

1 Friday, 4 October 2019

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning. We return to further oral
4 evidence today in the case study into the provision by
5 the Marist Brothers for the care of children in
6 residential circumstances.

7 Mr MacAulay, I think we've got a witness ready, have
8 we?

9 MR MacAULAY: We do, my Lady. The next witness is an
10 applicant and I would like to call John Christopher
11 McCall.

12 JOHN CHRISTOPHER McCALL (sworn)

13 LADY SMITH: John, please sit down and make yourself
14 comfortable.

15 John, you're touching the microphone there, which
16 makes me think that you know how to use microphones. We
17 need you to speak into the microphone so that we hear
18 you through the sound system, please.

19 Unless you have any other questions at the moment,
20 I'm ready to start and I'll hand over to Mr MacAulay to
21 explain what happens next, if that's all right with you.

22 A. Okay, no problem.

23 Questions from MR MacAULAY

24 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, John.

25 A. Good morning.

1 Q. Are you John Christopher McCall?

2 A. I am.

3 Q. In the red folder you'll find the statement that you
4 provided to the inquiry. I'll provide the reference of
5 that for the transcript: WIT.001.001.1023.

6 If I could ask you, John, to turn to the final page.
7 Can you confirm that you have signed the statement?

8 A. Yes, I have.

9 Q. Do you tell us in the last paragraph:

10 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
11 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry.
12 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
13 true"?

14 A. I agree.

15 Q. Can you confirm, John, that your date of birth is
16 [REDACTED] 1950?

17 A. I can.

18 Q. And you're now 69?

19 A. 69.

20 Q. In the early part of your statement -- perhaps I should
21 just say, the statement you have in front of you in hard
22 copy, but it'll also come on the screen. Some witnesses
23 find it easier to work off the screen, it's entirely
24 a matter for you.

25 You provide us with some background in relation to

1 your family, [REDACTED], [REDACTED]

2 [REDACTED] is that correct?

3 A. Yes, that's correct.

4 Q. And you tell us that as a child you lived in Glasgow.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. But there came a point in time when the decision was
7 made that you should go to St Columba's college in
8 Largs; is that correct?

9 A. That's correct.

10 Q. After your time at St Columba's college, did you then
11 move to St Joseph's College in Dumfries?

12 A. Yes, in 1962.

13 Q. If we look at the position in relation to St Columba's
14 in Largs, I think you tell us that you were there from
15 1958 to 1962.

16 A. Yes, that's correct.

17 Q. So you'd be aged 8 when you went there?

18 A. Aged 8 when I first went there.

19 Q. And left at the age of 12?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. I think we already know, you tell us in your statement,
22 that was a boarding school and it was run by the
23 Marist Brothers.

24 A. That's correct.

25 Q. Were there any day pupils at all during your time?

1 A. Yes, there was.

2 Q. How many?

3 A. It's hard to say. I think there was probably at least
4 half a dozen.

5 Q. And just looking at the pupil population of the school,
6 how many boys do you think at a given time were there?

7 A. Residential?

8 Q. Yes.

9 A. About 36, I think. I'm not sure if the full 36 were
10 residential or whether that included the day pupils or
11 not. The school was about 36.

12 Q. I'm going to put some photographs to you. Are you happy
13 to look at a couple of photographs for me?

14 A. Sure.

15 Q. The first photograph I want to look at is at
16 CFS.001.012.0666. It'll come on the screen in front of
17 you.

18 (Pause)

19 Do you recognise the building in the photograph?

20 A. Yes, I do.

21 Q. Is that St Columba's?

22 A. That's St Columba's.

23 Q. Essentially it was a house, a large Victorian type of
24 house?

25 A. Absolutely. It's just pretty well as I see it there:

1 the conservatory was to the right-hand side, there was
2 a hut to the right of that, which is not shown on the
3 photograph, and the driveway went all the way round, so
4 it was like a circular driveway.

5 Q. There are two main storeys and an attic storey as well?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. To give us a bit of orientation, if we go in the front
8 door and we're on the lower ground floor, what would we
9 find there?

10 A. As you went in the front door, the first room to your
11 left, which would have been the left bay window there,
12 was a classroom. To the right was a classroom. Beyond
13 the first room to the left, there was another small room
14 and I think that was the headmaster's room. And then
15 the staircase would have been ahead of you, and to the
16 right of the staircase you would have went through into
17 the kitchen area at the back.

18 Q. Then if we move on to the first floor of the building,
19 what do we find there?

20 A. Again, you would have dormitories to the left and
21 dormitories to the right. So the bay window to the
22 right would be a dormitory, and the bay window to the
23 left. Equally, at the back of the left-hand window,
24 there would be another small dormitory.

25 Q. Let's take the dormitory to the right with the bay

1 window, what sort of size was that?

2 A. It probably housed something like, in rows, maybe 12 to
3 16 beds, maybe.

4 Q. What about the one to the left?

5 A. It wouldn't be as much as that, slightly smaller.

6 Q. If we move into the attic space then, what we've been
7 calling the attic space, what would we find there?

8 A. Again, I think there was probably either two or three
9 beds to the front attic and at the back attic, which was
10 the opposite from that, I think there were only two beds
11 there. That was the one I was in initially.

12 Q. I will be asking you questions about a Brother Germanus;
13 are you able to tell us where his room was during your
14 time?

15 A. Yes. I don't think it's actually shown there because it
16 was essentially like a box room. There was no windows
17 in it that I can recall.

18 Q. What level was it on?

19 A. It was almost like a mezzanine level, so it was a level
20 below where the attic was and almost a landing that was
21 perhaps at the top of the roof space there (indicating).

22 Q. So as it were, between the first floor and the attic
23 floor?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And the conservatory type of structure to the right

1 then, what was that for?

2 A. That was used for, essentially, storing your shoes and
3 your slippers.

4 Q. And the hut that you mentioned, what was that for?

5 A. The hut to the right-hand side was like an old army-type
6 hut, with I think a corrugated roof, probably about
7 maybe 10 metres long. That was used for
8 sport/recreation purposes, and subsequently belting as
9 well.

10 Q. I'll come to look at that with you.

11 If I can ask you to look at another photograph,
12 CFS.001.012.0664.

13 (Pause)

14 It's not a particularly good photograph, but let's
15 see if we can get it as big as possible. Let's talk
16 about the main building that we've just been looking at.
17 Do we see that to the right of the photograph?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Are we looking at the rear of the building?

20 A. I think so. It looks a little bit different, but it's
21 always difficult to remember exactly how it looked at
22 the back, but I think that's pretty well how it was.
23 The kitchen area was what you see there at the rear.
24 That's where the kitchen was. So you can see the
25 dormitory -- you can see the top attic, and then you can

1 see another room below that, which I'm not sure what
2 that was, to be honest. The one to the right of that is
3 another weer dormitory.

4 Q. And while we have the photograph here, if we look to the
5 left, we see part of another building. Was there
6 another building associated with the college when you
7 were there?

8 A. There was buildings on either side. Whether they were
9 utilised by the college or not, I can't recall, and we
10 never accessed them.

11 Q. Were you aware of other brothers being there who might
12 have been housed in one of these other buildings?

13 A. It's possible, but I've got no recollection of movement
14 between the two buildings, for example.

15 Q. Do you have any recollection as to whether or not the
16 building that housed the college that you went to had
17 a name?

18 A. I think it did, but I can't remember the name.

19 Q. The names that we come across in some of the evidence,
20 there's the name Northfield and there's also the name
21 Landour. Do these names mean anything to you?

22 A. Not really.

23 Q. Can I then just look at the set-up in relation to the
24 brothers. When you went there, John, who was the

25 SNR ?

1 A. Brother MJD .

2 Q. Did he remain SNR during your time or did that
3 change?

4 A. No, no, he was pretty well there all the time.

5 Q. I have already mentioned Brother Germanus; what was his
6 tole during your time?

7 A. I think in my statement I refer to him as like the
8 sergeant major, and in a way that's what he was like.
9 He was the sort of one that organised everything,
10 essentially, from when you would go to play, what you
11 would play at. He would lead you, if you like, into the
12 town. So he did all that sort of stuff. He also
13 taught -- I can't remember exactly what he taught, but
14 I know he taught at times too.

15 Q. I think you've told us that he had a room in the
16 building in the main building.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. What about Brother MJD do you know where --

19 A. I have no idea. From these questions, I've no idea
20 where he stayed, to be frank. I have actually no idea
21 where any of the other brothers' rooms were.

22 Q. And it may be that they were in another building apart?

23 A. Possibly.

24 Q. Leaving that aside, what other brothers' names do you
25 remember from your time?

1 A. There was a Brother CIPHER WITHDRAW. There was another
2 brother, but I can't remember his name. It keeps coming
3 in and out. I had a friend who remembered it, but
4 I can't remember it again. I know he was very, very
5 good at drawing, for example. He was a good footballer;
6 he used to hide the ball under his cassock. I can
7 remember him vividly he was a nice guy, he was a good
8 teacher.

9 Q. You've mentioned perhaps three or four brothers --

10 A. I can remember three specifically. I can remember the
11 SNR CIPHER WITHDRAW Germanus and one another.

12 Q. So far as then contact with the boys would be concerned,
13 are you really looking at perhaps about four brothers?

14 A. Four brothers.

15 Q. In your statement, John, from paragraphs 15 through to
16 34, you talk about the routine at St Joseph's. Can
17 I can back to the sleeping arrangements that you talk
18 about. I think you indicated before that when you went
19 there, you were in the top, the attic area, and that you
20 had a room there; is that right?

21 A. Yes, that's correct.

22 Q. Did that change during your time at the school?

23 A. Yes. I think that was probably for the younger boys.
24 I can only presume that because obviously I was 8 when
25 I was there and I was in that one room. I can't

1 remember but there was either one or two beds in it.

2 That would be in that attic room and I was probably

3 there for a year, two years maybe.

4 Q. Where did you move to after that?

5 A. You moved down, and because you were that bit older,

6 you'd move into one of the other dormitories, either the

7 dormitory to the right, as you saw in the front, or the

8 left, or even the rear one. In fact, I was in the rear

9 one for a period of time.

10 Q. Looking at washing facilities, were there showers

11 available?

12 A. Not initially. There was metal wash-hand basins when

13 I first arrived there, the old type where you had the

14 jug at the side and you'd pour it in. That changed

15 probably after a year or so that I was there and there

16 was a shower facility put in, which I think, if

17 I remember, had either three or four showers in a line,

18 with no partition between any of them.

19 Q. So it was a communal shower?

20 A. It was a communal type shower.

21 Q. I'll come back and look at some of that in a moment.

22 Did you have visits from your parents during the

23 school term?

24 A. Occasionally. I would say maybe my parents particularly

25 would come maybe once every two or three weeks.

1 Q. And I take it you went home for the normal school
2 holidays?

3 A. For the actual holidays, you would, yes, go home.
4 I think the school pretty well closed down for that
5 period of time.

6 Q. Do you remember if anyone came to inspect the premises
7 in any way?

8 A. I can't recall anybody or any person or anybody, if you
9 like, coming to do an inspection at all. I was young,
10 so ...

11 Q. Yes. Can I just touch upon the matter of discipline.
12 How was discipline managed during your time?

13 A. Kind of severely in a way, you know. The belt was the
14 main form of discipline. You would normally get the
15 belt in fours, and unusually, sevens. And you would get
16 it for the weirdest and oddest things, from licking your
17 knife to leaving your slippers out.

18 I said once it was for sweating, it was probably for
19 running about when I wasn't supposed to be running
20 about, but I took it as because I was sweating.

21 But more than often I would get seven of the belt
22 rather than four.

23 Q. When you talk about fours and sevens that is the
24 strokes --

25 A. Two on each hand would be the fours and the sevens would

1 be two on each hand and three on the bare backside.

2 Q. Was there a particular monk who was doing the belting?

3 A. Yes, Brother Germanus was the main man. I can't recall
4 anyone else belting me other than him.

5 Q. So if you look at what you call the seven strokes then,
6 you've got two on each hand and then you say three on
7 the bare bottom?

8 A. I always got the belt, anyway, in the hut, so you'd be
9 taken over to the hut, just you and Brother Germanus.
10 You would go in the hut -- I can recall it vividly. He
11 would take you -- halfway down the hut there would be
12 a chair and it would be hands out on that side, that
13 side, trousers down, bend over the chair, and you'd get
14 another three on the backside.

15 When you left, it was always difficult -- I always
16 remember it was always difficult opening the door
17 because it was a steel knob handle, which was obviously
18 cold on your stingy hands. So, yeah, that's where it
19 always took place.

20 More than often, I would have seven rather than
21 four.

22 Q. And you've indicated some of the misdemeanours that
23 might cause that to happen.

24 A. Yes. It could have been anything, to be honest.
25 I think it depended on the mood he was in at the

1 particular time. There's no rationale behind whether
2 you got four or whether you got seven.

3 Q. You talked about his mood. Are you able to describe the
4 man?

5 A. I found him a very -- I think he was a very serious man.
6 Very rarely can I recall him ever laughing or joking
7 with you or any of that. Maybe he did, maybe he didn't.
8 He was probably in our company most of the time, doing
9 something, whether it be going into Largs itself, it
10 could be roller skating, it could be walking, whatever.

11 If we were on the beach, we used to have to pick
12 pebbles up off the beach every morning in order to clear
13 the area for bearing(?). Then you'd walk along the
14 beach and more than often it was him that would lead the
15 group. Sometimes it was another brother that would lead
16 the group, but more than often it would be him.

17 Q. What impression do you have looking back at least as to
18 what age he might have been at the time when you were
19 there?

20 A. It's hard to say. When you're that sort of age and you
21 look at somebody that's obviously in authority and
22 whatever, it could have been any age from 40 onwards,
23 I would have thought.

24 Q. Just looking at the way these brothers dressed, can you
25 describe the outfits for me?

1 A. Yes, they wore a black cassock, normally with shoes
2 underneath the cassock, and it had a white bib and
3 a crucifix.

4 Q. You've talked about your own experience of being belted.
5 What about other boys? Do you know to what extent other
6 boys were belted?

7 A. I know they did. Whether they got sevens or not,
8 I can't recall. I certainly know they got belted, so
9 they definitely had four of the belt. There was one
10 particular boy who I think we all sort of felt sorry
11 for, but he was ridiculed, really, because he just
12 detested the belt, fearful of it. And he was a big boy,
13 you know, so he would be pulled out. Funnily enough,
14 he was the only one I can remember actually being belted
15 in class and he'd be pulled out in front of everyone.
16 Because he detested it so much, he would always pull his
17 hands away, and of course Brother Germanus would get
18 more annoyed than that than anything else, and of course
19 the class then found that funny.

20 So the poor boy got even more ridiculed, the fact
21 that we were all laughing, I suppose, and the brother
22 getting madder and madder, and would whack him across
23 the legs or wherever in order to get him to put his
24 hands out.

25 Q. Do I take it from what you've said, John, that you then

1 always got the belt in the hut?

2 A. Yes. As far as I can recall. I can never remember
3 getting the belt in the classroom.

4 Q. How regularly do you think you'd be belted?

5 A. Quite a lot. Whether I was a rogue, a rascal or
6 whatever, I don't know, but I think I got belted quite
7 a lot. And I used to -- in fact, he made a point of it
8 one time, of addressing the class to say that there was
9 one boy who, after the belt, always said sorry. And
10 that was me, I always did. After I actually had the
11 belt, I apologised for whatever it was I'd done.
12 Obviously nobody else seemed to do that, but he seemed
13 to, I don't know, like the fact that I actually did
14 that. It didn't stop him giving me the belt, but
15 nevertheless it was an issue that he had raised in front
16 of the class, probably in his last year or second-last
17 year.

18 Q. Did the belt leave marks?

19 A. Oh yes. Yes. It stung your hands so much. We had
20 a ritual -- that's why I know the other boys obviously
21 got the belt and probably got it in the hut as well.
22 The toilet block was across from where the hut was and
23 it was our theory that if you urinated on your hands,
24 it would take the sting out. So normally, your first
25 port of call after having left the hut was to go to the

1 toilet.

2 Q. I just want to develop a mental image of this. Would
3 Brother Germanus go somewhere to get you and then take
4 you to the hut? How did it happen?

5 A. He would come and get you. Whatever it was or whatever
6 you had done, he would either say, "Meet me at the door
7 of the hut and wait there until I come across", or,
8 "Come with me to the hut".

9 Q. And if you went to wait, could you wait for a little
10 while then?

11 A. Sometimes, yes. You could be just standing waiting.

12 Q. And how did you feel about this whole arrangement?

13 A. Well, you knew that pain was about to come, and there
14 was nothing you could really do about it, so I wouldn't
15 say you became hardened to it, but you -- in those days,
16 because you got the belt regularly, you knew what you
17 were in for and it was just a matter of almost grinning
18 and bearing it as best you could.

19 Q. What were your feelings at the time? Can you remember?

20 A. There were feelings of fear, fear and trepidation,
21 knowing what was about to happen. It was even worse
22 with the sevens, you know, because the worst bit was
23 over the behind, really.

24 Q. You've told us you were there from the age of 8.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Did this process of belting in that way happen even then
2 at the age of 8?

3 A. Yes, the first belt I had, I think I wasn't long there,
4 and I'd licked my knife, not knowing that it was an
5 offence, essentially, to lick your knife, and I was
6 taken in there and I was given seven at that time.

7 Q. Was that by Germanus?

8 A. By Germanus.

9 Q. The other teachers that you might have been involved
10 with, I think you've indicated already, they did not
11 belt as far as you remember?

12 A. I can't recall them belting. I can't recall them
13 belting me.

14 Q. What sort of punishments did they give out?

15 A. It's an interpretation, because I've got nothing firm to
16 base it on, but my interpretation was that if you fell
17 out of line in any way, shape or form and the brother
18 himself hadn't dealt with it in his way, then you would
19 be referred to Germanus.

20 Q. Can I then look at another aspect of your time at
21 St Columba's, and that's other forms of abuse. You tell
22 us about this in your statement and in particular your
23 involvement with Germanus. Can you tell us when that
24 sort of thing started to happen?

25 A. Yes. Almost immediately. I remember being in the top

1 dormitory and in the top dormitory -- I was obviously
2 only 8 years old or 9 years old -- and I do recall
3 Brother Germanus, he used to come round -- I'll expand
4 on that a little bit later. He would shine a torch to
5 see if you were sleeping or if you weren't, and if you
6 weren't sleeping he would normally ask you, "Can you not
7 sleep?" and at that stage you would say, "I'm not
8 tired", or, "I haven't been tired, I can't sleep", or
9 whatever. Then he would take you to his room. His idea
10 then was to tickle you in order to get you to the point
11 you're tired and therefore you'd go back to bed and
12 sleep.

13 Q. Let's just look at the first time that happened to you.
14 You're not asleep and you're taken to his room, which
15 I think you have told us is on this mezzanine level.

16 A. Yes. I think the first time that that actually
17 happened, it was a tickling session.

18 Q. Can you just describe the tickling session for me? What
19 would he do?

20 A. You'd lie on his bed -- I can still remember the smell
21 of the room because in those days they smoked in the
22 rooms and so on. I can remember the tobacco-type
23 smell -- and I don't think the room had any windows, so
24 it was a wee, dark, dingy sort of place.

25 You would lie on his bed and he would kneel over you

1 and he would tickle you.

2 Q. Would you be on the bed as well?

3 A. Yes, you'd be on the bed.

4 Q. And tickling generally on your upper body?

5 A. On your upper body particularly. That's what I remember
6 the first time.

7 Q. And then the next time that that happened --

8 A. It happened during the course of the time that I was
9 there and generally what would happen is that -- and it
10 was almost as -- worse than the abuse itself, I suppose,
11 that ultimately took place was the apprehension of
12 trying to get to sleep, knowing that he was coming round
13 with a torch, and if he shone the torch and you blinked
14 or gave any indication whatsoever that you were awake,
15 he would take you out of your bed and take you up the
16 stairs to his room to either tickle you or whatever.

17 On a number of occasions, I can't recall how many or
18 whatever, but that's when it went even further, where
19 you would lie on the bed, naked, pretty well -- as far
20 as I remember I was naked, and I remember -- and I must
21 have been -- I think I must have been face down at the
22 time, but I can remember him asking me to open my legs
23 and he would put his penis between my legs, up near my
24 behind, get me to close my legs, and then he would start
25 tickling in order to get movement going and so on.

1 So that would happen, and then you would go back to
2 bed until the next event happened, and it came a point
3 where I became quite good at, if I wasn't sleeping, of
4 really pretending I was asleep and trying not to give
5 any indication at all.

6 Q. And on these occasions, if you were successful in that,
7 did he leave you alone?

8 A. Yes, he tended to. He would hang about for a bit and
9 maybe even go away and come back again. I got into
10 a few -- if you stayed still enough -- what he wouldn't
11 do is waken you up. I can't recall him touching you to
12 wake you up or whatever.

13 Q. So this business then of you lying naked on the bed and
14 him doing the abuse that you've described, what about
15 his state of dress? Did you ever see what that was?

16 A. Normally, at night, he wouldn't be wearing a cassock, so
17 he would have a T-shirt or something on.

18 Q. What about the bottom part of his body?

19 A. The bottom part, certainly at the time -- I know that
20 he had pyjamas, I saw him in his pyjamas, but I'm sure
21 at the time in the room that he didn't have his -- he
22 would take his pyjamas off when he put his penis between
23 my legs.

24 Q. Was that normally what happened, this business of you
25 being on the bed naked and him doing what you've just

1 described?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. How often did that happen?

4 A. It's hard to say. I don't know whether I blocked a lot
5 of it out or not, but I can recall at least two, three,
6 four times, perhaps.

7 Q. Is that over your whole period?

8 A. Over the whole period, yes.

9 Q. You have told us that it happened early on when you were
10 about 8.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did it continue when you were a bit older?

13 A. Well, what happened was that it stopped -- it pretty
14 well stopped after the last year, as I was older, so I'd
15 be about, what, 11, coming on 12. I think a lot of that
16 stopped because I had -- my father had got to know about
17 the other brother.

18 Q. I'll come to him in a moment.

19 A. So I think maybe Germanus, having known that at that
20 time, was a lot more wary, perhaps.

21 Q. So the sexual abuse that you've just described about him
22 putting his penis between your legs, you thought maybe
23 three or four times before it stopped?

24 A. Yes, and that would be anywhere between 8-year-old and
25 11-year-old, I would have thought.

1 Q. Are you saying then there were occasions when he came to
2 your bed, but you were able to pretend sufficiently well
3 that you were asleep and he would go away?

4 A. Yes, he would go away, yes. And there were other
5 times -- it wouldn't be that every time he took you up
6 to his room to tickle you that he would lie on top of
7 you with his penis; there were times that he would
8 solely tickle you.

9 Q. So far as those times were concerned, how many times do
10 you think that happened over the period?

11 A. Quite a lot, but I can't put a number of it, really.

12 Q. Would your pyjama top be off for that or not?

13 A. Yes, in order to tickle you.

14 Q. And your bottoms?

15 A. Probably, but I can't specifically recall.

16 Q. Did he ever ask you to make any other contact with his
17 private parts?

18 A. No.

19 Q. Did he make any contact with your private parts?

20 A. No.

21 Q. When this started, John, the dormitory you were in
22 at the time, were there other boys in that dormitory?

23 A. Yes. The top dormitory is a bit vague. I think there
24 were probably two beds there, so there might have been
25 another boy in that one. More often, as I moved down

1 dormitories, there were a lot more boys if you like.

2 Q. When you moved down and were a bit older, did this still
3 happen on occasions?

4 A. It happened early on. I would have moved down probably
5 at the age of maybe 9, 10, I'd be down into a bigger
6 dormitory.

7 Q. Did you ever see him approach any other boy?

8 A. No, strangely enough. But a lot of the time, you've got
9 to bear in mind I was probably so traumatised by him
10 coming round, I didn't want to look anywhere or give any
11 indication that I was awake at all.

12 Q. I was going to ask you about what your reaction was to
13 all of this. Can you help me with that?

14 A. That was probably the biggest trauma, I think, out of
15 the whole thing, was actually knowing the fact that
16 he was going to come round the dormitory and he was
17 going to see whether you were asleep or whether you
18 weren't, and you knew the consequences if you weren't
19 asleep. So you really tried -- eventually you really
20 tried hard to ensure that he thought you were sleeping
21 if you weren't sleeping.

22 Q. When the particularly sexual part of it happened, did he
23 say anything to you or did you say anything to him?

24 A. No, I think he would ... If I recall his whole
25 rationale to you, you know, was the fact that this will

1 help you get to sleep. So that would be the focus of
2 the thing. It wouldn't be, "You must come up to my
3 room"; it would be, "Come up to my room and I'll help
4 you get to sleep", and so on.

5 Q. And when it was happening, what was your own response?
6 Can you remember?

7 A. Probably none in that you followed the orders,
8 essentially.

9 Q. And then when you did go back to bed, did you sleep?

10 A. Well, you must have eventually, but it was more relief
11 that it was all over, and that was you -- at least for
12 another little while perhaps.

13 Q. One thing you do tell us in your statement is that
14 Germanus befriended your parents. Can you tell me about
15 that?

16 A. Yes, that was bizarre. I don't know how it all came
17 about, but he decided to befriend my parents and he had
18 a brother that lived in Ireland; I think I mentioned his
19 name there.

20 Q. I think you called him Dennis.

21 A. Brother Dennis, that was it. And whether it was on the
22 basis that his brother was coming to Glasgow, could you
23 put us up, I have no idea how it came about but, yes, he
24 would come to Glasgow and stay in my room. If I recall
25 at that particular time, it's a bit of a blur whether

1 I slept on the floor in that room and the two
2 brothers -- there were two single beds and whether they
3 used each of the beds or not, I can't fully recall. But
4 I remember the fear of knowing that he was in the house
5 and knowing I couldn't say anything because my parents
6 didn't know about him at all at any time. Nobody else
7 did.

8 Q. Would this be during holiday periods?

9 A. During holiday periods, yes.

10 Q. How often did this happen?

11 A. Probably in the course of the time I was there, maybe
12 three or four times.

13 Q. Do I take it from what you said nothing happened in
14 fact, although he was there?

15 A. No. It was almost like -- I suppose when I look back on
16 it now, and I shouldn't really because at the time it
17 was what it was. When I look back at it now, it was
18 probably always a thing in his eye looking at me to say,
19 "I'm here as well as there", so it gave you a lot of
20 fear.

21 Q. You mentioned the showers earlier in your evidence,
22 John, and I think at some point in time showers were
23 introduced.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Can you remember how long you'd been there before that

1 happened?

2 A. I think it was about a year, maybe a year and a half,
3 two years, when the showers were actually put in. They
4 were a big novelty, obviously, for us all.

5 Q. Would boys shower in a communal sense, by that I mean
6 would a number of boys be there together?

7 A. Yes, maybe three -- I can't remember whether there were
8 three showers or four but, yes, you'd probably all
9 shower at the same time.

10 Q. Was that supervised?

11 A. It was supervised by predominantly Brother Germanus,
12 although I think Brother CIPHER was there occasionally.

13 Yeah, you'd shower there and then when you were
14 finished showering, you had to clean the showers. So
15 you'd be on your hands and knees, trying to clean the
16 water away and so on and so forth.

17 Q. Would that be supervised?

18 A. Yes, that would be watched.

19 Q. Who would watch you doing that?

20 A. Brother Germanus and I think Brother CIPHER probably at
21 times.

22 Q. Together or separately?

23 A. I think there was one occasion they were together but
24 I can't be specific about it.

25 Q. Perhaps just to confirm, when you left the school,

1 Brother Germanus was still there; is that correct?

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. You've mentioned another brother and that's

4 Brother CIPHER.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And I think you say that he was a brother who arrived
7 after you had been at the school.

8 A. Yes, he must have arrived probably after I'd been there
9 maybe a couple of years, I think, so he'd be there when
10 I would be maybe 10, 11, something like that.

11 Q. So maybe 1960, 1961, you think?

12 A. Yes, roughly about then.

13 Q. You say his name was CIPHER WITHDRAW, is that right?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You describe him as being a strange character; what do
16 you mean by that?

17 A. He was just one of those ... I would put it down to,
18 looking back on it now, as almost an untrustworthy type
19 character. It's hard to describe that, but you know,
20 there was something shaky about him. I couldn't put
21 a finger on it.

22 Q. What was his role at the school?

23 A. His role -- and I found out later that he was probably
24 a young Marist Brother at the time when he was there,
25 probably not long having been through the seminary in

1 order to come out as a Marist Brother.

2 Q. So early twenties?

3 A. Must have been, yeah, and his role was predominantly,
4 supposedly, [REDACTED] teaching, [REDACTED] lessons. I can't
5 remember his other role that he actually had. He must
6 have had another role, but I just can't remember what it
7 was.

8 Q. Again, did he sleep somewhere but not within the main
9 building?

10 A. Yes. I have no idea where he slept.

11 Q. You tell us about an incident when you were in the
12 sickbay and Brother CIPHER came into the sickbay. Was the
13 sickbay in the main building?

14 A. No, it was ... If you look to that building that you
15 saw before, it was at the rear of that building and to
16 the far right is where I was in at that particular time.
17 Whether that was classified as a sickbay, in other words
18 everybody went there when they were sick, or whether it
19 was part of a dormitory, I can't fully recall.

20 Q. Was it separate from the main building then?

21 A. Oh, no, it was part of the main building, but it was on
22 the first floor at the rear.

23 Q. What happened on this occasion?

24 A. I would be -- I can't remember why I was sick or
25 whatever. But I was in the sickbay and he would come up

1 with a view, I think, initially to see how I was, but
2 very quickly he would either sit on the bed and he would
3 take your hand initially and put it in his cassock, and
4 his erect penis would be there, so you'd have to play
5 with that. He would do that either sitting in the bed
6 or standing up with a smile on his face. I always
7 remember the smile that he had on his face.

8 Q. How often did this happen at this time?

9 A. When I was in the sickbay, that happened maybe two or
10 three times during the period that I was actually sick.
11 But thereafter, it was on a weekly basis, certainly if
12 not more than that in his [REDACTED] room.

13 Q. Can I come to that then? You've mentioned that may have
14 been his reason for being there. Where was the [REDACTED]
15 room?

16 A. That was on the ground floor, behind essentially like
17 a cupboard-type place, behind the front bay window that
18 was to the right-hand side, so it'd be right into the
19 back, before the kitchens.

20 Q. What was the arrangement about getting a [REDACTED] lesson?

21 A. I can't recall ever getting a [REDACTED] lesson.

22 Q. I mean, in principle, what was the arrangement?

23 A. The principle was coming down and you would wait
24 outside, so there would be a group of boys. What was
25 strange was none of us ever spoke about it or even

1 suggested anything. But you would wait outside and when
2 it was your turn, you would go in supposedly for your
3 [REDACTED] lesson, but it would be the same ritual.

4 Q. What would happen when you went in?

5 A. The same thing: you put your hand in his cassock pocket.

6 Q. Where would this happen, would you be on a chair?

7 A. Yes, there would be a [REDACTED] -- there was a [REDACTED] there
8 (indicating), and if I recall, you sat down and he might
9 stand up beside you and he would take your hand and put
10 it in his cassock and you'd have to play with his penis,
11 essentially.

12 Q. Do you know if he ejaculated?

13 A. I can't recall that at all.

14 Q. How long would this sort of behaviour last?

15 A. It could be anywhere from maybe 5 minutes to 10 minutes.

16 Q. After that would you leave the room?

17 A. You'd leave the room and it'd be, "Next!"

18 Q. Would another boy come in?

19 A. Another boy would come in. Whether the other boy got
20 [REDACTED] lessons or not, I've no idea.

21 Q. Before you went in, let's say, on the occasions you did,
22 had other boys been in before you?

23 A. They could have been. They could have been. I can't
24 recall [REDACTED], but it's possible that there
25 was.

1 Q. You have mentioned there would be a group of boys
2 waiting to go into the [REDACTED] room; would that be obvious
3 to anyone passing by?

4 A. Yeah, it might have been. It might have been the class
5 at the time, they were on [REDACTED] lessons, and you might
6 have had to come out of your class to stand and wait for
7 your turn to go in. So when I say a group of boys, it
8 could have been one other boy, it could have been two
9 other boys or whatever. It wouldn't be half a dozen
10 boys.

11 Q. How often did this happen to you in the [REDACTED] room?

12 A. Reasonably regularly, I would say, over a period of
13 a year and a half, two years.

14 Q. And what ages would that cover?

15 A. I would be anywhere from 10, 11. 10 and 11.

16 Q. I think there came a point when you went to your aunt's
17 for the summer holidays and you spoke to somebody about
18 this; is that right?

19 A. Yes, my aunt lived in Aberdeen and my father was
20 a travelling salesman. So during the summer holidays
21 I would go with him, if you like, in terms of what
22 he was doing. And he would stay at his sister's, my
23 aunt's, in Aberdeen.

24 She had a lodger. I never really got to the bottom
25 of what the lodger was about, he was maybe 15, 16, 17,

1 and I would be 10, 11. But nevertheless, he would take
2 you out to play football or whatever, out the back or on
3 the street and so on.

4 I can't recall the specifics of it, but obviously
5 I had told him about this incident.

6 Q. Which incident in particular?

7 A. The [REDACTED] room type incidents. I told him about that
8 and I think he had obviously quizzed me a bit more, and
9 I thought no more of it.

10 Q. When you say you told him, did you tell him about what
11 Brother CIPHER had been doing to you?

12 A. Yes, so he was aware and he was obviously old enough to
13 be aware of the significance of that. And gratefully,
14 you know, he obviously had the courage and the where for
15 all to tell my aunt, who then obviously spoke to my
16 father.

17 I remember the day vividly when, if you like, my
18 father confronted myself with it, which was again in
19 Aberdeen outside my aunt's shop. She had a shop up in
20 [REDACTED] and I was in the car, sitting in the
21 passenger side. So we were going to the shop or we
22 would have been at the shop, and he said, "I need to ask
23 you something", of which he then asked me if what I had
24 said to this other boy was true and I confirmed the
25 truth of that. I said no more, but I just confirmed

1 that that was the case.

2 I can't remember him going into any detail
3 in relation to it, but he must have gone into some
4 detail, maybe the same detail the boy went into, so he
5 would have known what had happened.

6 I can't recall what happened after that, I don't
7 think there was any discussion after that, he didn't
8 even -- I can't recall him saying, "Just leave it to
9 me", or whatever.

10 I think what probably got me in later life was that
11 if that had been me, would I have sent my son back to
12 school or not? But that's another matter. So a little
13 bit of resentment in relation to that, but I did go back
14 to school. So after that term I was back at school and
15 lo and behold Brother CIPHER wasn't there.

16 Q. Do you know whether or not your father or your mother
17 made contact with the school?

18 A. I can only presume. Knowing my father, he would have
19 made contact.

20 Q. So the position is that if that's the case then,
21 Brother CIPHER was no longer at the school when you went
22 back off the summer holidays?

23 A. That's correct. I think they probably moved him
24 elsewhere.

25 Q. You have also told us, of course, of the abuse you

1 suffered at the hands of Brother Germanus. Do I take it
2 you didn't mention Brother Germanus to this lodger that
3 you --

4 A. No. Nobody else knew about Germanus.

5 Q. Thinking back, any reason why you didn't mention him?

6 A. Probably just fear in case he found out. The
7 consequences of him finding out, to me as a child, were
8 probably more of the same and more of the belt and more
9 of everything else that would have come with it. So it
10 was probably just a step too far to mention him.

11 Q. Just going back to the abuse you suffered at the hands
12 of Brother Germanus, you've told us about what he did
13 with his penis. Was his penis erect so far as you can
14 remember?

15 A. So far as I can remember. I can still feel it to this
16 day, strangely enough.

17 Q. Then there came a point in time, John, when you left the
18 college and you moved, eventually, to St Joseph's in
19 Dumfries; is that right?

20 A. That's correct, yes.

21 Q. And that, I think you said, was in 1962?

22 A. 1962, yes.

23 Q. So after the summer holidays, you went straight into the
24 first academic year at St Joseph's?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And you were there, I think you tell us, until 1968?

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. From 12 to 18?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. So far as St Joseph's was concerned, can I just ask you,
6 when you went there, did you go into a particular group
7 of boys?

8 A. Yes, you would go into -- there was ... what did they
9 call them now? They had four groups, essentially.
10 You'd go into a year to start with, so you'd be first
11 years, second year. And so it'd be first year you would
12 go into.

13 Q. So you're into secondary school straightaway?

14 A. You're into secondary school straightaway, and you'd be
15 allocated your different teachers, if you like, for your
16 different subjects.

17 Q. But when you went there were you aware of there being
18 a junior grouping, like a primary type set-up?

19 A. No. Not at St Joseph's. The primary essentially --
20 I always thought that the primary for St Joseph's was
21 St Columba's.

22 Q. So far as St Joseph's was concerned, what was your
23 experience of St Joseph's?

24 A. I had no adverse experience in St Joseph's, really.
25 I mean, you still got punished, but never to the same

1 degree as you did in St Columba's, but nevertheless, you
2 would get the belt. That was normally in twos and
3 occasionally maybe in fours. But that was the norm for
4 the time.

5 Q. You didn't get the belt on your bare bottom as you had
6 at St Columba's?

7 A. No.

8 Q. Can you remember who the SNR [REDACTED] or SNR [REDACTED] were
9 during your time?

10 A. I can remember some of the brothers: a Brother MYZ?,
11 brother MNV [REDACTED], Brother MJD [REDACTED] -- no, Brother Wilfred,
12 Brother MMK [REDACTED]. And SNR [REDACTED] -- was that
13 Brother MNV [REDACTED]?

14 Q. Do you remember if there was a Brother CIPHER WITH [REDACTED] when you
15 were there?

16 A. Yes, I can remember that, but I can't remember what he
17 liked like, actually. I remember the name.

18 Q. Do you remember a Brother MLS [REDACTED]?

19 A. Yes, Brother MLS [REDACTED] as well.

20 Q. Did you have anything to do with these particular
21 brothers?

22 A. No, not particularly.

23 Q. I think you do tell us about an incident when you may
24 have suffered a groin strain.

25 A. Yes. It was almost like -- I was very sporty, so I was

1 in the rugby team. One of the brothers then, I think it
2 was brother -- what was his name? I can't remember his
3 name. He was looking after the rugby team and I had
4 sustained a groin injury. In order to help the recovery
5 of that, he suggested a hot lamp, of which he invited me
6 to his room, of which I lay on his bed with a hot lamp
7 on my groin. My initial thought was, here we go again,
8 so to speak, but I have to say I think it was all
9 sincere and honest and it was to assist me in improving
10 the groin strain.

11 Q. I think at about the time you came to leave St Joseph's,
12 your father died; is that right?

13 A. He died whilst I was there.

14 Q. And after you left St Joseph's, I think you spent some
15 time in Canada; is that correct?

16 A. Yes. I had come back from St Joseph's, gone to the
17 funeral -- I was very good at sport and probably would
18 have been school champion and so on. In fairness to
19 them, they had encouraged me to come back after the
20 funeral and do nothing else but practice and get fit for
21 the sports and take part in the sports. But [REDACTED]
22 from Canada had come over to the funeral and I think
23 that she had probably brought me up from about 0 to 5.
24 There seemed to be a bond there between the two of us
25 and she encouraged me to emigrate.

1 So having left the school -- my father died on
2 ██████████ 1968, so thereafter I left in the August, I think
3 it was, of 1968, and I emigrated to Canada.

4 Q. But you did come back to Scotland and one of the things
5 you did when you came back to Scotland was to go to
6 St Columba's?

7 A. Yes. I was out and I think I'd got married by that time
8 and we were living in Port Glasgow when we got married
9 and we were taking a trip to Largs, and I think I'd said
10 to my wife then, "Come on, I'll show you the school
11 I was in". I remember driving in and, lo and behold,
12 there was Germanus on the top part of that circle that
13 goes round, and I got out of the car.

14 And it's interesting, I think my wife had said to
15 me, "Did you not want to hit him?" and honestly, I just
16 said no. I just looked at him. I remember looking at
17 him and saying, "Do you remember me?" and the only thing
18 he remembered was when we used to do the walks along the
19 beaches, there was one day there, there was a flare --
20 I didn't know it was a flare, nobody knew it was
21 a flare, but there was a flare on the beach, which I had
22 picked up, and I remember him saying, "No", but it was
23 too late, I'd pulled the trigger and it just skimmed his
24 ear.

25 Q. Right.

1 A. It could have probably killed him, but that was the only
2 thing he remembered at that particular time about me,
3 and it was the only conversation we had, and he said,
4 "I must go", and we shot off.

5 Q. And you didn't confront him in any way?

6 A. No.

7 Q. What year was it, do you think, you had this visit?

8 A. That'd be probably the 1970s.

9 Q. So the school was still in operation, I think?

10 A. Yes, I think so.

11 Q. And clearly he was still at the school?

12 A. He was still there.

13 Q. I think you also carried out some investigations with
14 the assistance of Mark Daly into both Germanus and also
15 Brother **CIPHER**.

16 A. Yes. What had happened was that Mark Daly was doing
17 a television programme at the time on Fort Augustus, and
18 following the path, I think, of the Jesuit priest that
19 was there who'd gone to Australia and so on. I'd been
20 watching the programme and almost sort of said to
21 myself, "I can't just let this go, it's not one school".
22 So I tried to contact Mark Daly, of which eventually
23 I sent an email, and I think he responded at that time
24 and asked me to send him some further details, of which
25 I did.

1 Then it was about 3 or 6 months later before he go
2 back to me and he then he spoke to me on the phone, of
3 which I then gave him the account, if you like, of
4 St Columba's. He did a little bit of investigating. He
5 found it difficult, he said, in terms of finding any
6 documentation or records or whatever in relation to the
7 school, who was there and so on. But he did know that
8 the brother that I was talking about, CIPHER WITHDRAW -- he
9 found out that Germanus had died and that CIPHER WITHDRAW
10 at that time was still alive and working in Glasgow.

11 Q. Can I ask you a little bit now, John, about what impact
12 you consider your experience, in particular at
13 St Columba's, has had on you and your life?

14 A. Yes, it's interesting. I think it's worth saying at the
15 outset I'm still receiving counselling. I've been
16 receiving counselling for the last 10 years on and off.
17 But recently, I've been receiving weekly counselling for
18 almost a year now.

19 The reason I mention that first is that in the early
20 part of my life, after school, I had adopted almost a
21 "blank it out" attitude, whereby if somebody had asked
22 me about being abused at school, I'd have said, "Yeah,
23 but it really doesn't matter, life moves on, it has no
24 issue or relevance to me".

25 The truth of the matter is, whether it's the abuse

1 or whether it would have happened anyway or whatever,
2 who knows, and there's a number of other things that
3 happen in your life -- like I've had a bad trip with
4 LSD, which was a stupid thing that I did at the time,
5 and whether that had an effect on anxiety and depression
6 and whatever I had ...

7 But the main issue that affects me now is
8 relationships. I have a massive problem in terms of
9 what I would call an emotional detachment during
10 a relationship. So much so that, without going into too
11 much detail, I see sex as a separate entity to
12 a relationship as a whole, and that has had a major
13 effect on any relationship that I'm trying to have.

14 Q. You give us quite a bit of detail about that in your
15 statement, John, and we can read that for ourselves and
16 I don't want to press you on it.

17 One positive thing you do say is you have two
18 children with whom you have a good relationship.

19 A. Yes. They're well aware. One's probably closer to me
20 than the other in that he's more empathetic; that's the
21 younger one. So I can talk to him pretty well about
22 everything and anything, I think. He knows, for
23 example, coming here, he's the one that phoned me the
24 night before and said, "Are you all right with it, dad?"
25 and so on and so forth.

1 Q. And then if we look at some of your final thoughts, and
2 we're looking now at paragraphs 92 onwards, you make the
3 point at paragraph 93 that:

4 "Children have to be protected. I think something
5 has to be put in place to protect children."

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And I think one of the things you also say is:

8 "It's important for children to have people that
9 they can trust and speak to."

10 A. Yes, I think that's absolutely correct. My own view
11 is that those people should be parents initially.
12 I suppose going back in my day, it was probably more
13 difficult, even parents didn't really -- you didn't hug,
14 you didn't kiss, you didn't do all of that sort of
15 stuff. Perhaps it's more open now. But certainly that
16 relationship between the parent and the child I think is
17 extremely important.

18 I say here the things -- in terms of working with
19 children and PVG checks and so on and so forth ...

20 LADY SMITH: Yes, John, that's an interesting point you make
21 about the PVG check. You say it's a spot-check, and
22 of course it's dependant on what's come to the notice of
23 the relevant authorities --

24 A. Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: -- that put the information on the record.

1 A. Yes, absolutely. But it is to me -- I have described it
2 as an MOT: it only happens at that time --

3 LADY SMITH: Yes.

4 A. -- and anything can happen in between.

5 There's no further overseeing, if you like, of that.
6 Once you've actually got that piece of paper, you're
7 good to go, so to speak, in terms of working with
8 children.

9 LADY SMITH: Is there also the danger of an assumption being
10 made that because the PVG check is okay, that's fine,
11 I've got a good person working in this environment,
12 I don't need to worry about them?

13 A. I think possibly. I don't even think from my own
14 experience, because I've actually been PVG checked
15 because I've worked with kids in football and curling
16 and so on and so forth, those people that perhaps you're
17 working for see it as it's something that has to be done
18 and once it's done, they've ticked the box, and once the
19 box is ticked, then there's nothing more to worry about,
20 we've actually covered ourselves in relation to this.
21 What it doesn't do is monitor the individuals
22 thereafter, so therefore it falls down on the back of
23 that.

24 LADY SMITH: Nor should it be seen as good reason to be
25 relieved of the responsibility to remain vigilant at all

1 times.

2 A. Absolutely. Absolutely. The bottom line is it's not
3 just down to the person that's being checked; it's down
4 to the other responsible people to ensure that the
5 safety of children is maintained thereafter.

6 LADY SMITH: Yes. Mr MacAulay.

7 MR MacAULAY: The other thing I think you wanted to mention,
8 it's not mentioned in your statement because I don't
9 think it was so much in the public domain at that time,
10 and that is the recently announced redress scheme for
11 children who have been abused.

12 A. Yes. I understand, ma'am, that the two are not linked.
13 Essentially, the child abuse inquiry is different from
14 the government initiative in relation to the redress
15 scheme. But I think what I'd like to say first is that
16 as far as the inquiry is concerned, I really do thank
17 the inquiry for what they're doing and I thank the
18 initiative for actually allowing people like myself to
19 voice what has actually been done to them, if you like,
20 in the past, and the impact that it's likely to have on
21 them.

22 What it does do is it then puts it out into a public
23 domain and it's only when that happens I think that the
24 powers that be start to take notice of some of these
25 things, and whether it be the PVG checks or something

1 else.

2 My background was the Fire Service and the Fire
3 Precautions Act wouldn't have come into being had the
4 Woolworths disaster in Manchester not happened. That
5 was the spark, excuse the pun, that put the whole Fire
6 Precautions Act into place. Equally, the Health and
7 Safety at Work Act, the same thing happened there.
8 It was major accidents at work and in industry and so on
9 that promoted the fact of health and safety at work and
10 now you have a Health and Safety at Work Act looking
11 after that.

12 I hope that coming out of this is something along
13 the lines of the Safety of Children in Care Act,
14 whatever it may be, that actually puts all the processes
15 and procedures in place to ensure the safety of kids
16 in the future. And I thank the inquiry because the
17 inquiry's actually going to do that.

18 But on the separate side, the Scottish Government,
19 gratefully, have taken an initiative and started
20 a process of not just the redress scheme. For example,
21 I know they put into place Future Pathways. That is an
22 organisation there to support individuals that have been
23 abused in care, alongside many other organisations that
24 do that too. But the redress scheme is something
25 that -- anybody that's been through all this probably

1 more than anything else would like the powers that be
2 that were responsible for them to say sorry.

3 Unless something is done in what's happened to
4 date -- because this is, what, 61 years since this
5 happened to me, and I'm sure there's many others which
6 have been a lot worse case than my case. But I think
7 the government initiative is something that will allow
8 that to happen, hopefully through either legislation or
9 through some other means, where those responsible for
10 these can actually say sorry.

11 What is interesting about the redress scheme, and
12 we're talking today about boarding schools, is that
13 they've already stated, and I have an issue with it --
14 they have already stated in the advance payment side of
15 it that boarding schools -- and they've used a phrase
16 which is bizarre to me: if your parents chose to send
17 you to a boarding school, you are not eligible for the
18 redress scheme.

19 Part of the consultation document that's coming out
20 poses that question and I find it bizarre because (a)
21 I don't understand what it means and I don't think
22 anybody else that went to a boarding school would
23 understand what it actually means, but what I can say is
24 the child didn't choose to go to a boarding school, and
25 the child didn't choose to be abused at a boarding

1 school. So I really do hope that the government address
2 this issue because, if they don't, then as a consequence
3 of putting boarding schools as part of their core
4 responsibility -- and they've taken it from the Scottish
5 Child Abuse Inquiry terms of reference and they're
6 adopting the similar terms of reference, so boarding
7 schools are in as part of care institutions -- you can't
8 then pick it out by saying if it was a fee-paying
9 boarding school then you're not eligible.

10 Because what you've done is you've said to those
11 that went to a boarding school an indication that
12 redress will take place and now you're going to pull it
13 away and that's not right. That will affect people like
14 me, and people worse off than me, in the future if that
15 happens.

16 So I plead with the Scottish Government to rethink
17 that.

18 MR MacAULAY: John, thank you for that message, and indeed
19 for engaging with the inquiry in answering my questions.

20 My Lady, no other questions have been submitted to
21 be put to John.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Are there any outstanding
23 applications for questions of John? No.

24 John, those are all the questions we have for you.
25 Thank you very much for engaging with the inquiry.

1 I know it has been a long process of engaging with us to
2 give your written statement, which has so much helpful
3 detail in it, and then coming here today to make your
4 evidence literally come alive by having you here to
5 engage with us. Please don't underestimate the impact
6 you doing that has. I'm very grateful to you and I'm
7 now able to let you go.

8 A. Thank you, ma'am, and thank you for everybody that's
9 given the support along the way.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

11 (The witness withdrew)

12 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, the next witness has been planned for
13 11.45.

14 LADY SMITH: We'll take the break now and if in fact the
15 witness is ready a little earlier and everyone is
16 around, we can start earlier.

17 (11.12 am)

18 (A short break)

19 (11.41 am)

20 LADY SMITH: I understand the next witness is ready; is that
21 right, Ms MacLeod?

22 MS MACLEOD: That's right, my Lady. The next witness is an
23 applicant who wishes to remain anonymous and he will use
24 the name "Thomas" in giving his evidence.

25

1 "THOMAS" (sworn)

2 LADY SMITH: Please do sit down, Thomas, and make yourself
3 comfortable.

4 That folder contains your statement and Ms MacLeod
5 will explain to you in a moment what she wants you to do
6 with it.

7 You'll see the red light is now on on your
8 microphone. Could I ask you to try and make sure you
9 stay in a good position for the microphone because we
10 neared to hear you through the sound system.

11 A. I'll do that.

12 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, I'll hand over to Ms MacLeod
13 and she will explain what happens next. Is that all
14 right with you?

15 A. Thank you, I'm ready.

16 LADY SMITH: Ms MacLeod.

17 Questions from Ms MacLEOD

18 MS MACLEOD: Good morning, Thomas.

19 A. Good morning.

20 Q. You've provided a statement to the inquiry and there's
21 a copy of that statement in the red file in front of
22 you. I'll give the reference for the transcript:
23 WIT.001.002.2934.

24 If I can begin by asking you to turn to the very
25 last page of the statement. Have you signed the

1 statement?

2 A. I have.

3 Q. In the final paragraph do you say:

4 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
5 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry"?

6 A. Yes, I have said that.

7 Q. And do you go on to say:

8 "I believe the facts stated in this witness
9 statement are true"?

10 A. I do, yes.

11 Q. Thank you.

12 I don't need your full date of birth, Thomas, but
13 were you born in 1950?

14 A. I was.

15 Q. And are you now 69?

16 A. I am.

17 Q. You begin in your statement by telling us a little bit
18 about your family background before you went to boarding
19 school. I think the family home was in Perthshire;
20 is that right?

21 A. It was, yes.

22 Q. And you were the second of five children?

23 A. I was.

24 Q. You go on to tell us that you had a very happy childhood
25 growing up.

1 A. I did, yes.

2 Q. And, sadly, that when you were, I think, around age 13,
3 your father passed away.

4 A. He did, yes.

5 Q. And your mother was then a widow with four sons and
6 a daughter?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. Was it really after that that the decision was taken
9 that you would go to boarding school?

10 A. Yes, it was.

11 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about that decision and the
12 background to you going to St Joseph's?

13 A. The decision was taken by my mother. She was concerned
14 that, with my father now being dead, that I would need
15 some kind of male role model or role models in my life.
16 She wouldn't have used the term role model, but she knew
17 what she was doing, and that was to find me a school
18 where I would be given a good education and good
19 formation as a person.

20 Q. Do you remember how old you were when the decision was
21 taken for you to go to St Joseph's?

22 A. At that time I would be 14, just at the beginning of
23 1964.

24 Q. You tell us, I think, that you travelled by train from
25 Perth to Glasgow.

1 A. Yes, we did.

2 Q. And did you part company with your mother in --

3 A. I did, yes, I remember standing on that long, long
4 platform at Perth, yes, watching her face receding into
5 the distance. I remember that.

6 Q. Once you were in Glasgow, were you then on a train with
7 a number of other boys who were going to the school?

8 A. Yes, there was a lot of boys heading in a train that had
9 been specially chartered to take us down to Dumfries.

10 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about that train journey
11 and how you found that experience?

12 A. I found it quite daunting, actually, because I was
13 pitched into a carriage with people I'd never met and it
14 was extraordinary, really, because I felt so
15 scrutinised: the shoes, the trousers, the blazer.
16 I remember there was a guy there who had
17 a battery-powered turntable and he was playing the
18 latest Beatles album. It was just chaotic and very,
19 very strange to me.

20 Q. I think you tell us that at that stage people were
21 commenting on your --

22 A. Oh, they were, yes. The fact that I had the regulation
23 shoes and the regulation trousers -- everything that had
24 been set out and prescribed, my mother had made sure
25 that they'd been bought and that's what I was wearing.

1 Q. When you got to the train station in Dumfries, I think
2 you say that that's your first recollection of seeing
3 one of the brothers?

4 A. Yes. That's right. We were gathered and grouped up
5 ready for the walk up to St Joseph's College from
6 Dumfries railway station.

7 Q. And Thomas, if you were around 14 at the time, was that
8 [REDACTED] 1964, the beginning of the school term?

9 A. Correct, that's right.

10 Q. We'll go on to look at this, but I think you remained at
11 St Joseph's until 1968, when you were 18.

12 A. I did, yes.

13 Q. St Joseph's was an all-boys school?

14 A. It was, yes.

15 Q. A boarding school?

16 A. It was a boarding school; it took day boarders as well.

17 Q. Do you have a recollection of the number of boys that
18 were there?

19 A. I think I've said something like 300 or so, yes.

20 Q. If it's all right with you, I will put a photograph of
21 the school grounds on the screen.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. That's at INQ.001.004.2710.

24 LADY SMITH: It may help for us to have you stand up and
25 point out particular places, if you're comfortable with

1 doing that. Other people have found it's quite useful
2 and we've got a big photograph up to do so.

3 MS MACLEOD: We don't know the exact date, Thomas, that
4 photograph was taken, but does this resemble what you
5 recall the layout of the buildings to be?

6 A. Yes. It does resemble that, yes. It does.

7 Q. The building in the centre of the photograph, is that
8 the school main building?

9 A. That was the main school block, yes.

10 Q. And behind that to the left of the photograph, do we see
11 a chapel?

12 A. That is the chapel, yes.

13 Q. And the next building along to the right of the chapel,
14 could you tell me what that is?

15 A. The top two floors were dormitories and the bottom
16 floors were accommodation for the brothers.

17 Q. The top two floors, the dormitories, was that for the
18 senior school?

19 A. Senior, yes, it was the senior division dormitories.

20 Q. And I think we'll come on to look at a time when you
21 moved over to that senior side.

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Then moving on to the next building then to the right of
24 that, towards the top of the photograph, could you tell
25 me what that is?

1 A. That's St Michael's Mount; that's where retired brothers
2 lived. Beyond that, there were tennis courts -- they're
3 not shown there, it is a older photograph -- but that's
4 St Michael's Mount, yes.

5 Q. If we come back to the main building and to the right of
6 that, do we see some lower level buildings? Do you
7 remember what those were?

8 A. These had gone by then because there had been a new
9 block built, which was the science block and the
10 assembly room and all of that, the theatre --

11 Q. The new building was there when you were there?

12 A. The new building was there and it was appended to the
13 main building in this area. So these have been cleared
14 (indicating).

15 LADY SMITH: So the new building was to the right of the
16 main building as --

17 A. To the right of the main building here (indicating).

18 LADY SMITH: If you were facing the front of the main
19 building, it would have been to the right?

20 A. Yes.

21 LADY SMITH: I think I'm right in saying the new building
22 was physically joined to the old building, was it?

23 A. It was, that's right, yes. Corridors were continuous
24 through it, yes.

25 MS MACLEOD: Thank you, Thomas. You can sit down again.

1 Thank you very much.

2 How was the school divided in terms of school years
3 and dormitories?

4 A. Right. So there was a junior division, those are the
5 very youngest boys.

6 Q. Was that sometimes called the wee-rec?

7 A. Yes, the wee-rec, and there was the inter-rec, the
8 intermediate division, and the middle-rec -- rec was
9 short for recreation. So the middle-rec, middle
10 division, and then senior division.

11 Q. So were there four divisions: the wee-rec, the
12 inter-rec, the mids and the seniors?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And when you started at the school, which division were
15 you in?

16 A. I started in the intermediate division.

17 Q. As well as the divisions, you also mention that there
18 were houses in the school.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Was that mainly for sporting matches?

21 A. Yes. It was a way of -- yes, that's right. You had
22 a house that you belonged to: St Patrick's, St George's,
23 St Ninian's, and St Andrew's.

24 Q. And that was something quite separate from the
25 divisions?

1 A. Correct, yes, it went right across the divisions.

2 Q. Did you start in around third year of secondary school?

3 A. I did, yes.

4 Q. Do you remember if there were primary school classes
5 in the school at all during your time?

6 A. To my recollection, Primary Seven -- that's what there
7 was, there was Primary Seven.

8 Q. In terms of the secondary class set-up, you went into
9 third year?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Something I think you mention in your statement is that
12 something happened between second and third year of the
13 school when there wasn't enough space for boys to move
14 up from the second to third year.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Could you tell me about that?

17 A. As far as I recollect -- and I've been very careful
18 about thinking this through. As I recollect, there were
19 three classes at second year, 2A, 2B and 2C, and there
20 were only two classes to go up to from the second year.
21 It seemed to me that there was a regular practice of
22 holding boys back to repeat the second year before they
23 would come up into the third year.

24 Q. So it's your recollection that each year some of the
25 second years would be held back to repeat their second

1 year --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. -- because there didn't appear to be space in third year
4 for them?

5 A. That's how it looked to me, yes, and that's how others
6 have described it.

7 Q. But you yourself, as you have told us, you went into
8 third year?

9 A. I did, straight in, yes.

10 Q. Who was SNR [REDACTED] of the school?

11 A. At that time?

12 Q. When you arrived.

13 A. Brother MZH [REDACTED].

14 Q. And did that remain the position during your time at the
15 school?

16 A. No. Brother MZH [REDACTED], I think, moved on in 1967, and
17 he was succeeded by Brother MYZ [REDACTED].

18 Q. We'll come on to look at the school [REDACTED] in due
19 course, but I think you tell us that that was a
20 MML [REDACTED]?

21 A. Yes, it was.

22 Q. Was he the school [REDACTED]

23 [REDACTED]?

24 A. He was, he was the school [REDACTED], yes.

25 Q. Looking at the other brothers who you recall from the

1 school, can you tell me which brothers you recall?

2 A. Okay. In no particular order?

3 Q. If we look at the divisions first of all.

4 A. Okay.

5 Q. Let's look at the junior division. Do you recall who
6 looked after the junior division?

7 A. Yes, Brother CIPHER WITHD looked after the junior division.

8 The intermediate division was Brother AKW .

9 Middle division was looked after by Brother Kenelm,
10 Brother Kenelm and MYZ . He was helped out
11 from time to time by Brother Marcellus. Then above the
12 middle division, the senior division was looked after at
13 that time ... at that time I think -- it was --

14 Brother MLD .

15 Q. And you set out for us in your statement a number of
16 other brothers you recall having teaching roles --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- and I'll just pick out a few of those. You mention
19 Brother CIPHER W; was he the teacher?

20 A. He was my teacher towards the end of my time
21 at the school, yes. Prior to that,
22 Brother MLD taught me .

23 Q. And Brother MFI ?

24 A. Brother MFI didn't have a teaching role, but he was
25 a presence in the senior division and had kind of

1 oversight of sporting things, yes.

2 Q. And Brother MZI ?

3 A. Brother MZI , [REDACTED] .

4 Q. As well as the brothers you set out a number of lay
5 staff that you recall as teachers.

6 A. I do, yes. [REDACTED] , [REDACTED]
7 [REDACTED] . Brian McEwan, geography, and
8 also took the drama section. Let me think ... There
9 was one other guy who taught physics. [REDACTED]
10 [REDACTED] .

11 Q. Mr MNT , I think you mention.

12 A. That's it, yes.

13 Q. Did the brothers do the majority of the teaching?

14 A. Yes, they did, yes.

15 Q. You mention that there came a time when your own brother
16 attended St Joseph's.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Was that after you'd left?

19 A. It was. He followed after me, my brother came into
20 St Joe's in the [REDACTED] of 1968 and left in 1969.

21 Q. So was he around 16 when he arrived?

22 A. He was, yes.

23 Q. And we'll come on to look at some of the things he told
24 you about his experience, but I think you tell us that
25 he was at the school for a short time and that he was

1 expelled.

2 A. He was, yes.

3 Q. Something you mention, Thomas, is that you noticed that
4 there was a strong influence of the west of Scotland, of
5 Glasgow, in the school.

6 A. Mm-hm.

7 Q. Could you develop that for me?

8 A. I was very conscious from the very beginning of how much
9 emphasis there was on Celtic Football Club, to be
10 a supporter of Celtic Football Club, and if you didn't
11 support Celtic Football Club there was something wrong
12 with you.

13 There was also a fascination with the gang culture
14 of Glasgow, which was prevalent at that time. So there
15 was a very strong, what I would call, west of Scotland
16 influence on the culture of the school among the boys.

17 Q. If you didn't have those things in your background,
18 I think you say that that was something you had to be
19 mindful of?

20 A. Oh yes, yes. Part of the camouflage of fitting in
21 rather than standing out might have been to support
22 Celtic or say you supported Celtic, yes.

23 Q. In relation to how, generally speaking, the boys were
24 treated or regarded at the school, you describe this for
25 us in paragraph 44 of your statement. You say:

1 "We were pretty much regarded as a body rather than
2 individuals."

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Is that how it felt for you at the time?

5 A. It did, yes, it did. It felt very much like we were
6 regarded as one big group, yes. Individuals -- very
7 little sense of the individual other than individuals
8 that were brought up from the past for us to look at.

9 Q. And you go on to say in that regard that it was pretty
10 much sink or swim.

11 A. It was, yes, that was my experience, very much so.
12 I certainly wasn't alone in that. There were others
13 like me who were floundering and it was a case of sink
14 or swim.

15 Q. In particular when you first arrived at the school, were
16 you homesick for a period?

17 A. Oh, I was, yes, desperately homesick. I think these
18 days, people would probably quickly recognise that I was
19 grieving for my father and that being away from my
20 family at that time wasn't actually very good for me.

21 Q. In relation to that --

22 LADY SMITH: Sorry, how long after the death of your father
23 did you start at St Joseph's?

24 A. My father died in the [REDACTED] of 1963 and I was at
25 St Joseph's by the following [REDACTED].

1 LADY SMITH: And you were still quite young at that stage?

2 A. I was.

3 LADY SMITH: A young teenager.

4 A. Yes, just 14, yes.

5 MS MACLEOD: In relation to your homesickness, was there any
6 kind of support or anything provided to you by the
7 school?

8 A. No, no, never.

9 Q. You provide us with some information about the routine,
10 the daily routine, at the school. I don't intend to go
11 through that with you in detail because we've got it in
12 your statement.

13 Something you do say is that there were no issues
14 in relation to having to eat your food or no problem if
15 you didn't clear your plate or anything like that.

16 A. No.

17 Q. You describe an occasion where something happened
18 in relation to mince.

19 A. Oh yes.

20 Q. Could you tell me about that?

21 A. Yes. This made the Scottish Daily Express as the hunger
22 strike, and of course it wasn't, it was sensationalised.
23 It was just we'd had enough of the mince, which had
24 a kind of doubtful look about it, and just one day
25 in the particular dining room that I was in, without

1 saying anything, we just piled out plates up at the end
2 of the table and wouldn't touch the mince. And that was
3 a statement we made at that time. We didn't expect it
4 to go any further, but the fact that it made the
5 newspapers didn't help.

6 Q. Did the principal get involved?

7 A. Yes, by that time SNR [REDACTED] was Brother MYZ [REDACTED]
8 [REDACTED]. He was outraged. I can remember him really
9 shouting at us. He was apoplectic with rage that we had
10 been so -- well, insolent, stupid. But the fact that it
11 had got into the newspapers, that really did matter,
12 that hurt.

13 Q. And I think you tell us that mince was put back on the
14 menu.

15 A. It was, yes, but we didn't have it quite so frequently
16 and it was actually better, so we'd made our point.

17 Q. Turning to the academic side of the school, Thomas, how
18 did you get on, generally speaking, with the schooling
19 side of things?

20 A. Okay. I worked hard. I really did work hard. I felt
21 it was very important because my mother was making a lot
22 of sacrifices for me to be there and there was quite
23 a competitive element in the school, so yeah, I wanted
24 to give a good account and I worked hard.

25 Q. I think you tell us that academic achievements were

1 important in the school.

2 A. They were, because the whole idea was that you came to
3 St Joseph's and you went to university.

4 Q. Indeed, you say that you were encouraged to regard
5 yourselves as the crème de la crème.

6 A. Yes, there was that, yes, and of course we would add our
7 spin, which was "thick and rich", yes.

8 Q. One thing you tell us is that in your fifth year at
9 school it was decided that there should be some
10 information given or counselling, I think you say --

11 A. Yes, there was.

12 Q. -- given to the boys about sexual relations.

13 A. Yes, there was. This was what was called "the sex
14 talk", where senior boys, a small number, would meet
15 with the then principal and have a talk through about
16 sexual relations, very, very skating across the surface,
17 basically, but particularly within what I would have
18 called the Catholic ethos and how it was your
19 responsibility as a young man to keep yourself from
20 doing things that were regarded as impure.

21 Q. You also tell us about something in relation to
22 confession, which you described as a puzzling incident
23 in relation to MML .

24 A. It was.

25 Q. What was that?

1 A. He made it known, and it was relayed to us, that he was
2 concerned that he wasn't hearing sufficient confession
3 of the sin of masturbation, and that was brought to us.

4 Q. Who brought that to you?

5 A. I think it was -- I'm not sure whether it was the
6 principal or it might have been the head of our
7 division, in which case that would have been

8 MLD [REDACTED]. But certainly it was brought
9 up and that became an issue, yes.

10 Q. So it was relayed to you that MML [REDACTED] had said
11 this?

12 A. Had concerns that he wasn't hearing enough confession of
13 the sin of masturbation.

14 Q. What did you think of that situation at the time?

15 A. Well, I was puzzled because I firmly believed -- and
16 I know that MML [REDACTED] didn't break the Seal of
17 Confession, but at the time I was really concerned that
18 he was saying such a thing and that it was coming to us
19 as if there was something wrong and we didn't quite know
20 what that was.

21 Q. Did the boys, do you recall, speak about this?

22 A. Yes, we did, we did. As usual, we thought: what's he
23 asking for, a productivity drive?

24 Q. You mention a particular occasion when you were out for
25 a run --

1 A. Mm-hm.

2 Q. -- and the brothers had arranged for a more senior boy
3 to run after you.

4 A. Yes, the guy called [REDACTED]. He trained with weights,
5 he was a very, very good sprinter, all of that. So
6 I used to go for a cross-country run every day and this
7 day in particular he was sent out with me. It was
8 perfectly obvious he'd been sent out to see what I did
9 when I was out on my run.

10 Q. Was this the only occasion that he was sent out?

11 A. It was the only one, yes.

12 Q. I think you tell us on that occasion that you outran the
13 boy.

14 A. I did, deliberately.

15 Q. But you went on then to have a fear that something might
16 happen to you?

17 A. Yes. Yes, it was one of those things. Loss of face was
18 so big and he was bigger, more powerful and better
19 connected than I was in the school, and I thought, "Oh,
20 maybe I shouldn't have done that", but I had a point to
21 make.

22 Q. I think you say that nothing did happen.

23 A. Nothing -- no, no. In fact, word got around that I had
24 outran this guy and I know there was, like, two camps,
25 there were those who thought, "Well done", and those who

1 thought, "Oh, what were you thinking?"

2 Q. I think you tell us that you didn't yourself at any time
3 try to run away from the school --

4 A. No.

5 Q. -- but that your cross-country running was a way of
6 getting away from --

7 A. That was my ritual running away every day, yes.

8 Q. Do you recall if any other boys ran away from the
9 school?

10 A. Yes. In particular, [REDACTED], a friend of mine who
11 lived in [REDACTED] in Essex, who went one night, took
12 a bicycle, cycled to the outskirts of Dumfries and
13 managed to thumb a lift and eventually got home to
14 [REDACTED] with the bicycle.

15 Q. And do you recall what treatment boys received, if any,
16 when they got back, how they were received back at the
17 school?

18 A. Right. When [REDACTED] got back, it was pretty well business
19 as usual. Whatever had been said had been said behind
20 closed doors, we knew nothing of it. He just came in
21 and carried on. He was a bit of a hero for a while.

22 Q. You talk about writing letters home to your family.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And that that was a process that was, to some degree,
25 supervised.

1 A. It was, initially it was, particularly in that third
2 year, I remember, we had to show our letter to -- at
3 that time it was Brother MNR.

4 Q. So would the boys be together writing their letters?

5 A. Yes, we all sat at our desks -- and this was part of the
6 Sunday -- you'd write your letter home, yes.

7 Q. How would the letter be shown to Brother MNR? Would
8 he come round?

9 A. You'd take it to his desk.

10 Q. Were there any occasions when there were issues raised
11 with anything you had written in your letters?

12 A. Punctuation. That's particularly it. I wrote "love
13 your son", and didn't put the comma after "love". So
14 he said, "I'm sure she does love you, but put the comma
15 in". That was the only time.

16 Q. I see. And I think you say that if there was something
17 in the letter that wasn't good enough, you may have to
18 rewrite the letter?

19 A. Yes, if that was the case, there would be a suggestion
20 that you go and have another go at that, sort that one
21 out, yes.

22 Q. So do you recall boys being asked to rewrite their
23 letters?

24 A. I don't recall that, actually. I don't have any clear
25 recall of anybody being sent back to do a rewrite, but

1 I do know there would be suggestions about how something
2 might be improved.

3 Q. We've touched on pastoral care already to some extent
4 in relation to your homesickness when you arrived. But
5 you do go on to discuss pastoral care in paragraph 111
6 of your statement. What you say is:

7 "It was very much a sense of 'us against them' when
8 it came to the brothers and the teachers."

9 A. Mm-hm.

10 Q. Could you perhaps elaborate upon that?

11 A. Yes. We were kind of comrades in adversity. We knew
12 that the brothers weren't particularly on our side. We
13 didn't get that feeling that we were on a level with
14 them in that sense, that they were on our side. So yes,
15 it was a case of -- well, the example I've given you of
16 just piling our plates up. We had to make a statement
17 and we made that statement collectively, but we didn't
18 prearrange it, we didn't even talk about it, we just did
19 it.

20 Q. I think you say that there was very seldom any contact
21 or conversation with the brothers.

22 A. There was minimal, minimal. I never actually recall
23 having a decent conversation with any one of the
24 brothers about anything.

25 Q. And you suggest that the culture was more your attention

1 was drawn to areas where you'd fallen short as opposed
2 to where you had done well?

3 A. Yes, that was always the case. What you hadn't done,
4 what you hadn't done well enough, rather than what you
5 were already doing well at. It was always that.

6 Q. You say that:

7 "What [you] wanted so much during your time at
8 St Joseph's was somebody to relate to, somebody who
9 could fill the space, as much as they could, that my
10 father had left behind and that was never realised."

11 A. It was never realised, it may not have been realisable,
12 but that's what I was looking for, yes.

13 Q. And you've mentioned camouflage already, but you go on
14 to say that you had to set about creating a social
15 camouflage.

16 A. Mm, yes, it was about fitting in rather than standing
17 out.

18 Q. And is that something that you felt during your whole
19 period at the school?

20 A. It became important to me from the very beginning
21 because of the way I was treated at the start, yes.

22 Q. You tell us that you recall there was a boy who died
23 during your time at the school.

24 A. Yes, [REDACTED]

25 Q. What are your recollections of that?

1 A. Well, [REDACTED] had something the matter with his
2 heart. It was pretty plain because he had that cyanosed
3 look, the blue nose, and eventually something happened
4 and he was admitted to hospital, which was just across
5 the road, actually, from the main building of
6 St Joseph's, where he died of heart failure.

7 Q. And I think you say he was buried in the cemetery in the
8 school.

9 A. At the back of St Michael's Mount, yes.

10 Q. Another incident you tell us about is about a boy who
11 was shot in the head during a field trip.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What are your recollections of that?

14 A. It was on Lochar Moss. They were out on a field trip
15 and the part of Lochar Moss that they were on was very
16 close to where a firing range was.

17 Q. Were you on the trip yourself?

18 A. No, I wasn't, no.

19 Q. Do you recall when in your time at the school, which
20 year, for example, this was?

21 A. I think I've written it in my statement. Was it 1966?
22 I think it might have been 1966. It was something
23 around that period.

24 Q. Did you hear about this once the group had come back to
25 the school?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. And what did you hear about what had happened?

3 A. We heard that he'd been shot in the head and that he was
4 in a bad way, he was in hospital, and it was
5 touch-and-go whether he was going to live or die. He
6 lived and eventually returned to the school some time
7 later. I remember that.

8 The police were involved. Parents were involved.
9 There were questions as to whether they had strayed on
10 to the range, all of that, because in those days, nobody
11 did what would be called risk assessments.

12 When it came to an inquiry, I think they found that
13 there was a spent round, in other words it was a round
14 that was at the end of its range and was dropping that
15 had hit him in the head.

16 Q. I see.

17 Can we now look at discipline in the school. What
18 explanation was given to you about rules and regulations
19 at the school, or how did you learn what you were
20 supposed to do and not do?

21 A. So there might be some general statements made at
22 assemblies, say, about particular issues or things that
23 were happening, but generally there was not what you
24 would call a grounding on what was expected of you,
25 where you stood, what was expected of you. You found

1 out -- I found out anyway -- the rules of the school
2 pretty well by experience. You would watch others, see
3 what goes, how does it go around here.

4 Q. Did you have an understanding that there was somebody in
5 charge of discipline at the school?

6 A. Yes, there was. The principal was in overall charge of
7 discipline, but each of the teachers had their own scope
8 for applying discipline in class and around and about,
9 and there were prefects also who were keeping an eye on
10 discipline matters.

11 Q. So if we look at the classroom set-up, first of all, if
12 a child was disciplined in the class, what kind of
13 discipline would that be?

14 A. Okay. It could take the form of disparaging remarks or
15 at the other end the use of the tawse, the belt.

16 Q. Would the teaching brother or the lay teacher administer
17 the belt themselves?

18 A. Yes, they would, yes. You wouldn't be sent to somewhere
19 else, no.

20 Q. In that respect was that on the hands --

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. -- that the belt was used?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. And how many strikes of the belt?

25 A. A maximum of six. It would be up to, I guess, the

1 teacher who was administering it to decide when enough
2 was enough, but six was the maximum.

3 Q. Were you on occasion belted in that way in the
4 classroom?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Were there occasions when a boy might be sent to the
7 principal for punishment?

8 A. Yes, if there was something really serious or
9 persistent, yes, then they would have to go to the
10 principal.

11 Q. Were you sent to the principal for punishment?

12 A. No, never.

13 Q. Did you have any understanding of what kind of
14 punishment would be administered or would be handed out
15 by the principal?

16 A. It would usually take the form of a really strongly
17 worded dressing-down, and also the risk or the threat of
18 involvement of parents, and that follow-up would be
19 sufficient to say, "Right, you've crossed the line".

20 Q. What about in the divisions, so away from the classroom?
21 Who managed discipline there?

22 A. Discipline away from the classroom would be the division
23 head, the brothers heading up the divisions and the
24 prefects.

25 Q. In your own experience, how was that managed? How would

1 boys be disciplined, for example, in the dormitories, if
2 they required to be?

3 A. Okay. It could be lines, it could be that you were
4 grounded for a while. It could be that you were given
5 extra chores to do, clearing up, litter picking, that
6 kind of thing.

7 Q. Would corporal punishment be used by brothers in respect
8 of the dormitories?

9 A. I don't remember that happening, no.

10 Q. You mentioned prefects there as well. What was their
11 role in relation to discipline?

12 A. Prefects were there to keep discipline, particularly
13 when we were moving in numbers, like at the end of the
14 day, coming up the stairs into our dormitories. There
15 would be no running, no talking, all of that, and you
16 could collect lines if you were seen to be particularly
17 making a noise on the stairs, that sort of thing.

18 Prefects generally would make sure that you were not
19 doing anything out of order, like for instance sloping
20 off to have a smoke in the lavatories, and some people
21 did that.

22 Q. If a prefect saw you doing that, what might happen?

23 A. Well, you'd be reported.

24 Q. Who would you be reported to?

25 A. You'd be reported to the division head.

1 Q. I think you tell us that you yourself became a prefect.

2 A. I did, to my great surprise, yes.

3 Q. As a prefect were you involved in disciplining or
4 punning children?

5 A. Yes, I was, yes -- what would I say? -- never
6 comfortable with that, but I tried to be as
7 compassionate as possible with that.

8 Q. And what kinds of punishment would you give to boys when
9 you were a prefect?

10 A. Probably the litter pick would be the most obvious.
11 Lines I just thought were pointless. I had no use for
12 them and I don't think anybody else had much of a use
13 for them other than the time it took.

14 Q. As a prefect, was it up to you what punishment to hand
15 out?

16 A. Yes, and if something serious had happened, obviously
17 I'd refer it to the division head, the brother and head
18 of the division.

19 Q. And prefects, were they selected from the sixth year or
20 the fifth and sixth years of the school?

21 A. Sixth and upper sixth.

22 Q. Something you touch on in your statement is bullying.
23 Were you aware of bullying going on at the school?

24 A. Yes, there was quite a strong culture of bullying, what
25 would be unmistakeably understood in these days as

1 bullying. Anybody who was regarded as other, not as
2 able, say, at football or not as sharp academically,
3 somebody of a different nationality. Anything like
4 that, yes, that would be a focus.

5 Q. You say in paragraph 153 that bullying was normalised.

6 A. Yes, it was. It was never addressed, it was normalised,
7 it was accepted. It was almost as if it was invisible.

8 Q. So do you think the brothers, for example, were aware
9 that bullying was going on?

10 A. Well, many of the brothers used what I would regard now
11 as sarcasm as a primary form of communication. You
12 wouldn't get much of what I would call approval or, you
13 know, that sort of thing, the sense in which you were
14 being acknowledged, other than being spoken down to
15 a lot.

16 Q. Do you recall if bullying was something that the
17 brothers took any steps to address or stop?

18 A. No, I don't recall at any time anybody, including
19 myself, being pulled up for behaviour that would have
20 been regarded as bullying. I never, ever saw that.

21 Q. You mention a couple of incidents that involve boys
22 fighting and I'll mention these to you. The first is
23 something that happened as a result of a trip to
24 Liverpool --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- in 1966 or 1967.

2 A. That's right, yes.

3 Q. Did something happen on that trip which resulted in --

4 A. Yes. Two of the pupils on the trip fell out and they
5 fell out in a very obvious way. They were going to
6 fight about this, so the fight was postponed until the
7 following morning, and then it was set up in the
8 gymnasium, and Brother MLD [REDACTED] was there. The
9 two people, one was called [REDACTED], the other one
10 I can't remember, but the two people squared up to each
11 other and they started to fight. We were watching and
12 the fight just petered out.

13 Q. So was this something you understood to have been
14 arranged at least with the knowledge of
15 Brother MLD [REDACTED]?

16 A. Yes, he was present. I think his judgement call might
17 have been -- and I can't really speak for him, but
18 I think his judgement call might have been that it would
19 be contained and that it would just fizzle out, which is
20 exactly what it did.

21 Q. I think you say that at the time you felt that setting
22 the boys up in that way was manipulative.

23 A. I thought it was, yes: let's you and him fight, yes. It
24 was manipulative in the sense that it sent a message to
25 the rest of us.

1 Q. You speak about another occasion when you witnessed
2 something on the flat roof of the school.

3 A. Right. I have to be very careful here. I didn't
4 actually witness this, but I knew about it, I was told
5 about it, yes.

6 Q. I see. So what were you told about?

7 A. Right. I saw the damage on one of the guys, the black
8 eye and the nose. There were a small number of pupils
9 in the senior division who were regarded as dissident,
10 a bit too clever, and my understanding was that they
11 were lured on to the flat roof of the main building
12 where they were set about by a number of people,
13 probably prefects, who beat them up.

14 Q. So was this one group of senior boys being lured on to
15 the roof by another group of senior boys?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And this was something you heard about?

18 A. It was, yes. We saw it. It was all over the senior
19 division, yes.

20 Q. And I think you say that this set the tone for your
21 expectations of being a senior pupil.

22 A. It certainly put fear into me that something like that
23 could happen if you were regarded as not fitting in.

24 Q. You mention that you saw the aftermath; what did you
25 see?

1 A. I saw one particular boy, I don't remember his name now,
2 but he had a black eye and his nose was bloodied.

3 Q. In relation to your own brother, I know you weren't
4 at the school at the same time as him, but did your
5 brother tell you some things that happened to him when
6 he was at the school --

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. -- in terms of physical things that happened?

9 A. Yes. Two of the pupils in the senior division there set
10 about him one day because they had unfinished business
11 with me and thought they could finish it with him. So
12 he was physically attacked, he was also bullied by them.

13 Q. You tell us that your brother passed away.

14 A. He did, in 1992.

15 Q. And that you didn't manage to speak to him in detail
16 about what had happened, but he'd managed to convey this
17 message to you?

18 A. He told me, yes. He told me a lot at the time and he
19 told me a lot later in life as well about how that
20 incident had impacted him to such an extent, yes.

21 He told me that -- he was living in Australia at
22 that time, he was receiving some kind of therapy for his
23 alcoholism, and he wrote to me about how it had been,
24 having been bullied, and carrying that with him.

25 Q. What impact did you understand that that had had on him?

1 A. It had a very big impact on him in terms of his fear,
2 fear of others, fear of -- yes, fear of being marked
3 out. He went on to join the Royal Navy and that must
4 have been hard for him, I think.

5 Q. I would like to turn now to the part of your statement
6 where you set out your experiences in relation to
7 Brother MFI. I think you tell us that your first
8 encounter with Brother MFI was something that
9 happened during a cricket trip.

10 A. Not as a matter of a cricket trip, no. It was a result
11 of him having seen me bowl. I was new to the senior
12 division and I went to the playing fields with
13 Brother MFI and . was
14 a batsman and I bowled to . MFI watched
15 me bowl and decided that I should be selected for the
16 cricket team.

17 Q. This cricket match where he saw you bowl, was this in
18 around about 1966?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Would you have been about 16 at the time?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Did there come a time then that you were called to go
23 and see Brother MFI?

24 A. Yes, I was. I think the time you're talking about is
25 the time when he asked me if I had a jockstrap and an

1 abdominal protector, and I said yes.

2 Q. So were you somewhere in the school and did

3 Brother MFI approach you?

4 A. I was called and told to go to his room.

5 Q. So you went to his room?

6 A. I went to his room, yes.

7 Q. And when you got there, what did he say?

8 A. He asked me if I had a jockstrap and an abdominal

9 protector, did I know what they were. I said, no, I had

10 no idea what they were, so he produced the jockstrap and

11 the abdominal protector.

12 Q. Did he ask you to do something in relation to your

13 clothing?

14 A. Yes, he told me to take my trousers off and my pants off

15 so that he could show me how to put the abdominal

16 protector and the jockstrap on.

17 Q. What did you think of that at the time that he asked you

18 to take your clothes off?

19 A. I thought, all right, that is what you're asking me to

20 do, I'll do it. I didn't think for a moment, what's

21 this? It was really just a case of: right, okay this,

22 is what we have to do. I was not at all comfortable

23 with that, but if you're told by a brother "do this",

24 you do it.

25 Q. What was the next thing he did from there?

1 A. Right. So he put the jockstrap on and to do that he had
2 to cradle my testicles in his hand, put the jockstrap
3 on, and then repeat the process to put the plastic cup
4 into the jockstrap. He did this several times in order
5 to be sure that I actually understood the process and
6 each time he handled me.

7 He also talked about needing to check whether I was
8 maturing physically, and all the time I was standing
9 there -- by this time I was pretty well rooted to the
10 spot, mesmerised at what was going on, because it wasn't
11 just once. I was thinking, why are we doing this again
12 and again? So I was pretty relieved to get out of that
13 room.

14 Q. How long do you think the whole episode lasted for?

15 A. I've said I think in total it would be about 45 minutes.

16 Q. For the majority of that, were your clothes removed?

17 A. Yes, I was naked from the waist down, apart from my
18 socks.

19 Q. I think you tell us that at that time you were focused
20 on making sure that it didn't go anywhere, the situation
21 didn't develop.

22 A. Right, and that was one thing I was really conscious of.
23 I was thinking, there must be nothing from me, no
24 movement, no sign of any kind of arousal, and nothing
25 must happen here, I need to be absolutely -- well, as

1 close to motionless as possible, the whole thing,
2 just ... Yes, I was frozen.

3 Q. Later that same evening, did somebody approach you and
4 say something?

5 A. Yes, later. One of the pupils, [REDACTED], said, "Has
6 MFI [REDACTED] had you up to fit your jockstrap yet?" and he had
7 this kind of little smirk on his face and I thought, oh,
8 you know about this, how do you know about this, what's
9 happened here? Immediately I thought, who else knows,
10 what else is going on here? I felt really vulnerable.

11 Q. And what was your response to the other boy?

12 A. I just said, "Yeah", and left it at that.

13 Q. After that incident, how were your interactions with
14 Brother MFI [REDACTED]?

15 A. Pretty well monosyllabic. He would very seldom
16 acknowledge me, very seldom say anything to me. Might
17 be a bit sarcastic. I remember when I was training for
18 athletics and I was doing interval training and he said,
19 "Mm, you're very one-paced", and he just walked off.

20 Another time in cricket nets, he stood about 5 or
21 6 yards from me firing the ball. It was a concrete
22 wicket covered by a coconut mat; this is for practice
23 purposes in the nets. He stood about 6 yards from me,
24 firing the ball into the concrete, the coconut matting,
25 so that it would come up quickly. The pre-text was of

1 testing my defence. All right, what else could I do
2 other than just do that, take it on and do the best
3 I could with it? But it was weird.

4 Q. You go on to say, following on from that -- in
5 paragraph 167, you say:

6 "I think there was a pattern with the brothers, that
7 it was a case of try it on and see what response they
8 could get."

9 A. Yes. Yes, that's on reflection, I have to say, because
10 at the time I wasn't joining up those dots, I wasn't
11 actually thinking: there is something more going on
12 here.

13 Q. You tell us about something else that happened the next
14 term of the school in the autumn term of 1966. I think
15 you were moved to a different dorm then; is that right?

16 A. Yes. Right, into a smaller -- yes, this was four beds,
17 a dormitory of four beds, a smaller room, yes.

18 It was one night, I know I was quite deeply asleep,
19 and I woke with a sensation of pressure in the middle of
20 my back and a hand feeling my buttocks. I was trying to
21 move, but my face was down and the pressure on me,
22 I couldn't turn over, I couldn't get anything out.
23 Eventually, I managed to turn and the person who was
24 doing this then headed for the door of this small
25 dormitory and went off.

1 I caught sight of his profile as he went out and it
2 was the full black habit of one of the brothers. I have
3 no idea who that brother was, but it was certainly
4 a brother's habit.

5 Q. And I think you tell us that the other three boys who
6 were in the room were asleep.

7 A. They were asleep, yes.

8 Q. Did this take place in the building behind the main
9 school building that you identified for us earlier, the
10 senior dorms?

11 A. The senior division, yes, that's right.

12 Q. And I think you've told us already that there were
13 brothers' accommodation in that same building?

14 A. Yes. Their refectory and their rooms were on the lower
15 two floors, the first and second floor.

16 Q. In terms of access within the building, could brothers
17 and boys move freely around?

18 A. Brothers would move quite freely. Boys weren't expected
19 to. Boys were expected to stay within our particular
20 confines.

21 Q. So would the door of the dormitory be locked or anything
22 like that?

23 A. No. No, it was open doors.

24 Q. After that incident, do you remember how you felt about
25 it, what your feelings were about what had happened?

1 A. Again, it's very confusing when something like that
2 happens in that situation where you don't know who to
3 talk to, you don't know who you can talk to, you don't
4 know who knows what and you don't know -- I couldn't say
5 anything to my mother, for instance. For a start, I had
6 no telephone connection with her, I would have had to
7 write to her, but I had no way of saying what had
8 happened to anyone and being able to trust that that
9 would be taken in confidence and that something might
10 happen as a result of it that would help.

11 Q. During that same autumn term of 1966, you describe an
12 incident that happened involving Brother MZI and
13 a rugby ball. This is in paragraph 172.

14 A. Yes. This was another puzzling day. I was at the
15 playing fields, Maryfield, big playing fields, and I had
16 taken a rugby ball up to practice kicking. Brother MZI
17 and another pupil, [REDACTED], came and they had
18 a rugby ball with them. Brother MZI set [REDACTED] and I up
19 to run up and down the pitch, passing the ball to each
20 other from about ankle height, so that we were bent over
21 almost double to pass this ball, catch the ball, pass it
22 back.

23 He ran behind us and at the time I really didn't
24 know what on earth this exercise we were doing was for.
25 I couldn't see what the benefit of it was.

1 Q. Did you ask Brother MZI ?

2 A. No, no, I didn't, because -- yes, I didn't. I didn't
3 challenge it, didn't want to know. I thought, oh, maybe
4 this is to do with flexibility, this is -- I had no
5 idea. I just thought, go along with it.

6 Eventually I was sent off to go and practice by
7 myself and Brother MZI and [REDACTED] carried on.

8 Q. You say:

9 "To me it was another case of trying it on to see
10 what response he got and then sending me away."

11 A. On reflection I thought that was another incident that
12 fell into that category.

13 Q. Another brother you tell us about is Brother CIPHER W.

14 I think you tell us -- you've told us already that at
15 one point he was a [REDACTED] teacher in the school.

16 A. He was, yes.

17 Q. And I think he was a [REDACTED] teacher, he went away for a
18 while, and returned to the school.

19 A. He did, yes. He went to [REDACTED] for a while.

20 Q. And you had another teacher in the meantime?

21 A. Brother MLD [REDACTED]. He taught me [REDACTED] from the
22 third year right through until Brother CIPHER W. became my
23 [REDACTED] teacher, yes.

24 Q. And was that in around 1967 --

25 A. 1967, yes.

1 Q. -- that Brother CIPHER W. came back to be the [REDACTED] teacher?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And I think you tell us that you had some trouble with
4 his style of teaching in comparison with the other
5 teacher.

6 A. Yes. I had been quite happy with [REDACTED]
7 [REDACTED] and all of those kind of things
8 with Brother MLD [REDACTED]. Brother CIPHER W.'s language
9 just seemed to be different. I think I've used the
10 metaphor:

11 "It was as if I held a currency which no longer had
12 any value."

13 I couldn't see how to patch across what it was I'd
14 learned with Brother MLD [REDACTED] into
15 Brother CIPHER W.'s style of teaching and the [REDACTED] that
16 we were dealing with.

17 Q. And I think you say that you went from being completely
18 okay with [REDACTED] --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. -- to really not being able to understand?

21 A. Yes, I completely lost any confidence in myself as
22 knowing anything about -- because it seemed to me
23 everything that I tried wasn't right.

24 Q. What did you do as a result of --

25 A. Well, I asked for help.

1 Q. And who did you ask for --

2 A. Brother CIPHER W.

3 Q. What was his response to that?

4 A. Right. He took to sitting alongside me in my desk -- it
5 was the bench seats but the desk had the usual kind of
6 lid. He would sit alongside me and then he would sketch
7 out [REDACTED],
8 take me through it.

9 Then he started to put his hands under the desk
10 after a while and he would touch me on my thighs, very
11 close to my genitals. And he would always finish his
12 demonstration by putting his arm round my shoulder and
13 kissing me on the neck or the ear.

14 Q. Was that done quite openly in front of the class?

15 A. Yes. The under the desk stuff, I don't know who was
16 aware of it, but I certainly was.

17 Q. But the kissing and putting his arm around you --

18 A. Yes, that was done quite openly, yes.

19 Q. Would he make any kind of comments to you or say
20 anything to you?

21 A. Yes. There was like an open running commentary to the
22 class about what he was seeing, what he was doing, and,
23 "You're just not getting this, if you'd spent less time
24 doodling you'd have understood more". It was just
25 deprecating, the commentary.

1 Q. I think you call it a belittling commentary that was
2 going on.

3 A. Belittling, yes.

4 Q. Are you able to give me any idea of how often this
5 situation would happen when he would sit next to you and
6 put his hands on you under the desk?

7 A. Pretty well every [REDACTED] session that would happen, that
8 was happening.

9 Q. Approximately over what period of time are we talking?

10 A. It's quite a long period of time, actually, because --
11 it came to a head as we were running in towards the
12 Higher certificate exams, the exams were coming up. So
13 it'll have started in the spring term in particular.

14 Q. In relation to the contact that he was making with you
15 under the desk, you mentioned that he started to make
16 contact with your legs.

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. And that would then get closer to your genitals?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Did he touch your private parts?

21 A. He didn't, but it was very close. Right at the top of
22 my thighs.

23 Q. What was your own response, your feelings, to this
24 at the time? Can you remember?

25 A. Well, I was feeling very frustrated because I felt as if

1 I was in a double bind. I needed help with [REDACTED],
2 and what I wasn't getting was help with [REDACTED] and
3 the more I got no help, the more I got molested.

4 Q. I think you say that something happened one day in the
5 class that you heard a pupil say something.

6 A. Yes. The pupil was named [REDACTED] and he was
7 sitting probably a row across to my left and slightly
8 behind me. And he just exclaimed one day, "Keep your
9 hands to yourself, you pervert!" and I -- and
10 Brother CIPHER W was just getting up from his desk at that
11 time.

12 Q. What did you take from that?

13 A. I thought, oh, it's not just me, he's doing this to
14 other people.

15 Q. You mentioned there coming up to the Higher exam.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Did something happen in relation to Brother CIPHER W as
18 you were coming up to sitting the exam?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Did he say something to you?

21 A. Right out of the blue. He stood at the front of the
22 class, he looked at me and said, "If you had any respect
23 for this school, you won't take this exam", and I was
24 devastated. I remember being so outraged that I spoke
25 out. My outrage resulted in probably the loudest voice

1 that I've ever spoken out in in St Joseph's College.
2 This was, I felt, completely wrong. I was giving so
3 much of my time to the school as a representative in
4 athletics and in rugby and cricket and football, drama,
5 all sorts, cross-country running. And for him to stand
6 there and say I had no respect for the school, that ...
7 Oh ...

8 Q. And how did Brother CIPHER W respond to what you were
9 saying to him?

10 A. He just looked like thunder, but I never had another
11 moment's bother from him after that.

12 Q. Did he then stop coming to sit beside you at your desk?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. In relation to the exam itself, did you go on to sit the
15 exam?

16 A. I did, yes. I had time, because by that time I'm
17 a prefect and I have my own room, I took study time in
18 my room, I took the books with me.
19 I suppose you would call it just cramming. I memorised
20 as much as I could, I passed the exam, I got a grade C,
21 and it was sufficient to fulfil my entrance requirements
22 for university.

23 Q. I think you tell us that, along with the other Highers
24 you had, that you got a place at St Andrews University?

25 A. I did, to read chemistry, yes.

1 Q. Another brother you mention, and we've touched on this,
2 is Brother MLD [REDACTED] but in particular you
3 mention tablets that he had and access that boys may
4 have had to those tablets.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. What's your recollection of those tablets and what they
7 were?

8 A. Right. I remember standing one evening -- it was still
9 light, so we were out in the open, and he called
10 a student called [REDACTED] to him and said, [REDACTED] go
11 up to my room and bring me one of those capsules and
12 have one yourself".

13 Q. What were the capsules, do you know?

14 A. When [REDACTED] brought it, I saw it, and it was
15 Librium, black and green.

16 Q. And I think you tell us also that your brother gave you
17 some information about those tablets.

18 A. Yes. At that time -- and this was known during my time
19 at school, but nobody actually said it in as many
20 words -- he also had a bottle of amphetamine capsules,
21 black amphetamine capsules. So there was Librium and
22 amphetamines.

23 Q. This was Brother MLD [REDACTED]?

24 A. Brother MLD [REDACTED] They were in his study and some of the
25 senior students used his room and study to brew up, to

1 make tea and coffee while they were studying in the
2 evenings.

3 Q. And did your brother tell you that this was a practice
4 that continued when he was at the school?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And did your brother tell you anything else in relation
7 to Brother MLD ?

8 A. Yes. It was late one evening, bedtime, and
9 Brother MLD asked to get
10 into bed with him.

11 Q. Is this something your brother told you?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Do you remember roughly when your brother told you this?

14 A. He told me that after he had been expelled because I was
15 asking him what had happened at St Joe's, what had gone
16 wrong, what had happened.

17 Q. Did he say anything else about Brother MLD
18 and what might have happened to him or --

19 A. Yes. As I understood it, Brother MLD was
20 deemed to have had a nervous breakdown and he was sent
21 to Switzerland to recover; I heard that from MYZ
22 MYZ .

23 Q. Do you remember when you heard that, approximately?

24 A. Well, it was very close to the time that my brother had
25 been expelled because I actually went down to Dumfries

1 to bring him home.

2 Q. So your brother being expelled, your brother telling you
3 about Brother MLD and the other boy, and
4 what you were then told about Brother MLD
5 going away, that all happened close together?

6 A. Yes, it was in 1969.

7 Q. Were you aware of any inappropriate sexual behaviour
8 between the boys at the school?

9 A. The only behaviour that I know of was a big question
10 mark that had been raised over one pupil who was alleged
11 to have made a homosexual approach to another boy.

12 Q. And was that something that you heard about while you
13 were at the school yourself?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Was that something that you understood to have happened
16 while you were at the school yourself?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. While you were at the school, did you ever tell anybody
19 about the things you've been telling me today, in
20 particular in relation to the sexual incidents?

21 A. No, I never mentioned it to anybody.

22 Q. I think you tell us that you left the school in 1968;
23 is that right?

24 A. I did, yes.

25 Q. Was your leaving quite sudden because of --

1 A. A rail dispute. We had to leave about a week early
2 while the trains were still running.

3 Q. Did you then go back to Perth to stay with your mother?

4 A. I did, I stayed -- yes.

5 Q. You have told us that you had a place at St Andrews
6 University. Did you go to St Andrews?

7 A. No, I couldn't face it. I understood that I was going
8 to be living in a tutor's house. I also left St Joe's
9 wondering if I actually knew anything about anything any
10 more, even though I'd passed the exams.

11 My self-esteem was pretty well as low as it had ever
12 been in my life, so I decided I couldn't take up my
13 place at St Andrews. There was some student unrest as
14 well and I just thought, I don't want to put myself into
15 that situation, I've had enough.

16 Q. You tell us that for the next year or so, 1968/1969,
17 that you were in, I think, what you call yourself "my
18 terminally weird phase."?

19 A. Yes. That's right, yes. Terminally weird, yes. I kind
20 of put myself beyond reach. I would go for long walks,
21 foraging, paint psychedelic posters, yes, listen to
22 music. Generally a year of not knowing what I was going
23 to do with the rest of my life at all.

24 Q. You tell us that your mother was supportive of you
25 during that period.

1 A. She was, she was incredibly tolerant and supportive,
2 yes.

3 Q. There came a time, I think, through a scheme which was
4 encouraging young men in Scotland to go into work,
5 a time when you got a job at Beecham's Pharmaceuticals?

6 A. That's right. In those days, if you were a young man
7 and you were you were unemployed in Scotland, an
8 employer could get a £5 a week bounty for take you on.
9 So Beecham's Pharmaceuticals in Worthing got that bounty
10 and I went and worked there.

11 Q. Did there come a time a few years later when you were
12 encouraged to look for something that you were more
13 committed to? I think that's how you put it.

14 A. Yes, I was, yes. I was doing a three-day week before
15 Edward Heath put the rest of the nation on it.

16 The physician at Beecham's said, "Your attendance
17 record is awful, I think you should look for something
18 that's going to make better use of your talents and it's
19 not here".

20 Q. Did you get a mystery message, if I can put it that way,
21 through your letterbox?

22 A. I did. I got an advertisement that had been cut out of
23 the Guardian and written in red letters across it was,
24 "Why don't you bugger off and do something useful?"

25 Q. And what was that advertisement for?

1 A. It was for [REDACTED] College of Arts, the theatre
2 degree course.

3 Q. And did you go on to be accepted on to that course and
4 do the course?

5 A. I did. Yes, it was a turning point.

6 Q. And I think you go on to tell us that you worked in
7 leadership and development.

8 A. I did, yes.

9 Q. And that you did a master's degree?

10 A. Yes, I did, yes.

11 Q. You tell us, sadly, that your wife died in --

12 A. My first wife died, yes, that's right.

13 Q. And that you then stopped working for a period?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And then went back into consultancy work?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. And are you now retired?

18 A. I am.

19 Q. Thomas, can I ask you about the impact you feel your
20 experiences at the school, at St Joseph's, have had on
21 your life? You deal with this in your statement, but if
22 I can just ask you to summarise how you see it.

23 A. Right. My time at St Joseph's was a mix of times when
24 everything felt very normal and constructive and useful,
25 and there were other times which were very destructive

1 and confusing. It was those destructive and confusing
2 times that I had no idea how to deal with because there
3 didn't seem to be any conduit I could take them down
4 that would help me.

5 As a result of my time at St Joe's, through the
6 early part of my twenties, late teens, I suffered
7 periods of very deep depression, clinical depression,
8 for which I was given medical treatment, drug treatment,
9 and also psychiatry.

10 I limped along from one period of depression to
11 another, and in between times managed to hold things
12 together more or less successfully.

13 A major turning point was going to [REDACTED]
14 College of Arts to be accepted. For a start there were
15 only 30 places and they had in excess of 300 applicants,
16 so to get a place there seemed like that was an
17 achievement. The course itself was very searching, very
18 demanding, and I enjoyed it enormously, but there was no
19 hiding place, so I had to drop all my weirdness. There
20 was no more of that anymore.

21 My periods of depression were less severe, they came
22 and they went, and were less destructive, they came and
23 they went. If I look at my history of relationships for
24 quite a large chunk of my life, it's relationships which
25 had been marred by the fact of my depression, my

1 inability to actually sustain productive and good
2 relationships for any period of time.

3 Q. I think you mention in your statement that the impact on
4 relationships with family and partners would be the main
5 collateral damage.

6 A. Yes, oh yes. Damage to myself too because I went
7 through a period when I was drinking to a dangerous
8 level.

9 Q. You mention an occasion when you were in the countryside
10 with your wife and you saw a building and something
11 happened.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Can you explain that to me?

14 A. Yes. It's near Rochdale and it's a place called
15 Hopwood Hall and it had been, I think, a seminary, but
16 the architecture was so similar to the architecture of
17 St Joseph's College, and I was standing looking at this
18 building, and the dark windows and all of that, and
19 something happened.

20 My wife noticed it and she said, "What's happened,
21 what's the matter?" I told her, "This reminds me of
22 St Joseph's", and I realised then that there was a lot
23 of, so to speak, stuff that I needed to find a way to
24 deal with because it was still there and it had that
25 power over me.

1 Q. You have a section in your statement where you deal with
2 records, and something in particular you say there is
3 that another boy told you that whilst he was in
4 Brother MLD's room, he saw an entry in
5 a diary.

6 A. Mm.

7 Q. First of all, can you tell me when you heard this from
8 the other boy?

9 A. Yes. That was the time in the senior division when --
10 and he was one of the boys who had access to
11 Brother MLD's study for making tea and
12 coffee during study in the evening.

13 Q. So this was something you were told while you were
14 at the school?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And what were you told about the diary?

17 A. Is it okay if I name the person who told me?

18 Q. If you say his first name.

19 A. Okay, [REDACTED].

20 LADY SMITH: I think everybody in the room will remember
21 that all children's names are subject to anonymity
22 outside this room.

23 A. Okay.

24 LADY SMITH: His first name was [REDACTED]?

25 A. [REDACTED]. He told me -- he said, "In

1 Brother MLD's diary for last week, written
2 across one of the days is 'homosex in dorm'. He said,
3 "What do you think that's about?" and of course I had no
4 idea. But yes, he'd seen that.

5 MS MACLEOD: What do you make of that comment?

6 A. What I make of it was that there were things going on
7 that brothers were aware of to the extent that an entry
8 was made in a brother's diary.

9 Q. So did you understand that to be that somebody had made
10 an allegation about something or --

11 A. It was just "homosex in dorm" so that's what we
12 conjectured about, what could that mean.

13 Q. I see.

14 In the final section of your statement, Thomas, you
15 set out lessons which you think ought to be learned and
16 perhaps we can look at that; it's paragraph 233 onwards.
17 One point you make is that you think there needs to be
18 supervision of the supervisors.

19 A. Mm, yes. I say there needs to be supervision of
20 supervisors because it's too easy for someone in
21 a position of supervision just to keep things to
22 themselves, to authorise themselves. If the supervisor
23 isn't supervised, then the supervisor's not accountable.
24 For me, at St Joseph's this was one of the issues, there
25 was no accountability, no one holding another to

1 account.

2 Q. And in relation to the matter of discipline, you suggest
3 that that should involve more than one person.

4 A. Yes, I believe so. I've worked in systems where the
5 person being disciplined always had an advocate and the
6 advocate's responsibility was to challenge the person
7 who was raising the matter of discipline so that
8 what was done was seen to be fair and clearly understood
9 and not arbitrary.

10 Q. Another point you make is that:

11 "Any child at any school needs to have the knowledge
12 of an outside channel of communication."

13 A. Yes. I suppose these days, you might talk about
14 Childline as being a conduit, but at that time there was
15 nothing that I knew of or anybody else knew of.
16 Something of that nature, yes, where you've got a place
17 where you can speak in confidence.

18 Q. You mention in loco parentis and that the
19 Marist Brothers were in effect in loco parentis. You go
20 on to say:

21 "There should be an increased amount of definition
22 and description of what that is."

23 A. Yes, I don't think that acting in loco parentis should
24 be something that someone is free to make up. If you're
25 acting in loco parentis, there should be a concrete

1 understandable set of metrics of how to behave in loco
2 parentis.

3 Q. In relation to your hopes for this inquiry, you says
4 that:

5 "[You] don't think they will ever be able to prevent
6 people who want to abuse making their way into positions
7 of trust where they have access to young children."

8 A. Mm. Yes, I think what can be done is to understand --
9 and my story, I hope, will be helpful in some small way
10 to that -- to understand how to design organisations, to
11 design out the opportunity that predatory individuals
12 take advantage of. Sometimes predatory individuals have
13 a responsibility for actually designing the
14 organisations, so they design in those opportunities.

15 Q. In the very final paragraph of your statement, 238,
16 I wonder if you could read that out for the inquiry.

17 A. Okay:

18 "I'm looking at the inquiry as an opportunity to
19 finish something which has been going on for quite
20 a long time in my life. When I discovered the inquiry,
21 I thought that I had a little to say that could be
22 a small piece of what I think is a very much bigger
23 picture. It is an opportunity to say my piece and have
24 done with it. My hope is that the future will be
25 different. My hope is that steps are taken to protect

1 the future of children under the care of others."

2 MS MACLEOD: Thank you, Thomas. I don't have any more
3 questions for you today.

4 My Lady, I am not aware of any questions having been
5 submitted for Thomas.

6 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
7 questions of Thomas? No.

8 Thomas, that does complete all the questions we have
9 for you here today. It simply remains for me to
10 thank you very much for your engagement with the
11 inquiry. In an exercise of self-deprecation, I hope,
12 you say you had just a little to say; you've actually
13 provided us with an enormous amount of detail, both in
14 your written statement and coming here today and drawing
15 on what's obviously a very clear recollection, so
16 I thank you very, very much for that, and I'm able now
17 to let you go.

18 A. Thank you, my Lady. Thank you for this opportunity.

19 (The witness withdrew)

20 LADY SMITH: Ms MacLeod, where does that leave us?

21 MS MACLEOD: That leaves us at the end of the evidence for
22 today and for this week. We have three witnesses lined
23 up to give oral evidence on Tuesday.

24 LADY SMITH: Very well. I will rise now until 10 o'clock on
25 Tuesday morning.

1 (1.07 pm)

2 (The inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am

3 on Tuesday, 8 October 2019)

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

JOHN CHRISTOPHER McCALL (sworn)	1
Questions from MR MacAULAY	1
"THOMAS" (sworn)	50
Questions from Ms MacLEOD	50

1

2

3

4