware of this?

13 A. So I think the staff were deliberately looking the other
14 way. And this is the really important point for me.
15 This stuff wasn't hard to see if you wanted to find it.
16 But they were looking the other way. Deliberately.

17 And there's a -- I can't remember which paragraph it
18 is in my statement, I'll see if I can find it on my
19 screen. I can't easily find it. The story I tell about
20 when the prefect was in our dorm, I was in fourth form
21 and the prefect was sat on me on my bed giving me dead
22 arms and what have you, and the housemaster walks in.
23 So this is after lights out, we're all supposed to be in
24 bed, we're all supposed to be going to sleep, and the
25 housemaster walked in and saw the prefect. And the

1 prefect is on top of me with his arm raised to thump me.
2 Kind of looking back, it's like what did the housemaster
3 think was going on? I mean, what's going on there? And
4 he said, "Oh, it's you", and walked out the room.

5 They were looking the other way. They did not want
6 to know about this. They could have seen it if they
7 wanted to, yet they chose not to. Probably because it
8 was character-building.

9 Q. That's paragraph 30 on page 7.

10 A. Yeah.

11 Q. On that occasion you recount what you've just told us
12 and he turned round having said, "Oh, it's you" and
13 walked back out, did the prefect stop or did he carry on
14 with blows?

15 A. No, so he did stop at that point and realised, oh,
16 I probably shouldn't be doing this, so he stopped at
17 that point. Yeah.

18 Q. But the teacher had gone?

19 A. But the teacher had gone. And the point was you knew --
20 that was indicative of -- you know, there was stuff
21 going on all of the time and the teachers weren't
22 there -- there weren't many examples that were so stark
23 staringly obvious as that, but what was apparent all the
24 time was the teachers weren't trying to find it and they
25 weren't really interested in it, and that led to a sense

1 that you wouldn't talk to anybody about this. You
2 wouldn't go to a teacher about this because they didn't
3 want to know. And they probably thought that what was
4 going on was okay, it's part of the experience. It was
5 character-building. You need to toughen up.

6 Q. Did you feel that was the ethos of Fettes when you were
7 there?

8 A. Oh, definitely the bit about character-building, that
9 would be said a lot, about character-building.

10 Q. By the staff?

11 A. By everybody. It was a kind of -- you know, amongst
12 some of us it was the sort of cynical, "Oh, it's
13 character-building, it's fine". And you know, there are
14 some things, you know, like teaching you resourcefulness
15 and ingenuity and so on and going off on your Duke of
16 Edinburgh's expedition in the fucking rain and having to
17 deal with that, putting your tent up and so on. You
18 know, life is not a bed of roses. That's fine. But
19 some of this stuff was -- you know, it was just
20 bullying. It was just physical abuse. You wouldn't
21 tolerate it as an adult and it was just going on all of
22 the time that when you weren't being thumped you were
23 just kind of like: I might get thumped. And it just --
24 you just lived with it.

25 Q. It was ever-present?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. If you weren't getting thumped, you were wondering when
3 you would next be thumped?

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. Just to go back to paragraph 30 briefly and the context,
6 from 29, this is some time in early 1983 and one of the
7 prefects, you say, was in your room and you and your
8 roommates were telling them about two boys who were
9 particular bullies of you and your contemporaries?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And the point is others said everyone got beat up by
12 them except you, so the prefect's response was, well,
13 you need to be beaten up and that's when he was on top
14 of you when the teacher walked in?

15 A. Yes. I mean, I think his exact words were, "He's the
16 only one who deserves to get beaten up", because I can
17 vividly remember it. You know, these two guys used to
18 come into the room, you know, sometimes they'd come in
19 for a few minutes they'd come in every night and then
20 they wouldn't come in for a while, blah blah blah, and
21 they would start with the oldest and they would work
22 their way round doing each of us over, and I was the
23 youngest. And sometimes they would do me as well, but
24 then sometimes they wouldn't. For no reason. They'd
25 just stop at the one next to me and then they'd walk out

1 and they wouldn't do me. And, you know, you'd sit there
2 in the corner, my bed was in the corner, and you'd just
3 kind of sit there waiting your turn and then either your
4 turn came or sometimes weirdly it didn't.

5 They were reciting to the prefect that had come in
6 that night, "Yeah, he doesn't even get beaten up", to
7 which the prefect said, "He's the only one who deserves
8 to get beaten up" and jumped on me and started and
9 that's when the housemaster came in.

10 Q. You describe the behaviour of these two boys as entirely
11 random and you just described why you would use the word
12 random because some days they would do it, some days
13 they wouldn't, they would do it days in a row, then it
14 would stop, you might be involved, you might not be.
15 What was your mindset when that was going on? How do
16 you describe it?

17 A. I'm not sure I understand the question, sorry.

18 Q. Well, what do you think is the primary emotion, put it
19 that way?

20 A. What was my primary emotion?

21 Q. Yeah.

22 A. Get this over. Let's get through this. Here we go
23 again. Let's get through this one.

24 Q. But thinking of the scenarios where these boys are
25 working their way round the room, the oldest first, you

1 were the youngest?

2 A. You just waited for it. Like, I hope it's not too bad.

3 It's going to hurt. Hopefully it won't hurt too much.

4 Q. Did you become numbed to it, if I can put it that way?

5 A. No, I'm not sure I'd quite -- you're resigned to it.

6 I'm not sure -- you know, you were numb afterwards,

7 that's for sure.

8 Q. Okay.

9 A. You were resigned to it. You were kind of: yeah, here

10 we go again. And you just wait in trepidation and

11 nervousness and a sort of certain amount of fear and

12 it's kind of I know what's coming and it will hurt but

13 it will, you know, and it will be done and it will be

14 fine. And this is -- so you'd wait and maybe they'd do

15 it or maybe they wouldn't. And we'd all just kind of

16 lie there and kind of go, oh, wait for it. But that

17 would be it for the night. You'd then know then, right,

18 we're not going to get disturbed again tonight, so now

19 we can go to sleep.

20 Q. That description is random bullying of everyone in your

21 room, so no one's being picked out for special

22 treatment, if you follow me.

23 A. (Witness nods). Correct.

24 Q. But you do describe certain individuals, and this is for

25 example at paragraph 23, a boy joining in fourth form

1 who was a train spotter. He presumably stood out?

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. And was that difference something that was instantly
4 picked on and lead to him being bullied more than
5 others?

6 A. Yes. So that difference for him was instantly picked
7 on. He wasn't in my house, so -- but, you know,
8 I knew -- and he was a year below us, but I knew people
9 in his house, good friends with some of the people in
10 his house and they were like -- and they told me he got
11 picked on pretty mercilessly. So I didn't witness it,
12 but he got picked on pretty mercilessly.

13 They organised a sort of train trip up to Mallaig
14 and a bunch of us went one day and that's how I kind of
15 knew this boy because he was on that trip and he had
16 these books all about the trains and the railway lines
17 of Britain and blah blah blah and that's how I was aware
18 of him. And then he was gone after a term because, you
19 know, he was a train spotter and train spotters are
20 losers and he was -- that was the kind of -- he was
21 just, you know, made to feel very uncomfortable.
22 I obviously don't think train spotters are losers;
23 that's the mindset that was being evoked.

24 If you were different, your life could be pretty
25 miserable. And I think particularly there were a few

1 people in my year who were bullied by people within the
2 year. So we didn't have that in Kimmerghame. We
3 were -- possibly because we were united in adversity
4 against those above us, we were a tight-knit group
5 amongst ourselves. I'm not sure that was the case in
6 all of the other houses. I think there were some
7 individuals whose lives were made pretty miserable by
8 their own year group and I think that's probably
9 a lonelier place to be than when it's somebody above
10 you.

11 Q. What would, from a Fettes point of view, be the cause of
12 difference? Who were the different people?

13 A. If you weren't -- there's no easy way to answer this.
14 I mean, I suppose the most important thing at Fettes was
15 being good at rugby. So, you know, the better you were
16 at rugby, the more alpha you were. If you weren't good
17 at sport or you weren't interested in sport, that shoved
18 you a long way down the pecking order.

19 And thereafter it was -- it's just a bit random,
20 right? It's just people's personalities. Some people,
21 they'd be taken against and that was it. I wasn't one
22 of those -- I don't put myself in that category and so
23 I can't really answer that from direct experience and my
24 observation from a distance is it's just -- it's
25 definitely they weren't good -- none of the people who

1 were badly bullied were good at sports. So being bad at
2 sport was a real weakness. But that wasn't in and of
3 itself the reason. There would be something else as
4 well. I don't know, just a quirk of personality, just
5 people take against you and that's that.

6 Q. Whatever it was, if you were perceived as different,
7 then life would be pretty grim?

8 A. Yes, I'd say so. I think once you were in a category,
9 it's pretty hard to get out of it too.

10 Q. And the one place you wouldn't get any help from would
11 be the staff?

12 A. It would -- so speaking personally, it would never occur
13 to me to speak to the staff.

14 Q. If I may, 'William', we'll come back to the culture of
15 reporting in a moment, but from what you're saying about
16 Kimmerghame, staff wouldn't be there to see what was
17 going on?

18 A. No. They wouldn't be there to see it or if they saw it,
19 it would just -- you know, to the extent that they saw
20 stuff and it was -- they were -- if it wasn't so severe,
21 it wasn't like criminally bad that they couldn't walk
22 past it, they walked past it.

23 Q. You talk, obviously, in your statement, and we don't
24 need to go through all the episodes, we've touched on
25 some, the bullying that you endured, but I would like to

1 ask you about the occasion -- and this is when you were
2 in fifth form, so a senior boy, and yet still the two
3 boys who have been causing you so much difficulty
4 throughout your school career, they grabbed you and put
5 you out of a window.

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. Tell us about that.

8 A. So I was in -- funnily enough I was in the same dorm
9 where we used to regularly get beaten up, where the
10 prefect had been on the bed, and I was in there talking
11 to some of the fourth formers, they were fourth formers,
12 that was the fourth form room. And then these two came
13 in, so they were in second year six by then, and we were
14 all talking for a few minutes about I don't know what,
15 just some random stuff, nothing of any note. And then
16 I don't know what the catalyst for it was, but they
17 grabbed me and they -- the window may have been open or
18 else they opened it, I don't know, they grabbed me and
19 they started shoving me out the window. Obviously to
20 begin with I tried to resist being pushed out of the
21 window. But they were bigger than me and there were two
22 of them and they could -- you know, I was holding with
23 my hands to try and not go out and they'd -- so then
24 I was shoved out of the window such that my waist and my
25 centre of gravity was beyond the sill of the window and

1 I -- the wall, you know, towards the floor lower down,
2 and I was -- I don't know how long I was there for. Not
3 that long. You know, a number of seconds, but I don't
4 know how long, with them holding onto my lower legs,
5 I suppose. And looking down and thinking -- thinking
6 about what I was going to do when they dropped me and
7 how I was going to survive when they dropped me.
8 Because we were above -- we were on the second floor and
9 on the ground floor there was a bay window so that the
10 edging of the bay window came out below where I was,
11 kind of flat stone, and I thought I have to land on that
12 and be able to propel myself beyond that without my head
13 hitting it so that maybe I can land in the flowerbeds
14 beyond. I mean, that is a ridiculous notion, but that's
15 what I was thinking. I was thinking, right, how am
16 I positioning myself so I can get beyond the parapet and
17 maybe land in the flowers beds.

18 Q. Or put it more simply: how do I survive?

19 A. How do I survive?

20 Q. Then you say in your statement, paragraph 36, page 8:

21 "This lasted about 30 seconds before they dragged me
22 back in and said, 'Look at your face. You've gone all
23 white. Did you honestly think we would drop you?' And
24 I don't think I replied but I think I thought 'Yes, it
25 crossed my mind'."

1 A. Yes. So what they said, I'm pretty sure that is what
2 they said word for word because it feels deeply
3 imprinted on my mind and I literally think, "Look at
4 you. You've gone all white. Did you think we'd drop
5 you?" That is what he said, pretty much those words to
6 that effect if it wasn't exactly those words, but
7 I reckon it's exactly those words. I honestly don't
8 think I replied. If I did reply, I can't remember what
9 I said.

10 With distance and with a certain amount of cynicism
11 there's a kind of like, well, yeah, it crossed my mind,
12 but the reality was I was expecting to be dropped, not
13 because -- because they're idiots, right? Because
14 they'd lose their grip and they'd accidentally drop me.
15 I was expecting to be dropped. And it's all just --
16 when I was brought back in, I'm sure I didn't say that.
17 I possibly didn't even think it at the time in that sort
18 of slightly detached, cool, relaxed way. But I was
19 definitely -- I wasn't panicking because you'd gone into
20 a zone where, you know, you're not going to survive if
21 you panic, so I'd gone into really carefully thinking
22 how am I going to -- how am I going to position myself
23 to get beyond the parapet and get into the flowerbeds,
24 and then they pull you back in and ... you know,
25 obviously just white as a sheet and couldn't say

1 anything.

2 Q. But you make the point in the statement that of course
3 you wouldn't tell anyone.

4 A. No.

5 Q. Let's talk about the culture of not grassing or speaking
6 out. That was endemic too. You just didn't talk.

7 A. Absolutely. You did not speak to people in authority
8 about what was going on. You'd talk amongst your
9 friends. I'm sure after that incident -- and again this
10 may be a fabricated memory, but I would have gone off
11 and said to my friends, you know, my year group, "Do you
12 know what those two have done now?" and they'd have
13 said, "They're idiots, aren't they?" But I can't find
14 that memory specifically, but that's kind of what would
15 have happened because, you know, we were always having
16 these conversations about things that they'd done and
17 what idiots they were.

18 What you would absolutely never do is go and speak
19 to somebody in authority about it because you don't
20 grass.

21 Q. Is that something you'd learnt in the junior school or
22 was this senior school only?

23 A. It's probably both. I mean, it's a little bit -- it's
24 a little bit school, right? You know, you don't -- or
25 you don't grass on your mates, you don't grass on your

1 classmates and blah blah blah. I mean, I think that's
2 still a thing a little bit today. But for something
3 like this, you just -- you wouldn't talk about it
4 because it was just -- it was -- it was
5 an unwritten, unspoken but very clear rule amongst all
6 of the pupils: you do not grass. Nobody spoke out about
7 anything and nobody spoke out about anything because
8 absolutely the worst, greatest, cardinal sin there was
9 was to grass. And however bad your life might be before
10 you spoke, it would be worse afterwards.

11 Q. And is that something do you think the staff were well
12 aware of?

13 A. I can't speak for what the staff were or were not aware
14 of. I just go back to if they wanted to find this
15 stuff, it wasn't difficult to find. But they weren't
16 looking.

17 Q. Did you tell your parents about this?

18 A. I did not tell my parents about it, no. I have
19 subsequently told my mother like a decade or more later,
20 but I did not tell them at the time.

21 Q. Why not?

22 A. Again, how does this play out? So they'll maybe go and
23 talk to the school about it. They'll bring to the
24 attention of the school something that we -- we felt,
25 I felt the school was deliberately looking away from and

1 didn't want to know about. What would the school do?
2 Who knows what the school would have done. But unless
3 what the school did was wide-ranging and effective and
4 very rapid, it wouldn't cure the problem and everyone
5 would know you'd grassed. And the one thing you don't
6 do is grass. And life would definitely be worse after
7 you'd grassed.

8 So, you know, the alternative is to go to another
9 school. Well, there's a little bit of the devil you
10 know, because somewhere else might be even worse than
11 this one.

12 Q. I think you do say, perhaps thankfully, that your sixth
13 year was better, though part of that you think was the
14 dynamic of the school becoming increasingly co-ed?

15 A. So I think there were two things. My own experience
16 would have been better anyway because these two
17 individuals who were the bane of our life in
18 Kimmerghame, they were two years above me so as I moved
19 into lower sixth, they were leaving the school. That
20 was always a kind of thing in the back of your mind,
21 like: this will end eventually because their time at
22 this school will come to an end and then I'll be free of
23 them. So there was -- you always kind of knew there
24 will be an end to this story. It's not forever. But
25 it's only because they'd leave as opposed to any other

1 proactive engagement.

2 So I think that undoubtedly had an effect, but
3 I also think my observation from a senior looking down
4 was we didn't behave in the same way to the juniors that
5 the seniors had behaved to us. We just didn't do it.
6 And I don't know why that was, but I think it was in
7 large part because there were girls. You know, there
8 had always been a few girls in the sixth form but not
9 many. I saw always, since the early 70s, there had been
10 a few girls in the sixth form but only in the sixth form
11 and not very many. A few girls joined when we were in
12 fourth form but again not very many, whereas in sixth
13 form there was a big intake of girls and then it was
14 kind of 50/50 and they were a kind of equal part of the
15 population and girls would not be impressed by bullying
16 and teenage boys want to impress girls and, you know,
17 terrorising the little kids isn't the way you do it.

18 I think the girls brought a cultural change in the
19 school. I don't think the school consciously brought
20 it, I think the cultural change came because the school
21 had made the decision to go wholly co-ed but the school
22 didn't talk about it, there were no discussions about
23 culture and behaviour and what we expect and this, that
24 and the other. Nothing more than, you know, we expect
25 you to behave like men.

1 So I don't want the school to take credit in sixth
2 form for how it was different for us. I think it was
3 a by-product of going co-educational, which frankly they
4 did to widen their fee-paying pool, not because they
5 thought: we've got a cultural problem and this is how we
6 can solve it.

7 Q. You talk on page 10 about the impact, and that includes
8 lack of self-belief, not comfortable meeting people, and
9 you put that back to your experience at Fettes?

10 A. I should be a bit careful about why I say -- and I've
11 tried to be in this statement a bit on a point -- there
12 isn't a control version of me to kind of say without
13 these experiences, this is what you'd have been like
14 instead. So I don't know. I can't -- I can't say
15 emphatically if this hadn't happened, I wouldn't be like
16 this.

17 But, say, you know, character-building and all that
18 kind of stuff, sometimes it can be
19 confidence-destroying, and I think that was
20 a significant part of my experience. But that's just my
21 perception. Maybe I'm looking for somebody to blame for
22 my own personal inadequacies, I don't know, but
23 I struggle to think how -- I can't look at myself and
24 go: do you know what, all of those experiences
25 definitely have made me a better person, because they

1 definitely didn't.

2 Q. Okay. But I think what you can say, and this is because
3 you have your own son, you see a world of difference as
4 to how he is being educated to the one -- to the
5 education you had?

6 A. Yes. So I see a world of difference in how he is being
7 educated. They have pastoral care. That wasn't even
8 a thing when we were at school. Maybe it was a thing at
9 some schools. But it wasn't even a thing. The sort of,
10 you know, well-being and so on and the motto in the
11 school is be kind, be kind, be kind, right, and it's all
12 about being kind to those in your peer group, those
13 below you, there's kind of merit points for showing the
14 junior kids around and being their buddies and all of
15 this kind of stuff. Positive behaviour is encouraged
16 and talked about and rewarded.

17 But that's one thing that I notice now, and the
18 other thing that I see is -- he's 14 now but at the time
19 I gave my statement he was 12 and he was the same age,
20 give or take a couple of months, as I was when I went to
21 that school and the teachers said, "We call you men",
22 and, like, how can you look at this 12-year-old boy and
23 say you're a man and we expect you to behave like men
24 and we call you men? It's an utter absurdity and to
25 leave kids of that age and a little bit older to sort

1 themselves out and police themselves is -- it beggars
2 belief now for -- from the place in life where I am now
3 and looking at them and how they are and what -- it's
4 just like what did you think was going to happen? It's
5 just extraordinary.

6 Q. 'William', thank you very much indeed. I have no
7 further questions for you. Is there anything else you
8 would like to add?

9 A. No, just to reiterate again I've not named people
10 because individually -- individually they're all, in my
11 mind, guilty of the things that they did to me or that
12 they allowed to happen to me, but no good comes of
13 holding them to account now, 40 years later. You know,
14 it's -- they didn't -- I don't think they broke the law,
15 you know, they were just really, really unpleasant, they
16 allowed unpleasant things to happen and it's done.

17 But I really -- the school really needs to confront
18 its past and understand it is those teachers
19 individually and collectively are culpable for
20 everything that happened because it was there for them
21 to see if they wanted to see it, and they were
22 deliberately looking the other way. And they kind of
23 dressed it up as character-building or this is what
24 coming to a boarding school is all about, but
25 fundamentally people were being taken advantage of and

1 needlessly being given a miserable time for no good
2 purpose whatsoever. No learning experience comes out of
3 that whatsoever. And they let it happen. And they can
4 say, "We didn't know", but they only didn't know because
5 they were deliberately looking the other way. They
6 could have known. They should have known.

7 MR BROWN: Thank you very much indeed.

8 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
9 questions of 'William'?

10 'William', that does complete all of the questions
11 we have for you. It only remains for me to thank you
12 for everything you've given us by way of assistance with
13 your evidence, both in terms of your written statement,
14 which is so clear and full and fair, and that's
15 reflected again in hearing from you in person over the
16 WebEx link. That's made your evidence come alive for me
17 and helped to build my understanding of what things were
18 like between 1979 and 1986 at Fettes. Thank you so much
19 for that.

20 I'm really grateful to you for engaging in this way
21 and I'm now able to let you be released from the link,
22 but with my thanks, as I say. Thank you.

23 A. Thank you very much for the opportunity.

24 LADY SMITH: Not at all.

25 (The witness withdrew)

1 LADY SMITH: Mr Brown.

2 MR BROWN: My Lady, that concludes the evidence for today.

3 I think between 8 and now we've had a full day.

4 LADY SMITH: We've done well.

5 MR BROWN: So time to up sticks and start again for the last

6 week of the Fettes evidence, which will be a three-day

7 week.

8 LADY SMITH: Yes.

9 MR BROWN: Tuesday, we hope to have one live witness and

10 further read-ins. Wednesday, three live witnesses, and

11 finally on Thursday we will hear from Helen Harrison

12 again.

13 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. Thank you all for your

14 attendance and interest today. I hope you have a very

15 good weekend. I hope it's not as cold and windy as last

16 weekend. And I look forward to seeing those of you who

17 are coming back next week on Tuesday at 10 o'clock.

18 (1.11 pm)

19 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am

20 on Tuesday, 7 December 2021)

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

'Claire' (sworn)2
 Questions from Mr Brown3
'Betty' (affirmed)62
 Questions from Mr Brown63
'Beth' (read)115
'William' (sworn)127
 Questions from Mr Brown127

