

1 Thursday, 29 September 2022

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning.

4 We return to evidence in our foster care and
5 boarding-out case study and today we begin, as was
6 mentioned yesterday afternoon, with a read-in.

7 Is that ready to go ahead now, Ms Innes?

8 MS INNES: Yes, my Lady.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 'Erin' (read)

11 MS INNES: The first read-in this morning will be for
12 an applicant who wishes to remain anonymous and has
13 chosen the pseudonym 'Erin'. 'Erin's' statement has the
14 reference WIT-1-000000922.

15 'Erin' was initially in the care of Grampian
16 Regional Council. She had a brief period in foster care
17 when her mother was in hospital with EOI-EOJ
18 EOI-EOJ in Aberdeen from 1989 and
19 then transferred to Sheila Davies from 1989 to
20 1989.

21 She was in foster care again with EOI-EOJ
22 EOI-EOJ between 1992 and 1992,
23 and then with EWJ-SPO in Aberdeenshire
24 between 1992 and 1992.

25 Despite the involvement of carers in Aberdeenshire,

1 it is understood that Aberdeen City Council is the
2 relevant successor. Records in respect of that period
3 have been recovered from Aberdeen City Council.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 MS INNES: Turning to the statement, first of all at
6 paragraph 1:

7 "My name is 'Erin'. I was born in 1986."

8 Then moving to page 2 at paragraph 4:

9 "I was born in Edinburgh. At that time, my mother
10 was either 19 or 20 years old. My sister and brother
11 were both born after me. My sister is about two years
12 younger than me and my brother is about three years
13 younger than me. We all have different fathers. My
14 mother didn't marry any of the men who fathered myself
15 or my siblings. I only know who my brother's father
16 is."

17 From paragraphs 5 to 17, 'Erin' describes her early
18 life. She moved from Edinburgh to Aberdeen in
19 September 1986 where she stayed at Richmondhill House
20 with her mother for nearly a year. Thereafter she then
21 lived with her mother in Aberdeen.

22 Moving to page 6 and paragraph 18:

23 "During the time I was with my mother, I was placed
24 on two occasions into foster care for a period of one or
25 two days at some point in 1989. That was between the

1 ages of three and four. I think they were both
2 emergency placements when my mother was, firstly,
3 prematurely in labour with my brother and, secondly,
4 finally in labour with him. Neither of the placements
5 lasted long. I think the foster carer I was initially
6 placed with was a foster carer by the name of
7 Sheila Davies. I think that the couple I was secondly
8 placed with, [EOI-EOJ] were the same
9 family that I was placed with later on when I was just
10 turning six years old."

11 Moving over the page to paragraph 21:

12 "The first more longer term foster placement came in
13 late [redacted] 1992. I arrived there just before I turned
14 six years old. The names of the foster carers were
15 [EOI-EOJ] I stayed with them for
16 three weeks until [redacted] 1992. I believe I was placed
17 with them under an emergency foster care arrangement
18 when I was three or four. Albeit I stayed longer, that
19 was also the same arrangement when I arrived in [redacted]
20 1992. I know that where they lived was a distance away
21 from the Tillydrone area, because there were issues with
22 organising contact sessions with my mother and that was
23 where she lived at the time. There are problems noted
24 in my records surrounding my mother having to get
25 various buses to see me.

1 I don't remember a massive amount about the three
2 weeks that I stayed with [EOI-EOJ].
3 I couldn't describe the house or what the sleeping
4 arrangements were. I can remember a kitchen table,
5 [EOI-EOJ] sitting there and there being
6 lots of children in the house at the same time. There
7 were probably as many as six or seven of us there at any
8 one time. Some of these children may well have been
9 [EOI-EOJ]'s own children but I couldn't
10 say for certain. I don't remember any names of the
11 other children.

12 I remember nastiness and being called names
13 constantly whilst I was there. It was always verbal
14 abuse rather than anything else. I don't ever remember
15 being hit. Whilst I was there I was told that I was
16 fat, stupid, pathetic and worthless by both
17 [EOJ] and [EOI]. I felt belittled
18 and humiliated. [EOJ] was definitely worse.
19 I remember her having a foul mouth on her.

20 [EOI] wasn't as bad but he was still nasty.
21 I can remember the day I left that foster care
22 placement. I had a bag with me and [EOJ] said
23 'Thank fuck you are going, who would want you anyway?'
24 That is the most vivid memory I have from my time there.

25 [EOJ] is now dead but I understand from the

1 police that EOI [REDACTED] is still alive. I have been
2 told by the Crown that they are looking to prosecute him
3 with something concerning children who have been in his
4 care in the past. I understand from what the police
5 have told me that the verbal abuse I suffered is
6 a running theme in terms of what they are hearing from
7 other people they have spoken with who were in EOI-EOJ
8 EOI-EOJ [REDACTED] care.

9 The reason I left the placement with EOI-EOJ [REDACTED]
10 EOI-EOJ [REDACTED] was because it was an emergency
11 placement. I can see from my records a note of me
12 saying that I did not want to stay or be returned to
13 EOI-EOJ [REDACTED]. There is no further
14 clarification surrounding that. I appear to have been
15 told I wouldn't be going back to them so I think I felt
16 that was fine at the time.

17 The second more longer term placement began on
18 [REDACTED] 1992. The foster carers were a couple called
19 EWJ [REDACTED] and a man whose surname was [REDACTED]. I don't
20 know his first name, but I think it began with a [REDACTED].
21 They had a daughter. I know that because I can see from
22 the records that I have that haven't been properly
23 redacted. I do know that EWJ-SPO [REDACTED] house was
24 a distance away from the Tillydrone area because there
25 were again issues with organising contact sessions with

1 my mother and that was where she lived at that time.

2 I stayed with EWJ-SPO until either [REDACTED]
3 1992 when I was aged six years old. I think the
4 placement was more permanent than an emergency one.

5 I don't remember a massive amount from my time with
6 EWJ-SPO. I have some small memories but the majority
7 of what I know has come from my records. Most of the
8 records I have recovered appear to have come from the
9 period of time I was there. Looking back, I think my
10 basic needs were met. I think food was an issue on the
11 side of EWJ-SPO. It is constantly mentioned in my
12 records that I would help myself to food to comfort eat.
13 That was especially so after home visits.

14 I remember not being able to join in on the family
15 activities when I was with EWJ-SPO. My records say
16 that I was taken on holiday with EWJ-SPO towards the
17 end of my placement but I don't remember that happening
18 and couldn't say where we went. It would have more than
19 likely been in the UK because I didn't get a passport
20 until adult life and I doubt my mother at that time
21 would have allowed me to get one. It is noted in my
22 records that we would be away so we would be
23 uncontactable. Later on there is a note saying that my
24 time away on the holiday had solidified my place within
25 the family for me. Feeling part of the family isn't

1 something I ever remember feeling during my time with

2 EWJ-SPO

3 There is a lot of information surrounding how

4 I supposedly stole out of EWJ's child's piggy

5 bank but no description surrounding how this was

6 supposedly discovered or me being found with the money.

7 It almost looks as if it has been assumed that because

8 I was there I must have been the cause of it.

9 I found reading through the records from my time at

10 EWJ-SPO quite hard. EWJ-SPO were sitting there with

11 a six-year-old child and saying things like I needed

12 firm boundaries because I would run riot, was

13 overaffectionate and had to be repeatedly told not to

14 smother adults with affection. Looking back on those

15 entries in my records, Social Services had taken

16 a six-year-old child from a family where they were

17 constantly told they were a problem, then placing them

18 with another one who were saying the exact same thing.

19 EWJ-SPO were saying those things about a child who was

20 active, wanting to play with things and just doing what

21 six-year-olds do. It was a situation where I was being

22 blamed for everybody else's behaviour. That situation

23 would be repeated constantly later on in my time in

24 care.

25 I have a memory that might be from my time with the

1 [REDACTED] but it could well have been during my time with
2 [REDACTED]. Logic would dictate that it
3 was with [REDACTED] because it surrounds my birthday and
4 I think that came after I was moved.

5 I remember getting new clothes for my birthday that
6 were too small. EWJ [REDACTED] said, if it was her, 'Oh,
7 you're too fat for those, they will need to go to our
8 daughter instead'."

9 LADY SMITH: Just one moment. Is there a problem with the
10 display? (Pause)

11 If you just want to note, Ms Innes, this began at
12 the beginning of paragraph 31, I think it was.

13 (Pause)

14 Shall I adjourn to see if you can sort this out?

15 I'm so sorry, there's a technical problem that's
16 cropped up that we weren't anticipating. Hopefully it
17 won't take too long to sort out, but rather than have
18 our excellent people here do it under my scrutiny, I'll
19 just adjourn.

20 (10.14 am)

21 (A short break)

22 (10.29 am)

23 LADY SMITH: I'm so sorry for that delay, but the matter now
24 seems to have been resolved and I'm hoping we won't have
25 any more hiccups.

1 Can we maybe just go back to the beginning of 31,

2 Ms Innes. I think that would make sense.

3 MS INNES: Yes, my Lady:

4 "I have a memory that might be from my time with the

5 EWJ-SPO but it could well have been during my time with

6 EOJ-EOJ. Logic would dictate that it

7 was with EWJ-SPO because it surrounds my birthday and

8 I think that came after I was moved. I remember getting

9 new clothes for my birthday that were too small.

10 EWJ said, if it was her, 'Oh, you're too fat for

11 those, they will need to go to our daughter instead'.

12 There is an entry amongst my records reporting that

13 during a home visit to my mother I had told her that

14 EWJ had smacked me. I remember being punished

15 when I was at EWJ-SPO and receiving a skelp on the

16 backside so that ties in. There follows notes about

17 EWJ being asked about that. The records note

18 her admitting that she had hit me and saying it was

19 a slight tap like she did with her own children. There

20 follows a note of her being told by a social worker that

21 her behaviour wasn't appropriate when she wasn't the

22 parent.

23 Contact with my mother initially happened three

24 times a week during my time with EWJ-SPO. That went

25 down to once a week after she declared she wasn't having

1 me back in Aberdeen and wanted me placed in Edinburgh
2 instead. At that point social workers started contact
3 with my grandmother. That was done to build up
4 a relationship in preparation for me being ultimately
5 moved down there. Towards the end of my time at the
6 EWJ-SPO there was a hearing in front of a full fostering
7 and adoption panel.

8 I can see that there are a lot of comments in my
9 records around that time concerning my grandmother
10 potentially facilitating an early return of me to my
11 mother. There are a lot of comments surrounding that
12 there might be a breakdown in communication which might
13 lead to issues for me later on. There are also notes
14 that show that Social Services were aware of the
15 problems my mother had had growing up when staying with
16 my grandmother and the issues between my mother and my
17 grandmother that led to us going up to Aberdeen. Even
18 with that knowledge it was decided by the panel that
19 I should be fostered by my grandmother."

20 Pausing there, my Lady, 'Erin' was then placed with
21 her grandmother in Edinburgh. The legal basis for this
22 was a condition of residence and a supervision
23 requirement dated [REDACTED] 1992. It had been
24 approved by the fostering and adoption panel in Grampian
25 on [REDACTED] 1992 but it was not a fostering

1 arrangement.

2 LADY SMITH: Right.

3 MS INNES: No fostering allowance was paid and the intention
4 was that the grandmother would seek custody or adopt.
5 When the supervision requirement was reviewed a year
6 later on [REDACTED] 1993, it was terminated and 'Erin'
7 was formally discharged from care to her grandmother.

8 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

9 MS INNES: From paragraphs 36 to 39 of her statement, 'Erin'
10 refers to the time that she lived with her grandmother.
11 She was then taken into care again and went to
12 Greendykes Young People's Centre. [REDACTED] Secondary Institutions - to be publis

13 [REDACTED] Secondary Institutions - to be published later

14 [REDACTED]
15 [REDACTED] Secondary Institutions - to be published later

16 From paragraphs 111 to 123 she speaks of her life
17 after being in care. She then goes on to discuss the
18 impact which her experiences have had on her, both in
19 care and through the time she lived with her
20 grandmother. She says that she feels massively let down
21 and failed by the systems which should have protected
22 her. She describes being left with a lifetime of mental
23 health issues. She speaks of the effect on her
24 education, her ability to work and her ability to
25 parent.

1 She goes on to describe the treatment and support
2 which she has sought. She tells of her involvement in
3 campaigning to overcome stigma and misinformation in
4 relation to self-harm.

5 Moving on now to page 40, paragraph 138, where
6 'Erin' speaks of reporting abuse to the police:

7 "I have been asked to provide a statement about what
8 happened during my time in foster care on two occasions
9 to the police. The first time there was police
10 involvement was either in 2016 or 2017. I know that
11 because it was shortly after I had moved to a new house
12 in Niddrie. Two police officers initially visited my
13 grandmother's house before she sent them to my house.
14 The police wanted to speak to me about my first
15 emergency placement with Sheila Davies when my mother
16 went into premature labour with my brother. It was
17 definitely a placement where I had only been with the
18 foster parents for a day or two. They wanted to know
19 what I remembered about Sheila Davies and her
20 relationship with her daughter. Seemingly
21 Sheila Davies's daughter had made a complaint against
22 her mother.

23 The police officers were from Aberdeen and had
24 travelled all the way down to speak to me. I didn't
25 know what to say to them at that time. I didn't have

1 much to tell them because I didn't know anything. All
2 we could work out was that I would have been on the
3 placement they were referring to when I was two or three
4 years old. I don't think they took a statement.
5 I think the conversation was more surrounding that I was
6 so young that I had no memories.

7 I ended up giving the police officers the Aberdeen
8 care records I had from my time in care. I handed over
9 my records more because of my concerns surrounding my
10 niece at that time. I wanted to show the police what my
11 mother was like when she was looking after children,
12 I wanted to show them that they should be concerned
13 about my niece's safety. Although sadly things had
14 happened to my niece, I did ultimately manage to make
15 sure that my niece and also my nephew never went back to
16 my mother's house. I haven't a clue what happened after
17 I spoke to the police on that occasion concerning the
18 foster carers they wanted to speak to me about.

19 Then the next time I spoke to the police was in
20 January 2021. Some people had reported EOI-EOJ
21 EOI-EOJ as being abusive whilst in their care
22 and they were in the process of contacting all the
23 people who had been fostered by them to obtain further
24 evidence. That led to the police wanting to speak to
25 me. The police phoned me out of the blue in

1 January 2021. The police making the enquiries were from
2 Aberdeen. They wanted to take a statement over the
3 phone from me there and then, but I wasn't able to do
4 that because I had my kids around. I remember that
5 I had to call a friend after the call because it all
6 came so sudden and I needed some support. It felt a bit
7 much because at that time I had only just started the
8 process of obtaining my records again. I was phoned
9 back by the police 25 January 2021. That's when
10 I provided a statement to a male police officer over the
11 phone. After providing my statement the police officer
12 informed me that EOJ [REDACTED] had recently died and
13 that it was EOJ [REDACTED] they were looking into.

14 The next time I heard from the police was a week
15 before Christmas in 2021. I received a letter asking me
16 for my availability between March 2022 and May 2023
17 because they may be pursuing a prosecution against
18 EOJ [REDACTED]. Apparently if the trial goes ahead it
19 is going to be held in Glasgow. The next thing
20 I received was a text on Christmas Day 2021 asking me to
21 make sure that I had sent them back the paperwork which
22 they had sent asking me to detail when I would be
23 available. I think the text only came three days after
24 receiving the letter. When I tried to phone the police
25 to tell them that I felt texting me on Christmas Day was

1 totally inappropriate all I could get through to was
2 a recorded message saying I could leave a voicemail.

3 The police's procedure surrounding contacting
4 persons who have been abused in care needs to change.
5 Receiving the letter I received the week before
6 Christmas and the text I received on Christmas Day
7 concerning their attempt to prosecute EOI
8 was totally inappropriate. The way they handled their
9 communication with me was all too much in amongst the
10 other things that were going on in my life at that time.

11 The only other time I have reported my care history
12 and the abuse I experienced is with the Inquiry. I have
13 been the most candid I have ever been with anyone when
14 providing this statement. I think that is partly
15 because those interviewing me are relative strangers.

16 I am attempting to recover my records to help the
17 process of filling in so many of the blanks that I have
18 when it comes to my childhood. There are so many things
19 that I just don't know. I want to see what answers
20 I can get and know more about me. I need to try and
21 understand why I am the way I am. I want to know why
22 I parent the way I parent. Another part of why I am
23 recovering all of my records is in anticipation of
24 applying to the redress scheme. I am trying to get all
25 of my ducks in a row before I go down that route.

1 I initially obtained my records from Aberdeen
2 Council when I was 21 in 2007. I think they were only
3 half of my records. I thought I had lost that set of
4 records so I applied for another copy. When I reapplied
5 for my records, Aberdeen Council were completely on the
6 ball. I had my redacted records within a month and had
7 no problems obtaining them. Apparently Aberdeen Council
8 have digitalised a lot of their records so that is why
9 they could provide them so quickly. The only issue
10 I have with the records that were provided is that there
11 are parts missing and the redaction isn't great. Parts
12 of them are redacted so poorly I am able to work out
13 what is being said. Fortunately, I found the copy
14 I obtained in 2007 and I am in the process of comparing
15 and contrasting them with the copy I more recently
16 obtained to find out what is missing.

17 Birthlink are in the process of helping me obtain
18 the records I haven't already recovered. I started that
19 process in the middle of 2020. I am currently on
20 a waiting list for my Edinburgh Council social work
21 records. As yet they haven't confirmed whether they
22 have them or not. I have been in a queue for a year and
23 they haven't got round to recovering mine yet. I have
24 been told that it will be six to nine months further
25 before they will become available, if at all.

1 My Edinburgh Council records should have been done
2 by now. Edinburgh Council have blamed Covid for it
3 taking so long. I have been told that none of the
4 records are digitalised, are still all on paper and they
5 need to get into storage to recover them. I have also
6 been told that it will take time to undertake the
7 redaction of what they recover."

8 Moving to paragraph 151:

9 "The experience of being placed in care is
10 horrendous. You are taken from the only place you know
11 and put into a place where you know nobody and are
12 looked after by strangers. When I look back on my
13 experiences in care the big thing I think that can be
14 learned is how not to look after children in care.
15 There were so many points in my childhood where someone
16 could have stepped in and so many points when they
17 didn't. The things that happened were allowed to happen
18 because of all of the failures along the way.

19 People were allowed to make decisions about things
20 that were going to happen to me without taking me into
21 consideration. There are things in my records where
22 people are noting that they didn't think it was
23 appropriate to discuss certain things in order not to
24 damage my coping abilities at that particular time.
25 There are notes surrounding things considering what

1 would happen if things didn't go the way they were meant
2 to go. There are reports that describe me as a bright,
3 bubbly, energetic six-year-old. When I read my records
4 I can't help but think how those who were supposed to
5 care for me took that and turned me into what I am now.
6 Why did other people get to decide that?

7 Social workers have a lot to answer for. They were
8 the ones who made choices throughout my childhood, their
9 decisions regarding my care have left me with a lifetime
10 of mental health issues that I will never get over.
11 They were the ones who placed me in the places I was.
12 None of them have had to answer for their decisions.
13 They were the ones who left me with my mother who had
14 a history of suffering abuse herself, then placed me
15 with my grandmother who had a history of not stopping
16 abuse happening within the family. They left me with my
17 family when they shouldn't have, even although they knew
18 there was a risk of abuse happening and put me in care
19 in inappropriate places."

20 Moving on to page 45 and paragraph 155.

21 For me, poor decision is not just the carers, foster
22 carers or social workers involved. It also concerns the
23 various panels who made decisions surrounding my care.
24 The adoption and fostering panel I was involved with
25 knew all about the issues between my mother and

1 grandmother but decided to place me with my grandmother.
2 I wish someone had stepped in there but they didn't.
3 I just don't know how the people on these panels and
4 the social workers involved with me made the wrong
5 decisions and screwed it up so many times. If it hadn't
6 been for the decisions that were made early on then
7 I might not be where I am now. I might have been better
8 or I might have been worse. At the end of the day
9 either way nobody gave me a chance. Nobody protected
10 me, looked out for me or tried to make things better."
11 Moving on to page 46 and paragraph 159:
12 "I am less than positive about GIRFEC and SHANARRI.
13 To me GIRFEC is just something that allows the net to be
14 stretched further than it should be. You can't keep
15 stretching the net further and further until it rips.
16 My experience of being a child and adult involved with
17 social workers is that those children who are at highest
18 risk are known to Social Services. I have repeatedly
19 seen social workers failing children who are at risk.
20 GIRFEC is used to dump all those children in that net in
21 the hope that those children at risk are caught. The
22 solution isn't GIRFEC. The solution is that as soon as
23 a child is known to be at risk then Social Services need
24 to deal with it. Children shouldn't be left with
25 abusive carers and families in the hope that things will

1 get better or because there is a lack of foster carers.
2 That just leads to situations where children are abused
3 or end up dead. But having mental health issues and
4 showing a willingness and ability to change is not
5 a risk factor."

6 Moving down to paragraph 161:

7 "I was basically told that everything I knew to be
8 true was a lie when I tried to report things. In my
9 experience children are never believed. I had the
10 belief as a child that I would never be believed because
11 I never had been. I'd tried to report things to various
12 people in the past and I hadn't been believed. Nothing
13 ended up being done. There needs to be more balance
14 when it comes to listening to children in care. It
15 shouldn't be that children aren't believed because it is
16 assumed that they lie. If there is someone available to
17 report things to and a child makes a report then that
18 needs to be taken seriously. Any report needs to be
19 investigated fully.

20 There were so many opportunities for people of all
21 sorts to step in and report things on my behalf during
22 my childhood. There has to be a whistle-blowing system
23 in place that doesn't cause issues for those who want to
24 whistle blow. People shouldn't feel scared to report
25 things when they see them. I was once reported as

1 a parent for shouting at my eldest when I was in the
2 street. When I look back, I think good on the person
3 who did that. The person who saw me shouting didn't see
4 that a minute earlier my eldest had run into the street
5 and had almost been run over by a bus. Yes, I did
6 scream and shout at him but I would much prefer he
7 learnt a lesson from that than be flattened by a bus.
8 That person wouldn't have known that and they wouldn't
9 have known whether he would be safe going back to the
10 home where he lived. That report put me through hell
11 but I much prefer that than another situation like my
12 niece or myself. People like that woman should feel
13 free to come forward whatever the consequences.

14 All staff involved in the care of children need to
15 be accountable. There needs to be a whole vetting
16 process for those who want to become a social worker,
17 carer or foster carer. They need to be vetted to the
18 highest level. If there is the slightest hint of
19 impropriety then that individual needs to be removed.
20 Get rid of them. They are not needed if they are like
21 that. If a foster carer has children who they have
22 failed that are their own biological children or adopted
23 then they shouldn't be given someone else's."

24 Moving on to page 49 and paragraph 169:

25 "I think that society needs to get rid of group

1 homes. They serve no purpose these days other than to
2 label the child. There are enough people in this world,
3 or should be enough people in this world, who are
4 willing to become foster parents. Every child should be
5 with a foster family so that that child feels part of
6 a family. I know foster carers who are amazing people
7 and carers. A lot of them go on to adopt the children
8 that they foster. They're the kind of people who need
9 to be looking after children, not staff in group homes
10 or foster parents who take in large volumes of children
11 under emergency placements. I appreciate that not every
12 foster family will be good but that should be managed by
13 the vetting process. That system would be better than
14 having a group home system because there needs to be
15 more staff involved in the care of children and
16 therefore more possibility for abuse. I also think that
17 where there is an increased number of people involved
18 there is less accountability."

19 Moving on to page 50 and paragraph 172:

20 "I know that some of the stuff I have spoken about
21 in this statement is minor in comparison to other
22 people. However, even with what I experienced I still
23 think that society needs to change. My experience of
24 care was that people thought that it was the child's
25 fault that they were in care. That needs to be changed.

1 I grew up being told by everybody, whether they be
2 family, police, staff in the care homes or teachers,
3 that I shouldn't be believed and that I needed to stop
4 lying. I want people to now believe and listen to me.
5 I want people to answer for what they did. My hope is
6 that the whole system changes. Everything needs to be
7 looked at from top to bottom. It would be good if one
8 of the recommendations from this Inquiry was to get rid
9 of GIRFEC and SHANARRI. They don't get it right for any
10 child, never mind every child. Most of all though
11 I want this Inquiry to change things so that children in
12 care can feel safe. I want children to be children,
13 I want children to have a childhood and then have a life
14 afterwards.

15 I have no objection to my witness statement being
16 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
17 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
18 draw."

19 'Erin' signed her statement on 28 February 2022.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Ms Innes.

21 Before we move on, I should just mention in passing
22 that names of foster carers, the EOI-EOJ and EWJ-SPO
23 were used during that read-in and they are protected by
24 my general restriction order. These people can't be
25 identified outside this room.

1 We are moving on to another read-in, are we?

2 MS INNES: Yes, Ms Rattray will deal with this, my Lady.

3 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray, when you're ready.

4 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.

5 'Linda' (read)

6 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, this is a statement of an applicant

7 who has the cypher FDL and wishes to remain anonymous

8 and has the pseudonym 'Linda'.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 MS RATTRAY: Her statement is at WIT.001.002.2551. 'Linda'

11 was in the care of Glasgow City Council. She was in

12 three foster placements in Glasgow.

13 The first with foster carers from around 2004 to

14 2008.

15 The second with foster carers who have the

16 pseudonyms 'Dylan' and 'Clair', who were the son and

17 daughter-in-law of the previous foster carers, but that

18 was only for a few days.

19 'Linda' was then moved to the third set of foster

20 carers, who were a couple who were the daughter and

21 son-in-law of the first foster carers. The daughter has

22 the pseudonym 'Susan' and that was from around 2004 to

23 early 2015.

24 We've been unable to recover children's records and

25 accordingly the dates are approximate.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, this is a particularly lengthy
3 statement and in line with all our read-ins we do edit
4 them.

5 LADY SMITH: Of course.

6 MS RATTRAY: So there has been editing here, but in this
7 particular statement, for example it may not simply be
8 not reading out certain sections, but it may also be
9 that I'll jump from one sentence in one paragraph to
10 another.

11 LADY SMITH: That's all right.

12 MS RATTRAY: So it may well be difficult to follow if one is
13 trying to read it at the same time, so I'll just perhaps
14 warn my colleagues of that.

15 LADY SMITH: I'm sure the team behind you are up for that
16 challenge.

17 Let me know if you need us to slow down while you
18 catch up.

19 MS RATTRAY: Thank you.

20 "My name is 'Linda'. I was born in 1988. My
21 contact details are known to the Inquiry."

22 From paragraphs 3 to 11, 'Linda' speaks of her life
23 before care. She lived in Glasgow with her parents and
24 younger sister and brother. Her parents were physically
25 abusive. Her dad went into prison. Her mum took drugs

1 and drank a lot. The children were left alone for long
2 periods. The social work department were involved with
3 the family.

4 Moving now to paragraph 12 on page 3:

5 "I remember social workers speaking to my mum in the
6 house and then telling me that I was going away.
7 I don't remember how it was put to me. They took me, my
8 sister and brother away. I remember sitting in the
9 Parkhead social work office for a really long time.
10 They had a huge playroom full of toys and I took one of
11 the toys, a wee toy computer from McDonald's, with me
12 when we left. I had that wee toy for ages.

13 I don't remember being transferred from Parkhead to
14 the foster carers' house. I just remember getting
15 there. My sister and I were taken to the same house.
16 I was about five and she was probably just turning four.
17 We were separated from our brother. He was a newborn
18 baby. I don't think they could find anywhere for us all
19 to be together.

20 The foster parents fostered children for about 20
21 years. I think they were both in their 60s. They were
22 Glasgow City Council foster carers.

23 The foster mother was really nice. She was so
24 different from my mum. I liked her because she was
25 strict. I think when someone is strict you have quite

1 a lot of respect for them. She was quite approachable
2 as well. She had white hair in a bob and quite
3 a wrinkly face. She smoked quite a lot and started
4 using an E-cig later on. I really liked her until later
5 on when I was a teenager and her daughter was my foster
6 carer.

7 The foster father worked [REDACTED]
8 [REDACTED] He was bald on top and sometimes had hair growing
9 round the side and back of his head. He always had
10 a thick white moustache. He was chubby and had a pin in
11 his leg. He had broken his leg and couldn't bend it, so
12 he walked with a limp.

13 They lived in one of those buildings that has one
14 house upstairs and one downstairs. Their house was on
15 the ground floor and had a front and back garden. There
16 were three bedrooms. It was really clean and tidy. It
17 was so different from my mum's. There was never much
18 lying about until my sister and I came in and messed it
19 up. I don't remember much about the colours in the
20 place, except the lime green living room. I loved that
21 colour.

22 The foster parents' daughter, 'Susan' [that's
23 a pseudonym, my Lady] and her husband were also foster
24 carers, as was their son, 'Dylan' and his partner
25 'Clair' [these two are pseudonyms]. I never understood

1 why they all fostered. I think it was for money. The
2 foster father was the only one who worked.

3 I remember being really happy when I first arrived
4 because the foster parents had dogs. I had never had
5 dogs in my life. One was a cavalier and the other was
6 a westie. I just loved them.

7 I remember being shown my room, there were two beds
8 in the room that my sister and I were to share. One of
9 the beds had a metal frame which was quite ornate. It
10 had loads of different leaves on it and there were bars
11 on one side. The other bed was just a wooden one.
12 I picked the fancy one.

13 There wasn't really anything for us to play with
14 when we arrived. We went to sleep and when we got up
15 the next morning there were loads of clothes and toys on
16 the couch. There were two big soft toys, a lion and
17 a panda. We weren't used to getting things like that.
18 It was amazing. It was so exciting. I remember it so
19 well. We didn't have any clothes when we arrived, so
20 I suppose they had to get us those out of necessity.

21 The foster mother used to get us up in the mornings.
22 She woke up about 6 o'clock and took the dogs out and
23 then she woke us up. I didn't like getting up in the
24 morning. I used to sleep in and she would come in and
25 shout to get me up.

1 We would get breakfast before leaving for school.

2 We got ourselves dressed. The foster mother used to do
3 our ties. She would tell us to brush our teeth but not
4 every single day. That was never really drummed into
5 us.

6 I think we played for a wee bit in the evening after
7 our dinner and then we would get put to bed at
8 7 o'clock. We got to watch a DVD every night. My
9 sister would pick the film one night and I would pick
10 the next. We had a TV with a built-in DVD player in our
11 room. The foster mother would put them on for us and
12 then come in later to check on us. We'd fall asleep
13 while it was still on sometimes. I had no difficulties
14 with sleeping before the foster father started abusing
15 me.

16 We were too young to know how to get washed
17 ourselves so the foster mother used to take us into
18 a shower to get washed once or twice a week.

19 We used to get Weetabix, Rice Krispies or Cornflakes
20 for breakfast. We never got really sugary stuff. The
21 foster mother was into her vitamins so she would make us
22 take healthy drinks. It was Actimel, but we called it
23 our healthy drink. We used to get one of those in the
24 morning.

25 I would go home from school and get dinner around

1 4 o'clock. The meals were your normal comfort food.
2 I quite enjoyed the food, except for the potatoes. We
3 got totties with every meal. We would get beans,
4 potatoes and something else all the time. I hated
5 totties by the end of it.

6 When we first moved in, we would eat our dinner on
7 the couch. They got a dining table later on. I used to
8 try and hide the potatoes, especially the ones with the
9 skins on, under the table or feed them to the dogs. If
10 I couldn't get the dogs to eat them I would just eat
11 them because I didn't want the foster mother to moan.
12 She would tell me there would be no pudding for me if
13 I didn't eat them, so I ate them. She mostly ate with
14 me and my sister. The foster father would be there too
15 sometimes if he wasn't at work.

16 I think the foster mother was a wee bit affectionate
17 towards us. I don't really remember her kissing us good
18 night or anything like that. She might have done
19 sometimes. I only have one very clear memory of her
20 cuddling me when I was upset. I think she did give us
21 a wee cuddle at other times, but I don't remember her
22 doing that. I liked her because you could go to her
23 when you were upset but she was a bit scary at times.
24 I think I was a bit scared of her. When she shouted,
25 you knew she wasn't really that angry, but when she was

1 silent, that's when you knew she was very angry.

2 I'd started school before I went into care but my
3 mum never took me very often. I don't remember having
4 any friends at school.

5 I don't think I went to school straight away when
6 I moved to the foster parents but I did return to the
7 same school. It was about a 20-minute drive away.
8 I think social work arranged for someone to take me to
9 and from the school. I don't remember the woman's name
10 but we had her for a long time. I remember being quite
11 sad when things changed. She used to play the same
12 music tape every day in the car. I can't remember what
13 it was but I loved it. My sister used to come in the
14 car too. I think she was in nursery at that point.

15 I remember trying to learn tens and units at school
16 and I couldn't do it. I think I was in primary 2 by
17 then. I had missed so much even by that point. I found
18 it really difficult and no matter how hard I tried
19 I just couldn't grasp it. I remember crumpling up my
20 paper and putting it at the back of the library. My
21 teacher was nice. I did enjoy school, but I found it
22 difficult.

23 I think it was Primary 3 when we moved to the new
24 school, close to the foster parents' house. Both my
25 sister and I were sent there. We were smartly presented

1 going to school. The foster mother used to walk us up
2 to the school with the dogs in the morning at first.
3 Once we knew our way, she would take the cut off into
4 the park and we'd walk the rest of the way ourselves.
5 It was only a ten minute walk.

6 I liked the new school at first. I made a friend.
7 My sister and I got really bad nits again at one point,
8 which were difficult to get rid of. The foster mother
9 used to bone comb our hair, she felt so bad at having to
10 do it but there was nothing else she could do. She used
11 to always do mine and my sister's hair slicked back with
12 gel in plaits. I think she thought the nits couldn't
13 get into the plaits. I got bullied for a wee bit at the
14 new school because of the nits.

15 The foster mother would force us to go to school
16 every single day. You couldn't get away with saying you
17 were sick or anything like that. She was really strict,
18 but I think that was a good thing.

19 The foster mother didn't make sure that we brushed
20 our teeth regularly. I had to get some teeth taken out
21 and some fillings when I went for a check up at the
22 dentist. Brushing our teeth became a bigger thing for a
23 while after that. She got us a wee hourglass timer and
24 she would tell us to brush our teeth, but it wore off
25 after a while. Having to brush my teeth was basically

1 not much of a thing throughout my entire time in care.
2 Even now as an adult I'm having to teach myself to get
3 into the habit of brushing my teeth.

4 We went to Disneyland in Paris when I was about
5 seven. We also went to Spain, Turkey and a few caravan
6 holidays. We always went with 'Susan' and the girls she
7 was fostering. I really enjoyed the holidays. The
8 foster father never came, neither did 'Susan's' husband.

9 I had taken on this role when I lived with my mum of
10 being responsible for the wee ones so it took me a long
11 time to break out of that and just be a child again when
12 we moved to the foster mother's.

13 The foster mother would take us to the toy shop and
14 I would say that I didn't want a toy because I thought
15 I was too old to play with toys. She would get my
16 sister one and then I would want one too.

17 I was friends with two girls who lived five minutes
18 from the foster parents. The foster mother was friends
19 with their mum. My sister and I would go to their house
20 to play, they didn't come to ours. I was also friends
21 with the girl who lived next door. I used to go over to
22 her garden and play and she would sometimes come into
23 ours.

24 We used to spend time at 'Dylan's' and 'Susan's'
25 houses playing with their foster children and they would

1 visit us. 'Susan' was a lot of fun when we visited her.
2 'Dylan' was really funny too and I liked spending time
3 with him, but when you got him angry he was so scary.
4 You never wanted to get in his bad books.

5 I didn't see my brother when I was living with the
6 foster parents. I don't think I asked to see him.
7 I don't know where he was at that time. I know now he
8 was with carers. They wanted to adopt him but my mum
9 blocked it.

10 I got some sporadic contact with my mum when I first
11 went into care. It then stopped and I didn't see her
12 for several years.

13 For a while, we stayed with my gran and grandad at
14 weekends. I really enjoyed it. I loved spending time
15 with them. They lived in Pollokshaws. We were taken to
16 their house in a black taxi on a Friday and we would
17 come back on the Sunday evening. If we were just having
18 contact with them during the week, we'd be taken to
19 Parkhead to see them. They never came to the foster
20 parents' house for contact.

21 I saw my grandparents a lot when I first went into
22 care, which was really nice. I think the foster mother
23 thought we were seeing them too much so the contact was
24 cut back. I was too young to speak up about it and
25 I was easily manipulated by the foster mother. She

1 would say something and I would just agree with her.

2 I remember one time after the abuse started, I broke
3 down when I was being returned to the foster parents'
4 house after a visit with my grandparents. It was quite
5 late at night when I got back to their house. I got out
6 of the taxi and started crying because I really didn't
7 want to go back there and I didn't want my gran to leave
8 me. The foster mother gave me a cuddle. This is the
9 one clear memory I've got of her giving me a hug.

10 I had a social worker called Andrea Nairn at first
11 and then it was Janine Fraser. I saw social workers
12 quite a lot when I first moved to the foster parents but
13 not so much after that.

14 Janine built up a really good relationship with me
15 and my sister and also with the foster parents. I think
16 she was based at the Parkhead office, I'm not sure how
17 often she visited us. I think it might have been every
18 six months. It was maybe a bit more often, but
19 definitely not as often as once a month. Janine used to
20 take me and my sister out to McDonald's sometimes. I'm
21 not sure what she spoke to us about. She didn't always
22 take us out. She sometimes saw us in the house. She
23 was really nice. She was my social worker for about
24 seven years.

25 I got good presents from the foster parents for my

1 birthday. I didn't have a party, but they did stuff for
2 my birthday. They would ask me what I wanted rather
3 than just surmising.

4 At Christmas, the foster mother would cook the
5 dinner and there would be a big table in the living
6 room. My sister and I both got a Nintendo DS one
7 Christmas which had just come out. I think I was about
8 six. I remember my sister was playing Nintendogs and
9 she couldn't get her dog to sit. She was screaming at
10 it, 'Joe, sit', it was so annoying. The foster mother
11 sent her outside in the snow. She got her clothes on
12 and went outside to play with it. You could hear her
13 screaming at the dog outside. She was only out for
14 about 20 minutes. It was a good Christmas.

15 A foster boy was living with the foster parents when
16 we moved in. I had forgotten all about him until
17 I started thinking back. He was older than us, probably
18 a teenager, he had his own room in the house. We used
19 to play fight with him in the garden. He ran away and
20 I don't know what happened to him. I remember being
21 told after he'd left that he broke into the house when
22 we were on holiday.

23 I remember the exact day the abuse started. I think
24 I had been staying with the foster parents for about six
25 months. The foster mother took my sister to the

1 hospital that day because she'd slipped on the wet
2 kitchen floor and banged her head. I was left at home
3 with the foster father on my own.

4 I was in the living room and the foster father told
5 me to come over to him. He then put his hand on my
6 crotch area. I didn't know what was happening and
7 I jumped away. He was telling me to relax and saying it
8 was a secret and I wasn't to tell the foster mother.
9 I was scared of him because he was a shouty person. He
10 shouted in general, not always in a bad way. I didn't
11 know how I was meant to react when he was touching me
12 and I was scared, so I just sort of let it happen.
13 I didn't even know it was wrong. I just knew it was
14 uncomfortable for me. It went on for about 15 minutes.
15 I remember the foster mother and my sister coming back
16 and I just went straight to my bed. I don't remember
17 the rest of the day.

18 The foster father didn't do anything to me for
19 a while after the first time and then it started to
20 happen about once or twice a week. I think initially it
21 happened when it was just me and him in the house but as
22 time went on he would do it when the foster mother and
23 my sister were at home. He would ask me to bring him
24 cups of tea into my room and he would molest me when
25 I took the tea in. The foster mother and my sister

1 would be in the living room.

2 He would also come into my room at night. My sister
3 would sometimes be in her bed sleeping but she never
4 ever noticed. By this time we had bunk beds. I had
5 problems sleeping because I was always scared that he'd
6 come in. He walked with a limp, so I knew when he was
7 coming. I would be lying in my bed terrified. I was in
8 the top bunk bed and he'd put his hand through the slats
9 and feel about. I would kid on I was sleeping, although
10 sometimes I was sleeping and I'd wake up with him
11 touching me.

12 I used my majorette stick to make a sort of tent in
13 my bunk bed to try and stop him. I made a sign that
14 said, 'NO FEELING', because that's what he used to say
15 to me, 'Let me have a feel'. It had been going on for
16 quite a while by this point and I knew I didn't like it.
17 I put the sign up and it was gone when I woke up in the
18 morning so I did another one and that was taken away as
19 well. I don't know whether the foster father or the
20 foster mother took the signs away.

21 The abuse started with the foster father feeling my
22 crotch area and then it got worse and he did other
23 things. Instead of just sort of feeling about, he would
24 try and force his fingers into me. It was really
25 painful and I used to cry. He would pull out his penis

1 and try to get me to touch him. He would pull my hands
2 onto him and I'd be touching him for a second and then
3 I'd pull away. There were other varying kinds of sexual
4 acts he did, but I don't want to go into the details.

5 I hated it and I hated him. Nearer the end of my
6 time there, I basically threatened him by saying that
7 I was going to tell the foster mother. I still didn't
8 really know what was happening and just had a feeling it
9 wasn't right. I didn't know why, but I knew it wasn't
10 good. He panicked when I said I would tell the foster
11 mother. I was unsure myself, but I sort of knew this
12 would get a reaction. I never ever told the foster
13 mother.

14 My sister didn't know what was happening to me and
15 she was having a great time living there. I was raging
16 at her so we used to fight quite a lot. I never spoke
17 to my sister about it at the time. I know it never
18 happened to her as I asked her later on. I don't know
19 why it was me. I feel I was targeted and I don't
20 understand why. I remember this one incident when I was
21 sitting in the garden and my sister was running about
22 the garden pulling her skirt up and down. The foster
23 father shouted at her for pulling her skirt up and then
24 he told me to lift mine up. The foster mother wasn't
25 there at the time. She never saw anything happening.

1 It's hard to say whether I think the foster mother
2 was aware of what the foster father was doing. I wonder
3 how she could not know, but I also think that it's
4 easily hidden so I really don't know what to think.
5 I don't know who took my signs that said 'NO FEELING'
6 away. I don't think those signs could have been
7 interpreted in any other way. The foster mother was the
8 one who came into our room to wake us up in the morning,
9 but it might have been the foster father who came in in
10 the middle of the night and took them.

11 I didn't tell anybody what the foster father was
12 doing to me and I didn't say to anybody that I wasn't
13 happy living there. It's hard to explain how I felt.
14 It was weird because there was the good part, which was
15 the foster mother who I really liked spending time with,
16 and then there was the foster father who I hated. And
17 although I knew I didn't like it, I didn't know it was
18 wrong so I never told anybody. Also, I was just
19 a little girl and I'd been told that it was a secret.

20 I started doing quite a lot of dangerous stuff to
21 myself after the abuse started. I got quite upset after
22 school one day and [REDACTED] on the way
23 home and used it to cut my arm. I was about seven at
24 that time. One of the girls fostered by 'Susan' had
25 picked me up from school that day and she told the

1 foster mother what I'd done.

2 I had forgotten about this incident until I started
3 to have serious mental issues when I was older and the
4 foster mother then brought it up. She said that she had
5 wanted me to see someone in mental health at the time
6 and Andrea, my social worker, was told to make the
7 appointment. Andrea then cancelled it and told the
8 foster mother to arrange it. This is what the foster
9 mother said to me, but I don't know if it's true.
10 I just know that I was meant to see someone and it never
11 happened. The foster mother didn't re-arrange the
12 appointment. I didn't need to go to the hospital for
13 the cut on my arm as it was only a scratch, but I had
14 tried to harm myself and nobody spoke to me about it or
15 got me any kind of help.

16 The incident with the [REDACTED] wasn't the first time
17 I had self-harmed. [REDACTED]

18 [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED]
20 [REDACTED]
21 [REDACTED]
22 We were removed from the foster parents because
23 a girl fostered by 'Susan' told someone that she was
24 being abused by the foster father. I think she was
25 about 12 at that point. We used to go to 'Susan's' to

1 play with the girls and the foster father would
2 sometimes babysit for them. I had no idea that was
3 happening to her and I didn't find out until later on
4 she had disclosed it.

5 I was about eight or nine when we were removed. We
6 went to stay with 'Dylan' and 'Clair' at first. We were
7 in our beds sleeping and the foster mother woke us up
8 and packed bags for us. We didn't understand what was
9 happening. I don't know if 'Dylan' came and picked us
10 up. I just remember we went to his house. We stayed
11 there for a few days but we spent a lot of time at
12 'Susan's' during those days. We then moved to live with
13 'Susan'. I don't think we went back to the foster
14 mother's before we moved to 'Susan's'.

15 I think Janine made the decision that we were to be
16 moved. I think the foster mother knew that we were
17 going to be moving from hers because she was the one
18 that said to us that we could go and stay with 'Susan'.
19 We thought that was a great idea because 'Susan' was
20 always so nice and a lot of fun when we visited her.
21 I think we basically asked to go to 'Susan's' because it
22 had been drummed into us by the foster mother that we
23 should move there.

24 'Dylan' was in his 30s. 'Susan', the foster mother
25 and 'Dylan' all lived close to one another. He lived in

1 a street just off the road up to our primary school. It
2 was only about ten minutes from the foster mother's
3 house.

4 'Dylan' and 'Clair's' house was messy. A foster
5 girl was living with them at the time but I don't
6 remember who else was there. There were maybe another
7 two children. I don't remember much about our time at
8 'Dylan's', only that we spent a lot of time with
9 'Susan'.

10 Nothing happened during those few days we were at
11 'Dylan's' but we used to visit him at times and he could
12 be really brutal with his discipline. If you did one
13 tiny thing wrong, he made a big thing of it.

14 He used to make the foster girl sit on the stairs
15 for hours at a time as a punishment.

16 Another girl who was fostered by 'Dylan' and 'Clair'
17 was really scared of the shower. I saw them drag her
18 upstairs and force her into the shower. She was
19 screaming.

20 They adopted another girl. She told them that one
21 of the wee boys they fostered hit her in the face with
22 car keys and 'Dylan' slapped the boy hard for that. The
23 boy was really young. I didn't see this but one of the
24 foster girls told me about it.

25 'Dylan' told me the foster girl and my sister to

1 clean the bathroom around Christmas one time. I used
2 bleach and didn't wear gloves and we got punished for
3 that. 'Dylan' and 'Clair' took the three of us to
4 a Christmas fair in Glasgow along with the boy who was
5 a relative of 'Clair's', but only the boy was allowed to
6 go on any of the rides. We had to just stand and watch
7 while 'Dylan' and 'Clair' made comments like, 'That's
8 what you get for being bad'. It was horrible. I was so
9 upset the whole time. I think I was about eight.

10 I'm not sure whether these things happened when
11 I was living with the foster mother or whether it was
12 afterwards when I moved to live with 'Susan'. They
13 might sound like small things but they were really
14 cruel.

15 Although the foster girl told someone about the
16 foster father she never got anywhere because she had
17 been sexually assaulted in the past, so they used that
18 against her and didn't believe her. I know now that she
19 spoke to the police at the time, but she couldn't get
20 anyone to help her and nothing happened to the foster
21 father.

22 I got interviewed by the police around the time we
23 moved to 'Susan's' but I didn't tell them what the
24 foster father was doing. I thought it was a secret, so
25 I couldn't tell them. I think I was interviewed in the

1 police station. I remember it was somewhere unusual to
2 me. They asked me if he had ever touched me or
3 something along those lines. I don't know exactly what
4 I said to them. I just know I never told them anything.

5 I still saw the foster father right up until I left
6 care. He would babysit us when we lived at 'Susan's'
7 but he never touched me again. He was obviously still
8 allowed to have contact with us because nobody believed
9 the foster girl. The foster parents were also allowed
10 to continue to foster. They fostered two girls after we
11 left.

12 'Susan' and her husband were in their 40s. Their
13 house had upstairs and downstairs and the loft had been
14 converted so it was quite big. It was just down the
15 road from where the foster parents lived. It wasn't as
16 clean as the foster mother's but it was fine. We then
17 moved house, I think when I was in Primary 7.

18 There were other foster children living with 'Susan'
19 and her husband. Four girls were there when we moved
20 in. I think one of the girls was in the middle of
21 moving because of what she had disclosed. She and
22 another girl were sisters. One girl was a year above me
23 at school, another was 16 and a third must have been
24 about the same age. A fifth girl came to live with us
25 later. She was about two years younger than my sister

1 and was 'Susan' and her husband's favourite.

2 It was fun staying with 'Susan' at the start. It
3 was just like it had been when we used to visit her.
4 That changed around a few months in. It was as if the
5 act had dropped and she didn't need to bother any more
6 and could just be herself. She became horrible and
7 verbally abusive to us and was not nice to be around.
8 I know now that 'Susan' was an alcoholic but I didn't
9 know that at the time. I think she was already
10 a drinker when we moved in, but her drinking got worse
11 as time went on. Her husband was okay too at the start.
12 He just didn't engage with us that much.

13 I don't think 'Susan' and her husband got on very
14 well. They argued a few times in front of us and he'd
15 say he was leaving. They didn't argue often, they just
16 kind of stayed out of each other's way. 'Susan' was
17 always upstairs playing on the PlayStation when her
18 husband was in and she would come downstairs when he
19 went out to the pub. Her husband never really
20 participated in anything. 'Susan' had a caravan for
21 a few years and we went every single weekend but her
22 husband never came.

23 I wrote a diary in the sort of end period of living
24 at 'Susan' and her husband's. I think it's weird that
25 I did this. It feels like I was maybe preparing for

1 something. I am going to be sharing some of the entries
2 with the Inquiry as I think it gives a better insight
3 into what I was thinking and feeling at that point.
4 I started writing it just before Christmas 2014 and
5 continued until around the second week in January 2015.

6 I shared a room with my sister and one of the other
7 foster girls when we lived in the first house. The room
8 was quite big so I didn't mind the three of us sharing.
9 The bedroom wasn't really decorated for children.
10 I don't really remember the mornings when I was young.
11 I think 'Susan' would wake us up. I don't really
12 remember getting dressed or anything like that.

13 The only thing 'Susan' was strict on was bedtime.
14 We went to bed at 7 o'clock. She made us go to bed at
15 the same time every night, but in other aspects of life
16 there wasn't much of a routine. I think it got a little
17 bit later as I got older, but it was still quite early.
18 It was unreasonable. I used to ask her if I could stay
19 up a bit later and I think she let us stay up to about
20 9.30 or 10 sometimes.

21 'Susan' didn't encourage us to wash. This went on
22 throughout my time in her care. I think we had a bath
23 about once a week.

24 Right from the start at 'Susan's' we got takeaway
25 meals, Chinese food and chippies for dinner. We used to

1 sit on the floor in the living room to eat. I don't
2 think we were allowed to eat on the couch. There wasn't
3 enough room for all of us to sit on the couch anyway.

4 When we moved house, one of the girls and I would be
5 sent to McDonald's four or five times a week to get
6 dinner for us all. All the kids would get a Happy Meal
7 and sometimes her husband would get something from
8 McDonald's too. 'Susan' always got a Chinese, so we
9 were sent there too.

10 'Susan' would maybe cook once or twice a week. She
11 would make things like mince and totties or chips and
12 macaroni. It was quite nice.

13 'Susan' always just sat in the house playing the
14 PlayStation. She'd maybe do an errand or go out with
15 the foster mother once in a while but that was it. She
16 never did anything with her life. She didn't work, but
17 she made us clean the entire house. It was like she had
18 a whole house full of maids. I understand that people
19 need to do chores, but it was so rigorous. They had to
20 be done before anything else. After dinner I had to do
21 all the dishes and clean the entire kitchen. That was
22 mine and another girl's job. I did the washings on
23 Sunday. My sister had to do the dining room. This was
24 when we were in the new house. I think we were too
25 young in the other house. She made the older girls do

1 it there.

2 She did a rota for us at first. She had it on the
3 fridge and we would get stars if we did the jobs
4 properly. She said we would get pocket money but even
5 although we had spent hours scrubbing the kitchen, she
6 would find one tiny thing wrong so she didn't give us
7 the money. She would say to us that we would never get
8 any money unless we did it properly. We got pocket
9 money only once in a blue moon. I think I got pocket
10 money a handful of times in the five years I lived with
11 them. Whenever we didn't do the cleaning to her
12 standard she would make us do it again or shout at us
13 and send us to bed. I was scared of her so I never
14 refused to do it.

15 I don't remember brushing my teeth as a young child
16 at 'Susan's'. They didn't like you brushing your teeth.
17 When we were older, we were meant to have separate
18 toothpaste but one girl had hers and we usually never
19 had any.

20 I got nits again but 'Susan' wasn't as helpful as
21 the foster mother had been. I think someone in her
22 house picked them up and we all got them because it
23 wasn't treated. Even when I would ask 'Susan' to get us
24 some sort of treatment she'd just put it off or she'd
25 get conditioner and tell the other girls to deal with

1 it. I think it was about a year before it completely
2 cleared up. It was horrible. I used to tear bits of my
3 hair out. I had really long hair, but I never wore it
4 down.

5 My sister has Asperger's, but we didn't know that at
6 the time. She had a whole range of unusual body
7 language. I think it's embarrassing that she was never
8 diagnosed while she was in 'Susan's' care.

9 'Susan' bought a caravan in Saltcoats and we went
10 there every weekend. We had no choice in the matter.
11 We never went anywhere else on holiday. The foster
12 father came twice in the school holidays I think.

13 'Susan' treated us in the same abusive way at the
14 caravan. She drank a lot there too. All the children
15 would go down to the complex and it would be mine and
16 another girl's responsibility to oversee the younger
17 ones. Even at the caravan it was mine and the other
18 girl's job to wash the dishes and clean the kitchen
19 every night."

20 Now to paragraph 100:

21 "When I saw the foster father he would make comments
22 to me like I was looking brilliant. This seems
23 innocent, but I just felt that it had some sort of
24 undertone and I didn't like it. He would give all the
25 children £5 each but I always got more. Everyone just

1 thought I was his favourite, but I knew why I was his
2 favourite."

3 From paragraph 101, 'Linda' speaks about her primary
4 and secondary school and other aspects of her life in
5 foster care. She enjoyed learning but says that 'Susan'
6 and her husband never encouraged her to do well at
7 school. They were not interested in helping her with
8 her maths. She says 'Susan' actually hated her studying
9 and 'Linda' thinks she was actively told not to.

10 When 'Linda' did well in her National 5s, 'Susan'
11 and her husband never really acknowledged what she had
12 achieved.

13 'Linda' says that her relationship with her sister
14 improved when she first moved to 'Susan's', but as time
15 went on, her sister was manipulated by 'Susan' and used
16 to suck up to 'Susan' by acting like her and taking her
17 side when 'Susan' was being abusive. 'Linda's' contact
18 with her brother was patchy throughout her time in care.
19 He came to stay at 'Susan's' for five months but had
20 behavioural issues and was too much for 'Susan' and her
21 husband.

22 'Linda' says that her access to her grandparents
23 went down to quarterly because 'Susan' was pushing for
24 it. She also had quarterly contact with her mum from
25 the age of 12. She saw her dad twice, both times in

1 prison, but felt manipulated by 'Susan', who said that
2 'Linda' was upset by seeing her dad so she wasn't
3 allowed to see him again.

4 'Linda' says that the culture in 'Susan's' home was
5 that anyone who sucked up to 'Susan' was untouchable and
6 this impacted adversely on 'Linda's' relationship with
7 her sister and the other foster girls. 'Linda' speaks
8 of how the problems at home affected her friendships at
9 school. At times she felt suicidal. She was never
10 allowed to have friends round to the house or to go and
11 meet them at night.

12 Moving to paragraph 142 on page 29, where 'Linda'
13 speaks about social work visits:

14 "Our social worker was Janine for the majority of
15 the time we were at 'Susan's' but we got a new one
16 called Eddie Thompson in the last year or so. The
17 Parkhead social work office was meant to deal with us,
18 but I think Eddie was based at Easterhouse.

19 The frequency of the visits from Janine reduced as
20 time went on. I don't think she came to see us much
21 during that long period of time when we had nits.
22 I think she got the impression we were happy. Once
23 a social worker thinks you're safe and appear happy,
24 they don't visit nearly as much.

25 When we did get access with Janine, she would take

1 us to the McDonald's round the corner. She always
2 picked us up at the house. She'd come in and we'd all
3 be in the living room. She'd have a short chat with
4 'Susan' and then ask us, in front of 'Susan', if there
5 was anything we wanted to talk about privately. We
6 would go 'nope' and then she would take us to
7 McDonald's. When she took us back she would have a talk
8 with 'Susan' somewhere in the house away from us. I was
9 always aware it was happening. I think it was a case of
10 we had had our time with social work, so 'Susan' had to
11 get hers too.

12 There was a link worker for 'Susan' and her husband
13 called Simon. I know he visited but I don't think he
14 came very often. I don't know what his role was. He
15 never spoke to us.

16 I used to go up and visit the foster mother if
17 'Susan' let me. The foster father would be there
18 sometimes but he never touched me again.

19 I was on a supervision order up until I was 16 and
20 I used to go to children's panels once or twice a year.

21 The panels were always really straightforward
22 because it seemed, especially from a social worker's
23 perspective, that everything was grand.

24 My gran caused loads of bother at the panels. She
25 knew something was wrong. I think I told her little

1 bits about 'Susan' but there was nothing she could say
2 or do about it. My gran hated 'Susan'. 'Susan' would
3 go into the panel and say that we were dirty and all
4 sorts of things about us. There was always this theme
5 that my sister and I were painted as being dirty. My
6 gran shouted at 'Susan' one time, 'You've got a cheek to
7 call anybody dirty, you dirty, smelly cow'. 'Susan' was
8 actually very dirty. She didn't wash very often
9 herself. Her husband was the same. I'm so glad my gran
10 did that. I remember the panel members were all telling
11 my gran to get out.

12 My mum started coming to the panels once we started
13 to get access with her. My dad went to one panel.
14 I don't think the prison let him come out for them.

15 I don't think they created the right conditions for
16 us to speak at the panels. There was always an audience
17 there and I felt intimidated. And I didn't trust the
18 panel members. They were people that I didn't know.
19 It's a huge thing to come out and say that my carer has
20 been abusing me for seven years. I couldn't just go and
21 tell that to total strangers. It might have made
22 a difference if you got the same panel members each
23 time. Even if they asked me if I wanted to speak to
24 them in private, I would say no because they'd ask you
25 that in front of people and those people would then ask

1 you what you spoke about. It just wasn't safe.

2 I never had a Who Cares? Scotland advocacy worker or
3 anyone like that. It was just down to me to speak. In
4 reality, it was always just 'Susan' who spoke for us.
5 We got sent forms which were supposed to allow us to
6 have our say but these would get read out at the panels,
7 so I never wrote the truth on them. I think it's a bit
8 naive of them to think a child will write down what they
9 want to say, especially when it's going to be read out
10 to everyone. It's not a safe system.

11 What 'Susan' loved to do to discipline you was to
12 send you to bed really early. We'd be sent to bed at
13 12 o'clock in the afternoon and we had to stay there
14 lying in bed the whole day with nothing to do. She
15 would come in and check to make sure we were still lying
16 in bed. I can hardly remember the sort of things that
17 resulted in her sending us to bed. It would be stupid
18 wee things. I remember one time a girl put too much
19 pepper in her macaroni. I thought I would wash the
20 pepper out for her because it was too spicy and I got
21 sent to bed for that. This was the kind of daft thing
22 that made 'Susan' send you to bed.

23 By the time I got to about 14 or 15 she tried to
24 send me to bed but not as much. I think she knew she
25 didn't have as much power that way any more. At that

1 point I had my own room and was just shutting myself in
2 my room and refusing to come out. I needed to just stay
3 away from them.

4 Another thing 'Susan' liked to do was throw us
5 outside as a punishment. She did that to me one time
6 when I'd just had a shower and only had a towel around
7 me. It was wintertime and she put me out and locked the
8 door. I was out for about ten minutes. Every one of us
9 got thrown outside at some point. I remember a foster
10 girl being put out of the caravan when she was having
11 a tantrum. 'Susan' put her out in the rain, wearing
12 just her pyjamas, until she stopped screaming.

13 'Susan' used to shout and swear at us a lot when we
14 were young. She was abusive when she shouted but
15 I can't remember all the things she used to say. It's
16 a bit blurry. She got more and more verbally abusive
17 towards us as time went on. She would be really
18 horrible to us. She would call me and my sister
19 'spastics'. I don't remember all the names. I just
20 know that she would always make you feel like garbage by
21 calling you names and swearing at you.

22 She picked on my sister a lot because she behaved
23 differently. She would call her a 'mongo', a 'spastic'
24 and a 'weirdo'. She'd completely bully her and make her
25 feel horrible.

1 'Susan' made me and another foster girl go into the
2 back garden and batter my sister one time because she
3 had hit another girl. Her husband was at the pub.
4 I wasn't hitting her at first, I was just sort of
5 pulling her about and 'Susan' shouted at me and said she
6 was going to batter me if I didn't hit her. I then
7 started battering my sister and she was screaming. This
8 went on for about ten minutes. I think this happened
9 around a year before I left.

10 When my brother came to stay with us, he had a lot
11 of behavioural issues and 'Susan' would slap him or drag
12 him up the stairs when he misbehaved. I remember he
13 would be screaming.

14 'Susan' found out a foster girl was smoking and she
15 made her eat cigarettes as a punishment. The girl was
16 crying and the rest of us were in the house watching
17 this.

18 'Susan' drank whisky and vodka and would tell us to
19 pour it for her. She could drink three-quarters of
20 a bottle of vodka or whisky in one night. I would be
21 sitting and watching the telly and she would tell me to
22 go and pour her a drink. She got really aggressive when
23 she started drinking and she wanted to argue with you.
24 She would get angry and ask you about things and then
25 twist what you said so she could shout at you. She did

1 it with all of us. It was never just out-and-out anger
2 with her. It could be casual conversation and then it
3 would progress and progress. When I think back on it,
4 she was so manipulative. She would try and manipulate
5 you into saying something wrong or just something she
6 didn't like so that she had a reason to verbally abuse
7 you. She used to take my iPad off me and look through
8 my messages. She would get information and use it
9 against me.

10 If she didn't like something we'd done, she would
11 call my sister, a foster girl and me into the living
12 room and give us abuse for hours. We would sit there
13 and take it and do whatever she wanted. Any number of
14 things could start it. She'd say that our rooms were
15 a mess, that we didn't do enough cleaning, that we were
16 weird or we were dirty or she'd say insulting things
17 about our families. It could be a tiny thing that
18 started this. That's why we were so scared. Nothing we
19 did was good enough. She always had a reason to
20 verbally abuse us. This would usually happen when she
21 was drunk and her husband was at the pub.

22 'Susan' used to always say things to me about my
23 family not wanting me. This was quite a common theme.

24 'Susan' would throw things at us and be quite
25 destructive to the property when she was drunk. She

1 would throw glasses at my sister, the foster girl and
2 me. They hit me a few times. They never smashed on me,
3 but they struck me and it was sore.

4 She would sometimes say to us when she'd been
5 drinking that if we moved from hers we would go to
6 a children's unit as no one wants older children. She
7 would say things like we would get our stuff stolen or
8 we would get raped in a children's unit. I was
9 terrified.

10 One Christmas Eve, when I was about 13 or 14, she
11 phoned herself and kidded on she was speaking to the
12 social work about us being taken into a children's unit.
13 She said we were the scum of the earth and made us all
14 pack our bags. We put all our things into black bags.
15 I remember making sure I took my bible, as this was
16 around the time I was so desperate that I had turned to
17 religion.

18 Usually the husband would be out at the pub so it
19 would just be my sister, the other foster girl and me in
20 the house when 'Susan' was drinking. The husband was
21 difficult to speak to. He never really spoke to me. He
22 would go to the pub, get drunk and then he would speak
23 when he came back. He was nicer when he was drunk. If
24 he came in drunk and 'Susan' was being aggressive
25 towards us, he would kind of stick up for us a wee bit

1 but not enough to actually help us. He'd say, 'Just say
2 aye okay and then ignore her'. So he knew what she was
3 like but he never really helped.

4 The husband could be the same as 'Susan' when he was
5 sober. He would shout all the time. It was mine and
6 the other foster girl's job to do the dishes and clean
7 up the kitchen every single night and he was basically
8 in charge of that. He would shout at us if he thought
9 we hadn't done it right.

10 He was especially partial to the fifth foster girl,
11 so it was mostly him that would go off his head at us if
12 we stood up to her when she was doing horrible things to
13 us. He was so unfair, even when she hit us she didn't
14 get told off. The argument all of us had was that she
15 was old enough to know better but we were painted to be
16 bullies. My sister especially got painted as a bully as
17 she would sometimes hit this foster girl back.

18 After I had been living with 'Susan' for quite
19 a while, the foster mother told me that we had moved
20 from her house because she and the foster father were
21 quite ill and they thought they were going to die. She
22 said that she would have us back if she could. This
23 insinuates to me that she was aware of what was going on
24 in 'Susan's' house. This was the worst betrayal. I did
25 like the foster mother up until she said that to me.

1 She had been strict but fair and nice and nothing like
2 'Susan'.

3 There was an incident after school one day when
4 I was doing my National 5s. I had to do a report for
5 biology and all my papers were lying on the floor in my
6 room. 'Susan' came in and was shouting 'look at this
7 mess'. She was drunk and I think she was angry because
8 she didn't like me studying. She then grabbed all of my
9 papers and I must have had a surge of adrenalin because
10 I stood up to her. I had never stood up to her before.
11 I was always terrified to do anything or even speak when
12 she went into a rage. I used to be quite mellow and
13 just try to stay out of the way. But this time, I think
14 because school at that point was the only thing I cared
15 about as I saw it as my way out, I grabbed my papers out
16 of her hand. They were so important to me so I took
17 them back off her. This was a huge thing for me to do.

18 She was shouting at me to give them back to her,
19 saying, 'I'm going to fucking burn them, I'm going to
20 burn them, I'm going to fucking rip them up'. I kept
21 a hold of them and she kept coming into my face and
22 screaming at me. I then threw them all over the place
23 and shouted, 'Go fucking get them then'. She came into
24 my face and I was obviously scared, but I was taller
25 than her so I was towering over her. She was quite

1 a fat woman and she probably could have hurt me, but
2 I didn't care. I was shouting right back at her. She
3 spat on my face at that point because she said that
4 I spat on her when I was shouting back at her.
5 I hadn't. Her spittle landed on my face, and I then
6 pushed her out of my room.

7 Everyone in the house was aware of the incident in
8 the room but no one ever stood up to her. My sister and
9 the foster girl were shouting at me to stop arguing with
10 her and to do what she wanted. They saw her spit on my
11 face but they would have felt that they had to take her
12 side. If you ever disagreed with 'Susan', you would be
13 the one who then had to deal with her rage.

14 'Susan' ended up ripping my papers and I lost quite
15 a lot of work. I was supposed to be submitting the
16 report a week later. It took a whole week to try and
17 recover what I'd lost. I didn't have a computer, so
18 I had done research at the library and printed off
19 papers there. She ripped those papers and half the
20 report I'd handwritten.

21 She didn't apologise. She said that I'd spat on
22 her, obviously just to try and cover her own back. She
23 stayed away from me on the days after it. I don't know
24 why but I think it was maybe because she didn't expect
25 me to behave how I did and she was a bit scared.

1 I think I wouldn't have hesitated to react the same way
2 again because I was so angry for a while after it.
3 I think she was maybe feeling a bit guilty too, because
4 she let me stay off school to try to sort it out.

5 The dog used to go for spa days, get fancy hairdos
6 and go out to a sort of day centre. It was so spoilt
7 and it wasn't a nice dog. We weren't getting a proper
8 dinner and this dog was being treated like that. I feel
9 it's important to mention this. Getting a Happy Meal
10 for my dinner four or five times a week went on for
11 years. I was still getting a Happy Meal for my dinner
12 when I was 16. I was so slim and completely
13 malnourished. I think that on its own is abuse.

14 There are other entries in my diary that show how
15 I was feeling about living at 'Susan's' nearer the end
16 of my time there. I'm swearing so much because I was so
17 angry."

18 From paragraph 178 'Linda' describes how unhappy she
19 was in the foster placement and gives other examples of
20 abuse as illustrated by reference to her diary of the
21 time. She felt lonely and victimised.

22 Moving to paragraph 198, page 40, where 'Linda'
23 speaks of reporting her abuse:

24 "I had a good relationship with the social worker
25 Janine, but I didn't feel that I could speak to anyone

1 about what was happening at 'Susan's'. I was so
2 engrossed in it. I was terrified of 'Susan' and half of
3 it felt normal to me. The manipulation by her was so
4 deep that it was difficult for me to even try and figure
5 out that the way she was treating us wasn't normal.

6 Also, we had been terrorised with the idea that
7 there was nowhere else for us to go, that nobody wanted
8 us older children and that we'd get raped if we ended up
9 in a children's unit. I felt trapped.

10 Eventually I did tell a teacher. I'm a bit muddled
11 and don't really remember the time frame, but I did tell
12 my biology teacher, Ms McCrae, and then the head of the
13 year, Ms Higgins, I think I was 15. I was at breaking
14 point and I just needed to tell someone. I was
15 struggling with biology and I remember going to Ms McCrae
16 to ask her for a book of past papers. She was a lovely
17 teacher. I ended up telling her that I was having a lot
18 of trouble at home. I was just so upset that day.

19 Ms McCrae was a support teacher as well so she took
20 me down to the support office. I actually had my diary
21 with me. She was so worried when I told her about
22 'Susan' and she wanted to see what was in the diary. At
23 that point I refused because I was too scared but I told
24 her what 'Susan' was doing and that I didn't want to
25 live with her any more.

1 Ms McRae phoned the social worker Eddie Thompson.
2 She then arranged, without 'Susan' knowing, for her,
3 Eddie and me to have a meeting, not the same day but
4 soon after.

5 At the meeting, options for me to move were
6 discussed and I said to Eddie that I was quite scared
7 about moving. I told him that I didn't want to go to
8 a children's unit and I then lied and told him that
9 everything was all right. I didn't really know him so
10 I didn't trust him. I had only met him three times
11 before. He was this new person who had come in and
12 Ms McRae just expected me to tell him everything.
13 I couldn't do that, especially when I knew he was going
14 to go back to 'Susan's' and do something or say
15 something to her. I was terrified of that. Eddie was
16 actually a really nice guy but at that time I just
17 didn't know him. I had been with Janine for about seven
18 years or something, so our relationship was nothing
19 compared to that.

20 I hadn't changed my mind about what I wanted but
21 I was too scared to tell the truth to Eddie. I felt
22 horrible for Ms McRae but I just couldn't do it.
23 I don't know what her reaction was to me not saying
24 anything. She didn't show one. I think she was maybe
25 a bit confused.

1 Ms McRae did keep in contact with me after that, but
2 she also referred me to Ms Higgins, the head of year.
3 I was raging with Ms McRae at first for telling
4 Ms Higgins about me. I felt like I had been totally
5 betrayed. I now know it was for the best, for me and
6 for her as well.

7 I went to see Ms Higgins and she asked me to tell
8 her what was going on. I just told her how I was
9 feeling mentally. She obviously knew from Ms McCrae
10 what was happening, but I made the focus more on my
11 mental health. She tried to understand why I was
12 feeling the way I was and she tried to help me as much
13 as she could. She arranged for me not to sit any
14 prelims and that was a huge help. All my friends had to
15 sit their prelims, so that caused more problems with
16 them because they already thought I was an attention
17 seeker.

18 I told Ms Higgins that I was feeling suicidal and
19 she referred me to Lifelink but I refused to engage with
20 them. They came to the school to see me and I went to
21 one session but I hated it. It wasn't that I had
22 trouble speaking to them about my suicidal thoughts,
23 I just thought it was a waste of time. It was
24 embarrassing and I felt like I was being patronised.
25 I still feel the same way about counselling because of

1 that experience.

2 They had these sort of animal figures and they asked
3 me to pick which one I thought I was, which one was my
4 spirit animal. I was having none of that. Ms Higgins
5 often suggested I should seek professional medical help,
6 but I refused that too. I didn't know how to deal with
7 the doctor and it would have meant having to get 'Susan'
8 involved, so that was a no-no. I would say that
9 Ms Higgins did try to get me proper help, but I refused
10 it. She then just got me to speak to her and tried to
11 help me that way.

12 'Susan' was not aware of anything that was going on
13 at school. I was quite worried about her finding out
14 but nothing happened. I specifically said to Eddie that
15 he was not to say anything and I don't think they told
16 her anything or made any enquiries with her.

17 I carried on living at 'Susan's' for about four
18 months after I'd disclosed what was going on.

19 I was really suicidal over the Christmas and New
20 Year period in 2014/2015 and was making attempts on my
21 life and self-harming."

22 Now to paragraph 215:

23 "I ended up telling 'Susan' that I had been
24 self-harming and making attempts on my life. I told her
25 it was because of the way they were treating me.

1 'Susan' was shouting at me and saying things like, 'I'm
2 no fucking walking on eggshells just because you want to
3 top yourself'. When she'd calmed down I told her that
4 I wanted to go to the doctor and she said, 'Tell me
5 when'.

6 'Susan' took me to the doctor. I didn't say
7 anything to the doctor about the abuse because 'Susan'
8 came in with me. The doctor got me an emergency
9 appointment with the Child and Adolescent Mental Health
10 Services. I think I saw them for the initial assessment
11 that same week. 'Susan' came to the assessment too.

12 After the initial assessment, CAMHS asked me where
13 I'd like to meet with them privately and I said school.
14 I think I saw the woman five or six times at school.
15 I didn't find it very helpful. She told me about
16 breathing techniques and that kind of thing which was
17 helpful in some respects, but it wasn't what I needed.
18 I didn't speak to her about the abuse. I wanted to tell
19 her. I think she knew, but I just couldn't say.

20 During this time I had a social work review.
21 I think 'Susan' requested it because I'd told her I had
22 been self-harming. I think it took place about a week
23 after I had told her. Ms Higgins came to the review.
24 I think it was in the Parkhead social work office. They
25 were all sitting round a table talking about how I had

1 been self-harming. It wasn't a good experience just to
2 sit there and listen to people talking about it.

3 About two weeks after I had seen the doctor, I spoke
4 to Ms Higgins. I spoke to her about how I was feeling
5 and how I hated living at 'Susan's'. Then I said to her
6 that I needed to tell something else, but I didn't know
7 how. I then told her I'd been molested by the foster
8 father. I cried for hours in Ms Higgins's room after
9 telling her. She gave me a hug and tried to comfort me.
10 Once I sort of contained myself, she told me to go off
11 and get some lunch and she was going to deal with it.
12 She then phoned social work.

13 I went back to see Ms Higgins after lunch and Eddie
14 and another female social worker were there. I don't
15 know the woman's name. I only ever saw her that one
16 time. The social workers were really apologetic. They
17 said they were so sorry it had happened and Eddie asked
18 me if I wanted to go back home to 'Susan's'. I said
19 absolutely not, I could not go back there. They then
20 tried to explain to me what was going to happen.
21 I don't know if it was at that exact time, but they did
22 tell me at some point that everyone would be removed
23 from 'Susan's'.

24 Eddie and the woman took me to the Easterhouse
25 social work office so they could find me somewhere to

1 stay. I just sat in their work bit with them until they
2 found a place for me. I had no belongings with me other
3 than my school books so the woman social worker took me
4 to the Fort shopping centre to buy me clothes and
5 toiletries. They found me a place with a respite carer
6 in Cardonald. The women social worker drove me there
7 quite late that night.

8 I felt elated at first when I knew I was being moved
9 from 'Susan's'. It felt like a total weight had been
10 lifted. I was almost manic. I was excited but also
11 terrified at the same time. As the day went on, I ended
12 up feeling really sad and upset and scared.

13 In some ways I did still feel relieved to be away
14 from 'Susan', but I felt a lot of guilt about it all
15 too. Although 'Susan' had been this horrible, horrible
16 person, and her husband as well, I felt that I'd maybe
17 done the wrong thing, as even though 'Susan' did the
18 things she did, she always painted us as a family."

19 From paragraph 227 'Linda' speaks of moving to
20 a respite carer's in Cardonald. Although having turned
21 16, 'Linda' would have preferred to have lived on her
22 own.

23 The other children were removed from the placement
24 with 'Susan' and 'Linda' felt they hated her because it
25 was 'Linda's' fault they had been moved. 'Linda's'

1 sister was moved to Ayr, but they saw each other at
2 school.

3 To paragraph 232 on page 47:

4 "Eddie reported the abuse I disclosed to the police
5 and he then arranged for me to speak to them. He took
6 me to Baird Street police station when I was living in
7 Cardonald.

8 The policewoman I spoke with was Lorna Baillie.
9 I don't know if she was from a specialist unit. I'm
10 really glad I got to speak to a female officer. That
11 was the first time I had ever spoken to anyone in such
12 an in-depth way.

13 I think the police and social work asked all the
14 other children questions after I gave my statement, and
15 I think that's when it came out that another girl who
16 was fostered by the foster parents after me had also
17 been abused by the foster father.

18 I know there was a charge made against the foster
19 father after I gave my statement, but I don't know what
20 he was charged with.

21 During the period of about a year after I gave the
22 statement, I had been asking social work what was going
23 to happen and they were quite evasive any time I asked
24 for information. I was quite annoyed at the time
25 because they hadn't explained to me what it actually

1 meant to give a statement. I felt that they had totally
2 thrown me into it without any sort of support. It also
3 felt like they were working against me to try and save
4 themselves, because they were obviously at fault for
5 placing me into the care of these people.

6 Social work phoned me about a year after I had given
7 the statement and asked to meet me immediately. Eddie
8 and another social worker picked me up in a car and told
9 me that the foster father had recently passed away. The
10 police then phoned me and said that there was nothing
11 they could do now, so nothing ever happened with
12 anything that I had tried to take forward.

13 Now to paragraph 241:

14 "I never got an explanation from the police for why
15 no charges were brought against 'Susan'. I think they
16 said that there wasn't enough evidence.

17 The fact that nobody was prosecuted makes me feel
18 totally invalid. These people were allowed to do what
19 they wanted to me. They got away with it, even though
20 I tried really hard to do something about it. I am
21 studying law now and it makes me so annoyed that the
22 whole system is based on corroboration."

23 From paragraph 243 'Linda' describes life after
24 foster care and living with a supported carer in
25 Renfrew, who 'Linda' did not find supportive. She felt

1 she was just thrown into something with no help and no
2 guidance. She also thinks it's a disgrace that the
3 social work did not get her help like counselling when
4 she had been through a really traumatic experience.

5 She felt that support from her school was short
6 lived. She had to travel from Renfrew to Springburn
7 each day to get to school, which was a two-hour bus
8 journey. The situation affected her exam results so she
9 did five highers again in sixth year.

10 'Linda' speaks of her life after leaving school.
11 She studied law at college as a step towards her aim to
12 achieve a degree in law at Glasgow University. She says
13 that Glasgow University is about the only university
14 that allows lower entry requirements for
15 care-experienced young people.

16 From paragraph 269, 'Linda' speaks of the impact her
17 experiences have had upon her. She says there's been no
18 positive impact on her from her time in care, it's all
19 been bad. It's affected her mental health and her
20 education. She is distraught that no one has been
21 prosecuted. Her relationship with her sister has been
22 badly affected and she's been called a liar by other
23 girls who were fostered.

24 Moving to paragraph 283 on page 57, where 'Linda'
25 speaks about records:

1 "I have my records. They are with my lawyer now.
2 The first time I got to read them was when I had just
3 moved into the supported carer's. Eddie got them and
4 gave them to me to read. He left me in the room and
5 said he was there if I needed him. I wanted to read
6 them on my own. I was raging when I read them and
7 I felt embarrassed to read people's opinion of me as
8 a little girl. It's ridiculous how people will paint
9 you to try and get away with their own crimes.

10 A lot of the stuff in the records is bullshit. It
11 says in the records that I put shit on the walls on one
12 occasion when I was living with the foster mother. This
13 is a scandalous lie. I have never done that. This is
14 in keeping with this common theme that my sister and
15 I were dirty. I just don't understand it.

16 The records also say that I was quite cheeky, not
17 nice, loud and attention-seeking, and my sister was the
18 opposite. It's also in the records that I am a liar.
19 All this information has obviously come from 'Susan',
20 who is the perpetrator. So the situation is that what's
21 on record is 'Susan's' version of events, not mine, and
22 everyone will think that's the truth. The reality is
23 that I never got the chance for my version of events to
24 be put on record. This makes me so angry. I feel like
25 I have nothing to support my version of events. This is

1 one of the reasons why the Inquiry is so important to
2 me, because I have nothing that is the actual truth."

3 At paragraphs 286 to 288 'Linda' speaks of taking
4 legal advice in relation to possibly raising civil
5 proceedings, partly for her own closure. At
6 paragraph 289 she says:

7 "This is another reason I wanted to speak to the
8 Inquiry. I think if I can't get any closure then
9 I should try and at least feed into something bigger.
10 It might not happen for me, but it's a way for me to try
11 and help others. I also think it will be good for me to
12 have a written statement that I've had some control
13 over."

14 Now to paragraph 291:

15 "I think in terms of improving safety for children
16 in care, the building blocks need to be put in place so
17 there's the opportunity for children to tell social
18 workers what's happening to them. They can't just show
19 up and expect someone to disclose their whole life to
20 them, especially when they've suffered something as
21 serious and terrifying as abuse.

22 As well as creating opportunities for children to
23 speak, I think social workers should keep a closer eye
24 on the children and carers. In my case, it wasn't hard
25 to see. 'Susan' didn't even wash, and we never touched

1 her. They need to visit the children more often. If
2 they only visit for an hour every so often, then it's
3 easy to convince them that everything is fine. The
4 children won't know them well enough to confide in them
5 and the carer can easily convince them that everything's
6 good. They need to look at things with a more critical
7 eye when they visit. Children can act as if
8 everything's fine if you only see them for a short
9 period of time, but if they're seen more often they
10 won't be able to keep the act up.

11 I think social workers should be better trained to
12 look for signs of abuse, like the police are learning
13 now. I was chronically sad. Young people shouldn't be
14 sad, and if they are, that is a clear warning sign.

15 The social work visits to 'Susan's' were always
16 pre-arranged. No one ever just turned up. I always
17 knew when they were coming and the house was always
18 cleaned. As far as I know the only checks done on
19 foster carers are the PVG checks. I don't know about
20 the logistics for this, but I wonder if there could be
21 more in-depth checking of foster carers, even when there
22 are no suspicions. I'm thinking that we could have
23 something like the Care Inspectorate just showing up at
24 people's houses. I think this would help protect kids
25 a bit better. They'd get a more realistic picture of

1 how people are living if they did that. If the carers
2 tried to shut the door on them and not let them in, they
3 would then know something was up.

4 I think also that when someone makes an allegation
5 about a carer, at the very least no other child should
6 be around that person. I don't understand how the
7 decision for us to go and live with 'Susan' was even
8 an option. There was still an element of risk there, so
9 it seems ridiculous to me that it was even considered.

10 I think social work should find ways of trying to
11 help and be inconspicuous when children tell them things
12 about their carer. I was afraid of the consequences
13 when I told Ms Higgins and then I refused to tell Eddie
14 when he was brought in. I had done my research and
15 I knew if I said anything they had a duty to act. If
16 they were able to reassure a child that they were not
17 going to say anything to the perpetrator then it would
18 be easier to tell them what's going on. I still feel
19 this way now living in supported care. There's no
20 opportunity to say how I really feel because all the
21 information is always shared. I feel that I can't
22 disclose anything or even say anything negative.

23 I hope that everything is made public by the
24 Inquiry, as there needs to be more awareness of the
25 number of people that have suffered abuse. I want

1 people to know that this is rife. I want the Inquiry's
2 report to inspire change in social work for children in
3 care. I don't know how the Inquiry feeds into the care
4 system, but I hope there's collaboration so there's
5 a better chance of change happening.

6 I don't have all the answers on how to improve
7 things, I just know that a lot needs to change.

8 I have no objection to my witness statement being
9 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

10 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
11 true."

12 'Linda' signed her statement on 19 November 2018.

13 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

14 I think we should certainly take a break now,

15 Ms Rattray.

16 MS RATTRAY: Yes.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18 (11.56 am)

19 (A short break)

20 (12.12 pm)

21 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

22 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

23 'Nora' (read)

24 MS INNES: The read-in that I'm going to do now is for

25 an applicant who wishes to remain anonymous and has

1 chosen the pseudonym 'Nora'. Her cypher is FDZ.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

3 MS INNES: 'Nora' was due to give oral evidence today, but
4 unfortunately has been unable to come and give oral
5 evidence.

6 'Nora' was in the care of Glasgow City Council. In
7 respect of a foster placement where abuse is alleged,
8 that was with JBV/JBW from
9 2000 until 2010. Moving to her
10 statement, which is at WIT.001.001.6968:

11 "My name is 'Nora'. I was born in 1994. I was born
12 in the Springboig area of Glasgow. I lived with my
13 parents.

14 I was the second youngest of six children. I had
15 an older sister and three older brothers. A brother
16 about 12 or 13 years older than me, then it was my
17 sister who is 10 years older me, my brother who is the
18 next oldest and then it was my brother who was five or
19 six years older than me. My wee brother was about
20 a year younger than me.

21 Me and my little brother had the same dad. The four
22 older ones had a different dad.

23 I went into care when I was two years old so I don't
24 have memory of my life with my parents. I have obtained
25 my records and it seems from them that my mum was

1 a binge drinker. My dad was drinking too and there were
2 lots of fights in the house.

3 I believe that my older siblings had been in and out
4 of care before I came along. When I went into care, all
5 of my siblings were taken into care too.

6 I moved to a house in Bishopbriggs in Glasgow with
7 the brothers closest in age to me. This is the first
8 place I remember, my older siblings were placed in
9 different care settings but I don't know where.

10 I only remember certain wee things. The three of us
11 shared a room. My older brother had a bed in an alcove
12 in the room. My younger brother and I had a cot.
13 I think I was three years old.

14 They seemed like nice people. I remember they had
15 a trampoline that you could hold onto and I would go
16 round it with my scooter. They lived on a grassy hill
17 with a path below it. I remember coming off the scooter
18 and going head first into the wall. I remember my
19 brother shouting, 'dad, dad'. The foster father came
20 out of the garage and took me to hospital in the
21 next-door neighbour's car.

22 I remember waking up one morning and the bunny
23 rabbit died with his paw in the cage. That's all
24 I remember of that place.

25 My records show that I was at a school in

1 Bishopbriggs but I don't remember it.

2 It turns out that my foster carers weren't nice
3 people, because my mum later told me that we were moved
4 from there because my older brother had been abused
5 there. He had been hit or something by the foster
6 father.

7 According to my records I was placed in a school in
8 Stirling. I think it was like a children's home. I was
9 placed there for about 21 days when I was five years
10 old. I have no memory of that so I don't know if it is
11 true that I was there.

12 My younger brother and I then went to different
13 foster carers.

14 I was five years old and my brother was four years
15 old when we went to stay with JBV/JBW
16 JBV/JBW. They lived in Knightswood, Glasgow.

17 I remember arriving at my new foster home. The
18 social worker took me and my brother. I think the
19 social worker at the time was Linda Wilson. She was our
20 social worker for the full time we were in Knightswood.
21 Linda Wilson's team leader was Jackie Sheeran so it so
22 have been her to took us to the new foster home.

23 The foster parents, who were called JBV/JBW
24 JBV/JBW had bought us one of those yellow and
25 red plastic cars. I saw that when I arrived. The rest

1 of my earlier memories are vague. I don't really
2 remember things until I was ten years old.

3 We lived in an upstairs and downstairs house with
4 JBW and JBV. There were two bedrooms and the
5 bathroom upstairs and the dining room, living room and
6 kitchen were downstairs. Me and my brother shared
7 a bedroom for a while. The dining room eventually got
8 turned into my room when I was in high school. This was
9 just because of our age and I needed my own room.

10 JBW and JBV didn't have any children of their
11 own, they had a dog. They wanted us to call them 'mum'
12 and 'dad', so that's what we called them. I think it
13 was more for the outside world. They didn't want people
14 to know that we were fostered. We didn't know a lot
15 about being fostered until we were older and had left.

16 There were no kind of house rules about knocking
17 before coming into my room. JBW and JBV would
18 just walk in without knocking. Most of the time the
19 door to my room would be open during the day because it
20 was attached to the living room.

21 We had normal chores to help clean the stairs and
22 Hoover the living room. We also just had to clean up
23 after ourselves.

24 We could help ourselves to food in the kitchen when
25 we wanted to. JBV and JBW did the cooking. We

1 also just took a bath or shower whenever we wanted to.

2 There were no rules about things.

3 We went to school at St Ninian's. We were then made
4 to move school when I was in Primary 6. We were made to
5 move to Temple Primary School because JBV said it
6 was easier for her to get to work after dropping us off
7 at school. I didn't want to move school and was in
8 tears about that. I was about ten years old.

9 The social worker never spoke to me about it, but my
10 social work records say that I had been asked about it.

11 JBV told the social work that the reason she
12 made us move school was because of bullying. That
13 wasn't true, it was because it was easier for JBV .
14 I actually started to get bullied by a boy when I moved
15 to Temple Primary. I would end up in tears because
16 I was so angry.

17 One day the bullying got too much and the boy put
18 his knee into the back of my leg. This was at the end
19 of the day and I was in tears. I had had enough and
20 I told the teacher. My friend got JBV who was
21 outside and JBV came into the school. I can't
22 remember what happened because we were in Primary 7 and
23 almost going into secondary school.

24 I went to Knightswood Secondary School. The boy who
25 used to bully me in primary went so the same secondary

1 and was in my registration class. He carried on his
2 bullying and was eventually made to move class.

3 I enjoyed school. I hated maths, but I think that
4 was because JBW was a maths teacher. He worked at
5 another secondary school. I tried to ask him to help me
6 with my maths at home, but he would scream and shout at
7 me if I didn't know an answer. He would tell me I was
8 stupid and he didn't have any patience with me.

9 I think it was frustrating for JBW that he was
10 a maths teacher and I couldn't do maths. When I failed
11 a maths test at school I knew I would get into trouble
12 for it when I went home. He would shout at me and say
13 he couldn't understand how I could fail maths when he
14 was there to help me. I think he was blind to his own
15 behaviour.

16 JBW would sometimes just do my English homework for
17 me because he didn't have the patience to explain
18 things. It would then become a screaming match and then
19 he would just do it for me.

20 JBV would sometimes be there when JBW was
21 shouting at me, but she didn't do anything. She
22 couldn't stand up to him. My brother got it in the ear
23 from JBW once as well.

24 JBW tutored some of the children of family friends.
25 He didn't react in the same way with them. JBW had one

1 personality in the house with us and another personality
2 for other people. JBV was the same. They both
3 played completely different people around other people.
4 They knew how to please people and act like they were
5 perfect, but they were horrible in the house with us.

6 JBV took me to a speech therapist because she
7 noticed that I wasn't pronouncing some words properly.

8 I ended up not liking school and not wanting to be
9 there. This was a mixture of what was going on at home
10 and not fitting into certain groups at school.

11 I struggled with French. JBV wrote a letter to
12 the school asking if I could do something else because
13 I was seeing a speech therapist and struggled with
14 English, let alone French. The school didn't let me
15 change.

16 I did standard grades and passed some of them.

17 Birthdays and Christmases were good. We were
18 spoiled at times.

19 We didn't get as much if we were going on holiday,
20 which was fair enough. One year we were going to
21 Benidorm on Boxing Day so we got less presents.
22 I remember my brother got a football strip and I was
23 annoyed because I got less things than him. He got more
24 spoiled than me.

25 We went to mass the odd time at Christmas. Other

1 than that, religion didn't really play a part in our
2 lives because the JBV/JBW weren't very religious.
3 I had been baptised with my mum and had my First Holy
4 Communion at St Ninian's. My brother didn't get that
5 because we moved school. My mum wasn't happy about
6 that.

7 I would have friends round for my birthday or go out
8 for dinner. It was the same as the other kids got for
9 their birthdays.

10 We went abroad quite a lot or to the Lake District.
11 They were good trips. I liked going to the Lake
12 District because I always got a new book when I was
13 there.

14 I was able to see my mum about once a fortnight
15 through the social worker. Me and my brother would meet
16 her in the contact centre or in McDonald's. We would
17 only meet my mum and she would sometimes bring my older
18 brother along. We never saw our two oldest brothers and
19 my dad was never around.

20 None of our real family was allowed to come to our
21 house. JBW and JBV wouldn't allow it. They
22 didn't want us to see our real family.

23 Conversation with my mum was hard because she didn't
24 know what to ask us and we didn't know what to say to
25 her. The relationship was hard to build on when we were

1 younger.

2 Social work didn't organise any contact with our
3 siblings. My sister then fought with a lawyer to be
4 able to see us too and she was allowed to. It was
5 easier with my sister because she was closer in age and
6 we had more to chat about.

7 My mum was still drinking on and off. I don't know
8 if she got any support from the social work. I think
9 she tried to get help from other places.

10 My mum came to one of the contacts whilst drunk. We
11 were waiting on Argyle Street in Glasgow with the social
12 worker and a heavily pregnant woman who was going to
13 observe the contact. The social worker had received
14 a call from my mum's key worker to say that my mum had
15 found her friend dead that morning and there was
16 a possibility she would turn to drink because of what
17 she'd seen. My mum turned up drunk. She tried to give
18 us a cuddle but the social worker stopped her, but we
19 wanted a cuddle.

20 My mum kicked off and started calling the social
21 worker every name under the sun. The social worker took
22 us away from her. I was a bit taken aback. I was upset
23 because my mum was upset and wanted to look after her.
24 I understand now that the social worker just wanted us
25 away from my mum, but I didn't understand at the time.

1 JBV and JBW didn't want us to see our real
2 family. They tried to cut it out or wanted it to be
3 written contact. They told the social work that we
4 would be upset after meetings. A safeguarder got
5 involved to get statements from everyone. That
6 backfired on my foster carers because we said the
7 opposite and told the safeguarder that we wanted to see
8 my mum more.

9 Contact with my mum stayed the same after the
10 safeguarder's report. We would see my mum for a few
11 hours once a fortnight. My sister would come to meet us
12 too, but she had to pre-arrange it with the social
13 workers if she wanted to bring her kids. She wanted us
14 to build a relationship with her kids but the social
15 workers thought it took the focus of the contact away
16 from us.

17 We didn't have enough trust with the social workers
18 to talk to them. I didn't feel like I could speak
19 openly to the social workers or that I would be
20 believed. I didn't remember them asking me directly if
21 I was happy or not. I felt JBW and JBV had more
22 authority. We saw the social workers usually around the
23 time we had contact with our family. The only time we
24 would spend alone was in the taxi journey to and from
25 contact.

1 I sometimes saw the social worker alone, but that
2 was if she specifically asked to speak to me alone when
3 she came to the house. We would talk in my room and she
4 would ask me how things were and what we had been up to.
5 I don't know how many times that would have happened,
6 but when it did JBW would straight away ask me
7 what we'd talked about afterwards.

8 JBW and JBV would tell us what we could and
9 could not talk about before panels. We didn't go to all
10 the panel meetings. Sometimes we would be at school.

11 JBW and JBV wouldn't go to all of them either.

12 I can't remember if we took any of our own clothes
13 with us when we went to the foster carers. We lived
14 with them for ten years so they bought all of our
15 clothes.

16 I had some choice about what I was allowed to buy
17 and wear, but I had to always be nice and neat.

18 My brother would get designer trainers that were
19 about £60, but I would get the cheaper trainers that
20 would be about £15. That led to me being bullied at
21 school. It was very noticeable sometimes how we were
22 dressed differently. I never questioned it.

23 We would get money to go shopping or to go to the
24 cinema. We would get it if we asked for it. I would
25 sometimes be allowed to go out if I wanted to.

1 I was allowed to have friends come to the house, but
2 they weren't allowed to stay over. I was not allowed to
3 ever stay the night at my friends' houses, even though
4 one of my friends only lived two streets away. I don't
5 know why not.

6 [JBW] and [JBV] were violent.

7 I always had to look nice and neat. I wasn't
8 allowed to wear tracksuit bottoms unless it was my dance
9 uniform. I didn't realise that I had naturally curly
10 hair because [JBV] always straightened my hair. She
11 would make me put make-up on before we went out
12 anywhere. She would do that when I was 12 or 13 years
13 old.

14 One day I put rollers in my hair and kept them in
15 overnight. When I took them out in the morning,
16 [JBV] didn't like it. She dragged me by the hair
17 and stood me in front of the mirror and said, 'Look at
18 the state of you'. We were supposed to be going to her
19 sister's house for her birthday, but she said she
20 couldn't take me anywhere looking like that. She
21 stormed out of the house and left me and my brother.

22 I decided that I'd had enough and threw everything
23 off my desk onto the floor and started packing my things
24 to leave. I was about 12 or 13 years old. [JBW] asked
25 me what I was doing and I said I was leaving. [JBV]

1 then came back and took us to her sister's house. Her
2 sister commented that my hair looked nice and I told her
3 JBV hadn't liked it. That was me being a bit of
4 a witch, saying that in front of JBV.

5 I was treated differently than my brother. I got
6 into trouble a lot more. I would also get in trouble
7 more when I was playing with other cousins at
8 JBV's mum or sister's house. Even the cousins
9 noticed it.

10 JBV would tell me that I was going to end up
11 like my mum with seven different kids to seven different
12 fathers. I couldn't do right for doing wrong with her.
13 She would moan that others at work bragged about their
14 children, but she couldn't do that because we didn't do
15 anything for her to brag about. We would tell her that
16 my brother was doing Boys' Brigade and I was winning
17 dance competitions, so there were things she could say.

18 JBW would lose his temper quite easily with both of
19 us. My brother got it more than I got it from JBW.

20 One day when my brother was about 11 or 12 years old, he
21 was messing about in the kitchen and answering back to
22 JBW. JBW stormed into the kitchen, grabbed my brother
23 by the throat and held him up against the wall. My
24 brother's feet were off the floor. JBV was in
25 tears and trying to get JBW to stop, but there was

1 nothing she could do. I think she was scared of JBW.

2 One night when I was 14 years old, JBW had heard me
3 on the phone in my room. He would stand outside my door
4 and listen. He came in and I hid my phone under the
5 bed. He asked me where my phone was and I said it was
6 in my school bag. He told me to get it so I hid the
7 phone in the waistband of my pyjamas and went to my
8 school bag on the floor and pretended to scramble around
9 to find it. JBW was sitting behind me on the bed and
10 told me to hurry up and then he kicked me in the back.

11 I said I needed to go to the toilet and ran
12 upstairs. I text my boyfriend at the time and said that
13 JBW had heard me on the phone and asked him not to
14 phone me back. I then deleted all the text messages.
15 I went downstairs and managed to sneak the phone into my
16 school bag. JBW took the phone and I went to bed.

17 I was seeing a boy when I was 14 years old. He was
18 16 years old and I fell pregnant. I went to the doctor
19 with my friend to discuss my options and a termination.
20 They booked me in to see a gynaecologist. When I went
21 to see a psychologist, she saw my medical records.
22 I said that I had gone to see a doctor about
23 a termination but then I changed my mind. The
24 psychologist said that was backed up by the fact that
25 I never went to any other appointments.

1 I wasn't planning on telling JBV I was
2 pregnant. Me and my boyfriend agreed not to tell them.
3 His parents knew that we wanted to keep the baby, but my
4 boyfriend's mother came round to the house and told
5 JBV. I think she felt JBV had a right to
6 know.

7 I ran away to my boyfriend's house one night.
8 JBV and my brother came looking for me and found
9 his house. I told my boyfriend not to let her take me
10 away because I would just get hit for running away when
11 I got home. I said it in front of JBV and she was
12 telling me not to be stupid and to get home.

13 JBV took me away and my boyfriend asked me
14 that he be kept updated about what was happening with
15 the baby. JBV said she would keep him updated.
16 When we got home, JBV asked why I had said I was
17 going to get hit and I said because I knew I would. She
18 then took my phone off me and said that my boyfriend
19 wouldn't be finding out anything about the baby. She
20 then started to ask me why I had been upstairs in the
21 bedroom.

22 JBV was upset about the whole situation. She
23 told me I was silly and that we needed to speak to
24 someone. We went to see someone in a building near
25 Strathclyde University. The woman at the meeting made

1 me take another pregnancy test and told me to discuss
2 the pros and cons of the pregnancy and keeping the baby.
3 JBV booked me into a sexual health clinic at
4 Sandyford Place in Glasgow. JBW took me to the
5 appointment and made me put a different surname on the
6 form. I am guessing this was to hide the truth so that
7 I wouldn't flag up in the system and nobody would know.
8 At the appointment they checked how far along in the
9 pregnancy I was.

10 My boyfriend came over one night and JBW and
11 JBV had a go at him. They asked him what school,
12 their family and social work would all think and say
13 about it. They asked what kind of person he was and
14 what kind of person gets a girl pregnant. They were
15 making out that he was a pervert and it was all his
16 fault. We told them it was a mutual thing and I had
17 consented. He ended up leaving the house in tears.

18 JBV kept saying that it was my decision to
19 keep the baby if I wanted, but then saying what about
20 them and what about her family. I knew deep down that
21 she was just saying it was up to me, but that it wasn't.
22 We didn't have a discussion about the pros and cons and
23 I wasn't asked what I wanted. It was more about them
24 and what people would think, because I wasn't the
25 perfect child that she wanted. None of it was about me.

1 It was about what they wanted.

2 JBV took me to all my appointments after that.
3 Whenever she took me to the clinic in Sandyford, she
4 made me wear a tracksuit and have my hair tucked into my
5 top and wear a hat. I was to look messy and unclean and
6 keep my head down so that nobody would recognise me.
7 The discussions at the appointments all led to me having
8 a termination.

9 I was given a tablet to start the termination
10 process. I tried to hold it in my mouth for as long as
11 I could without swallowing it because I didn't want
12 a termination. JBV made sure that I swallowed it.
13 The next part was the hospital procedure.

14 My brother was told that I had an appointment at the
15 dental hospital. He was told to tell everyone at school
16 that. My best pal knew the truth because she was
17 friends with my boyfriend.

18 I was in hospital from first thing in the morning
19 until 7 pm at night and the termination procedure was
20 carried out. JBV stayed with me all day. There
21 was not really any conversation or affection. She did
22 tell me not to look when I gave birth. She wanted me to
23 have the implant contraceptive put in my arm that day
24 before I left, so I had to have that.

25 On the way out of the hospital and in the car home

1 I was told to slouch down in the car so nobody would see
2 me. I was to go straight to my room when I got home so
3 that my brother wouldn't know anything. Everything had
4 been hidden from him.

5 After that, it was almost as if it was done and
6 dusted and dealt with. I had the next day off school.
7 I phoned my boyfriend to tell him what had happened. He
8 said he knew that would happen.

9 I didn't speak to anybody about it. I just knew not
10 to. We were grown up knowing what to discuss with
11 people.

12 JBW used to come into my rooms at nights. This was
13 when I was 11 years old. He would have a carry on with
14 me but he would lift up my top and touch me under my
15 top.

16 I got a pink Nokia phone for my 12th birthday. If
17 I was to get it early, he was putting his hand up my
18 top. I knew it wasn't right. I would shout on my
19 brother to come out of his room, pretending it was
20 a carry on thing. I thought it would stop if my brother
21 came into the room, which it did.

22 My bedroom door would be shut at night, but I know
23 that JBW would come into the living room and watch
24 porn. I know that because there was a glass cabinet
25 against the wall and if I opened my bedroom door

1 slightly, I could see the reflection from the TV on it.
2 Sometimes I would get up to go to the toilet. He would
3 switch the TV off or jump up and try to hide what he was
4 watching on the telly.

5 When I was about 14 years old, I used to wake up at
6 nights and he would be there leaning over me. I would
7 wriggle myself about. Then he would put the light on
8 and ask me why I wasn't sleeping. I would say that
9 I couldn't sleep and then he would come back through
10 with a pill and water to help me get to sleep.

11 JBW would check my washing basket before I went to
12 bed to see if I had taken my underwear off. He would
13 tell me to wear a nightie dress to bed some nights.
14 Sometimes when I woke up some buttons on my pyjama top
15 would be undone. Sometimes my nipples would have little
16 cuts on them. I would feel like something wasn't right.

17 I tried to put a wooden chair against my door at
18 night, but it wasn't heavy enough to keep the door shut.
19 Sometimes I would wake up at night and he would hide in
20 the kitchen to pretend he wasn't there. There was
21 an alcove in the kitchen beside the freezer and he would
22 hide there because I couldn't see him when I looked into
23 the kitchen. This would be after he had been in my
24 room.

25 I think JBW was coming into my room almost every

1 night. A lot of it was a blur. Especially after
2 whatever tablet he would give me. He would give me one
3 whenever I woke up. I worked out afterwards, when
4 I moved away, that he was probably giving me one of my
5 brother's ADHD tablets, which were supposed to help him
6 sleep at night. They were the only pills that were in
7 the kitchen. We later worked out that some of my
8 brother's pills were missing.

9 I told JBV one day when we went to Braehead
10 after I had an exam. We were sitting at a coffee table
11 and I told her that JBW was coming into my room at
12 nights and hovering over me. She looked confused and
13 said it was strange. She never came back to me to
14 discuss it again, it was just swept under the carpet
15 until the next time I told her. I must have told her
16 about it on three different occasions. There was still
17 no reaction from her. I just got a confused, puzzled
18 look from her.

19 We went on holiday to Benidorm on Boxing Day in 2009
20 and stayed over the New Year. Me and my brother had
21 been sharing a room. One day on holiday my brother
22 said, 'I saw JBW sitting on your bed last night'. He
23 said this in front of two boys we had met on holiday and
24 I just laughed it off. I didn't know what I was
25 supposed to say in front of two random strangers.

1 I told JBW that my brother had seen JBW
2 sitting on my bed at night. She had a word with JBW
3 that night in their room. I heard her asking him, but
4 I didn't hear his response.

5 JBW kept on coming into my room at night even after
6 we came back from the holiday. One night I thought
7 I would stay up to see what was happening. I stayed
8 awake and I realised that it was sexual abuse that was
9 happening. He put his hands down my trousers and put
10 his finger inside of me. At that point I just froze.
11 My body had frozen stiff. Then I came out of it and
12 started to wriggle my body around. JBW left my room
13 and went into the kitchen. He then came back into my
14 room to try to put his hand up my top. I started to
15 wriggle around again pretending that I was starting to
16 wake up from my sleep. He then left the room.

17 I knew what was happening wasn't right. I was
18 confused. What are you supposed to do when someone who
19 is looking after you does this to you? I didn't feel
20 like I could tell JBW. I didn't know what she
21 would do if I told her. The next night I text a boy
22 I was speaking to in Kirkintilloch. I told him what
23 JBW was doing at night. I decided that I needed to run
24 away. I was 15 years old at the time.

25 I tried to kill myself a few times. I would also

1 self-harm. This was to take me away from all that was
2 going on.

3 I decided to try and contact some of my real family.
4 One day after school I went to my auntie's house who
5 I had found on social media. I had been stealing money
6 from JBW and JBV's house for a few weeks to run
7 away. That paid my taxi fare to go to my auntie's
8 house.

9 Once I got there, I asked to speak to my mum so my
10 auntie phoned my mum. I broke down on the phone and
11 told her that JBW had been sexually abusing me. My mum
12 had been drinking but she told me to get a taxi to her
13 house right away, so I did.

14 I couldn't find her flat in the scheme when I got
15 there. My mum found me and took me up to her flat with
16 her partner and the dog. She had some coffee to sober
17 up and took me to my oldest brother's house. It was
18 a surprise for him. We ordered food and then I was sent
19 into a room to play with my niece while my mum spoke to
20 my brother and his girlfriend.

21 My brother's girlfriend took me to the police
22 station at Possilpark. They said we needed to go to
23 Drumchapel where I had been reported missing, so they
24 took me there. The police questioned me about what had
25 been happening. I told them everything. I was there

1 from midnight until about 3 am. I wasn't medically
2 examined because the police didn't think there was any
3 point.

4 My brother's girlfriend sat in the police interview
5 with me because I didn't want my mum to hear it all.
6 They took my younger brother out of the house that night
7 and brought him to the police station. Emergency social
8 workers, who I didn't know, came in and were taking me
9 and my brother somewhere to stay for the night. I asked
10 to see my mum and they said no. At that point I broke
11 down and was in tears. I was fine and calm the whole
12 time up until then and had told the police what had
13 happened.

14 My brother and I were bundled into the back of a car
15 and taken to a children's unit near Finnieston that
16 morning to get a few hours' sleep. We were told that we
17 were being taken for the night. There was only one
18 bedroom available and I said that my brother could take
19 it and I would sleep on the couch. I couldn't stop
20 crying. The social worker checked I was okay and then
21 left us.

22 I was in a daze the next morning and in this random
23 place with these random people. I didn't want to be
24 there or go back there. The social workers came and
25 took us back to the police station for more interviews

1 and questions. I was made to retell what I had told
2 them the night before, more or less. My brother was
3 questioned that day too but he didn't know anything that
4 had happened to me.

5 The social workers then came and took me to [REDACTED] and
6 [REDACTED]'s, our new foster parents. I can't remember which
7 social worker took us there. I roughly remember them
8 explaining things to us. They tried to find somewhere
9 else for us first, but I think [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] were the
10 ones who answered the phone.

11 I never saw JBW and JBV [REDACTED] again. They tried to
12 contact my brother a few times.

13 I was with the JBV/JBW [REDACTED] for ten years. The last
14 five years were horrible. The memories of the first
15 five years were nice. They would sometimes give us hugs
16 and we would sometimes get praise. They looked after us
17 to a certain extent, but I do think we were just their
18 little robots. They tried to mould us into these
19 perfect children. I think it became apparent in the
20 last five years that they couldn't mould us.

21 I told JBV [REDACTED] about JBW coming into my room
22 a few times. I don't know if she ever spoke to him, but
23 it never stopped happening.

24 I told my mum about JBW sexually abusing me and my
25 mum took me to the police. I gave a statement to the

1 police twice about what JBW had been doing to me. As
2 far as I know, it went to the Procurator Fiscal. I was
3 told that somebody would be in contact but nobody ever
4 was. I never got a letter from the police or social
5 work.

6 I was 15 years old when we were taken to our new
7 foster parents, [REDACTED]. I think
8 an emergency social worker took us. It was dark when we
9 pulled up to their house. We went in and were
10 introduced to them and then they brought down the other
11 kids to meet us.

12 There were two other foster girls and a boy who
13 lived there. The boy was 11, one girl was about 18 and
14 the other was about 12. The oldest girl had been there
15 for about 10 years.

16 It was strange, because me and my brother were used
17 to it just being us for so long. [REDACTED] asked us if we
18 wanted food and ordered us a Chinese takeaway. I didn't
19 eat much because I was nervous. I then went to my room
20 and I had to share with the girls. The first night was
21 okay. They were very welcoming.

22 It was a relief to be away from the JBV/JBW [REDACTED] and
23 also to be far away from Glasgow, but a bit of a panic
24 about the new situation.

25 The social workers came back two days later to see

1 how we were. That was when they had a chat with me and
2 I told them what had happened at the JBV/JBW . They
3 didn't know, because it wasn't in my social work
4 records.

5 I told about what had happened before and
6 JBW's abuse. This was in the first week and I told her
7 in front of my brother so he could understand too. believed me when I told her about JBW and she has
8 always been there by my side. I felt like I wasn't
9 believed by others because nothing was done about it.

11 Things were good at and 's. It was
12 different because there were five of us in
13 a three-bedroom house. There was a bunk bed and a
14 single bed in the girls' room. I slept on the single
15 bed. Sharing things with other people was hard for me
16 at first.

17 I clicked with the older girl straight away because
18 she liked dancing too and we would go dancing together.
19 I struggled with the younger girl.

20 It was good there and I have stayed there. I now
21 have my own room. The boy moved because he kept running
22 out. The older girl moved out when she was 21, but she
23 just moved up the road. Me and the younger girl didn't
24 get on because she was stealing and was acting strange.
25 sat us down to talk about things.

1 A suitcase of our clothes had come to the police
2 station and we opened it at [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]'s. All my
3 stuff was clothes from the holiday in Benidorm, so it
4 was summery clothes. I had arrived in my school uniform
5 so we had to go shopping to get new clothes.

6 [REDACTED] JBW and [REDACTED] JBV were supposed to send our
7 personal things on, but they missed a lot of things out.
8 They later sent more of my clothes and things that
9 I could wear. They forwarded on my dancing trophies,
10 but I never got some other things like pictures.

11 I was in fourth year and my brother and I were still
12 going to the same school. A driver would drive us there
13 and back. My social worker, Linda, would come and see
14 me at school. She also had a chat with school to keep
15 them informed on my home life.

16 I wanted to move school to get a fresh start, but it
17 was better to wait until I finished my exams and fourth
18 year. After fourth year, I moved to Garnock Academy in
19 Ayrshire. It was hard to settle into a new school at
20 that age. I did my intermediate ones and two when I was
21 there.

22 [REDACTED] would give us pocket money but that stopped
23 when I started getting a £60 bursary every fortnight
24 from school. [REDACTED] would try and help us budget, and she
25 would still give me money if I asked for it, if I told

1 her what it was for.

2 Social work had put me in touch with their family
3 and children counsellor. [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] would take me
4 to my appointments in Glasgow. The woman I was seeing
5 said I couldn't talk about anything that had happened to
6 me for legal reasons because it was with the police.
7 I went a couple of times and we discussed things from my
8 early stages of life. I didn't find it useful so
9 I didn't go back after about four sessions.

10 I didn't have much contact with social work after
11 the first couple of months I moved in. They didn't
12 really check up on me.

13 'Linda' got early retirement within the first year
14 I was at [REDACTED]'s. My mum told me and I told [REDACTED]. It
15 should have been the other way around. [REDACTED] should have
16 told me and I should have told my mum. Linda should
17 have spoken to me before she left.

18 I got another social worker called Alex Bruce
19 eventually but it took a while. He told me that he was
20 only going to be there for a short while. When
21 I finished with him, I met a woman in the house and she
22 told me that she wouldn't be my social worker. She gave
23 me a date and time to meet the woman who was going to be
24 my social worker. I was to meet her under the clock at
25 Central Station. I waited for an hour and nobody turned

1 up.

2 Social workers would meet me one to one when they
3 came, but because they didn't come often and it was
4 always someone different I didn't build a relationship
5 with them. They would just be asking questions to tick
6 boxes on their forms.

7 I never heard from the social work department for
8 a while after that. [REDACTED] arranged for a children's
9 rights officer to talk to us. Me and my brother were
10 then appointed a social worker called Andrew. He has
11 been my social worker for a few years but I haven't seen
12 him in well over a year.

13 Nobody really checked up on me after I moved to [REDACTED]
14 and [REDACTED]'s. [REDACTED] pointed out that I was placed with
15 them because of what had happened to me in previous
16 foster care, yet nobody checked up on me. Nobody built
17 a relationship with me. They could have killed me and
18 buried me in the garden and social work would not know.

19 There was an incident between the boy and my brother
20 after two years. I don't know what happened but some
21 social workers came round. [REDACTED] said she wouldn't let
22 them move my brother, but they moved him that day. He
23 was 14 years old.

24 I couldn't process that he was being taken away
25 straight away after we had been together all our lives.

1 [REDACTED] was the only one that had checked that I was okay.
2 It was difficult too because she had built a bond with
3 him. She had helped discover that he didn't have ADHD.

4 My brother was moved and put into a children's unit
5 in Glasgow, which was 10 minutes from where we used to
6 live with the JBV/JBW [REDACTED]. He stayed there for a year
7 or two. He was left there. I was able to see him a few
8 times if I contacted him to arrange it. He had a lot of
9 freedom to do what he wanted there. He would sometimes
10 run away and come back to [REDACTED]'s. She would call and
11 send him back.

12 [REDACTED] was always open about contact with our
13 families. There was no social work help to make
14 arrangements with my family, but I could do it myself
15 because [REDACTED] was okay with it. My mum had met [REDACTED] at
16 meetings and liked and trusted her. My family didn't
17 come to the house.

18 I had told Andrew that I wasn't getting on with the
19 girl. I was angry with her and had said in anger that
20 I wanted to leave if she didn't leave. That was put in
21 my social work records.

22 Her social worker and Andrew sat down to talk about
23 things. Her social worker then made a comment to [REDACTED]
24 saying that things couldn't be that great in the house
25 if even I had said that I wanted to leave. I had said

1 that to my social worker in anger. The other girl's
2 social worker had read that from my file and told [REDACTED].
3 She had no right to do that.

4 I am the only one left at [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]'s now.
5 Social work wouldn't let her foster again. They said it
6 was because she had a snib on the outside of her living
7 room door. I don't understand why that would be
8 a problem. We could still have gone into the living
9 room if we wanted to. She took it off a couple of weeks
10 after they told her it was an issue.

11 Things are really relaxed at [REDACTED] and [REDACTED]'s.
12 I feel like I am just part of a family there. I get
13 cuddles when it is my birthday or to say thanks and well
14 done for anything. It has been a supportive experience
15 that has made me a stronger person. I think everyone
16 needs more foster carers ..."

17 It says "with them", maybe it should be "like them":

18 "I am 23 years old now but I am still sort of in the
19 care system. The social work arrangement is supposed to
20 change when you turn 18. A woman from social work came
21 to the house to see [REDACTED] last week and she said that
22 I should have changed to an arrangement called
23 'continuing care' when I turned 18. This would mean
24 that [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] become supported carers and get less
25 money. This never happened. They have a new worker now

1 that has got the ball rolling to change the arrangement.

2 I have heard from others that when the arrangement
3 changes from foster carer to supported carer, they get
4 set times to do their own washing. It becomes more like
5 living in a hostel. I was worried about that, because
6 I didn't want things to change from being a family
7 environment. [REDACTED] has said it wouldn't change things
8 with us, but it's a shame for other children if that
9 happens. They must just feel like they are lodging in
10 someone else's house.

11 One of my older brothers passed away 10 or 11 years
12 ago.

13 I am currently a student and I am studying for
14 a BA Honours in education and Social Services. I am in
15 my honours year and I plan to do a masters when
16 I finish. I ultimately want to work as a children's
17 advocate for Who Cares? Scotland.

18 I had reported JBW [REDACTED] to the police when
19 I was 15 and I never heard anything back for three
20 years. I got legal help in 2012 and 2013 when I was
21 about 18 years old. I kept getting passed to different
22 lawyers, but they would say they couldn't help because
23 there wasn't enough evidence.

24 I found out later that the Procurator Fiscal had
25 decided not to go ahead with it because there was no

1 evidence. Nobody had told me.

2 A social worker told ' [REDACTED] ' to go to a different
3 lawyer called Livingstone Brown for a civil action.

4 I am suing the JBV/JBW [REDACTED] for taking me to
5 a termination when they had no right to, and the social
6 work for neglect because not a single soul has been
7 there.

8 I have been with Livingstone Brown for two years
9 now. It has been a long and painful process. We are at
10 the closing stages with that. It has been a problem
11 getting legal aid. Legal aid wanted statements from my
12 mum and brother and a psychologist's report before they
13 gave me legal aid. I have had to resubmit another form
14 and we are waiting for that to be sorted.

15 Glasgow City Council are trying to say that the
16 foster carers are not employed by them so they are not
17 at fault. I have seen what JBW [REDACTED] and JBV [REDACTED] have said
18 in their report to their solicitor. They have said that
19 my court action is a malicious act because I was in care
20 and that I know they have money and will have to pay for
21 the court action.

22 I used to have nightmares of bumping into the
23 JBV/JBW [REDACTED] and them coming into my work. The thing
24 I relive the most is flashbacks of the abuse that
25 happened.

1 I have low self-esteem due to the emotional abuse.
2 I don't feel worthy. I think this is from JBW telling
3 me that I was stupid because I wasn't good at maths and
4 JBW saying I would turn out like my mum.
5 I don't wear make-up most of the time now and just
6 put my hair up in a bun. I think that's because I was
7 forced into dressing up so much and made to wear make-up
8 when I was in foster care with the JBV/JBW.
9 I used to be really, really skinny and I started
10 putting on weight a couple of years ago. I struggled
11 with that and felt like I needed to lose weight.
12 Sometimes I feel fine and some days I feel like I need
13 to make more of an effort with myself and lose weight.
14 I had a breakdown a couple of months ago. I was
15 having an argument with my partner and I was sick. He
16 got annoyed and I just blanked out. I didn't speak.
17 I just sat quietly and scratched my hands.
18 . I remember doing
19 it but I didn't have any feeling while doing it. I have
20 two scars now. That was the first time in years
21 I self-harmed.
22 I didn't know what I used to do when I lived at the
23 JBV/JBW ' was self-harm. It was never talked about
24 then. I was at an event called Who Cares? recently and
25 that's when I realised that I had poor mental health at

1 age 13 and 14, and was self-harming. It still affects
2 me with flashbacks and the pain.

3 I didn't know much about the situation of being
4 fostered until I got my records. It was only then that
5 I was able to own that care identity. We were made to
6 call JBW and JBV 'mum' and 'dad'. My real mum
7 didn't like that because she was our mum.

8 My lawyer has seven files on me, which he has
9 managed to get from social work.

10 I only remember being in three different placements,
11 but my records show that I have been in six. I know
12 from my records that I was placed in a school for
13 children in Stirling when I was five years old. I have
14 no memory of that so I don't know if it is true.
15 I would have to see records of the time periods to know
16 if that was true.

17 Social workers need to have more regular contact and
18 check up on families. They need to have a better
19 relationship with children so children can say if
20 something isn't right. They should meet children where
21 the child feels more comfortable. It should feel more
22 like a fun day out rather than a meeting. This would
23 help children express themselves.

24 When a child does come forward to say something
25 isn't right, there needs to be support afterwards. The

1 child should not just be forgotten about and left to
2 deal with it alone. I think more training for social
3 workers and smaller caseloads would help them to do
4 a better job.

5 I have no objection to my witness statement being
6 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
7 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
8 true."

9 'Nora' signed her statement on 23 February 2018.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Ms Innes.

11 We used the **JBV/JBW** names in the course of that
12 read-in, but they're covered by my general restriction
13 order and they mustn't be identified outside this room.

14 I think it's time that we should take the lunch
15 break and we have a witness attending for 2 o'clock,
16 have we?

17 MS INNES: We do.

18 We do have a very short read-in, which will take
19 just about ten minutes.

20 LADY SMITH: Oh, let's do that then.

21 Sorry, I didn't realise that could also be cleared
22 just now.

23 Elspeth Cromar (read)

24 MS RATTRAY: My Lady, this is a statement of Elspeth Cromar.

25 Elspeth Cromar, otherwise known as Margaret Mennie,

1 is the foster carer who we heard about yesterday --

2 LADY SMITH: Yes.

3 MS RATTRAY: -- when evidence was given. She is the person

4 we showed on the screen has been convicted of physical

5 abuse of three of the foster children in her care.

6 LADY SMITH: Yes, you referred us to the document detailing

7 the charges and her conviction and a community payback

8 order, I think.

9 MS RATTRAY: That's correct. The conviction was in respect

10 of assault by hitting the children repeatedly on their

11 body, including with slippers, and there was also

12 reference to the boys being tied by the wrist to the bed

13 and the children being locked in a cupboard.

14 LADY SMITH: The cupboard was also one of the charges, yes.

15 Thank you very much.

16 MS RATTRAY: Obviously, as someone convicted of child abuse

17 this person is not anonymous.

18 LADY SMITH: That's right yes. Thank you.

19 So it's both names, she was Margaret Mennie and then

20 she became Elspeth Cromar.

21 MS RATTRAY: That's right.

22 "My name is Elspeth Cromar. I have also been known

23 by the surnames Munro, Ross and Mennie. I was born in

24 1949. My contact details are known to the Inquiry.

25 I became a foster carer because I loved children.

1 I was a foster carer from 1988 until 2000. I went
2 through various checks before becoming a foster carer.

3 I did not receive any training before or during my
4 time as a foster carer. I did get ongoing visits from
5 social workers for children that I was looking after.

6 I did not view myself as either employed or
7 self-employed. I did not see being a foster carer as
8 a job as I was caring for children who needed it.
9 I looked after emergency, long-term and short-term
10 children as required and as space allowed me to.

11 I was provided with money to help me provide care
12 for the children who were put into my care. All the
13 money I received was used on the children in my care, to
14 help with extra costs for food, clothes, toys and
15 holidays.

16 Originally I fostered [REDACTED]. After
17 [REDACTED] I fostered alone with the support of my
18 eldest daughter. I had sons at home at the time of the
19 fostering. I resided in Dunblane, Edinburgh and
20 [REDACTED], West Lothian, during my time as a foster
21 carer. When we moved to Edinburgh, we built
22 an extension onto the house which was funded with help
23 from social work. That enabled me to take children who
24 had been with me previously.

25 I fostered more than ten children. Their ages

1 varied from babies to the age of eight at the time of
2 their arrival at my home. I fostered long term and
3 short term through Glasgow social work with a couple of
4 emergency care placements.

5 I could get children with very little notice in the
6 case of emergencies. Social worker or key workers dealt
7 with the move.

8 I got all the children up, washed and dressed. They
9 were given breakfast then school, lunch, dinner and
10 bedtime at appropriate times. After school, children
11 would be outside playing or playing in the house.

12 The bathroom was as per a normal household. There
13 was no difference in facilities for my own children and
14 foster children. Everybody was treated in the same
15 manner.

16 I provided clothes for the children and I did the
17 laundry. All of the children had their own clothes,
18 although some may have been handed down.

19 All meals were home cooked with the exception of the
20 odd takeaway or meal out. All the children ate the same
21 meal, unless they disliked the meal and then something
22 else would be provided.

23 Books, toys and games were available to all the
24 children. They were able to watch TV. They also
25 attended the cinema on occasion. All of the children

1 had their own possessions as well as shared possessions.
2 They attended Sunday School until they decided that they
3 did not wish to attend.

4 We went on holidays to Spain, Portugal, Alton Towers
5 and North Wales. I went on these holidays with my
6 foster children as well as my own children.

7 All of the children attended nursery or school, as
8 was appropriate for their age. I attended parents'
9 evenings and school shows, et cetera. Homework was
10 completed at home.

11 I stopped being a foster carer when the last
12 remaining foster child in my care died. I was convicted
13 of child abuse in July 2021."

14 Although I think we know from the records, my Lady,
15 it was 31 May 2021.

16 LADY SMITH: Yes.

17 MS RATTRAY: "I am not aware of any abuse that took place or
18 was carried out during my time as a foster carer.

19 If the foster children in my care had any concerns
20 or worries, they could speak to my eldest daughter,
21 their social workers or their teachers.

22 I have never been the subject of any allegations of
23 abuse for which there has been no criminal conviction.

24 Abuse of foster children in my care has been
25 reported to the police but I don't know the information

1 about that. I have been subject to criminal
2 proceedings. It was a horrendous experience.

3 I have not given any other statements about my time
4 as a foster carer, except to the police and my
5 solicitors in the course of the criminal proceedings
6 against me.

7 I have no opinion to offer on lessons that can be
8 learned to protect children in foster care now or in the
9 future.

10 I have no objection to my witness statement being
11 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
12 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
13 true."

14 Elspeth Cromar signed her statement on
15 18 August 2022.

16 My Lady, by way of background, this statement was
17 prepared with the assistance of our statement-taking
18 team from a response that Elspeth Cromar had given when
19 she was sent a section 21 notice requiring her to
20 provide a statement. Up until then she declined to
21 cooperate and because she didn't sign a confidentiality
22 undertaking, we were not in a position to put the
23 applicant's statement to her in full for her comment.

24 LADY SMITH: That makes sense and explains why there's no
25 specific reference to them.

1 MS RATTRAY: Yes.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

3 Does that complete what we're reading in before the

4 lunch break?

5 MS RATTRAY: It does indeed, my Lady.

6 LADY SMITH: Very well. I'll rise now until 2 o'clock.

7 (1.00 pm)

8 (The luncheon adjournment)

9 (2.00 pm)

10 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray.

11 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.

12 The next witness is Frances Shah, who was a social

13 worker with Strathclyde Regional Council and then

14 Glasgow City Council from 1982 to 2010. Ms Shah

15 approached the Inquiry to give evidence about some

16 relevant matters. In the course of taking her written

17 evidence, it came to light that she'd also been a social

18 worker for an applicant who is 'Joe', and 'Joe' gave

19 oral evidence of Tuesday of this week, which was

20 Day 327, on 27 September 2022.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 Frances Shah (sworn)

23 LADY SMITH: I think that's a little high for you, Frances,

24 is it?

25 Can we get it a little lower?

1 A. That's better.

2 LADY SMITH: That's better.

3 As you probably realise, Frances, we need to hear

4 you through the sound system --

5 A. Sure.

6 LADY SMITH: -- if you could try and stay in a good position

7 for that.

8 You've given us a really helpful statement already

9 with a lot of detail in it, which is very good to have

10 had in advance. It's in that red folder that's beside

11 you and you'll be taken to that in a minute or two.

12 We'll also bring your statement up on that screen

13 that's in front of you, which you might find helpful,

14 and we'll be able to take you to the parts of it we

15 specifically would like to discuss as we go through your

16 evidence.

17 A. Yes.

18 LADY SMITH: Other than those practicalities, Frances,

19 please will you let me know if you want a break at any

20 time, for example. I know that giving evidence can be

21 exhausting, particularly when we're asking you to go

22 back in time in your memory quite a wee while, given the

23 period during which you were in regular social work.

24 A. Mm.

25 LADY SMITH: Let me know, or if there's anything else that

1 we can do to help you give your evidence as clearly and
2 carefully as you can.

3 A. Right.

4 LADY SMITH: You tell me, all right?

5 A. Yeah.

6 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, Frances, I'll hand over to
7 Ms Rattray and she'll take it from there, all right?

8 A. Yeah.

9 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray.

10 Questions from Ms Rattray

11 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.

12 Frances, to start, what I'd like to do is refer to
13 the written statement you have given to the Inquiry,
14 because we have given it a reference and I'll read out
15 the reference number for our purposes, which is
16 WIT-1-000001036. That's, as you see, appearing on the
17 screen in front of you.

18 To start with, I'd like you to look at the paper
19 version of your statement, which is in the red folder.
20 If you could actually turn to the back page of your
21 statement, which should be page 52.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Do we see that at the last paragraph it says:

24 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
25 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.

1 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
2 true."

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Then you've signed your statement; is that right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Thank you. You can put that to one side now.

7 To start, what I am going to do is essentially take
8 you through your statement. It's a very detailed
9 statement. We won't necessarily be looking at all the
10 detail but certain issues that arise from the evidence
11 you have given.

12 By way of a background, you tell us that you were
13 born in 1953. Is that right?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You approached the Inquiry to give a statement about
16 your experiences as a social worker --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- when working with Strathclyde Regional Council, which
19 then became Glasgow City Council?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What was it that motivated you to approach the Inquiry?

22 A. I was in contact with another young man that had
23 contacted me and I told him about the Inquiry for him to
24 come forward.

25 Q. The young man, was this a young man who had previously

1 been a person in care, a child in care?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Right.

4 A. Foster care, yeah.

5 Q. Having suggested that someone else should give evidence

6 to the Inquiry, did you then think it would be helpful

7 if you gave evidence as well? Is that --

8 A. Yes. I wanted to do that, yes. And I did do it.

9 Q. The first section of your statement is under the heading

10 of "General experiences as a social worker". I'm going

11 to look at that section first and some of the issues

12 which arise there.

13 But firstly -- also I'll look at your qualifications

14 and training.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. You tell us that you have an honours degree in

17 psychology --

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. -- from the University of Strathclyde, which you

20 acquired between 1973 and 1977?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And you have both a certificate and a diploma in social

23 work --

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. -- which you obtained from Glasgow University between

1 1979 and 1981?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. In the course of your career you have undertaken further

4 studies?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You have a postgraduate child protection certificate?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Which you obtained by distance learning from Dundee

9 University?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. You also studied child play therapy for two years at

12 Notre Dame, which you say is a course which was

13 accredited by Strathclyde University?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You have undertaken a counselling skills course at the

16 Kinharvie Institute in Glasgow?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. You also mention a weekend course in Myers-Briggs at the

19 Kinharvie Institute.

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. When I looked up Myers-Briggs on the internet it came up

22 with something like to do with personality types?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Can you perhaps explain what that is?

25 A. Oh dear, I forgot -- I think from what I remember,

1 Myers-Briggs was -- they weren't qualified people, it
2 was a mother and daughter and they did all this research
3 and I went along for -- it was an overnight thing,
4 I stayed a couple of nights and they worked out
5 different personalities and -- into where you go on
6 holiday -- and it all turned out correct, that one
7 personality did the same thing and the other. It was
8 quite good. I've never heard of it again since, but --

9 LADY SMITH: The Myers-Briggs systems I've heard of,
10 Frances, are used to help young people when they're
11 trying to make decisions about what type of career or
12 what type of further education might work for them and
13 it's one of the tools --

14 A. Right.

15 LADY SMITH: -- that I don't know if it's currently being
16 used, but it certainly was at one point --

17 A. Yes.

18 LADY SMITH: -- to try and help young people understand
19 themselves and where their strengths might lie.

20 A. Yeah. It wasn't for that that I was there. It was us
21 as the subjects.

22 LADY SMITH: Oh, I see.

23 MS RATTRAY: In relation to work experience, I'll confirm
24 the brief overview you've given in relation to that.
25 Before your qualification as a social worker, you

1 undertook temporary research post at Gartnavel Royal
2 Hospital assisting another person in acquiring their
3 PhD?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. You undertook residential work at Bellshill Children's
6 Home?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Residential work in a home for severely mentally
9 disabled children in London?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. You worked in a reception centre for children who had
12 been taken into care in London?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. You did voluntary work in a nursery?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And you were also involved teaching English to
17 a Pakistani lady as part of a scheme?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. What scheme was that?

20 A. That was a scheme I think being run by Glasgow to help
21 people who are non-English speakers to learn English and
22 I just volunteered and they appointed everyone to
23 particular families and I was with this one family with
24 six children for quite a long time really, just teaching
25 her English by reading and so on.

1 Q. Thank you.

2 Turning to your work experience post qualification

3 as a social worker, your first position was as

4 a children and family social worker in Drumchapel in

5 Glasgow?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. You remained in Glasgow and that was from 1982 to 1987

8 round abouts?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You then moved to be a children and families and also

11 a generic social worker in Govanhill from 1987 to 1997?

12 A. I think it was just children and families, I don't

13 remember doing ... unless it was on duty or something.

14 LADY SMITH: That's what you say in your statement.

15 A. Right.

16 LADY SMITH: You say generic duties.

17 A. Oh right.

18 LADY SMITH: What would that mean?

19 A. That means that I was a children and families social

20 worker, so my long-term caseload was children and

21 families, but all of us community care probation, I

22 don't know, did generic duty. So I might be visiting

23 an elderly person or taking an elderly person into care

24 or on duty. It wasn't like per qualification what you

25 were doing.

1 LADY SMITH: I see what you mean.

2 MS RATTRAY: Thank you.

3 You were in Govanhill from 1987 to about 1997.

4 Then you were in the Gorbals from 1997 to 2000.

5 Priesthill from 2000 to 2001.

6 Latterly in Pollok from about 2001 to 2010, when you

7 took early retirement.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. You tell us in paragraph 9 of your statement that at one

10 stage you were combining your duties with being

11 a practice teacher --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- in the team. What did that involve?

14 A. Normally a worker would have a student, if they've done

15 the practice teachers' course. My area manager asked me

16 if I would take four students together and cut my

17 caseload and I agreed to do that, so I had four students

18 and a caseload.

19 Q. How easy was it to manage those responsibilities

20 alongside your other social work duties?

21 A. It was very -- it was quite difficult, because I found

22 it very hard to get time to give the students what they

23 needed. But worse than that, the team -- not the team,

24 the management around me didn't seem to understand the

25 system. So if my students had maybe five or six cases

1 each, if any one of those cases moved into child
2 protection, they should have been reallocated to a team
3 member, but it came to me. So I ended up with all their
4 work that they couldn't do as well as my own caseload.
5 Yes, it was hard.

6 Q. Moving on to some of the points you raise in relation to
7 your experiences as a social worker, on page 4 at
8 paragraph 13, if you have that in front of you?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. You seem to be saying something here, as I understand
11 it, about at some stage when you were working there was
12 a change in either culture or practice?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. From a kind of assessment-based to obedience?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Can you explain what you mean by that?

17 A. When I started out in Drumchapel, which was my first
18 social work post, it was much like we would have been
19 trained for on our course, that we took responsibility
20 for our own service users and we assessed them properly
21 and that would be discussed in regular supervision with
22 a senior member of staff.

23 That changed to you were there to do as you were
24 told basically. So it was against the assessment I was
25 told to do something else I was expected to carry out

1 what they were saying. Whole things like assessment,
2 values, all seemed to go by the way. It was just about
3 really doing what you were told.

4 Q. How did that impact upon your ability to deliver
5 a service to a child in care?

6 A. Well, badly, I mean very badly, because on a few
7 occasions I was told -- I'd done a full assessment that
8 I'd made without discussing it with a senior and that
9 was supposed to go ahead and management would change it
10 and say, no, you have to do this, and I was saying that
11 isn't what the child is needing. They weren't
12 interested in what the child was needing. They were
13 interested in getting rid of the workload and I was told
14 just to get on with it basically.

15 Q. I think moving to paragraphs 14 to 16 and you give us
16 some detail here and I don't need to go into the detail
17 with you, but you seem to be saying that at times there
18 could be a culture of bullying within the department,
19 depending on the leadership?

20 A. I think so, yes. Yes.

21 Q. You make reference at paragraph 16 to someone in
22 management perhaps micromanaging?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Which you thought was meddling?

25 A. Well --

1 Q. Can you explain what you mean by that?

2 A. Well, we kind of managed our own cases and the seniors
3 would, you know, meet with you and do supervision and
4 you would talk about it and what was going to happen,
5 but I found that the operations manager was much more
6 involved in what staff were doing in the team. She
7 would undermine what had been decided and undermine me
8 at meetings with the clients present. Very involved in
9 the nitty-gritty of what I had to do.

10 It's difficult to sort of explain. Quite silly
11 things like we had a couple of little twins in the
12 office and I'd promised them something out of the
13 machine. You know, they were coming into care. Crisps
14 and juice or whatever. I told them they could have it
15 and then my operations manager, who knew I'd said that,
16 said that they couldn't.

17 That was quite demeaning. It sounds trifling, but
18 for the children that's very bad to see that.

19 Really getting involved in things that really she
20 shouldn't have been getting involved in. That was for
21 me and my senior.

22 Q. What was her concern at the time about the children
23 being given something to drink and eat?

24 A. I think it was because it came out of the machine,
25 because she also told myself and the homemaker that we

1 weren't to take them to McDonald's however we didn't
2 have any money sufficient to take them to anywhere else
3 and we did take them to McDonald's. But she had
4 concerns about the food they served -- I don't know, to
5 be honest.

6 Q. You go on to contrast this approach at paragraph 17 to
7 someone who you say was old school.

8 A. Yeah.

9 Q. And that he knew procedures but he wasn't procedural?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. What do you mean by that?

12 A. He knew on a human level, certainly on his professional
13 level from his own education, what was needed and he and
14 I agreed many times on things. He was kind of like the
15 time when we were meant to assess our own cases and he
16 wasn't into coming round the office and telling everyone
17 what to do and that kind of thing. When he left, that
18 changed a lot.

19 Q. As I understand it, perhaps early in your career you had
20 more autonomy, perhaps --

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. -- to make decisions on your cases and later that
23 changed?

24 A. Yes. Not just autonomy but assessment and everything.
25 We were given the case, we knew what to do because we

1 were qualified and we went out and assessed the family,
2 got to know the family. Relationship, which in my
3 training was about using relationship with the service
4 user so that you could try and -- you know, help them.
5 That all went by the way. We weren't allowed -- it
6 wasn't favoured. If you went into a meeting and said
7 that you had the child on your caseload for three years,
8 that was -- you can't say that, it's irrelevant. That's
9 not -- that's the kind of level I mean.

10 Q. Having a child on your caseload for three years, that
11 was relevant to you?

12 A. Yes. Even things like the homemakers that I would
13 say -- say "[REDACTED]'s homemaker", [REDACTED] being the wee
14 girl and I would be corrected:

15 "It's not her homemaker, it's the team's homemaker,
16 it doesn't belong to you or the child."

17 I just found that quite bizarre, really.

18 Q. At paragraph 18 you say that when you were in Pollok
19 there was a dedicated foster care social work team that
20 was known as the family finding service?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Which had been there since 1982?

23 A. They were at headquarters. They were district
24 headquarters. They weren't in our team, they were in
25 Centenary House I think it was in Glasgow.

1 Q. What was their remit or role?

2 A. Their remit was to find -- well, to take our assessments
3 once we referred a child and find a placement. They
4 were involved in finding emergency placements but also
5 in finding long-term foster carers where that would be
6 needed, and they would attend reviews in the child was
7 already in care, which they would have been, and they
8 were the people responsible for the social -- a member
9 of their team would be a link worker for the foster
10 carer while I'd be a social worker for the child.

11 Q. Right. Turning to paragraph 20, you tell us that you
12 didn't find your workload to be manageable?

13 A. That's right.

14 Q. But nobody did and you didn't feel supported?

15 A. That's right, yeah. No support at all.

16 Well, they were more concerned about -- you had
17 a big caseload and you knew there were children waiting
18 urgently that you'd arranged to see or you'd arranged
19 a particular piece of work. They were much more
20 concerned about you sitting at the computer and putting
21 down details about ethnicity and all sorts of things.
22 I do think computers had a part in actually destroying
23 the assessment work that we did.

24 Q. Why was that? In what way did the bringing in computers
25 impact on that?

1 A. Because the computers were structured into boxes, shall
2 we say, it was like the new social workers were
3 assessing that box in terms of -- you know, it would be
4 a tick box and you had to take that kind of information,
5 whereas that wouldn't be the sort of detailed
6 information that I would be doing in an assessment in
7 child protection, for example.

8 The paperwork became enormous. There was a child
9 protection form, I can't remember what it was called
10 properly, that came out and it had everything on it,
11 including child's religious experiences, the child's
12 understanding of the world, this kind of thing, which is
13 fine if you're assessing a child for long-term permanent
14 care, but this was for a child protection enquiry. The
15 evidence should be collected about the bruises or the
16 child's allegations or whatever. And it went -- that
17 didn't work so well once we had computers I didn't
18 think.

19 Q. Okay. You tell us at paragraph 21 that you didn't feel
20 you had adequate support or resources to do your job
21 properly --

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. -- and there weren't enough placements for kids and it
24 wasn't uncommon for children to be coming from ten
25 different placements by the age of 16?

1 A. Yes. I met children -- they weren't necessarily on my
2 caseload, but they'd be brought into the office to go
3 into care and I'd maybe recognise them from a lot
4 younger. And, yeah, they were coming into care and --
5 I've forgotten what I was going to say now.

6 Yeah, and I certainly met children who were coming
7 at, say, 12 or 14 and I knew they'd been around since
8 they were about two or three and it would -- it would
9 never have happened in Drumchapel. I don't think it
10 would have happened very often in Govanhill. Everybody
11 seemed to expect it in Pollok, because all the kids have
12 been in six or seven placements and were getting moved
13 around all the time.

14 Q. Why do you think it was that, you know, in Pollok that
15 was happening but perhaps it wouldn't be happening in
16 another office?

17 A. I think by then it would have been happening in the
18 other offices as well. It was a matter of the time.
19 That was another effect, Strathclyde was much easier to
20 work for than Glasgow City Council. Much easier.

21 Q. Why?

22 A. They would do things like -- we could get what we call
23 corpy cars which would take someone like me, who at that
24 time didn't drive, if it was an emergency. But they
25 would also often collect children and they were used to

1 the children, they worked for the council as drivers but
2 they were used to the children chatting and if the child
3 was to disclose they would tell us. It wasn't like that
4 for Glasgow City Council. Glasgow City Council didn't
5 want their taxis being taken by clients and children and
6 that became quite difficult. The whole attitude was
7 different.

8 Q. You say the attitude was different, how child-centred
9 was the attitude?

10 A. They weren't child-centred. They seemed to -- I don't
11 know what else they did. They drove about people who
12 wore suits and worked in kind of business professions.
13 I don't know what they did, but they weren't really for
14 people that I worked with. We were allowed to get them,
15 but it was much harder. You had to fill in forms as
16 well to get one and everything became a form in the end.

17 Q. Moving to paragraph 23, you say that child protection
18 was usually managed quite well, you think, when you
19 worked in Pollok, but you say that some of the seniors
20 were not particularly aware of child protection
21 procedures?

22 A. Yes. That wasn't just in Pollok. That was in Gorbals
23 as well. Which I may have said somewhere.

24 But, for example, you -- when I was in Drumchapel
25 and Govanhill for the first part of Govanhill, if

1 a child protection came on the scene your senior took
2 responsibilities for phoning clients that you couldn't
3 come, and say, look, she's involved in an emergency,
4 she'll phone. That then came to us, the social worker,
5 to do, you had to phone around all sorts of people to
6 say there was an emergency and they would argue with you
7 and it wasn't kind of done properly.

8 My recollection in -- certainly in Drumchapel,
9 nobody would have ever been doing more than one child
10 protection at a time. One time in the -- not so much
11 the Pollok office but in the Gorbals office I was
12 involved in about six child protections at the same time
13 and a worker that came from another place, it was
14 a hospital or something, was really, really short and it
15 wasn't just me. A lot of people did that. There didn't
16 seem to be any understanding -- and you were still
17 expected to do your long-term work while you were doing
18 the child protection as an emergency.

19 LADY SMITH: Just to confirm the period in time we're
20 talking about, you started in Drumchapel in 1982,
21 I think, didn't you?

22 A. Yes.

23 LADY SMITH: And then moved to Govanhill in 1987?

24 A. Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: You were there for 10 years?

1 A. 10 years, yes. I would have stayed there but we got
2 moved to the Gorbals. Our office closed.

3 MS RATTRAY: At paragraph 24 you talk about procedures for
4 reporting concerns.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. That you would tell your seniors?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And if there was an allegation of abuse, the senior
9 would come out on the visits with you?

10 A. Yes. In the beginning, yes. When there was a child
11 protection enquiry, in fact for all the time that I was
12 at Drumchapel, when there was a child protection
13 enquiry, the senior of the person that was going on the
14 enquiry, you went in twos but it was me and a senior.
15 That all changed at some point and it had to be two
16 workers. It wasn't necessarily two -- well, you could
17 take a very new member of staff who'd never done a child
18 protection. It wasn't --

19 Q. You say that that stopped towards the end of your time
20 as a social worker but you say there was still two
21 people going out --

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. -- but one was perhaps not qualified or newly qualified?

24 A. Well, I think there were issues around if there wasn't
25 another social worker available, then a home care staff

1 member might -- I don't think they did it actually in
2 child protection, but it was stuff that should have been
3 done by social workers that were given over to
4 non-qualified staff.

5 And in fact in the Gorbals office I was working on
6 one child protection and it went into the evening, went
7 quite late, and the person supervising me was a home
8 care organiser and left me, left us to it and didn't
9 really -- and on that occasion it was an issue when the
10 area manager had said previously we were to get the
11 police if going to this family and that didn't happen.
12 I don't -- she didn't seem to understand that we would
13 be at risk and I actually went into grievance over that
14 case, but that was only one of several.

15 Q. So the change in practice, that adversely affected the
16 way that you were able to deal effectively with a child
17 protection case?

18 A. Yes, I think so, yes.

19 LADY SMITH: Frances, can you tell me what specifically was
20 the grievance that you lodged?

21 A. The grievance was against the home care organiser --
22 I think that's what she was, and she sort of looked --
23 you know, supervised the home care team, the homemakers
24 and social work -- social work assistants were done by
25 seniors, but junior staff. And she didn't really know

1 what she was doing. Didn't know what to say in child
2 protection and didn't seem to understand the urgency of
3 it. Because I was left phoning a senior at the standby,
4 the out of hours, who was saying to me: Where's your
5 manager? And I said she's gone home.

6 There was an issue over staff risk and myself and --
7 well, the other person didn't go into grievance, but she
8 backed me up and came to give evidence and it was due to
9 the case not being properly managed, to us being left,
10 and just she wasn't aware of the information that I was
11 trying to get across. She wouldn't have known what was
12 serious and not serious. But mainly the police issue as
13 well, that the police should have been there.

14 LADY SMITH: What was the outcome of your grievance?

15 A. Oh, I think it failed. It flopped. I didn't feel --

16 I knew before I went that that was going to happen.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

18 MS RATTRAY: Perhaps moving now onto the question of
19 whistle-blowing. You tell us about that from paragraphs
20 25 to 27.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You say that there were policies, but they weren't used
23 as staff were fearful?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. What were staff fearful of?

1 A. It would come back on them. And actually that was not
2 just the case in social work, that was from what I've
3 seen on the news other situations where people are
4 involved that people blow the whistle for example in
5 a care home, the next thing the person that's told
6 everybody what's happening is sacked. And I think staff
7 were very afraid of that or being penalised in some way.
8 It was much easier to just shut up and get on with it.
9 But I wasn't the sort of person that would do that.

10 Q. I think you say there was an occasion where you wrote
11 a letter to a member of senior management because the
12 team management wasn't listening, you felt.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And that resulted in some disciplinary action being
15 taken against you?

16 A. Yes, yes.

17 Q. You had the assistance of your union?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And the branch secretary, you say, of the Glasgow Unison
20 said that your letter had been whistle-blowing?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. You say the senior management didn't accept it as that
23 and just thought you were being a nuisance?

24 A. Yes. I was complaining about a senior member of staff
25 without grounds is what they saw it being. I had the

1 manager of Unison, the Glasgow branch, supporting me all
2 through that and I had written to headquarters.

3 I made a bit of a mistake. Criminal justice were
4 involved and I wrote to a person that I knew very well
5 from the past who I thought was head of criminal justice
6 but he hadn't, he'd moved on to -- I can't remember what
7 he was, head of health. The head had changed. And he
8 accepted the letter and gave it over to the right person
9 and afterwards he regretted doing that because it came
10 back on me. Nobody was prepared to listen.

11 Q. Moving now to the subject of record-keeping, this is
12 where you talk again about computers, which you've
13 mentioned already.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. I think you say that you were told that you could spend
16 one afternoon a week updating computer records?

17 A. It wasn't necessarily one afternoon a week, it was
18 a particular -- you know, they would say they haven't
19 updated this and you're to do that Tuesday afternoon,
20 clear your diary and sit and do that. That happened on
21 several occasions and on every occasion the duty senior
22 came to get me to go out with him to do a job. So my
23 manager wasn't there. He then went to the ops manager,
24 because he was concerned for me, he knew me well, and
25 the ops manager decided with him that I should go out

1 and do whatever it was, child protection, so the
2 records -- there was no time for the records.

3 Q. You do tell us you were making handwritten notes for the
4 file?

5 A. Well, in the past we'd all done it in Drumchapel, most
6 people -- a lot of people did notes at home, it was
7 a handwritten file. They'd get permission, take it home
8 and everybody seemed -- some people didn't do it at all
9 but mostly people were quite committed to doing that.
10 Well, you couldn't take a computer home and do that with
11 that system and I just -- instead of helping us, the
12 computer just seemed like another whole body of work
13 that you had to do. It really wasn't helping anybody.

14 Q. I think you say at paragraph 28 that someone once said
15 to you that if something wasn't on the computer, then it
16 just didn't happen.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. If it was on the computer, then it had happened whether
19 it had or not?

20 A. Yes, that was a friend that went back to social work
21 after ten years from a specialist organisation. It
22 wasn't in Glasgow, it was out in Lanarkshire, and she
23 returned to that and she came home after the first week
24 and said exactly that. She said, "Right, if it's on the
25 computer it happened, if it's not on the computer it

1 didn't happen". That's what she said and she herself
2 was eventually disciplined. She had the same ideas as
3 I did about what you should do in social work.

4 Q. I think you say one of the messages you had is that the
5 lack of time to update computer records --

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. -- perhaps led to mistakes in those records?

8 A. I think that would be possible, yes. You weren't
9 writing records on the computer just like you'd do
10 a written file. You were supposed to keep -- say you
11 had a family of three children. The records all had to
12 be separate and redacted in case when they grew up they
13 wanted to see their file, it all had to be separated and
14 things that you did had to be separated on the computer.
15 Like when you took the money or whatever the issue was
16 about, child concern, it was all in separate
17 compartments. And that was quite difficult because
18 a lot of compartments merge and come together at the
19 same time and that isn't the way the computer worked.

20 Q. At paragraph 32 you tell us there was a time when you
21 were in Drumchapel and you might be given three-quarters
22 of a page of notes by somebody who had been dealing with
23 a case for two years.

24 A. Yes, yes, yes. Case notes were not big in Drumchapel.
25 I felt people actually did a much better job, they just

1 were getting on with the work and -- I mean I did case
2 notes and other people did do case notes but it wasn't
3 the main thing in Drumchapel. In fact, when I moved to
4 Govanhill, I was quite surprised when a worker turned to
5 me and said, "I have a supervision, I haven't written my
6 case notes for over a month", and I'd come from
7 an office where people were taking many months before
8 they wrote their case notes.

9 I'm not saying that's right, but Govanhill was much
10 tighter in that respect, but that was before computers
11 and I was able to do it.

12 Q. We have heard some evidence in the course of the Inquiry
13 that case notes can be very important to children when
14 they leave care and perhaps they're recovering their
15 records. We have heard people say, "When I read my
16 records there was nothing in them".

17 A. Yeah, I can believe that.

18 Q. "It doesn't tell me anything about my childhood."

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. How does that fit in with the pressure of keeping
21 records, do you think?

22 A. I mean I think the records that were properly kept were
23 largely by social workers that were doing it in their
24 own time. I know I did. We were taking it home, it
25 wasn't updated. Other people did write records in the

1 office but some people didn't write any at all or didn't
2 write very many at all. But, to be fair, in Drumchapel
3 that wasn't the biggest thing that you did. It became
4 much more about records and records being about covering
5 the back of the social worker, the senior, the ops
6 manager and very little about the child or the client.

7 Q. At the end of this section you tell us about the
8 circumstances in which you left social work and I don't
9 need to go into the details of that, but I think as
10 an overview you say that you agreed with a family who
11 had complained --

12 A. (Witness nods).

13 Q. -- and you wrote to higher management for help and
14 I think your senior was on leave at the time and that
15 resulted in disciplinary action --

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. -- and you were sacked?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. Then an issue arose with file notes because they weren't
20 on the computer, but you had had handwritten notes on
21 the file.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And when they went to the file, the handwritten notes
24 were no longer there?

25 A. Yes. I had the evidence of my own senior who supported

1 me, it was another senior. She went and saw the notes
2 in the file. And then when they went to get them, the
3 notes had gone.

4 Q. But she was then able to confirm that the notes had
5 existed?

6 A. She put it in writing directly to the council, directly
7 to the people that were hearing my appeal.

8 Q. And so therefore you won your appeal?

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. You were reinstated?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. But you chose the option of taking early retirement?

13 A. As soon as I was reinstated and I complained about the
14 treatment -- I didn't have an argument or anything, they
15 threatened to discipline me again and that was when the
16 branch secretary said, "I want you out of there, you
17 can't possibly go back, would you take requirement, as
18 though you were retiring at 65 with all the benefits?"
19 So I said, "Oh yes". Yes, my health wasn't great at
20 that point either, so yes I took retirement at 57.

21 Q. Tell me the circumstances of the family who complained,
22 is that connected to one of the children that you tell
23 us about later in your statement?

24 A. I don't remember mentioning it in my statement. It's
25 not --

1 Q. All right, okay.

2 A. There was an issue around that particular case in that
3 the client that I was working with was the stepmother of
4 these children after the father had beaten her up, hit
5 her, and she'd had them since they were very small and
6 she was saying, "These are my kids and I'm keeping
7 them". And she was great with the children and that was
8 fine, but the management didn't see it that way. They
9 started talking about, "This is like Baby P" and it was
10 nothing like Baby P. The kids were not being abused at
11 all by the stepmother. But one of the problems was ...
12 is that that step-mum went to the criminal justice ops
13 manager, because the ex-partner was in the criminal
14 justice system, and told that manager of something very
15 important about child protection that was never passed
16 on to me and manager then said she'd passed it on to my
17 senior, who said to me, "I've never had a conversation
18 about any case with that manager", and I was really
19 penalised for not knowing about this, but she hadn't
20 shared the information but she told the inquiry that she
21 had.

22 That was quite common, things like that happening.

23 Q. Right.

24 What I'm going to do now, Frances, I'm going to move
25 on to the section in your statement where you tell us

1 about general experience as a social worker in relation
2 to foster care.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You say under the heading of "Recruitment and training of
5 foster carers", if we look at that first, you say the
6 keyword is parenting.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. You make the point parents should behave in the same
9 way, whether they're fostering a child or not.

10 A. Yes. I'm not quite sure what I meant by that, sorry.

11 Q. That's what I was going to ask you because what
12 I wondered from that, and I'll ask you to comment, is
13 that does that arise from maybe experience that foster
14 parents were not behaving like parents towards foster
15 children in a way that they would towards their own
16 children?

17 A. I think back in that time nobody knew about fostering.
18 Once you got a child -- you know, you've got maybe five
19 or six kids on the register living at home in vulnerable
20 positions, other children coming into care, you had to
21 do a cut somewhere and everyone assumed that foster care
22 was safe. And so it was not monitored as much. You
23 could leave out that visit to do something that was
24 considered more urgent.

25 I'm really not sure why I'm saying parents should

1 behave in the same way there.

2 Q. I'm just wondering whether there's an implication here
3 as to whether parents behave in a different way towards
4 foster children?

5 A. Yes. I think what I was trying to say there was that
6 the parents in the house, whether they're parenting
7 their own natural children or they're parenting foster
8 children, the parenting needs to be the same. I think
9 that was the point I was trying to make.

10 Q. Can I take it from that then, behind that statement
11 there are experiences where the parenting wasn't the
12 same?

13 A. I think we didn't realise that until a lot later in
14 social work. It wasn't just foster care. I mean
15 a number of the institutions that have now come forward
16 where young people have now grown up and some of them
17 are even quite elderly and are reporting abuse, **Secondary**
18 **Secondary Insti**, at Fort Augustus, all sorts of places, and
19 I think there were things happening looking back to
20 foster kids. I don't think they were all safe. At the
21 time we thought they were.

22 Q. In relation to assessment, you tell us that you were
23 involved in assessing potential foster carers.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. You say at paragraph 40 what you actually had to do was

1 form a relationship with the person and find out about
2 them.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Can you explain that to us? What does a relationship
5 reveal that perhaps other checks don't?

6 A. Well, I think you're doing very in-depth interviews for
7 both -- as far as I remember, long-term foster carers or
8 even emergency foster carers, there wasn't much
9 difference between that and when you were assessing
10 adoption. There's still a child that's -- and you had
11 to form a relationship with the would-be prospective
12 adopters in order that they would talk about things.
13 The adoption assessment includes everything, from their
14 health to their sexual life -- not -- you know, their
15 marital relationship, the other people around. It's
16 an in-depth assessment.

17 There's a big form for that as well. But I'm not
18 sure whether everybody did in-depth -- I mean, I'd had
19 children on my caseload where the child had been placed
20 permanently and she was about to be placed with another
21 child, when there was an issue of Munchausen's came up
22 and I had that person for six months with a wee boy and
23 she swore blind she'd never hurt him, but the
24 dihydrocodeine in her system, that was in her purse and
25 I think that -- you really have to look out for that

1 when you're assessing foster carers. You can't just
2 take somebody on because they're willing to take the
3 child out a Saturdays -- it's much more in depth than
4 that. And you've got to know the people really well.
5 You've got to be able to say yes, these people are not
6 only safe for children, but they will be child centred
7 when they take these children into their care.

8 Q. At paragraph 42 you explain the kind of checks which are
9 carried out, criminal checks and health checks and so
10 forth --

11 A. Yes, all that is done as well, yes.

12 Q. But you say apart from those physical things, we also
13 tried to get a feel for what the prospective foster
14 carer thought --

15 A. Fostering was all about

16 Q. -- fostering was all about. Were you looking for
17 anything specific here?

18 A. Well, some people didn't understand what fostering was
19 all about. I did the Drumchapel fostering campaign and
20 gone into a house where a woman wanted to be a foster
21 carer and I knew immediately this really wasn't going to
22 happen and in the middle of talking to her, another lady
23 came in, I don't know whether it was a grown-up daughter
24 or a next door neighbour, and she turned and said to the
25 person, "Do you want to look at this? Do you want to

1 get some [children]?"

2 Obviously it wasn't that common, but that was the
3 most extreme form of it, but you did pick up on other
4 things where people -- I don't know, wouldn't maybe --
5 you know, you'd ask them what happens when the child
6 turns 14 and he's reached adolescence and what would
7 you -- and they weren't all aware of that. My friend
8 who worked, as I said, at the other voluntary
9 organisation, a lot of their clients were young
10 teenagers who were adopted as babies and when they
11 started acting out it was -- well, it must have come
12 from their natural family, it's inborn, we'll give them
13 back. That was common in her job, certainly.

14 I just think you need to be really, really sure.
15 You need to be sure that the couple are consistent as
16 well. If it is a couple. You know, you don't want one
17 saying yes, you can have this and the other one says no
18 you can't. And for some people doing that with foster
19 children was much more difficult than parenting their
20 own children, because they'd known their children since
21 they were babies. Some people did struggle with that.
22 But it's well to know that at the beginning, really.
23 Q. You mentioned that potential foster parents or perhaps
24 foster parents didn't always have an understanding about
25 birth parents and arranging sibling contact?

1 A. Yeah. Well, that was a problem. I had some sympathy
2 with them, because if you're going to bring a birth
3 mother or father into a foster home where the child is
4 being fostered for contact that could be quite
5 difficult, because a lot of the people coming for access
6 were very emotional, they might be drunk, they might be
7 under the influence of drugs and understandably foster
8 carers don't want that in their home.

9 But I think there was a difficulty understanding
10 that the child -- you know, you don't share that with
11 the children. You make the child understand why they're
12 in care, but there are certain things you don't disclose
13 to kids about their parents, because they're small
14 children.

15 I'm not sure how much there was understanding in
16 some of the foster carers. I mean I worked long term
17 when I was at the Govanhill office with a very nice set
18 of foster carers who were absolutely fine and then it
19 all suddenly went wrong and just -- you know, they
20 actually got struck off. Not while I was there, though,
21 it was like years later, but I heard there was
22 complaints about their house and I had never picked up
23 anything but there were issues. And that's the kind of
24 issues you really want to know about before you place
25 children. You don't want to be placing them and then

1 moving them in a couple of years if it's long-term
2 parents.

3 Q. You say you don't see everything when you're doing
4 assessments and there are things people don't realise
5 themselves, let alone tell the social worker. What kind
6 of things? That's at paragraph 43.

7 A. Yeah. I think that's about their own parenting
8 experience and what they thought parenting was all
9 about. And I think -- no, you don't see everything when
10 you're doing assessments. And it isn't always anyone's
11 fault. It was -- give an example of a child that foster
12 carers were keeping, quite a young child, whose father
13 was a child murderer and paedophile, and it was how they
14 were going to share that with the child. And we went
15 through that at length about what this was about and
16 then at the point where they became permanent they
17 turned to me and said, "Do you think she's going to grow
18 up like her dad?"

19 Well, I thought I'd been through that quite a lot
20 but they obviously hadn't realised and they were now
21 going to bring up that child wondering all the time is
22 she going to be like the father.

23 That's just one of many things, but you have to be
24 really sure that they understand what they're doing.

25 Q. You say at paragraph 46 that foster carers didn't need

1 qualifications or experience.

2 A. Yes, that's right.

3 Q. Was being a parent considered valuable experience?

4 A. Being a parent of their own children was a valuable
5 experience, but they -- you know, there are different
6 reasons that people don't maybe understand that the
7 children they're going to have have had a really bad
8 time and they're taking that child out of that situation
9 so the kid should be all right, we're fixing him. You
10 know, they didn't really see the link between what had
11 happened to the child earlier on. That's only one
12 example, really.

13 I'm trying to think of a ...

14 Q. So --

15 A. Yeah, I mean I did do the multi-ethnic fostering in --
16 where was I then? Govanhill at some point, where I went
17 out with my catchment area, they appointed me to do
18 mixed-race statements and stuff and there was quite
19 a few shocking things in that.

20 An example that comes immediately to mind is a lady
21 who was wanting to adopt a small child, she was an older
22 person and she had a history of prostitution, which she
23 denied, and was married to an Arabian man whose father
24 had been employed by the Saudi king and he was lovely to
25 her, but he had no idea about what she'd done and we

1 didn't tell him. I said, "You'll have to tell him" and
2 she said, "No, I'm not doing that, it wasn't me". I did
3 that check three times. The police can't be wrong three
4 times. And I just thought: how well do people really
5 know each other?

6 Then it turned out -- I did a lot about the extended
7 family and it turned out that the woman's mother was
8 extremely racist and was not wanting these children to
9 be placed at all.

10 These are kind of things that don't come up at
11 first. Over time they'll say something and you will
12 think, "Oh, that doesn't sound quite right".

13 Q. So in relation to experiences of parenting, I think you
14 said the children that are being placed in a foster care
15 situation are children that have been affected by trauma
16 in their earlier lives?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Would you agree that being a parent and having some
19 parenting skills is not enough --

20 A. Yeah.

21 Q. -- to be able to properly foster a child in care?

22 A. Yeah, I think it's not enough. They have to have
23 a level of understanding. I don't know that they should
24 go and get qualified somewhere, because that doesn't
25 always work either, but they should have

1 an understanding of the child, if the child's acting out
2 or if he starts crying in the night or whatever, they
3 must have some understanding of what that child's been
4 through. And I think we assumed for a long time that
5 they did have understanding.

6 LADY SMITH: Frances, is one of the problems that so far as
7 your own children are concerned, it's highly likely that
8 an attachment bond formed in the child's very early
9 life?

10 A. Yes.

11 LADY SMITH: And you live with that child, you bring that
12 child up within the attachment bond.

13 A. Yes.

14 LADY SMITH: It feels quite different from how you are going
15 to feel, however much you try, towards a child who comes
16 to you for foster care.

17 A. Yes.

18 LADY SMITH: Which could be short term?

19 A. Yes.

20 LADY SMITH: There may be no longevity about it at all.

21 A. Yes.

22 LADY SMITH: That child may bring with them a sense of
23 attachment bond to somebody else --

24 A. Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: -- however unfit the parent --

1 A. Yes.

2 LADY SMITH: -- so far as maintaining the safety of the
3 child is concerned?

4 A. That's true, yes, the child would have an attachment to
5 the natural parent at some point if they'd lived with
6 the natural parent. But a lot of the children that were
7 in care had multiple attachments and in the end they
8 didn't really make any attachment. You could change the
9 social worker and the child would hardly even notice,
10 because they'd been through that many. I mean I stayed
11 around but some kids changed their social worker every
12 six months. I think it's a big thing about attachment
13 theory, yeah.

14 LADY SMITH: Children in those circumstances may learn never
15 to trust what feels like attachment as actually being
16 genuine attachment?

17 A. Yes, quite possibly, yes.

18 LADY SMITH: Just rewinding, is being a parent of your own
19 children actually that helpful necessarily at all?

20 A. No. That's right. Because there were children --
21 people who became foster carers who couldn't have
22 children or didn't have any children. Yes, that's quite
23 right, the actual natural parenting isn't always
24 effective.

25 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

1 MS RATTRAY: You mentioned that as part of an assessment you
2 would speak to children and ask them how they felt about
3 foster children coming into the home. How realistic
4 were children in their understanding and what they
5 expected of a foster child coming into --

6 A. I didn't actually do that many in families where there
7 were young children. They were mostly older children,
8 teenagers and stuff, and they seemed to think it was
9 a good idea what was happening. Didn't have a lot of
10 contact with them, though. Wouldn't have done a lot of
11 integrated work with children that were already in their
12 own house. It wasn't something that came up very much
13 for me, that, really.

14 And really, I think, actually now back it's the
15 family finding team would have been involved in that,
16 not me. That was their job because they were going to
17 be the link worker for the carer.

18 Q. I'll turn to the topic of training and you say elsewhere
19 that you think childcare qualifications would be a good
20 thing for foster parents to have, but you don't think
21 that would work because it would affect the number of
22 foster carers who would be available?

23 A. Yeah. If foster carers had to get any sort of
24 professional qualification, who's going to pay for that
25 qualification? And no, social work wouldn't pay for

1 something like that as far as I think. No.

2 So they could have done with more training. Did the
3 Drumchapel fostering thing as well, where we brought
4 people in, we roleplayed being difficult children with
5 people and you could -- you know, you could assess from
6 that that some reactions were fine and others needed
7 a bit of work.

8 Q. You tell us at paragraph 48 that you were involved in
9 training but there wasn't any specific training on how
10 to discipline children.

11 A. Mm.

12 Q. Why wasn't there any training on that topic?

13 A. I don't know. I would raise that with people in
14 an assessment, but quite often what people would say
15 about that, they'd then do something else. Obviously it
16 was before the days when hitting a child became -- you
17 know, it was legal back then and some foster carers did
18 that and some managers thought it was okay.

19 Yeah, I don't think -- yeah, there was written
20 guidance but that won't be around now. There was
21 guidance given to foster carers about what to do in
22 situations and --

23 Q. What was that guidance? I mean were they told that they
24 could smack?

25 A. No. No. We couldn't really do anything about it other

1 than move the child, which we wouldn't if the child's
2 having a good relationship and that happens. But that
3 wouldn't have been something social work would have
4 suggested, certainly.

5 Q. So if they didn't suggest it, did they say that they
6 weren't allowed?

7 A. No, I don't think -- it was more about, you know, when
8 children act out, not everybody understands what's
9 behind -- what's the motive, the reason why the child's
10 acting out and do a bit of work around that, that if
11 he's punching you and kicking you and telling you he's
12 going to kill you, that isn't actually what he means,
13 he's talking about his dad or -- you have to do a bit of
14 that kind of reflective work in an assessment of
15 a foster carer or an adoptive carer, certainly.

16 Q. In relation to a child who might be distressed by their
17 experiences and are lashing out and kicking and punching
18 and so forth, was there ever any training on how to
19 restrain a child?

20 A. No. No. I don't ever remember doing that.

21 Whether the family finding team, they may have done,
22 because a lot of the stuff with the would-be foster
23 carers would be done by the family finding team and they
24 would all get together and work jointly, but at the time
25 the assessment that we got wasn't me, it was -- or

1 anyone in my team, it was from family finding who got
2 the assessment with these and they passed and this is
3 what they were like and you got all the information on
4 them and then went out to meet them.

5 I did assessments myself on top of that as another
6 part of my job.

7 Q. I think elsewhere in your statement I think being
8 presented as a children's social worker with foster
9 carers who had been assessed by the family finding team
10 and so forth, I think you say elsewhere that there was
11 then an assumption --

12 A. Yeah.

13 Q. -- that they knew how to --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- discipline children and manage them in an appropriate
16 way.

17 A. Yes. Well, that would have been presented by the family
18 finding team at the linking meeting that, you know, you
19 could ask questions and that was certainly presented as
20 such.

21 Q. Do you think that was a safe assumption?

22 A. Not now, no. I don't now, no.

23 At the time, I don't know. I mean if I'd seen
24 foster parents doing something they shouldn't be doing,
25 then I would report that back and that would be worked

1 on or the child be moved if there was any risk. But it
2 wasn't something that we spent a lot of time on.

3 Q. In relation to general foster care arrangements, at
4 paragraph 51 and 52 you talk about the relationship
5 between the children's social worker and the link
6 worker.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. The link worker essentially being part of the family
9 finding team --

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. -- and being there for the foster carers, and yourself,
12 as the social worker, being there for the child.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. In relation to what you say about information sharing
15 and that the two social workers were supposed to be
16 a liaison --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- were there problems with communication or forming
19 a liaison?

20 A. It depends who the link worker was. I had some very
21 good relationships with link workers and I had some that
22 were not so good.

23 Q. How important is information-sharing between these two
24 personnel?

25 A. It's essential. It is essential to see that the foster

1 carers are actually getting supported. I'd need to know
2 about it if they're not. You know, that kind of thing.
3 I would say to them, you know, does your link worker
4 come? And yes. And we'd have a conversation about
5 that. Or we'd do joint visits sometimes with the link
6 worker.

7 Q. In terms of providing support, what was your role in
8 providing support?

9 A. I would support the same way. I mean we would have
10 shared information and knew what we were both doing,
11 even if we were doing it separately, and you would
12 provide support -- really, what happens when you've got
13 a situation like that is the problem is coming through
14 the child. So the foster carer's not phoning up saying,
15 "I need support doing such-and-such", that would be
16 a link worker, but she may phone up and saying, "The
17 child's bashing the dog" or whatever it is and you would
18 go out there and see what's going on. But that would
19 normally be me, the team social worker, in that
20 situation.

21 Q. Because sometimes having heard the evidence of children
22 and their experiences and social work visits and so
23 forth, the impression sometimes that comes across is
24 that social workers of whatever type, whether the
25 child's social worker or a link social worker, seemed to

1 be spending a lot of time supporting the foster
2 parents --
3 A. Yeah.
4 Q. -- and less time supporting the child.
5 A. Yes. I could think that that would be true, yes.
6 I didn't do that. I mean I didn't know that other people
7 didn't until one of the assistant district officers who
8 I knew well said to me, "But you always do a lot of work
9 with the child", and I said:
10 "Well, don't other people?"
11 "Oh no [she said] other social workers don't do
12 that".
13 I mean, they should have been, but it became clear
14 to me there were certain social workers who wanted to
15 work with children and others that were doing the job
16 but weren't particularly interested in supporting
17 children or know what to support.
18 LADY SMITH: Ms Rattray, it's after 3.00 just now and
19 I normally take a break at about this stage. Would it
20 work if we did that now?
21 MS RATTRAY: Yes, of course.
22 LADY SMITH: Frances, is it okay with you if we just take
23 a very short break now for a breather?
24 A. Yes, of course.
25 LADY SMITH: Let's do that.

1 (3.03 pm)

2 (A short break)

3 (3.18 pm)

4 LADY SMITH: Are you ready for us to carry on, Frances?

5 A. Yes.

6 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

7 Ms Rattray.

8 MS RATTRAY: Thank you, my Lady.

9 Frances, I'm now going to look at paragraph 54 and

10 speaking about siblings in care.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. You tell us that siblings were supposed to be placed in

13 foster care together --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- but in some circumstances that might happen?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. You say at the end of that paragraph --

18 LADY SMITH: Some circumstances that "might not happen".

19 MS RATTRAY: "Might not happen", sorry. My apologies.

20 You also say at the end of that paragraph:

21 "Whether siblings should be placed [in care]

22 together sometimes depended on the circumstances and the

23 family relationships."

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Were there situation where it would have been better for

1 siblings to be together but they weren't together?

2 A. I think it was policy that siblings should be together,
3 unless there was a reason why they couldn't, and that
4 might be because they just didn't get on and fighting
5 and didn't want to be placed -- I tried one time, it was
6 just an emergency situation, but a little boy, asylum
7 seeker family was going into foster care because mum
8 went to the hospital or something and I took the sister,
9 who was about 13 and she actually confided in me, she
10 said, "Look, we don't have to stay together" and
11 I said, "Are you really tired?" and she said, "Oh yes,
12 I've been looking after him all the time", so you give
13 her a break and put her with somebody else.

14 And other situations where one child might be
15 suitable for foster care and the other might not, not
16 then, not at that moment.

17 Q. Were there ever situations where it would have been
18 better for the children to be together but they couldn't
19 be because there wasn't a suitable placement, for
20 example?

21 A. Possibly. I never knew of that myself. I did in
22 residential care where there were six children and they
23 weren't all together. But I don't remember
24 separating -- I remember working with a child who had
25 a sibling in another family and I don't know how that

1 came about and the sort of disaster there was that the
2 young girl, who was about 12, desperately wanted to see
3 her brother and he didn't. The brother didn't want to
4 know her at all. That was kind of a difficult thing to
5 put to the children's panel, because you can't say in
6 front of the child, "Your brother doesn't like you, he
7 doesn't want to see you".

8 There were situations like that, where they had been
9 placed separately for a reason then. I don't know what
10 the reason was, but it was pretty obvious he didn't want
11 to know.

12 Q. Turning to paragraph 58, you make the point that you
13 weren't involved in the matching of children to foster
14 families?

15 A. That's right.

16 Q. That was by the family finding team?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. But you think children were probably misplaced because
19 of a lack of availability of foster carers?

20 A. Oh yes, yes, definitely. It was difficult to get even
21 short-term foster carers. Sometimes they would get more
22 children than they were actually assessed for, because
23 we had nowhere to put a particular child and they would
24 say, "Yes, we'll take him". Foster carers were few and
25 far between throughout my career really. Although less

1 so, I would say, in the beginning. We seemed to have --
2 in Drumchapel we had foster carers all over the place.
3 But later, no.

4 Q. Okay. At paragraph 60 on the topic of, you know,
5 preparing children for placement, you said that there
6 would be preparation for longer-term placement and
7 placements involving parental rights?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. What do you mean by placements involving parental
10 rights? Whose parental rights are you talking about?

11 A. Well, the children coming in probably to permanent care,
12 probably too old to be adopted, there was no one
13 available, and they would stay in long-term care but the
14 parent, the natural parent, the birth parent, had
15 parental rights and we would make effort to assume the
16 parental rights, which we usually did, but that involved
17 a great big long report and a lot of procedures, and
18 while that was happening the child was still in care, in
19 a home or -- you know. I mean a children's unit or
20 something.

21 Q. Where, for example, the Local Authority had assumed
22 parental rights, that was connected to perhaps
23 a longer-term placement --

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. -- and you'd expect children to be prepared for that

1 placement?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. You say though with emergency and short-term placements

4 children were usually just taken to the foster home?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. How short is short term?

7 A. It was supposed to be -- it was supposed to be a few

8 days, I suppose, or a week. It wasn't uncommon to meet

9 people in emergency care who'd had a child for six

10 months. You know, there'd be nowhere else to put that

11 child. And that kind of put a bottleneck then on our

12 emergency foster carers, because they weren't doing

13 emergency.

14 Yeah, it was really hard to find a placement. You

15 would be at the office very, very late waiting to hear

16 back from the family finding team that they'd found

17 somewhere, with the child waiting at the office not

18 knowing where they're going.

19 Q. You speak at paragraph 68 -- I may have the wrong

20 paragraph here, but it's about transport to and from

21 contact.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. By other people, for example. You speak about this

24 elsewhere.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Transporting children used to be something that social
2 workers were involved in --

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. -- and you say it's become more of an escort?

5 A. Yes.

6 I felt that a lot of things that were done on the
7 basis of unqualified staff, escorts -- the escort wasn't
8 an ordinary escort like somebody putting, you know,
9 their own child going somewhere and they bought a taxi.
10 The care workers taking the children weren't qualified
11 to deal with the situation. Some did, some that had
12 been around a long time did, but very often I felt
13 really that should have been the social work task,
14 because you know the child, you understand the child.
15 If they start -- because some children did disclose to
16 taxi drivers. You know, you need a worker on hand
17 that's knowing what to do with the children but the
18 homemakers were really under pressure as well. They
19 were set up -- certainly in Pollok escorting three or
20 four children to different placements, at great
21 distances, never had any lunch, nothing. That wasn't
22 uncommon.

23 Q. In relation to visits, at paragraph 70 you tell us about
24 visits and you say that social workers were supposed to
25 visit children in foster care once a month, sometimes

1 fortnightly.

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. And it depended on what else you had on?

4 A. Yeah.

5 Q. And how far away the placement was?

6 A. Yes, yes.

7 Q. Given your workload and what you've told us about those

8 pressures, were you always able to carry out visits --

9 A. No.

10 Q. -- as often as required?

11 A. No. In earlier times in Drumchapel and in Govanhill

12 I would say I did, but later, no. No. You just weren't

13 able to go and do the work you wanted to do.

14 Q. When you did visit, did you always have the opportunity

15 or did you always speak to the children alone?

16 A. Well, I -- I did in most cases, yeah, yeah, I would say

17 I did. But ... it was very difficult situations out

18 there. One boy who, you know, I got on with the foster

19 carer, everything seemed okay. There was an issue

20 around, he was over 12, did he want to stay, and she had

21 talked to him and decided to keep him and I had nowhere

22 else to put him so that was kind of agreed. She then

23 told the child he was to go, he was to get out, she'd

24 had enough of him. Didn't tell me, didn't tell his

25 grandmother, didn't tell the link worker. I came back

1 from holiday and had to rush out and take him into care
2 quick.

3 I mean things like that shouldn't be happening. You
4 don't tell a child something like that and then decide
5 that you've changed your mind, you know.

6 LADY SMITH: On this matter of speaking to children alone,
7 I think what Ms Rattray was particularly interested in
8 was whether it was always possible to do that?

9 A. No, it wasn't always possible to do. I don't know that
10 any foster carer would have refused, but I think there
11 were situations where we probably just didn't ask
12 because we did trust the foster carers.

13 LADY SMITH: Yes.

14 A. Although normally you would -- you know, you would speak
15 to the children kind of just naturally, but maybe not
16 take them to one side and --

17 LADY SMITH: Are you telling me there wasn't a standard
18 practice that at every visit the social worker would
19 make a point of speaking to the child or children alone?

20 A. I think that didn't happen. Unless the social worker
21 made that happen. I don't know if that was -- you're
22 certainly meant to see the child.

23 LADY SMITH: Ah, that's not the same thing.

24 A. No, it's not the same thing.

25 No, I don't know. I know a lot of people -- several

1 workers that were maybe younger, more newly qualified,
2 would come to me and look for what they needed to get
3 for their child and I would say, "What you need to do is
4 ..." And then they'd say, "We don't have time for that,
5 I have to get another worker to do it". People didn't
6 have the time to undertake work with children latterly.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

8 MS RATTRAY: Would it be true that if on the face of it
9 everything seemed fine visits were less frequent?

10 A. Yes, I would say -- I don't know if they were
11 deliberately less frequent. If you suddenly had
12 an emergency elsewhere with children who were at risk at
13 home, you would -- you know, you would maybe have a kind
14 of line of who you would not see and that would be like
15 people you thought were very capable foster carers or
16 foster carers in general. That would be cancelled.

17 Q. When you carried out a visit, sometimes we've heard in
18 evidence that children talk about social work visits but
19 they never looked at their sleeping arrangements, for
20 example. That perhaps when they first arrived in the
21 placement their sleeping arrangements were inspected --

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. -- and after that it wasn't routine and we've heard some
24 children say, well, if they just looked at the sleeping
25 arrangements they would have seen there was a problem.

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. Was it normal to inspect a child's bedroom, for example?

3 A. No, no, but I did assume if it would have been part of

4 an assessment the link worker would have been looking at

5 where is the child going to sleep, what sort of bed have

6 you got, you know, they would maybe do that.

7 LADY SMITH: But, Frances, what if the place where the child

8 was actually put to sleep was not the place that whoever

9 was doing the preliminary assessment had been shown?

10 A. I -- I don't ... I don't know whether the foster

11 assessment involved looking at the house and what was

12 going -- I would have thought it would be. But again it

13 probably depended on which worker. There wasn't sort of

14 a statutory -- and I know places where I did see

15 children in their bedrooms, take them out, where foster

16 carers were always very willing for that to happen.

17 LADY SMITH: But other places where you never saw the

18 child's room or the room where the child slept, if I can

19 put it that way.

20 A. Yeah, that could happen. I'm trying to think now, but

21 yes, possibly.

22 LADY SMITH: You see, Frances, I have heard of numerous

23 cases in which a foster child was given a place to sleep

24 in an overcrowded bedroom.

25 A. Yes.

1 LADY SMITH: Seriously overcrowded in some cases.

2 A. Yes.

3 LADY SMITH: And in others that was not the room that had
4 been shown to somebody who did do a pre-fostering
5 inspection.

6 A. Yes, I can believe that, yes. I mean things did start
7 coming to light even in the Govanhill team. One of my
8 colleagues, who was an old friend, had actually gone to
9 a house where she knew the children very well, there
10 were two girls, and she was suspicious. She found
11 indeed one was sleeping on the floor in the attic and
12 not allowed to come down and she took the child away
13 without even phoning the office. She just -- she
14 removed the child. But that wasn't looked on all that
15 well, because then we had to find somewhere else.

16 So, yes, I can believe that there are homes where
17 people don't think to say, "Can I see the bedroom?"
18 or ... I would normally say, "Where do you play? Can
19 I see your toys? Have you got any books?" And you
20 would do it that way. And almost with all of mine
21 I think I did.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

23 MS RATTRAY: That's something that there's always the
24 thought that there's a limited number of placements,
25 it's difficult to find a placement, so if you -- if

1 there is a concern in a placement --

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. -- you're always trying to manage that other concern:

4 where else am I going to put the child?

5 A. Yes. Yes.

6 Q. Is that a significant influence on whether a child is

7 removed --

8 A. It is a very significant influence, because the child

9 won't be going to another foster carer if they're --

10 well, I would probably say over seven. They might end

11 up in a children's unit and latterly they weren't

12 suitable. I had a girl of 15 that was sleeping on

13 a board on the floor and the room was boarded up at one

14 of the children's homes because the kids had broken it

15 and I was shocked, because I hadn't seen that before but

16 I wasn't happy about leaving her there, but if I took

17 her back to the team, where were they going to put her?

18 That was very much a concern, yeah.

19 Q. Is it fair to say there might be a reluctance to remove

20 children from foster placements because of that?

21 A. Yes. Yes. I think so.

22 Q. The other point in relation to visits, you say at

23 paragraph 70 is that you always told the foster carer

24 that you were coming before you visited.

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. You don't think that was policy, it was just courtesy?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. "At the time we didn't know about abusive foster

4 carers."

5 A. That's right, yes. I never visited foster care anywhere

6 without phoning up and making sure they were going to be

7 there and be in. Yes, that is true.

8 Q. We've heard a lot of evidence about social work visits

9 and how children are dressed up, they are clean and they

10 have special clothes on, the house is cleaned, they're

11 having to sit there, they've been told what to do and

12 say.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. How effective is a visit if it's always announced?

15 A. I think going back at that time it wasn't -- I mean

16 you're right, they can -- the foster carers can cause

17 a scene which isn't really what the child is living in.

18 I don't think many social workers were aware of that.

19 The colleague I've spoken about certainly was, but

20 I don't think people immediately went out to see if

21 anything was going wrong and -- so -- yeah. I think we

22 wouldn't necessarily see the children on their own.

23 Q. You say at paragraph 73 of your statement, Frances,

24 that --

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. -- you don't think that people -- and I presume
2 including social workers -- do enough work with children
3 and it's because of a lack of time.
4 A. Yeah.
5 Q. And that all too often in the rush of things, things
6 don't get done properly.
7 A. Mm-hmm.
8 Q. That most workers were overworked and you don't believe
9 it would have improved since you left?
10 A. I don't think so. I think statutory things will
11 improve, like if it's a statutory rule or a policy, you
12 visit and you see the child, that will be done, but it
13 wouldn't be done as part of an assessment of what needed
14 to be done. I would leave a placement thinking, you
15 know, I didn't ask them about that, I must mention that
16 and next time I would phone or -- I don't know that
17 everybody did that. I don't think they did. They were
18 just happy that things seemed all right and would just
19 carry on.
20 Q. In relation to moving placement, you say at paragraph 73
21 that work should have been undertaken to prepare a child
22 for moving placement, but sometimes that work would be
23 carried out and then the child wasn't moved for months.
24 A. Yeah, I've heard of that happening, yeah. I don't know
25 if I ever worked with that myself. I'm trying to think.

1 Yeah, I don't know what work was done with children
2 if they were going to move. There were always
3 difficulties with getting funding, I remember that.
4 You'd got the placement and you were buying it in, say
5 from Barnardo's, and the money wasn't released at
6 headquarters, not district headquarters, the
7 headquarters, you know, the child could wait three to
8 six months before the funding was released.

9 Q. A situation like that, there must have been -- if
10 a child has been prepared for a move and it doesn't
11 happen, there must have been a huge amount of
12 uncertainty for that child?

13 A. I think we would not probably do the work until the
14 funding was -- we knew that we were getting or it had
15 been released. You don't have to move the child on the
16 day that the funding becomes available. I wouldn't have
17 done long-term preparation with small, young children
18 until it was nearer the time, although I would assess
19 were they wanting to go and live with a family, how did
20 they feel about that?

21 Q. At paragraph 76 you say:

22 "Children might be asked how they felt about a move,
23 but they weren't consulted about it."

24 I'm taking from that that however the child felt,
25 they didn't have a great degree of any influence over

1 the decision.

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. Do you think that has any impact upon the thinking of
4 a child who wants to disclose, who wants to speak
5 about --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- something they're unhappy about, if they have
8 an experience of a system where their views are taken
9 but they feel they're not actually listened to and it
10 makes no difference?

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. Would that perhaps discourage a child from speaking up
13 at all?

14 A. I'm not sure whether -- I know and I'm aware that a lot
15 of children didn't speak up. We know that now. About
16 residential care as well as foster carers. I don't know
17 it was deliberately overlooked. There was no concerns
18 about the young person or the concerns you had didn't
19 seem to relate to whether they wanted to be there or
20 not. But you're right, they wouldn't have -- asking
21 a child whether they're happy and did they want to stay
22 and that kind of thing, it's difficult to do that. If
23 they say no, there's nowhere to take them to. They're
24 back in care again at the children's unit.

25 I mean the policies -- I think the law is that you

1 have to listen to children. That came into play later
2 in my career. But yes -- but listening and then acting
3 on what they're saying isn't the same.

4 Q. I'm going to turn now to a child who was in your care
5 who's given evidence earlier this week and you know who
6 he is.

7 A. Yeah.

8 Q. And we're using his pseudonym, which is 'Joe'.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. I know you know who I mean by that.

11 A. Mm-hmm.

12 Q. We know that 'Joe' and his older brother were in
13 a foster placement with foster parents the FSQ-SPO in
14 Larbert?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. We know the dates were from [REDACTED] 1993 to
17 [REDACTED] 1999. We know that from the records.

18 A. (Witness nods)

19 Q. Generally in your statement -- and we have all the
20 detail, so all that's taken into account -- that you
21 were involved with the family since before care, from
22 1987.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. You tell us a bit about the background there.

25 Ultimately the boys were placed with foster parents who

1 had been assessed by Barnardo's?

2 A. There was care before then.

3 Q. Yes. I'm not going -- we have that in your statement

4 and we are aware of it. I'm not going to ask you --

5 A. That's right. We wanted to put the children to

6 permanents and Barnardo's -- I didn't seek that, the

7 family finding team would do that. They'd find out if

8 the specialist placement's going anywhere and there were

9 concerns about those children because their ethnicity

10 and their culture were totally different. There would

11 be those that say they should have been placed with

12 people of the same colour as themselves, but these kids

13 had never known anything about that culture. They were

14 eight and six.

15 Q. I think you tell us they had grown up in a very

16 westernised --

17 A. So did their mother, yeah.

18 Q. They were placed with the FSQ-SPO, who had been

19 assessed by Barnardo's and not fostered before, and at

20 paragraph 102 of your statement you say they were

21 matched, you think they were matched with the FSQ-SPO

22 because the FSQ-SPO were available and were willing

23 to look after children of a different ethnic origin?

24 A. Yes, I'm sure that's probably true. I'm sure they would

25 have presented very well about those kind of issues.

1 Q. At paragraph 104 of your statement --

2 A. Mm, yes.

3 Q. -- which starts on page 26 and moves over to page 27.

4 A. Mm-hmm.

5 Q. I think the point you're making here and we know from

6 the records that the initial placement for those boys

7 with the FSQ-SPO was anticipated to be about two

8 years?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. With the plan that they would then be moved on --

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. -- to a permanent placement --

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. -- whether adoption or permanent foster carers. Then

15 ultimately there was a decision that it would be

16 a permanent placement.

17 I understand that you may have some comments to make

18 on a kind of policy approach which suggests that

19 children ought to be placed for two years and then moved

20 on.

21 A. I think the theoretical thing behind that was that it

22 was assumed that if they formed an attachment to these

23 temporary people, they'd be able to transfer that

24 attachment to somebody else, but I didn't think that was

25 at all credible. These children were already -- any

1 child taking the attachments they had in their birth
2 family and then they are meeting with somebody else and
3 making attachments knowing that they're going to move
4 on -- I mean, to say to children, "We really like these
5 people, but you'll be moving in two years", I just
6 thought it was a nonsense, to be honest. I didn't think
7 that was the way to treat children at all. That was the
8 practice, for Barnardo's, anyway.

9 LADY SMITH: Sorry, are you saying this was a Barnardo's
10 policy?

11 A. It was -- I don't know if it was a policy, but
12 I think -- I'm trying to think -- yeah, I think -- yes,
13 it wasn't just Barnardo's. The thinking around at that
14 time was about transfer of attachment and it was all
15 probably based on Bowlby I think, and I just couldn't
16 see how that could really work. Because you were
17 basically saying to the children, "If they like you,
18 they'll keep you". Obviously I didn't say that to them,
19 but that was kind of -- children know that without being
20 told. Telling them that they're only going for two
21 years -- or you don't tell them at all and -- you know.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

23 A. It's difficult.

24 MS RATTRAY: I'm wondering whether -- I don't have the
25 source of that here right now, but thinking back perhaps

1 to a practice or a system where, for example, children
2 who are regarded as being hard to place essentially are
3 placed with foster carers --
4 A. Yeah.
5 Q. -- specialist foster carers --
6 A. Yes.
7 Q. -- who work with the children --
8 A. Yes.
9 Q. -- to adjust them to family life --
10 A. Yes, that was the intent.
11 Q. That's the idea, and then they're moved on to
12 a permanent family. So it's almost like a period of
13 adjustment and training.
14 A. Yes.
15 Q. But for such a period, there are issues with attachment,
16 you're saying.
17 A. Yes. And also, if that's the plan, you don't actually
18 have anyone to send the children on to in two years.
19 You might never have anyone. You wouldn't know.
20 Q. Moving now to page 35 of your statement. You've been
21 told that 142 sets out from 'Joe's' statement, and we
22 heard from him earlier this week, about certain types of
23 abuse.
24 A. Yes.
25 Q. You tell us at paragraph 143 that you weren't aware of

1 this.

2 A. I was not aware of any of that, no.

3 Q. And you would certainly consider that everything 'Joe'

4 says happened to have been abuse?

5 A. Absolutely true, yes.

6 Q. I think perhaps you say elsewhere that you didn't find

7 'Joe' to be a child who told lies?

8 A. No, he didn't. He didn't tell lies. It was the

9 opposite. He'd tell you how it was.

10 Q. The abuse that is described as paragraph 142, and

11 I think 'Joe' explains in his statement that this

12 appeared to be an attempt by the foster dad --

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. -- to try and -- well, certainly in the incidents about

15 eating tablet or caught smoking, it seemed to be trying

16 to exercise a degree of discipline or a lesson.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. I'm just thinking, this comes back to what we talked

19 about earlier?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. In relation to: to what extent was there any guidance or

22 training on the question of how one or a foster parent

23 should discipline a child?

24 A. I think the difficulty with that one -- because it's

25 obviously quite abusive -- is when you go to see the

1 foster carer that's been assessed and everything,
2 they're not going to tell you that they're going to do
3 things like that. They know not to say the things
4 they've done. You go and meet them and they seem fine.
5 They're not going to tell you that they're going to give
6 the child salt instead of sugar. Nobody would say that.
7 And certainly during their assessment they wouldn't have
8 said it because the assessment would finish. That would
9 end it.

10 Q. I'm going to ask you to look at some records now in
11 relation to 'Joe'.

12 A. Mm-hmm.

13 Q. The first record I want to look at is at GLA-000002170,
14 at page 31.

15 A. Right, the Barnardo's --

16 Q. That was page 1.

17 What we have here I understand to be progress notes
18 or case notes.

19 A. (Witness nods)

20 Q. I understand that this is your handwriting?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. By way of a background, it appears to be you have
23 written up notes on a visit to 'Joe's' foster placement on
24 5 April 1995.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. We know that this is some years before the placement
2 came to an end in [REDACTED] 1999.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. I think it starts -- if we move to the foot of that
5 page, when you arrive there, I think what we see in the
6 final paragraph is:

7 "The foster parents advised of a misunderstanding in
8 which 'Joe' had mistakenly thought he was being sent
9 back to Garfield."?

10 A. Right.

11 Q. Which was the children's home he was there before.

12 "They advised that they waited a couple of minutes
13 to see what would happen and 'Joe' became very
14 distressed."

15 A. Right.

16 Q. And you advised that 'Joe' must feel very insecure --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- and needs ongoing reassurance.

19 A. Yes. I don't remember that actual incident, but, yes,
20 he needed -- he needed -- he particularly needed
21 assurance because his older brother was like the perfect
22 son. Couldn't do a thing wrong. And that was largely
23 true. People looking -- in the office, his behaviour
24 was markedly different from his little brother. So,
25 yeah, I mean 'Joe' needed ongoing reassurance. They

1 both did, but 'Joe' particularly -- he was younger at
2 the time all the things happened. I think the older one
3 had really managed very well with parenting his mum,
4 basically. But the younger one, he had a lot of issues.
5 There's bits there about stealing and lying. That
6 must have come from the foster carers. I've never known
7 him to steal or lie ever.
8 Q. Yes, I think you actually comment on that in this record
9 and we'll come to that in a moment.
10 A. Right.
11 Q. If we turn over the page to page 32. At the top of that
12 page the notes carry on and in particular you ask
13 whether 'Joe' was happy about talking to you on his own:
14 "Foster parents said he was not."
15 A. I don't remember that. I remember I would have asked
16 'Joe' --
17 Q. But it appears that you insisted that you saw 'Joe'
18 alone.
19 A. Right, yeah.
20 Q. And then you interviewed him in the living room.
21 A. Yes.
22 Q. Then there's a very lengthy note of the interview, which
23 seems to go quite well and 'Joe' seems to be quite
24 willing to chat with you.
25 A. Yes.

1 Q. If we turn to page 33, which is a record of this visit
2 and the meeting, and towards the bottom of the page, at
3 one point we see:
4 "'Joe' returned to the armchair and stated
5 despondently, 'Dad says I keep being bad'."
6 Then if we move over the page to page 34, the second
7 paragraph, we see that you say:
8 "'Joe' continued to talk negatively about
9 himself ..."
10 You were obviously trying to say very positive
11 things about him, "You should be saying good things
12 about yourself".
13 A. Yeah.
14 Q. But he didn't seem to know that there was anything
15 positive about himself.
16 A. Didn't think there was anything positive about himself.
17 It was doubly difficult, really, because the older boy
18 was an extremely good-looking boy and everyone liked him
19 and he wouldn't have been acting out, whereas 'Joe'
20 would have been maybe being a bit difficult and everyone
21 just seemed to like the older brother.
22 Q. Moving to the bottom of this page, we see that following
23 your meeting with 'Joe', the foster parents returned to
24 the living room with the brother, "... who looks tall,
25 well-built, robust and very healthy".

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. I think the foster father asked what 'Joe' has said.

3 If we turn over to page 35, we see that the response

4 is the child, 'Joe', repeated the bad things about

5 himself and you corrected him, saying that you'd heard

6 that he was a very good footballer.

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Then the foster father made a joke, which was

9 nevertheless a put down of 'Joe'.

10 A. Yes. I don't remember the actual thing that was said,

11 but yes, that -- yes. I don't feel he was thought of as

12 highly as his brother by the foster carer, foster

13 father.

14 Q. That you then said, "Oh, he's good at art".

15 A. Yeah.

16 Q. And the foster parents stated immediately, "So is his

17 brother".

18 A. Right. That fits with -- I don't remember that, but

19 that would, yes, be much of what was happening at that

20 time. I think I was obviously beginning to pick up then

21 that all wasn't really well.

22 Q. At an earlier stage in the visit, the brother had

23 entered the room and ordered 'Joe', "Go upstairs now" in

24 a very adult fashion?

25 A. Yes, that happened. The adult presentation of the older

1 one was an issue even at the family therapy that they
2 went for. The older one acted like one of the adults.

3 Q. Turning to page 37 and the second paragraph, and this is
4 not really to ask you about anything to do, but I just
5 simply wanted to highlight that in terms of 'Joe's'
6 evidence, there's the reference to the ladder that the
7 boys go up and down to their attic bedroom.

8 Because, my Lady, I think there were some questions
9 and 'Joe' was speaking about that ladder?

10 LADY SMITH: Yes, thank you.

11 A. Yeah.

12 MS RATTRAY: There isn't any issue I need ask you about
13 that, Frances.

14 A. All right.

15 Q. Where I will turn now is to page 39 and this is the end
16 of your notes and you have a summary of concerns.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. That:

19 "'Joe's' totally negative self-image in his new
20 family and school."

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. That there's a:

23 "Concentration on badness rather than problems."

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. I think the foster parents, and most particularly the

1 foster father, and they seem to be taking a moral rather
2 than a therapeutic approach.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. "The family interactions, often subtle, apparently
5 intended to be humorous but nevertheless reinforcing the
6 children's' concept that 'Joe' is 'mad and bad' and his
7 brother is 'sensible and mature'."

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. You go on to say there is:

10 "... evidence that 'Joe' has not been given
11 sufficient and appropriate reassurance and
12 encouragement."

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And:

15 "'Joe's' current problems were not manifest prior to
16 this placement."

17 A. Oh right.

18 Q. "There are no records of stealing, intensive lying,
19 school problems or the aggression ..."

20 A. That's true. There was none at Garfield. None of
21 that --

22 Q. Between the boys.

23 A. Mm.

24 Q. 'Joe' did have a history of immense difficulties, but
25 they were not the same problems as now.

1 A. Yeah, his difficulties were not lying or stealing or
2 anything like that and he'd been a younger child as well
3 at that time. His difficulties was that he would throw
4 a tantrum for something that he wanted when you were out
5 and then if you bought him that thing he'd throw it
6 down. It was that kind of thing. Running riot on
7 a Glasgow bus one day and being upset by an old lady
8 telling him, "Santa is not going to come to you". That
9 kind of thing.

10 The older boy was never involved in anything like
11 that. I would spend most of my time looking after the
12 younger one, often with the older one's help. He just
13 joined in.

14 Q. You go on to say that you feel:

15 "... some of 'Joe's' difficulties may be emerging
16 in response to the present ..."

17 A. Oh right.

18 Q. "... rather than the past situation, ie from the foster
19 family rather than the natural family."

20 A. That's the first time that I've realised that I put
21 that. I thought that I had missed it all and thought it
22 was all to do with 'Joe's' past, but I see I was
23 already at that point thinking something's going wrong
24 in the present, not the past.

25 Q. Over the page at 7 you say that there's been:

1 "Changes in the foster parents, most particularly
2 the foster father, that seem to have occurred during the
3 period that [you weren't] visiting ..."

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. I know from your statement there were periods that you
6 weren't visiting because of work pressures and ill
7 health?

8 A. Mm.

9 Q. " ... and in the transference from short-term to
10 permanent carers."

11 At 8 you say there's:

12 "Evidence of anti-social work and related agencies
13 attitudes, particularly with the foster father ..."

14 A. Yes. I was picking that up. I hadn't realised I had
15 picked it up, but I have.

16 Q. Yes, and this is back in 1995.

17 A. Right.

18 Q. The next record I'd like to look at, we know from 'Joe'
19 and we know from what you say in your statement about
20 the circumstances in which this placement came to
21 an end.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. If we turn to GLA-000002166, page 17. This is a report
24 dated 18 October 1999 by Ros Wass --

25 A. Wass, the Barnardo's worker.

1 Q. Who was the link social worker with Barnardo's.

2 A. Yeah.

3 Q. It's a report that was prepared in respect of 'Joe's'

4 disrupted placement, that there was a meeting to discuss

5 that.

6 A. (Witness nods)

7 Q. She raises various issues and at the second paragraph

8 here she says:

9 "Although the foster family's successfully offered

10 'Joe' many years of a good family life, this was in

11 effect a first placement with inexperienced and untested

12 carers who in the event found it difficult to see 'Joe'

13 in context as a looked-after child where parenting has

14 to be shared with the Local Authority and decisions

15 negotiated."

16 A. Yes. I actually think it was a bit worse than that

17 myself, because I think now, looking back, that the

18 foster father didn't want the kid at all. He wanted the

19 older boy, who was -- the foster carers had two adult

20 daughters and I think that the older boy was the son

21 that the foster father had always wanted and I was aware

22 of that from the beginning. Not that I saw him being

23 nasty to him in any way, but they were quite really open

24 about that at the beginning. They didn't know if they

25 would manage 'Joe' as he got older, what's he going to

1 be like as a teenager and all that kind of thing, but he
2 was only a little boy at that time, six or seven.

3 Q. She says at the foot of that paragraph:

4 "The foster parents felt let down, unsupported at
5 times."

6 There was also reference to that they were not able
7 to maintain attendance at a support group that would
8 have helped them towards more realistic expectations and
9 better coping strategies.

10 A. I didn't know that or I don't remember that happening,
11 but yeah.

12 Q. And at times they expected more than 'Joe' could achieve
13 and it was difficult for the foster parents to
14 understand the reality of 'Joe's' damage and his
15 inability to please them.

16 A. Yes, I would agree with all that.

17 Q. Although there continues to be a close relationship
18 between the foster mum and 'Joe', the foster father was
19 more conditional in his affections, seeing 'Joe's'
20 continuing difficulties as a rejection of what they had
21 to offer.

22 A. Right, yeah.

23 Q. It says:

24 "I do feel they reached a stage when they felt that
25 they were unable to keep him safe and he was outwith

1 their control."

2 A. Yeah, that bit there's very interesting because those
3 words about rejection of what they had to offer was one
4 of the older -- the older brother's only two years older
5 than the little one and that's what he would come away
6 with. He would say it in front of me. He would say,
7 "You're not taking the opportunities you're being given"
8 and you're talking about a nine-year-old and, you know,
9 he was very negative about him as well. Secondary Institution

10 Secondary Institutions - to be published later we
11 talked about that, it came into play, and I asked the
12 older one had anything happened to him and he said,
13 "I wouldn't let that happen to me", and the implication
14 that 'Joe' had allowed that ...

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. But a boy of that age wouldn't say that without he's
17 heard that from an adult, I don't think.

18 Q. In that context, it goes on to speak about 'Joe':

19 "... part of a sibling group where his older brother
20 adapted more positively and was the focus of 'Joe's'
21 envy and jealousy and this tended to lead to good/bad
22 splits with 'Joe's' difficulty orchestrated against the
23 backcloth of his brother's success and the foster father
24 found it easier to approve 'Joe's' social compliance
25 rather than accept 'Joe's' disturbance and the good/bad
 child

1 dichotomy was apparent. This made it hard both for
2 'Joe' to feel accepted and for the foster father to
3 accept him."

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. If we move to the foot of this page, there are also
6 criticisms in this report of the service being provided
7 by the Local Authority. It took ages to achieve
8 auxiliary support for 'Joe' after several school
9 failures, it took ages to set up therapy at Notre Dame
10 and it was allowed to fail because of inadequate
11 arrangements. The family felt required to fill in and
12 instructed their own clinical psychologist --

13 A. Well, yes.

14 Q. -- but that had the effect of aggravating 'Joe's' level
15 of disturbance--

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. -- and failed to communicate his work with the caring
18 network.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. If we move over the page to page 19, which is the third
21 page of this document, a reference:

22 "Frances was often off sick or on duty, making it
23 difficult to get access to social work help, and there
24 was no contingency towards schooling for 'Joe' in the
25 event of the inevitable exclusion."

1 A. I don't remember being often off sick, there must have
2 been a particular thing happening, I don't remember what
3 that would be, though, but I was always on duty at the
4 time.

5 Q. Is that fair comment, that your ability to feed-in to
6 this foster family was affected by --

7 A. Oh yes. I used to argue with management about -- you
8 know, this placement's breaking down, it's not working,
9 I need to go out there, "No, you're on duty, you're the
10 duty worker, in the early intervention team, that's what
11 you have to do".

12 By that time I didn't have a supportive senior, so
13 yeah, I knew that I should be there but I couldn't.

14 Q. I want to turn to one last document here and that's at
15 page 24 of this document, which just tells us that this
16 is a report prepared by you for a childcare review and
17 the report's dated 13 May 1999, so we know this is after
18 the placement broke down in the [REDACTED].

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. If we turn to page 28 and this is a detailed report, and
21 what this says is:

22 "The foster father has repeatedly stated that
23 'Joe's' placement is no longer viable. The foster
24 parents feel they could only care for him if he gets
25 himself sorted out."

1 A. Yeah.

2 Q. "This would be a condition for even a weekend base if he
3 were settled into a residential school. The foster
4 father expressed his views that 'Joe's' difficulties are
5 genetic and I find no indication of any understanding of
6 the child's emotional trauma and distress, caused by
7 both his past and his present situation."

8 A. Yes. I think he thought that the child was kind of born
9 bad at that point. The foster father also did things
10 which were -- he worked out of a team. You know, he
11 went and got that psychologist while I was trying to fix
12 up therapy at Notre Dame, which happened, but they got
13 that psychologist involved and the psychologist was
14 known personally through their daughter who was doing
15 a degree and he -- anyway, and I had difficulty with
16 this. I had difficulty with everybody around 'Joe'.
17 The schools. The moving schools wasn't all his fault.
18 I mean none of that was his fault.

19 I mean the headmaster of the first school he was at
20 in Larbert said to me, "Well, you know, if this
21 placement's so important to him, can't you just threaten
22 him that you'll take him away if he doesn't behave
23 himself?"

24 This comes from a headmaster, who also made a joke
25 about colour after that.

1 The psychologist had some really strange theories,
2 that this child was multiple personality and that he
3 didn't know what he'd done that day and of course
4 I asked 'Joe' and he said, "Of course I knew what
5 I did". There were very strange happenings.

6 And that was the foster father that did that. He
7 came out with strange things as well about diets, the
8 child had halitosis(?) or something.

9 Q. Yeah, I think we see him trying particular diets,
10 thinking 'Joe's' problems were dietary.

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. We see here that the FSQ-SPO [REDACTED] had made it very clear
13 that they can't provide any care for 'Joe' during school
14 hours due to their work commitments, but then we see
15 that there's a very different perspective from
16 [REDACTED], who was 'Joe's' respite carer at the
17 time, who said:

18 "'Joe' has been absolutely fantastic this week. She
19 has challenged him on every issue since his arrival on
20 [REDACTED] 1999 and feels this has now paid off. He's
21 a different child from when he arrived. He comes in and
22 goes to bed on time. He has never stolen from the
23 [REDACTED] home, he has responded very positively to the
24 firm consistent care and control that Mrs [REDACTED] has
25 provided."

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. She goes on to express great anger and concern about the
3 position of the other foster family. She states that
4 she's had innumerable telephone conversations with the
5 foster mother advocating on 'Joe's' behalf and
6 Mrs [REDACTED] conveyed 'Joe's' level of shock and distress
7 to the FSQ-SPO [REDACTED], the foster family, but nothing has
8 changed.

9 A. Yeah.

10 Q. She further reports that 'Joe' has made many phone calls
11 to the FSQ-SPO [REDACTED], initially crying and pleading for
12 another chance, later telling them how much he loves
13 them and making promises to be good. The child waits by
14 the phone when he has made arrangements for them to
15 phone him. His calls are never reciprocated. All the
16 contacts have been initiated by 'Joe'. Mrs [REDACTED]
17 defines the foster family's position as "nothing less
18 than emotional cruelty".

19 A. Oh, I hadn't read that before, I don't think.

20 Q. That's certainly another perspective from a foster
21 carer --

22 A. Yes, I would agree.

23 Q. -- who is also a foster carer, indeed, who was provided
24 by the Barnardo's service?

25 A. Yes.

1 Was that the emergency one?

2 LADY SMITH: She's described as a respite carer earlier on.

3 A. Yeah, respite. You see, so he did really well in that
4 placement after he had left the other -- he did really
5 well and the department's answer to him doing really
6 well in that family was to stick him in a children's
7 unit. And he sat there on the bed saying, "Why am
8 I here? Look at it", he said, "Look at the carpet, it's
9 all torn, look at the window". You know, he was
10 heartbroken.

11 And I witnessed one of the calls that he made,
12 I think from either foster care or when he was at
13 Falkland school, he made a call and it was like that, he
14 was asking why they didn't want him and can't he come
15 home and -- yeah.

16 The way the placement ended did shock me a little
17 bit. I actually didn't think that they would do that,
18 really. And even the story I got about that was wrong.
19 I think it was the foster father that phoned me and
20 said, "'Joe's' set himself on fire". I thought where is
21 he? Was he in hospital? I thought he'd have major
22 burns. So I phoned up the hospital, he had no burns at
23 all. He'd set his clothes on fire but he wasn't wearing
24 them at the time and the foster father then said we
25 can't trust him in the house, what if he sets the house

1 on fire? We're not having him back.

2 MS RATTRAY: If I understand the position correctly, when he

3 did that he was out in some woodlands --

4 A. That's right, he wasn't in a building or anything, no.

5 Q. I'm going to take you back to your statement now,

6 Frances, and page 52. I appreciate there's a lot you've

7 told us in your statement, including about another child

8 in your care which we haven't got to today, but it is

9 all there, it's all very carefully read and is very much

10 part of the evidence in this case study.

11 A. (Witness nods)

12 Q. I see you say at paragraph 209 in terms of lessons

13 perhaps that we can learn --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- that you think:

16 "... safeguarding means you should see the child in

17 foster care. You can't just assume that foster carers

18 won't abuse children."

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. "I haven't always felt that way and that came as a bit

21 of a shock to me when I reached that realisation."

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. "Foster placements can go wrong and foster carers can

24 abuse children."

25 A. Yes. Yes, I didn't know that in the beginning.

1 I didn't think of things like that. But that was the
2 environment. Nobody did. Everyone assumed the foster
3 children were all all right. And then we found out they
4 weren't and the safeguarding thing was set up. Not like
5 the safeguarding at the children's panel, the
6 departmental safeguarding. But I didn't have the case
7 at that point.

8 Q. Just simply for the record, after you signed your
9 statement, you provided a summary, a document which
10 you've prepared, which is called, "Factors impinging on
11 practice"?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Which you consider are factors in practice which impact
14 adversely on the ability to care for children --

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. -- in foster care. A lot of the points you raise in
17 that we have covered today, but just for the record,
18 that's in the bundle at WIT-3-000001283.

19 A. Do you want me to --

20 MS RATTRAY: No, we have it. Just for the record that it's
21 there and that information is there.

22 That this afternoon, Frances, ends my questions.
23 Thank you very much for answering them.

24 A. Thank you.

25 MS RATTRAY: I'm not aware of there being any application

1 for questions, my Lady.

2 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
3 questions of Frances?

4 Frances, that completes all the questions we have
5 for you.

6 A. Okay.

7 LADY SMITH: As Ms Rattray's already said, we have your
8 statement and that is part of your evidence and I have
9 read it and I've seen all the detail of the other child
10 you provide us with as well as --

11 A. Yes.

12 LADY SMITH: -- the detail about 'Joe', both of which as
13 examples of what you came across are really enlightening
14 to me.

15 Thank you also for your general evidence about
16 social work and foster care in particular during that
17 time when you were working in that area. It's really
18 helpful to have heard that.

19 A. Thank you.

20 LADY SMITH: You must be exhausted now. I know we've put
21 you under the spotlight for quite a while now and I'm
22 delighted to be able to let you go --

23 A. Thank you.

24 LADY SMITH: -- and hopefully have a safe journey back home.

25 A. Thank you.

1 (The witness withdrew)

2 LADY SMITH: That completes the evidence for today, I take
3 it?

4 MS RATTRAY: It does, my Lady, but I would like to add to
5 the record that the read-in after the mid-morning break
6 this morning, I think we used the pseudonym 'Nora' --

7 LADY SMITH: Yes, I noticed that.

8 MS RATTRAY: -- in error, it should be 'Emma'.
9 Just for the record, any reference to 'Nora' should
10 be a reference to 'Emma'.

11 LADY SMITH: I thought, unbeknown to me, she had changed her
12 pseudonym. It's not that 'Nora' is her name, but that
13 was the name --

14 MS RATTRAY: No, 'Nora' isn't her name. It's simply the
15 wrong pseudonym.

16 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

17 MS RATTRAY: That does conclude the evidence for today,
18 my Lady.

19 We resume tomorrow where we have two oral witnesses
20 and further room for read-ins.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.
22 I'll rise now until 10 o'clock tomorrow morning.
23 (4.15 pm)

24 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am on
25 Friday, 30 September 2022)

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

'Erin' (read)	1
'Linda' (read)	24
'Nora' (read)	78
Elspeth Cromar (read)	114
Frances Shah (sworn)	120
Questions from Ms Rattray	122

