

1 Tuesday, 31 May 2022

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning. This is the second day this week
4 that we're going to hear evidence from individual
5 applicants in relation to our foster care case study and
6 we have our first witness ready and waiting, I think,
7 Ms Innes; is that right?

8 MS INNES: We do, my Lady. Josephine Duthie has waived
9 anonymity. She was boarded out on 9 May 1956 by Glasgow
10 Corporation, a predecessor of Glasgow City Council. She
11 was boarded out in the Morayshire area. However, our
12 understanding is that Glasgow were the responsible
13 authority.

14 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

15 Josephine Duthie (affirmed)

16 LADY SMITH: Let me start with what I hope is an easy
17 question for you. How would you like me to address you?
18 Ms Duthie or Josephine?

19 A. Josephine.

20 LADY SMITH: Well, Josephine, welcome. Thank you for coming
21 to give evidence to the Inquiry. I want to do
22 everything I can to make it as comfortable an experience
23 for you as possible, although I know it's not easy, and
24 giving evidence about anything can be challenging, let
25 alone the subject matter that we're covering here.

1 In your red folder there, there's a hard copy of
2 your statement, and as we look at parts of it you'll
3 also see it coming up on screen in front of you, so use
4 either or neither, whatever works for you, of those
5 documents.

6 We may also show you on screen parts of other
7 documents that we've recovered. We'll see how that
8 goes.

9 I take a break in the middle of the morning around
10 11.30 anyway, but if you want a break at any time,
11 please let me know. What works for you will work for
12 me. Likewise, if you have any questions, do ask. No
13 question is a stupid question if it's in your head and
14 you'd like an answer to it. We want to do what we can
15 to help. All right?

16 A. Yes, thank you.

17 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, I'll hand over to Ms Innes and
18 she'll take it from there.

19 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

20 Questions from Ms Innes

21 MS INNES: Now, Josephine, we understand that you were born
22 in Glasgow in 1948.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You have a copy of your statement in front of you, and
25 if you could please go to the final page of it, which is

1 page 23, I think we see that you signed this statement
2 on 16 February 2017 and at paragraph 116 it says that
3 you have no objection to your statement being published
4 as part of the evidence to the Inquiry and that you
5 believe the facts stated in the witness statement are
6 true.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Have you had the opportunity to have a look over your
9 statement again before you've --

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. -- come to give evidence today?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Okay. I'm just going to take you through some parts of
14 your statement. If we go back to the beginning, on
15 page 1, as we know, you were born in Glasgow. If we go
16 down to paragraph 2, you tell us that you have two
17 brothers, Robert, born in 1949, George, born in 1952,
18 and then a younger sister, who has since died, and she
19 was born in 1953.

20 A. Yes. I have also two other sisters which weren't
21 brought up with us.

22 Q. I think those sisters you mention in your statement,
23 that you perhaps contacted later in your life; is that
24 right?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Thank you. Can you tell us something of your life
2 before you went into care? What memories do you have of
3 that? I think you cover this at paragraph 5 and 6 of
4 your statement going on to page 2.

5 A. Yes. We were neglected. My mother left home, I must
6 have been about five, and we were left to wander about
7 the streets of Glasgow in the middle of the night with
8 my little brother. And I remember eating candle wax off
9 the chest of drawers because we were very hungry.
10 That's really basically -- we were just neglected.

11 Q. You talk at paragraph 6 about your mother being arrested
12 and your father being unable to look after you, the
13 house being repossessed and you were put into care.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You say that after that you would see your parents on
16 one more occasion, when they came to see you in
17 Dunclutha Children's Home --

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. -- which is one of the homes that you then went to, but
20 after that visit you never saw them again.

21 A. No.

22 Q. Going on on page 2, you tell us that initially you went
23 to Castlemilk Children's Home in Glasgow?

24 A. For one night, yes.

25 Q. And then you went to Dunclutha, as I've said, in Dunoon?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And you were there until 1956?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. If we move on to the next page, please, to paragraph 10,

5 you say there that you don't know who made the decision

6 about your future but you found out about it from the

7 nurses at the home?

8 A. Yes, that's right.

9 Q. What did they tell you?

10 A. They told us we were being sent to a farm with lots of

11 animals, a happy place, good food and well cared for and

12 we would be loved. And that's what we were told.

13 Q. Can you recall what your reaction was to that? Or any

14 feelings that you had about that at the time?

15 A. A bit strange because you didn't want to go away from

16 your mother and father. Or you were a bit concerned in

17 case we were going to be split up. Because our little

18 sister at the time wasn't with us, she was in another

19 home.

20 Q. So it was just you and your two brothers?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And then I think you go on to say at paragraph 11 that

23 you and your brothers were taken to a croft by

24 a Ms Kennedy of the social work department at Glasgow

25 and you say that your sister didn't come with you --

1 A. That's right.

2 Q. -- it was just you and your brothers. What do you
3 recall about the journey?

4 A. It was a very long journey, and I think we ended up in
5 Inverness instead of Elgin, but I didn't really think
6 much of the journey. It was a long journey and
7 I probably slept most of the way.

8 LADY SMITH: Was that the first time you'd been on a long
9 journey?

10 A. Yes.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

12 MS INNES: Then you tell us about your first recollections
13 of seeing the place that you were going to be living in,
14 which we understand is a croft near Elgin.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. What were your first impressions?

17 A. I think my mother must have been affected during the war
18 because she had installed in us bombing and people being
19 shot and things like that, and as soon as the taxi had
20 turned around the corner, I could see this long building
21 with a white corrugated roof and I thought: I don't want
22 to go there because the planes will see the croft at
23 night. But then, once we got to the croft, this woman
24 came out with a head scarf on and -- I hate to say this,
25 but the ugliest person I've ever seen in my life. And

1 we were just bundled out the car and left to stand
2 outside initially while the children's officers went
3 inside to the croft.

4 And then we were taken in and the children's officer
5 spoke to us and then went away and the woman locked us
6 immediately into our bedroom.

7 Q. Did you have any impression of how old this woman was?

8 A. Not at the time, but I found out she was 59 years old
9 and she was disabled. She had a straight leg.

10 Q. Were you told her name or what you were to call her?

11 A. We were told to call her auntie.

12 Q. So you say a little -- if we go on to page 4 at the top
13 of the page, that there was no running water and no
14 electricity in this?

15 A. No. The water was a well half a mile away and there was
16 no light, they had Tilley lamps.

17 Q. And there were no other children on the croft?

18 A. No, no other children. Just the Marchmont family.

19 Q. Then at paragraph 15, if we just go down a little, you
20 say that your sister arrived later that year, so you
21 arrived in May of 1956?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. And your sister came in August?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Was the croft isolated or were there other houses around

1 it?

2 A. No, the croft was isolated. There was another croft
3 maybe a quarter of a mile away.

4 Q. You say that you arrived and she immediately locked you
5 in a room.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Can you remember what happened next?

8 A. She locked us in our room and threw in a pail that we
9 had to pee in, excuse the word, and we sat there for
10 a long time before she came back and ordered us into our
11 pyjamas and gave us a slice of toast and that was us,
12 and she left us. So I had to get my brothers and sister
13 ready for bed.

14 She came in and one of my little brothers was crying
15 and she asked him why he was crying and he wouldn't stop
16 and she slapped him across the face several times to
17 make him stop crying and then she left us and we were
18 there until morning.

19 Q. Can you remember how you felt about that at the time?

20 A. I think we were quite numb. We just didn't know what to
21 expect. My brothers and sisters were crying and I'm
22 supposed to be the big sister, I was only eight, and
23 I just didn't know what to do with it. So we all went
24 into bed and just -- in the middle of the night, she had
25 these rollers around her head and I remember I'd be

1 waking up around 3 in the morning and I could hear
2 something clicking and I saw this head looking over the
3 top of us with these things flashing in the light and
4 I just didn't know what it was and we were terrified.
5 And then she went away.

6 LADY SMITH: Now, Josephine, at this time you would be
7 eight?

8 A. Eight, my Lady, yes.

9 LADY SMITH: And your two brothers would be what?

10 A. Five and three -- sorry, sorry, seven and four. Seven
11 and four.

12 LADY SMITH: You were born in 1948. The next down brother
13 was born 1949 and then 1952.

14 A. Seven and four.

15 LADY SMITH: So you were in charge of the little ones?

16 A. Yes.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18 MS INNES: You say then you were all in the same room
19 together?

20 A. Yes, all in the same room.

21 Q. Were there separate beds or not?

22 A. There was two -- one double and one single. She
23 eventually removed the boys to another box room.

24 Q. Now, just a little bit more about the house itself.
25 You've explained it was isolated. Was it surrounded by

1 fields? Were there animals?

2 A. Yes, there were fields, about 10 acres, and she rented
3 out the ground to a farmer whose cattle and sheep grazed
4 on the ground. And these animals we had to help look
5 after.

6 Q. We'll come back to that a little bit more in due course.
7 You also say at paragraph 16 that she had ten cats.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Were they all in the house as well?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. At the bottom of this page you start discussing the
12 routine. You've described what happened overnight at
13 the beginning of your stay with Ms JCU the guardian.
14 How did things then develop during the day, the next
15 day, for example?

16 A. Well, she got us up at 5 o'clock, made us dress, we were
17 lucky if we got breakfast, sometimes we got a bit of
18 toast, sometimes she made us -- but I had to make the
19 porridge, and I took a wee while to learn how to make
20 porridge. Then she sent us out about 5 o'clock in the
21 morning to feed all the animals, check all the sheep and
22 the cows hadn't been caught in barbed wire during the
23 night and if they had been, we had to pull them off that
24 barbed wire.

25 Excuse me.

1 Q. It's okay.

2 A. Sometimes we were late for school because we didn't get
3 the job finished. We'd get the eggs in. We had to go
4 half a mile to get water and carry buckets of water up
5 to the croft. We weren't allowed to drink any, we had
6 to drink out of a rain butt, so you had to scrape all
7 the grime off the rain butt before you could get water.

8 Q. Can we talk about some of that a little bit more. So
9 when you started living with her, you were obviously old
10 enough to go to school yourself.

11 A. It was during the school holidays when we arrived there
12 so we couldn't go to school initially and she sent --
13 some of the children from other crofts came down to play
14 with us, but it didn't last long. I could see her
15 standing looking at the window staring at us and it
16 ended up the children never came back. Because every
17 time they went away, we were punished and locked in our
18 room.

19 Q. Just in terms of the water, there was no water coming
20 into the house at that time.

21 A. No.

22 Q. You said there was a well.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And am I right in thinking that you had to go and
25 collect water from the well?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And what did she use that water for, do you know?

3 A. I have -- I presume for herself, for washing dishes,
4 for -- to feed her animals.

5 Q. Okay. But you weren't allowed to use that water?

6 A. No. We weren't allowed to use the water at all.

7 Q. Okay. Did there come a time that water was piped into
8 the house?

9 A. Yes, but we -- my brothers and I, we had to dig the
10 trench from the croft about half a mile away, half
11 a mile away. It took us a week to dig that trench so
12 they could lay the pipes. We weren't fed while we were
13 digging. We had to eat cat food or anything we could
14 find.

15 Q. You do cover some of the chores that you had to do in
16 your statement, and if we could look, please, first of
17 all at paragraph 14, which we've already passed, you say
18 that you were to be used as cheap labour to run the
19 croft.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You then give us some more details of the things that
22 you had to do. So at paragraph 18, you talk about the
23 day starting every day at 5 am, as you've said, and that
24 you had to collect firewood as well as water?

25 A. Yes. You had to go to the wood and collect firewood.

1 The bigger the tree, the better. You used to self-harm,
2 you used to scratch your legs until they were bleeding
3 in the hopes that she would take pity on you and put
4 plasters on your legs or, you know, be concerned, but
5 she didn't. You were trying to get affection, so you
6 harmed yourself to get that affection, but it didn't
7 come. But we had to trail these trees home and cut them
8 into blocks for her firewood.

9 Q. So you also had to chop them up?

10 A. Yes, saw them with a two-handle saw, yes.

11 Q. Would you have to do that with one of your brothers?

12 A. My brothers, yes.

13 Q. Did this start as soon as you went there --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- at the age of eight and seven, as we've heard?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And you say that as well as doing that in the morning,
18 you had to do that at night as well?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And you say that she would just be sitting stoking the
21 fire?

22 A. Yes. With a poker that she would hit us with, whether
23 it was hot or cold.

24 Q. You talk about feeding the animals and collecting the
25 eggs, and you say that you also had to help get the

1 others up and dressed.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. So as well as doing these chores, you were essentially

4 responsible for your younger siblings.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. I'm going to come back to school and some other aspects

7 of the routine, but if we just carry on looking at some

8 of the chores and work that you had to do, if we can

9 move on a little to paragraph 41 on page 9, you talk

10 there again about you being used as slave labour to do

11 everyday jobs needed to keep the croft running, and you

12 say you were obviously from the city and you weren't

13 used to country ways. For example, she told you to go

14 and collect potatoes and you had no idea what she meant

15 and then she beat you.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And you say that she told you to stay in the field until

18 you finished?

19 A. Yes, that's correct.

20 Q. Then I think you go on at paragraph 51 on page 11 to

21 talk about tarring the roof of the barn.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Can you tell us about that, please?

24 A. Yes. There was a huge pail of -- I don't know what it's

25 called, it's tar, it's got another name but I can't

1 remember what it's called, and she would climb up the
2 ladder and take this brush and tar, and tar all the
3 sheds for the winter time.

4 Q. Is that something that happened on one occasion --

5 A. Once a year.

6 Q. Once a year?

7 A. Once a year, before winter.

8 Q. At paragraph 52 you talk about you and your younger
9 brother being made to kill geese.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Can you tell us about that, please?

12 A. Geese and hens. Well, it was for the butcher for the
13 winter time, we had to -- geese, as you know, are very
14 big, strong birds and we had to sit -- will I tell you
15 how it's done?

16 Q. Mm-hmm.

17 A. We had to sit on the goose, stretch its neck and put
18 a stick over the neck and pull the head, and that's how
19 we had to kill the geese.

20 Q. Was that done regularly as well?

21 A. Regularly for the butcher, yes. Especially for
22 Christmas, yes.

23 Q. At paragraph 59, on the next page, you talk about
24 something that you've already mentioned in your
25 evidence, so looking after the animals and having to

1 rescue them from the snow and the barbed wire fences.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I assume that would have been quite heavy work as well.

4 A. Yes. Well, there was a danger that the sheep would fall

5 on top of you and you wouldn't get up and you couldn't

6 see, there was a blizzard, there was no lights, and you

7 just had to feel your way around. And if you were

8 really cold and you were shut out in the middle of the

9 night, you slept with the sheep because they were warm.

10 Q. You talk about grading the eggs and feeding the animals

11 and killing the animals, as we've seen.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And then you say:

14 "We would be sent to fields with scythes to cut down

15 the thistles so the cows didn't eat them."

16 Can you tell us about that, please?

17 A. The scythes, they're long-handled with a huge blade and

18 we had to cut off the top of the thistles so that the

19 cows wouldn't cut their mouths when they were eating,

20 and that was a very hard job. And we were young

21 children.

22 Q. And then you say that every two years you had to climb

23 into the well.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. What was the purpose of that?

1 A. It was to clean the well. There was an underground
2 spring and the water came into this hole in the ground.
3 It was about six feet down into the well. She would put
4 us into the well and we had to scoop all the mud and put
5 it into a tub and take it out the well and clean it.
6 But as you were in that well you were sinking all that
7 time and it was just -- I can't swim to this day. I'm
8 absolutely terrified of water. Because the -- she
9 wouldn't let us out until we were finished. We were up
10 to our waists by the time she would let us out.
11 LADY SMITH: So you said it was about six feet down into the
12 well you had to go.
13 A. Yes.
14 LADY SMITH: And you were a lot less than six feet at that
15 time.
16 A. Yes, the ground was above me, yes.
17 LADY SMITH: And the ground underneath you was soft?
18 A. Soft, very muddy and wet, yes.
19 LADY SMITH: How did you get down into the well?
20 A. She lowered us down.
21 LADY SMITH: How?
22 A. With a rope. She tied a rope around her waist and
23 lowered us into the well.
24 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
25 MS INNES: At paragraph 60, you talk about making butter and

1 you remember spending ages turning the butter churn.
2 Was that something that you and your brothers and your
3 sister did as well?
4 A. Well, myself and my older brother did it. We didn't
5 mind that because it was just -- it was easy. It wasn't
6 a hard job.
7 Q. Then you say that you washed your clothes outside?
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. So, again, did you do that? Did she do any washing of
10 clothes?
11 A. Well, we did most of it. She maybe did the bedsheets
12 now and again, but we did most of the washing.
13 Q. Then you say that you recall being made to clean the
14 chimney.
15 A. Yes.
16 Q. Can you tell us about that?
17 A. It's a long ladder. We had to go up this long ladder
18 and clean the chimney. But every time we went up the
19 ladder, she would -- if we weren't going quick enough
20 she would use her poker or a stick and smack our leg to
21 make us go quicker and get the job done before it got
22 dark.
23 Q. And was that a regular occurrence as well?
24 A. Yes, it was -- I would probably say every third month
25 because it was a croft and that was the only -- there

1 were only two chimneys. And her fire was lit all the
2 time but our bedroom fire was never lit.

3 Q. You then say that you had to whitewash the walls?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And again was that something that was done on a regular
6 basis?

7 A. Yes, but then again it's one I didn't mind doing at all.

8 Q. Then you talk about digging drains to keep the water
9 away. Are you referring there to something different to
10 digging the trench to get the water --

11 A. Yeah, to keep the water away from the house, we had to
12 keep digging trenches down to the lower level.

13 Q. Then you say you also had to cut hedges.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Were there hedges between the fields or --

16 A. There was a 12-foot hedge. There was the croft and then
17 there was a brae up to the croft and there was a 12-foot
18 hedge which ran in front of the croft and we had to cut
19 that in the summer time.

20 Q. And given that it was 12 foot did that involve going up
21 ladders?

22 A. A ladder, yes.

23 Q. You say:

24 "These were crofting tasks but not for young
25 children."

1 You say she would praise you for doing the tasks.

2 A. Sometimes, yes.

3 Q. And you say that you don't know what she was doing?

4 A. No, she was really watching, she was making sure we were

5 doing something or throwing something at us if something

6 was wrong or taking one of my brothers or sister away to

7 punish them for something we had done maybe the day

8 before. Not one day passed that someone wasn't beaten

9 or yelled at or humiliated.

10 Q. Now, I want to move on from the chores and the work that

11 you had to do on the croft. Is there anything else that

12 we've not covered that you think was another chore or

13 piece of heavy work that you had to undertake on the

14 croft for her?

15 A. No. No.

16 Q. If we can move back, please, to paragraph 21, which is

17 on page 5, you say there that before you went to bed,

18 you were either made to stand in the corner until

19 bedtime or were locked outside to stand until she was

20 ready for bed.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And you say:

23 "It was in all-weathers and I can recall suffering

24 from chilblains as a result of the cold weather. It was

25 always dark and we had no idea of the time ..."

1 Was that something that started and continued for
2 the whole time that you lived there?

3 A. Yes. We were either sent outside in the dark with
4 hardly anything on or she would drag us out of bed in
5 the middle of the night for no reason whatsoever and we
6 had to stand one at a time in a hallway for all night.
7 I would lie down on the ground when I knew she'd gone to
8 her bed, but you're always listening because when you
9 could hear her getting up, you stood to attention. You
10 had to be standing when she opened that door. Didn't
11 matter what time of night it was.

12 Q. And what would happen if you weren't standing?

13 A. You were beaten with a poker or a stick or whatever she
14 had in her hand.

15 Q. Did she give any reason as to why she was doing that?
16 Was it a punishment for something?

17 A. No reason whatsoever. She would scream, she would
18 scratch on the door, she would have this little dog that
19 would bite our heels in the middle of the night to get
20 us out of bed for no reason whatsoever.

21 Q. When you say that she was screaming, what sort of --

22 A. Just screaming and scratching her nails down the door.
23 Whether to frighten us? I don't know. She would lock
24 my sister and I in a cupboard in the bedroom and say
25 that "the devil will let me know in the morning if

1 you've been good or bad", and she would let us out in
2 the morning.

3 Q. And when she was screaming at you, was she saying
4 things?

5 A. No, I couldn't understand what she was saying. She was
6 just screaming.

7 Q. Okay. Did she also shout at you or --

8 A. Yes, she would shout. She would grab me by the hair and
9 swing me off my feet to the extent one day she broke
10 this part of my nose and my nose was just bleeding for
11 ages. You know, no help was given.

12 Q. So she did nothing about that?

13 A. No.

14 Q. She didn't call the doctor?

15 A. No, nothing.

16 Q. Did she try to help you?

17 A. No, nothing. She would tie me to a fence. When I knew
18 my brother was getting -- my older brother was getting
19 a beating, I would try and catch him coming home from
20 school and I would tell him to go to the woods, not to
21 go to the croft, and she -- one day she caught me and
22 then ever after that she tied me to the fence before
23 I could warn my brother, before he got his beating.

24 Q. How did you know that the beating was coming on that
25 occasion?

1 A. Because she would go for a stick or a poker or a brush
2 and I knew that someone was getting it and it was
3 usually my older brother.

4 Q. Okay. So when you came home from school, would she try
5 to intercept you on the way home and tie you to the
6 fence?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. How long would you be left there for?

9 A. I was sometimes there for hours.

10 Q. And could you free yourself or --

11 A. I wouldn't dare. I wouldn't try to do it because then
12 I would be punished further. I had to just stay there.

13 Q. If we move down to paragraph 23 on page 5, you talk
14 about washing in a basin of cold water.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And you had to wash in front of your siblings, despite
17 that you were a bit older.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. So where was this basin of water?

20 A. In the living room.

21 Q. And did all of you just have to wash in that basin?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Did there ever come a point when you got some more
24 privacy?

25 A. Never. And if you didn't wash properly, she would nip

1 you, she would touch you in places that she shouldn't
2 have touched you, telling you you weren't clean. She
3 would take my little sister by the hair and throw her
4 face into the bin -- the basin and tell her to wash
5 herself properly.

6 Q. And then you say that after a few years you got a cold
7 water tap into the house.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. But there was never warm water for washing?

10 A. No, never.

11 Q. And you say that electricity did eventually come to the
12 house while you were there?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. I think perhaps if we can look, please, at some of your
15 records, if we look at GLA-000001865 and at page 6. If
16 we go down to 14 July 1959, if you just bear with me
17 a moment, my display has gone to sleep. I think we see
18 there that it says on this occasion:

19 "Guardian and four children seen. Healthy and full
20 of fun. Ada was awarded two prizes at school ..."

21 And I think that's you?

22 A. Yes, she called me Ada.

23 Q. She called you Ada?

24 A. That was my middle name. I don't know why.

25 Q. You don't know why she called you by your middle name?

1 A. No.

2 Q. And you won two prizes at school and two at Sunday
3 school and it says that you were a smart, attractive
4 little girl:

5 " ... and quite handy in the house although not too
6 keen on housework".

7 What's your reflection on that?

8 A. It was just her way of getting round -- I really
9 honestly don't know. I don't think anyone likes
10 housework, but if you're forced into something, it's
11 just ... I was only, what, eight, ten, whatever.

12 Q. And then it says:

13 "House improved since installation of electric
14 light. Running water being installed soon."

15 So that refers to the fact that up until 1959 it
16 appears that there hadn't been any electric light in the
17 house?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And the Corporation were obviously aware of that?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And there was a suggestion that running water would be
22 installed soon?

23 A. Yes, that's right.

24 Q. But that came later, I think you say?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And it says:
2 "Bedroom comfortable and guardian and children
3 making a bookcase to hold the children's books."
4 A. No. We never had any books or toys.
5 LADY SMITH: What about the two books that you got as prizes
6 at school? Were you able to keep those?
7 A. They were there for a wee while, then she took them from
8 us. They were there just in time for the children's
9 officer to see them and then they were removed. It was
10 like our Christmas presents. We had them all day
11 Christmas so anybody coming to the croft could see them,
12 and then we never saw them again.
13 LADY SMITH: Did you ever get to read those two books?
14 A. No.
15 MS INNES: Just while we're in this document, I think these
16 are visiting records from Glasgow Corporation and can
17 you recall a children's officer coming to visit?
18 A. We -- yes. I think it was maybe once a year we saw him,
19 but we were never spoken to. We were left outside. He
20 went in and spoke to her, then he came out and said,
21 "Are you happy?" and we all said yes, because we didn't
22 have any other option, and that was it. They never took
23 us aside and asked us any questions.
24 Q. I think if we look on in this document to page 11, these
25 are some of the records. This is from 1962 going into

1 1963. The first record there I think says:
2 "Visited. Josephine is continuing to do very well
3 at school."
4 But I don't think it tells us whether you were seen
5 on that occasion or not.
6 A. Probably not.
7 Q. And then the next entry, 20 June 1962:
8 "Visited with Councillor Blackwood. Josephine is
9 continuing as usual and will be getting her holidays
10 from school soon. Since my last visit there is nothing
11 else to report. Keeping in good health and doing well."
12 Again, I don't think we know whether you were seen
13 on that occasion or not.
14 A. No.
15 Q. Then if we go to 29 August 1962 we see:
16 "Visited. Josephine and her sister and brothers
17 were away ..."
18 On that occasion.
19 A. We would have been working in the woods. We would have
20 been collecting sticks and told not to come back until
21 the car had gone away from the croft.
22 LADY SMITH: So not away in Lossiemouth for a day with
23 friends as the note says?
24 A. No, absolutely not.
25 LADY SMITH: Did you ever go away to Lossiemouth with

1 friends?

2 A. I escaped one day to go to Lossiemouth by telling a lie
3 that it was a school outing and I slept the night on the
4 beach there just to get a break and then I came back.
5 No, we didn't go to Lossiemouth, no.

6 MS INNES: Then if we go on to the next page, 27 November
7 1962:

8 "Visited Josephine and the guardian seen. Josephine
9 returned from school whilst I was visiting. She is
10 continuing to do well at school and is in the midst of
11 her exams."

12 And then there's reference to attending a croft
13 which is started at a local school. Can you remember
14 doing anything like that?

15 A. No.

16 Q. And it says:

17 "Keeping in good health."

18 And then at the next entry, 6 February 1963:

19 "Visited. Ms JCU seen. Josephine had a swimming
20 class after school today so was late in coming home."

21 A. I'll tell you something about that swimming class. That
22 was a lie. The only way I could get out was saying that
23 I could swim and she allowed me to go to this swimming
24 class. I even -- my dream was to be an artist and
25 I drew at school. I entered a "learn to swim" poster

1 and I won 24 tickets to the swimming baths and she
2 didn't know it was a poster that won it. I told her I'd
3 won a swimming competition so that every week I could
4 get out and just wander around just to get away from it.
5 So I'm afraid, I'm sorry, that was a lie. I cannot
6 swim.

7 LADY SMITH: And of course by that time you were about
8 15 years old?

9 A. Yes, my Lady.

10 LADY SMITH: Looking for freedom.

11 A. Yes, my Lady.

12 MS INNES: And then if we scroll down to the next visit,
13 25 April 1963:

14 "Visited. Guardian seen. States Josephine is
15 continuing to do well at school and takes part in all
16 the school activities. She is continuing to win prizes
17 at the interschools swimming competition."

18 So is that what you were just referring to?

19 A. Yes. I apologise for that.

20 Q. And then it says:

21 "Keeping in good health and behaving well though
22 displaying the usual temperamental outbursts common to
23 her age group."

24 And that information, I think, must have come from
25 the guardian.

1 A. Yes, she was a retired nurse. In fact, a mentally
2 retired nurse. So she knew all the things to say.

3 Q. Then the next entry is 9 July 1963:

4 "Visited with Bailey Valance. Josephine was away
5 with friends to Fochabers for the afternoon."

6 A. I didn't have any friends.

7 Q. Then it's noted:

8 "She has been rather wayward and self-willed
9 recently but Ms JCU I feel is managing to keep her in
10 hand."

11 A. I was complaining more. I was concerned for my brothers
12 and sisters. I wanted them out of that croft. At that
13 time, I couldn't have cared less what happened to me.
14 I wanted them away. I even wrote Glasgow a letter
15 begging them to remove them from that croft. They did
16 send someone up to see me, but nothing happened.

17 Q. We'll perhaps come to it in a moment, but can you
18 remember when it was that you sent that letter
19 to Glasgow?

20 A. Yes, I had actually left the croft to go into Aberdeen
21 to do my nursing and that was when I wrote that letter.

22 Q. Okay, we'll come back to that in a moment.

23 I think we've seen that there were various notes of
24 visits but the vast majority of them I think it's noted
25 that you weren't there and you weren't seen.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Thank you.

3 LADY SMITH: Had you any idea of where Glasgow might put
4 your brothers and sister other than there?

5 A. No, I just wanted them away from there. Because my
6 little sister was so badly affected by it. From the age
7 of three she was beaten on the head with a hockey stick,
8 any stick she could find. I would come home from school
9 and there would be brown fluid coming from her ears and
10 she would be hiding under the bed. She eventually was
11 moved from mental institution to [REDACTED] to
12 [REDACTED] She couldn't cope with life. She took
13 several overdoses.

14 Sorry.

15 LADY SMITH: Don't apologise, please.

16 MS INNES: If we can go back to your statement, please, and
17 at page 6, and if we can talk a little bit more about
18 schooling at the bottom of page 6. Paragraph 28. You
19 say you attended the local school and you did well.
20 I think maybe what it should say there is that the other
21 pupils could not understand foster care?

22 A. No. I didn't really tell them -- well, when I was in
23 primary school, we were classed as foster children and
24 they didn't want to play with us because we were -- they
25 didn't understand, it was different, we were different.

1 We came from Glasgow. We didn't have any parents. So
2 initially they didn't want to play with us. But then
3 when I went to the Academy, I didn't mention the croft,
4 I just said I lived with my aunt, and they seemed to
5 accept that better.

6 Q. Do you know if there were other children in the school
7 who had been boarded out?

8 A. None that I know of.

9 Q. And you say you also had a different accent and that
10 didn't help?

11 A. Yes, that's right.

12 Q. Then you talk at paragraph 29 about going to
13 Elgin Academy in 1961 and I think you say that you began
14 to make friends there but you couldn't really tell them
15 what was happening.

16 A. Yes, I made one friend who I'm still friends with now,
17 yes.

18 Q. You say that you did have a problem with getting to
19 school late and you had to explain that to the
20 headmaster.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What explanation did you give for being late?

23 A. I actually told him what was going on. I told him that
24 we were getting beaten in the morning if we didn't do
25 our work and she would deliberately -- we had about two

1 miles to walk to the bus, to catch a bus into the city,
2 and if we didn't get away in time, we would miss the bus
3 and we had to walk to school, to walk another three
4 miles to school. And he -- he eventually understood,
5 didn't do anything about it. I did notice in a bit of
6 my notes it just says I'm quieter than I should be for
7 a girl my age, and he didn't -- he didn't give me any
8 punishment. When I came to school, no one said
9 anything. So they were good in that respect. I could
10 just walk in any time.

11 Q. If we go on to the next page at the top of page 7,
12 paragraph 30, you talk about your brothers and sisters
13 not doing well at school because of your harsh routine.
14 You say you used to help them with homework because they
15 weren't allowed to do it at home?

16 A. Yes, I used to do my homework under the bridge at school
17 before I got home. I'd come off the bus and walk up to
18 the railway bridge, sit in there and do my homework and
19 then go to the croft. Because then we had our work to
20 do as soon as we got in.

21 Q. At paragraph 31 you say that you recall one of the
22 teachers saying to you, "Well, at least you were all
23 kept together".

24 A. Yes. In those days that used to annoy me because I used
25 to think maybe if she had only got one child, she might

1 have been kinder. But I think getting four young
2 children -- I know we didn't get any help, but neither
3 did the guardian. There was no support for her and
4 I think she just lost it totally and didn't know what
5 else to do but punish us.

6 Q. If we scroll down this page, we have a heading, "Food"
7 at paragraph 33 and you say that the food was poor
8 quality and often your brothers would eat cat food to
9 stave off your hunger.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And you say that there was lunch at school but that
12 obviously didn't apply during the school holidays.

13 A. No -- yes, that's right. We all ate the cat food. It
14 was cat food and bread and water. I used to steal eggs
15 from the hen house and take them to the wood and cook
16 them in a tin can. I made nettle soup. I tried
17 everything just to eat.

18 Q. And you say that you were badly underweight.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And in fact when you tried to start your nursing career
21 you were turned down?

22 A. I was turned down initially. I was told to go home and
23 eat and then come back.

24 Q. I think we obviously know that you did then pursue
25 a career in nursing, so how did you overcome that?

1 A. Overcome the?

2 Q. The issue about your weight.

3 A. Yes, they then -- I didn't put on any weight. They took
4 me in. They decided to give me a chance and go with it.

5 Q. Then you talk about Christmas and birthdays, and I think
6 you've mentioned something about that already in your
7 evidence and how you would hang up stockings at the
8 beginning, it says there, and you would get an orange or
9 something small, but that stopped.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. I think you say over the page that birthdays weren't
12 acknowledged.

13 A. No, they weren't.

14 Q. At the next the section we see there, paragraphs 36 and
15 37, we see a section "Pocket money", and I think you
16 didn't receive any pocket money.

17 A. No, nothing at all. And when I did get my first job
18 before nursing, I was sent to a factory in Fochabers and
19 she gave me the bus fare to get there but I had to walk
20 the 6 miles back because she wouldn't give me the bus
21 fare and if I didn't get back in time for my supper at
22 night, I didn't get any supper. And she took all the
23 pay from me.

24 Q. Then at paragraph 38 you say that the only medical care
25 you can remember was attending at the doctor's surgery

1 for treatment for a sore leg which had been caused by
2 being tied to the fence?
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. But nothing was ever said.
5 A. No.
6 Q. So there was no explanation asked for that you can
7 remember?
8 A. No.
9 LADY SMITH: Why did she tie you to a fence?
10 A. To stop me warning my brother to get a beating -- when
11 he was going to get a beating. I would run down the
12 brae to catch him, to tell him, but she caught me one
13 day and then tied me to the fence every time so
14 I couldn't warn him.
15 LADY SMITH: If you managed to warn him, did he run off?
16 A. Yes, he would run to the woods, yes.
17 MS INNES: If we go on to the next page, please, page 9, and
18 under the heading of "Abuse", and I think we've covered
19 some of this already in your evidence. You talk at
20 paragraph 42 about what you said about her getting you
21 up in the middle of the night and having to stand to
22 attention, and at paragraph 43, you say that you would
23 be beaten with anything she had in her hand at the time.
24 A. Yes. She would use a brush with a long handle and you
25 would grab that brush and she would swing you round

1 that, round in a circle, until she pulled you off your
2 feet, and then she would hit you with the brush.

3 Q. Then you go on over the page I think at paragraph 45
4 where you note that the cats that she had were better
5 fed than you.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You say at 46 she would often burn you with a cigarette?

8 A. Yes. Not burn you as such but burn the hair from your
9 skin. So she didn't leave a mark. And if she did leave
10 a mark, you were taken off school. You were off sick.

11 Q. Then you've referred to the material in the next
12 paragraphs already in your evidence, but at
13 paragraph 50, you talk about being made to stand outside
14 with a white cover over your heads?

15 A. Yes. My sister, mainly my sister, but I -- it was done
16 to me as well, but it was mainly my little sister, she
17 would put a white cover over our head and -- because she
18 said the bats -- she would threaten her with the bats
19 coming to land on this white cover and my little sister
20 would scream and scream, and she thought that was
21 hilariously funny.

22 Q. If we go on over the page, please, and at paragraph 55
23 you say there that the older your brothers got, the
24 harder she treated them.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. What sort of things would she do?

2 A. She would drag them out of the bed with their hair and
3 their private parts and pull them along holding onto
4 that and force them to do other things.

5 Q. Then again at paragraph 56 I think you note the visits
6 by children's officers that were known about in advance.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And you say that you would be dressed in your Sunday
9 clothes --

10 A. And made to stand outside, yes.

11 Q. Over the page you go on to speak about the matters that
12 we've already covered in terms of the work that you were
13 made to do.

14 At paragraph 61 on page 12 you say that you all knew
15 what was happening was wrong but you were children and
16 didn't understand what was happening.

17 "We all wanted our parents back."

18 You've said already in your evidence that you never
19 saw your parents again --

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. -- after you'd seen them at Dunclutha. Did you have any
22 contact with them at all?

23 A. My mother appeared in 1976 as an aunt and she was not in
24 her right mind. She had knitted a small scarf and hat
25 for me to wear and I think she thought I was still six

1 or seven years old. I was married at the time and my
2 husband just said, "She's not staying", and he took her
3 back to the station. She couldn't see me as who I was.

4 My father I never saw again. He died in 1964.

5 Q. Right. If we go on again in your statement to
6 paragraph 71, please, it's on page 14, you say there
7 that:

8 "Other people in the community knew this was
9 happening to us in auntie's care. The neighbouring
10 croft knew what was happening and they were good enough
11 to invent jobs around their croft that they needed
12 a hand to get us to come there."

13 And when you arrived there, there were no jobs but
14 you were fed and allowed to play.

15 A. Sorry, could you repeat that?

16 Q. Sorry, it's paragraph 71 that's up on the screen just
17 now. So it says there that other people in the
18 community knew that this was happening to you in
19 auntie's care.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And you mentioned particularly the neighbouring croft?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And you say they knew what was happening?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And they made up jobs?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. For you to do. When you got there, there were no jobs
3 but you were fed and you were allowed to play?

4 A. That's right, yes.

5 Q. Can you tell us a little bit more about that?

6 A. When we first arrived, one of my brothers went down
7 crying to the croft and they immediately called in the
8 Cruelty, we called them the Cruelty in those days, and
9 they came up to that croft and the four of us were told
10 to come down but she came with us and they asked us if
11 we were happy but she was standing beside us and we had
12 to say yes. So all the way up to the croft she had
13 beaten my little brother, locked him in his room when we
14 got there. He was locked in there for two days. We
15 could hear him crying and screaming and to this day he
16 never told us what she did to him.

17 But after that, they had children down there so they
18 invented jobs now and again that we were supposed to go
19 down and help there, and they gave us food and -- we
20 couldn't really play because she could see from the
21 window if we were playing or working. But they saved us
22 a great deal.

23 Q. If we go to the next page, page 15, at paragraph 75 we
24 see the reference there to the neighbouring croft having
25 called in the authorities and you say that that was

1 early in 1957.

2 A. That would be right, yes.

3 Q. So not very long after you had actually gone to

4 the croft.

5 A. That's right.

6 Q. But you've explained that after the incident, you were

7 beaten and what happened to your brother.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Did that then have an effect on you reporting what was

10 going on again?

11 A. Yes, we never tried -- we knew that if we told someone

12 that it would get back to her, or that we were afraid

13 that it would get back to her. We did try and tell the

14 school. It just was very difficult. We couldn't tell

15 anyone.

16 Q. Then you say at paragraph 76 at the bottom of this page:

17 "In 1964 the local minister knew what was

18 happening ..."

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And you understood that a letter was written suggesting

21 that you be removed?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. If we can look, please, back to GLA-000001865, page 26,

24 at the very bottom of that page. The last entry,

25 I think this is from your brother's visiting records.

1 A. Yes, it is.

2 Q. 9 January 1964:

3 "Visited. George and the guardian seen."

4 And then there's reference to matters about George.

5 And then in the final line we see:

6 "I visited Mrs Laing, minister's wife at her own

7 request. Mrs Laing stated that she and her husband are

8 rather worried about the Marchmont children, stating

9 that in their opinion, Ms JCU was not a satisfactory

10 person to have the care and upbringing of the children."

11 It then goes on to say:

12 "I felt that the Laings, although perhaps having

13 some justification for some of their complaints, are not

14 yet adjusted to country life (they moved here about

15 a year ago from Edinburgh) and also they obviously have

16 been subjected to complaints from Josephine about the

17 amount of work she has to do before going to school in

18 the mornings. As far as I can tell, Josephine is asked

19 only to make her own bed and tidy her room before

20 leaving for school and is not being victimised by her

21 foster mother in this respect."

22 A. Yes, I wasn't the one that complained to the minister,

23 it was my brother that complained to the minister.

24 Q. Was that George or Robert?

25 A. Robert.

1 Q. Robert complained to the minister, okay.

2 You've obviously seen this record before and, as you

3 say, the minister's wife seemed to be suggesting that

4 you should be removed from the care of Ms JCU and then

5 we see the reaction of the children's officer to that

6 saying that although perhaps they had some

7 justification, it was perhaps because they weren't

8 adjusted to country life.

9 A. No.

10 Q. Do you have any reflections on that, having seen that

11 record?

12 A. It just my brother was very friendly with the minister

13 and he was obviously telling the minister and his wife

14 everything that was going on. She's obviously blamed me

15 for that, but it was my brother who made that complaint.

16 Q. What do you think about the reaction of the children's

17 officer?

18 A. It must be very difficult for a children's officer if

19 they are not seeing the children at the same time,

20 they're only listening to the guardian or foster parent.

21 I mean, who does he believe? Children can be

22 troublesome sometimes, but, I mean, it was four of us

23 and we were all saying the same thing. So he should

24 have -- he should have spoken to us about it.

25 Q. Okay. Then if we go back, please, to your statement and

1 back to page 15 and paragraph 74, you talk there about
2 the letter that you mentioned earlier in your evidence
3 that you wrote to the social work department --
4 A. Yes.
5 Q. -- asking them to be removed and you say there that you
6 learned that they visited the croft and spoke to the
7 guardian who advised the Social Services that your
8 letter was an exaggeration and your brothers were fine
9 and the upshot was that your brothers were left with
10 Ms JCU ?
11 A. My brothers and sister.
12 Q. And your sister.
13 A. Yes.
14 Q. Then if we go on to paragraph 77 on the next page, you
15 noted there that your sister and your brothers ran away
16 regularly from the croft.
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. Do you know what happened when they did that?
19 A. The police took them back. They didn't listen to any
20 explanation and she told them that foster children can
21 be troublesome and they accepted that explanation.
22 Q. At paragraph 78, you say that you think you also told
23 other churchgoers about what was happening?
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. Was that all of you or can you remember doing that

1 yourself?

2 A. No, I remember doing it, yes.

3 Q. What was the reaction of these people?

4 A. They didn't do anything. They sympathised but they

5 didn't do anything. Nothing was done. They all knew.

6 They all knew what was going on. In fact, the croft

7 would say that before this woman got us, that she was

8 looking after the old man of the croft and they could

9 hear her screaming and shouting at him half a mile away

10 and that was before we were even put to the croft.

11 Q. Okay, so after that, as we know, you moved I think to

12 Aberdeen to embark on your nursing career.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. After that, did you ever go back to the croft again?

15 A. Yes. Once my children were young, I -- because I was

16 always told I would be good for nothing and that history

17 would repeat itself, I would be exactly the same as my

18 mother, I thought I'm going to take my three children

19 and my husband up to the croft and just show her that

20 what she was saying was just lies. So I took them up to

21 the croft and I saw her and the -- my children didn't

22 know, I didn't explain to her, they just called her "the

23 lady and her pussycats", and she turned around to my

24 husband and she said, "Oh, at least you're keeping her

25 tidy and you're making sure she doesn't wear nail

1 varnish and make up", and that's all she said, and then
2 we left. But that was it. I never -- I only went back
3 when I knew she was dying.

4 Q. Did you see her before she died then?

5 A. Yes, she took a stroke and I thought I need to see the
6 end of this, so I went back up to the home that she was
7 in at the time and she did see me and didn't say much,
8 and then a few weeks later she died and I went back up
9 to her funeral. I took my youngest daughter with me.
10 The coffin was open and I -- I couldn't help it, but
11 I grabbed her nose just to make sure that she was gone,
12 and for some reason I -- I -- it was just -- I knew that
13 was the end.

14 Q. If we can go on in your statement, please, to
15 paragraph 86 on page 17, and I think you talk there
16 about your sister.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And you say that you learned later in life that auntie
19 had broken your sister's arm --

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. -- during one of the beatings. She was taken to
22 hospital and on her discharge she refused to go back to
23 the croft.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And she went from there then to a hostel for young

1 girls; is that right?

2 A. For troubled girls, yes.

3 Q. And I think you've already mentioned that she then went
4 into hospital.

5 A. She was then sent to [REDACTED] I have her reports
6 and it states when she was at school she started to hit
7 young children and I think it was only because that's
8 all she knew, was being bad used, so that was the right
9 thing to do, was to hit other children.

10 Q. Perhaps if we can just talk a little bit about the
11 impact on your life of what happened to you. How has
12 your health been affected?

13 A. My health has been good. I'm a very nervous person,
14 I will admit that. I found it difficult when I left the
15 croft, I went into the nurses' home. I couldn't tell
16 any of the other students about myself. I had no money,
17 I had no belongings. When they went home for their
18 holidays, I had to stay in the nurses' home because
19 I had nowhere to go.

20 During my training it was a struggle because
21 I couldn't buy books, I couldn't -- I had only the grant
22 from the training. I just -- I mean, I had no idea
23 about life in general. I didn't even know that you took
24 different sizes of shoes. My first pair of shoes
25 I bought just because I liked it and I was walking down

1 the brae and one of the students said, "Your shoes are
2 too big for you", and I says, "No, they're not", and she
3 says, "Yes, they are". I had no idea that you had
4 different sizes of clothes, different sizes of shoes.
5 I came in with a bra and school clothes -- sorry, not
6 a bra, a white vest and navy knickers and all the others
7 students had their modern teenagers' clothes. I had no
8 idea about anything like that. So I had to work from
9 nothing, but I got there in the end.

10 Q. You talk in your statement about the impact on you and
11 I think that you did have some treatment for depression.

12 A. Yes, I was on valium for -- when my three children --
13 I had three children quite quickly. After my first
14 child, for some reason, I don't know whether there was
15 a record that I was a foster child or a boarded-out
16 child, but when my first child came along, this home
17 visitor came and checked on my first child, emptied all
18 the drawers in my house to make sure that I was treating
19 that child properly, and she did that a few times until
20 my husband complained and threw her out the house.

21 Sorry, I forgot where I'm going.

22 Q. So you said that you had some treatment after you had
23 the children, you had the children in close succession,
24 I think at paragraph 104 of your statement at the bottom
25 of page 20, you talk about your confidence being

1 affected.

2 A. Yes, and my husband was a bit of a drunk. He wasn't

3 a bad man, he was just a bit of a drunk and spent all

4 the money and I ended up on valium for several years

5 until one day I thought I can't go on like this and

6 I just -- I stopped the valium.

7 Q. Now, we know if we go on to page 21 and paragraph 106

8 that you -- we know that you've written a book about

9 your experiences --

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. -- called 'Say Nothing'. How did it come about that you

12 decided to write about your experiences?

13 A. My first husband, before he died, because I had been

14 telling him about it, he said write it all down. So

15 I started writing poetry initially and then I thought

16 I'll write a few pages and that will be a book, but when

17 you look at a few pages, it's not a book. So I started

18 to write, going back and just writing everything

19 I remembered. And then he died and that was put away

20 for a long time. I married again and then my second

21 husband told me to finish the book, which I did.

22 Q. We know that that book of course has been published. We

23 also know from material that I'll put here in a moment

24 that you have, I suppose, tried to have your experience

25 and the experience of others in similar situations

1 recognised.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. If we can look at SGV-000042943. I think we see here
4 that there's a letter dated 21 December 2009 which you
5 wrote to the Scottish Government following Tom Shaw's
6 report on historical abuse.

7 I think if we look in the first paragraph you say
8 that you'd just finished reading the report and you say
9 that you were:

10 " ... very disappointed that this review has not
11 included the vast amount of children boarded out to
12 foster carers during the years investigated in this
13 report."

14 You then go on to refer to the Clyde report and if
15 we go down to the next paragraph, we see that you refer
16 to your own experiences and having recovered your
17 records from Glasgow social work department and you say
18 at the bottom of the page:

19 "The contents of these notes did not highlight any
20 evidence of reports of abuse or lack of care, but there
21 were several indications that 'the children were not
22 present or seen' during any visits and these notes
23 contained a letter sent to their office by a respected
24 member of the community questioning the ability of the
25 foster carer ..."

1 And I think that's from the minister?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. In the next paragraph you go on to say that you're:

4 " ... aware that Tom Shaw's report didn't deal with
5 individual cases and has looked solely at the abuse of
6 children in residential homes, but I feel that
7 boarded-out children are entitled to a voice and as the
8 Clyde report states, 'this method is their committee's
9 preferred mode of handling children in need of home
10 replacement'."

11 And you say:

12 "In my opinion, a separate or complementary
13 investigation should be instigated on behalf of those
14 children, drawing attention to the needs of each child
15 placed any distance from support or means of immediate
16 help."

17 I know it's a long time since you've seen that
18 letter. Can you give us a bit of an explanation as to
19 what you've tried to do in more recent years to
20 highlight the position of people that were boarded out
21 as you were?

22 A. Yes. I joined the review group, which is an amazing
23 group. I will never forget their support and I just
24 wanted to give the boarded-out children a voice.
25 I really didn't know how to do it and I started writing

1 poetry and I came across a gentleman who was in the
2 Review Group and -- or a part of the Time to be Heard.
3 In fact, I went to the Time to be Heard and I noted that
4 it was all residential children, it wasn't anything to
5 do with boarded-out or foster care, and I felt we had
6 a voice just as much as residential children.

7 I went to some of the workshops and then I was --
8 I got involved by this gentleman who was a poet and the
9 poetry I wrote is in the book, but it's about some of
10 the experiences I'd had. He asked me if I'd gone
11 through that experience and I said yes and he invited me
12 down to Glasgow and I got involved in the Review Group
13 and I tried on some occasion to mention boarded-out and
14 say that it should be brought to the table and try and
15 change the terminology from foster care or include it
16 with the boarded-out generation, because after all, we
17 are the old generation. There's not many of us left and
18 I felt that we had quite a strong voice.

19 Q. You mentioned there the terminology of foster care and
20 boarded-out.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. How would you see it from your perspective? Is what you
23 experienced, is that foster care as far as you're
24 concerned?

25 A. No. As far as I'm concerned it's boarded-out, because

1 at the end of the day we were in a Children's Home and
2 we were boarded out to crofts in the Highlands and
3 Islands of Scotland and we were boarded to a guardian,
4 it's on our notes, it doesn't say foster parent, it
5 states a guardian, and I've always looked at it as
6 boarded out. Unfortunately in the book it says foster
7 care but that was the editor didn't want to mention
8 boarded-out in case you got it mixed up with boarding
9 schools, so that was the reason it wasn't in the book.

10 Q. If we can go back, please, to the end of your statement
11 at page 22 in paragraph 113, at the bottom of this page,
12 you're asked there about lessons to be learned from your
13 experience. First of all, you say that a big lesson to
14 be learned is that good records should be kept of where
15 the children are sent. They should not be sent to
16 strange people in strange areas where there is no
17 control or supervision.

18 Would you like to say anything more about that
19 point?

20 A. Yes. I should also say that they should not lose
21 contact with their original family. I mean, I had two
22 sisters which I didn't know about. I mean, I don't know
23 them very well. I have -- I'm in communication with
24 them, but the closeness isn't there. In fact, the
25 closeness with my own brothers and sisters are not there

1 because we had to beat each other. If she didn't want
2 to beat us, she forced us to beat them while she stood
3 on and watched.

4 Q. If we go on to the next page, you talk about children
5 being too terrified to say anything in front of adults.
6 Is that another lesson that we should take from your
7 experience?

8 A. Yes. I am still wary of people in authority. I find it
9 difficult. You always feel that you are good for
10 nothing, that you don't mean anything, so no matter what
11 you say, it's not really important. And you always feel
12 that way.

13 Q. Then you talk about Ms JCU really wanting to have one
14 child to teach how to run the croft and you've mentioned
15 that already in your evidence this morning and you say:
16 "She was paid for us being there."

17 A. Yes, she was.

18 Q. Do you see that as being significant?

19 A. No, I've nothing against her being paid. It's -- no,
20 I have nothing against that.

21 Q. It's perhaps what's done with the payment and what's
22 provided.

23 A. Yes, exactly. Yes.

24 Q. Then you say in the next paragraph:
25 "It is important to realise that foster care is just

1 as important as institutional care. In foster care it
2 is much harder to seek help. It is easier in
3 institutional care to be heard."

4 Can you expand on that, please?

5 A. Yes. It maybe isn't. I mean, I -- it maybe isn't
6 easier to ask for help in institutional care, but I feel
7 if you're in an isolated place, you have no one you can
8 fall back on, you have no one you can talk to. You're
9 talking to your own brothers and sisters who are also
10 being abused. I really can't say much of that. I don't
11 know what to say about that.

12 Q. Are there any other lessons that you think we should
13 take from your experience or are these the primary ones?

14 A. I think that's the primary ones, yes.

15 Q. Thank you. Now, Josephine, I understand that you've
16 prepared a brief statement which you would like to read
17 out to cover some ground in your evidence.

18 A. If nobody objects.

19 LADY SMITH: No, I'd be very interested to hear it,
20 Josephine. Please do go ahead when you're ready.

21 A. Thank you. It's just a summary.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

23 A. My brothers and sister and I are part of a forgotten
24 generation of children who were boarded out from the
25 children's homes in the 1950s and 1960s by Local

1 Authorities, mainly Glasgow, to isolated crofts in the
2 Highlands and Islands of Scotland, supposedly for
3 a better life away from the busy cities to clean, fresh
4 air of open country. The majority of these children
5 went on to have a happy experience in a loved
6 environment, but many more, maybe into the hundreds,
7 experienced nothing but severe abuse in all its forms,
8 used as farm labourers, beaten, sexually humiliated,
9 starved and ignored, even by the police, who often took
10 a desperate runaway back to the croft they were trying
11 to escape from.

12 In the past, when evidence was found that guardians
13 or foster parents overworked their children and that the
14 boarding-out practice was open to abuse, this was
15 ignored and children continued to be sent to these
16 isolated crofts with very little check on their
17 progress. Inspection of these crofts were infrequent
18 and recognition of abuse was a naive expectation that
19 community's self-policing would prevent cases of child
20 abuse. This did not happen because the community did
21 not want to speak out in case the child was punished
22 further for reaching out for help.

23 The shocking reality of the boarded-out practice was
24 to deny many of the children any knowledge of parents
25 after they were boarded out or any other siblings they

1 may have or where they had come from or who they even
2 were. Many grew up not knowing that they had brothers
3 and sisters. Often it was a story of hardship,
4 unbelievable abuse, poverty in part and even slavery.
5 Many of our generation, the boarded-out generation, have
6 passed away, including our sister, and these voices must
7 be heard loud and clear so that their cries for help
8 have not been in vain.

9 Thank you.

10 MS INNES: Thank you, Josephine. I have no more questions
11 for you and I'm not aware of any applications.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you. I'll just check. Are there any
13 outstanding applications for questions?

14 Josephine, I have no other questions for you. Just
15 let me say although about five minutes ago you told me
16 you were left feeling good for nothing, that's not
17 right. You are good for many, many things, as I've
18 heard, including, from my perspective, having made
19 an extremely valuable contribution to the work we're
20 doing here in this case study looking into foster care.

21 A. Thank you.

22 LADY SMITH: I'm so grateful to you for your thoughtful,
23 fair reflections and your very clear evidence. I know
24 we haven't articulated all the detail today, but I have
25 that in your written statement and of course anyone who

1 would like to read more is able to read your book as
2 well, although I do know it's a tough gig, as they say,
3 from beginning to end.
4 Thank you for coming.
5 A. Thank you very much, my Lady.
6 LADY SMITH: I'm now able to let you go.
7 A. Thank you.
8 (The witness withdrew)
9 LADY SMITH: Well, that brings us neatly to just about
10 11.30, Ms Innes, so I'll take the morning break now and
11 then we'll move to the next witness after that. Thank
12 you.
13 MS INNES: Thank you.
14 (11.30 am)
15 (A short break)
16 (11.45 am)
17 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.
18 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady. The next witness is
19 George Marchmont, who has also waived anonymity. He is
20 the brother of Josephine Duthie, and so he was also in
21 the care of Glasgow Corporation, now city of Glasgow,
22 boarded out in Morayshire on 9 May 1956.
23 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
24 Can you just remind me, Ms Innes, obviously we know
25 Josephine waived anonymity and George has waived

1 anonymity. There are other children in the family whose
2 first names have been or may have been mentioned.
3 Remind me what the position is in relation to them?
4 MS INNES: Robert has also waived anonymity. His statement
5 will be read in tomorrow.
6 LADY SMITH: Yes.
7 MS INNES: And their sister [REDACTED] she died and therefore in
8 the documents her name has been redacted.
9 LADY SMITH: Yes, of course. Just to remind people in the
10 room who haven't picked this up already, it's easier
11 just to use Ms [REDACTED] JCU 's name, Ms [REDACTED] JCU having been the
12 crofter who had these children boarded with her, but her
13 name can't be mentioned outside this room because of my
14 general restriction order. Thank you.
15 George Marchmont (sworn)
16 LADY SMITH: Can we begin by you helping me with what I hope
17 is an easy question. How would you like me to address
18 you? Sorry, you probably can't work out where the
19 sound's coming from. It's me, Lady Smith, who is
20 speaking.
21 A. Just George will do.
22 LADY SMITH: You're happy with George?
23 A. Yes.
24 LADY SMITH: Very well. George, the hard copy in the red
25 file in front of you is your statement. We'll also be

1 putting bits of it up on screen as we look at it and we
2 may look at another document. If we do, that will come
3 up on screen as well.

4 Do let me know if you have any queries or concerns,
5 if you want a break or if it's not working for you,
6 you're not comfortable with the way we're doing this.
7 It's really important to me that I do what I can to make
8 you comfortable when you're giving evidence because
9 I know it's not easy, all right?

10 A. Okay.

11 LADY SMITH: I'll hand over to Ms Innes if you're ready.

12 A. Thank you.

13 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

14 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

15 Questions from Ms Innes

16 MS INNES: Now, George, we know that you were born in 1952;
17 is that right?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. You've given a statement that's in the folder in front
20 of you, which is WIT.001.001.7818, that's just the
21 reference that we use.

22 If I could ask you to look at the final page of your
23 statement, please. I think we see there at paragraph 90
24 you say that you have no objection to your statement
25 being published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry

1 and that you believe the facts stated in the statement
2 are true. I think you've signed and dated it on
3 27 March 2018; is that right?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Thank you. If I can take you back to the beginning of
6 your statement, and it will come up on the screen as
7 well, at paragraph 2 you say that you remember nothing
8 about your life before you were in care.

9 A. No, no.

10 Q. We know that you were boarded out you were only four.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So that would explain why you can't remember anything
13 before then.

14 A. (Witness nodded).

15 Q. You say your first memory, I think, is being in
16 Dunclutha in Dunoon?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. At paragraph 5 at the top of the next page you say that
19 you can remember leaving Dunclutha.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Can you tell us a bit about the journey, what you can
22 remember of it?

23 A. Yes. I remember going onto a ferry and you could see
24 the water going onto it and I sort of crawled because
25 I was afraid I was going to fall. So we went on there

1 and then we went across, came out the boat and then we
2 had to go and catch a train, I think there were two
3 trains, but it was a steam train it was, and then we got
4 a taxi to the place.

5 Q. Had you ever been on a train before?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Did you know why you were getting the ferry and the
8 train? Can you remember?

9 A. No. No, I didn't.

10 Q. I think you were with your sister Josephine and your
11 brother Robert; is that right?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Then you say in your statement that you think that there
14 was a man and a woman there but you don't know who they
15 were?

16 A. Well, yes, there was. Somebody took us. I'm sure there
17 was.

18 Q. Then at paragraph 6 you talk about arriving at the
19 croft, which we understand was near Elgin.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Can you remember what the croft was like?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Can you tell us about that, please?

24 A. Do you want the inside of the building or --

25 Q. Start with the inside, yeah.

1 A. Yes? Well, you went in the door. Onto your right was
2 the living room and kitchen, well, sort of thing. The
3 cooker was in that corner. There was a table in front
4 of the window. A little stool beside the fire. There
5 was a fire and another chair, and then there was
6 a couch. The bedroom door was there and then there was
7 a wall, an old wall unit thing there, and then there was
8 a door and then there was a table in the middle.
9 Q. Okay, so that was on one side as you went into the
10 house.
11 A. Yes.
12 Q. So it sounds like there was a living room with a bit of
13 a kitchen --
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. -- and a bedroom?
16 A. Yes.
17 Q. And who slept in that bedroom?
18 A. My brother and myself.
19 Q. Okay. And then on the other side of the door as you
20 went in, what was on that side?
21 A. That was where my sisters were. But when we went there,
22 we were all in that room to start off with, and then we
23 were moved into the other room.
24 Q. Okay. When you say you were all in that room, were you
25 all in the room that your sisters ultimately slept in?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. We know that you went to stay with a guardian called

3 Ms JCU

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Where did she sleep?

6 A. She slept on a settee in the living room. Sort of

7 pulled it down.

8 Q. Right, okay. So that's the inside of the house, and you

9 say I think at paragraph 8 that it was a poky place.

10 I think initially we know that there was no electricity.

11 A. There was no electricity. It was a Tilley lamp.

12 Q. Tilley lamps?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. You say at paragraph 9 that there were no carpets, just

15 vinyl on the floors?

16 A. Yes. That's right. She made rugs out of old clothes

17 and that was down on the floor, but they didn't cover

18 the whole floor.

19 Q. Then I think at paragraph 10 you tell us a little bit

20 about what was outside the house, so perhaps if you can

21 just explain to us what the outside was like.

22 A. Outside the house there was a big shed, that way, and

23 you come out the door and there was a fence, a sort of

24 garden with a fence around it, and you went along a wee

25 laney and you had the wash house and then next to it was

1 the -- where -- I can't remember what the other building
2 was.

3 Q. Okay, so there were a couple of buildings, a shed. So
4 you say here there was a red brick milk shed --

5 A. Yes, that's right. Green doors.

6 Q. And a washroom that was attached to the house.

7 A. Yes, that's where we used to wash our clothes.

8 Q. Right. And did you have to do that?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Together with your sisters and brother?

11 A. Yes, yes.

12 Q. Do you know if Ms JCU ever did that?

13 A. No.

14 Q. And you say here that there was a byre built onto the
15 side of the house?

16 A. Yes, that's right.

17 Q. And were there animals in the byre?

18 A. Sometimes. Not often, no.

19 Q. Then you say in front of the byre was the midden where
20 all the rubbish went.

21 A. Yes, the midden, yes.

22 Q. And was there a toilet in the house at all?

23 A. No, no toilets.

24 Q. Did there ever come a time that there was a toilet in
25 the house?

1 A. No, never. There's still no toilets in it.

2 Q. If we go on, please, to page 3 of your statement, I'd
3 just like to ask you about your first impressions when
4 you got there. How did you feel when you arrived at the
5 house? Can you remember?

6 A. Well, I was frightened. I don't know. I met the lady.

7 Q. What do you remember of her?

8 A. I remember putting my arms around her and she took my
9 arms away from her.

10 Q. Right. Did she or did anybody say what you were to call
11 her?

12 A. It was Aunt JCU

13 Q. You mention in the next paragraph at paragraph 13, you
14 talk about when you were -- initially in the house as
15 you've just said, the three of you were sharing the
16 bedroom, so you and your brother and your sister were in
17 one room.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And you say there were a couple of beds in that room?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And were you sharing a bed with your brother?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And you say there was a fire in the room but it was
24 never put on?

25 A. There was a fire in our room. No, it was never put on.

1 It was always cold. Damp.

2 Q. And did the same apply when you and your brother moved
3 into the other room?

4 A. Yes, it was the same. There was no heating.

5 Q. So the only fire that was ever on was the one in the
6 sitting room?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. If we go further down, we see at paragraph 14 that you
9 say that there was no toilet in the house, as you've
10 said.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Then at paragraph 15, you say:

13 "A metal bath was put on a chair in the middle of
14 the living room ...".

15 A. Yes, that's right.

16 Q. So you and your brother and your sisters just had to use
17 that?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Did there ever come a time that you had any more privacy
20 as you got a bit older?

21 A. No, no privacy.

22 Q. And you say the water could be hot or cold?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. If we go onto the top of the next page, please, at
25 paragraph 16 you say:

1 "If we weren't washing right, she would rub the
2 carbolic soap that we had to use on our tongues."
3 A. On our tongues, yes.
4 Q. Then there's a section, "Food". Can you tell us what
5 the food was like when you were living with Ms JCU ?
6 A. Oh yes.
7 Q. What was it like?
8 A. Well, she called it sapps, and that was stale bread,
9 green, mouldy bread, warm milk and Kit-e-Kat.
10 Q. So cat food?
11 A. Cat food. We had to feed the cats and what was left, we
12 had to eat it.
13 Q. And did she eat that as well?
14 A. No.
15 Q. You say there that she would give it to you and she
16 would have mince and tatties or soup to herself.
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. And biscuits. Did you ever get any biscuits?
19 A. No.
20 Q. You say at paragraph 20 that she would boil up potatoes
21 for the chickens?
22 A. Yes, little green potatoes, and we used to eat them when
23 she wasn't there.
24 Q. You say I think at paragraph 18, just slightly before
25 that, you say that you would also do some cooking when

1 you were there.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. But you say there was never much food.

4 A. No.

5 Q. Then at the bottom of this page, so from paragraph 21,

6 you talk about clothing. What clothing were you given

7 when you were at Ms JCU s?

8 A. Well, not very much.

9 Q. Right.

10 A. She bought a jacket for school, a sort of blazer thing,

11 but she took it back the next day and got the money and

12 she went and bought cigarettes with.

13 Q. Right, so she --

14 A. So I didn't get the jacket after all.

15 Q. Right. You say that she would buy things and then the

16 next day she would take them to get the money back.

17 A. Yes, well, it was like Christmas presents. You got

18 Christmas presents. You never saw them the next day,

19 never saw them again.

20 Q. I think you're saying there that she got money for

21 clothes, that would have been from Glasgow, presumably?

22 A. Oh yes.

23 Q. But then she went and sold the clothes that she bought?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And then used the money as you've said?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Then you say at paragraph 22 that you had to wear shorts
3 with big underpants underneath.

4 A. Yes. On the way to school, there was a railway bridge
5 and on the way to school we would take our trousers off,
6 take the pants off, put them in our bag, put the
7 trousers back on, go to school. We'd do the same on the
8 way back.

9 Q. So that she wouldn't know any different by the time you
10 got home?

11 A. No, no.

12 Q. Then you talk about having to wash your own clothes, as
13 you've already mentioned.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You then go on to talk about being at school and when
16 you first got to the croft you were too young to go to
17 school at that point.

18 A. Yes, that's right.

19 Q. What happened when you started going to school? Were
20 you able to go all the time?

21 A. No.

22 Q. Why not?

23 A. I hardly went to school.

24 Q. Right.

25 A. I couldn't even read, write, tell the time when I left

1 school.

2 Q. Why were you hardly able to go to school?

3 A. Well, we had dog bites, we had bruises, couldn't take

4 gym. She hardly put me to school.

5 Q. So she kept you off school?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You say at paragraph 27 that one teacher was very good

8 to you:

9 "I think she knew something was wrong, but she never

10 did anything about it."

11 A. Yes, she was good to me.

12 Q. Did she ask you anything about what was going on at

13 home, can you remember?

14 A. Well, she knew there was something wrong but she didn't

15 do anything about it.

16 Q. Then you say under the next heading, "Contact with

17 family", you didn't have any contact with your parents?

18 A. No, not me.

19 Q. Can you remember ever seeing your parents?

20 A. Yes, I saw -- I didn't see my father, but I have seen my

21 mother.

22 Q. And was that when you were older?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Then you say at paragraph 29 that Ms JCU never showed

25 you any love or affection?

1 A. No, never.

2 Q. And you say that you would never go to her if you were
3 upset?

4 A. No. No.

5 Q. Why did you not do that?

6 A. I couldn't speak to her, she was bad.

7 Q. Then at the top of the next page, please, you talk about
8 visits and inspections. Can you remember anybody coming
9 from Glasgow Corporation to see you?

10 A. Yes, I do. Came in a big chauffeur-driven car and went
11 into the house and we were outside. We weren't allowed
12 in.

13 Q. And did you know in advance when he was coming?

14 A. No, I didn't know, no.

15 Q. Can you remember, did Ms JCU just send you outside when
16 they arrived or --

17 A. Yes, yes, we were put out.

18 Q. And did the man from the counsel try to speak to you at
19 all?

20 A. Not one bit.

21 Q. Then you have a heading about birthdays and Christmas
22 and I think you've talked a little bit about that. You
23 say here that birthdays were never celebrated at all?

24 A. Never, no.

25 Q. Did you know when your birthday was?

1 A. No.

2 Q. Then you say at paragraph 33 that you would have
3 a Christmas goose. She used to breed them, she would
4 get somebody to come and kill them and she locked you in
5 the barn to pluck them.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Can you tell you about that?

8 A. She even made us kill them.

9 Q. Right.

10 A. She made us put a stick on its neck and pull and I was
11 so frightened.

12 Q. Then under "Healthcare" you say you had bad asthma?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Can you remember Ms JCU helping you to go to the doctor
15 to see about that?

16 A. I had asthma and I couldn't breathe and my sister and
17 brothers went away to school and I was in the living
18 room and there was a sink there and I couldn't breathe
19 and I was on the floor with my elbow on the sink trying
20 to get air and I was there the whole day without
21 medication and it was time for them coming home from
22 school when she got up off the chair, looked out the
23 window and she saw them coming. She came over, took my
24 arm and put me into bed.

25 Q. Right. And then you say --

1 A. And then she got my sister to go to the phone box and
2 phone for the doctor. But I was there the whole day.
3 Q. And you say that in addition to that, you had some
4 injuries over the years.
5 A. Yes.
6 Q. Did you ever see the doctor about that?
7 A. No. I was washing my feet in the bath and she had this
8 kettle from a hook from the fire, she put a cloth around
9 the handle and she was pouring water in and I took my
10 feet out so she could do it and she put my feet back in
11 and then she poured the boiling water on top of my feet
12 and they came out like a balloon. You know, the skin
13 was -- I couldn't even get shoes on. And then she took
14 her scissors and cut the skin.
15 Q. If we go over to page 7, you have a heading, "Chores".
16 You say at paragraph 38 that you would all have chores
17 to do. She would check that you had done them right and
18 if you hadn't, she would give you a beating and she was
19 just sitting in the house while you were doing the
20 chores. Is that right?
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. Then you go through some of the things that you had to
23 do and at paragraph 39 you say that you had to collect
24 water from the well?
25 A. Yes. We had to collect water, down half a mile, maybe

1 less, I don't know, a good bit down the field, yes. We
2 had to collect it from there and there was a basin, you
3 had to fill it up every day, for tea and that, and on
4 the way this day we went to the well and there was cows
5 in the field and there was an electric fence to keep
6 them out because the other fence was all broken and
7 fallen down, and this day there was a wee calfy, you
8 know, a calf, and it kept running after me and I would
9 stop and feed it and talk to it, and she was walking on
10 there and she came walking back and I was busy giving
11 the cow a wee -- some food. And she went behind me and
12 she pushed me straight onto the electric wire. Every
13 time I tried to get up, I would put my hand up and
14 I kept touching it. I still have the marks on my hands
15 where the electric wire was hitting me.

16 Q. Okay. Then at paragraph 40 you say that when she
17 decided to get water in the house, you had to dig
18 a trench from the next door croft?

19 A. Yes. The house down below, we had to dig the trench
20 every single day for weeks on end with a pick and shovel
21 all the way up to the house, across the road, up to the
22 brae to the window to get the water in.

23 Q. And that was you and your brother and your sisters?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Then at paragraph 41, you talk about having to go and

1 collect firewood?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What did you have to do in relation to that?

4 A. Well, we had to cut the wood for the fire and, you know.

5 Q. So you had to collect them and then chop them up?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Then you say at paragraph 42 that you had chores at the

8 weekend. You had to paint the sheds with creosote and

9 dig the garden?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Then you talk about helping with some of the animals?

12 A. Yes, we had to feed the animals and clean them out.

13 Q. And you say that if you didn't do it, you would get

14 a hiding with her walking stick or the dog's chain?

15 A. Yes, yes.

16 Q. Then you talk again about plucking the hens and the

17 geese.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And you say you were locked in the barn until they were

20 all done?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Can you tell us about that, please?

23 A. Well, we were locked in the barn. The geese was lying

24 beside us and we had to pull all the feathers off it and

25 we had to stay there until it was done.

1 Q. You talk there about a game that you played with your
2 sister and it was a good laugh but you got into trouble.
3 A. Yes.
4 Q. Then over the page at paragraph 44 you say that there
5 was a farmer who rented land --
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. -- and you also had to help him --
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. -- with his sheep when they needed dipped. So what did
10 that involve?
11 A. Its was just rounding up the sheep, you know, putting
12 them into the pen. He was very good.
13 Q. So he was doing the heavy work of actually dipping them?
14 A. Yes, I was just ... you know.
15 Q. Helping him?
16 A. That same walking stick, she broke that stick over my
17 back.
18 Q. Can you remember what happened that led up to that?
19 A. Yes, I remember.
20 Q. Can you tell us about that?
21 A. I had the bath for washing my feet and there was
22 a little stool beside the fire, so -- and there was
23 a cat sitting on there, a wee round circle, and there
24 was only about that for me to sit on. So I was sitting
25 on that and I was busy washing my feet and of course the

1 cat stuck its claw into my bottom.

2 Q. Right.

3 A. And the bath went sliding along the floor. So I picked

4 up the -- I picked up the bath and I wanted to put my

5 underpants on to do it, you know, for modesty, and she

6 wouldn't let me. And so I cleaned up all the water into

7 the bath and had picked the bath up ... (Pause).

8 I picked the bath up -- the bath up -- to empty into

9 the sink. Well, she stood beside me, she lifted that

10 stick up and she walloped me across the willy.

11 I dropped the bath, I dropped the bath, and ... and the

12 water went all over again, and she took that walking

13 stick right across my back. It was that hard she broke

14 it.

15 Q. Right, okay.

16 A. I'm so sorry.

17 Q. It's okay.

18 LADY SMITH: Please, please don't apologise. If you want

19 a break, that's fine.

20 A. No, I'm sorry.

21 LADY SMITH: If you just want to sit quietly for a few

22 moments, it's fine.

23 A. No, I'm okay, I'm okay.

24 LADY SMITH: Are you all right? There are tissues if you

25 need them to wipe your nose in front of you. But

1 please, don't feel the need to apologise. I quite
2 understand why this is upsetting, all right?
3 (Pause).
4 Shall we go on?
5 A. Yes, yes.
6 MS INNES: You're okay to go on? Okay. I'm going to move
7 on to talk about some more of the abuse that you
8 suffered, and just let me know if you'd rather not talk
9 about any of the incidents, okay?
10 A. Yeah, I'm fine.
11 Q. So at paragraph 46, you talk about being off school and
12 you had gone into the room I think when she was using
13 the toilet --
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. And she said -- and you were saying that you were
16 hungry.
17 A. Yes.
18 Q. And what was her reaction to that?
19 A. She did the toilet in a pail and she couldn't stand, she
20 had a straight leg and she was holding her thing up and
21 she'd just done the toilet and of course I came out --
22 I opened the door and I came out and I said, "I'm
23 hungry", and she said, "What did you say?" I says, "I'm
24 hungry", and she -- she says, "Come here". Excuse me
25 for swearing, but she says, "Come here you little

1 bastard", so I went over and I was crying, and she
2 said -- she grabbed my hair and she said, "What did you
3 say?" I says, "I'm hungry". She says, "Well, if you're
4 hungry, lick that", and she pushed my face into her
5 backside. Sorry.

6 Q. It's okay. (Pause).

7 A. I'm okay, I'm okay.

8 LADY SMITH: Hang on.

9 A. I'm okay. I'm so sorry.

10 LADY SMITH: Please, please, please, George, don't
11 apologise. Help me to do the right thing for you. If
12 the right thing for you would be to take a break for
13 five to ten minutes, let's do that.

14 A. No, no, I'm fine. I'm just being silly.

15 LADY SMITH: You're not being silly at all. I don't think
16 you're being silly.

17 A. Okay.

18 LADY SMITH: You're doing a great job in helping me
19 understand what it was like for you to be boarded out
20 with this woman all these years ago. I do appreciate
21 the impact that there will be on you at the moment as
22 you're pulling these things back to the front of your
23 mind. As I said, I know it's not easy.

24 A. Okay.

25 LADY SMITH: Shall we carry on?

1 A. Yes.

2 LADY SMITH: All right. Ms Innes.

3 MS INNES: Thank you.

4 You go on in this part of your statement to tell us

5 about some other things that happened. We have them

6 written down in your statement, so I don't want to go

7 into too many more of them, okay? But I know that you

8 wanted to tell us about something that's not in your

9 statement that happened.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Can you tell us about that, please?

12 A. Well, she had a potty that was underneath the table.

13 When we used it, we had to go out to empty it in the

14 midden and of course I had peed into the potty and

15 instead of going out with it, I just put it back under

16 the table, and I did that again, a second time, and

17 of course she walked past it and touched it with her

18 feet. So she took the potty out and then she said, "Ah,

19 you didn't empty this potty", so she put -- she poured

20 it into a cup and made me drink it.

21 Q. Okay. Thank you for telling us about that.

22 As I say, I'm not going to go into the other things

23 that you cover in your statement unless you really want

24 to talk about any of the other things that happened.

25 A. Well, when you go to your bed at night, and my bed was

1 right beside the door, and she would -- she came
2 through -- this one night she came through and I hadn't
3 brushed my shoes, I think it was, and so she pulled the
4 blankets down and she grabbed my hair with this hand and
5 with this hand she grabbed my penis and dragged me off
6 the bed.

7 Q. And where did she take you?

8 A. Oh, I had to go and do my shoes.

9 Q. Is there anything else that you'd like to tell us about?

10 A. No, well, she -- I was lying on the bed and she opened
11 the door and I hadn't done anything and so she took her
12 walking stick and hit me and it hit my eye. My eye was
13 way out here, it was black and blue, and I got no
14 treatment. I'm still getting treatment today with it.
15 She hit me in the eye with the stick. And no treatment.

16 Q. And did she keep you off school after that?

17 A. Oh yes.

18 Q. Okay. Now, we know in your statement, if we go on,
19 please, to page 10 and paragraph 59, that you say that
20 you left school at the age of 14.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Even although you'd left school, did you carry on living
23 with Ms JCU ?

24 A. I did, yes.

25 Q. And I think there also came a point when your sister

1 Josephine had left to start nursing in Aberdeen?

2 A. Yes, yes.

3 Q. Did things change as you got older or not?

4 A. No, no, no.

5 Q. At the top of page 11, you talk about your brother

6 running away.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And then you say that your younger sister also ran away.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Did you ever try to run away?

11 A. No.

12 Q. Why not?

13 A. I don't know. I can't tell you that. I don't know.

14 Q. When the others ran away, what happened? Did they come

15 back?

16 A. Well, the police would take them back, but they took

17 them away eventually. My brother, he ran away and they

18 didn't take him back the last time.

19 Q. And then your sister, I think, went away as well?

20 A. My sister went away, yes.

21 Q. You then say that you were left alone with Ms JCU

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And then I think you --

24 A. I started work at the golf club and I had to come home

25 every week. I had to hand over my whole pay packet to

1 her. I got nothing back.

2 Q. I think you say in this paragraph that we're looking at
3 here that sometimes she would give you money for the bus
4 and other times she wouldn't and you'd have to walk.

5 A. Yes. Yes.

6 Q. I think at paragraph 65 you talk about coming home when
7 you were 17 after a competition and the door was locked.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. And did she let you into the house?

10 A. No. I slept under the hedge that night.

11 Q. Then I think you say that you left then and after that,
12 at the top of page 12, on page 68, you say you went back
13 to see her a couple of times.

14 A. Yes. I -- I went back thinking we have been on our own,
15 I thought maybe she'd thought about it and she might
16 have just said sorry, but that sorry never came, so I --
17 I just didn't go back again.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. There was another time -- I'm sorry for butting in.

20 Q. That's okay.

21 A. There was another time that we got ready for school, the
22 three of us, and I did something wrong, I can't remember
23 what it was, and she got -- she made my -- she made my
24 brother hold my feet and she told -- my sister was
25 crying and she didn't want to do it but she was made to,

1 she held my feet and my brother held my shoulder. She
2 went to the fireplace and she took the poker from the
3 fire and she was banging my elbows with this poker.
4 Q. And it was hot at the time, you said it was in the fire?
5 A. Yes, well, it was sitting in front of the fire so -- you
6 know how you get your funny bone.
7 Q. Yeah.
8 A. And she was banging my elbows. I was screaming. My
9 sister was crying.
10 Q. Okay.
11 A. And she would make us hit each other, you know, and
12 she -- she used to have the same belt on the door. You
13 know, it used to be for a cutthroat, you sharpened your
14 thing on it.
15 Q. A knife on it.
16 A. She used to use that, take the belt off, but she would
17 use the buckle and you would have buckle marks on your
18 back.
19 Q. Do you know if anybody ever noticed the injuries that
20 you suffered?
21 A. Nobody noticed, I'm sure. It was all covered up. No
22 doctors, nothing.
23 Q. Did you ever try to tell anyone? You mentioned this
24 teacher.
25 A. No, it was a waste of time. I tried and I tried, but

1 nobody listened.

2 Q. When you say nobody listened, did they ...?

3 A. Even the police was told but nobody did nothing.

4 Q. Okay. I think you cover this at your -- if we go on to

5 page 13 at paragraph 77, you say that you didn't tell

6 people at school what was happening because if she had

7 found out, you would have got another hiding.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Did that stop you telling anybody?

10 A. No.

11 Q. No. You did try to tell people?

12 A. I did.

13 Q. Then you say at paragraph 78 that your sister Josephine

14 later told you that one of the neighbours had reported

15 it?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. But you don't know what happened about that?

18 A. No, I don't know what happened, no. I don't think

19 anything happened. I don't know.

20 Q. Then you say at paragraph 79 that one of the only people

21 that you told was the minister in the church in Golspie.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. I think that was later?

24 A. Yes, he believed me. He came to the meeting with me and

25 he knew what was going on.

1 Q. Came to the meeting when you came to give your statement
2 to the Inquiry?
3 A. Yes, yes.
4 Q. You say at paragraph 81 of your statement, just at the
5 bottom of this page, that you think about your time in
6 foster care every day and it's in your mind all the
7 time.
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. Does that remain --
10 A. Yes.
11 Q. If we go on at the bottom of page 14, you give us some
12 other information and you say at paragraph 87 that you
13 know that Ms JCU was being paid for having you because
14 a white envelope would arrive.
15 A. She would have to go into Elgin to the post office to
16 collect it, and that's what she did.
17 Q. And you say you never saw any of that money, though?
18 A. Never a penny. Nothing.
19 Q. Okay. Then at paragraph 88, you say that it was your
20 understanding that it was the government's policy at the
21 time to move children out of homes into foster care or
22 to be boarded out.
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. And you say that your impression is that the quicker
25 that children were moved out of the homes, the quicker

1 others could be moved in?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And you feel that the home got money for every child and

4 therefore the more children they had, the more money

5 they got?

6 A. Well, yes. I'm sure that's the way it worked. I didn't

7 know at the time, but I'm sure that's what happened.

8 Q. Then at paragraph 89 at the top of the next page you

9 talk a little bit more about what we should learn from

10 your experience.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. So you talk about the need for checks being made of

13 children in care?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Can you tell us about that, please, what are your

16 thoughts on that?

17 A. Well, my thoughts was when you interview a child, you

18 always have the parents sitting with you. A child is

19 not going to open up in front of the parents who are

20 living with them. And if a child is trying to explain

21 something, you'll always get a parent that might butt in

22 trying to stop the question or put you off the question.

23 If a child should be interviewed in a room televised for

24 people to see and being heard, the parents cannot say,

25 "Oh, you made them say that."

1 There should be something said. You know, for the
2 child should be interviewed by itself with the proper
3 people around it, no parents. They could watch what's
4 being said on a screen.

5 Q. Then I think you say that the child should be seen on
6 their own, as you've just said, and they should be asked
7 if they're okay, if they're being treated well, fed well
8 and clothed well.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. So as you say, things that never happened to you.

11 A. No.

12 Q. And then you also say that you think that schools should
13 keep notes of children that are in foster care and
14 should monitor their behaviour and appearance.

15 A. Yes, that's right.

16 Q. Can you explain a little bit more about that, please?

17 A. Well, I think that the parents -- the schools should
18 keep an eye on people. You know, if there's something
19 wrong with the child, they should -- signs, there must
20 be signs a child is trying to give. People are bound to
21 see the signs there's something wrong, and if they think
22 there's something wrong, they should do something about
23 it.

24 Q. Thank you. Are there any other lessons that we can
25 learn from your experience that we've not covered?

1 Anything else that you'd like to tell us?

2 A. No.

3 Q. Those are the main things, the most important things?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. If you've got a child in care, it's the child you should

7 be speaking to, not the parents, because it's the child

8 that's in care, not the parents. And the parents will

9 always try and cover up what's happening and they'll try

10 and stop the child from telling it.

11 Q. Yes. Okay. Is there anything else that you would like

12 to say in your oral evidence that we've not covered?

13 A. No, no, I'm fine.

14 MS INNES: Thank you very much, George, for your evidence.

15 I don't have any more questions for you and there's no

16 applications, my Lady.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Can I check whether there are any

18 outstanding applications for questions?

19 George, that does complete all the questions we have

20 for you. Thank you for coming today. Thank you for

21 being prepared to go through what I know hasn't been

22 easy, but it's been so helpful to me to hear directly

23 from you about your experiences all these years ago.

24 You're no doubt going to be exhausted when you leave

25 here, so I hope you have plans to have a restful

1 afternoon and you can just be at peace for the rest of
2 the day.
3 A. Okay.
4 LADY SMITH: But go with my thanks and know that you have
5 made a valuable contribution, for which I'm very
6 grateful.
7 A. Thank you.
8 (The witness withdrew)
9 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.
10 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.
11 We do have a statement which can be read in at this
12 point before lunchtime.
13 LADY SMITH: Yes.
14 MS INNES: Again, if I might be excused to speak to the
15 witness?
16 LADY SMITH: Certainly, yes.
17 MS INNES: But Ms Rattray will deal with the read-in.
18 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Ms Rattray.
19 'Jane' (read)
20 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.
21 This is a statement of an applicant who wishes to
22 remain anonymous and has chosen the pseudonym 'Jane'.
23 Her witness statement is at WIT.001.001.190.
24 'Jane' was boarded out to Banffshire from [REDACTED]
25 1945 to [REDACTED] 1949. The placing authority and who

1 supervised the placement was the predecessor of the City
2 of Edinburgh Council.

3 "My name is 'Jane'. I was born in 1939. My contact
4 details are known to the Inquiry.

5 I can't remember my life before being in care.

6 I have one sister and six brothers. I didn't meet my
7 brothers or my sister until I was in my 20s.

8 I went into care when I was two or three because of
9 cruelty. My dad worked on the trams. My mum left us
10 and went to London or Glasgow and left my siblings and
11 me on our own. We were staying in Niddrie somewhere.
12 I was in the Eastern General Hospital, along with two of
13 my brothers, but then we got separated.

14 I don't know where any of my siblings went. I was
15 in Redhall Children's Home and some other places in
16 Edinburgh which I don't remember. I was too young.
17 I didn't even know when my birthday was. I then went to
18 Montrose when I was seven or eight. That's the first
19 clear memory I have of my childhood."

20 From paragraphs 3 to 35, 'Jane' speaks of her
21 experiences in Dorwood House, Montrose. You will see
22 from the heading above paragraph 3 that 'Jane' had some
23 doubt about the timing of that placement. The records
24 which the Inquiry have recovered say that 'Jane' stayed
25 at Dorwood House after the boarding-out placement.

1 Moving now to paragraph 36 on page 7:

2 "After being removed from Dorwood House, I got to
3 stay with Mr and Mrs [REDACTED]. Mr [REDACTED] was
4 a minister. They were lovely people. The other girls
5 went to other local houses or to Abelour Children's
6 Home. I wasn't able to stay with the [REDACTED] for long,
7 just a week or so. After that, I was fostered by Mr and
8 Mrs FFR-SPO [REDACTED]

9 Mr and Mrs FFR-SPO [REDACTED] came and got me from the
10 foster carers I was staying with. I had no involvement
11 in the decision to place me with them. I can't remember
12 the FFR-SPO [REDACTED] first names. I had to call them mum
13 and dad. We were introduced and they took me away.
14 I hated them straight away, I just had a feeling.
15 I can't remember how long the journey was from Montrose,
16 maybe an hour or so. It was the first time I had been
17 in a car, it was a big shock to the system.

18 The FFR-SPO [REDACTED] had two children of their own,
19 a girl and a boy. The FFR-SPO [REDACTED] fostered me and
20 another girl. She had been in Dorwood House with me.
21 She was about three years older than me and was a great
22 knitter. I had been there a couple of week before and
23 I was over the moon when she arrived.

24 I hated it at the FFR-SPO [REDACTED] I was frightened of
25 Ms FFR [REDACTED] Mr [REDACTED] was a lovely man. He was

1 a shepherd so he was away a lot. I was with the
2 FFR-SPO for about a year. Mrs FFR's father
3 stayed with them too. I hated them.

4 Mr and Mrs FFR-SPO had one bedroom and their kids
5 had the other. Me and the other foster girl had to
6 sleep on the kitchen floor. We had to wait until the
7 FFR-SPO had stopped using the kitchen when they went
8 to bed and then we could go to bed. We had a blanket to
9 lie on and another one of top of us.

10 I also had to sleep in the barn. There was a thing
11 on the barn wall that I was afraid of. I thought it was
12 going to eat me. It was a stag's head, but I didn't
13 know that at the time. I was made to sleep in the barn
14 twice.

15 The food at the FFR-SPO house was better than
16 at Dorwood House. Mrs FFR cooked the meals on
17 the fire. During the week we had lunch at school.
18 Mrs FFR had tick, credit, at the bakers. One
19 time me and the other foster girl ordered a load of
20 cakes and ate them. We got battered for that.

21 The FFR-SPO didn't have running water in the
22 house. They had a tin bath that we bathed in.
23 I collected water from the stream and it would get
24 heated by the fire.

25 I took some clothes with me but the FFR-SPO

1 bought me new clothes. The Edinburgh authorities used
2 to bring a big bag of clothes. The social worker would
3 tell us that she had brought clothes for us. I used to
4 think I was going to look great, but Mrs FFR gave
5 those clothes away, or she sold them. Mrs FFR
6 made us tell the social worker that we were getting the
7 clothes. I think I wore the daughter's hand-me-down
8 clothes. She was a couple of years older than me.

9 I can't remember the name of the school I went to.
10 We had to wear a uniform. I hated school at the
11 FFR-SPO We had to walk miles to get there and it
12 took about 45 minutes. The social worker got bikes for
13 me and the other foster girl but we never got to use
14 them because Mrs FFR sold them.

15 We used to have to cut peat for the fire. There was
16 no water in the house. I had to collect water from
17 a stream. The water tasted lovely. I had to carry it
18 in a bucket but I spilled most of it.

19 I didn't have to do any other chores but the other
20 foster girl did. She had to do cleaning.

21 I got on well with the FFR-SPO daughter. She
22 and I would muck about together. I didn't get on with
23 their son. He used to suck on a sweet, then offer it to
24 me when it was half done. I didn't have any toys at the
25 FFR-SPO I have never had toys in my life.

1 The FFR-SPO had a cow called Jessie. I used to
2 go and look at Jessie the cow. I loved her.

3 There was no religious instruction at the
4 FFR-SPO They didn't go to church.

5 I can't remember Christmas at the FFR-SPO
6 I think that's partly why I went crazy about making
7 Christmas great for my kids when I had a family of my
8 own.

9 I didn't know about my birthday at the FFR-SPO
10 I remember when I had grown up, I met a man and told him
11 I was 22. I was actually 24 but I still hadn't found
12 out my correct date of birth even at that age.

13 I didn't see a social worker before I went to the
14 FFR-SPO At the FFR-SPO, the social worker did
15 visit us a couple of times. She was lovely and she gave
16 us sweets. Mrs FFR told the social worker we
17 slept in their best room but we slept on the kitchen
18 floor. The social worker didn't believe me when I told
19 her that.

20 I had to call Mr and Mrs FFR-SPO mum and dad.
21 There was one time Mr came back and asked me
22 where my mother was. She was in bed with the butcher
23 and I told him that. I didn't understand what it meant.
24 Mr chased us all out of the house. I don't
25 know what happened next. Mrs FFR battered me for

1 that.

2 Mrs FFR used to say she was going to see the
3 Queen when she went out. She would lock us in the
4 house. She locked her own children in too, not just me
5 and the other foster girl.

6 If I did something wrong, Mrs FFR would slap
7 me in the face. It was a life of hell. In terms of
8 people who abused me, Mrs FFR was the worst of
9 the lot. She used to hit me with a belt, the type you
10 use to sharpen razors. I have still got a scar on my
11 leg from where she cut me when she got caught in bed
12 with the butcher. I don't know how many times she hit
13 me. I would be screaming when she did it. Belts
14 terrified me.

15 She used to get nylon stockings from men. It was
16 just after World War II. She put nylon tights on me.
17 It was to try and hide the bruises.

18 Mrs FFR beat me every other day.
19 Mrs FFR beat her own daughter too. She didn't
20 beat the other foster girl. She was timid.

21 I remember that the Queen or someone in the
22 Royal Family was getting married or engaged or
23 something. Mrs FFR was watching it on TV with
24 her pals. I said something and she picked me up and
25 dropped me on the floor. I had a sore bum for days.

1 The FFR-SPO got me up in the middle of the night
2 once. It was because I had taken the end of
3 a shepherd's crook to help get apples off the trees.
4 One of my friends had marvellous apple trees at her
5 mum's house. I left the end of the crook in a tree.
6 Mr [REDACTED] asked me where it was. I told him someone
7 had put it up in a tree. He said he would see them
8 about that but I think he knew it was me. He didn't
9 batter me, and he wouldn't let Mrs FFR [REDACTED] batter me.
10 There was an incident where Mrs FFR [REDACTED] stripped
11 me naked, strapped me and then threw me into nettles.
12 I can't remember what it was for. She dragged me out of
13 the nettles and hosed me down. There were three men
14 working there at the time and they were disgusted. That
15 was one of the times that I had to sleep in the barn,
16 scared of the stag's head.
17 I told the social worker the truth about what it was
18 like at the FFR-SPO [REDACTED] but she didn't believe me. She
19 would say, "Oh, you're an awful girl". I don't think
20 the social worker wanted to know. Even though she
21 didn't believe me, the social worker must have said
22 something to Mrs FFR [REDACTED] because I got beaten by her
23 after the social worker left.
24 The social worker took us away from the FFR-SPO [REDACTED]
25 I think she must have seen the bruises on my legs after

1 Mrs FFR beat me and threw me in the nettles.
2 I was taken away about a couple of weeks or maybe
3 a month after my last beating. The social worker came
4 for me and took me away on a train to Abelour Orphanage.
5 She didn't say why, but I think those three guys
6 reported the FFR-SPO
7 Mrs FFR used to have a saying. She would
8 say, "If you don't behave, you'll go to Abelour", so
9 I thought Abelour would be bad, but I would have gone
10 anywhere to get away from Mrs FFR "
11 From paragraph 65 to 93, 'Jane' tells of her
12 experiences in Abelour Orphanage. She was visited by
13 her older adult brother, who she met for the first time
14 when she was age 13 or 14.
15 Turning now to paragraph 94 on page 17:
16 "My brother was living in Glasgow where his
17 girlfriend was. He was living in army barracks, then he
18 got a house. He got me out of Abelour Orphanage when
19 I was 15. Although I liked Abelour, I was glad to get
20 out. My brother told me I would be leaving Abelour. He
21 wrote to tell me. The staff at Abelour Orphanage read
22 your letters but they had to give me that letter as my
23 brother was coming back to Abelour to pick me up.
24 I left about two months after my brother wrote me the
25 letter saying I was going to stay with him. I think

1 that was for Abelour to check he really was family.
2 I didn't know where any of my siblings were when I was
3 in care at Redhall, Montrose or Abelour.

4 My brother collected me from Abelour and we got
5 a train to Glasgow. My brother had a nice house. At
6 Glasgow I got taken in by my brother's girlfriend's
7 sister and her husband. They must have got checked out
8 by the social workers. I hated it at their house.
9 I was there from the age of 15 until I was 17. That was
10 when I met my husband. He was a handsome man, he looked
11 like Dean Martin. He came from Edinburgh and he used to
12 come through to Glasgow to see me. While waiting on
13 a bigger house, I had to stay at my brother's
14 girlfriend's mother's house for a while.

15 My brother's girlfriend got me a job working in
16 a factory making sausages. That was when I was staying
17 with her mother. I got paid £5 per week but I had to
18 hand it over to the mother and I just got two shillings
19 back for myself.

20 I met my mother when I was 18. She wanted to see me
21 and I wanted to see her. I wrote to my dad to get the
22 address where she stayed. I saw her at her flat in
23 Edinburgh. She was playing cards and she took me into
24 the kitchen. She asked me for money to gamble playing
25 cards. She wanted to see me again a few times after

1 that but I just ignored her. I didn't see her again
2 until I saw her in a care home when she was ill. She
3 said, 'If Christ can forgive the thieves on the cross,
4 why can't you forgive me?' I was choked, but I couldn't
5 forgive her."

6 From paragraphs 98 to 101, 'Jane' tells us about her
7 married life and children. I'm now moving to
8 paragraph 102 on page 19:

9 "I ended up running a window cleaning business with
10 my husband. After a while, we also started doing other
11 cleaning work, but it was mainly windows. He died in
12 1989 from cancer. I kept working until I was 70.

13 I am now living in a retirement flat. I am very
14 proud of all of my children. One of my sons died around
15 five years ago from cancer. One of my daughters has now
16 been diagnosed with cancer.

17 I have never really had a relationship with my
18 siblings. I did try to form a relationship with them,
19 but they didn't try. The only one I speak to now is one
20 of my brothers.

21 Since leaving care I have had a happy life, but I do
22 keep thinking about what happened to me in care. It has
23 had a big impact on me, but I didn't give in. I was
24 overprotective of my children when they were younger.
25 I lived for my family. I did used to suffer from

1 nightmares, years ago. I would think I was back in
2 care.

3 I have not made any formal report about the abuse
4 I suffered in care. I have told my children. I told my
5 dad when I lived with him when I was 16. I have never
6 had any counselling over the years since leaving care.
7 I think I just wanted to try and put it behind me.
8 I had my family and that's all that mattered.

9 I have never tried to get my records but I would
10 like to have them. I understand that Future Pathways
11 may be able to help me with that.

12 I would like the Inquiry to clarify where I was in
13 care and for how long because I am not sure about all of
14 the places I was. As a child, I didn't know how long
15 a year was, so I would like to find out exactly how long
16 I was in each place.

17 I have no objection to my witness statement being
18 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
19 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
20 true."

21 And the statement was signed by 'Jane' on 15 January
22 2020.

23 My Lady, that concludes the evidence for this
24 morning and there is another oral witness who is
25 scheduled for 2 o'clock.

1 LADY SMITH: 2 o'clock.

2 MS RATTRAY: And we hope to have a further read-in as well.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much indeed. Just before

4 I rise, you may have noticed that two foster families

5 were mentioned, very briefly, the [REDACTED] and then the

6 [REDACTED] FFR-SPO those names are not to be repeated outside

7 this room.

8 I'll rise now for the lunch break and sit again at

9 2 o'clock.

10 (12.55 pm)

11 (The luncheon adjournment)

12 (2.00 pm)

13 LADY SMITH: Good afternoon. Ms Innes, do we have the

14 witness for this afternoon ready?

15 MS INNES: We do. She is using the pseudonym 'Maisie'. She

16 was in care, in foster care, in a number of places in

17 Morayshire. We've not been able to ascertain who

18 precisely was responsible for her care. We have tried

19 to recover records from Moray, Aberdeen, Aberdeenshire

20 and Clackmannanshire all without success.

21 There is a suggestion in her statement that it could

22 lead to the responsible authority being Stirling and her

23 cypher was shared with that Local Authority prior to her

24 giving evidence, but as I say, neither we nor the

25 witness know exactly who was responsible for her care.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you for the efforts so far, Ms Innes.
2 (Pause).
3 'Maisie' (sworn)
4 LADY SMITH: 'Maisie', what I hope's an easy question for
5 you first, you're happy with me calling you 'Maisie',
6 yes?
7 A. Indeed, yes.
8 LADY SMITH: You may or may not know what the red folder is.
9 Do you understand that has your written statement in it?
10 A. That's got my statement in it.
11 LADY SMITH: But parts of it will also come up on screen --
12 A. Okay.
13 LADY SMITH: -- as we look at it and if we want you to look
14 at any other documents, they'll come up on screen as
15 well.
16 A. Right.
17 LADY SMITH: If at any time you want a break, please let me
18 know. I usually break around 3 o'clock in the afternoon
19 anyway, but if you need a break at any other time --
20 A. Thank you.
21 LADY SMITH: -- just tell me. If you have any questions or
22 any concerns, do tell, and let me help to do whatever
23 I can to make what's not the easiest task ahead of you
24 as comfortable as I can.
25 A. Thank you.

1 LADY SMITH: All right? If you're ready, I'll hand over to
2 Ms Innes and she'll take it from there. Ms Innes?
3 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.
4 Questions from Ms Innes
5 MS INNES: Now, 'Maisie' we see from your statement that you
6 were born in the year 1946; is that right?
7 A. Yes.
8 Q. You've got your statement in front of you in the folder
9 and I wonder if I could ask you to look, please, at the
10 last page.
11 A. The last page?
12 Q. Yes, page 22, and we see paragraph 98 says that you have
13 no objection to this statement being published as part
14 of the evidence to the Inquiry and you believe that the
15 facts stated in this witness statement are true.
16 I think you've signed it and it's dated 12 February
17 2020.
18 A. That's right.
19 Q. And I think you've read over your statement again
20 I think maybe yesterday --
21 A. Yesterday afternoon, yes.
22 Q. -- before coming to give evidence?
23 A. Yes.
24 Q. Okay. If I can take you back to the start of it again,
25 please, there's a heading, "Life before going into

1 care", and you say there that you have only vague
2 memories of before you went into care.

3 A. Mm-hmm.

4 Q. I think you later found your birth certificate, which
5 showed you that were born in Clackmannanshire?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. But I don't think you really remember where you were
8 until you were taken to a place in Fyvie; is that right?

9 A. I don't even remember the place in Fyvie. That was --
10 I overheard social workers at some point talking about
11 Fyvie and I had been there, but other than that, that's
12 my only recollection.

13 Q. Okay. You say that you believe that in this place in
14 Fyvie, there had been perhaps neglect and there had been
15 a report to the Cruelty --

16 A. Yes, I believe so.

17 Q. And you got that information again from overhearing --

18 A. Yes, yes.

19 Q. -- social workers discussing?

20 A. I wasn't meant to hear that.

21 Q. And you say that you overheard that discussion when you
22 were about eight?

23 A. Yes, that's right. When I was able to compute things
24 a bit better, you know.

25 Q. And then you went to a children's home called

1 Clydeville House near Buckie?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I'm going to pass over that period of time until

4 paragraph 9 of your statement, which is on page 3.

5 You tell us that you moved away from the home and

6 you say that you were taken together with somebody else

7 by a Mr FPS

8 A. That's right, Mr FPS

9 Q. And you understand that he was from the Social Services?

10 A. That's what I understood, although at that point I'd

11 only been three years old so I didn't know what Social

12 Services were, you know, but with hindsight, obviously

13 it was. But I just remember leaving -- leaving

14 Clydeville and being told just, "You'd better be a good

15 girl now", and that was my sort of counselling before

16 moving on. I was, oh, okay. So I was warned I had to

17 be good.

18 Q. You went with another girl?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Who was the other girl? Was she related to you in any

21 way or not?

22 A. No.

23 Q. Had she been at the home with you?

24 A. Yes, I think so. I think so.

25 Q. And was she about the same age as you or was she older?

1 A. No, she was about three years older than me. But I was
2 told at that point she was my sister.

3 Q. Right.

4 A. Which I knew was -- even then I knew that wasn't right,
5 you know.

6 Q. Okay. And then you moved to a family, I think they were
7 the ERF-SPO

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Can you remember your first impressions of them as
10 a family when you arrived?

11 A. It all seemed pretty normal to a three-year-old at that
12 point. It was very different, quite frightening because
13 I'd left a very sort of secure place in Clydeville where
14 I'd felt very happy in fact, and suddenly I was taken
15 from there and told, "Be a good girl", and, "This is
16 your new mother and father", but I have no major
17 recollection of the place as such, you know.

18 Q. Okay. And you say here that they had a little boy of
19 their own?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Who was around the same age as you?

22 A. [REDACTED] was about -- oh, sorry, I shouldn't say that, but
23 yeah, he was about the same age as me, roughly.

24 Q. Okay. And you've referred to your age already when you
25 went there and you say you think you were three at

1 paragraph 11 because you remember being told that you'd
2 turned four?

3 A. Yes, that's right.

4 Q. As well as the foster parents and their son, you say
5 that there were two women living in the house?

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. Who were they?

8 A. I'm not sure who they were. I assumed they were
9 relatives of either of the ERF-SPO May have been
10 younger sisters of Mrs But it was never
11 ever made quite clear who exactly they were. But they
12 were what I would have said were family. And they lived
13 there.

14 Q. Then you talk a little bit about the house and you say
15 it was in a new council estate --

16 A. Yes, yes.

17 Q. A new house.

18 A. Mm-hmm.

19 Q. Did you and the girl you went with share a room?

20 A. Yes. Shared a bed.

21 Q. Yes, I think you go on to say that at the top of the
22 next page.

23 A. All right. We shared a room, yeah.

24 Q. If you look at paragraph 13, which is on page 4, you say
25 that to begin with, of course, you were in the house,

1 you weren't old enough to go to school.

2 A. That's right.

3 Q. You were at home with the foster mother.

4 A. Mm. But I can't remember [REDACTED] being in the house at

5 that time, really, but anyway, that is -- I just

6 remember myself being there.

7 Q. Okay. Then you go on to talk about some of the things

8 that you remember about the routine with the family and

9 eventually you did start going to school, obviously,

10 while you were there.

11 A. Yes, I did.

12 Q. You talk about food and you say that you all ate the

13 same food, at paragraph 15, but there weren't enough

14 chairs so yourself and the other foster child who was

15 there had to stand at the table?

16 A. Yes, that's right.

17 Q. You say that the foster parents' son got a chair?

18 A. Oh yes, yeah.

19 Q. If we go on over the page, please, to the top of the

20 next page, page 5 and paragraph 17, you talk about

21 clothing and you say that you were given clean school

22 clothes --

23 A. Yes, that's right.

24 Q. -- so you had a school uniform.

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. But then what did you wear when you weren't in school?

2 A. Just absolute rags. I remember even at that young age
3 being very embarrassed about what I was wearing.
4 Although, I mean, people were poor after the war. You
5 know, this was post-war, so I understand there was not
6 much going around, but what I did have to wear was
7 dreadful. I sometimes had to wear [REDACTED]'s cast-off
8 trousers and things like that, which was very
9 embarrassing.

10 Q. Then you talk about school and how you got on there.
11 You say that everyone at school would have been aware
12 that you were with the foster parents, but you weren't
13 treated any differently?

14 A. No, I didn't feel -- no. I think I was still far too
15 young to take that on board.

16 Q. At the bottom of this page at paragraph 20 you talk
17 about yourself and the other girl in the home playing
18 games in the hallway and it being very cold.

19 A. Oh yes, yes, it was freezing cold. There was no
20 heating, just a coal fire in the sitting room, but we
21 weren't allowed in there. We had to play out in the
22 hallway, which included the front door, so it was
23 just -- it's very cold in the northeast.

24 Q. Yes. Was there any heating in your bedroom?

25 A. No, no.

1 Q. It was just in the sitting room? I think you say here
2 that the foster carers' son was allowed to go in the
3 sitting room whenever he wanted?

4 A. Yes. There was a massive divide between -- it was like
5 them and us. Very much so.

6 Q. And you remember a time when a visitor came and he
7 thought you were so cold that he took you in?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Okay.

10 A. It was a very kindly thing to do.

11 Q. Then at paragraph 21, you talk about what sort of toys
12 and things that you had to play with. Did you have
13 toys, can you remember?

14 A. No.

15 Q. And you say that there were no books.

16 A. No books, no. there was a comic come into the house once
17 a week and I used to try and be at the door first to get
18 it and then rush into the toilet and lock the door to be
19 the first to read it because I just was an avid reader
20 and was desperate for anything.

21 Anyway, [REDACTED] cottoned onto that and he was, "It's
22 my comic", you know.

23 Q. You then go over the page and in paragraph 22, you can't
24 recollect that --

25 A. No.

1 Q. -- you were expected to do any chores or anything?

2 A. No, no.

3 Q. You say at paragraph 23 that other than being told that

4 you were four, birthdays weren't celebrated or

5 recognised?

6 A. No, not at all.

7 Q. And you say you didn't know when your birthday was?

8 A. No, no. It's just I have such a vivid recollection of

9 that, being told I was four. I can still see myself

10 standing in the living room and being told, "Oh, you're

11 four today". Oh, that was it.

12 Q. And nothing else around it --

13 A. No, no, nothing, no, not a thing.

14 Q. At the bottom of this page at paragraph 26 there's

15 a heading, "Good memories", and you say that you

16 remember the foster mother being a nice lady?

17 A. Yes. She seemed to be quite a gentle lady. I don't

18 remember any issues with her on her own. She was just

19 lovely.

20 Q. And you refer to her being in hospital sometimes?

21 A. Yes, I think she was in hospital and I think she had

22 become ill. I don't know what the issues were, but

23 I remember her being quite poorly. I didn't go to

24 hospital or anything to visit her, but I remember her

25 coming home. But I wasn't told anything. These are

1 just my observations, you know.

2 Q. And you say that when she was away or even just out,
3 things were different in the house?

4 A. Even when she was there, if those two ladies were
5 around, they -- they sort of beat me up and punched me
6 and she didn't really stop them. That was the only
7 thing I could say about Mrs [REDACTED], against her, is
8 that she didn't stop anything happening.

9 Q. Over the top of the next page at paragraph 27, you say
10 that you never saw or heard of any of your own family
11 when you lived there.

12 A. No, no.

13 Q. After you went into care, did you have any contact with
14 your family?

15 A. No, no. None. No.

16 Q. In the next paragraph you talk about oversight and
17 inspection by the fostering authority.

18 A. Oh yes.

19 Q. You say that you remember one time going to see
20 Mr [REDACTED] FPS [REDACTED]?

21 A. Yes. I remember going into an office in Buckie, which
22 was not far from [REDACTED] just about 10 miles, I think,
23 and I don't know why I was there. I don't know if maybe
24 I had to report that I was still alive or something.
25 Maybe, you know. I have no idea why I was there, but

1 I definitely was there.

2 Q. Then you talk about a Ms Kennedy who came to visit you
3 and you think that she was with Stirling social work?

4 A. Somewhere down there, yes.

5 Q. And you say she probably visited at least once year?

6 A. Yes. I remember a big black shiny car appearing, which
7 was in itself embarrassing because nobody had a car then
8 and all of a sudden there was a big black shiny car
9 sitting on the street for everyone to see. I think
10 I must have been very self-conscious, but anyway,
11 I remember that.

12 Q. And you say that you didn't know when she was coming,
13 she would just appear?

14 A. Oh no, no, no, definitely not.

15 Q. But then you think that the foster parents must have
16 known that she was coming?

17 A. I would have assumed so, but I had no knowledge, no.

18 Q. You refer to being given better clothes to wear before
19 she came?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And you say about her going into the sitting room, were
22 you also taken into the sitting room to speak to her or
23 not?

24 A. Well, I was there with them both in the sitting room.
25 I remember that. I'm not sure if Ms Kennedy had spoken

1 to Mrs [REDACTED] beforehand or anything like that.
2 I do remember being in the same room with the two of
3 them.
4 Q. And do you remember Ms Kennedy speaking to you?
5 A. Very little. Very little.
6 Q. And you say that you were never alone with her?
7 A. No, no.
8 Q. And you talk in the next paragraph about Mrs [REDACTED]
9 wanting you to read when Ms Kennedy was there?
10 A. Yes, yes, I remember that, Mrs [REDACTED] picking up
11 a newspaper and telling me to read and being told, "She
12 how good she is, she can read", you know, so ...
13 I remember that. Just a little snippet.
14 Q. If we go down to the next paragraph at paragraph 30,
15 you've mentioned this already. You say that there was
16 a difference in treatment between --
17 A. Oh yes, a very, very marked difference. Even as a child
18 of a very young age I noticed it, yes.
19 Q. And you've mentioned about going into the sitting room
20 and such like. What other things did you notice about
21 difference in treatment?
22 A. Just a general not being -- like having to stand at the
23 table, for instance, and I think -- other than that not
24 really, but these were just little things that
25 I noticed. But I really couldn't elaborate. But there

1 was a big difference.

2 Q. You say here at the end of this paragraph that the

3 foster father, I think, was often in the garden doing

4 the vegetables. He was very fond of his little boy and

5 spent time with him playing.

6 A. Yes, that's right, yeah.

7 Q. But not with you?

8 A. I don't know, I was just told to get out of the way

9 because I would have been tramping all over his carrots

10 or something. But I did like to play in the garden.

11 And I still have a fondness for gardening. But he

12 certainly didn't encourage it.

13 Q. Then if we go over to the next page, page 8, and at

14 paragraph 31 you talk about the way that the two women

15 who lived in the house --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. You describe them as being scary. How was it that they

18 behaved towards you?

19 A. They were very big, very loud, just bullying. No -- no

20 love, no attention. Nothing. I was very frightened of

21 them.

22 Q. And you describe them slapping you.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And sometimes if you were ever in their way or near

25 them, they would hit you?

1 A. Yeah, they would give me a punch or a -- or a kick on
2 the leg even.

3 Q. And I think you said that sometimes Mrs [REDACTED] was
4 there and she did nothing --

5 A. She didn't say anything, no. At the time I remember
6 they were making hot drinks and they had sat me -- one
7 of them had sat me on the table, because I was quite
8 tiny, of course, and I don't know if they'd asked me
9 a question and I didn't answer it appropriately or how
10 they wanted it answered and I was just slapped
11 completely off the table. Which was quite shocking, you
12 know. But again that was just -- it seemed to be
13 accepted by Mrs [REDACTED] if she knew. I don't know.
14 I don't know. But they were, they were -- they were
15 both really awful.

16 Q. And you say --

17 A. They certainly didn't want me there. Maybe I had taken
18 their bedroom or something, I don't know, but we all
19 seemed to be quite squashed in because there was Mr and
20 Mrs [ERF-SPO] [REDACTED] there was [REDACTED] there was these two
21 sisters, and then there was [REDACTED] and me, and it
22 could only have been at the very most three bedrooms.
23 So maybe they had been elbowed out of their room so we
24 could be taken in. That was my sort of overall
25 impression.

1 Q. Okay.

2 A. But again that's just me, my perspective on things.

3 Q. And you say at paragraph 32 that they also called you

4 names and --

5 A. Oh gosh, yeah.

6 Q. -- made comments about your mother as well?

7 A. Yes, which I had never even knew I had a mother, but

8 when I was told I had a mother, I was told that she was

9 a whore, a word I didn't understand. I mean, I didn't

10 know how it was spelt, even, you know. It was just

11 absolutely awful.

12 Q. You say that this happened on a daily basis.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And it continued the whole time that you lived with the

15 ERF-SPO [REDACTED] ?

16 A. Yes, yes.

17 Q. And then you talk about an incident that happened with

18 Mr ERF [REDACTED]

19 A. Yeah.

20 Q. I don't know if you feel able to tell us about that?

21 A. Well, I think I'd been about five or six and it was

22 summertime because it was very light and [REDACTED] and

23 I had been put to bed and told, "Stay in bed", or

24 whatever, but I had got up to look out the window

25 because it was broad daylight and Mr ERF [REDACTED] was

1 working in the garden and he had -- he saw me and he
2 came in and came upstairs and dragged me out of my bed,
3 because I had obviously jumped in again, and dragged me
4 downstairs into the sitting room. There was a fire on,
5 so it must have been a chilly kind of evening.

6 Then he pulled me onto his knee or whatever, I think
7 I had on a nightie or pyjamas or something, but anyway,
8 he exposed me and he took the poker and put it in the
9 fire and said, "If you don't behave again, this is going
10 up inside you", and that is just imprinted in my memory.

11 I don't remember afterwards. I must have been too
12 shocked. I don't remember going back to my bed or even
13 the next day. It's just a total -- it's totally black
14 to me.

15 Q. You say in the next paragraph that we can see on the
16 screen that after that incident you hated living in the
17 house and wished that you were someone else.

18 A. Oh, I did, yes.

19 Q. You then go on at paragraph 37 to say that you think you
20 were about eight when you left that house?

21 A. Yes. I think so.

22 Q. And you think that wasn't too long after the incident
23 with the poker that you've referred to?

24 A. I think so, because I don't remember using much in the
25 way of evasive action with Mr ^{ERF} from that

1 point onwards, so whether he was away working or what,
2 but I don't remember any more of him at all.

3 Q. Then you say that you have a recollection of
4 Mrs [REDACTED] being in hospital, the two older women
5 looking after you and there being an air of tension in
6 the house?

7 A. Yes. There was.

8 Q. Then you left. Can you describe what you recall
9 happening?

10 A. When I left?

11 Q. Mm-hmm.

12 A. Mr FPS [REDACTED] came to the door, I remember Mr FPS [REDACTED] and he
13 said -- well, I didn't have much to pack anyway.
14 I could put it in a little knapsack. And he said,
15 "We're going off to [REDACTED] or something. Not saying
16 that we were leaving the ERF-SPO [REDACTED] but -- they
17 weren't there to say goodbye or anything.

18 Mrs [REDACTED] was there, but none of the others. Not
19 the sisters or anyone else. But we had obviously been
20 told we were leaving, because [REDACTED] was crying and
21 I thought: what are you crying for? Which made me think
22 that she'd had an easier time than me.

23 Q. And how did you feel about leaving?

24 A. Delighted. I had put up with so much. Mr ERF [REDACTED]
25 in particular, but the continuous abuse that I received

1 from those two -- I'll call them older sisters -- was
2 really awful. At that point I still had some hope that
3 there was a better future for me.
4 Wrong.
5 Anyway
6 Q. If we go over the page, at paragraph 40 we see that you
7 were taken to a place in [REDACTED] as you've already
8 said. What were your first impressions of that home?
9 A. Well, I was a bit hopeful. It was a nice house. There
10 was a little girl there who was very pretty and nicely
11 dressed, and the woman seemed okay. And I thought,
12 yeah, this is maybe -- this is maybe going to be a nice
13 home for me and maybe I'll get a nice mummy.
14 Q. You say that in fact you can't remember what they were
15 called or what you were asked to call them?
16 A. No.
17 Q. I think you can't really remember the foster father.
18 You think he was away quite a lot?
19 A. I don't, I just remember meeting him once or twice.
20 I think he was a fisherman and spent a lot of time at
21 sea, a deep-sea fisherman type thing.
22 Q. Okay. Again you and the other girl that you were with
23 shared a double bed in a room, you say?
24 A. Mm-hmm.
25 Q. If we go on to the next page, you say, I think, that you

1 can't really remember a lot of what the routine was.

2 At paragraph 45 you say that in relation to clothing
3 you don't think you had very many clothes.

4 A. Oh no, no.

5 Q. And you mention that you ended up wearing a boys'
6 leather jacket?

7 A. Yes, it was a jacket I'd found somewhere and I said,
8 "Shall we hand this in to the police?" because I was
9 a very good little girl, but, "No, just wear it".

10 It was okay, actually, apart from embarrassment,
11 because it was nice and warm and I used to do a lot of
12 beachcombing because the lady didn't like me in the
13 house, she wanted you out so she could clean, so it was
14 just basically if I wasn't at school, I was told to go
15 and play, so I spent a lot of time on the beach, which
16 was quite nice.

17 Q. You say that you had to go to a different school when
18 you went there?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. What was that like?

21 A. I was beginning to feel that it was a bit difficult,
22 moving, because I had left friends behind in [REDACTED]
23 that I never saw again, you know, so I had to start all
24 over. I found it difficult. I don't think I made any
25 friends at school. I spoke rather differently from the

1 northeast fisher dialect, which didn't help because
2 it -- I was an outsider, basically.

3 Q. If we go on to the next page, I think at paragraph 48
4 you talk about what you've just said, that you were
5 outside a lot of the time while she was cleaning the
6 house.

7 A. Yes. Yes.

8 Q. At paragraph 49 you talk about you and the other girl
9 who was in foster care doing chores, as in housework.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. But you say you can't remember the foster carer's own
12 daughter doing anything?

13 A. No, no. It's just that we were basically told that we
14 had to -- "You're living here and you will clean up
15 after yourselves", that was the message. Because I was
16 just a young child, I'd only been eight, nine, and
17 I would get up from the table and leave and they'd say,
18 "Get back, you've got the dishes to do", and I was quite
19 amazed because I hadn't had that to do before. So I was
20 soon roped into cleaning any mess that I would have
21 made, yes.

22 Q. Then at paragraph 50, here too you talk about birthdays
23 never being recognised or celebrated?

24 A. No, no, not at all. So I don't even know if I had
25 a birthday there.

1 Q. You talk about getting a sewing box at Christmas.

2 A. Mm.

3 Q. I think you come back to this later on.

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Was that a present from them or was it a present --

6 A. No, that was from Social Services.

7 Q. Right.

8 A. I'd asked for a sewing box and it was lovely. It was

9 really -- I was really pleased with it and I must have

10 been naughty, I don't know, but she grabbed it from me

11 and put it into the oven and the oven was on, so it all

12 melted. So that was quite a -- it was quite a trauma,

13 really. I mean, I just thought how -- how cruel can

14 people be? I don't know what I'd done wrong, I'd

15 probably done something wrong, but when you're eight or

16 nine, you don't really you know. Well, I don't

17 know what I did but I must have been naughty and that

18 was my punishment. Because she knew that was one thing

19 that made me happy.

20 Q. If we go on to the next page at paragraph 53, you say

21 that at this point there was no contact with your own

22 family.

23 A. No.

24 Q. And you were in fact told by them that you didn't have

25 a mother and a father.

1 A. That's right. And I had been told in the last place
2 that I had one and she was not a nice person.

3 Q. And you say that you were bewildered and confused by
4 that?

5 A. Very much so.

6 Q. And in relation to visits from the social worker,
7 Ms Kennedy, you can't remember any of that?

8 A. There must have been one visit when I was there because
9 she would have asked me what I wanted for Christmas.
10 She came once a year and she would ask me, so she must
11 have been that once when I got the sewing box.

12 Q. Then at paragraph 54 you talk about relationships with
13 the family and you mentioned their daughter before.
14 Were you able to form any friendship with that little
15 girl?

16 A. No. Not at all. Not -- no way at all, no. I think --
17 I don't know, there might have been a bit of resentment,
18 but I don't know. There was definitely no relationship.

19 Mind you, I didn't have much of a relationship with
20 [REDACTED] either, who was foisted on me as being my
21 sister. I don't remember any serious bonding or
22 anything. No sort of love or anything like that.

23 Q. And you say in this paragraph that you never felt part
24 of this family?

25 A. No, no, no, no.

1 Q. You were never shown any love and attention.

2 A. Never.

3 Q. And again there were differences in the way in which

4 they treated --

5 A. Yes, very much so, yeah. When I read back my statement,

6 I can see the parallels between foster care 1 and foster

7 care 2. There was a definite, definite divide where

8 I was treated differently. Treated with total lack of

9 affection, where in particular I could see [REDACTED] in

10 this one and [REDACTED] in the other one getting love,

11 getting hugs. Nothing, nothing.

12 Q. Over the next page you talk in the next paragraph about

13 the incident with the sewing box that you've told us

14 about.

15 A. Oh yes.

16 Q. At paragraph 56 you tell us that you were moved then

17 from that house and I think you said earlier in your

18 statement that you thought you were there maybe for

19 a year to 18 months?

20 A. Yes, it didn't seem long, no.

21 Q. Can you remember how you found out that you were moving

22 from there?

23 A. Again, Mr ^{FPS} [REDACTED] in his shiny black car came and picked

24 us up. And said we were going to Macduff. I was, "Oh,

25 right, where's that?" By that time I was old enough to

1 realise that again I would have to start over, start my
2 whole life over again, and that was quite daunting
3 because I had more idea of what was coming, you know,
4 new places, new faces, new teachers, new school.

5 Q. What did you feel about leaving the house in [REDACTED]?

6 A. I was really quite ambivalent about that.

7 Q. You say that Mr FPS [REDACTED] came and collected you. Can you
8 remember any discussion with him or with Ms Kennedy
9 about moving?

10 A. No, none. Nothing. Absolutely not.

11 Q. And then you moved to Macduff. I think the foster
12 carers you stayed there, Mr and Mrs ERA-ERB [REDACTED] during the
13 time you lived with them, they moved house during the
14 time that you were there.

15 A. Mm-hmm.

16 Q. So if we talk about the first house that you went to
17 when you moved to live with them, what was it like?

18 A. Yes, that was in [REDACTED] and it was quite a shock
19 because I had come from a newly-built fully electric
20 house, et cetera, and we arrived at this tiny cottage,
21 there was no electric -- there was gas lights on the
22 wall, those flaring things. There was no bathroom at
23 all. It was an outside loo. We had to sort of climb
24 almost like a ladder to get up to a bed in the attic.

25 Q. Yes, you say at the bottom of this page that you and the

1 girl that you were with -- again you'd moved together,
2 I think?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You were in the eaves of the house and you had to climb
5 up a stepladder to get there.

6 A. That's right, yes.

7 Q. You say this house wasn't cold, although you had to go
8 outside to use the toilet, as you say.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And you said it wasn't kept particularly clean --

11 A. No, it wasn't.

12 Q. -- and it was a hovel?

13 A. To my young eyes, it was messy. There was no proper
14 kitchen either. There was a sink with cold water behind
15 a curtain and I don't know what they cooked on. I can't
16 remember that. But it was -- really, it was just
17 absolutely awful, an awful place.

18 Q. Then you say that you moved to another house.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. A post-war prefabricated house.

21 A. Yes, that was sheer luxury after the first one.

22 Q. When you lived there up until this point, was it just
23 the foster parents and you and the other girl or were
24 there other people there?

25 A. Yes, at that point -- when we were in [REDACTED]

1 the first place, there were no lodgers, but when we
2 moved into the house it was in the [REDACTED] all of
3 a sudden the sitting room was taken over at night by
4 a sofa bed thing and there was a male lodger.
5 Q. Right.
6 A. Yeah.
7 Q. Did that then continue for the rest of your time with
8 this family?
9 A. Yes. There was always male lodgers from that point on.
10 Q. And were they men that were coming up to work on the
11 fishing boats or --
12 A. No. They didn't seem to do anything.
13 Q. So you say first there was the house at the [REDACTED]
14 which was the prefab house and then you moved when you
15 were 13 to another house which was a newly-built house?
16 A. That's right.
17 Q. You say there were three bedrooms upstairs but you say
18 the sleeping arrangements were the same, you and the
19 other girl were in a room together.
20 A. Yeah.
21 Q. The foster parents were in another room and then at this
22 point the third room had the lodgers in it.
23 A. It had two lodgers in it by then, yeah. Two men. Who
24 were very creepy.
25 Q. Were they the same men who stayed there for a long

1 period of time or did they change?

2 A. Yes. The one that was in the prefab house in [REDACTED]
3 [REDACTED] moved to the house in [REDACTED] but then she got
4 another lodger and he was a bit younger, I think he'd
5 maybe be 40, 50-ish, but he was quite a frightening man.
6 There was something about him. I know now that he had
7 mental health issues, but at that point I didn't
8 understand that. But he had definitely got issues. And
9 he wasn't, working either.

10 Q. Right. So there was this man who you think was 40,
11 50-ish?

12 A. Yeah.

13 Q. And you said he was younger than the other lodger?

14 A. Yeah, the other guy would be about 60-ish, I think.

15 Q. And the foster parents themselves, the ERA-ERB [REDACTED] how old
16 were they, do you know?

17 A. Well, the man I remember being told at the very
18 beginning was 72 when I arrived.

19 Q. Right.

20 A. And she was 50-ish.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. But he was definitely in his early 70s. I mean, he
23 looked an old man. You know, he had the grey moustache
24 and the pipe. Very stereotypical-looking old man.

25 Q. At this paragraph you say that when you were about 14,

1 the other girl who had been with you up until that time
2 moved out.

3 A. Yes. She moved out and got married. She was only about
4 18 but she got married.

5 Q. And at that point you moved into the foster mother's
6 bedroom and --

7 A. No, the foster mother moved into my bedroom.

8 Q. I see.

9 A. I don't know why, but all of a sudden she was there.
10 Because I thought, oh, got a bed to myself, but that
11 didn't happen, no.

12 Q. Okay.

13 A. And she was a big woman, this Mrs ERB a huge woman,
14 and very muscular. Well, to me at that age she seemed
15 that way.

16 Q. You say you stayed in that house for the next four years
17 until you were 17?

18 A. Yes, I think maybe I'd be nearer 18 than 17 because
19 I had started nurse training and so I must have been 17
20 and a half.

21 Q. Okay.

22 A. But there was an absolute dreadful incident in the house
23 between these two men where the younger guy, who I said
24 seemed to have mental health issues, he attacked the
25 older guy in the bedroom that they shared and it was

1 a total bloodbath. It was absolutely awful. I phoned
2 the police and they said to me, "You know, you really
3 shouldn't be here", so I ... after that, I decided I had
4 to make a move so I found a nice lady in the next
5 village who took me in as a lodger, just for a short
6 while, because after that I moved into the nurses' home.
7 And I had a room to myself in the nurses' home.

8 Q. You go on in your statement to talk about some of the
9 routine in this home with the ERA-ERB and at
10 paragraph 66 you remember, I think, going to a store
11 with the foster mother.

12 A. Yes, I remember that, yes. I remember that it was
13 a shop in [REDACTED] By that time I knew that the
14 clothing I was acquiring was paid by Social Services and
15 I was allowed, say, two pairs of socks and three pairs
16 of knickers and whatever was the list in those days, you
17 know.

18 Q. And you say there was a list of things that you were
19 allowed to buy.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. But there was a degree --

22 A. Because I remember her being there with the list.

23 Q. Right. You talk at paragraph 67 again about schooling.
24 So when you moved to Macduff, you changed school again
25 and initially went to Macduff Primary and then to the

1 High School there.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. How did you find school there?

4 A. I think it was quite a challenge to begin with because

5 again I was an outsider coming in and I was aware of

6 what other children were saying about me, taunting me,

7 "You don't have a mum and dad", and, "You were boarded

8 out", and silly things like that. It made me feel

9 isolated. Although I did eventually make one really

10 nice friend, but no, it was ... not an easy time,

11 actually. There was not like any respite at the school

12 from what was happening at home, you know.

13 Q. And then you say that you did exceptionally well in the

14 11 Plus?

15 A. I did, yeah.

16 Q. I think that might have meant or should have meant that

17 you would go to Banff Academy?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. But you didn't go to Banff Academy?

20 A. No, no.

21 Q. Why not?

22 A. I was told, and Social Services told me this, that

23 because I was fostered and not able to afford to go to,

24 I think, Banff Academy, it would really just be better,

25 "You'd be better off staying where you are. We can't

1 see you progressing", or -- but I'm basically told,
2 "You're not -- although you've got the intellectual
3 ability, because of your background, because of who you
4 are, you're not going", just, "Basically you're not
5 going". I wasn't given, like, an option.

6 So that was -- by that age, of course, I was very
7 aware of what was going on and that was a huge setback
8 for me.

9 Q. And you say that --

10 A. I was made to learn shorthand and typing. I wasn't very
11 good at it. Instead of -- I did have one language, but
12 if I had gone to Banff Academy, I'd have had one
13 language and I would have had Latin because it was a far
14 superior education, a very good school. But I got
15 French and bookkeeping and stuff like that.

16 Q. And you say that you left school at 15 and got a job in
17 a solicitors' office in Banff?

18 A. I did, I did. I saw a notice on the school notice board
19 and I just went for it.

20 Q. And when you started working there, did you have to give
21 any of your wages to the ERA-ERB or did you get to keep
22 your wages, can you remember?

23 A. Oh no, no, no, I had to pay. I got £3 a week and
24 I think I gave them £2 and I had £1. I had bus fares
25 and things like that. But no, no, I had to pay. I'd

1 forgotten about that, yeah. I always had to pay my way.
2 "Now that you're earning, you will ..." you know. And
3 I just took that as a given. I didn't complain about it
4 or -- I just paid.

5 Q. If we go on to page 17 and paragraph 71, I think this is
6 possibly a bit earlier in your life --

7 A. Yes, it was.

8 Q. -- because you say from the age of 11 you were sent to
9 friends' houses to do cleaning.

10 A. To clean. I didn't make a very good job of that either,
11 to be honest, but I remember trying to clean windows.
12 It was freezing cold. And I don't think the lady was
13 that impressed with me. I didn't deliberately sabotage
14 it, I should have. But anyway, I did my best. She was
15 quite a nice lady. But on the other hand I was 11 years
16 old and I was being sent out to clean her house. It's
17 quite shocking when you look at it now, you know.

18 Q. And you say it was a bed and breakfast business.

19 A. Yes, she had a slightly larger house and I think she
20 took in people for bed and breakfast. I remember doing
21 lots of dishes as well when there was things going on,
22 I'd be roped in to do the -- you know, there was like,
23 say, ten people for breakfast, I would be over there in
24 the morning to help with breakfasts and clear up and all
25 that sort of thing.

1 Q. Did you see any money for doing that?

2 A. No, no. Nothing.

3 Q. Then you go on at paragraph 72 to talk about the things

4 that you did in the house itself.

5 A. Oh yeah, yeah, yeah.

6 Q. What sort of things did you have to do in this house?

7 A. Oh, again the usual washing up, which was okay, that's

8 standard for most children, they've got to wash the

9 dishes, you know. But I had to -- on Friday night I had

10 to empty the kitchen and scrub the floor. Saturday

11 morning I had to go and do the shopping, and then when

12 I came back, I had to empty the sitting room and sweep

13 the -- no hoovers, of course -- sweep the floor, mop the

14 floor, and do the dusting. I don't remember stripping

15 the beds but I probably did.

16 Q. If we go over the page again here to the top of page 18

17 and paragraph 74, you again say that birthdays weren't

18 celebrated here either.

19 A. No, no, not at all.

20 Q. And at Christmas there was a present from Social

21 Services?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And maybe some other presents.

24 A. Yeah. At that time I did get what we call a Christmas

25 stocking with an apple, an orange and some bits and

1 pieces in it and a present from Social Services. Books.
2 I used to just get books by that point. I remember
3 getting What Katy Did and What Katy Did Next. I loved
4 them. I liked Katy.

5 Q. Then you go on at paragraph 75 to say that you got no
6 help or information from the foster mother --

7 A. No, no, no.

8 Q. And again in relation to visits, at paragraph 77 you can
9 recall a couple of visits from Ms Kennedy.

10 A. Yes, I don't remember her at all in what I call the
11 hovel in [REDACTED] I remember her in the prefab
12 house. I remember more the big shiny car sitting in the
13 road than anything else. I remember her twice, I think.

14 Q. Can you remember if she spoke to you on your own then?

15 A. No, she didn't, no.

16 Q. Was she speaking to Mrs [REDACTED] ERB ?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And were you there when she was speaking to Mrs [REDACTED] ERB
19 can you remember?

20 A. Not all the time I don't think, no. Because usually the
21 two of them would be there before I came in from school
22 or whatever. I remember coming home at lunchtime from
23 school -- at that time I was able to walk home -- and
24 they'd obviously timed it so that Ms Kennedy would see
25 me on my lunch break. But no prior knowledge of her

1 visit or anything, although Mrs **ERB** must have been
2 told. Or maybe not. Maybe she did appear out of the
3 blue on an ad hoc inspection. I doubt it, but ...
4 Q. Okay. Then at paragraphs 78 and following you go on to
5 some of the things that happened when you were in this
6 house.
7 A. Yes, yes.
8 Q. And you talk about the first lodger, I think this might
9 be the older man?
10 A. Yes, yes.
11 Q. And are you able to tell us how he behaved towards you?
12 A. Well, to me, until him creeping into my bedroom,
13 et cetera, I thought he was just quite a quiet, pleasant
14 old man who wouldn't do any harm, just, you know.
15 I think when you're a young girl and there's an older
16 man, you don't really have them in your vision as such.
17 But I don't know if he'd been out -- I think he'd been
18 out drinking because I was in bed and he'd come back and
19 he came creeping into my bedroom, because this was in
20 the prefab so my bedroom was just completely next door
21 to the sitting room and the bathroom and everything was
22 very close together. So it was quite easy for him to
23 just slip into my bedroom.
24 Q. Okay.
25 A. And again, I was quite young, about 13. 13, yeah,

1 I must have been about 13, and he was offering me
2 money for me to touch him or him to touch me. But
3 I told him to get lost. And he wasn't -- he was quite
4 a timid man in many respects, so thankfully there was no
5 major battle. But from that point on, I was very, very
6 aware that this is wrong. That's all I could think of,
7 that it was very wrong. But I didn't tell anyone,
8 of course.

9 Q. And why did you not?

10 A. Oh, I don't know, I don't know. I was at an age where
11 maybe I couldn't even articulate what was happening.
12 I don't know. It was embarrassing, maybe? I maybe felt
13 a bit of shame that -- I don't know. It just was
14 an embarrassing all over for me and I just wanted to put
15 it aside.

16 Q. Then in the next paragraph you talk about the other
17 lodger who came later.

18 A. Oh yeah, yeah.

19 Q. And how did he behave towards you?

20 A. He kind of just ignored me and I ignored him. Just
21 because he -- he -- by then I was becoming more aware of
22 these men in the house and the potential that they had
23 to damage me. I don't know how, but I just had that --
24 I don't know, it was a sort of innate warning system
25 that -- not to be trusted would be, you know, how

1 I would put it.

2 MS INNES: I'm just conscious of the time, my Lady, and

3 although I don't have too much further to go, I'm

4 conscious of the time.

5 LADY SMITH: 'Maisie', would it suit you if we just took

6 a short break now and finished your evidence after that?

7 A. I don't mind, no.

8 LADY SMITH: Five or ten minutes.

9 A. I have a train at 4 o'clock.

10 LADY SMITH: Oh, you'll catch it without difficulty. From

11 Waverley?

12 A. Yes. It's just down the hill.

13 LADY SMITH: We'll have a very short break for everybody's

14 benefit. Thank you.

15 (3.04 pm)

16 (A short break)

17 (3.12 pm)

18 LADY SMITH: Welcome back, 'Maisie'. Are you ready if we

19 carry on?

20 A. Yes, thank you.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Ms Innes.

22 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

23 Now, 'Maisie', we were at your statement and at

24 page 19 and at paragraph 80 you talk about the way that

25 the foster mother behaved towards you. How did she

1 behave towards you?

2 A. She was physically very violent. I remember one time
3 putting my shoes on without properly unfastening the
4 laces and she went totally berserk. The shoes were
5 really hard leather, proper leather-soled shoes and she
6 dragged me upstairs and made me lay on the bed and beat
7 me with my shoes until I was screaming in agony. And
8 from that point on, I was just so unhappy. And I could
9 see other houses with children playing with their
10 mothers, and I had once again landed in a place that was
11 horrific in that -- well, just horrific.

12 I remember being very sad and very unhappy about
13 that. But didn't think that I should tell somebody,
14 because I would be naughty, I had done something wrong,
15 I hadn't put my shoes on properly.

16 Q. You talk about another occasion where she punched you
17 and put your head through a window.

18 A. Yes, that was later on. We were in the prefab house at
19 that point and I -- I'd probably been cheeky, because
20 I am a fairly cheeky person anyway, and we were sitting
21 at the kitchen table, quite a big window in this prefab
22 house, and she just lashed out at me and knocked me
23 truly squarely into the window and there was a lot of
24 blood but I think that frightened her a bit, but it was
25 panic stations and she was running with cold compresses

1 and things, but it didn't need medical attention. Or if
2 it did, I didn't get it.

3 Q. And you say that the beatings from her were quite
4 regular but they became less as you got older; is that
5 right?

6 A. Yes. Maybe I avoided her more or -- I don't know.
7 Maybe I was wise enough not to ever speak out of turn or
8 that sort of thing, you know, but they did.

9 But one thing not in my statement was the fact that
10 she would instigate fights for pleasure between [REDACTED]
11 and me. She would make us fight or try and fight, make
12 us use -- "Oh, use your fists", and it was like as
13 though we were some freak show. I didn't mention that
14 in there, but I just recalled that just now.

15 Q. And you say another thing at paragraph 81 is that she
16 also locked you --

17 A. Oh she did, yes.

18 Q. And this was you were locked in the coal shed and this
19 was when you lived at the [REDACTED] so the prefab
20 house?

21 A. Yes, that's right. So I'd have been, oh, 12 at the
22 very, very, very most, I think. 12, 13. I'm not quite
23 sure, now. Maybe 10. Because I went to the same
24 school, which was primary and secondary, it's quite
25 difficult to have a cut-off point where, oh, this

1 happened before and -- you know. But I do remember

2 being in the coal shed, being locked in.

3 Q. And you say that sometimes that would be for hours in
4 the dark.

5 A. Oh yes, yeah, yeah.

6 Q. Then at paragraph 82 you deal with the foster father.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And how did he behave towards you?

9 A. Well, there was no dialogue between us, there was no
10 communication of any sort. There was the absolute bare
11 minimum of communication as far as I can recall. He
12 just used to sit in his chair by the fire with his pipe
13 and spit into the fire, because I remember it sizzling,
14 which was yucky for me at that age, I suppose, still is,
15 and he would sit with his genitals exposed just for the
16 sheer hell of it, I think.

17 He didn't say anything, he just made sure that they
18 were exposed. So that was -- and then he started saying
19 things. He had a friend, or a brother, I'm not quite
20 sure now, I think he might have been a brother,
21 an old -- an older man, anyway, more or less the same
22 age as himself, and he would make remarks to him which
23 I did not understand at the time at all but they were
24 like, "Aye, she's ready for the knife", things that were
25 like what does that mean, you know? But apparently it

1 means that I was ready to lose my virginity and I'd been
2 about 13 or 14.

3 I didn't know what it meant but I knew it was not
4 nice behaviour, very horrible behaviour.

5 Q. Then over the page on page 20 at the top of the page, so
6 in paragraphs 83 and 84, you talk about --

7 A. I talked about that, yes.

8 Q. -- leaving that house and the circumstances in which you
9 found other lodgings, I think.

10 A. Mm-hmm.

11 Q. You then say at paragraph 87 at the bottom of this page,
12 I think as you've said already, that you worked in the
13 solicitors' office for a couple of years --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- and then you decided that you wanted to do nursing
16 and you've talked about going to Aberdeen to do that.

17 A. Yes. My nursing career was good in a way because
18 because I was a student nurse, I was able to live in the
19 nurses' home and that was my home. So if I hadn't liked
20 nursing, I don't know what I would have done, but
21 I would have had to find a home as well with another
22 occupation, but luckily I did enjoy it and had nice
23 girls for company and felt more like a family in there.
24 I made some good friends. And moved away from all the
25 horrible nastiness of foster care. Sadly.

1 Q. And you say at paragraph 88 that in the 1980s you
2 studied psychology and obtained a degree.

3 A. Yes, I got my degree in psychology. And then I did --
4 I returned to nursing, but there was a vacancy at
5 [REDACTED] University and they asked me to apply and I did
6 and I got the job on the proviso that I did my Master's
7 in teaching, which I did, so I had a very fulfilling
8 career in lectureship as well as my nursing career. And
9 that was me not being allowed to go to Banff Academy,
10 but I think I was quite determined to prove myself. Not
11 to anyone, but just to prove to myself that I was able
12 to do these things.

13 Q. And did you have to go back to college and do additional
14 highers before you started your degree, for example?

15 A. No, I was very lucky because when I started my nursing
16 career, at that time you did an entrance exam.
17 Otherwise I don't know what I would have done. But at
18 that point there was an entrance exam and I went to see
19 the matron of the hospital and took me into a room and
20 did this, it was a bit like an 11 Plus type thing as
21 well, you know, general sort of thing, and she hired me
22 on the spot, basically, and said, "You can start", so
23 that is how I got into further education.

24 LADY SMITH: Because you had a nursing qualification?

25 A. Yes. That was enough to get me to wherever I wanted

1 after that.

2 MS INNES: If we go on to the next page, please, and under
3 "Impact", and I think in paragraph 93 you say:

4 "I think I have tried to turn around all the
5 negative impact from my time in care and use it in
6 a positive manner."

7 Are you able to explain to any extent how you've
8 been able to do that?

9 A. I think I've just always, always looked forward. I've
10 not looked back at all the nastiness. This is -- I've
11 always tried to prove to myself I can do things and
12 prove myself to be a very good mother as well, without
13 having any sort of teaching in that particular role.
14 I've always just tried to be a positive person.
15 I don't -- I don't like being seen as a victim at all,
16 which I'm sure many ladies would say, many men. I am
17 definitely a survivor. Whatever's happened to me
18 I think has made me stronger.

19 I try and not let it make me too hard, because you
20 can become so immune to nasty things that you could
21 appear as being a very hard person, but I don't think
22 I am, you know. In my two careers, I've never been
23 accused of that in any way, you know, and my children
24 are loving and respectful.

25 Q. If we go over the page to the final section where you

1 talk about lessons to be learned, obviously you said in
2 the section that we looked at there that you've tried to
3 turn the negative into a positive and I think you look
4 forward, as you say. Are you able to explain why you
5 came forward to the Inquiry to look back, in essence?

6 A. I know. I had been reading a lot about this Inquiry in
7 the press, et cetera, and thought, you know, it's about
8 time that you did something to hopefully mitigate things
9 for children coming behind you. So I plucked up courage
10 and thought right -- I always felt that because I was in
11 foster care and all the abuse was behind closed doors
12 that there was no one that you could -- there was no
13 witnesses. So I always felt it was absolutely pointless
14 to say anything. Even with the dire abuse that I went
15 through, especially with Mr ERF I still felt
16 that it was pointless of me.

17 But anyway, when this came up, I thought now is my
18 chance to put in my little bit into this huge pool of
19 information that you've got now, and if it helps in any
20 way, I'm more than happy.

21 But my statement will be shredded. Very soon. Yes.

22 And my children don't know I'm here. They don't
23 know about this at all. I feel that the buck stops here
24 with me.

25 Q. I think you say in this final paragraph here at 97, you

1 talk about what you've just said, that you hope no other
2 child is subjected to what you were.

3 A. Mm-hmm.

4 Q. And you specifically say that your view is that foster
5 care must be more closely monitored and children must be
6 encouraged to speak out if they're unhappy with
7 anything.

8 A. Yes, yes, yes.

9 Q. And do you think these are the main things that we
10 should learn from your experience?

11 A. Yes, yes.

12 I think I missed out teachers -- no, I did say
13 education, because there's so many agencies involved
14 that can pick up on these things and that was never done
15 with me, so there's bound to have been times where I was
16 not a normal child with what was happening, but there
17 was never anything -- nobody ever took me aside and
18 said, "Look, are you okay?" Nothing. Absolutely
19 nothing. So I don't want any other child to go through
20 that.

21 MS INNES: Okay. Thank you very much for your evidence and
22 coming forward to the Inquiry to share that with us.
23 I don't have any more questions for you.

24 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
25 questions?

1 'Maisie', that does complete all the questions we
2 have for you. Thank you so much for deciding to engage
3 with us, both for giving us your detailed written
4 statement and coming today to give oral evidence. It's
5 been enormously helpful to hear your intelligent,
6 articulate and thoughtful reflections on your time in
7 foster care, and the fairness with which you look back,
8 but rightly highlight what I need to know for my
9 purposes. I'm very grateful to you for that.

10 You mentioned you're going to shred your statement.
11 Can I just assure you that although your statement will
12 end up appearing on our website, it will be redacted to
13 protect your identity. If ever you did want to look at
14 it, it will be there, as will your transcript. You
15 don't have to.

16 A. Yes.

17 LADY SMITH: And we'll do what we can to make sure you're
18 not identifiable.

19 A. Thank you.

20 LADY SMITH: I'm now able to let you go with my thanks, and
21 you've got plenty of time to get to the station.

22 A. Sorry about that.

23 LADY SMITH: Not at all. Not at all.

24 A. It always takes me at least half an hour to find the
25 right platform. I'm not a city girl.

1 LADY SMITH: If you're going north, it will be one of the
2 platforms on the outside, one side or the other of the
3 station.
4 A. Okay, thank you. Good luck.
5 LADY SMITH: I'm sure our team will help with that.
6 A. Yes.
7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
8 (The witness withdrew)
9 LADY SMITH: I just need to remind people that there were
10 two foster families mentioned there, the ERF-SPO
11 and the ERA-ERB Their names aren't to be repeated
12 outside this room. There were also some references to
13 other children in foster homes whose names can't be
14 mentioned outside this room. At one point 'Maisie'
15 herself used her own name, but as you should have picked
16 up, that's an identity which is protected and is not to
17 be repeated.
18 So, Ms Innes.
19 MS INNES: My Lady, we have another read-in with
20 an applicant present to hear that. Ms Rattray will deal
21 with that and again I'll try to briefly speak to the
22 witness before she leaves.
23 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.
24 Whenever you're ready, Ms Rattray.
25

1 'William' (read)

2 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.

3 This is a statement of an applicant who wishes to
4 remain anonymous and has chosen the pseudonym,
5 'William'. His statement is at WIT.001.001.918.

6 The Inquiry has been unable to recover any records
7 of 'William''s time in foster care. However, from the
8 information we have, it is likely that the placing
9 authority was a predecessor of the City of Edinburgh
10 Council.

11 "My name is 'William'. At one of the children's
12 homes I was known with a different middle name and I've
13 no idea why. I was born in 1933. My contact details
14 are known to the Inquiry.

15 My birth certificate says I was born in the Western
16 General Hospital in Edinburgh. My mother was living in
17 the poorhouse at the time and I don't know if that was
18 where I was born and it was convenient to say I was born
19 in the hospital. She was taken in because she was
20 an abusive drunkard.

21 I have been given two different dates for my birth.
22 One date written in my records was in 1933 at the
23 Western General Hospital and it's from some sort of
24 register that can't be clearly made out because of how
25 it's been photocopied.

1 My father was not on the scene. I knew of him.
2 Later on when I'd left the institutions once or twice my
3 mum saw him in the distance and she crossed the road to
4 avoid him and told me he was bad. I never got to know
5 him and that upsets me to this day.

6 My oldest sibling was my sister and she was seven
7 years older than me. Then my other sisters were about
8 four years older and two years older than me. They were
9 all fostered out. There was also an older brother and
10 I don't know if he really was my brother. One of my
11 sisters told me he wasn't and he was illegitimate. He
12 may have been my mum's son by someone else.

13 My earliest memory is living in a basement flat in
14 Brunsfield. I remember sitting on a table and my
15 brother was there. He was much older and he seemed ten
16 feet tall. He was dressed in a Black Watch uniform and
17 he was a bandsman. He was going back to Libya.

18 We went up the stairs to say cheerio to each other.
19 I remember that my mother had been frying fish on the
20 open hearth. I tried to help but it came up in my face
21 and my mother heard me screaming. She got butter and
22 wrapped it all round my face. I'm not scarred, but I've
23 found I have to shave four ways to get a reasonably
24 decent shave.

25 My next recollection was being at school in the

1 Canongate. I think it was called Milton Road School
2 then. There was a wee boy I ran about with. One
3 recollection was that we ended up on London Road
4 together and I panicked that we'd gone all the way to
5 London.

6 When I was aged seven, I remember I was with my mum
7 and I was getting a bus with her. I didn't know what
8 was going on, she just told me to take my gas mask and
9 the label. The bus came to Castle Terrace. I was
10 crying as my mum wasn't going on the bus with me, but
11 I was also excited to be on a bus trip. I didn't see
12 her again until one time somebody took me to stay with
13 her and a man I called uncle, but he wasn't really
14 an uncle. That was in a flat in West Port where she
15 stayed with a man."

16 From paragraphs 8 to 17, 'William' speaks of his
17 experiences in Broomlee Evacuation Camp in West Linton.
18 While there he was introduced to the youngest of his
19 older sisters. He didn't know her.

20 Moving now to paragraph 18 on page 5:

21 "I wasn't in Broomlee for long before I was fostered
22 out. I was fostered out to people in Fife. It wasn't
23 a nice experience. I asked for the money I made from
24 the potato picking in Broomlee. I was told by the new
25 foster carers I wasn't getting it as it was to pay for

1 shoe repairs because I kept running away. I don't
2 believe that. The money was kept by the foster carers.
3 I can't recall their name.

4 I remember one particular day in the kitchen that
5 I didn't eat all the food I had in front of me.
6 I didn't like it. I got punched. I think it was the
7 mother. And my back went up against the big key that
8 was in the door. I remember that vividly.

9 I do remember having to walk to school and having to
10 go to the Salvation Army on a Sunday, but I didn't have
11 anything against them.

12 I shared a bed with a youth or a man. I know I woke
13 up every morning feeling very cold because he had all
14 the bed clothes. I don't think there was any sexual
15 abuse. I think if there was, I would have remembered or
16 been frightened. My daughter says that I told her that
17 I sometimes woke up without pyjama bottoms. I don't
18 remember that. Maybe I've blocked it out.

19 After I was fostered, I was put in the Northern
20 General Hospital in Edinburgh for a few weeks for some
21 reason and I don't know why. I wasn't ill. I think it
22 was because there was nowhere else to put me at the
23 time. I was on a ward with patients who were older."

24 From paragraphs 23 to 31, 'William' tells of his
25 time in Strathern House, Stockbridge, in Edinburgh, and

1 Middleton Evacuation Camp in Gorebridge.

2 Turning now to paragraph 32 on page 8:

3 "Then my mother took me back again. We stayed in
4 Edinburgh with an old lady who had arthritis and she was
5 bedridden. Both my mother and my father were looking
6 after her. I don't know why they wanted me back and
7 I don't know how the powers that be allowed it.
8 I wondered if they got money for having me at home.

9 They'd gone out together leaving me in the house
10 with the old lady. Then I heard a commotion on the
11 street and I saw them fall out of a tram car and they
12 were fighting. Then the door to the flat was bashed in
13 and they were in the room fighting each other.
14 I remember jumping on my father's back and telling him
15 to stop hitting my mother.

16 The next thing I remember was waking up the next
17 morning on my own and they'd done a bunk and left. Then
18 a young couple came in to take the place of my mother
19 and father and I stayed a week before another place was
20 found for me to go."

21 From paragraphs 35 to 44, 'William' speaks of his
22 experiences in Canaan Lane and Redhall Home in
23 Edinburgh, then he moved to Redhouse Home in Musselburgh
24 when he was 12 or 13 years old. He left took at 14 and
25 got a job in a paper mill in Musselburgh. He lived in

1 Redhouse in an annex for boys who were working. He paid
2 £1 for his digs and 2 pence pocket money and the rest
3 was put in the bank for him.

4 Now turning to paragraph 45 on page 10:

5 "I was working at the paper mill for six months when
6 I fell out with the foreman over an incident at work and
7 I left the job. After I left the paper mill, I went to
8 work in the gas works as an apprentice gas fitter.
9 I could have stopped on there, but I would have had to
10 go to night school to study theory.

11 I got my papers to join the Forces and I joined the
12 Navy for a seven-year stint. I had no family to be with
13 so there were no problems with being away. I was
14 allowed to continue staying at Redhouse for 14 or 15
15 months before I moved into Naval quarters to live in.
16 By the time of my first leave from the Navy, some of the
17 money I'd saved when I was at Redhouse I'd spent on good
18 clothes. I was afraid to leave the clothes at Red
19 House. I asked my mum to look after them until I next
20 came back on leave. I came back six months later and
21 she'd pawned the clothes. We fell out over this.

22 I got married for the first time and we started off
23 living in Edinburgh before moving to married Naval
24 quarters in Devonport in England.

25 Some time after I got married, my mother became

1 mentally unwell and was an inpatient at the Royal
2 Edinburgh Hospital in Morningside. I went up to her
3 flat to make sure it was secure. They hadn't made their
4 bed so I did that for them and discovered she had money
5 under the mattress. I put it into a savings book for
6 her. When she came out she called me a thief and
7 I showed her the savings book but she didn't want to see
8 me again. A long time after that, the police came to
9 find me as she was in hospital and she died soon after.

10 When I was demobbed from the Navy I came back to
11 Edinburgh and I couldn't get a job in engineering, which
12 was what I was doing in the Navy. Instead I went into
13 nursing geriatrics in a home for old people for nine
14 years. Unfortunately I was dismissed because I got
15 drunk, not on duty, it was New Year's Day and the people
16 coming in to take over from me were wishing me a happy
17 new year and giving me a wee drama. I ended up drunk
18 and dismissed because of it.

19 I wasn't unemployed for long and I ended up working
20 in the agricultural department driving a forklift truck
21 for the next nine years.

22 My first wife and I adopted a girl and a boy
23 thinking we were unable to have children. We went on to
24 have two daughters of our own and then our son. Then my
25 wife left myself and the children and she moved away.

1 I had to stop work so I could look after the children.

2 Then I managed to get a job with the drainage
3 department for the Corporation. I was there for 20-odd
4 years. I enjoyed the job but I didn't enjoy the people
5 who worked with me as they were lazy. I was made
6 a foreman and I was very strict with the other workers
7 but a lot of the time I did their job instead to make
8 sure it was done properly. I enjoyed working and I was
9 lost when I retired.

10 When my first wife left, I took an overdose. I'd
11 had a drink the night before. I woke up in hospital and
12 I was in overnight. I had no intention of doing myself
13 harm, it just happened. When she passed away, my
14 children had not had a relationship with her for several
15 decades. Following the end of my first marriage,
16 I married again and we've been happily married for many
17 years.

18 My time in care turned me into a different person to
19 the one I should have been. My education suffered.
20 I have a lot of intelligence but I don't know how to use
21 it appropriately like I should have done. In the Navy
22 I couldn't write well on paper so I didn't get promoted,
23 but people who could do the paperwork were promoted.
24 They were people who were not good at practical stuff
25 and they got promoted.

1 When I was in the Navy, I got a present sent to me
2 from my sister who I'd not seen since I was in
3 Broomlee Camp. I got an address and it turned out that
4 she and my two other sisters had been fostered out.
5 I went up to visit and it was only my youngest sister
6 left by then. Then much later on she was getting
7 married and that's when I met up with my brother and two
8 other sisters. Then the contact ceased.

9 I met them all much later on. There was no writing
10 back and forth between us. They were all like strangers
11 to me.

12 I have a cutting of an article written in 1996 about
13 me and my family. I was reunited with my eldest sister
14 and that was reported. Her daughter had originally
15 written to a newspaper to say that she was looking for
16 me. My first wife saw the article. I phoned up and one
17 thing led to another and I met up with my eldest sister.
18 There was no emotion there at all. She was a stranger
19 to me and I didn't know her.

20 My brother wasn't very forthcoming about me being
21 his wee brother. I stayed with my elder sister after we
22 met when I was on leave, but there was no emotion there.

23 Thanks to my sisters I have family photographs of us
24 together as adults at family events. I've missed having
25 a family to turn to.

1 In terms of personal relationships, with my wife
2 I had my insecurities and fear that I would lose her.
3 Even now I still feel insecure but I don't know what I'm
4 insecure about and there's always a doubt. It's
5 something I don't want to think about or explore.

6 I've had problems with alcohol. When I was in my
7 early 40s, I asked to see a psychiatrist at the Royal
8 Edinburgh Hospital in Morningside. I told her I was
9 an alcoholic and I felt insecure. No questions were
10 asked of me and nothing came of it. They were no help
11 at all. I didn't feel they were interested and I was
12 wasting my time. The issue was resolved when my wife
13 threatened to leave me and never come back. I stopped
14 drinking whisky, which was the problem. Now I drink rum
15 with water and it's just one at night and a bottle often
16 lasts for a month. I had to help myself in the end.
17 I've not had any other support.

18 I developed a dislike of Christmas and I don't
19 appreciate it even now. I'm very poor at receiving
20 gifts. I love to give, and I don't know how to react.
21 It embarrasses me. I didn't have any experience of
22 receiving gifts. I don't know if it's because of my
23 time in care, at Christmas I always feel sad because
24 I didn't know my father. I'd have liked to have
25 a father to guide me and to give me a decent upbringing.

1 I think if I'd been fortunate that way, I would have
2 progressed better in the Navy if my father had been
3 around to guide me.

4 I have no awareness of or memory of any sexual abuse
5 when I was in care, but I've always had an issue with
6 going into the gents toilets. I don't know if that is
7 relevant to any experience of my time in care.

8 At hospital appointments over the years I've been
9 asked questions about my own and my family's health and
10 I don't know the answer. I know my sisters have all
11 died from dementia.

12 I was very strict with my own children, mainly
13 because of the strict way I was brought up. I'm quite
14 ashamed of it. I never thought I would be like that,
15 and it was mainly temper that made me do it. It wasn't
16 a planned thing and it wasn't because I was regimental.
17 I just felt it was because I was told myself as a child,
18 "Don't do this and that" and only speak when I was
19 spoken to.

20 Overall, I think I was quite a good dad, but quite
21 selfish to too in a lot of ways. I think it was because
22 the jobs I had were always shift work and tiring.

23 I've never understood why I was put back in the care
24 of my mother who was an abusive alcoholic. It wouldn't
25 be allowed today.

1 I've tried to recall many things to get answers.
2 I've written to everyone I can think of in Edinburgh and
3 Fife to ask about records of my being fostered. They
4 have no record of anyone being fostered in Fife from
5 1940 onwards, which seemed odd. There must have been
6 someone fostered in that time. There are no records in
7 Edinburgh either.

8 I submitted a subject access request to the City of
9 Edinburgh Council to request my records. It wasn't
10 a straightforward process. Birthlink helped me with
11 getting records and they were very helpful to me. They
12 also helped me to put together a family tree.

13 I feel there is information missing from the records
14 I have. The authorities kept telling me it all happened
15 too long ago and no records were kept then. I felt
16 indifferent when I got them as if they didn't relate to
17 my life at all. I felt as if the records were
18 describing someone else.

19 The papers I have in my possession are my own
20 notebook of recollections and thoughts, my application
21 to get my records, information from Birthlink about my
22 family tree, records from the City of Edinburgh Council,
23 various letters from the Children and Families Team
24 about what they could and couldn't do regarding my
25 records, and information about the redress scheme.

1 I also contacted Kezia Dugdale in her role as an MSP to
2 ask for help in tracking down my records. I have also
3 previously spoken to the National Confidential Forum
4 about my experiences of being in care and I gave them
5 a statement.

6 Depending on their age, I think for children in care
7 it's important to keep your chin up and think
8 positively. If you think someone is being cruel to you
9 in care, find an appropriate person to speak to and
10 report it.

11 A lot depends on the person who is being interviewed
12 and depending on what their experience has been. If
13 their experience was bad or cruel and that person has
14 behaved badly, they are likely doing it because of the
15 cruelty they experienced.

16 I have no objection to my witness statement being
17 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
18 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
19 true."

20 And the statement was signed by 'William' on
21 23 February 2022.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

23 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, that concludes the evidence for today
24 and we will resume tomorrow at 10 o'clock with read-ins
25 and two oral witnesses.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much indeed. I'll rise now
2 until 10 o'clock tomorrow and that's the last day we'll
3 be sitting this week of course because of Thursday and
4 Friday being public holidays.

5 (3.50 pm)

6 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am
7 on Wednesday, 1 June 2022)

8 I N D E X

9	
10	Josephine Duthie (affirmed)1
11	Questions from Ms Innes2
12	George Marchmont (sworn)59
13	Questions from Ms Innes60
14	'Jane' (read)91
15	'Maisie' (sworn)104
16	Questions from Ms Innes105
17	'William' (read)152

18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

