

1 Tuesday, 8 October 2019

2 (10.00 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning and welcome to the resumption of  
4 our case study in the provision of residential care by  
5 the Marist Brothers in St Joseph's School and  
6 St Columba's School in Dumfriesshire on one hand and in  
7 Largs on the other.

8 We return to the oral evidence of witnesses this  
9 morning and I think, Ms MacLeod, you're going to  
10 introduce it; is that right?

11 MS MACLEOD: Good morning, my Lady, yes. The first witness  
12 is ready, he wishes to remain anonymous and to use the  
13 pseudonym "James".

14 "JAMES" (sworn)

15 LADY SMITH: I can hear that the microphone seems to be in  
16 a good position to pick up your voice. Ms MacLeod will  
17 explain what she wants you to do with the red folder in  
18 a moment and, if you're ready, I'll hand over to  
19 Ms MacLeod and she will explain what happens next.

20 Questions from MS MacLEOD

21 MS MACLEOD: Good morning, James.

22 A. Good morning.

23 Q. You've provided a statement for the inquiry and there's  
24 a copy of that in the folder in front of you; it'll also  
25 come up on the screen in front of you.

1           Can I begin by asking you to turn to the final page  
2           of the statement. I'll give the reference of the  
3           statement for the transcript: WIT.001.002.4468. Looking  
4           at the final page, have you signed the statement?

5       A. I have.

6       Q. In the very last paragraph do you say:

7           "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
8           published as part of the evidence to the inquiry"?

9       A. I do.

10      Q. And do you go on to say:

11           "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
12           statement are true, although I would point out that 40  
13           or 50 years down the line, memory can play false"?

14      A. Correct. I have one question if I may: I have  
15           a different reference number at the top of the sheet.

16      Q. I see. The reference number I gave was actually for the  
17           first page of the statement.

18      A. That's all right.

19      Q. The reference number for the final page is  
20           WIT.001.002.4490.

21      A. Correct.

22      Q. I don't need your date of birth, James, but to give  
23           a time frame, can you confirm that you were born in  
24           1957?

25      A. That's right.

1 Q. And are you now 62 years old?

2 A. I am.

3 Q. You begin by setting out for the inquiry some background  
4 to your life before you went to boarding school and I'll  
5 just touch on that with you. I think you tell us that  
6 you lived in Paisley; is that correct?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. Was that with your parents and your grandmother?

9 A. Correct.

10 Q. And you went to a local primary school initially in  
11 Paisley?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Can you remember the decision being taken while you were  
14 at primary school that you would move to St Columba's in  
15 Largs?

16 A. Not in any great detail, but I remember there was  
17 a discussion that took place between my parents and my  
18 cousin's parents, so the net result was we both went.

19 Q. You mention that you went to St Columba's with your  
20 first cousin.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And did you go to St Columba's when you were around  
23 8 years old?

24 A. That's right.

25 Q. Was that in 1965?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Essentially, James, you go on to tell us that, broadly  
3 speaking, your time at St Columba's was a positive  
4 experience.

5 A. Very much so.

6 Q. How many children were at St Columba's when you arrived  
7 there in 1965?

8 A. I think I've said in here that there were a total of  
9 about 50, of whom about 33 were boarders at any one  
10 time, the remainder being day boys from the area.

11 Q. What about the age range of boys?

12 A. We were all between 8 and 11.

13 Q. Who was the SNR [REDACTED] of the school?

14 A. [REDACTED], Brother MJD [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] Brother Nilus,  
15 if I remember correctly.

16 Q. And other than the SNR [REDACTED] were there an any of  
17 other brothers caring for the boys?

18 A. There were. Principal among them, the person that would  
19 stick most in my mind was Brother Germanus. There was  
20 also Brother Douglas, Brother MLA [REDACTED], and an elderly  
21 brother, retired, Brother MFN [REDACTED]

22 (Pause)

23 Q. I will put a photograph on the screen, if that's all  
24 right with you, James, of the exterior of St Columba's.  
25 It's at CFS.001.012.0666.



1 A. I think that's slightly before my time, but yes, that's  
2 the building.

3 Q. We don't have a specific date for the photograph.

4 A. I think that's Victorian, so it's quite a while before  
5 me.

6 Q. Looking at the school on that building, is that the  
7 building where the school was when you were there?

8 A. Yes, it is. There are a number of differences with my  
9 memory, obviously. The gardens were not quite so  
10 splendid and the greenhouse was getting a bit sad.  
11 There was also a Nissen hut to the right of the  
12 greenhouse as we look at the picture, which we used as  
13 a sort of recreation hall.

14 Q. If we stick with the main building first of all, looking  
15 at the ground floor, can you recall what the rooms were  
16 used for?

17 A. The two bottom rooms facing us to the right and the left  
18 of the main were both classrooms. Behind the right-hand  
19 one, in other words behind the one -- the more  
20 dramatically curved of the bays was, if I recall  
21 correctly, Brother MJD office. Then at the back of  
22 the hall was an alleyway going down, past a small  
23 dining room used by the brothers, to the main dining  
24 room which we used.

25 Q. Was the main dining room and kitchen area at the back on

1 the ground floor?

2 A. Yes, on the ground floor.

3 Q. What about the first floor then?

4 A. The two rooms above were both dormitories. The one on  
5 the right was one I remember actually being ill in, and  
6 being as sick as a parrot because everyone else was out  
7 and I was stuck, on a beautiful sunny day, in my bed.

8 The window in the middle, I can't remember. One  
9 assumes that would be something like a shower room or  
10 some such, but I can't honestly remember that. And the  
11 one on the left was a --

12 Q. The first floor, in the main, was that used as  
13 accommodation for the boys?

14 A. Yes. And an attic. There's a little window right  
15 at the top. That was used as well.

16 Q. As a dormitory for the boys?

17 A. Yes, as a dormitory.

18 Q. I think you tell us in your statement that  
19 Brother Germanus had a room in that building. Where was  
20 his room?

21 A. He was right up at the top because the younger boys --  
22 as you got a bit older, you got a bit further away from  
23 authority, if you like. The ones who were more likely  
24 to sleep badly or be a bit homesick were usually assumed  
25 to be the younger ones and he was right up in a tiny

1           little cuddy at the top.

2           Q. Was that on the attic level?

3           A. On the attic level, yes.

4           Q. Was Brother Germanus the only brother that stayed over  
5           in the house?

6           A. In that area, yes. What you can't see on the view here  
7           is behind the tree on the left there is a path, or there  
8           was a path, going up to what I assume to have been  
9           servants' quarters and a coach house in the days  
10          relevant to this particular photograph, which was  
11          subsequently used as accommodation for the other  
12          brothers.

13          Q. The conservatory building that we seen, annexed to the  
14          house, what was that used for in your time?

15          A. We used it as a boot room, so it was a bit scruffy.

16          Q. And you have mentioned a Nissen hut.

17          A. Yes.

18          Q. Where was that in relation to the conservatory?

19          A. To the right of the glasshouse, the conservatory, and  
20          where all those trees are now -- or were then. It was  
21          put in there presumably some time after the war for  
22          whatever purpose, but we used it as a rec room.

23          Q. So is that for -- what did you have, games --

24          A. It had, from memory, a sort of table football table or  
25          something similar, there was a table tennis table.

1           A lot of seats. A very wonky floor. That's about all  
2           I can remember, I'm afraid.

3       Q. I'm going to put one more image on the screen, which  
4           perhaps shows the back of the building. That's at  
5           CFS.001.012.0664. It's quite small, but hopefully  
6           we can zoom in on it.

7       A. Right.

8       Q. I don't know if you recognise that angle, James.

9       A. Yes, except that by my time that was all grass. The  
10           path was still there but everything else was grass  
11           because -- well, I certainly didn't think -- there was  
12           no full-time gardener employed.

13      Q. So do we see the main house then in the top right of  
14           that photograph?

15      A. Yes.

16      Q. That long building along the back of the house, is that  
17           the kitchen area?

18      A. No, the kitchen -- yes and no. The kitchen is  
19           probably -- you'll see there's a chimney at the  
20           left-hand side of the long low bit and then another one  
21           in the middle. At the right-hand end is roughly where  
22           the kitchen would have been.

23      Q. I see.

24      A. The other bit filling in the gap would have been the  
25           dining room we used. Funny little place at the back,

1           roughly between the two left-hand windows, I think, it  
2           has changed a little bit -- and I remember practising  
3           the piano in there of an evening. I was the world's  
4           worst pianist, which is why they probably kept me way  
5           out of the way at the back. But that was where I did --  
6           the screen's gone blank.

7           That was where I played the piano and it was in the  
8           same line as the dining room.

9           Q. And the window that we see just above that lower  
10          building, are these the windows of the first floor  
11          dormitories?

12         A. They are.

13         Q. And the window at the very top, is that the back window  
14          of the attic floor?

15         A. Yes, it is.

16         Q. To the left of the photograph we see another building,  
17          a white building; what was that in your time?

18         A. That was a private house, as I recall. The only other  
19          building that was of any significance to the school was  
20          on the other side, which was Northfield, which was  
21          subsequently in fact bought by the brothers after I'd  
22          left and became part of the school. In fact, it still  
23          survives as a building, whereas St Columba's, of course,  
24          is now a collection of houses.

25         Q. Do you recall if St Columba's or any of these other

1 buildings had particular names during your time?

2 A. This one was -- it began with an L. Landour House.

3 Q. Which one was Landour House?

4 A. St Columba's.

5 Q. You've told me about Brother Germanus' room. Where did  
6 the other brothers sleep?

7 A. This coach house area that you can't actually see off  
8 the right-hand side of this picture and off the  
9 left-hand side of the previous picture. They were  
10 cottage level -- a bit like this bit at the back but  
11 turned through 90 degrees and running parallel to the  
12 house.

13 Q. Was that a completely separate building?

14 A. A completely separate building, yes.

15 Q. Did that have a name?

16 A. No. It was, as far as I know, just in times gone by,  
17 the coach house.

18 Q. Thank you for looking at those photographs for me.

19 Looking at the dormitories themselves, are you able  
20 to give me an idea of how boys were divided in the  
21 dormitories? Was it by age or something else?

22 A. Generally by age. As I say, you kind of got promoted on  
23 the way down.

24 Q. So do I take it for that that the most junior, younger  
25 boys were the on top floor --

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. -- and as you grew older you went down the floors?

3 A. Yes, that's to the best of my memory.

4 Q. So when you started in the school, which level of  
5 dormitory were you in?

6 A. From memory, I was in the forward-facing bit of that  
7 attic that you see.

8 Q. At the front?

9 A. Yes, from memory.

10 Q. Looking at the front of the building?

11 A. Yes, looking at the front of the building, yes.

12 Q. How close were you then to Brother Germanus' room?

13 A. Probably from here to the fire extinguishers, roughly  
14 I should think. Not in a straight line.

15 Q. It would take you a few seconds to walk?

16 A. Probably, yes.

17 Q. What was Brother Germanus' role in relation to the  
18 dormitories?

19 A. I suppose you could say a kind of warden, in effect his  
20 entire duties because he looked after us on trips and  
21 things like that. He tended, I suppose, to be a bit  
22 like Mary Poppins, I imagine, if you want to use that as  
23 an analogy.

24 Q. So would he be involved, for example, in the morning  
25 routine, getting boys up and boys going to bed?

1       A. I honestly can't recall that. If you said to me,  
2       "Do you remember getting out of bed in the morning and  
3       getting dressed?" I don't. I just really remember  
4       breakfast. Maybe, you know ...

5       Q. What about through the night? Did Brother Germanus have  
6       any role?

7       A. If -- I only remember there being one occasion. We had  
8       a lot of high wind -- and in fact there will be those of  
9       us may recall that there was a very large storm in about  
10      1967/1968 -- in fact, one of those chimneys came down.  
11      I think that wasn't while we were there, I think we  
12      might have been on holiday or something, it might even  
13      have been after I left.

14             But I remember there were a lot of high winds on  
15      occasion and there being a lot of trees round the  
16      buildings that were -- the houses that were there, quite  
17      mature trees. A lot of the younger boys got disturbed  
18      by the noise, because it did wail and scream, and  
19      I remember him being quite busy trying to run round  
20      after people, but that's only one night that I recall.

21      Q. And otherwise, would he be aware of what was going on  
22      in the dormitories? Would he be able to hear what was  
23      going on, for example?

24      A. Only -- unless he had got ears like a bat I suspect he'd  
25      only hear what was going on in the attic level.



1           Those of us on the next level down would probably  
2           have got away with murder and quite literally got away  
3           with it.

4       Q.   In your statement -- and this may be in relation to the  
5           top level -- you say that:

6           "Brother Germanus could hear a pin drop from his  
7           room."

8       A.   Pretty well. I remember that particular night, when  
9           I didn't think the wind was particularly loud, but  
10          people started to move around and get disturbed and  
11          he was in there like a shot. You could hear his voice,  
12          "It's all right, it's okay".

13      Q.   Would you hear him come into the rooms or would he have  
14          occasion to check on the boys during the night, anything  
15          like that?

16      A.   As I recall only in response to a problem because when  
17          you went to bed that was it, he was gone.

18      Q.   So would boys call out during the night or become upset?

19      A.   On occasion that I remember. There's really only this  
20          one night that stands out in my mind.

21      Q.   You mention that he was quite a light sleeper; is that  
22          something you remember?

23      A.   As I say, because of this business of being able to hear  
24          things drop, hear the pin drop, I remember he did say if  
25          anybody wanted -- this is only just beginning vaguely to

1           come back to me -- I remember him saying that if anybody  
2           wanted anything, they were to call. So he was  
3           confident, I think, that he would hear us.

4       Q. Did boys wet the bed while you were at the school?

5       A. Do you know, specifically ... I remember one chap who  
6           did, I imagine he wouldn't be alone, but we were young  
7           boys, so I suppose, yes, it probably did happen.

8       Q. And do you remember how that was dealt with by the  
9           school or the staff?

10      A. I'm afraid not, really, no.

11      Q. Something you mention is writing home to your family,  
12           and that's something you had an opportunity to do.

13      A. Yes.

14      Q. Was that in any way supervised?

15      A. Yes. That would be on a Saturday morning and we were  
16           expected to produce for inspection -- you know, we were  
17           expected to cover one side of the piece of paper, about  
18           A5 size. We weren't expected to be Shakespeare or  
19           anything, but we were expected to write something.

20      Q. Was there a particular brother who managed that process?

21      A. In my memory it's Brother MLA I remember doing  
22           that, but whether that was true all the way through,  
23           I can't remember.

24      Q. You talk about some happy memories that you have of the  
25           school, you tell us about trips and things that you went

1           on, including boat trips.

2       A.   Yes.

3       Q.   You mentioned already earlier in your evidence a day  
4           when you were ill and couldn't go --

5       A.   Yes.

6       Q.   -- on a trip.

7       A.   Yes.

8       Q.   And I think you tell us that Brother Germanus came into  
9           your room on that occasion and gave you something.

10      A.   A very few minutes before the boys were due to go, he  
11          turned up with a bottle of lemonade -- and it was  
12          Lawson's, I remember that very vividly, who used to  
13          illustrate their labels with pictures of the steamers  
14          that used to go up and down the Clyde. He plonked this  
15          down beside me and, I think, some biscuits and said, we  
16          will back at, whatever, sorry you are missing it, and  
17          then I heard the van go and that was them, they were  
18          off, and I was not happy.

19      Q.   Can you just tell me a little bit about  
20          Brother Germanus, what he was like as a person?

21      A.   Quiet. I would have said fairly unflappable. A good  
22          way of illustrating that, I suppose -- there was along  
23          the front in Largs a little miniature zoo, long gone,  
24          and the promenade went from a house called Vanduara,  
25          which is now, I think, flats, in a large sweeping curve

1 past this miniature zoo, past Nardini's, eventually if  
2 you carried on far enough, you can still get out to the  
3 Pencil at Fairlie, and we used to roller skate along  
4 there. So if you imagine 33 giggling boys going off in  
5 different directions and one chap with a beret and a  
6 pipe on roller skates at the back, herding us all.

7 Q. Is that Brother Germanus?

8 A. That was Brother Germanus.

9 I think you had to be fairly laid-back in order to  
10 cope with that, from subsequent experience with crowds  
11 of youngsters ...

12 Q. How would you describe his manner and interactions with  
13 the boys?

14 A. I would have said relatively easygoing. He wasn't  
15 someone who you'd consider to be a martinet in any way.  
16 He didn't come across as being hard or he didn't come  
17 across as being in any way aggressive. He was the sort  
18 of person whom I personally had no difficulty in  
19 relating to. That I do remember.

20 Q. I think you develop that in paragraph 76 of your  
21 statement where you say that:

22 "Brother Germanus was the sort of guy who would pick  
23 up and care for small birds and animals."

24 A. Yes, he was. That's the impression I had of him and it  
25 sticks pretty vividly in my memory.

1 Q. Aside from Brother Germanus, was your main contact with  
2 the other brothers in the school setting?

3 A. Well, yes --

4 Q. The classroom setting?

5 A. Yes. Except on occasion, of course, if there was any  
6 news to be broken or any problems, you'd potentially see  
7 the SNR [REDACTED] I only ever remember seeing  
8 Brother MJD [REDACTED] in that context on one occasion; I can't  
9 remember what the topic was. I don't think I'd been  
10 particularly out of order, but he was quite a gentle  
11 sort of chap as well.

12 Q. St Columba's, being a primary school, were you in a  
13 classroom with the one teacher teaching you all  
14 subjects?

15 A. If you go back to that photograph, the room on the right  
16 on the bottom, to the right of the door, was, as  
17 I recall, the senior of the three classrooms. You  
18 started off, I think, in the one to the left. You then  
19 went through to the one behind it, because there's only  
20 three years of us, and then you ended up in the one  
21 in the front on the right. That was the one that I have  
22 probably most memories of. Brother MLA [REDACTED] was our  
23 class master at that point.

24 Q. How did you find the level of teaching, of education?

25 A. Well, I don't think I did too badly, insofar as

1 subsequently going some years further forward -- I've  
2 still got some of my reports from schools and letters  
3 from my parents and things, and I seem to have done all  
4 right at primary. So I certainly was very content where  
5 I was to the extent that when asked where I wanted to  
6 go, both my cousin and I said, "We'll go to  
7 St Joseph's", because you don't stop to think about cost  
8 when you're only 11.

9 Q. Can I ask you about discipline at St Columba's and how  
10 that was managed. Did you get a sense that there was  
11 a particular brother in charge of discipline?

12 A. Not really. The ultimate sanction was the SNR [REDACTED],  
13 but I never remember being in any vast pile of poo that  
14 would have required me to be in front of Brother MJD [REDACTED]  
15 Maybe that was just luck because I don't think I was any  
16 better than any of the others.

17 Q. if we look at discipline in the classroom, first of  
18 all, if a teacher required to discipline a boy, what  
19 would happen?

20 A. I have to say that discipline, if in terms of  
21 discipline, tellings-off, beltings -- I don't remember  
22 that as a particularly prominent feature of my life  
23 there. Not at all.

24 In fact, even moving forward to St Joseph's, I only  
25 remember one occasion there.

1 Q. Do you remember any occasion where corporal punishment  
2 was used at St Columba's?

3 A. No, I don't, actually. I'm in doubt in that era it  
4 probably was; I just don't recall it.

5 Q. And you go on to tell us that indeed you never felt you  
6 had a problem with anything that might be considered  
7 abusive while you were at St Columba's?

8 A. Not in the least.

9 Q. How would you summarise for the inquiry the three years  
10 that you spent at St Columba's?

11 A. I was very happy. Talking to my parents about it  
12 afterwards when I'd finished school and I'd gone through  
13 university and things, they remembered me being happy  
14 and they were content that it should be so. That was  
15 why I imagine that when we decided we wanted to move on,  
16 they were happy with that.

17 Q. Indeed, you tell us that you and your cousin were  
18 presented with four choices or thereabouts.

19 A. We were, yes.

20 Q. And you chose to go to St Joseph's from St Columba's?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. And did you start St Joseph's in the [REDACTED] of 1968?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. In terms of -- St Joseph's would have been a bigger  
25 school?

1 A. And a lot further away. It was much bigger. As  
2 I recall, there were -- there was a very small junior  
3 school, I think about two classes maximum, and six years  
4 with probably three classes in each year, so  
5 considerably larger.

6 Q. On the point of being further away, I should have asked  
7 you previously: while you were at St Columba's, did your  
8 family visit you?

9 A. Oh yes.

10 Q. Quite regularly?

11 A. The way it worked was I saw my own mum and dad every  
12 second week and aunt and uncle every other week.

13 Q. They came and saw you and your cousin together?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. And as you've just mentioned there, St Joseph's was  
16 further away from home?

17 A. Oh yes.

18 Q. You mention that St Joseph's had divisions --

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. -- in the school. Can you just tell me about that?

21 A. The junior division was essentially the first year, so  
22 what you'd call F1 or S1 nowadays.

23 Q. Was that known as "the wee-rec"?

24 A. It was indeed, yes.

25 Q. Then from there --



1       A. The intermediate division or the inters. Then middle  
2       division and then ultimately the two years of the senior  
3       division.

4       Q. Do you remember if there were also some primary school  
5       years?

6       A. Just the two years. I don't remember whether that was  
7       still running by the time I left, I couldn't honestly  
8       tell you that, but I was conscious of them being there  
9       when I first started. I think it might have faded out  
10      at that point, I'm really not sure. I do remember on  
11      the ground floor of the Big Mount, which was the red  
12      sandstone building behind the main building, there were  
13      two junior classrooms. As I say, I don't know how long  
14      that continued after -- I generally cannot remember.

15      Q. I'll now put a photograph on the screen for you. That  
16      is at INQ.001.004.2710.

17      A. Gosh.

18      Q. This is an aerial view.

19      A. That's a golden oldie as well!

20      Q. Again, we don't have a date for this photograph. Do you  
21      recognise the school --

22      A. Oh yes.

23      Q. -- in the centre?

24      A. Oh yes.

25      Q. Then to the back of the school, do we see there are

1 a number of buildings --

2 A. Right.

3 Q. -- to the left?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. Is that the chapel?

6 A. That's the chapel, yes. It was built as a memorial  
7 chapel for the First World War.

8 Q. Moving on from the chapel, to the right of the chapel,  
9 what was that building?

10 A. That was known as the Big Mount. What its proper name  
11 was, I have no idea, if indeed it had one. The building  
12 to the right of it, which is a low-lying white building,  
13 was the Wee Mount. They were joined -- there's a rising  
14 piece of ground between them and there was  
15 a concrete-slab bridge with railings going across to the  
16 first floor of the Big Mount from the level of the  
17 Wee Mount.

18 Q. So from the Big Mount to the Wee Mount?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Looking at the Big Mount, what was that building used  
21 for?

22 A. By my time, as I say, there were two junior classrooms  
23 on the ground floor. I can't honestly remember what the  
24 rest was used for. But moving up into it, the top --  
25 the only bit that I remember vividly was the top bit,

1           which was part of the senior division accommodation.

2           When you reached sixth year you didn't just get  
3           a room of your own -- not everybody did in fifth year,  
4           but they only had curtains, but when you got to sixth  
5           year, you got a door and you'd really arrived.

6       Q.   What about the Wee Mount, what was that used for?

7       A.   That was where the brothers lived.

8       Q.   Did any brothers live in the Big Mount?

9       A.   I can't honestly remember. I suspect they must have  
10       done, but I don't honestly know.

11      Q.   I'll now put another photograph on the screen:

12           INQ.001.004.2715. This photograph shows the back of the  
13           school.

14      A.   That's much more recent. That's changed enormously.

15      Q.   This is a more recent photograph. Again, we don't have  
16           a date, I'm afraid.

17      A.   Well, it must be within the last 15 or 20 years,  
18           I should think, because the extension on the left, with  
19           the moss all over the roof, is not as it was when I was  
20           there. That I did know had been rebuilt. All those  
21           prefabricated things are what was a major playing field.

22      Q.   To the top of the photograph?

23      A.   Yes.

24      Q.   If we look at the main building, in the photograph to  
25           the left of that, was that building there during your

1 time?

2 A. Yes, that was built, I think, in the mid-1960s, so it  
3 was there by the time I arrived, and it wasn't -- it  
4 didn't, as I say, look like that, it's been completely  
5 built round.

6 It contained the assembly hall, which I think it  
7 probably still does, looking at the way that's  
8 configured, the labs, physics, chemistry and biology,  
9 and the geography room. There was one small extension  
10 of the intermediate dormitory in it as well, and the art  
11 department, which would be the top floor to your left as  
12 you look at that, looking out over the flat roof -- and  
13 you'll see that there is a circular mark in among the  
14 moss. Up above that there was a little observatory on  
15 there, made of fibreglass -- and damn cold in the  
16 winter.

17 Q. An area you mention in your statement is the Ranch.

18 A. What remains of it can be seen in the topmost tree.  
19 There was an old --

20 Q. James, the photograph is actually on a screen behind  
21 you. Perhaps you could point out the Ranch for me.

22 A. That's the remains of it there (indicating).

23 Q. I see. Where the main road is on the photograph, at the  
24 very top?

25 A. Yes. It didn't have any access from the main road by my

1 time, but it would have had a door onto that at some  
2 point, I imagine.

3 Q. Was that a recreational area for seniors?

4 A. For the senior division, yes.

5 Q. Thank you for looking at the photographs.

6 Turning now to your recollection of the school roll  
7 of St Joseph's, how many boys were there during your  
8 time, roughly?

9 A. Roughly 500 I should think -- but that's a little bit  
10 finger in the air.

11 Q. And the majority of them were boarders?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Did the school start admitting girls while you were  
14 there?

15 A. One or two. I think by the time I left there had been  
16 maybe four, five, something like that.

17 Q. Who was the SNR [REDACTED] of St Joseph's?

18 A. [REDACTED] when I arrived, Brother MYZ [REDACTED], known for  
19 some peculiar reason as MYZ [REDACTED].

20 Q. Did that change during --

21 A. Yes, Brother MMK [REDACTED] who was initially the [REDACTED]  
22 teacher, became the SNR [REDACTED] I can't remember  
23 whether it was in my fifth year or in my sixth year.  
24 I can't honestly remember.

25 Q. You mention a Brother MFI [REDACTED]

1 A. Yes, a [REDACTED] teacher.

2 Q. Was he your [REDACTED] teacher?

3 A. Briefly. For his sins, he only had me very briefly.

4 Brother CIPHER WIT had me for a bit longer and then one of  
5 the lay teachers had to put up with my, because my [REDACTED]  
6 was appalling.

7 Q. And Brother Francis is someone else you mention.

8 A. Biology teacher.

9 Q. You tell us a little bit about the matron in your  
10 statement; what was she like?

11 A. I only have this image and a faint recollection of the  
12 voice: a bit of a battle-axe, not very tall, somebody  
13 who if she told you were staying in your bed, you by and  
14 large didn't argue, you tended to stay there. It's one  
15 of these things where you have more of an image than  
16 anything else. But she was certainly in charge of her  
17 domain.

18 Q. If you had an issue or a problem that you wanted to  
19 raise with somebody at the school, who would you raise  
20 it with?

21 A. Initially, in the more junior parts of the school,  
22 Brother CIPHER WIT was the brother in charge of the  
23 wee-rec and you would take things to him.

24 Brother MLX was in charge of the inters at the time  
25 I had -- I think I mention in my statement my

1           grandmother dying and it was him who came to tell us  
2           that our parents were coming to take us home to gran's  
3           funeral and things.

4       Q.   So would it then be the brother who was in charge of  
5           your division, as it were?

6       A.   By and large it would be, yes.

7       Q.   When you started in the wee-rec, and you have mentioned  
8           Brother [CIPHER WIT] already, was he looking after that  
9           division?

10      A.   Yes.

11      Q.   What was he like?

12      A.   You always got the impression he was gruff and a bit  
13           grumpy but, by and large, if you needed something he was  
14           there. He was, again, just a feature of my life. You  
15           accepted it, I didn't have any problem with it. He had  
16           his own idiosyncrasies, I suppose, looking back in time.  
17           But he played an active part in what went on, driving  
18           vans and things, kids going hither and thither, which  
19           was pretty good considering he had [REDACTED].

20           I can almost remember his face, but more than  
21           that ... I just was not afraid of him -- no, slightly  
22           in awe of him because he did exercise discipline with  
23           a bit of a rod of iron and if you transgressed, you got  
24           warned, and if did you it again you were in trouble.

25      Q.   And if you were in trouble what did that entail?



1       A. I can't remember whether I mentioned it in here, but the  
2       one thing that does stick out -- he used to be in charge  
3       of part of the dining area because not everybody fitted  
4       into the main dining hall, so there were a couple of  
5       subsidiary bits. In one of these subsidiary bits, you  
6       sat in sixes, and one chap was in late for lunch one day  
7       and we ate his chips. When he came in, he sounded off  
8       big style and went and complained to Brother CIPHER WITH  
9       so he came along and enquired who had pinched the chips,  
10      and we'd all pinched his chips, so we all got a rap on  
11      the hand with the belt. And then at the end that he  
12      said, "You too: (a) for turning up late and (b) for  
13      coming and complaining". So that's --

14     Q. I think you mention that he belted the boy who was late  
15     as well.

16     A. He belted the lad as well for being late.

17     Q. And in the dormitory context, did he have a belt in that  
18     area?

19     A. I don't remember one up in the -- he had one, but  
20     I don't remember it being exhibited in the dormitory.  
21     Undoubtedly, probably it was, but I don't remember it.

22     Q. Do you remember any boys being punished at all in the  
23     dormitory area?

24     A. I remember one or two people standing by their beds for  
25     some reason or other and I can't remember what that was



1           about, but that was (a) brief and (b) manifestly not  
2           painful.

3           Q. Then when you moved up to the next dormitory area and  
4           were with Brother MLX how did he manage discipline in  
5           the dormitory?

6           A. Again, he was very quiet, not very tall, and I would  
7           have said not inclined to raising his voice. I never  
8           found him anything other than helpful. These are people  
9           you associated with -- firstly, we were 12 and he was in  
10          a position of authority over us, so you tended to accept  
11          that. I don't recall ever having any problems.

12                 The one thing I do remember his character coming out  
13          in, as I say, was when he got my cousin and I together  
14          to tell us about my gran. That was just one of those  
15          things.

16          Q. I think you felt that was appropriately dealt with.

17          A. I thought very much so, very much so. He made sure  
18          we were separated from the rest of the gang to be told  
19          and chivvying two away for a group of kids takes a bit  
20          of doing without making it too obvious, but he did.

21          Q. What about the educational side, the classroom side of  
22          St Joseph's? Being a secondary school, I presume that  
23          you moved around, did you, from class to class?

24          A. Yes, you stayed -- we tended to end up -- I can't  
25          remember how we got streamed in the first year. But the

1 classes were really imaginative, 1A, 1B, 1C, and I think  
2 it was just done alphabetically for the first year, from  
3 memory. I honestly can't remember. But thereafter you  
4 tended to get streamed by marks and the top stream were  
5 obviously expected to be a little bit more successful.  
6 I've still got all my school reports and some, shall we  
7 say, are less glowing than others.

8 Q. But generally, did you find the level of education on  
9 offer to be acceptable?

10 A. Well, yes. It was purely and simply traditional  
11 education. For example, things like the engineering  
12 disciplines, technical drawing, that sort of thing, the  
13 brothers had had to make an arrangement with  
14 Dumfries Academy for anybody who was doing that to go  
15 out to do it because there was no facility for it in the  
16 school. It was maths, English, French, physics,  
17 chemistry, biology. What else? Art, a big art  
18 department. History. There were two characters in the  
19 history department, both lay teachers. I've obviously  
20 left something out, but in the main it was what you  
21 might call traditional education of that period.

22 Q. What about the organisation of discipline in the  
23 classroom setting? How was that managed?

24 A. Well, when you were in and a class was going on, you  
25 were expected to sit at your desk, pay attention and do

1           what you were told. So if you were supposed to be  
2           writing an essay, you were supposed to be writing  
3           an essay.

4           We did homework as well. We did an hour's homework  
5           at night and again you were meant to be there for that  
6           period of time and there would be something moving round  
7           to check and also somebody -- if we had questions or  
8           whatever, we had somebody to deal with those questions.  
9           Sometimes obviously that had to be deferred to the  
10          morning because what you were doing might not have been  
11          that person's subject.

12        Q. Do you recall occasions when children were punished in  
13          classrooms?

14        A. Not specifically, no. Again, I imagine that it did  
15          happen, but I don't remember -- oh, I do tell a lie. We  
16          had a [REDACTED] teacher, MLY? [REDACTED] -- MLY? I think it  
17          was MLY? [REDACTED] I remember someone being a complete  
18          twerp. I don't know what it was, but it was one that  
19          had the rest of us thinking "oops". But what he was  
20          doing is he ended up standing with Mr MLY? [REDACTED] briefcase  
21          in his arm, which was a very heavy briefcase, and after  
22          his hand started to go down like that (indicating), he  
23          said, "Go and sit down now".

24        Q. So he was asked to hold that?

25        A. He was asked to do that, yes.

1 Q. I understand.

2 Was corporal punishment used in the classroom?

3 A. I think so, but again, if you said, give me an example,  
4 I couldn't. The last port of call was the SNR  
5 and I imagine that Brother MYZ did at some point.  
6 Again, maybe I was lucky that it didn't happen to me.

7 Q. You talk about sport in your statement and you tell us  
8 that the school was divided into houses, separate from  
9 the divisions, for sport and I think you were involved  
10 in rugby yourself --

11 A. Yes, until I got injured and then ended up travelling  
12 round a bit with one of the more senior teams just as  
13 a sort of gofer, really.

14 Q. You also tell us about school trips you had to Spain.  
15 Were you also involved in the school choir?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Do you recall there being inspections of the school?

18 A. Yes, there were two kinds, really. The local authority  
19 would from time to time come in, but I don't remember  
20 the details of that, and we'd have a visit from the  
21 regional Marist authorities as well. But that was  
22 more -- I suppose -- I don't know how that worked from  
23 Brother MYZ perspective, I imagine he was being  
24 inspected, but we just turned up, stood up, sat down,  
25 sang, listened, whatever it happened to be for the

1 assembly that went on at the same time. And that was  
2 it. But yes, we were subject to inspection and fairly  
3 frequently.

4 Q. I think you mentioned there came a time during your  
5 being at St Joseph's when you were homesick.

6 A. Yes, in my second year. For the life of me, I cannot  
7 remember why. First year had passed in a sort of blur  
8 without any trouble. And second year, I really  
9 don't ... I really cannot tell you why that happened.

10 Q. Do you recall how you managed that or if you sought help  
11 from anybody in the school?

12 A. Well, where I was at the time was in one of those  
13 extension bits that I mentioned in the newer bit of the  
14 building. The brother in charge of us there was  
15 Brother **AKS** known for some reason as **AKS** He would  
16 occasionally notice that I wasn't -- nothing had changed  
17 and he would ask me what was going on. Of course,  
18 you're not going to admit to anyone that you're feeling  
19 a bit like that, and I didn't -- I tried to conceal it  
20 from my parents and everything as well and I suppose  
21 I just sort of fought my way through that one and  
22 subsequently discovered an alternative kind of sport,  
23 which I got into, and that -- the third year and  
24 subsequent years were fine, no bother at all.

25 Q. You mention in your statement that you were bullied for

1 a time at the school.

2 A. I went to secondary school standing 4 feet 10 and a half  
3 tall, and no more sleek than I am now, so I was a little  
4 tubby chap and quite a lot of the lads weren't, and  
5 I did get ragged a bit for being small and fat.

6 Q. Was that verbal bullying or physical bullying?

7 A. Verbal. I don't really remember anybody -- I mean, kids  
8 get into fights and, yes, I remember one of the brothers  
9 having to sort out a great gaggle of us having a dust-up  
10 in one of the dormitory floors and it was a case of  
11 everybody stand up and everybody get a lecture and  
12 everybody clear out, but I don't know what it was all  
13 about.

14 Q. Did boys run away from St Joseph's?

15 A. Not that I recall. Presumably someone did, but I don't  
16 actually remember -- I certainly don't remember the  
17 police coming charging round looking for anybody, no.

18 Q. Similar to St Columba's, you say that you weren't aware  
19 of any abuse taking place during your time.

20 A. I wasn't. I may have been particularly blind or  
21 particularly naive, but as I also say, my parents were  
22 fairly streetwise and in fact, certainly in  
23 St Columba's, were involved in the parents and friends  
24 and peripherally involved in the parents and friends at  
25 St Joseph's, so there were quite a lot of people with

1 quite a lot of regular contact, and I suspect if any of  
2 them were worried about us, or we'd expressed any  
3 concerns, there would have been at least enquiries, if  
4 not withdrawal, and it didn't happen.

5 Q. You indeed say that, other than the period of  
6 homesickness that you've referred to, you had a great  
7 time at St Joseph's?

8 A. I have again very happy memories. I got a lot more  
9 opportunities and a lot more freedom, I suspect, than  
10 would have been the case had I been living at home and  
11 commuting, say, to Glasgow or something like that.

12 Q. Once you left school, you tell us that you went on to do  
13 medicine at university.

14 A. I did.

15 Q. Indeed you say a lot of your school year went on to do  
16 medicine.

17 A. It was a funny thing. By the time we got to the sixth  
18 form, the school had a bit of a tradition for producing  
19 the things that academic type things do, so doctors,  
20 dentists, lawyers, teachers, that sort of thing, and  
21 most of the people from my year wound up in one of those  
22 disciplines.

23 Q. You tell us that you joined the Naval Reserve as  
24 a student.

25 A. I did.



1 Q. And you remained in uniform, as you put it, serving in  
2 the UK, Europe, the Middle and Far East and the  
3 Mediterranean until you retired in 2015?

4 A. Correct. And I don't know whether I mentioned it in  
5 here, but I actually went back and I had a trainee going  
6 through training and I actually went back for nine  
7 months subsequently, so I finally hung up my uniform at  
8 the beginning of May 2016.

9 Q. Looking back at your time at both St Columba's and  
10 St Joseph's, what impact do you think your time at those  
11 schools has had on your life?

12 A. If I'm honest, I think you had to be fairly nimble and  
13 fairly flexible in your relations with people. Because  
14 it was an all-boys school, probably you could also say  
15 there were a little bits missing, but I had lots of  
16 younger female cousins and that sort of thing. So maybe  
17 that was a failing, maybe single-sex education is not  
18 a good idea, but it seemed to work for me. My own  
19 thoughts are that it stood me in reasonably good stead  
20 when I went to medical school.

21 Subsequently, as I say, my memories, are positive so  
22 I'm not sort of waking up at night, thinking "Oh, if  
23 only". Any mistakes that have been made have been made  
24 by me and not by anybody else.

25 Q. You leave us with some final thoughts, James, towards



1           the end of your statement. In paragraph 157, I think  
2           you provide a quote from Shakespeare --

3       A. Yes.

4       Q. -- and I wondered if you could read that for me --

5       A. Of course.

6       Q. -- and then perhaps explain why you wish to include  
7           that.

8       A. I'll possibly explain first. The reason is that in my  
9           career I've come across situations where people have  
10          been blamed for things, people have been left with the  
11          blame, rightly or wrongly, and that one incident or  
12          couple of incidents have defined what has happened to  
13          them subsequently. All the things that they may have  
14          done previously, which had either been adequate or good,  
15          tend to be overlooked and that is why I quoted  
16          Shakespeare:

17                "The evil that men do lives after them; the good is  
18                oft interred with their bones."

19                I feel that very strongly in a lot of -- not just  
20                here in the school context, but in terms of what has  
21                happened with people I have known and/or worked with in  
22                the past.

23       Q. I see. In the next paragraph you go on to say:

24                "There was huge humanity on display every day of the  
25                week in both schools."

1 A. Yes, I felt so.

2 Q. You say:

3 "People are human and everybody makes mistakes."

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And then you go on to say:

6 "No doubt there will be people out there who will  
7 say I am a fantasist, but frankly I think people will  
8 have memories that assume greater significance to them  
9 than perhaps was the case."

10 A. Yes, and again that comes out of my subsequent  
11 professional career: there are people whose lives have  
12 been defined by a memory that they have to the exclusion  
13 of many other things and that's caused us a lot of  
14 trouble in the service over the years as well.

15 MS MACLEOD: Well, thank you very much, James. I don't have  
16 any further questions for you today.

17 My Lady, I'm not aware of any questions having been  
18 submitted for James.

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Are there any outstanding  
20 applications for questions? No.

21 James, that's all the questions we have for you  
22 today. Thank you very much for engaging with the  
23 inquiry, both by providing your very detailed statement,  
24 covering both schools that we're looking at here, and by  
25 coming along today to explain yourself what evidence

1           you have to give. It has been very helpful and I'm now  
2           able to let you go with my thanks.

3                               (The witness withdrew).

4       MS MACLEOD: My Lady, I think the next witness may be ready  
5           for about 11.15, so if we were to plan for 11.15 and  
6           then perhaps we could update people if there was any  
7           delay.

8       LADY SMITH: Let's do that and we can take an early break,  
9           perhaps.

10                   Thank you.

11       (10.52 am)

12                               (A short break)

13       (11.17 am)

14       LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

15       MR MacAULAY: My Lady, the next witness is an applicant. He  
16           wishes to remain anonymous and to use the name "Edward"  
17           in giving his evidence.

18                               "EDWARD" (sworn)

19       LADY SMITH: Edward, please sit down and make yourself  
20           comfortable.

21                   One important thing to ask you is could you try to  
22           make sure you stay in a good position for the microphone  
23           because we need to hear you through the sound system;  
24           we'll tell you if it's a problem.

25                   If you're ready, I'll hand over to Mr MacAulay and

1           he will explain what happens next; is that all right?

2       A.   Thank you, yes.

3                       Questions from MR MacAULAY

4       MR MacAULAY:   Good morning, Edward.

5       A.   Good morning.

6       Q.   In the red folder in front of you, you'll find your  
7           statement.  I'll give the reference of it for the  
8           transcript: WIT.001.002.8872.  If I could ask you,  
9           Edward, to move on to the last page of the statement,  
10          can you confirm you have signed it?

11      A.   I have, yes.

12      Q.   Do you tell us in the last paragraph:

13                "I have no objection to my witness statement being  
14           published as part of the evidence to the inquiry"?

15                Is that right?

16      A.   That's correct.

17      Q.   Do you go on to say:

18                "I believe the facts stated in this witness  
19           statement are true"?

20      A.   Correct.

21      Q.   Can you confirm for me, Edward, so that we can get  
22           a time frame, that you were born in 1955?

23      A.   Correct.

24      Q.   And I think you're now 64; is that right?

25      A.   Yes.

1 Q. In the early part of your statement, you provide us with  
2 some information about your family background. For  
3 example, you had I think three brothers; is that right?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. You had one brother who was particularly older, there's  
6 quite an age gap between the older of the brothers and  
7 yourself?

8 A. I have a brother 10 years senior to me.

9 Q. You also had one brother who was, I think, younger than  
10 you; is that right?

11 A. One brother younger, yes.

12 Q. And I think, as we'll hear later, he died at a point in  
13 time that was important to you.

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. You provide us with some information about your family  
16 background and where you lived. I think in particular,  
17 you spent the very start of your education in a primary  
18 school in Glasgow; is that correct?

19 A. That's correct, yes.

20 Q. But thereafter, I think you moved to be a day pupil at  
21 St Columba's College in Largs?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. Was at least part of the reasoning for that -- was it  
24 that an older brother was going to go there as a  
25 boarder?

1 A. Yes. My older brother [REDACTED] who was two years my  
2 senior, was going there and because of the age  
3 restrictions, I was taken there at the same time as  
4 a day boy only, becoming a boarder a year later.

5 Q. So what age were you when you went as a day boy?

6 A. Six.

7 Q. And I think that would be about 1961; is that correct?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. By what you've just told us, a year after that, in 1962,  
10 you became a boarder?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. I'll ask you a little bit about the routine. Perhaps  
13 before I do that, I think it's right to say that after  
14 you had been at St Columba's, you moved on to  
15 St Joseph's, Dumfries?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. I think you were there for possibly, what, three or four  
18 years?

19 A. At St Joseph's, possibly five years.

20 Q. Five years?

21 A. Yes, until O-level age, whatever that would be in  
22 Scotland.

23 Q. Okay. We'll come and look at that.

24 Can I just look at some aspects of the routine with  
25 you. Moving on to when you became a boarder, was there

1           a particular part of the building that you looked upon  
2           as your dormitory?

3       A.   In Largs or Dumfries?

4       Q.   In Largs.

5       A.   Yes, a shared bedroom.

6       Q.   When you started off, were you in the top or attic area  
7           of the --

8       A.   No. To the best of my knowledge, one landing up.

9       Q.   How many boys would be in the room with you at that  
10          time?

11      A.   Four or five beds, not always full.

12      Q.   As you got older at the school, did you move from there  
13          to another dormitory?

14      A.   No, that remained my bed for my entirety there.

15      Q.   During your time in that area, were you with boys of  
16          a similar age?

17      A.   Yes, or perhaps a year older. I'm led to believe --  
18          I learned later that I was the youngest at the school  
19          because of the need to join me up with my elder brother  
20          and be there at the same time. I was possibly there  
21          younger than anybody else, but possibly just by many  
22          months or a year.

23      Q.   What you're saying is you didn't share a dormitory or  
24          a bedroom with your older brother?

25      A.   No.

1 Q. Looking at the shower or bathing arrangements, what  
2 can you tell me about that?

3 A. On the same floor as I slept, there was a bathroom,  
4 shower room, a shower similar to -- like a deep, square  
5 bath, an old-fashioned type -- not showers as we know  
6 them today, a standing-up job that you would wash  
7 yourself in, and a bath at the same time, and a WC.  
8 A largish room, you know, on the same landing.

9 Q. Can I ask you a little bit about the brothers whose  
10 names you can remember. Can you help me with that?  
11 First of all, can you remember who the SNR was  
12 when you went there?

13 A. Not when I -- I can't guarantee that when I went there  
14 he was SNR, but the SNR I recall was  
15 a Brother MJD, and that's the only one I can recall.

16 Q. Can you help me then with some of the names of the other  
17 brothers that you had dealings with?

18 A. Well, Brother Germanus is the name that rings most to  
19 me. I struggle with the other names, but there was one  
20 called Brother MLA, who I didn't have much contact  
21 with, but he was a large, flamboyant man. Other than  
22 that, I can't really name other brothers at Largs.

23 Q. I will be looking in a little bit more detail at you and  
24 Brother Germanus, but can I just ask you this: did  
25 Brother Germanus have a room close to where your



1           dormitory was?

2       A.   Yes, but one up, one floor up, or a half landing up,  
3           possibly not even another floor. A half landing up from  
4           where we were.

5       Q.   So he was close to you?

6       A.   Very close, yes.

7       Q.   I'll come back to look at that in a moment.

8           Did you have much contact with your older brother  
9           when you were at St Columba's, as a boarder in  
10          particular?

11       A.   I know he was there, we were there together, I know we  
12           went on to Dumfries and spent time together, but I have  
13           to tell you, sitting here, that my recollection of  
14           interaction with him is very limited. Why, I don't  
15           know. It's one of these things that I can't put my  
16           finger on. I can't remember spending time with him,  
17           I can't remember sharing a laugh or a joke or some  
18           sweets with him. But it's something I can't explain to  
19           you, you know. My involvement with him at both places  
20           is very shallow and I don't know why.

21       Q.   You do tell us that your parents would come and visit at  
22           weekends; is that right?

23       A.   Some weekends, and not always the parents, but maybe  
24           somebody else from the family.

25       Q.   On these occasions --

1 A. At Largs.

2 Q. On these occasions at Largs would you be taken out?

3 A. Yes, you'd be taken along for a Nardini's or a Moorings.

4 Q. Just more generally, do you remember any other form of  
5 inspection taking place at St Columba's?

6 A. No, no.

7 Q. If I can touch upon the school side of things,  
8 education. Do you have any recollection at all as to  
9 what the set-up was there?

10 A. As far as schooling at St Columba's is concerned,  
11 I cannot recall a lesson, a schoolroom, a desk. I just  
12 can't recall anything that would help answer your  
13 question.

14 Q. If we jump ahead a bit, although you may not be  
15 absolutely clear about the dates when you came to leave  
16 St Columba's, I think what you say in your statement is  
17 your brother died in [REDACTED] 1965, your younger brother.

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. And you were still at St Columba's at that time?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. So you were there for a number of years overall?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. Was it after your brother's death that you went on to  
24 St Joseph's?

25 A. Correct, in the same year, I do believe.

1 Q. That gives us some sort of a time frame.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. When you were at St Joseph's, did you ever run away?

4 A. I did, once.

5 Q. Why did you do that --

6 A. Sorry, not St Joseph's, St Columba's.

7 Q. I beg your pardon, St Columba's, yes.

8 A. I did once, yes. As you've already pointed out, before  
9 I was a boarder, I was a day boy, and I used to travel  
10 down on the Western SNT bus from [REDACTED] in Renfrewshire  
11 down to the school and walk from the SNT depot to  
12 St Columba's, even although I was only 6. So on one  
13 occasion, for whatever reason, I took it into my mind  
14 that I was leaving and I made for the bus station and  
15 got on the first bus I saw and I went upstairs and I was  
16 kind of crouched down between the front seat and the  
17 wall of the bus, and I just sat there for what seemed  
18 like an age, and then Brother [REDACTED] MJD came and tapped me  
19 on the shoulder and took me back to the school in what  
20 I recall was a sort of van that -- a chef gentleman or  
21 a cook that we had had a van and he brought me back to  
22 St Columba's in that.

23 Q. Did you have a reason at that time for running away?

24 A. Well, I was living in absolute fear and horror of  
25 Germanus and his activities with me.

1 Q. And I'll come to those in a moment. I think in your  
2 statement you thought that this was in 1965 that you ran  
3 away, so that would be your last year; is that your  
4 recollection?

5 A. I can't say with a degree of certainty if it was 1964 or  
6 1965, but it was in the mid-period of being at the  
7 school in my mind.

8 Q. Were you asked by Brother MJD who I think you thought  
9 was the SNR, why you had run away?

10 A. No, there was no ... I was just brought back in silence  
11 and put back to normality in silence and nothing was  
12 ever done or said. There was no scolding done or  
13 belting or anything like that, I was just brought back.

14 Q. Can I ask you a little bit about discipline. What you  
15 say in the statement is you never saw any corporal  
16 punishment at St Columba's.

17 A. No.

18 Q. For example, did you ever see any child getting the  
19 strap?

20 A. I have no recall of that happening to me or to others.

21 Q. Did you see any other child being hit in any way?

22 A. I have no recall of that either.

23 Q. Well, can I then just look at your own experiences with  
24 Brother Germanus. What was the first thing that  
25 happened?

1       A. Very early on in my boarding career, when I started  
2       staying in the dorms and not as a day boy, I think  
3       almost within days he came and got me from my bed on one  
4       occasion. This was the first encounter. I was taken  
5       into a hallway, landing, where I was asked to stand up  
6       on a table/sideboard to reach up to a hatch area of the  
7       roof, open the hatch, and lift down a black bag of  
8       whatever.

9       Q. Just focusing on where this was, if you're on a landing  
10      and you're trying to reach the roof area, are you on the  
11      top level of the building?

12     A. I think the mid-landing.

13     Q. The mid-landing?

14     A. I think the mid-landing through -- up to a hatch in  
15      a hallway between our bedroom area and his room.

16     Q. So the hatch you're talking about was in the roof, was  
17      it?

18     A. In the roof or a high-up cupboard or a high-up  
19      duckett(?) type hatch.

20     Q. So you had to stand on a table to reach this area?

21     A. Yes. As I stood on the table, he would hoist me forward  
22      for the extra inches to do that (indicating).

23     Q. Yes. You're holding your hands up.

24     A. He's holding his hands, I'm lifting down what turned out  
25      to be a bag.

1 Q. So are his hands on your person?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Which part of your body?

4 A. My hips.

5 Q. Did you reach the bag and take it?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What sort of bag was it?

8 A. I would liken it to a small, old-fashioned doctor's bag:  
9 a smallish bag, two handles, leather.

10 Q. Then when you had reached the bag and taken it down,  
11 what happened after that?

12 A. He lifted me back down off the table and told me to go  
13 into the bathroom and take my pyjamas off because I had  
14 got them dirty leaning in the hatch. So I went into the  
15 bathroom area and he went off with the bag and I come  
16 back in and I was still standing there in my pyjamas and  
17 he said, "Take your pyjamas off". I said, "They're not  
18 dirty", because he'd already said to me, "Take your  
19 pyjamas off because they're dirty". I said to him,  
20 "They're not dirty", and he hit me a clout, a hit,  
21 a heavy-handed hit across the back of the neck and head,  
22 and told me to take my pyjamas off and of course I was  
23 crying and blubbing, and he took the pyjamas off there  
24 and then.

25 He took a towel to my back, he said I was dirty, he

1           stood me in the half bath area type thing, and he was  
2           wiping my back. I'm in terrible throes of being upset.  
3           The next thing I know, he's ejaculating on my back,  
4           standing in the shower area.

5       Q. Can I ask you this --

6       A. Which I don't know what he's doing at the time. I don't  
7           know what that is.

8       Q. But you know now?

9       A. I know now.

10      Q. Can I ask you this: how was he dressed?

11      A. He had black trousers on, bare feet. He had a white  
12          vest on, very un-Marist-like, and his trousers tied up  
13          with a brown belt, not looped through the trousers --  
14          I'll never forget the sight of him -- a belt holding up  
15          his trousers. That's how he was dressed.

16      Q. And you realise now that he was masturbating. Do I take  
17          it from what you've been telling us that he was behind  
18          you when this was happening?

19      A. Yes.

20      Q. Were you standing at this time?

21      A. I was standing in what I describe as the half bath.

22      Q. And what contact, if any, was he making directly with  
23          you?

24      A. He had his hand on my shoulders and on my head.

25      Q. Did you have a sensation of your back being wet or

1 anything of that sort?

2 A. Eventually, yes. But his other hand was groping me --

3 Q. And what do you mean by that?

4 A. -- and fingering me.

5 Q. Can you just explain what you mean by that, if you wish?

6 A. Yes, yes, he's fingering me with one hand, he's got me  
7 pulled towards him, he's eventually ejaculating on my  
8 back.

9 Q. Was he making contact then with your genital area?

10 A. No, no, just my anus.

11 Q. So when you talk about fingering, he's really making  
12 contact with your anus?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. How long did this particular episode you've been telling  
15 us about last for?

16 A. Minutes. Three, five minutes.

17 Q. Were you crying throughout the whole period once you  
18 were slapped?

19 A. Well, I was crying and that wasn't pleasing him, and you  
20 would get an extra slap for crying, just to stop crying.  
21 So there was random slaps from him.

22 Q. On this occasion?

23 A. On that occasion and other occasions, yes.

24 Q. I'll look at other occasions in a moment. But this  
25 first occasion you've been telling us about, Edward, how



1 did that come to an end?

2 A. How that came to an end was he wiped off my back, we  
3 went back into the hall, he lifted me back on to the  
4 table to replace the bag in the hatch type, the loft,  
5 whatever, and lifted me back down again and told me to  
6 go in and put my pyjamas on.

7 Q. So for this part of the episode, are you naked when  
8 you're on the table?

9 A. The second time, yes.

10 Q. Was he making contact with you when you were on the  
11 table?

12 A. He was fingering my buttocks.

13 Q. And so far as the bag is concerned, did you have any  
14 idea as to what was in the bag?

15 A. None, sir. No idea what the significance was of the  
16 bag. I often think it was a prop. I often think it was  
17 just a prop.

18 Q. Thereafter, then, did you go back into the bathroom and  
19 put your pyjamas back on?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And did you go back to bed?

22 A. He took me back to the bed and tucked me in and made me  
23 lovely and cosy.

24 Q. Were there other boys in that room at the time?

25 A. Yes. I don't know if there was a full complement of

1           boys, but yes, there was other boys in the room.

2           Q. And do you know if anyone was awake or were they  
3           sleeping?

4           A. Sleeping or not aware or not looking or just ...  
5           whatever.

6           Q. I think you said a minute or two ago that something  
7           similar happened again. Can you tell me what next  
8           happened?

9           A. Well, the bag in the loft thing happened perhaps maybe  
10          three/four times and the procedure was just the same,  
11          although on one occasion I had developed a nosebleed.  
12          From the crying and being told to stop crying and the  
13          slap on the back of the head, my nose was bleeding as  
14          well.

15                 On one occasion, another gentleman came into the  
16          bathroom. We were at the bathroom part of the  
17          expedition at this time and he said to Germanus, "What's  
18          going on?" and he said, "His nose is bleeding and I'm  
19          tidying him up", and the younger man, who I believe to  
20          have been a Marist, but I don't know -- he wasn't  
21          dressed as Marist, but he was dressed darkly, jacket,  
22          T-shirt, black T-shirt -- dismissed Germanus out of the  
23          room and said, "I'll sort it out, you leave him alone".  
24          He tidied me up, as it were, from the crying and the  
25          bleeding and whatever else, and put my pyjamas on and

1           took me back on the bed. I don't know who the gentleman  
2           was and I don't believe that I saw him again.

3       Q. This particular incident you're telling us about, when  
4       this man came into the bathroom, were you naked?

5       A. Yes.

6       Q. Was your nose bleeding?

7       A. Yes.

8       Q. Had that part of the process that involved him  
9       masturbating and ejaculating on your back --

10      A. It had already taken place.

11      Q. So the man that came in then, what did he require to do?

12      A. He required to tell him to get off me, wipe my bleeding  
13      nose and that area, perhaps the back, I can't say for  
14      certain, but he dressed me in my pyjamas and took me to  
15      my bed.

16      Q. So far as Germanus would be concerned, how was he  
17      dressed on this occasion?

18      A. I'm fairly certain the same casual wear that happened on  
19      the other occasions, just his trousers and a white vest.

20      Q. So this is one of those occasions where you've had the  
21      table episode first of all --

22      A. Yes.

23      Q. -- and the bag part of that?

24      A. Yes.

25      Q. And then you're being told to go to the bathroom to

1           remove your pyjamas?

2       A.   Yes, because your neck's dirty or your back's dirty or  
3           your pyjama's are dirty. But it became that you knew  
4           what was coming next, you were getting a slap if you  
5           weren't out of your pyjamas.

6       Q.   Was that the position, even on this occasion, were you  
7           still in your pyjamas when Germanus reappeared?

8       A.   I was out of the pyjamas but crying and bubbling, and  
9           I got the slap for crying and bubbling, which brought on  
10          the nosebleed.

11      Q.   The slap -- clearly there was contact with your nose --

12      A.   No, the slaps were usually from the side or behind.

13      Q.   But it caused your nose to bleed?

14      A.   Correct, sir.

15      Q.   On how many occasions did the bag process take place to  
16          your recollection?

17      A.   I think three/four.

18      Q.   The time that you were interrupted by this other person,  
19          at what point in time was that?

20      A.   Possibly the last time, possibly occasion 4. It's  
21          impossible to say with a degree of certainty.

22      Q.   How did matters develop after that?

23      A.   He was always nearby or, you know, close to me, as it  
24          were. But the bag thing, as I say, was dispensed with  
25          and he would just come and get you on some nights and

1 take you to the bathroom.

2 Q. When you say "some nights", would there be times when he  
3 would be leaving you alone?

4 A. Oh yes, yes. Yes. Yes, if -- over my period of years  
5 there, months and years there, I would say there was two  
6 dozen, perhaps, incidents took place, including the four  
7 with the bag and the table and the hatch.

8 Q. These other incidents then over this period of years, as  
9 you've pointed out, was it the same sort of things that  
10 were happening in the bathroom?

11 A. Not always. Not always. But the procedure was almost  
12 the same with the pyjamas off, some fingering, some  
13 front fingering ...

14 Q. And did the process always end with him ejaculating on  
15 your back?

16 A. It seemed that way to me. It seemed that way to me that  
17 it always happened and there was always the cleaning off  
18 and there was always -- I had to remain silent, it was  
19 always a finger across the mouth, you know, stop the  
20 crying, and back to bed, put you in, tuck you in lovely.

21 Q. And so far as being hit is concerned, did you continue  
22 to be hit?

23 A. Only when crying, and I probably started controlling the  
24 crying and just stood there like a zombie. From the  
25 first incident I would describe my being as zombified.

1 I didn't know what he was doing, I didn't know what it  
2 was, I didn't know why he was doing it, I didn't know if  
3 it was happening to others, but I just knew, I just felt  
4 something, you know ... I just ... so frightened and so  
5 caught up in it, you know, I was unable to speak. I was  
6 unable to speak.

7 And if I was going to say something, I've often  
8 thought to myself: if I was going to say something, what  
9 is it I'm saying and who am I going to say it to? You  
10 know, that's one of the reasons that closes you up and  
11 you become clammed up in the situation. You're almost  
12 compliant at the end of the day. That was my experience  
13 with him.

14 Q. When you went to bed at night then, how would you be  
15 feeling?

16 A. Apprehensive, pensive, was he coming, was he not, get to  
17 sleep if you can and sleep all night if you can, and if  
18 it doesn't happen, it doesn't happen.

19 If it did happen, three or four minutes or four or  
20 five minutes sorted it all out, and you were back to  
21 bed.

22 Q. Were you always awake when he came or were there times  
23 when you had fallen --

24 A. No, I would be sleeping and on occasions he would wake  
25 you up. He would wake you up in the dead of night in

1 his bare feet.

2 Q. Would he be saying anything to you?

3 A. Not "Come with me", you know. Nothing -- no, there was  
4 no instructions given, there was just a little gentle  
5 tug, take hold of your pyjamas, take you through, lead  
6 you by the pyjamas or the shoulder. No, there was no  
7 commentary with it.

8 Q. And when he came for you, would your room be in  
9 darkness?

10 A. Semi-darkness. There would be a hall light, landing  
11 light or whatever. There was always a bit of light  
12 about.

13 Q. I think one of the things you say in your statement --  
14 it's at paragraph 42 -- is you describe him as a vicious  
15 man.

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is that particularly because of the hitting that took  
18 place?

19 A. Absolutely. It wasn't a slap like your mum might give  
20 you for taking a biscuit; it was a vicious thud. It was  
21 a meaningful thud to let you know who's boss.

22 Q. You've mentioned the nosebleed. Was the nosebleed  
23 a regular occurrence?

24 A. It came a regular occurrence. Actually, my nose bled  
25 until I was 40, and I had to get an operation on it to

1 stop it. I often think it back to those days. I had  
2 dreadful nosebleeds all my days.

3 Q. You also mention an occasion when you had a whole church  
4 service and something happened with Germanus. Can you  
5 tell me about that event?

6 A. There was a church along the front in Largs that you'd  
7 be taken to on perhaps a special holiday of obligation  
8 or whatever, for different reasons on different days  
9 you'd go to a church service. I was there once and he  
10 got sat beside me -- he was never far away from me and  
11 he got sat beside me and he was holding me by the leg,  
12 like a father might hold his son, in a nice, playful  
13 way. That was fine. But I actually got such a fright  
14 and got so confused and frustrated that I messed myself  
15 in the church, sitting there.

16 When it became apparent what had happened, I was  
17 obviously crying and whatever, and older boys had to  
18 take me back all along the front, back to the school in  
19 Largs. Actually I'd soiled myself, not with urine.

20 Q. And how did you find that experience?

21 A. I think about it today. I think about it today. It  
22 makes me shudder, makes me shudder, with great shame and  
23 everything that went with it, you know.

24 Q. What age do you think you were when that incident  
25 happened?



1 A. Seven, perhaps coming 8.

2 Q. Did you ever raise with your parents that you were  
3 having these troubles at school?

4 A. Never. Never.

5 Q. Did it cross your mind, thinking back, to raise these  
6 matters with your parents?

7 A. I went through phases of definitely going to tell them  
8 and never telling them. I never spoke about the matter  
9 and perhaps you'll understand when I tell you about the  
10 day my brother died.

11 Q. Can you tell me about that?

12 A. [REDACTED] 1965, Germanus comes and gets me from  
13 wherever, I don't know. But he takes me into -- there  
14 was a room, I think we referred to it as the piano room  
15 because there was a piano in it, and it was a room  
16 nobody ever got into. But I was taken there by Germanus  
17 and he told me, he sat me down and he said, "Your  
18 brother has gone to heaven. Your brother has gone to  
19 heaven", and I said, "Okay", not really understanding  
20 what he was saying to me yet. "He's gone to heaven,  
21 there are people coming for you and you're going home  
22 now. If you ever utter a word of our little secret, if  
23 you ever speak a word of our little secret, you'll never  
24 see him again." He told me this. He took me from that  
25 piano room to where my bed was to gather up my bits and

1 pieces and back down to wait for a car that was coming  
2 to pick me up because my brother had passed away.

3 Q. And did you understand from what he was saying that your  
4 brother had passed away?

5 A. Yes. But he didn't say he was dead, "He had gone to  
6 heaven" was his phrase.

7 Q. Yes. What was your response to this, then, Edward,  
8 can you remember?

9 A. I was dumbfounded at what he was telling me, that I'm  
10 never going to see [REDACTED] again if I speak about that.  
11 I hadn't taken on board yet that [REDACTED] actually  
12 dead. I didn't really understand what "gone to heaven"  
13 meant. But that's how he left it with me and I was  
14 taken away that day, and the promise of never seeing him  
15 again lived with me and continued to live with me.

16 LADY SMITH: Was he trying to tell you, do you think, that  
17 if you said anything about it, you wouldn't go to heaven  
18 to join your brother, you'd go to hell?

19 A. That's not how he phrased it, my Lady.

20 LADY SMITH: Just that you wouldn't see your brother again?

21 A. I wouldn't see my brother again. I wasn't completely  
22 clear that he meant he was dead.

23 LADY SMITH: I see.

24 A. I thought perhaps heaven was another college or whatever  
25 or ... I wasn't clear on that.

1 LADY SMITH: How old were you?

2 A. Seven.

3 MR MacAULAY: You say it was [REDACTED] 1965, and when we look  
4 at your date of birth in 1955, you're probably about 9  
5 when your brother died.

6 A. Possibly, yes. Yes.

7 Q. So you'd been at the college for perhaps three years,  
8 three to four years by this time?

9 A. Not three full years.

10 Q. Because you had been a day boy to begin with?

11 A. Correct, and also part of each year of the three, yes.

12 I wasn't there for the whole of 1965 perhaps.

13 Q. You go to your brother's funeral because you realise  
14 ultimately that --

15 A. I didn't go to my brother's funeral.

16 Q. I see. Did you leave and go home then when your brother  
17 died?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. But after that, did you go back to St Columba's?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. What you say in your statement now is that:

22 "By this time, [you] feel [you are] a bit stronger."

23 Are things beginning to change between yourself and  
24 Germanus?

25 A. No, I never felt any stronger in St Columba's, but I did

1           gain some strength and some understanding and some grit,  
2           as it were, in St Joseph's.

3       Q.   So when you came to leave St Columba's in 1965, was the  
4           abuse that you've mentioned still going on until you  
5           left?

6       A.   Was I abused after my brother died?

7       Q.   Yes?

8       A.   Yes, I was.

9       Q.   Was it the same sort of things that you've already told  
10          us about?

11      A.   Taken from the bed, taken to the landing, occasionally  
12          to his little bit of a room, pyjamas off, fingering and  
13          whatever was pleasing him.

14      Q.   You've mentioned there that on occasions you'd actually  
15          be taken to his room, and you've told us where that was  
16          located.

17      A.   Yes.

18      Q.   How would he be dressed on these occasions when he had  
19          you in the room?

20      A.   A variety of ways, but mostly the black trousers, he's  
21          off duty for the evening, as it were, not in Marist  
22          garb.

23      Q.   On any occasion when you saw him, did you see him in  
24          a state of undress? By that I mean, without his  
25          trousers on, for example?

1 A. Trousers down, yes, round the ankles, yes.

2 Q. You saw that?

3 A. Both in the bathroom and in his room, yes.

4 Q. Did you get sight of his private parts?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Did he ever ask you to touch his private parts?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And can you help me with that? What did he ask you to  
9 do?

10 A. I'd rather not.

11 Q. If you don't want to, don't.

12 You mentioned a little while ago, Edward, that when  
13 Brother Germanus was dealing with you when your brother  
14 died, he put it in such a way that this was your secret.  
15 Had he ever before that referred to what was going on as  
16 your secret?

17 A. No. The warnings before were always silence, hand over  
18 the mouth, not to speak about this, not to speak about  
19 this thing that you don't really understand what it is  
20 anyway. No, he never -- he wasn't using the word  
21 "secret" until my brother died.

22 Q. You've been telling us about your experiences, Edward.  
23 Did you see how Brother Germanus interacted with other  
24 boys?

25 A. Yes. Yes, I did see in the course of happenings where

1           there were other kids around there, everything seemed  
2           natural and proper. I didn't see that he -- I didn't  
3           see any wrongdoing or have any knowledge of anything  
4           happening to other children. His other dealings looked  
5           normal. His other dealings with other people looked  
6           normal to me. I had no reason to think there was the  
7           same happening elsewhere. I had no knowledge of that.

8       Q.   Insofar as the other brothers are concerned, your  
9           dealings with them were normal?

10      A.   Yes, and from what I can tell you, limited.

11           I couldn't -- apart from MJD coming for me on the  
12           bus -- apart from -- there was a good thing at Largs  
13           where we went on the beach and we went along the rocks  
14           and it was good, it was a nice happening. It's one of  
15           the happenings I carry with me that -- you know,  
16           anything that was good from the place, and there were  
17           other brothers there that would come along with you, and  
18           there were even brothers who were only there for a few  
19           days and they would walk the beach with you.

20           But I had no problems with anybody else, no  
21           interaction with anybody else, nothing to report other  
22           than the gentleman who stopped him one night, as I have  
23           explained to you.

24      Q.   Thinking back to that incident, how obvious would it be  
25           to that person that came and interrupted what was going

1 on what had been going on?

2 A. Okay. Well, I often think about it and I say to myself  
3 the man summed the situation up as he entered the door  
4 and dealt with it in a decisive manner. He dispatched  
5 him, cleaned me up, said very little or nothing at all,  
6 and took me back to the bed. I don't think there could  
7 be any doubt in his mind that something was amiss.

8 Q. But do I understand you to say that, notwithstanding  
9 this occasion, the abuse you've described to us  
10 continued?

11 A. Yes. Yes. Yes, that didn't stop him. That didn't stop  
12 him.

13 Q. I think we've focused on the fact that you came to leave  
14 St Columba's in 1965 and that same year you moved to  
15 St Joseph's; is that correct?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Had your older brother gone to St Joseph's in front of  
18 you?

19 A. I believe so, but I can't answer you with any definite  
20 accuracy. I believe that he was already there a half  
21 a term or a half a year prior to me going down.

22 Q. And if you went there in 1965, you'd be 10 or perhaps  
23 coming up to 11 when you went to St Joseph's?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. When you first went there, was there a particular

1 division of the school where you went first of all?

2 A. Yes. You went to -- the young boys were in a separate  
3 building away from the main building, and that's where  
4 your bedrooms were. If I recall, some of your early day  
5 classrooms were over in that building as well.

6 Q. Was there a particular brother who was in charge of the  
7 younger boys that you can remember?

8 A. No, not a particular brother, just a variety of  
9 different brothers.

10 Q. Can you remember the names of brothers that you had some  
11 contact with at St Joseph's?

12 A. Yes, I can: Brother David, Brother AKW  
13 Brother MLU, Brother MYZ, Brother MZH  
14 Brother MFI

15 Q. You provide us with detail of the routine at St Joseph's  
16 and what life was like. Are you able to sum up your  
17 experience as a boy at St Joseph's?

18 A. Well, when I went to St Joseph's, I went under great  
19 stress. I was determined not to be there. We lived on  
20 a farm in Renfrewshire and when the trunk came out --  
21 you got a trunk packed with everything that was required  
22 by the school. A list was supplied and this trunk was  
23 packed with everything in, printing your name tags and  
24 things like that.

25 When the trunk came out, that was the sign that



1 I was going there to this place where there were many,  
2 many Germanuses, and that wasn't suiting me at all, and  
3 I protested and protested and sulked and slopped about  
4 and would have done anything not to be there.

5 On the first occasion -- we lived on a farm, as  
6 I say -- and I went missing the day that the car was  
7 coming to take me to Central station, because you'd get  
8 gathered at Glasgow Central and you'd get taken to  
9 Dumfries. I went missing and farm people had to come  
10 looking round the hills for me and physically drag me  
11 down, get me showered, get me bathed, get me dressed,  
12 and sit on me, I kid you not, in the front of our yard  
13 on a garden chair until the car came and put me in the  
14 car to Central station. That was the protest that  
15 I made and I made that every time.

16 I went to Dumfries with the great fear of what I was  
17 carrying from St Columba's. But to fast forward on  
18 that, I need not have been worried because nothing  
19 happened to me untoward at Dumfries, although it took me  
20 two or three years to come out of my shell to get a bit  
21 stronger, to get a bit more confident about being about  
22 them.

23 Academically, I was absolutely -- I carried nothing  
24 academically from Largs on to Dumfries, and I continued  
25 at Dumfries, just putting my time in and saying, "I'll

1           be out of here, when 15 comes, I'll be gone".

2           Q.   Is that what happened, you left at the age of 15?

3           A.   Yes.

4           Q.   And that would take you to about 1970 or thereabouts --

5           A.   Correct.

6           Q.   -- or 1971?

7           A.   Yes.

8           Q.   Do you have any recollection of corporal punishment  
9           being an issue at St Joseph's?

10          A.   There was corporal punishment.  Nobody avoided it.  
11               Nobody avoided it, including me.  But with the exception  
12               of a couple of bad apples, most brothers, and certainly  
13               the lay teachers, were very fair and sparing with that.  
14               But there was corporal punishment.  It wasn't a big  
15               feature, although it was there and it was in the ether,  
16               you knew the strap was a possibility.  Sometimes you got  
17               it when you weren't involved, just for being in the  
18               wrong area at the wrong time.

19          Q.   The couple of bad apples you mentioned, were these  
20               brothers or lay staff?

21          A.   They were brothers.

22          Q.   Why were they bad apples?

23          A.   They were very handy to pull out the belt.  One used to  
24               wear it like a bra strap up here (indicating) under his  
25               tunic and pull it out like John Wayne, and whoever was



1           there phoning my mother, crying, until my brother got  
2           the phone cut off.

3       Q.   He got that cut off at the local end, so to speak?

4       A.   Cut off from me making reverse charge calls from  
5           Dumfries to [REDACTED]. He phoned the exchange or told me  
6           he did so in order to block that happening. Anyway, so  
7           I was very uncertain and very unsure of myself in the  
8           early days and there was some decent boys about that  
9           would take you under their wing, as it were, but you  
10          were told early on about certain brothers to look out  
11          for, not to be caught alone with him.

12      Q.   And what --

13      A.   And of course, I know what they meant, without  
14          explaining to them, I knew what they were getting at.  
15          I carried the story in my mind of Largs.

16      Q.   I'll come back to your phone calls home in a moment, but  
17          were there particular brothers that were being  
18          identified by the boys who were giving you advice?

19      A.   Yes. One in particular that sticks in my mind, and  
20          others that don't.

21      Q.   And the one that sticks in your mind?

22      A.   His name was Brother MFI [REDACTED]

23      Q.   What were you told about him?

24      A.   Never to be in the showers when he's about.

25      Q.   Did you see him in the showers?

1 A. Around the shower area, yes.

2 Q. Would he have a view of the boys who were showering?

3 A. Oh, he would be in the shower room proper, yes,  
4 supervising whatever, totally unnecessarily.

5 But there were other brothers that I wouldn't be  
6 able to recall to mind. AKW that I mentioned  
7 earlier, who was handy with the belt, that was the  
8 reason to avoid him. But it was for other reasons that  
9 you were to avoid MFI

10 Q. Were you given any explanation as to what these reasons  
11 were or did you just assume?

12 A. It was a nod and a wink: don't be caught with him and  
13 don't be in the shower if he's around. It was a nod and  
14 a wink and I was carrying enough knowledge to know what  
15 they meant.

16 Q. You mentioned how you were phoning home -- did you say  
17 on a daily basis or on a regular basis at least?

18 A. On a multi-daily basis, yes.

19 Q. In a state of upset?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And this went on for two years?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And you spoke to your mother?

24 A. And sometimes it would ring out, sometimes you'd get  
25 through, sometimes you'd just be babbling, if you got

1           through down the phone, "Come and get me, I want out of  
2           here, I have to get out of here".

3       Q.   But at this time, from what you've said to us  
4           in relation to St Joseph's, you're not being subjected  
5           to any form of abuse?

6       A.   No, not in St Joseph's.

7       Q.   So what was the cause for this?

8       A.   It was just I didn't want to be with Marists. I didn't  
9           want to be there in a Marist school. I wasn't  
10          completely aware in the early days that nothing untoward  
11          was going to happen to me, but I got stronger as time  
12          went on.

13                But in the early days my ambition was not to be  
14           there and to get my mother to get me away from there.  
15           And I was thinking that the crying baby gets attention  
16           but on this occasion it didn't.

17       Q.   And you've told us, or at least you've been told, that  
18           your older brother took steps to prevent you --

19       A.   He told me.

20       Q.   He told you?

21       A.   He answered the phone and said, "Don't ring up anymore,  
22           you're upsetting your mother, we don't know what's wrong  
23           with you, and we've told the telephone exchange not to  
24           accept any calls from the Dumfries number".

25       Q.   And did that happen, were the calls not accepted?

1       A. I don't know, but it was good enough for me not to have  
2       the embarrassment of being told, you know, we're not  
3       putting the call through. I don't know if he did it but  
4       I was told he did.

5       LADY SMITH: If I remember rightly, in the days of being  
6       able to make reverse charge phone calls, the exchange  
7       would ask the recipient of the call if they would accept  
8       the charge before they would put it through, every time.  
9       So it may be that they were saying, "No, we won't take  
10      this call".

11      A. That's correct, ma'am. That's the way I recall it. You  
12      would actually hear the lady saying to the person, "Will  
13      you take a call from Dumfries?" You would hear it  
14      at the other end.

15      LADY SMITH: Yes.

16      MR MacAULAY: So how would you describe then your time at  
17      St Joseph's? Give us an overview of that period.

18      A. Academically?

19      Q. Just generally.

20      A. Generally, I carried the fear there, went with great  
21      trepidation. I got stronger into the second and third  
22      year, got bullish. Nothing was happening to me -- and  
23      at this stage I was making sure nothing was going to  
24      happen to me. I would be bold enough to -- that danger  
25      had gone, so it was a better place. It wasn't as bad.

1           It was a better place to be, although I was just always  
2           with one eye on the calendar to when I wouldn't be  
3           there. That's how best I can describe it to you.

4       Q.   Academically then how did you fare?

5       A.   Academically, zero. I didn't get anything.

6       Q.   Why was that?

7       A.   I didn't excel at lessons. I didn't get the early grasp  
8           of things, I spent too much time in fear in the early  
9           days. You were getting exam papers with questions  
10          looking for answers and you wouldn't really fully  
11          understand the question anyway. It just zoomed past me  
12          and I wasn't too bothered because I just wanted out.  
13          I was going to be out and gone as quickly as I could.

14          Sports-wise, didn't want to know. Did not want to  
15          go -- anything that was connected with people, anything  
16          that was connected with Marist Brothers, swimming baths,  
17          taking your clothes off, no. Rugby here, rugby there,  
18          cricket there, not for me. I bought a fishing rod  
19          because on a Wednesday and a Saturday you could get out  
20          of the place and do your own thing, if you wanted to go  
21          fishing or perhaps you had some other trumped-up  
22          interest. I bought a fishing rod and I walked the  
23          streets of Dumfries rather than participate in anything  
24          that was going on on a Wednesday or a Saturday. The  
25          fishing rod was never in the water, but it got me out of



1           there. That was my Dumfries.

2           Q. And I think you tell us that when you came to leave  
3           at the age of 15, you had no qualifications.

4           A. None. I think I can safely say that I never got  
5           anything by way of a Scottish award of merit or  
6           education or O or A-level, anything. I could be  
7           corrected because I did like [REDACTED], but I don't think  
8           I got that either -- he was a lay teacher and a very  
9           lovely man called Mr Rinaldi.

10          Q. After you left St Joseph's, did you go home for  
11          a period?

12          A. After I left St Joseph's I went home for a short period  
13          of time, yes.

14          Q. And then you tell us you went to Glasgow to work?

15          A. Yes. I went to Glasgow to work and stayed with  
16          different people in flats. I didn't want to be home,  
17          I didn't want to be with my brother, [REDACTED]. I didn't  
18          want to speak to my mum and dad about what had happened.  
19          I blamed them for Largs and I carried that with me for  
20          all the time I was never explaining. They never knew  
21          what was wrong with me.

22                 But I was home and as early as I could, I was gone.  
23          Up in Glasgow by 16, my own apartment by 18, and I never  
24          went home again. I never spent a Christmas Day or an  
25          Easter Sunday or anything with my mum and dad again.

1 I left as quickly as I could.

2 Q. Did you ever explain to your parents --

3 A. Never explained. I never explained, which to my eternal  
4 shame, how I treated my mother, all because of Largs.

5 It is my eternal shame that I never treated her the way  
6 I should. It wasn't her fault. It wasn't her fault.

7 Q. You provide us with some insight into your work history,  
8 Edward, and you've, I think, had a successful working  
9 life overall; is that right?

10 A. I've always worked, yes.

11 Q. On the personal front, you got married and you have  
12 a supportive family?

13 A. I have a supportive family, yes. I have three lovely  
14 daughters and a very strong wife. The one thing the  
15 Marists did do for me in the most recent past was tell  
16 me to tell my wife and my daughters that they had in  
17 fact raped me in the way they had. They insisted that  
18 I told them, my family, and when I told them -- and it  
19 took me a long time -- the love gushed out of them and  
20 into me and I wondered why I had stayed quiet for all  
21 the years. I couldn't understand why I stayed quiet.  
22 The love gushed out of them and they fully understood  
23 the hurt I was carrying.

24 Q. Was this in more recent years that you made this  
25 disclosure?

1 A. This was in the last four years.

2 Q. I'll come on in a moment to your interaction with the  
3 Marists in that period.

4 You mention an incident when you were at a family  
5 wedding and I think the name Germanus came up.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. I think you tell us that was in perhaps 2013.

8 A. The [REDACTED] of 2013.

9 Q. Can you help me with what happened there?

10 A. Yes, sir. I was at a family wedding in Ayr and a lady  
11 approached me well into the evening, a lovely lady, and  
12 asked me if I was Edward, I said I was Edward. Was my  
13 family Edward's family? Yes. Did you go to Largs?  
14 Yes, I went to Largs school, yes. So she went on to  
15 tell me that her husband had gone there and he was  
16 telling marvellous stories about the place and the  
17 people and that he'd kept in touch with them after being  
18 a pupil and that they would all come to her house in  
19 Paisley and everything was lovely and jam on all the  
20 sandwiches and everything was beautiful. Then she said  
21 the name, "and, of course, Brother Germanus".

22 I went quiet for a while. My wife was with me.  
23 I said, "The best way I can answer you, madam, is this:  
24 I'm delighted your husband had the experience he did,  
25 but it was not the same for everybody in Largs", "What

1 do you mean?" she said. I said, "We're at a wedding and  
2 I'm not going to explain to you, but please take it from  
3 me, it was not the same for everybody". She pressed me  
4 a wee bit and I said I had to cut her off and said, "No,  
5 I'll be saying no more this evening for certain".

6 My wife took me aside that evening and the following  
7 day and asked me what was wrong. I said it was just  
8 what happened there. And I said, "I'll tell you some  
9 day". So she pestered me and we spoke about it and she  
10 said to me, "Edward, we're 40 years married, you go into  
11 a dark place regularly, and nobody knows what's wrong  
12 with you, and you're telling me now that that's what  
13 happened to you?" She said, "You have to go and see  
14 those people, you have to go and speak to them, you have  
15 to go and get it out of your system and speak about it".  
16 And I took her strength and I went and I wrote to the  
17 brothers.

18 Q. That's the next part of your statement I want to then.  
19 What you tell us in paragraph 105 is that in 2014 you  
20 made contact and you ended up speaking to  
21 Brother Brendan Geary; is that correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. I think you arranged to have a meeting with  
24 a representative --

25 A. I spoke to Geary and others. By the time I had phoned

1           them in Partick in Glasgow and by the time I had got  
2           passed from pillar to post, I spoke to Geary and others,  
3           but Geary was the one that took up the cudgel with the  
4           reply.

5       Q.   I think the first meeting you had with a Marist Brother  
6           was with a man by the name of Ronnie McEwan?

7       A.   Yes.

8       Q.   Did you understand him to be a Marist Brother?

9       A.   Yes.

10      Q.   And did you discover that he was a safeguarder?

11      A.   What happened was -- Brother Brendan Geary wrote  
12           a lovely letter and he said that somebody would be in  
13           touch soon and the somebody who got in touch was a  
14           Brother Ronnie McEwan, who said he had to meet me and I  
15           had to come into their offices. I said, no, I'm not  
16           going to your offices, I'll arrange something and  
17           we will meet. So we went -- I got a meeting room in  
18           a hotel and this man came along, who was Ronnie, and  
19           he wasn't in Marist identification garb, he was a casual  
20           civilian-like chap, a very pleasurable, very personable  
21           person.

22                We met and I said I want to tell you what happened  
23           to me. I started with my story. I wanted to slap the  
24           table and get a wee bit angry and leave and think that  
25           I'll feel better the next day. As I'm telling him my

1 story about Germanus, all of a sudden I said to him,  
2 "Ronnie, I'm going to stop talking now because I'm  
3 looking at you and you know all about this". He said,  
4 "Yes, we do know all about Germanus". I said, "Oh,  
5 well, I've been carrying a secret for 50-plus years  
6 about my dead brother, who if I ever uttered a word  
7 would result in me never seeing again, and here you are,  
8 you know what was going on with Germanus and the secret  
9 is not really a secret". I said, "Were there other  
10 people?" and he said, "One other person, 10 years your  
11 junior". I said, "What happened to him? Was it sexual  
12 and violence?" And he said yes.

13 So the meeting to my mind got -- I got highly  
14 confused at the meeting. Here I am, I'm speaking to  
15 someone who knows all about it, the secret's not  
16 a secret at all. He asked me if I had any more  
17 questions for him and I said, "I've got one question for  
18 you: who are you?" Now, he's misunderstood me because  
19 I meant who are you as a person because he was in  
20 civvies. He said, "Good question", and laughed. He  
21 said, "Do you like football?" I said, "Yes, I like  
22 football". He said, "We're Celtic, and by that I mean  
23 we discovered Celtic, we initiated Celtic football team  
24 in Glasgow", and Celtic this, Celtic that. I thought to  
25 myself, I've come to a meeting about abuse 50 years ago

1 and all of a sudden the answer to the question about who  
2 they are is "We are Celtic". I just got so confused.

3 I said to him, "I'd like to meet the other man,  
4 Ronnie, the younger man, and have a word with him and  
5 perhaps we can compare notes", "Yes, I'll look into that  
6 and I'll see to that", and we parted that day.

7 The last thing he said to me was, "Just in case  
8 you're thinking about it, do not phone the police".  
9 I said, "Okay, why are you saying that?" He said,  
10 "Because we have a system in place for alerting the  
11 police to situations of abuse in Marist schools",  
12 "You'll handle all that?" "Yes, I'll be reporting it to  
13 the police".

14 Q. Did he mention anything else with you as to who else you  
15 should maybe get in touch with at that meeting? If  
16 I move down to paragraph 110, there's some reference  
17 there to a trust. Was that at this meeting or at  
18 another meeting?

19 A. It was at meeting 2. That was at meeting 2. That was  
20 at meeting 2.

21 Q. Did you contact the police?

22 A. I didn't. I took him at face value.

23 LADY SMITH: Edward, can I just recap a moment to get the  
24 sequence of events correct? Your first contact was with  
25 Brother Brendan Geary.

1 A. That's right.

2 LADY SMITH: And you say you got a very helpful letter back  
3 from him.

4 A. Yes.

5 LADY SMITH: Was it in his letter that he told you someone  
6 would get in touch with you?

7 A. Yes.

8 LADY SMITH: And then this man Ronnie McEwan got in touch  
9 with you?

10 A. Correct, yes.

11 LADY SMITH: Am I correct to understand you to think that  
12 Ronnie McEwan was part of the Marist organisation or  
13 what?

14 A. On first meeting with him I wasn't aware what he was,  
15 whether he was an adviser to them or actually  
16 a Marist Brother. Later on I discovered he was  
17 a Marist Brother.

18 LADY SMITH: But he didn't actually explain at the first  
19 meeting, other than the reference to  
20 Celtic Football Club that you remember?

21 A. No, he didn't mention safeguarding or he being  
22 safeguarding at that meeting.

23 MR MacAULAY: Did he ever mention that to you?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Did you understand then that he had some involvement



1 with safeguarding within the order?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. At paragraph 111 -- and this may or may not be at this  
4 first meeting, but I think at a meeting, at least,  
5 Ronnie McEwan discussed with you what the background to  
6 St Columba's had been. Was that at the first meeting or  
7 a subsequent meeting?

8 A. That was at the first meeting.

9 Q. What did he say about the background?

10 A. He said that Largs -- we were discussing generally  
11 Largs. He was warm and open to -- he seemed very hurt  
12 about what I was telling him, even although Germanus  
13 wasn't a shock to him. He seemed very hurt and very  
14 warm, receptive, and wanting to assist with thinking it  
15 through with what had happened. He explained that Largs  
16 in fact was a holiday home for Marist Brothers. He said  
17 in fact there were two houses there, one that I know  
18 I lived in and one next door, adjoining houses, detached  
19 seaside villas.

20 They were originally holiday homes for Marists to  
21 come and have a retreat and relax, from all over the  
22 world, relax at Largs. Then he said, in the most  
23 damning of manners, that somebody had the bright idea to  
24 get some kids in to teach, and he rolled his eyes to the  
25 sky, as if saying to you and me, standing in a pub,

1 discussing something and somebody had the bright idea --  
2 meaning that that wasn't the idea at all, but that  
3 children were going to be about there.

4 It shocked me, it shocked me that basically -- my  
5 thoughts started thinking to myself, this wasn't  
6 a school at all, it was a cesspit of goings-on. But at  
7 that stage I'm thinking that I'm the only one involved  
8 and I'm hearing about one other guy 10 years later who's  
9 only the second person involved. That's what he  
10 explained to me about Largs.

11 Q. So were you taking from this part of the conversation  
12 that he, Ronnie McEwan, did not think it had been a good  
13 idea to have boys in this place with the Marists?

14 A. His demeanour left me in no doubt that that was the  
15 case, that he thought it was a bad idea.

16 Q. You mentioned earlier when we were looking at  
17 St Joseph's about advice or warnings you were given  
18 about Brother MFI Did Brother MFI feature in the  
19 conversation with Ronnie McEwan at this first meeting?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Can you tell me about that?

22 A. He asked me about Dumfries and I told him, in an  
23 abridged version, about Dumfries. He actually asked me  
24 about my brother showing a bit of concern as  
25 well, to which I hadn't even brought into the equation

1 at the time.

2 He asked me about Dumfries. We spoke about Dumfries  
3 and he said that he actually had a bad incident there  
4 with a brother called Brother MFI and in fact there  
5 was a police investigation launched, but MFI had  
6 either left the Marists or left the country or both and  
7 was back in Ireland, and he in fact was sent to get  
8 MFI back from Ireland to face the police in Dumfries  
9 & Galloway to discuss about the goings-on at  
10 St Joseph's.

11 He did that, he went and got MFI, and he brought  
12 him back and, unfortunately, Brother MFI passed away  
13 before investigations could be completed.

14 Q. You go on to tell us about a second meeting you had with  
15 Ronnie McEwan. You tell us at 113 that this was in the  
16 Kinharvie Institute Building in Partick --

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. -- in Glasgow. What do you know about the  
19 Kinharvie Institute?

20 A. Only what he explained to me. Kinharvie was, in the  
21 early days, a building or a place in Dumfriesshire and  
22 they had a home there where administration was done from  
23 the Marists and perhaps Marist training. Young Marists  
24 were brought there and trained to be Marists, as it  
25 were, and the building in Partick was the remaining

1 building for the Marists in Scotland and they ran an  
2 institute there of guidance for other people -- I think  
3 the terminology is that they're facilitators. I'm not  
4 fully au fait with what that is, but they facilitate.

5 So for the second meeting, he took me there.  
6 I asked to see him and I felt confident enough at that  
7 time to go there. I went into a room, teas, coffees, no  
8 problem, didn't want that, just a chat. I said, "How  
9 did you get on with the police?" "Oh, have they not been  
10 in touch yet?" "No, they have not been in touch yet",  
11 "I'll chase that up".

12 Then he said, "Do you, Edward, know that we have  
13 a fund to deal with situations like yours?" I said,  
14 "No, I'm not aware of that". He said, "We have. What  
15 I want you to do is get a solicitor and have him write  
16 to a man called Leo Martin". He gave no details, but he  
17 said, "Your solicitor will know who that is". And he  
18 said, "We have a fund to compensate people who have been  
19 wronged by us". Didn't fully explain it, but along  
20 those lines. And I said, "Okay, well what you're saying  
21 is" -- he said, "No, I urge you to do that, I want you  
22 to do that". He said, "Regardless of litigation,  
23 I would like you to keep in touch with me and talk and  
24 we can talk together, regardless of litigation".

25 Q. How long after the first meeting do you think this

1 second meeting took place?

2 A. The first meeting was February 2014. The second meeting  
3 September 2014.

4 Q. So there's over six months of a gap between the two  
5 meetings?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. I think you mentioned Leo Martin; did you understand him  
8 to be a solicitor?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. On that occasion, did Ronnie McEwan meet your wife?

11 A. Yes, he did. We had a rather unfortunate incident  
12 in the office. It's something like this: he is a man  
13 who purports to be perhaps a psychologist or child  
14 psychologist or someone who's a psychologist in this  
15 field of abuse. The meeting, although it was going to  
16 be casual, turned into a session where he was asking me  
17 this question and that question, and I said to him --

18 LADY SMITH: Sorry, is this Ronnie that you're with?

19 A. Yes, McEwan.

20 LADY SMITH: And he's got some counselling experience?

21 A. It appeared that way, yes.

22 LADY SMITH: I see, thank you.

23 A. I said to him, "No, really" -- and he said, "There must  
24 be questions in your mind you want to ask". I said,  
25 "Why would that man be doing that to me? Why would that

1 man be doing that to the other person? What is actually  
2 going on in people's minds, Ronnie?" He said, "Yes,  
3 good question". "Speaking from my own experience", he  
4 said, "the first time I got an erection --" and I went,  
5 "Ronnie, please".

6 MR MacAULAY: You thought that was inappropriate?

7 A. "I'm not comfortable with this, talking like that". And  
8 he said, "Oh yes, okay, I can understand, I can  
9 understand why you wouldn't be comfortable with that".  
10 I said, "We'll just leave it alone". And the feeling  
11 that I was actually in a counselling session wasn't  
12 suiting me at all because I still had questions to ask  
13 him. I wanted to know about the other boy and things  
14 like that and he was being evasive about the other boy,  
15 eventually telling me, "I've been in touch with him and  
16 he doesn't want to talk to you", the other abused boy,  
17 who has a similar story to mine.

18 So I left that meeting and he walked me out and my  
19 wife was outside in the car and he went over and he  
20 introduced himself and there was a lot of hugging and  
21 there was crying on the pavement. There was lots of  
22 that going on, there was lots of comfort, but as it  
23 turns out, in my mind, there was also deceit. The main  
24 ingredient was deceit.

25 Q. Why do you say that?

1 A. Because as it turned out -- I was sitting there saying  
2 the police haven't been in touch with me yet and he's  
3 worried about that, can't understand that, but he knows  
4 why; he hasn't told them.

5 Q. How do you know that?

6 A. Because one year later, the police haven't been made  
7 aware.

8 Q. After that second meeting, Edward, I think you have  
9 contact with a nephew that you hadn't had contact with  
10 for a long time; is that right?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Can we just use the name MGT to identify who we're  
13 talking about?

14 LADY SMITH: For your benefit, Edward, can I just interject:  
15 a few minutes ago you may have used your own name, but  
16 you are of course entitled to anonymity and any mention  
17 of your own name cannot be repeated outside this room.  
18 Everybody here knows that, but it is important that  
19 I give you that reassurance.

20 A. I'm grateful for that, madam. I'm grateful for that.

21 MR MacAULAY: Did you become aware that your nephew MGT  
22 had also gone to St Columba's?

23 A. Yes. After the meeting in Kinharvie, Downhill, Partick,  
24 my wife said to me, do you know that your  
25 nephew MGT -- we're not a close family -- went to



1 St Columba's. I didn't know that, albeit it was  
2 17 years after me. I said, no, I wasn't aware of that.  
3 She said, yes. I said, well, I don't know how to get in  
4 touch with him. So a few days went by, a couple of  
5 calls were made, and all of a sudden I had a number for  
6 my nephew MGT and I rang him.

7 How are you, Uncle Edward, bit of chit-chat.  
8 I said, "Did you go to the school in Largs?" "Oh yes",  
9 he said, "Germanus & Co". I said, "Why did you say  
10 that, Germanus & Co?" "Oh", he said, "I was there",  
11 "Okay, I'll come and see you". So he did. He was as  
12 good as his word, and not a week went by and he came to  
13 see me.

14 Q. Was this still in 2014 or was it later than that?

15 A. Still in 2014, sir. He came to see me and we  
16 discussed -- I said you were at Dumfries. I told him  
17 a bit of my story, not everything, you never do. I told  
18 him a bit of my story and he said, "Well, I was there  
19 the day they killed Aldo". I said, "Say that again to  
20 me". He said, "I was there the day that Aldo got  
21 killed". I said, "You just said they killed Aldo", and  
22 he said, "Read it any way you want, but it haunts me to  
23 this day". I said, "Explain". He said, "There was  
24 a little boy there called Aldo Moroni and he was getting  
25 a vicious beating on the landing outside the toilet for



1           supposedly being in the toilet too long. There was  
2           screaming and shouting and holy murder going on", he  
3           said, "bearing in mind, he's 8, 9 or 10 at the time", he  
4           said.

5           "And it got worse", he said, "and the next thing we  
6           know there's an ambulance there and the next thing we  
7           know, we're at a funeral in Dunoon and Aldo's dead."

8       Q. And I think he draws a link between what he saw  
9       happening and the death?

10      A. Correct.

11      Q. And clearly, we will look at that. But your response to  
12      that, of course, I think you thought, taking it at face  
13      value, as you say in your statement, that if it happened  
14      in that way, was an outrageous thing to have happened?

15      A. I was dumbfounded, sir. I was dumbfounded. I said to  
16      him, "What happened? What was done about it?" He said,  
17      "Nothing, we were told he had a heart attack and died  
18      and that was the end of it".

19      Q. Was that then the background to your third meeting with  
20      Ronnie McEwan?

21      A. Correct.

22      Q. So that was information that had been relayed to you  
23      before you saw Ronnie McEwan for the third time?

24      A. Yes. So what happened, I chewed on that and thought  
25      about that and thought about the little fella.

1           I thought about -- he explained to me the beating  
2           was done by Germanus. I thought about my days and  
3           I thought about the back of my head and the bangs I was  
4           getting. And I thought about my cowardice in not  
5           speaking up at the time. Could it have saved Aldo?  
6           Could I have stopped that boy being killed if I'd had  
7           the courage to come forward? All these things were  
8           chewing me out.

9           So I got in touch with McEwan again and in  
10          February 2015, he flew to my house in England via  
11          Stansted Airport, came to my house, and it was going to  
12          be more chats about why the police hadn't called yet,  
13          had we got in touch with Leo Martin.

14          And I said to him, "Ronnie, I've got something to  
15          ask you". We were sitting in my lounge and I said,  
16          "I want to ask you about a boy called Aldo Moroni". He  
17          said, "No, can't help you, never heard of him, never  
18          heard of Aldo Moroni". I said, "You've never heard of  
19          Aldo Moroni? Well, let me tell you what I've heard",  
20          and I told him the story. He said, "No, I don't know  
21          anything about that". I said, "I find that strange".

22          The next thing he said to me was like a light bulb  
23          in my mind. He said, "How would it be, LZW  
24          if we wrote a substantial cheque out to a child abuse  
25          charity of your choice?" and I said, "How would it be?

1           It wouldn't be. What is that all about?" He said, "You  
2           know" ... "Once you explained to me I've got to go  
3           through Leo Martin for this to be compensated but you're  
4           saying that you can write a cheque to a charity in our  
5           name, and it's in immediate response to being questioned  
6           about Aldo Moroni". So total confusion. The meeting,  
7           to my mind, was over. I said, "I still haven't heard  
8           from the police", "That's very strange, I'll look into  
9           that again".

10          Q. Was that really how the meeting came to an end then?

11          A. That's how the meeting came to an end.

12          Q. How long did this particular meeting last for?

13          A. He was there a couple of hours. He obviously got -- he  
14           came into our house and he got hospitality, lunch,  
15           et cetera. So I was dumbfounded and I knew -- I felt  
16           I'd stumbled on something, I felt I'd stumbled on  
17           something terrible, terrible. So I started asking about  
18           and I got a solicitor to get in touch with Leo Martin,  
19           who came back rather quickly and said he's taken  
20           instructions from the Marists, but you'll have to go  
21           through the courts if you want anything. I said,  
22           "I didn't say I wanted anything but he told me there was  
23           a system in place that would help bring closure to the  
24           matter".

25          Q. And that he is Ronnie McEwan?

1 A. He is Ronnie McEwan.

2 Q. Just to understand, you've gone to the solicitor on the  
3 back of what Ronnie McEwan said to you?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And your solicitor has contacted Leo Martin and has been  
6 given this message about what you'd have to do?

7 A. Yes, but he also had the presence of mind to contact the  
8 police and the police told him in no uncertain terms  
9 that no report had been made to either them or Dumfries  
10 & Galloway Police, which was getting mentioned as the  
11 place they had told about the abuse.

12 Q. So do I take it from that that no report had been made  
13 to the police by the Marists?

14 A. One full year afterwards.

15 Q. And when were the police contacted by your solicitor?

16 A. Immediately then.

17 Q. Is that some time in early 2015?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. Did you yourself contact the police?

20 A. I was the second person to contact them, as is  
21 procedure, because I had to phone and make the  
22 complaint. But at that stage they knew about it and  
23 they offered to come and see me in England and I said  
24 I was horrified to think people are jumping in cars and  
25 running about, that I could be up there at some stage

1 in the near future and I could meet with them. They met  
2 me in Parkhead police station and they took a full  
3 statement about all of what I've said to you.

4 Q. And the focus there, of course, was on Germanus and what  
5 had happened?

6 A. Absolutely.

7 Q. When was that statement given, can you remember?

8 A. September 2015.

9 Q. But were you told in fact by the police that Germanus  
10 had died?

11 A. McEwan had already told me that in some intervening  
12 emails or -- yes, an email, saying, "You asked about  
13 Brother Germanus, here's the details, died 1998, as  
14 Brother David". He had changed his name to  
15 Brother David, which I can understand.

16 Q. And was that then really the end of the matter insofar  
17 as your complaint was concerned?

18 A. With the police?

19 Q. Yes.

20 A. No, the police were good to start with. They wanted to  
21 know more. They asked me could I name other children  
22 that were there at my time of the incidents with  
23 Germanus or indeed at the Aldo Moroni time, and  
24 I of course told them about my nephew MGT They  
25 asked me if there were other people that would come

1 forward, could I involve myself and speak to anybody  
2 that I thought may be able to shed some light or  
3 corroborate what was I was saying and then I went on to  
4 tell them about how I had learned from the Marists about  
5 the gentleman 10 years my junior who had a similar story  
6 to tell.

7 Q. So that information -- and I think you also mentioned  
8 Aldo Moroni -- that information was passed on by you to  
9 the police?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. So you had passed on to the police what you'd been told  
12 by MGT --

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. -- in connection with Aldo Moroni?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. I think you also made some contact with your brothers at  
17 around this time; is that right? You've mentioned in  
18 particular one brother in passing and that's

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. I think it's the case you hadn't seen him for quite some  
21 time.

22 A. As part of their enquiries, Kilmarnock Police asked me  
23 about my family details and I told him I had two  
24 brothers. I told them one of them in fact had been at  
25 Largs and at Dumfries, the other one hadn't. So they

1           took my details and they said they would contact these  
2           people. I said, well, as for the older boy, I don't  
3           think he'll have much to say, but you can contact him.  
4           As for the younger boy, [REDACTED] I would rather you didn't  
5           contact him until I have contacted him because [REDACTED] had  
6           a troubled passage in life and was in a bad way, for  
7           different reasons. He was getting looked after by  
8           a charity.

9           I didn't want the police arriving at the door and  
10          bringing any unwanted spotlight on him, especially  
11          unknown as to what it was about. So they agreed that  
12          it would be a good idea if I spoke to him and teased out  
13          whether he had anything to add.

14        Q. And did you have a number of meetings then with [REDACTED] in  
15          2016?

16        A. I went to see him almost immediately but the timing was  
17          not right to even mention what was going on, he wasn't  
18          in a great way. Left it a couple of weeks and went  
19          back. Three, four, five meetings went on where I didn't  
20          mention it to him, but I was with him and just treating  
21          him with respect. I've arrived out of the blue, we  
22          hadn't been together in 50 years, so I was just treating  
23          him with a bit of respect, giving him wee bits of help  
24          if I could.

25          Then, about the fifth, sixth time, I said to him,

1 we're talking about -- he was in a good way, he hadn't  
2 drank for a few days and I said, "Do you remember  
3 Largs?" Well, it was like a geyser had burst. "Largs?  
4 Don't effing talk to me about Largs. And by the way,  
5 "he said, "I didn't know anything about you and  
6 Germanus, I didn't know anything". And I said, [REDACTED]  
7 who's mentioning Germanus?" "Oh, yeah, yeah, I know  
8 about that, I know about that", he says, "I didn't know  
9 at the time, I didn't know at the time", "You didn't  
10 know what at the time?" " Just the way he was with you,  
11 just the way he was".

12 Then he went on to explain that Germanus used to  
13 come to our farm in the holiday period, come from Largs  
14 to [REDACTED], to our farm. He said, "You would go and  
15 hide", he's telling me. Again, I cannot recall that,  
16 but I have no reason to doubt what [REDACTED] was telling me.

17 He said, "I used to be dispatched to the road end,  
18 walk to the farm where the bus route was, meet Germanus  
19 off a bus. And walk him up to the farm and it was  
20 always, 'Where's Edward? Where's Edward?' and you'd be  
21 off for the day on the pony or a bike or whatever, you'd  
22 be away hiding until he left". And I honestly can swear  
23 to you I didn't even know he came.

24 Q. And what about [REDACTED] himself? Did he say if anything  
25 had happened to him?



1       A. More importantly, if I could just stay at Largs for  
2       a second, he said to me something else that I didn't  
3       know apart from Germanus coming to the house. He said  
4       the nurse in the cottage in the playing fields,  
5       seemingly across the main road from the house before the  
6       beach was playing fields, which I know about, I've  
7       played in them, but there was a cottage or a small house  
8       there and a nurse lived in there and she was the nurse  
9       for St Columba's. I have no knowledge of this, I didn't  
10      know there was a lady nurse over there. She had told  
11      him -- he knew her name, but I can't recall it.

12             He said, "Mrs X said to me, [REDACTED] watch your  
13      brother with Germanus, I'm warning you know, watch your  
14      wee brother with Germanus'". He said, "I never really  
15      knew what she meant, I didn't know what was going on".  
16      I said, "What about you? What happened to you?" And he  
17      said, "Oh, nothing happened to me there but they took me  
18      -- they picked me for a football tournament and they  
19      took me to Sligo in a minibus, Celtic strip, Celtic kit,  
20      and they said we were going to Sligo to play football.  
21      In Sligo, Edward, I met some very, very bad people, some  
22      filthy people, and it did not end well".

23             I have to tell you now I'm looking at a 64-year-old  
24      man, a tough boy he was, all his days, the tears are  
25      running down his face and mine. We were sitting in his

1 house. He's telling me this story about how they took  
2 him there and when they had come back from Sligo it was  
3 a holiday time, but he didn't go from Sligo back to  
4 Largs, he went back to Dumfries. And after a while in  
5 Dumfries he told a Marist, who he referred to as AKX  
6 AKX he didn't use a name, he said AKX  
7 AKX He said I told him about it and he said,  
8 "He took my clothes off and he leathered me within an  
9 inch of my life with the buckle end of a belt until  
10 I was bleeding and I was taken to the infirmary where  
11 MZH came to me for over three or four days and every  
12 day he said to me, your mother can never know  
13 this, your mother can never know this".

14 His parting words -- and the last words he ever said  
15 to me were, "And then MZH said a funny thing and it  
16 has troubled me all my days, 'You'll have to learn to  
17 keep your pyjamas on, ". And he said to me,  
18 "Edward, I never took my pyjamas off, it wasn't me".

19 For 50-odd years he's been carrying that in his head  
20 and we're all wondering why he was the way he was, the  
21 whole family. I couldn't tell you the troubled passage  
22 he had in life and I'm telling you it here now.

23 Q. I think you said that what he said to you was that  
24 filthy things happened to him in Sligo, but he didn't go  
25 into the detail of what had happened; is that correct?

1 A. No, no. We were both sitting there. We know what  
2 "filthy things" means.

3 Q. And do I understand the position to be --

4 A. "Bad people", he said.

5 Q. Do I understand the position to be that when he went  
6 from Sligo it was from St Columba's in Largs, but by the  
7 time he came back --

8 A. By the time he came back it was holiday time and then it  
9 was on to Dumfries.

10 Q. And that is where he --

11 A. He told AKX [REDACTED] what happened.

12 Q. And that's where he got the beating you've just told us  
13 about?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. I think I'm right in saying, and I won't dwell on this  
16 for too long, that you did raise an action against the  
17 Marist order, is that right, Edward, a civil action?

18 A. What happened, sir, was this, that the gentleman  
19 solicitor who phoned the police and learned that the  
20 police had not been informed and then got the ball  
21 rolling with that came to me and said to me, "Edward,  
22 our company is not a company that is best equipped to  
23 handle that kind of thing, but I want to recommend  
24 strongly that you speak to these other people and  
25 I encourage you to do so because the conversations I had

1 with Leo Martin" -- one of the indications he came back  
2 and said to me was that something along the lines of  
3 a trust or a charity and "You can't touch us", sort of  
4 style. He said, "I want to tell you, <sup>LZW</sup> [REDACTED] that's  
5 not correct, so I want you to go to this other firm of  
6 solicitors and meet with them and tell them everything  
7 you've told me and I want you to take it from there".

8 Q. And I think, to perhaps cut a long story short, the  
9 action was raised but it failed because of time bar  
10 issues?

11 A. What happened was the solicitors said they wanted to  
12 take it to the court and take it to, as it happened, to  
13 Lady Wolffe, and they explained the situation to  
14 Lady Wolffe about what had happened, and the [REDACTED]  
15 aspect and not to speak and, et cetera, et cetera. But  
16 to cut a long story short, it failed on time and was not  
17 allowed to proceed.

18 But Andrew Hajducki, a gentleman barrister, urged me  
19 to inform Lady Wolffe in the court what had happened and  
20 there was a bit of an unreal situation for a moment  
21 where Mr Hajducki was saying, "Edward, tell her what  
22 happened to you", and Lady Wolffe, with great respect to  
23 her, said, "No, sit down, do not tell me what happened,  
24 I have no need to know what happened". Andrew Hajducki  
25 insisted I tell her, which -- obviously I respected the

1 court and I sat down and the matter failed. It failed  
2 again on appeal because the solicitors spotted some  
3 errors in the dates of the matter.

4 But the Marists were there in attendance and that's  
5 the first time I ever had sight of the man Geary, who  
6 flew in from Nijmegen, to make sure that I could not  
7 speak. That was the level of their activity in bringing  
8 comfort or solution to me.

9 Q. Can I then look to that part of your statement where you  
10 tell us -- you give us quite a bit of detail about the  
11 impact that you consider what happened to you,  
12 particularly at St Columba's, has had on you. Can you  
13 summarise that for me?

14 A. The first thing I would say is that I carried from there  
15 something that I carry even now and nothing's going to  
16 change that. I carried shame and fear and cowardice for  
17 not coming forward. I think about this often. I think  
18 [REDACTED], my beautiful baby brother, died in unfortunate  
19 circumstances. Had he not died, Germanus would never  
20 have uttered those words to me.

21 Had he not died, the likelihood was that, three  
22 years later, he'd have been going to Largs as a pupil  
23 and I think that I'd have found the strength of some  
24 sort to say, "No, you can't let that little guy go  
25 there, you cannot let him go down there". I feel

1           certain in my bones, but it didn't happen that way, it  
2           happened another way.

3           The follow-on from that is 17 years later  
4           Aldo Moroni -- I learned what happened to Aldo Moroni  
5           and I just ... I just find it a little hard to come to  
6           terms with. I just find it very hard to come to terms  
7           with how that chain of events has taken course.

8           I never got an education. It was furthest from my  
9           mind. I never passed an exam. They took away my  
10          confidence. I found new confidence. I became another  
11          person -- I became two people. There's the guy who's  
12          in that room, who's in that horrible room with that  
13          vicious man, and there's the guy who wasn't there, the  
14          guy who says, "No, no, close the door, don't go in the  
15          room, don't go in the room". The furthest I've gone  
16          into that room is this morning with yourself, sir.  
17          That's what you had to do to survive: you had to shake  
18          it off and put it aside.

19          When I did find the courage to come and speak to  
20          them, I find what they did to me then was almost  
21          re-abuse. They abused my family. We're all hurt now.  
22          They took me through to Edinburgh and humiliated me,  
23          after telling me to take them to Edinburgh.

24        Q. That's to the court?

25        A. Yes. They told me to take them to Edinburgh. They told

1 me the name of Leo Martin, they told me the procedure to  
2 follow. They took me through there and then cut the  
3 feet from under you in a humiliating manner.

4 If this is the path to healing, I don't understand  
5 it, I don't understand it. They're managing a crime.  
6 You think you're with a cuddly brother who's listening  
7 very carefully to what's happening to you and they're  
8 putting arms of comfort round you. They're actually  
9 managing their crime and I'm so stupid and uneducated  
10 that I can't figure that and I'm going along with it.

11 Q. But the one positive thing that you've mentioned  
12 in relation to what happened to you, Edward, is the  
13 support you have had from your family.

14 A. Without a doubt, sir, without a doubt. In fact, it  
15 trumps all, the fact that I've got a wife and three  
16 daughters that could turn around and just give you all  
17 their strength to look them in the eye and say, "You  
18 didn't beat me, you did what you did to me but you  
19 didn't beat me". That's what I feel.

20 Q. If I could take you, finally, to the final part of your  
21 statement. This is paragraph 160. You talk about  
22 lessons to be learned. One of the things you say  
23 there is that:

24 "In the old days in particular the Marist Brothers  
25 were godlike."

1           Is that how you looked upon them?

2       A. Absolutely. Absolutely. You were brought down there  
3       and you were put in the hands -- you're privileged,  
4       God's people are going to teach you one on one, going to  
5       teach you French, going to teach you to be a rocket  
6       scientist, God's people are going to do that, you're  
7       in the finest place ever, your parents are paying  
8       hard-earned cash over to them. They're putting you in  
9       a room there and then they're sending in what they refer  
10      to as a dormitory brother because he's too dim to teach.  
11      That's the phrase they gave him, "He's a dormitory  
12      brother, he's too dim to teach".

13   LADY SMITH: When did you hear that?

14   A. From Brother McEwan.

15   LADY SMITH: Ah.

16   A. I asked what Germanus' title or status was. He said,  
17      "Well, he was too dim to teach a class and had a speech  
18      impediment and we made him a dormitory brother". "We  
19      made him a dormitory brother", ie he's in your dorm.

20   LADY SMITH: Edward, just going back to something you were  
21      saying earlier about you feeling guilty for not speaking  
22      up, can you look back and remember that you were about 8  
23      or 9 years old and you've just described to us how you  
24      felt about this environment that was run by these  
25      godlike people. Can you accept, whatever happened, you



1           should not feel guilty for it?

2       A.   I do, and I do conquer that, but then I think of the  
3           knock-on consequences that I talk about. I think of the  
4           things that if I'd had the courage to, say, scream the  
5           house down, if I had been a little boy not petrified,  
6           that ran out of that room screaming, "He's touching me",  
7           or, "He's doing this", things would have been different  
8           for a lot of people. Things would have been so  
9           different, but I didn't do it.

10      LADY SMITH: You were very young; who would you have gone  
11           to?

12      A.   And what would you have said, what words would you use?  
13           I often think, what words do you use: he's doing what to  
14           me? You don't know what he's doing to you. This is  
15           God's man in town with a cross round his neck.

16      LADY SMITH: Yes.

17      MR MacAULAY: You have also told us that there was a point  
18           when another man came and would have realised what was  
19           going on.

20      A.   There's no doubt in my mind.

21      Q.   And there's no doubt he did nothing. He was in a far  
22           better position than you to do something, was he not?

23      A.   And the nurse knew when she told [REDACTED]

24      Q.   The final thing you say in your statement at  
25           paragraph 161, that sentence, can you read that first

1 sentence out?

2 A. "I hope that the truth is out there for all to see and  
3 that people are brought to book, whether they were the  
4 perpetrators or the enablers. They need to own their  
5 own dirt."

6 Q. I think that's one of your hopes for this inquiry --

7 A. Absolutely.

8 Q. -- that the truth comes out?

9 A. Tomorrow's children. Tomorrow's children. The damage  
10 is done, we can't fix yesterday, but we can fix  
11 tomorrow.

12 Q. On that note, Edward, can I thank you for engaging with  
13 this inquiry and for answering all my questions the way  
14 you have done today. I could see it was quite difficult  
15 for you at times.

16 A. Thank you, sir.

17 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, I can confirm that no other questions  
18 have been submitted to put to Edward.

19 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Can I check whether there are any  
20 outstanding applications for questions? No.

21 Edward, that does complete all the questions that  
22 we have for you. There are no more questions for you  
23 today, but I do want to thank you very much indeed for  
24 engaging with us the way you have. You've provided  
25 a detailed statement that's of enormous assistance and

1           you've come here today to talk about your experiences  
2           when you were a little boy. As Mr MacAulay said, I can  
3           see how difficult and how challenging it has been for  
4           you, and I suspect when you leave, you will feel  
5           drained, but please be assured you go with my thanks for  
6           all that you've given us to help with our work here.  
7           I'm now able to let you go.

8       A. Thank you, ma'am.

9                               (The witness withdrew)

10       MR MacAULAY: My Lady, we're due to sit again at about  
11           2 o'clock. It's a video link arrangement, so we may  
12           have to see how that works out.

13       LADY SMITH: Yes.

14       MR MacAULAY: We're planned for 2 o'clock.

15       LADY SMITH: I think the other end is five hours or so  
16           behind us, so they may be fairly flexible if we're  
17           a little bit after 2.

18           Thank you.

19       (1.10 pm)

20                               (The lunch adjournment)

21

22

23

1 (2.00 pm)

2 LADY SMITH: Good afternoon. It looks as though we have  
3 a link; is that right, Mr MacAulay?

4 MR MacAULAY: Yes, my Lady, we do. This next witness would  
5 like to remain anonymous and to use the name "Thomas" in  
6 giving evidence.

7 There is a five-hour difference between us and him.

8 LADY SMITH: Good morning, Thomas. Are you able to see me  
9 all right?

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 LADY SMITH: Good. I'm Lady Smith and I chair the Scottish  
12 Child Abuse Inquiry that you're now speaking to. I'm  
13 very grateful to you for having agreed to give evidence  
14 to us over the video link. What I would like to do,  
15 first of all, Thomas, is ask you to take an oath to tell  
16 the truth.

17 "THOMAS" (sworn) (via video link)

18 LADY SMITH: If it's all right with you, Thomas, what I'll  
19 do is hand you over to Mr MacAulay, who I think you've  
20 already met over the link, and Mr MacAulay will explain  
21 to you what happens next; is that okay?

22 A. Yes, that's fine, thank you.

23 Questions from MR MacAULAY

24 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

25 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, Thomas.

1 A. Good morning.

2 Q. I think it's 9 am where you are, near Ottawa; is that  
3 correct?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. Can you confirm to me that you have signed the statement  
6 that you provided to the inquiry?

7 A. I can confirm that, yes.

8 Q. And do you tell us in your statement that you have no  
9 objection to your statement being used as part of the  
10 evidence to the inquiry?

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. Do you also say that you believe the facts stated in the  
13 witness statement are true?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Can you confirm to me that you were born in the year  
16 1972?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. In your statement you provide us with some background  
19 information, in particular about your life before you  
20 went into care. It would appear that you were one of  
21 quite a number of siblings; is that right?

22 A. Correct.

23 Q. You, I think, provide us with some insight into a couple  
24 of incidents that happened to you when you were a very  
25 young age, in particular, for example, dropping

1 a boiling kettle on yourself. You tell us about that.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And you have a vague recollection of that, do you?

4 A. It's a very vague memory, I can't put any faces to it,  
5 but I just remember me being (inaudible: distorted) and  
6 I grabbed the kettle by the cord, so I'm assuming it was  
7 an electric kettle, and I pulled it off of the counter  
8 and the water landed on my foot and I remember a couple  
9 of people having a conversation about something to the  
10 effect of, "Told you not to leave him alone". But  
11 that's really all I remember about it. I have a memory  
12 of being at the hospital, almost outside of myself,  
13 probably because I think because the memory I have is  
14 seeing myself coming into the (inaudible: distorted) in  
15 a wheelchair. But looking back in hindsight that was  
16 probably me seeing another child coming into the  
17 hospital. But that's all I have as far as that memory.

18 Q. The other early memory that you tell us about is in  
19 connection with a sexual assault. You have a vague  
20 recollection of that.

21 A. There was a boy down the road [REDACTED] that  
22 basically was a bit of a masochist and he used to -- he  
23 would molest me behind his parents' place and I had an  
24 altercation -- I wouldn't really call it an altercation,  
25 I had an incident with one of the priests at the school

1           that I went to.

2           Q.   And I think these events happened when you were in  
3           foster care; is that right?

4           A.   Correct, yes.

5           Q.   And you went to foster care with a couple, and we'll  
6           call them [REDACTED]; is that right?

7           A.   Yes.

8           Q.   And was that, as you've just mentioned, in a place,  
9           [REDACTED]?

10          A.   Correct.

11          Q.   I think you thought that you were about 2 years of age  
12          when you went into foster care?

13          A.   Yes. I just got some information back from -- I think  
14          it was the Sheriff Court in [REDACTED] I'd been trying  
15          to get the information since 2006(?) to verify, when  
16          I was 2 years old, when I was first introduced to them.

17          Q.   What you tell us in your statement is that insofar as  
18          your early life with them was concerned, by and large it  
19          was a fairly stable and happy life?

20          A.   Correct. Probably -- well, yeah, it was the most stable  
21          I'd had up to that point, yes.

22          Q.   As I understand it from what you say in your statement,  
23          Thomas, your foster carers' house [REDACTED]

24          [REDACTED]; is that right?

25          A.   [REDACTED]

1

2 Q. As a little boy, were you in the habit of playing around  
3 the area of the school?

4 A. Yes. Once I was up and about and investigating on my  
5 own, I used to go to the school. I think it was  
6 initially through my adopted father, who was doing some  
7 contract work outside, [REDACTED]. So  
8 that's probably when I started going over there. It was  
9 definitely before I attended the school as a student.

10 Q. You mentioned your adopted father. Is it the case that  
11 your foster parents, [REDACTED] and [REDACTED], did adopt you?

12 A. Yes, the adoption was finalised in [REDACTED] 1981.

13 Q. Can I then take you to the time when you became a pupil  
14 at the school. What you tell us in your statement,  
15 Thomas, is that when you were aged about 7 you began  
16 attending St Columba's as a day pupil; is that right?

17 A. I believe it would probably be around that time.  
18 I can't be very specific with my age when I started  
19 attending the school. I just don't have the records of  
20 my grades and things like that, so I know I attended  
21 Primary One and Two at St Mary's, and possibly  
22 Primary Three, so I think I did Four and Five at  
23 St Columba's, but I can't be exactly sure.

24 Q. If we work on that basis, that you might have been about  
25 7, then I suppose that would take us to about 1979 when



1           you went as a day boy?

2       A. Yes, that would sound right, yes.

3       Q. And you said you were there for Primaries Seven and  
4       Eight, so that would be two years, which would take us  
5       to about 1981?

6       A. Well, I'm sorry, no, it wasn't Primaries Seven and  
7       Eight. I know when I was in St Mary's, I did  
8       Primary One and Two and possibly Three, so when I went  
9       to St Columba's, it was Four and Five. Because when  
10      I got to Canada, I started in grade 5, so it was almost  
11      like -- it's hard to explain how the school system works  
12      here, but they held the number back but the education  
13      system continued on. So your Primary Six might be their  
14      grade 5. It's hard to explain. It's a little  
15      different.

16      Q. Yes. But you were there roughly from the age of 7 to  
17      the age of 9?

18      A. Yes, I would say so, yes.

19      Q. We know from other evidence we've heard that it was  
20      a boys' school and that it was run by the  
21      Marist Brothers. Can I ask you this, Thomas: are you  
22      able to remember the names of any of the brothers that  
23      you had dealings with?

24      A. Brother MFY . I think Brother MFY was more of  
25      a friend of the family. I don't know if he was

1 (inaudible: distorted) worked there. Brother Germanus,  
2 who was a friend of the family. Brother AKU was one  
3 of my teachers. And then Brother Arthur, who I believed  
4 was the headmaster or at the very least that's who  
5 I took as the teacher of confidence, so I would say to  
6 me he was the headmaster.

7 Q. You describe Brother Arthur as the headmaster and also  
8 being a very caring person; is that your recollection?

9 A. Yes, correct, yes. I can't say for sure whether he was  
10 the headmaster or not, but that was how I remember him,  
11 because I was fairly young and it's a long time ago.

12 Q. You mentioned Brother Germanus. What you tell us in  
13 your statement is that your mother was very fond of him,  
14 by that you mean your adopted mother, but you yourself  
15 don't really have any memories of him; is that correct?

16 A. Correct, yes. My mother would always say, "Do you  
17 remember such-and-such", and Brother Germanus would be  
18 one of the names that would come up. I think I remember  
19 him just because she always mentioned his name; I don't  
20 really remember him as a teacher.

21 Q. You also mentioned a Brother AKU and I'll come back to  
22 him in a moment.

23 Did you remain a day boy throughout your time at  
24 St Columba's?

25 A. Yes. Yes, I believe there were a couple of times that

1 I stayed at the school, just in a friendly manner, but  
2 I was not in permanent residence at the school.

3 Q. Do I take it from that that at a time in the morning you  
4 would go to school and you'd leave, generally speaking,  
5 some time in the afternoon?

6 A. Correct. Yes, (inaudible: distorted) end up back at the  
7 school in the evening after dinner, just playing with  
8 the children.

9 Q. You'd go back, particularly in the summertime,  
10 I suppose?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. In your statement, from paragraph 34 onwards, you  
13 provide us with some evidence as to the routine and  
14 things that may have happened. I want to ask you about  
15 matters that you touch upon from paragraph 46 onwards,  
16 and in particular what you tell us about Brother AKU .

17 Was Brother AKU one of your teachers?

18 A. Yes, he was.

19 Q. Can you tell us about how he behaved towards you?

20 A. I think he probably had different types of ways of  
21 interacting with people. Around some people, like my  
22 family, obviously, he was a very nice person. In class  
23 he could be -- I dreaded his class. That was in my  
24 statement.

25 He had a tendency to throw things at students and

1 I was one of the students, I think. Pretty much  
2 everybody in the class was a victim of that at some  
3 point or another, but that's kind of what triggered me  
4 in getting involved with the investigation, because that  
5 was one of the things that I talked to my spouse about,  
6 how Brother AKU used to throw dusters at us in class.  
7 That could be for something as simple as watching sports  
8 going on in the field outside, because the playing field  
9 [REDACTED], or it could be for not  
10 understanding your work that you were doing at the time.

11 I believe it was [REDACTED] that he taught  
12 with us. I can't remember specifically which one it  
13 was, but I've never been very good at [REDACTED], so whether  
14 that has anything to do with it or not ... But my  
15 self-esteem was pretty low. He had some (inaudible:  
16 distorted).

17 Q. What were your feelings at the time then if you were to  
18 go to one of Brother AKU classes? How did you feel  
19 about it?

20 A. Dread. The way I described it in my statement was it  
21 was kind of a "better you than me" attitude towards the  
22 children, like if you're the one getting it from  
23 Brother AKU, then maybe it's not going to be me today,  
24 which I don't think is healthy for a child.

25 Q. What you say in your statement is that you think that,

1           psychologically, this behaviour of Brother AKU damaged  
2           you; can you explain that?

3           A. Well, my self-esteem was not very good. As I say, I was  
4           never good at [REDACTED]. I don't know whether that's  
5           a direct connection, just not understanding the [REDACTED],  
6           I don't know if that's connected or not, but  
7           I definitely had some trauma. I used to shake a lot.  
8           I don't know if that was directly related to that or  
9           that was something else previous.

10          Q. And you've mentioned dusters; would he throw anything  
11          else?

12          A. It could be chalk. I think mostly it was dusters but  
13          I recall chalk as well.

14          Q. How often did this happen?

15          A. Fairly frequently. I can't say for sure. Like I say,  
16          it's a long time ago, so I just have the memory of it.  
17          I would say frequent enough to traumatise me.

18          Q. When you went to the school, as we've discussed, you'd  
19          be about 7 years of age. Did this happen when you were  
20          at the school at the very beginning?

21          A. I don't recall (inaudible: distorted). I can't say if  
22          it was something that was progressive or something  
23          (inaudible: distorted) at that school, but maybe  
24          progressive (inaudible: distorted) would be an  
25          assessment to how he approached things with me.



1 Q. Did the dusters ever make contact with you, ever hit  
2 you?

3 A. Yes. I can't recall it ever happening regularly like  
4 that, but yes.

5 Q. Did that happen once or more than once?

6 A. Pardon me?

7 Q. Did hitting you with the duster, striking you with the  
8 duster, happen more than once?

9 A. I can't say for sure, but I know (inaudible: distorted).  
10 It left something with me.

11 Q. One thing you do say is that you have a memory of  
12 walking into his classroom in sheer terror; is that your  
13 memory of that?

14 A. Yes. He shouted a lot, so when he got angry (inaudible:  
15 distorted) some things because it could be -- it all  
16 seemed arbitrary as a child, like who was going to get  
17 hit with a duster. It was very routine.

18 Q. Did you ever tell anybody about this?

19 A. Yes. I talked to Brother Arthur about it when I was --  
20 in my statement also. I can't really remember how the  
21 conversation came up. Sometimes we would just have  
22 conversations and I remember being up in his office  
23 upstairs, above the classrooms, and talking to him about  
24 it.

25 Q. And what did you tell him?

1 A. Basically that I was -- I guess the word I didn't use  
2 was "intimidated", but I was afraid or uncomfortable  
3 being around him. I suppose scared. But there was  
4 a lot of things going on in my life at the time.  
5 We were moving over to Canada, so, as I said in my  
6 statement, he, Brother Arthur -- I wouldn't say coerced,  
7 but he (inaudible: distorted) I was moving away and some  
8 problems could arise if things escalated. He didn't put  
9 it in those terms but they were delivered to a child in  
10 a child's kind of way.

11 Q. When you spoke to Brother Arthur, were you aware at that  
12 time that you were going to be moving to Canada?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Was that in 1981?

15 A. Well, we moved in 1981, but they had been talking about  
16 it for a couple of years and things were in the process.  
17 They were just waiting to get paperwork finalised for me  
18 so they could move. It was something they were working  
19 with at that point.

20 Q. So far as you're aware in relation to what was happening  
21 in the classroom and what you said to Brother Arthur,  
22 did anything change so far as Brother AKU was  
23 concerned?

24 A. No, I would say nothing really changed. (Inaudible:  
25 distorted). I had other incidents that occurred.

1 I can't say what came first or ... There were other  
2 incidents.

3 Q. I'll come to those in a moment, but staying with the  
4 behaviour in the classroom, one thing you also say -- in  
5 fact I don't think it's limited to the classroom -- you  
6 say:

7 "Brother AKU would berate [you] all the time."

8 What do you mean by that?

9 A. Well, if you're not paying attention and you're not  
10 understanding and you're looking out of the window and  
11 you're being yelled at and you're told to pick up the  
12 duster and bring it back, that's what I mean by  
13 berating. I'm already feeling down and afraid and now  
14 you're yelling at me and telling me to bring the duster  
15 back to you.

16 Q. Apart from throwing chalk or throwing a duster, did  
17 Brother AKU make any other contact with you in  
18 a physical way, for example using the strap or anything  
19 else?

20 A. No, I don't believe I ever got the strap at that school.  
21 I got it in a couple of other schools but not in that  
22 one.

23 Q. I think you do tell us that Brother AKU was somebody  
24 who was friendly with your parents; is that right?

25 A. Correct, yes. My family was friendly with all the



1 Marist Brothers. My mother was very religious so she  
2 was really, really fond of them.

3 Q. You tell us about something that happened when you were  
4 getting changed for rugby and that Brother AKU would  
5 stand and watch. Can I just ask you what your  
6 recollection is in relation to that?

7 A. Yes. The first time that that occurred -- it had always  
8 felt odd to me. I came from St Mary's School and  
9 whenever we -- St Mary's was a public school and I guess  
10 you go with what you know. Coming from a public school,  
11 when I had gym class, we changed but we never had to  
12 slip our underwear off. That was one of the thing that  
13 I noticed the first time we had rugby -- and I can't  
14 even say how many times we played rugby. It was just  
15 a regular part of the curriculum for the sports part of  
16 school, but we were all to take our underwear off and  
17 put our little rugby shorts on.

18 But that felt strange and I felt like -- I'm only  
19 speaking for myself, but the reason I got was that most  
20 of the children there felt that was normal, whereas  
21 I felt it was odd. So I don't know if that was because  
22 they were -- how they were raised at the school, maybe  
23 that was the first school that they ever went to,  
24 I don't know, I can't read too much into that. But for  
25 me it was strange.

1 Q. And would Brother AKU stand and watch when you  
2 changed?

3 A. Yes. He would stand at the doors and make sure  
4 everybody stripped down and changed, yes.

5 Q. What you're saying, I think, is you're comparing your  
6 previous experience at St Mary's, where you'd keep your  
7 underwear on, to what was happening at St Columba's, and  
8 you had to remove your underwear before you put on your  
9 rugby shorts?

10 A. Correct. It was almost like an inspection. I think  
11 that would be a good way of putting it.

12 Q. You also tell us about an incident when you scraped your  
13 knee during a rugby scrum and what happened afterwards.

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. Can you tell me about that incident?

16 A. Yes. We were playing rugby and I got just a scratch  
17 from hitting the ground and after the scrum was over  
18 everybody was to go back and change and we went up --  
19 there was like the pantry, it was one of the buildings  
20 at the back of the school. I remember that because  
21 a child had an accident when I was there and he  
22 (inaudible: distorted) the pantry and that's why  
23 I remember it. Yes, he basically had a cloth and was  
24 wiping down my knee, and he just grabbed me for a couple  
25 of seconds on my groin while I was drinking some juice

1 and, like I said, I didn't make any eye contact with  
2 him. It probably only lasted about 4 seconds, and then  
3 he released me and told me to go and get changed. That  
4 was a shock to me.

5 Q. Yes. Your reaction was that you were shocked at what  
6 he'd done?

7 A. I was shocked. I had already been molested by another  
8 child down the road, so I was kind of aware of what was  
9 going on. But this was my teacher and somebody of  
10 confidence, so I was in shock, yes.

11 Q. You've already touched upon speaking to Brother Arthur  
12 about things that were happening to you. Did you tell  
13 Brother Arthur what Brother AKU had done on this  
14 occasion, namely that he had taken hold of your genitals  
15 for a short period?

16 A. It's very hazy, so I think ... I'm going to say no.

17 Q. What age were you when this happened, this particular  
18 incident?

19 A. It would have been close to the time when I left for  
20 Canada, so I would have been somewhere between 7 and 9.  
21 I can't say for sure.

22 Q. You've mentioned already, Thomas, that you and your  
23 adoptive parents left Scotland to go and live in Canada.  
24 I think you tell us in your statement that was in  
25 [REDACTED] 1981; is that about right?

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. And indeed, you've provided the inquiry with  
3 a photograph of yourself and some of the brothers that  
4 was taken on the day you left the school; is that right?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Indeed, I think you tell us that after you moved to  
7 Canada you received some correspondence from the  
8 brothers at St Columba's, or at least your adoptive  
9 parents did?

10 A. Correct.

11 Q. Again, you have provided those letters to the inquiry or  
12 copies of them?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Can I just then look at life after you left Scotland.  
15 You provide details of that to us from paragraph 57  
16 onwards in your statement, and in particular that your  
17 adoptive father wasn't doing very well in the sense that  
18 he had difficulty finding work; is that correct?

19 A. Correct, yes. His demeanour changed.

20 Q. And what happened then?

21 A. Well, he basically became a dark shadow or a cloud over  
22 my life. I didn't understand -- I felt like everything  
23 that was going on was my fault, his frustrations in  
24 life. He didn't want me to assimilate into the country  
25 where I was living. So he'd berate me for my accent

1           changing or the way I spoke words. He wanted me to  
2           remain Scottish.

3           I had more difficulty with mathematics because when  
4           we came over, we switched from imperial to metric, so  
5           there were some violent outbursts from him, big slaps to  
6           the back of the head if I couldn't understand maths  
7           questions, things like that.

8       Q. And you tell us in your statement, in particular, some  
9           details about your private life. You've remained in  
10          Canada, you haven't moved away from Canada, and also --

11       A. Correct.

12       Q. -- you met your wife in 1989 and you're married to her;  
13          is that right?

14       A. Yes, we live in common law, but we're married.

15       Q. I think you said earlier it was your wife who persuaded  
16          you to make contact with the inquiry.

17       A. Yes, we had a good talk about it and she thought  
18          it would be the best thing for me, just to get this out  
19          (inaudible: distorted).

20       Q. What had you told her that made her react by telling you  
21          to contact us?

22       A. Basically, she had just seen me emotionally  
23          disintegrating for the past -- since 2006 when I found  
24          my biological family, and all the information that I've  
25          gathered since then, trying to piece my life back

1           together. I think that's probably what drove it.

2           Q. You have in fact --

3           A. Looking for closure, maybe.

4           Q. Sorry, could you repeat that?

5           A. Looking for closure for myself.

6           Q. You returned to Scotland in 2006; is that right?

7           A. Correct.

8           Q. And back again in 2007 as well?

9           A. Yes.

10          Q. Did you meet members of your biological family?

11          A. Yes, I did, in 2007 I met my mother and my surviving  
12          brothers and sister and some aunts and uncles.

13          (inaudible: distorted) -- I believe it was 2009 -- I got  
14          an emergency call to go and meet him and he actually  
15          passed away while I was on my way over to meet him. The  
16          first time I met my father, it was a funeral, so that's  
17          been traumatic as well.

18          There's been a lot of incidents like that that seem  
19          to occur in my life.

20          Q. But in relation to meeting your biological family, what  
21          sort of an experience was that for you?

22          A. Joyous at first, traumatic later because I found the  
23          history of my family and -- oh, just the things that  
24          have happened to them as well. I mean, there's a lot of  
25          things I could go on about. The things they've gone

1 through kind of make my life look like roses. So it was  
2 traumatic.

3 Q. One thing you do say at paragraph 64 of your statement,  
4 at the end, as you put it:

5 "I think my life has been stolen."

6 What do you mean by that?

7 A. Yes. Well, I never had any explanation as to why I was  
8 taken away from my family and I was always told children  
9 should be seen and not heard and, "I brought you into  
10 this world, I can take you out of this world", "If it  
11 wasn't for us ... your family was terrible". A lot of  
12 negativity directed towards my family without any honest  
13 judgement, you know. I feel like their lives were  
14 stolen, like my life was stolen. My innocence was taken  
15 away by corrupt people in all walks of life.

16 I have very -- I don't have a lot of faith in people  
17 in general. I find most of the people I've interacted  
18 with in my life have let me down in one way or another.

19 Q. You do in your statement, over a number of paragraphs,  
20 beginning at paragraph 66, talk about impact and, in  
21 particular, you talk about the impact that you consider  
22 that Brother AKU behaviour had upon you. Can you  
23 just summarise that for me, please, if you could?

24 A. Well, as I stated, with the schooling and self-esteem,  
25 that would have been one of the first experiences with

1 difficulty in my education, with being shown that  
2 somebody you trust can't be trusted. I mean, this  
3 person knew my history to some degree, so he took  
4 advantage -- I'm sorry, I kind of got sidetracked on the  
5 question a little bit. Could you rephrase that?

6 Q. Yes, of course. I'm looking at the whole issue of  
7 impact on your life and I'm asking you what impact  
8 do you consider that Brother AKU behaviour had on  
9 your life.

10 A. A lack of trust in people for sure, yeah.

11 Q. What you say in your statement, and I'll pick it up at  
12 paragraph 66, is that:

13 "Brother AKU abuse eroded trust. I still don't  
14 trust people to this day. I remember confusion, sadness  
15 and dread heading to his classroom."

16 Are these your recollections of that period in your  
17 life?

18 A. Yes, and it stuck with me my whole life. I'm not going  
19 to say that that's because of Brother AKU that they  
20 stuck with me, but they're definitely familiar emotions  
21 from that time. I think it's probably residual from  
22 everything that has happened in my life because I've had  
23 to struggle since literally my first days of birth and  
24 after birth, so ...

25 Q. And you provide us with some details, Thomas, and



1 I won't read it out, as to the things that have happened  
2 to you and what you may have tried to do to yourself  
3 over your life. Is that right, you've provided us with  
4 these details?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. I think you also say that you have tried counselling.

7 A. Yes, I have. I went into counselling for PTSD, I did  
8 several, about four sessions, and then I got back into  
9 work again, so I had to step out from those sessions,  
10 but they were helpful to some degree.

11 Q. Have you found the counselling to be beneficial?

12 A. Yes, to some degree, but I'm very cynical, so I have  
13 a tendency to look at the other people (inaudible:  
14 distorted) telling myself that I wasn't in the right  
15 groups and things like and that these people don't have  
16 the same issue as me and that there's no connection.

17 Q. So far as records are concerned, I think you have  
18 already mentioned that you have been seeking to get hold  
19 of your social work records. Have you now received some  
20 records?

21 A. Yes, I have. I received them last week and I sent  
22 a copy, an electronic copy, to (inaudible: distorted) in  
23 Edinburgh.

24 Q. I think what you have said is you have just received  
25 very recently some social work information and you've

1 sent that on to the inquiry; is that right?

2 A. Correct, yes. I had been searching for this information  
3 since about 2007 -- actually 2006 when I went to  
4 Edinburgh and the registry office, and I've been chasing  
5 it for years and I've finally got it.

6 Q. With regard to lessons to be learned, where you deal  
7 with that in your statement, one thing you do say  
8 is that there should be a real effort made to  
9 reintegrate children in foster care back into their own  
10 families.

11 A. Correct.

12 Q. That's a view you hold, is it?

13 A. It's a view I hold. That statement was made before  
14 I got my information back from [REDACTED]. I was under  
15 the impression that maybe those steps hadn't been taken,  
16 but it looks like, according to documents that I've got,  
17 they took a lot of steps to try and make things work on  
18 my behalf. But I think ultimately, (inaudible:  
19 distorted) and I'm not sure what it was.

20 Q. Under reference to your hopes for the inquiry, in  
21 paragraph 81 what you say is this:

22 [REDACTED] Brother AKU and [REDACTED]

23 [REDACTED] the duster. [REDACTED]

24 [REDACTED] I knew the person  
25 wasn't lying because I had been telling my wife all

1 along that I had a teacher who used to throw dusters at  
2 us."

3 That's what you've been telling us today. You go on  
4 to say:

5 "I hope I will find some peace from coming forward  
6 to the inquiry knowing that it might help someone down  
7 the road or help myself down the road."

8 That's your hopes for the inquiry and for yourself?

9 A. Yes.

10 MR MacAULAY: Well, thank you, Thomas, for engaging with the  
11 inquiry and answering the questions I've put to you  
12 today. Your statement, as I think I said to you earlier  
13 on, is evidence to the inquiry, so we have that as well.

14 My Lady, I haven't received any questions to put to  
15 Thomas.

16 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for  
17 questions of Thomas? No.

18 Thomas, thank you very much for getting in touch  
19 with us and engaging so as to give your written  
20 statement, which, as Mr MacAulay has already explained,  
21 is evidence before the inquiry itself. But you've added  
22 to that by cooperating with us today to talk to us over  
23 the video link, and that's been really helpful.  
24 Thank you for helping to build the picture that we're  
25 getting of what life was like for boys at the school

1           when you were there. That has been of great assistance  
2           and I'm now able to let you go and get on with the rest  
3           of your day. I hope it's a good one. Thank you.

4       A. Thank you.

5                       (The video link was terminated)

6       MR MacAULAY: That's all the evidence for today, my Lady.

7           Tomorrow we have two oral witnesses and probably  
8           a read-in as well.

9       LADY SMITH: Very well. The usual 10 o'clock start,  
10       I think, tomorrow?

11       MR MacAULAY: Yes.

12       LADY SMITH: That's it for today. Thank you to everybody.

13           I'll rise now and sit again at 10 o'clock tomorrow  
14           morning.

15       (2.47 pm)

16                       (The inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am on  
17                       Wednesday, 9 October 2019)

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

I N D E X

"JAMES" (sworn) .....	1
Questions from MS MacLEOD .....	1
"EDWARD" (sworn) .....	39
Questions from MR MacAULAY .....	40
"THOMAS" (sworn) (via video link) .....	112
Questions from MR MacAULAY .....	112