- Thursday, 19 December 2024
- 2 (10.00 am)

- 3 LADY SMITH: Good morning, and welcome to the last day in
- 4 Chapter 11 of this phase of our case study hearings. We
- 5 move to the closing submissions that are going to be
- 6 presented on behalf of the institutions that we have
- 7 heard about and the archdiocese that's represented here.
- 8 Mr MacAulay, would you like to introduce today's
- 9 proceedings.
- 10 MR MACAULAY: Yes, as your Ladyship has said, today is the
- 11 phase when we listen to submissions on behalf of those
- 12 with leave to appear.
- 13 My learned friend Mr Henry appears on behalf of
- 14 St Mary's, the Good Shepherd Sisters, and also for the
- 15 Archdiocese of Glasgow in respect of St Mary's and the
- 16 Good Shepherd. Can I suggest that he should begin, and
- 17 complete what he has to say.
- 18 Then my learned friend, Mr Gray, of course, appears
- 19 for Kibble.
- 20 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.
- 21 Mr Henry, when you are ready.
- 22 Submissions by Mr Henry
- 23 MR HENRY: Good morning, my Lady, and I would intend to
- 24 begin with the closing submissions on behalf of
- 25 St Mary's Kenmure.

- 1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 2 MR HENRY: My Lady, as your Ladyship is aware, I appear on
- 3 behalf of St Mary's Kenmure and these submissions have
- 4 been prepared in response to the invitation of the
- 5 Inquiry to St Mary's Kenmure to make the closing
- 6 submissions in relation to the issues raised during the
- 7 hearings which have taken place this month in respect of
- 8 Chapter 11 of Phase 8 of the Inquiry.
- 9 My Lady, can I begin with an apology in relation to
- 10 the failure to meet the Inquiry's deadline --
- 11 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 12 MR HENRY: -- for the lodging of these submissions. It is
- 13 appreciated that it causes inconvenience and disturbance
- 14 to the Inquiry. It was not the intention of St Mary's
- 15 Kenmure, my Lady, and I apologise for the late lodging
- of those submissions.
- 17 LADY SMITH: They should have been in on time, Mr Henry. No
- 18 reason was given for them being as late as they were,
- 19 and 'inconvenience' rather understates the impact that
- 20 it has on all concerned. Those who deal with the
- 21 administration of them coming in, those of us who want
- 22 to read them and think about them in advance, quite
- 23 separately from anything else. I don't know, are you
- able to explain why they were as late as they were?
- 25 MR HENRY: My Lady, again I do apologise. The submissions

- were drafted by the legal representatives. They
- 2 required input and instructions from St Mary's Kenmure.
- 3 The two processes brought together took longer than
- 4 was anticipated, my Lady. I can offer no other
- 5 explanation other than that, my Lady, and again I offer
- 6 my apologies.
- 7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 8 MR HENRY: My Lady, turning to the submissions.
- 9 As the Inquiry is aware, St Mary's Kenmure is
- 10 located in Bishopbriggs in East Dunbartonshire, although
- 11 the school traces its history back to the east end of
- 12 Glasgow in the mid 19th century. In or around 1905, the
- 13 Catholic Industrial School of Glasgow, which was located
- 14 at premises beside St Mary's Parish Church in
- 15 Abercromby Street, Glasgow, relocated to purpose-built
- 16 accommodation on the Kenmure estate, Bishopbriggs.
- 17 In 1916, following a minute of agreement between the
- 18 chairman of the directors of the Catholic Industrial
- 19 School of Glasgow and the Superior General of the
- De La Salle Brothers, the school was placed under the
- 21 superintendence of the Brothers. The building continued
- 22 to belong to the Archdiocese of Glasgow.
- 23 The De La Salle Brothers provided key employees and,
- 24 with other staff, ran the school until the Brothers left
- in 1966. Following the Brothers' departure, the board

of management governed the school and employed the staff.

In the mid 1970s, a secure unit known as the Ogilvie Wing was opened on the St Mary's Kenmure site. A new secure unit was subsequently built on the site, opening in June 2000. It was registered for 36 beds, plus one emergency bed. At that time, St Mary's Kenmure provided six open places and 30 secure places. Prior to the opening of the new secure unit, the Archdiocese of Glasgow sold the site to the Cora Foundation. The board of management continued as before.

When the new building opened and the young people on the site had moved into the new secure unit, its predecessor buildings were either demolished or were to be demolished. While St Mary's Kenmure is a company limited by guarantee, it is managed by an independent charitable organisation, a board of directors oversees the school's operations. A director of services is responsible for the day-to-day operational running of the school. The company is the registered provider of services to young people and is registered with the Care Inspectorate and the Registrar of Independent Schools. It is approved by the Scottish Ministers to provide secure accommodation services.

The objects of the charity are to provide secure

- 1 care and education for young people who are experiencing
- 2 social, emotional and behavioural difficulties. The
- 3 charity aims to meet its objective by the operation of
- a secure unit, with a view to affecting the mental,
- 5 physical and moral welfare of the young people within
- 6 the school and, as far as possible, to encourage them to
- 7 take their place as responsible citizens of the
- 8 community. The charity further aims to promote the
- 9 provision of additional childcare and educational
- 10 facilities to disseminate experiences, information and
- 11 treatments.
- 12 LADY SMITH: Can you remind me, Mr Henry, are you quoting
- 13 from the stated objectives of the charity there?
- 14 MR HENRY: Those are the stated objectives of the charity,
- 15 my Lady.
- 16 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 17 MR HENRY: My Lady, before turning to the evidence led
- during the Inquiry hearings, St Mary's Kenmure wishes
- 19 briefly to address the terms of its Section 21 response
- 20 to the Inquiry.
- 21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 22 MR HENRY: Which was explored with Mr Mannion during his
- 23 evidence to the Inquiry on 13 December.
- 24 St Mary's Kenmure's Section 21 response was
- 25 submitted in February 2022, which was before Mr Mannion

- joined the school in February 2023. St Mary's Kenmure
- 2 appreciates that Mr Mannion might and should have been
- 3 better briefed to understand the background to the
- 4 written responses.
- 5 LADY SMITH: It did put Mr Mannion in a very difficult
- 6 position, didn't it?
- 7 MR HENRY: It did, my Lady, and his discomfort was obvious
- 8 to those of us sitting here, my Lady.
- 9 LADY SMITH: It seemed very odd that nobody had thought that
- 10 he was going to be put in the position of speaking about
- 11 the school, and the background, under reference to the
- 12 Section 21 response, which he had played no part in, and
- 13 he needed to know about and understand and nobody had
- 14 helped him to do that, so he came to it cold, in effect,
- 15 when he came to give evidence.
- 16 MR HENRY: Yes, my Lady. I think Mr Mannion had been
- 17 provided with the Section 21 response, but clearly more
- 18 could have been done to assist him with that.
- 19 LADY SMITH: Yes, simply providing him with a dense document
- 20 wasn't really the way to do it, was it?
- 21 MR HENRY: It wasn't, my Lady.
- 22 St Mary's Kenmure did not intend to be uncooperative
- 23 with or disrespectful to the Inquiry. It apologises for
- 24 the terms of the response and for any inconvenience or
- 25 delay that that caused the Inquiry and indeed, my Lady,

- any difficulties that it caused to counsel to the
- 2 Inquiry when leading evidence from Mr Mannion.
- 3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 4 MR HENRY: St Mary's Kenmure appreciates that the definition
- 5 of abuse is wide-ranging and can manifest itself in many
- forms. St Mary's Kenmure acknowledges that abuse took
- 7 place within the school. It is accepted by St Mary's
- 8 Kenmure that inappropriate or excessive use of restraint
- 9 is abuse.
- 10 The Inquiry has heard evidence of physical,
- 11 emotional and sexual abuse. St Mary's Kenmure
- 12 apologises for all instances of such abuse that took
- 13 place within the school, whenever they took place.
- 14 St Mary's Kenmure regrets that the health and well-being
- of young people was harmed by controlled drugs being
- 16 brought into the school by staff --
- 17 LADY SMITH: I wanted to stop you with this use of language
- 18 which features through all of the submissions you
- 19 present. These were children. You know what the
- 20 definition is I work on --
- 21 MR HENRY: Yes.
- 22 LADY SMITH: -- for a child: anybody under 18.
- 23 MR HENRY: Yes, my Lady.
- 24 LADY SMITH: They weren't young adults, they weren't adults,
- 25 they were children, and they deserved the care and

- 1 treatment that children should have had.
- 2 MR HENRY: Absolutely, my Lady.
- 3 I think the term used is 'young people' rather than
- 4 'young adults', but certainly children is the more
- 5 appropriate term, my Lady, that's accepted.
- 6 LADY SMITH: Mr Henry, it is not difficult to see that
- 7 underlying it there is an impression of an attempt to
- 8 pull away from the real fact that these were children
- 9 not getting cared for as children should have been cared
- 10 for. And somehow -- and I am sure that it is not what
- 11 you intend -- but somehow it is mitigated by that fact,
- 12 when it wasn't. In fact, the need to take the
- 13 appropriate care for teenage children was elevated.
- 14 MR HENRY: My Lady, it certainly is not the intention to
- 15 move away. It is accepted that these are children, and
- I am quite happy to use 'children' throughout the rest
- of these responses, my Lady.
- 18 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 19 MR HENRY: Indeed, the removal of home leave as a form of
- 20 punishment was and remains unacceptable. St Mary's
- 21 Kenmure apologises for all instances in which it was
- 22 used as such.
- 23 The Inquiry's focus in this chapter in relation to
- 24 St Mary's Kenmure has not been to solely look back at
- 25 matters as they previously stood. The Inquiry has heard

- 1 evidence in relation to the Care Inspectorate's
- 2 inspection of the school in September and October of
- 3 this year. The Care Inspectorate rated the service as
- 4 unsatisfactory, along with an improvement notice that
- 5 stated no new admissions could be accepted until the
- 6 improvement notice was lifted. Though some of the
- 7 findings were about the physical environment, many were
- 8 about the implementation of processes and practices,
- 9 their findings included environmental safety, child
- 10 protection and safeguarding being consistently
- 11 compromised, meaning children were not being cared for
- 12 safely.
- 13 LADY SMITH: When you say 'environmental safety', for
- 14 example, that relates to the security of doors that
- should have been secured, and weren't secured --
- 16 MR HENRY: The doors --
- 17 LADY SMITH: -- amongst other things.
- 18 MR HENRY: I understand, my Lady, there's also in relation
- 19 to windows.
- 20 LADY SMITH: Yes. There was a particular problem in
- 21 children being able to get access to places they
- 22 shouldn't have access to, where dangerous objects could
- 23 be obtained by them.
- 24 MR HENRY: Indeed.
- 25 LADY SMITH: Isn't that right?

- 1 MR HENRY: Indeed, my Lady, I think that related to the
- 2 magnetic closing of the doors, and the doors not being
- 3 manually locked.
- 4 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 5 MR HENRY: Children being subjected to, or witnessing, high
- 6 level of physical restraint, which was often
- 7 disproportionate to the level of risk presented. There
- 8 was an absence of effective recording and reporting
- 9 around risk management, leading to a high risk of very
- 10 poor outcomes and dangerously low staffing levels.
- 11 My Lady, St Mary's Kenmure welcomed the Care
- 12 Inspectorate in to the school. Mr Mannion stated in his
- 13 evidence that St Mary's Kenmure accepts all of the Care
- 14 Inspectorate's findings and is cooperating fully and
- 15 vigorously with the Care Inspectorate to address the
- 16 serious issues identified.
- 17 As the Inquiry quite rightly identified, the more
- 18 powerful the lens that can be used to examine St Mary's
- 19 Kenmure, the better. St Mary's Kenmure regrets the
- 20 deterioration within the school and apologises
- 21 wholeheartedly to the children who have been affected.
- 22 St Mary's Kenmure recognises that whilst it is
- 23 currently unavailable for new admissions, it places the
- 24 secure care sector in Scotland at greater risk of being
- 25 unable to provide a service that meets demand.

- 1 My Lady, it is not in the written submissions, but
- 2 I think the Inquiry is aware that the Care Inspectorate
- 3 were within the school this week.
- 4 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 5 MR HENRY: My Lady, certainly, as I understand it, the Care
- 6 Inspectorate were at St Mary's until leaving yesterday
- 7 evening. St Mary's understands that formal notification
- 8 of the Care Inspectorate's findings will follow in due
- 9 course.
- 10 However, from conversations between St Mary's
- 11 Kenmure staff, board members and members of the Care
- 12 Inspectorate, St Mary's Kenmure anticipate, I can say no
- 13 higher than that, my Lady, that the Care Inspectorate
- 14 will permit St Mary's roll to be increased to a maximum
- of 12 young people.
- 16 LADY SMITH: Up to 12?
- 17 MR HENRY: Up to 12, my Lady, and that a further review will
- 18 take place in February next year. My Lady, I don't have
- 19 a date for when the roll might be increased to 12, this
- 20 was simply based on conversations which took place
- 21 yesterday.
- 22 LADY SMITH: So at the moment, how many children are there?
- Do you know?
- 24 MR HENRY: It's seven, my Lady.
- 25 LADY SMITH: Seven.

- 1 MR HENRY: So it would be an increase of five.
- 2 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 3 Do you know when the report will be delivered of
- 4 this week's work?
- 5 MR HENRY: I don't, my Lady. I don't think St Mary's
- 6 themselves have been told that, my Lady.
- 7 LADY SMITH: We can no doubt follow up on that. But it
- 8 would be helpful if, as soon as St Mary's know, you let
- 9 us know. We will also, no doubt, find out from the Care
- 10 Inspectorate, but the two-pronged approach would assist
- 11 us.
- 12 MR HENRY: Certainly, my Lady.
- 13 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 14 MR HENRY: My Lady, the Inquiry has heard evidence in
- 15 relation to St Mary's Kenmure from decades past up to
- 16 the present day. St Mary's Kenmure did not seek to
- 17 question the evidence of the survivors. It apologises
- 18 for all instances of abuse that occurred within the
- 19 school. It accepts that harm was caused to children as
- 20 a result of their time in residential accommodation.
- 21 St Mary's Kenmure acknowledges the suffering
- 22 survivors have experienced and their bravery in coming
- 23 forward. The school does not seek to challenge or
- 24 minimise the experience and evidence of those survivors,
- 25 it apologises for the failings which have contributed to

- their pain and suffering. St Mary's Kenmure is grateful
- 2 for the opportunity to participate in the Inquiry's
- 3 proceedings and seeks to assist the Inquiry in any way
- 4 that it can.
- 5 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 6 MR HENRY: My Lady, if I turn now to the Roman Catholic
- 7 Archdiocese of Glasgow.
- 8 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 9 MR HENRY: I again, appear on behalf of the archdiocese.
- 10 Again, my Lady, can I start these submissions with
- 11 the same apology which prefaced the St Mary's
- 12 submissions. My Lady, again, no disrespect was meant to
- 13 the Inquiry. It is appreciated the difficulties that
- 14 the late lodging has caused the Inquiry and it's the
- same reasons, my Lady, in terms of the two-pronged
- 16 approach of drafting instructions took longer than
- 17 expected, my Lady. That's simply the only explanation
- 18 that I can provide.
- 19 As the Inquiry is aware, the archdiocese traces its
- 20 post-Reformation history to 1878, when Pope Leo XIII
- 21 restored the ancient hierarchy in Scotland by means of
- 22 the Apostolic Constitution Ex Supremo. This created two
- 23 archdioceses and four dioceses in Scotland, the
- 24 Archdiocese of Glasgow being one of those archdioceses.
- 25 The current archbishop is the Most Reverend

William Nolan, who was installed as Archbishop of

Glasgow on 26 February 2022. The archdiocese, too,

remains grateful for the opportunity to participate in

the Inquiry's ongoing work and is committed to assisting

it in any way that it can.

The archdiocese accepts that harm was caused to children, who are now adults, as a result of their time in residential accommodation. The archdiocese acknowledges the suffering, trauma and pain that the survivors have experienced and their bravery in coming forward. It is acknowledged that there may be others who have suffered but have not yet come forward and the archdiocese continues to seek ways to support survivors.

The archdiocese in no way seeks to challenge or minimise the evidence of survivors. The purpose of these submissions is to set out to the Inquiry, should it assist the Chair, the archdiocese's position in relation to the evidence led during this chapter in relation to St Mary's Kenmure and the Good Shepherd Centre in Bishopton.

Before turning to the evidence led, the archdiocese wishes to thank the Inquiry for the opportunity to provide updated Section 21 responses in relation to these establishments and for the Inquiry's staff and legal teams' assistance in relation to that, my Lady.

- 1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 2 MR HENRY: Turning to St Mary's Kenmure, my Lady, the
- 3 Inquiry is aware that the school traces its roots back
- 4 to the east end of Glasgow in the mid 19th century.
- 5 Your Ladyship has these submissions. I don't know
- 6 whether your Ladyship requires them to be read in to the
- 7 transcript again.
- 8 LADY SMITH: Yes, perhaps you can just summarise them so
- 9 that I have them for the transcript, please.
- 10 MR HENRY: Indeed, my Lady.
- 11 As the Inquiry is aware, that following a move from
- 12 the east end of Glasgow at the beginning of the 20th
- 13 century to the Kenmure estate in Bishopbriggs, the
- 14 De La Salle Brothers were invited by the then Archbishop
- of Glasgow to the school, which was placed under the
- 16 superintendence of the De La Salle Brothers in 1916.
- 17 The property remained under the ownership of the
- archdiocese, and the archdiocese appointed members of
- 19 the board of management, with other members being
- 20 appointed by the Town Council of Glasgow. The Brother
- 21 Superintendent, the headmaster of the school, was
- 22 appointed by the Superior General of the Brothers, as
- 23 were other Brothers. Lay staff were appointed by the
- 24 superintendent, but the chaplain was appointed by the
- 25 archbishop.

- 1 LADY SMITH: It is interesting, because the picture is then
- 2 not simply that the archdiocese remained the property
- 3 owner and leave a different organisation to operate as
- 4 they choose and decide whatever activity is carrying on
- 5 in it, but the archdiocese was very much involved in,
- 6 some might say, controlling how it runs, because of the
- 7 choice of the head, the choice of people on the board of
- 8 managers and the influence that the archdiocese is then
- 9 in a position to bring to bear.
- I am not saying there is anything sinister in that,
- 11 please don't get me wrong, but one can't help but fail
- 12 to notice that the input of the archdiocese must have
- 13 continued to be quite significant.
- 14 MR HENRY: Indeed, my Lady.
- 15 As I understand it, the headmaster was appointed by
- 16 the Superior General of the Brothers, but certainly the
- 17 archdiocese had the choice of appointing in relation to
- 18 board members.
- 19 LADY SMITH: Oh yes, yes.
- 20 MR HENRY: And indeed the chaplain of the school, my Lady.
- 21 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 22 Do you know whether -- maybe you don't -- there was
- 23 any consultation between the Superior General of the
- 24 Brothers and the archdiocese over the appointment of the
- 25 headmaster, because it was a key role?

- 1 MR HENRY: It is a key role, my Lady. It is not a question
- 2 that I know the answer to.
- 3 LADY SMITH: It may be that it was felt that it was
- 4 sufficient that there was influence on the board of
- 5 management, I don't know.
- 6 MR HENRY: It may well be, my Lady. But I am not in
- 7 a position to assist the Inquiry with that.
- 8 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 9 MR HENRY: As the Inquiry is aware, the De La Salle Brothers
- 10 left the school in 1966. The board of the school
- 11 continued to govern the school as it had done before,
- 12 employing staff as required. The board of managers was
- 13 responsible for the school, and employed the staff. The
- 14 archbishop appointed some board members. These included
- 15 clergy from the archdiocese. The board members were
- 16 appointed to personally assume membership of the board
- and responsibility for the establishment. The board
- 18 employed the staff of the school and governed it.
- 19 The legal status of the board of managers was later
- 20 changed to a company limited by guarantee, known as
- 21 St Mary's Kenmure. The company was incorporated on
- 22 17 December 2010, and the first meeting of the board of
- 23 directors of the new company was held on 12 April 2011.
- 24 The company was formed under a memorandum of
- 25 association, which established the objects and powers of

the charitable organisation. The company is the
registered provider of services to young people, and is
registered with the Care Inspectorate and the Registrar
of Independent Schools and is approved by the Scottish
Ministers to provide secure accommodation services.

The Inquiry has heard evidence, both in relation to the historical position of the school and the current difficulties faced by St Mary's Kenmure. Throughout this time, the archdiocese appointed some board members and clergy from the archdiocese were at times board members. The archdiocese was accordingly represented on the board.

The Inquiry has heard evidence of physical, sexual and emotional abuse at St Mary's Kenmure. It has heard of the withdrawal of home leave being used as a punishment and controlled drugs being brought into the school by staff. It is clear to the archdiocese that whatever rules, regulations, legislations, policies and procedures that were in place, they failed to prevent the abuse described by the survivors.

It is a matter of deep regret for the archdiocese if any failings on the part of the archdiocese have contributed in any way to the abuse suffered by pupils at St Mary's Kenmure. The archdiocese also regrets if failings on its part may have contributed to the

- situation currently faced by St Mary's Kenmure and, most 1 2 importantly, the children cared for there. The archdiocese apologises for those failings. 3 In relation to the Good Shepherd Centre, my Lady, 5 the archdiocese understands that by the early 1980s, the Good Shepherd Sisters were well-established in Bishopton, Renfrewshire, following a move from the east 7 end of Glasgow in the 1940s or 1950s. Bishopton is 8 located within the Diocese of Paisley. 9 10 Although there had initially been two separate centres on the site in Bishopton, St Euphrasia's 11 Training Centre and Dalbeth Approved School, the two 12
  - establishments had merged to become the St Euphrasia's Centre, that centre would later become the Good Shepherd Centre.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

During the 1980s, the Good Shepherd Sisters began the process of removing themselves from the site at Bishopton. In April 1981, the then Archbishop of Glasgow, Thomas Winning, wrote to the convent solicitor, indicating that the bishops and the Hierarchy were ready to undertake the responsibility of running St Euphrasia's for a period of two years. The responsible body became the Scottish Hierarchy of the Roman Catholic church. During this time, a board of management was established and took responsibility for

- the governance of the school. The archdiocese
  understands that the structure of the board has been
  changed to a company limited by guarantee, and remains
  a charity.
- 5 Given its location within the Diocese of Paisley, the archdiocese understands that the responsibility for 7 the appointment of board members at the Good Shepherd Centre lies with the Bishop of Paisley. Though there 8 9 was a period when, in terms of the articles of 10 association, the archdiocese had some rights and the archbishop had some rights in terms of appointments, it 11 is the archdiocese's understanding that, in practice, 12 those appointments were made by the Bishop of Paisley. 13 14 There have, however, been periods when clergy from the archdiocese were members of the board. 15
- LADY SMITH: Can you just explain to me exactly how that 16 works? We start out by the time the Good Shepherd 17 18 Sisters are indicating they want to leave, but it sounds as though some efforts were made to enable continuation 19 of work being done at the premises, and the archbishop, 20 21 in 1981, writes a letter saying, 'Okay, the bishops are 22 ready to undertake the responsibility of running 23 St Euphrasia's', so it must have been talked about for
- When he says 'the bishops', who is he referring to?

some time before then.

24

- 1 MR HENRY: My Lady, it's my understanding that that refers
- 2 to the Hierarchy, but if your Ladyship would allow me
- 3 one moment.
- 4 LADY SMITH: If you could. Thank you.
- 5 (Pause)
- 6 MR HENRY: My Lady, certainly it is my understanding that it
- 7 would be the Hierarchy, my Lady, I don't know whether
- 8 the Bishops' Conference were a separate body at that
- 9 time --
- 10 LADY SMITH: Yes, I see.
- 11 MR HENRY: -- I just simply don't have that information to
- 12 hand. But it would be that the Hierarchy of the Church
- 13 would be responsible, my Lady.
- 14 LADY SMITH: All right. Where, then, does the archdiocese
- 15 fit in?
- 16 MR HENRY: My Lady, the archdiocese, and the archbishop is
- 17 part of the Hierarchy.
- 18 LADY SMITH: All right.
- 19 MR HENRY: And would have a role in that sense.
- 20 LADY SMITH: They would be involved to that extent, okay.
- 21 Then we find that it is the Bishop of Paisley who is
- 22 directly involved with appointments to the Good Shepherd
- 23 Centre, and that's geographical, do I have that right?
- 24 MR HENRY: Bishopton is in church terms, my Lady, located
- 25 within the Diocese of Paisley.

- 1 LADY SMITH: Yes, all right, thank you.
- 2 When you then refer to the archdiocese at one period
- 3 having rights in terms of appointments, what are we
- 4 talking about?
- 5 MR HENRY: My Lady, there was the document which I think
- 6 counsel to the Inquiry explored. At one stage there
- 7 was, I think, the articles of association from 2001,
- 8 where there was reference to appointments may be made
- 9 by, I think it was referred to both the Archbishop of
- 10 Glasgow and the Bishop of Paisley.
- 11 LADY SMITH: Okay, yes.
- 12 MR HENRY: My Lady, that document was certainly referred to
- in evidence.
- 14 LADY SMITH: That was in the time of the previous corporate
- 15 body, the one that predated the establishment of the
- 16 charity, the company limited by guarantee?
- 17 MR HENRY: It was a 2001 document, I believe, my Lady, or
- 18 certainly early 2000s --
- 19 LADY SMITH: Okay.
- 20 MR HENRY: -- in any event, my Lady.
- 21 My Lady, the archdiocese understands that the
- 22 Inquiry has heard evidence of the period following the
- 23 withdrawal of the Good Shepherd Sisters from the
- 24 establishment.
- 25 Throughout the Inquiry's hearings, there has been

- 1 evidence of physical, sexual and emotional abuse which
- 2 has taken place, which survivors told about at Good
- 3 Shepherd Centre. The archdiocese deeply regrets that
- 4 any such abuse has taken place and the archdiocese
- 5 apologises for any failings on its part which have in
- 6 any way contributed to that abuse.
- 7 The archdiocese does not seek in any way to
- 8 challenge or minimise the experience and evidence of
- 9 survivors. It does not challenge their evidence.
- 10 While it may be of little consolation to survivors
- 11 to hear of lessons learned, the archdiocese is committed
- 12 to learning lessons through this Inquiry. The
- 13 archdiocese takes the issue of safeguarding extremely
- 14 seriously. It follows procedures which cover the
- 15 Catholic Church in Scotland and those procedures are
- 16 monitored by the Scottish Catholic Safeguarding
- 17 Standards Agency, which is an independent body.
- 18 LADY SMITH: That's the relatively new body you are
- 19 referring to there, is it?
- 20 MR HENRY: I don't know about relatively new, my Lady. If
- 21 your Ladyship will allow me one moment.
- 22 LADY SMITH: Can you remind me?
- 23 MR HENRY: My Lady, I don't have the date that the Scottish
- 24 Catholic Safeguarding Standards Agency was set up. If
- 25 I recall, I think Monsignor Bradley may have been asked

- 1 about this in the evidence --
- 2 LADY SMITH: Yes, okay.
- 3 MR HENRY: -- my Lady.
- 4 My Lady, the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Glasgow
- 5 is grateful for this opportunity to participate in this
- 6 phase of the Inquiry, and it remains the archdiocese's
- 7 intention to assist the Inquiry in any way that it can.
- 8 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 9 MR HENRY: My Lady, unless there are any other matters,
- 10 relating to the archdiocese, it would be my intention to
- 11 turn now to the Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of
- 12 the Good Shepherd.
- 13 LADY SMITH: Thank you, that's fine.
- 14 MR HENRY: My Lady, for brevity I will refer to them as the
- 15 Good Shepherd Sisters, and I appear on their behalf.
- 16 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 17 MR HENRY: My Lady, the body with the long title, the
- 18 Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good
- 19 Shepherd, was formed in June 2014 by the amalgamation of
- 20 the Order of Our Lady of Charity and the order of Our
- 21 Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd, which was founded
- 22 by Sister Mary Euphrasia Pelletier in 1835 in Angers,
- 23 France.
- 24 The two congregations shared a common origin, that
- of the Order of Our Lady of Charity, which was founded

in Normandy in 1641 by the then Father John Eudes, who
was later canonised. The order had the stated goal of
caring for girls and women.

In 1825, Sister Mary Euphrasia was appointed superior of the community of the order in Tours, France.

In 1829, Sister Mary Euphrasia was asked by the Bishop of Angers to set up a home for girls and women there. That home opened in 1829 and was called the Good Shepherd, in memory of another house with a similar ministry which had existed in Angers during the previous century.

The generalate was approved in 1935, and, with this approval, the church established a congregation distinct from the Order of Our Lady of Charity. The order have cared for children since their beginning in France.

The Congregation of Our Lady of Charity of the Good Shepherd is an international, apostolic, religious institute of pontifical right. It is not subject to the diocesan hierarchy for its internal workings, but is committed to working with the authority of the Hierarchy, and according to its norms.

The order has its own Superior General, and a general chapter that meets every six years. The current provincial chair in the United Kingdom is Sister Anne-Josephine Carr.

- The Good Shepherd Sisters' interest in this chapter
  relates to Dalbeth School and St Euphrasia's Training
  Centre in Bishopton, Renfrewshire. The move to
  Bishopton followed a period spent in Dalbeth, Glasgow,
  where Dalbeth Girls' School operated as an approved
  school.
- 7 In the summer of 1948, a new voluntary home, 8 St Euphrasia's Training Centre, opened.
- 9 In 1953, Dalbeth Girls' School opened on its site in Bishopton.
- In 1971, the two establishments merged to form the

  St Euphrasia's Centre. St Euphrasia's Centre was

  an independent residential establishment, governed by

  a voluntary board of managers, the responsible parent

  body being the Sisters of the Good Shepherd.
- The Good Shepherd Sisters realised that they were

  not going to be able to staff the St Euphrasia's Centre

  indefinitely. Following discussions with the Catholic

  Hierarchy of Scotland, it was decided that the

  St Euphrasia's Centre would be handed over to the

  Hierarchy.
- In 1981, the Hierarchy took on responsibility for
  the centre, which continued to be governed by
  a voluntary board of managers.
- 25 In 1995, the property was sold to the Cora

- 1 Foundation.
- On 1 April 1996, the Good Shepherd Sisters left
- 3 Bishopton, with the keys to the property being
- 4 transferred to the Cora Foundation.
- 5 My Lady, it was a fundamental tenet of the Good
- 6 Shepherd Sisters that they were never to strike
- 7 children. This followed an instruction from
- 8 Sister Mary Euphrasia that children were not to be
- 9 struck, nor harsh measures used. Sister Mary Euphrasia
- 10 directed that that order was to stand forever and
- always, as though it were inscribed and printed
- 12 everywhere. This order applied regardless of whether
- 13 corporal punishment was permitted by the law, statutory
- 14 regulations which applied in any jurisdiction within
- 15 which the Good Shepherd Sisters were operating.
- 16 Though the policy itself may be considered
- 17 enlightened at a time when corporal punishment of
- 18 children was permitted in Scotland, the Good Shepherd
- 19 Sisters accept that people do not always adhere to the
- 20 high standards expected of them. A policy can only be
- 21 as effective as those administering it.
- 22 The Good Shepherd Sisters accepted that there were
- 23 occasions when corporal punishment was used.
- 24 LADY SMITH: Maybe the order should have been inscribed and
- 25 printed everywhere.

- 1 MR HENRY: Indeed, my Lady.
- 2 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 3 MR HENRY: My Lady --
- 4 LADY SMITH: In fairness to the Good Shepherd Sisters, they
- 5 are not the only religious order I have come across
- 6 whose founding documents included clear directions that
- 7 children were not to be hit, but somewhere that was lost
- 8 in the mists of time as their operations progressed.
- 9 MR HENRY: Yes, my Lady.
- 10 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 11 MR HENRY: My Lady, the Good Shepherd Sisters accept that
- 12 harm was caused to children, who are now adults, as
- 13 a result of their time spent in residential
- 14 accommodation. They acknowledge the suffering, trauma
- 15 and pain survivors have experienced and their bravery in
- 16 coming forward. It is acknowledged by the Sisters that
- 17 there may be others who have suffered but have not yet
- 18 come forward. The Good Shepherd Sisters apologise to
- 19 all those who suffered harm as a result of their time
- 20 spent in the care of the Sisters.
- 21 The Good Shepherd Sisters acknowledge that the
- 22 definition of abuse is wide-ranging and can manifest
- 23 itself in many forms. Survivors have given evidence of
- 24 experiencing and/or witnessing a number of forms of
- 25 abuse, including the use of a punishment or detention

- room. There has been evidence of young people being required to work in the laundry, and cleaning parts of the inner buildings.
- The Good Shepherd Sisters understood the laundry to
  be at its training centre in Bishopton and was intended
  to function in a way to give the young people a work
  ethic and work experience in preparation for their time
  after leaving the care of the Sisters.
- 9 There has, my Lady, also been evidence of a lack of
  10 suitable accommodation being provided to children within
  11 the --

education.

- LADY SMITH: You will remember no doubt, Mr Henry, that one of the witnesses from whom we heard was born in 1944 and she went into the Good Shepherd accommodation at the age of 11, not because she had done anything wrong, not because she had got into bad company, but there was a lack of adequate parental care and she couldn't safely be left with her own family, her own mother. Just 11. She explained that every week day, certainly, her life would be dominated by 12-hour shifts in the laundry, and then oh, there was a change at the weekends when they got to do the cleaning. She was absolutely clear it wasn't a lack of suitable education, she had no
- Now, surely you are not saying that putting

- a 11-year old child into a laundry was a way of
- 2 preparing the 11-year old child to have a work ethic for
- 3 leaving care?
- 4 MR HENRY: No, my Lady.
- 5 LADY SMITH: No. It wasn't, was it?
- 6 MR HENRY: No, my Lady.
- 7 My Lady, the work in the laundry was not suitable
- 8 for children.
- 9 LADY SMITH: It was dreadful, and from her evidence it
- 10 sounded as though there were quite a number of them
- 11 having to work the way she worked.
- 12 MR HENRY: Indeed, my Lady, and the children should not have
- 13 been required to take part in that commercial
- 14 enterprise.
- 15 LADY SMITH: No.
- 16 Do you know whose decision it was that there should
- 17 be a significant, and it was a commercial enterprise,
- 18 being operated at Bishopton, using these children as the
- 19 labour that was carrying out the laundry work; do you
- 20 know who decided that?
- 21 MR HENRY: My Lady, I don't have that information to hand.
- 22 Certainly enquiries can be made with those instructing.
- 23 LADY SMITH: It may not have been recorded, but if there is
- 24 anything else that assists one get to the bottom of who
- 25 thought it was okay, and why they thought it was okay to

- do that, and whether they -- I suspect it was a decision
- 2 taken remote from the inner sanctum of the Bishopton
- 3 property -- ever went anywhere near it to see what was
- 4 happening.
- 5 MR HENRY: My Lady, certainly the evidence is clearly of
- a substantial commercial enterprise that children should
- 7 not have been working in, and should not have been
- 8 exposed to the dangers involved in that.
- 9 My Lady, survivors also gave evidence of the
- 10 requirement to clean parts of the buildings, including
- 11 the use of devices which may have been referred
- 12 elsewhere in this Inquiry to as buffers.
- 13 LADY SMITH: I think the term commonly used is bumper.
- 14 MR HENRY: Bumper, sorry.
- 15 LADY SMITH: Bumpers. That was certainly a feature in, oh,
- 16 way back, Daughters of Charity, Smyllum, maybe not the
- only place. It was also a tool that was used, as
- 18 I understand it, in army barracks, because it was heavy,
- 19 very heavy. Often the structure of them was metal such
- as iron, so that they were heavy enough to put good
- 21 pressure, really good pressure, on the floors to make
- 22 them sparkling clean in the way soldiers would expect
- 23 their men to do. Not exactly right for children.
- 24 MR HENRY: No, my Lady. It's a matter of regret for the
- 25 Good Shepherd Sisters that survivors were put to work in

- 1 this way.
- 2 My Lady, the Good Shepherd Sisters accept that
- 3 children who were placed in their care in Bishopton were
- 4 harmed and they apologise for that harm suffered by the
- 5 survivors.
- 6 The Good Shepherd Sisters welcome this Inquiry and
- 7 appreciate that it is important for all voices to be
- 8 heard. The Sisters regret that survivors have painful
- 9 memories of time spent in their care and the Good
- 10 Shepherd Sisters do not seek in any way to challenge or
- 11 minimise those experiences and that evidence of the
- 12 survivors.
- 13 The Good Shepherd Sisters are grateful to the
- 14 Inquiry for the opportunity to participate in its work,
- and are committed to assisting it in any way that they
- 16 can.
- 17 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.
- 18 Can I now turn to Mr Gray.
- 19 Submissions by Mr Gray
- 20 MR GRAY: Thank you, my Lady.
- 21 On behalf of Kibble Education and Care Centre, my
- 22 Lady, I have prepared a written submission and
- 23 I understand that my Lady has been provided with a copy
- 24 of that.
- 25 LADY SMITH: I have, thank you.

- 1 MR GRAY: With my Lady's leave I would therefore propose to
- 2 read out the submission at this juncture.
- 3 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 4 MR GRAY: My Lady, by way of introduction, at the
- 5 introductory hearing of this phase of the Inquiry,
- I indicated in the opening statement, which I made on
- 7 behalf of Kibble, that it wished to express its deepest
- 8 and most profound sympathies to all those who have been
- 9 the victims of abuse whilst in care in Scotland.
- 10 At the outset of this submission, I would wish, and,
- 11 indeed, am specifically instructed, to reiterate those
- 12 sentiments which are so keenly felt by all employed by
- 13 and associated with Kibble.
- 14 My Lady, in relation to the issue of the assistance
- 15 to the Inquiry that has been provided, as I indicated in
- 16 the opening statement, Kibble has been committed to
- 17 assisting the Inquiry in its investigations wherever
- 18 possible. The care, welfare and safety of vulnerable
- 19 young persons -- by which, my Lady, I mean children --
- 20 is at the core of everything that Kibble seeks to do and
- 21 where any abuse may have occurred within its
- 22 organisation, Kibble has been determined to ensure that
- 23 all possible assistance is provided to the Inquiry to
- 24 undertake its investigations.
- 25 As the Inquiry is aware, to date Kibble has provided

- detailed and comprehensive written responses to several
- Section 21 notices and has provided extensive records,
- 3 some dating back to 1930, relevant to the Inquiry's
- 4 requests.
- 5 My Lady, whilst it is appreciated that this phase of
- 6 the Inquiry is now coming to a conclusion, Kibble
- 7 continues to offer to provide any information which the
- 8 Inquiry may wish, in particular should anything arise
- 9 from the evidence given by 'Robert', SNR
- 10 SNR , and Mr MacMillan, its current Director of
  11 Corporate Services.
- 12 My Lady, turning to the evidence of the applicants
- 13 which has been recently given. As I also indicated in
- 14 the opening statement, my Lady, in relation to this
- phase of the Inquiry, Kibble has been anxious to listen
- 16 to and reflect upon the evidence given by those who have
- 17 been the victims of abuse, including at Kibble. My
- 18 Lady, in that regard, my Lady will be aware that
- 19 Mr MacMillan was present to hear the evidence of
- 20 applicants and, indeed, both Mr MacMillan and
- 21 Mr Jim Gillespie, the organisation's chief executive,
- 22 are present today.
- 23 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
- 24 MR GRAY: My Lady, in my submission, the applicants, in
- 25 giving evidence about the most serious incidents of both

physical and sexual abuse to which they or others were subject during their childhood, whilst in care at Kibble, in periods in the early 1960s and early 1980s, showed a quiet dignity and extraordinary courage in equal measure.

As Mr MacMillan, the Director of Corporate Services at Kibble, said in evidence, having listened to the accounts of both 'Iain' and 'Graham', the events described were appalling and the manner in which the applicants gave their evidence was humbling.

It is clear, in my submission, when one has regard to the evidence of the applicants, and that contained in the witness statements which have been read in, that the conduct with which the Inquiry is concerned at Kibble in the period of the early 1960s, 1980s and 1990, was not only appalling, but also reflected systemic failings, which at various times included a repeated disregard by staff for acts of physical and sexual abuse, whether committed by other young persons or staff, and, on occasion, sexual abuse perpetrated by the most senior member of staff.

That these failings were systemic was a matter which was very properly acknowledged by Mr MacMillan in evidence, and for which, on behalf of Kibble, he offered his deepest sympathies to all victims.

- 1 My Lady, turning now to Kibble for the period from
- 2 1993 to date. My Lady, in relation to Kibble's
- 3 activities since 1993, the Inquiry has had the benefit
- 4 of hearing the evidence of 'Robert', who was SNR
- of Kibble from 1993 until his retirement in 2017.
- 6 LADY SMITH: It's a remarkably long period of tenure, but
- 7 very helpful to have heard from somebody who was
- 8 involved with Kibble over such a long period.
- 9 MR GRAY: Indeed, my Lady.
- 10 And also from Mr MacMillan, who, as already stated,
- 11 is Kibble's Director of Corporate Services, having
- 12 originally joined Kibble as a fundraising officer in
- 13 2007.
- 14 There is no doubt, in my submission, that as set out
- in detail by 'Robert' in his evidence, in 1993 Kibble,
- as with many other similar institutions, had many
- 17 longstanding and fundamental deficiencies in the way in
- 18 which it operated. In the context of the issues with
- 19 which this Inquiry is concerned, it is significant to
- 20 note, in my submission, that 'Robert' recognised that
- 21 many of those deficiencies, namely no training, poor
- 22 recruitment, poor checks, poor screening, insufficient
- 23 probation periods and nepotism encouraged abuse.
- 24 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 25 MR GRAY: My Lady, as the Inquiry has heard, from the date

- of his arrival at Kibble in 1993, 'Robert' embarked upon
- 2 what, in my submission, was a comprehensive and
- 3 innovative programme of improvement to address all the
- 4 deficiencies which he had identified and to ensure,
- 5 insofar as was reasonably practicable, that the sort of
- 6 abuse described by the applicants to this Inquiry would
- 7 never recur, and that Kibble would become a safe
- 8 environment which met the needs of young persons
- 9 compassionately and appropriately.
- 10 My Lady, the scale of the challenge faced by
- 11 'Robert' on taking up his appointment was, in my
- 12 submission, summarised very aptly by him in his witness
- 13 statement, when he stated:
- 'It might not have seemed it at the time, but we
- 15 were trying to haul a system that was archaic into the
- 16 20th century, just as everyone was leaving the 20th
- 17 century.'
- 18 LADY SMITH: It was a very powerful comment and very frank
- 19 on his part.
- 20 MR GRAY: My Lady, in my submission, however, the evidence
- 21 of both 'Robert' and Mr MacMillan demonstrates in the
- 22 clearest terms that the Kibble of today, and, indeed,
- for many years now, bears no resemblance in any respect
- in the way that it is run to the Kibble institution with
- 25 which the Inquiry has been concerned.

1 I would invite the Inquiry to accept that it 2 successfully met the significant challenges which it and many other institutions faced in 1993, when 'Robert' 3 assumed his position. My Lady, an early indication of 5 the positive influence which the changes introduced by 'Robert' had may perhaps be gleaned from the 7 overwhelmingly positive views expressed by the applicant 'Logie', when describing in evidence his placement at 8 9 Kibble between 1999 and 2001. 10 LADY SMITH: You are right, it was good to hear what he had to say and it perhaps highlights the importance, 11 Mr Gray, of ensuring that whilst good progress, good 12 practice, can be praised and reflected on as 13 14 achievement, one must never lose sight of that period 15 where, as in 'Robert's' statement it was summarised, 16 there was no training, there was poor recruitment, there were poor checks, there was poor screening, there was 17 18 insufficient probation for staff and there was nepotism. I mean, a powerful list that's as important to remember 19 20 and reflect on as achievement, isn't it? MR GRAY: Indeed, my Lady. In my submission, that was 21 22 something which came across very clearly in the evidence 23 of 'Robert', that not only from his perspective was it 24 fundamentally important to understand the deficiencies, 25 and address them, but also when making improvements at

- 1 no time to be complacent.
- 2 LADY SMITH: No, high risk if you are.
- 3 MR GRAY: My Lady, in questioning Mr MacMillan, counsel to
- 4 the Inquiry suggested that Kibble could properly be
- 5 described now as the Rolls-Royce of the education and
- 6 care sector for young persons.
- 7 In my submission, having regard to the depth and
- 8 breadth of the measures taken, as outlined in evidence
- 9 by both witnesses, coupled with the pioneering approach
- 10 which it has taken at all times to seek to ensure the
- 11 safety of all children, for example its research into
- 12 and introduction of the safe crisis management technique
- in 2003, such a description is a fair reflection of the
- 14 position which it holds.
- 15 My Lady, in my submission, as a result of its
- 16 intensive and innovative efforts over the last 30 years,
- 17 Kibble is quite properly recognised as a centre of
- 18 excellence in its field and, as the Inquiry has heard,
- 19 it has gradually expanded the scope of the expert and
- 20 specialist services which it provides to ensure that
- 21 there is a wholly integrated system of measures and
- 22 services in place to meet the diverse and frequently
- 23 complex needs of vulnerable young persons.
- 24 My Lady, against that background, it is perhaps not
- 25 surprising that the quality of the service which Kibble

provides, and the care and compassion with which that
service is provided, is something which has been
consistently recognised by the Care Inspectorate in its
various inspections in recent years.

In both 2023 and 2024, unannounced inspections of Kibble were undertaken by the Care Inspectorate. The key findings may be summarised as follows:

In relation to its unannounced inspection of the school care accommodation service in February 2024, the accommodation was assessed in relation to: how well do we support children and young people's rights and well-being, and whether children and young people are safe, feel loved and get the most out of life. Kibble was assessed as 4, being good, out of 6, being excellent. The inspection noted that there were many young people enjoying warm and caring relationships with staff and that there was very good advocacy support in place. The 'our voice' meetings enabled young people to elevate their voice and their views to be represented.

The Kibble Safe Centre was also the subject of an unannounced inspection in January 2024. Its care accommodation was assessed in relation to: how well do we support children and young people's rights and well-being and whether children and young people are safe, feel loved and get the most out of life. Kibble

was assessed as 6 out of 6, being excellent.

My Lady, the inspection noted, amongst other points, that young people consistently described highly positive relationships that were warm, respectful and fun, that there was an embedded culture of relational care which was the foundation of the stability and predictability that allowed young people to thrive. The service listened and responded to young people's views and wishes. Young people were made aware of their rights and there was a highly integrated, sector-leading and innovative approach to meeting the physical and mental health needs of young people.

It was also noted that senior managers had aspirational and forward-thinking views and worked collaboratively with a range of external organisations to champion the needs and rights of young people.

Finally, it noted that there was a continuous, robust evaluation of children and young people outcomes, experiences and their setting ensured they received the best possible care and support in high quality surroundings.

My Lady, in relation to the previous year, 2023, my Lady, I don't propose to read that section, because it does, to some extent, repeat what is set out in 2024 -- LADY SMITH: Yes.

- 1 MR GRAY: -- but I would obviously invite my Lady to have
- 2 regard to what is noted there.
- 3 LADY SMITH: Yes, and one, of course, you are reminding me
- of, because that was the two separate reports on the
- 5 school care accommodation service and the safe centre,
- and then, 2023, it was just the school care
- 7 accommodation service, is that right?
- 8 MR GRAY: Yes, it was Kibble's intensive services which were
- 9 subject to assessment in March 2023 --
- 10 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- 11 MR GRAY: -- and were assessed to be very good, 5 out of 6,
- 12 very good, 6 being excellent.
- 13 LADY SMITH: Yes, so the focus was a slightly different
- 14 aspect of their provision, although obviously not that
- dissimilar from what was looked at in 2024?
- 16 MR GRAY: Indeed, my Lady.
- 17 It is interesting to note at (iii) that the eight
- 18 points which are noted provide strong echoes of what was
- 19 found in 2024, albeit in a different part of the
- 20 organisation.
- 21 LADY SMITH: Yes, thank you.
- 22 MR GRAY: My Lady, in all the circumstances which I have
- 23 outlined, I would invite the Inquiry to conclude that,
- 24 consistent with what one would hope from an organisation
- 25 which takes its responsibilities extremely seriously,

- Kibble has taken the most comprehensive of measures in
  the last 30 years to place the safety and welfare of the
  children in its care at the heart of its activities and
  that the most recent findings of the Care Inspectorate
  provide the Inquiry with reassurance as to the success
- of the measures which have been taken.
- I would, however, my Lady, wish to conclude these
  submissions by repeating the very deepest and most
  genuine sympathies on behalf of Kibble to all those who
  suffered any form of abuse whilst in its care.
- My Lady, these are matters of the most profound
  regret and it is hoped that victims may at least draw
  some comfort from the knowledge that Kibble has taken,
  and continues to take, the most robust measures to
  ensure the welfare and safety of the children in its
  care.
- 17 LADY SMITH: Mr Gray, thank you very much.
- 18 MR GRAY: Thank you, my Lady.
- 19 LADY SMITH: That completes the business today, apart from
- 20 me to thank everybody for their contributions to this
- 21 chapter of Phase 8, for bearing with us right up to
- 22 today, which is getting very close to the festive break,
- 23 wishing you all a very good Christmas and New Year, but
- 24 welcoming back anybody who is going to be interested in,
- or engaged in, Chapter 12, which we start the evidence

- in relation to on the 6 January, I think.
- 2 MR MACAULAY: 7 January, my Lady.
- 3 LADY SMITH: 7 January, sorry, yes, we will all be back at
- 4 work by 6 January at the latest, but 7 January we will
- 5 be back here. I will be back here and ready to hear the
- 6 next section of evidence.
- 7 Perhaps just for the record, Mr MacAulay, could you
- 8 remind people which particular places?
- 9 MR MACAULAY: Rossie, Howdenhall and St Katharine's,
- 10 I think, are the establishments we look at.
- 11 LADY SMITH: Yes, I think so, and we are expecting that to
- 12 run into February?
- 13 MR MACAULAY: Yes.
- 14 LADY SMITH: Yes.
- Thank you very much, and I wish you all well.
- 16 (10.55 am)
- 17 (The Inquiry adjourned until 7 January 2025)
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25

1								
2								
3				I N	DE	X		
4								
5	Submissions	by Mr	Henry				 	1
6	Submissions	by Mr	Gray .			****	 	32
7								
8								
9								
10								
11								
12								
13								
14								
15								
16								
17								
18								
19								
20								
21								
22								
23								
24								