

Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry

Witness Statement of

Karen Johnson

Support person present: No

Other persons present: Annie Little, Solicitor, Clyde & Co.

1. My name is Karen Johnson and my date of birth is [REDACTED] 1976. My contact details are known to the Inquiry. I am an archivist, working for the Christian Brothers European Province, Marino, Dublin.

Background and employment history.

2. I studied for a degree in Fine Art at The National College of Art and Design in Dublin. After that I worked for one year in art related screen-printing. I then saw a position for an Archival Studentship in 2000. This was with the National Library of Ireland. It was a one year studentship, which led to the Higher Diploma in Archival Studies. I was based in the manuscript department in the National Library, mainly answering enquiries from people and doing research.
3. I also worked in the National Photographic Archive, which is part of The National Library of Ireland, but is located in a different building. I worked there for several weeks. This was to gain experience in all types of archives within the National Library.
4. I then undertook a one year post-graduate course in Archival Studies in University College Dublin, which was a very intensive course. At the time, it was a Higher Diploma but now it is a Masters course. Towards the end of the year our lecturer gave those of us interested a job description and contact details for the Christian Brothers as they were looking for an archivist. The Brothers had made contact with

UCD through the archivist for The Sisters of Mercy. I applied for the position, went for an interview with the Brothers in May, and started work in early June 2002.

5. I was the first professional archivist the Christian Brothers had employed. There had been a Brother dealing with the archives in St Mary's Province before me, but he hadn't worked in the archives for over a year. From looking at the records, there had been Brothers working in the archives since the 1980s.
6. The Irish Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse started in the year 2000, so the Christian Brothers needed someone to deal with all of the enquiries to the archives. Complaints had started coming in since about 1998, possibly earlier. I think the Brothers had been looking for an archivist for about a year before I started.

Christian Brothers

Training/Handover

7. There wasn't really any training as such, when I started. There was one Brother, he wasn't an archivist but he was a historian. He was doing research on the industrial and residential schools run by the Brothers. His name was Brother Leo Judge. He gave me a guide to the structure of the archives, the sources of information we had, the location and names of the Industrial schools, the day schools and other residential schools. There were many schools called, "St Joseph's" so in the beginning I relied on Brother Judge to learn which school was where.

Work duties

8. Most of my work since 2002 has been in answering enquiries from The Irish Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse, The Residential Institutions Redress Board, An Garda Síochána, the UK Police, Solicitors and The Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry. There are also many enquiries from members of the public tracing their family history. There are enquiries from schools celebrating 50, 100 or 150 years in operation, and they are looking to explore the history of these schools. The Brothers

and staff in the administration offices in the Province Centre and Brothers in Communities also have requests for information from the archives from time to time.

9. I carry out research and copy records for these people and organisations. I also process any records from communities or schools that are closing down. I create and use finding aids to find specific records. A finding aid is anything that can help you to find records in the archives.
10. In terms of archives that we hold, in Ireland there were two Christian Brothers Provinces. There was one originally then in 1956 a line was drawn from Dublin to Galway. St Mary's Province was to the north of that line which included Northern Ireland and St Helen's was the name of the Southern Province. In 1945 the English Province, St Mary's England was established. These three Provinces remained in existence up until 2007, when they amalgamated. There are archives for each of these Provinces. St Mary's Province, England covers St Ninian's in Scotland. St Ninian's was the only residential school run by the Christian Brothers in Scotland, although they did have a day school in Edinburgh. We have separate finding aids for each of the three Provincial archives.
11. The main finding aid for St Mary's Ireland is a huge Word document, St Helens has a database and I created a list in Word for the English Province Archive in 2006. Smaller lists and databases have been created relating to individual schools and residents. Before that, there were typed paper records with basic indexing for the Irish Provinces. For St Ninian's there is also a list of the Brothers and a list of lay staff, which are forms of finding aids. A lot of the records have now been digitised.
12. One of the Brothers, Brother Frank Crummey, has been coming in to work at the archive twice a week since 2002. He has been scanning photographs and other documents. It is useful to have these records digitised, rather than risk damaging the physical documents by repeated handling. Brother Crummey usually focusses on photographs, what is used most often and what is most useful to have in digital format. In relation to St Ninian's he scanned the register, annals and log books first,

the correspondence was scanned later when we began to get the Section 21 Notice's from the Inquiry.

13. We don't generally scan correspondence files, unless it relates to an inquiry coming in. We have focused on photographs and registers.
14. The only Order I deal with is the Christian Brothers, and the only residential school they had in Scotland was St Ninian's.

The Archive, Griffith Avenue, Marino, Dublin

15. The three Provinces, St Mary's Ireland, St Helen's Ireland and St Mary's England amalgamated in 2007. Plans for a new archive to accommodate all three archives were drawn up in 2005 or 2006. However, it was in 2008 when all three provinces amalgamated their records in the new archive in Marino. St Ninian's in Scotland would have come under the jurisdiction of St Mary's Province England, which also had schools in Liberia.
16. I was involved in designing the new archive. I knew the extent of St Mary's Ireland and St Helen's Ireland archives and there were also records previously stored in The Allen Library, named after Brother Allen, in Dublin. He collected rare books. He had a section relating to Irish Independence and some records relating to the Congregation. I was also familiar with the archives of the General Council, which is now called the Congregation Leadership Team. Their archives were in Rome (the Generalate Archive). The plan was to bring all archives to Dublin, and place them in the new Archive. I wasn't yet familiar with the archives of St. Mary's England so I was invited by the Brothers to visit the English Province archive in their Provincialate "Woodeaves" in Manchester in 2006.
17. "Woodleaves" has been a Christian Brothers' residence since about 1945. The Provincial Council moved in to that building in 1992. Before that, the Provincial archives were stored in Liverpool, and before that they were in Bath up to around 1986. The St Ninian's collection was part of the Provincial archives that were moved

from Bath to Liverpool to Woodeaves. I have provided photographs showing the Archive in “Woodeaves” and also the Province Centre archive in Marino.

Photograph 1

18. This is a photograph of Woodeaves, in Manchester. This previously contained the archive for St Mary’s, England. The archive there was just a small room, round the other side of the house. The Provincial Council only moved into that building in 1992.

Photographs 2 to 10

19. Photographs 2 and 3 show the English Province archive as it was when I arrived. These show sections of the Archive room. Everything was boxed in different sized cardboard boxes. I realised that everything in the archive would have to go into standard size archive boxes before it could be transferred safely to Marino. I made about 10 visits to Woodeaves in 2006 to rebox the full collection into archive boxes. At the same time I created a list of the material held in the archive. Photograph 4 shows the standard archive boxes into which the collections were transferred, these would fit into the new shelving system in Marino. I used the same coding system as we had in St Mary’s Ireland and St Helen’s Ireland. The SME stands for St Mary’s England. We use letters for the bay of shelving and numbers for the shelves, L and R stand for left and right. This was in continuation of the system that had originally been used in Ireland. Photograph 5 is the cover of the list of the archives I made in Woodeaves in 2006. This list covers the entire collection that was transferred from Woodeaves to Marino in 2008. The list of material for the St Ninian’s Falkland collection appears on pages 15 and 16. This is important since there has been much concern over the number of log books available in relation to St Ninian’s. Photograph 6 shows page 15 of the list. This list clearly shows the collection transferred from Woodeaves to Marino in relation to St Ninian’s. It is clear that only 3 log books (listed here as day books 1951-68, 1950-61 and 1969-76) were recorded by me as being in the archive in Woodeaves in 2006. The same 3 log books were transferred from

Woodeaves to Marino in 2008. The same 3 log books are currently in the archive in Marino. Digital copies of the same 3 log books were provided to the Inquiry in 2018. There were no further log books for St Ninian's in the archive in Woodeaves in 2006, there were no further log books for St Ninian's transferred from Woodeaves to Dublin in 2008. There are no further log books for St Ninian's in the archives in Marino.

Photograph 7 shows page 16 of the list and includes the box containing the photographs of St Ninian's. Photograph 8 includes another reference to the photographs. Photographs 9 and 10 show where Falkland appears elsewhere on the main list under sections on accounts. These photographs and accounts have been provided to the Inquiry.

Photograph 11

20. This shows the Christian Brothers Province Centre, Griffith Avenue, Marino, Dublin. MIE (Marino Institute of Education), the teacher training college is the older building on the left hand side. The Province Centre buildings are on the right hand side. The 2 top floors are administration, and the ground floor is the archive, with storerooms built into the hillside. This helps to control the temperature and humidity in the archive.

Photograph 12

21. This is the office area and reading room in the archive, some finding aids which are printed, are stored in the left hand side shelf, these are in addition to the digital finding aids. Brother Greg Wall works here too. He was involved with creating indexes to the St Ninian's correspondence and he has also typed up the log books. Another Brother, Brother Frank Crummey does the scanning, twice a week, he has been mentioned already.

Photographs 13A to 13B

22. Photograph 13A is the door into the storerooms. 13B is the airlock corridor that we have at the Archive, to maintain a consistent atmosphere for the documents.

Photographs 14 to 15

23. Photograph 14 shows the 3 doors to the large store rooms. Photograph 15 shows the fire and water detection alarm systems. The water detection system has sensors on the floor in each room, in case of leaks or flooding.

Photograph 16

24. This is the plan of one of the Archive Store rooms, one of the others is a mirror image of this one.

Photograph 17

25. This is the mobile shelving system. This room contains the European Province archives, St Helen's and St Mary's Ireland, St Mary's England and the Allen Library collections. The blue boxes are St Mary's England which includes the St Ninian's collection.

Photograph 18

26. These are the archives for St Mary's, Ireland.

Photograph 19

27. These are the records for St Mary's England which were transferred from Woodeaves in 2008. These include St Ninian's, Falkland. The two boxes for St Ninian's are marked at C01L and C01R.

Photographs 20 to 23

28. Photograph 20 shows the photographs for the three Provinces all stored together in one row. These include the box of photographs from St Ninian's, Falkland, this one is indicated. Photograph 21 is a close-up of the label of this box. Photograph 22 shows the contents of the box. Photo 23 shows the contents laid out, outside of the box.

Photographs 24 to 25

29. Photos 24 and 25 show the brown photo album that was given to the Brothers by MKF in 1991 and the blue folder on the left contains photographs and the newsletters for St Ninian's.

Photograph 26

30. This shows the two boxes on the bottom shelf of the St Mary's England archives containing all the records that we have in the Provincial archives relating to St Ninian's, Falkland. These are the box codes (C01R and C01L) that are included in the list of St Ninian's Falkland material referred to in paragraph 19 above and are shown in photos 6 and 7.

Photograph 27

31. This is the contents of box C01R containing the Admission register and the 3 Log Books for St Ninian's, Falkland. That is all that is in that box and all that is recorded on the list in photo 6 as being in that box.

Photograph 28 to 30

32. Photograph 28 shows the contents of box C01R laid out on a table, out of the box. The large brown book on the right is the admission register, the 3 smaller books are the log books, also known as the day books. Photographs 29 and 30 show the 3 log books, open on the first page showing the dates they were begun, 1951, 1951 and

1969. These are the 3 log books referred to in the list shown in photo 6 and referred to in paragraph 19 above. There are no other log books for St Ninian's in the archive. Digital copies of all 3 log books have been provided to the Inquiry.

Photograph 31

33. This is the last of the 3 Log Books for St Ninian's, Falkland held in the archive, it covers the years 1969-76. The last entry was made on 9 July 1976. The SNR up to July 1976 was Brother MHJ. When he was relieved of his position as SNR he stopped writing the log. The log was not continued in this book.

Photograph 32

34. This is a close-up of the Log Book, again showing the last entry. This photograph shows the amount of blank pages left in the log book in July 1976. If the log was continued by the next SNR in July or August 1976 it would have been normal practice for him to continue writing in this book. It would appear that the log book was not maintained after 9 July 1976.

Photograph 33 to 34

35. These are blank pages after the last entry in the Log Book dated 9 July 1976. There were quite a lot of blank pages after the last entry in July 1976. They have not been written on at all. I do not know if there was another separate book started by either the new Superior, or the Headmaster, that has been lost since, that is a question we have been trying to answer since 2013. In 2006 I listed the 3 log/day books and did not pay any more or less attention to those than any other material I was listing in the archive in Woodeaves at the time. The 3 log books, up to 1976 were transferred with the rest of the English Province collection to Dublin in 2008. It was not until 2013 when the Police began making enquiries about St Ninian's that questions began to be asked about the possible existence of a log book covering the period 1976-1983. The notes I made of the unexpected visit by the Gardai to the archives in Marino on

behalf of the Scottish Police in 2014 were made available to the Scottish Inquiry in 2018.

Photograph 35

36. This is the inside cover of the Admission Register for St Ninian's, Falkland.

Photograph 36

37. This is a list of material relating to St Ninian's, Falkland written in pencil by somebody who had access to the St Ninian's archive. This list is important as it lists the same 3 log books listed in my list of 2006. We tried to find out who wrote the list, but nobody recognised the handwriting. It must have been written between 1991 and 2006, as MKF photo album is included. It only includes the same three Log Books, up to July 1976. It is unfortunate that we could not find out who wrote the list. It would have been useful to be able to date the list as that would have confirmed another earlier date that the collection contained only 3 log books.

Photograph 37

38. This shows the other side of the papers shown in photograph 36, the back of the documents that the handwritten lists were written on. The Provincialate in Bath moved to Liverpool in 1986.

Photograph 38 (a-f)

39. This is a photocopy of the list shown in photograph 36. 38b shows item 4 as the log book 1951-1968, 38c shows item 5 as log book 1969-1976 and item 6 is log book (summary of others 1951-1960). These are the only 3 log books on the list, the same 3 log books on my list in photo 6. (I typed 1950-61 instead of 1951-61 in 2006). These lists were shown to the Gardai when they visited the archive in 2014 with a warrant seeking records. During that visit I provided photocopies and scans of the records they were looking for from 1970-1983, including the log book entries from

1970-76. The Gardai were reassured by the lists as they are confirmation that the archive only holds 3 log books for St Ninian's and that the same 3 log books were all that were in the archive in Woodeaves in 2006. The Gardai were satisfied that the archive didn't hold any log books for St Ninian's after July 1976. As mentioned, the notes I made of the unexpected visit by the Gardai to the archives in Marino on behalf of the Scottish Police in 2014 were made available to the Scottish Inquiry in 2018.

Photograph 39

40. This is a solicitors' letter from Hill Dickinson, the Brothers' solicitors relating to the St Ninian's documents they returned to Woodeaves during an investigation in 1998. I found this in one of the complainants' files that has been provided to the Inquiry. I came across it when I was scanning the file for the Inquiry. The solicitors had borrowed the St Ninian's collection and were returning most of it with the exception of the correspondence at that time. I have made notes on this letter to give further descriptions to the items the solicitor listed. The 3 log books shown in photograph 28 are listed here. No. 8 is the blue and black log book 1951-61, No. 7 is the red log book 1951-68, No. 2 is the wine and black log book 1969-76. No. 6, the item listed as the brown day book must be the book of Annals. The brown Annals book is shown in photo 41. The solicitor noted that he was retaining the correspondence files, he did not mention that he was retaining another log book. The correspondence files were returned. A request has recently been sent to Hill Dickinson's Solicitors to search their old files relating to St Ninian's investigations in 1998 for any reference to a log book that could cover the period 1976-83.

Photograph 40

41. This is a list of the Superiors and Headmasters of St Ninian's from 1976-1983. These are the Brothers who should have kept the records including the log books. The Log book was kept up to 9th July 1976 at which time Brother **MHJ** finished up as **SNR**. The remainder of that log book is blank. It would appear that Brother Coffey, the next **SNR** did not continue writing the log book. In the visitation report

of [REDACTED] 1977 there is a reference to the [REDACTED] SNR keeping a log. [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] LNA [REDACTED] If Brother [REDACTED] LNA did keep a log, he did not continue writing it in the same book that covers the period 1969-76. As seen above there were plenty of pages left in that book, Brother [REDACTED] MHJ Brother Coffey, Brother [REDACTED] MBS and Brother [REDACTED] LNA are all deceased. Former Brother Farrell is alive and is currently in prison. He could be asked if he or Brother [REDACTED] MBS kept a log book during the period 1981-83. He could also be asked if he remembers a log book for the period 1976-81.

Photograph 41 to 49

42. Photo 41 is box C01L showing the brown cover of the Annals, the record of events of the Falkland Community. Photo 42-48 show the correspondence files and other pieces of documentation that are all also listed in the 2006 list shown in photos 6 and 7. Photo 49 shows the first page of the book of annals. All of this documentation was provided to the Inquiry in 2018.

Photographs 50 to 51

43. This is another storeroom, it contains the Generalate archives, these are the archives that were transferred from Rome to Marino in 2015.

Photograph 52

44. These are the Visitation Reports held in the Generalate archives that came from Rome. They include the visitation reports for St Ninian's, Falkland which were all provided to the Inquiry in 2018.

Photograph 53

45. This is the Generalate correspondence with St Mary's Province, England (in the Generalate archives). These boxes have been gone through and any document

referring to St Ninian's and Falkland have been copied and provided to the Inquiry in 2018.

Photograph 54

46. These are the boxes containing Brothers' Generalate files, kept in alphabetical order. Some files which made reference to Falkland have been provided to the Inquiry in 2018.

Photograph 55

47. These are the archive collections for the Irish Industrial schools. There are no individual files for residents of these schools until we get into the 1980s and 1990s. Most of the schools were closed before that time, just 2 remained open after 1974. For the schools, which closed before the mid-1970s loose items such as Birth Certificates or Orders of Detention were filed in numerical or alphabetical order and not on individual residents' files. It did not seem unusual to me that there are no individual files for residents of Falkland as it closed in the very early 1980s.
48. This is a close-up of a section of photograph 55. This shows the Detention Orders filed in numerical order. We only hold individual hanging files for residents of schools that stayed in existence well into the 1990s. In the earlier decades documentation received on individuals such as Orders of Detention were saved all together in numerical order.

My role assisting the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry

49. When documents are requested, if they have not been scanned already, either Brother Crummey or I will scan them. Those documents are then shared with Clyde & Co. Solicitors via fileshare who provide them to the Inquiry.

50. I have been responsible for creating an inventory of the documents requested and uploading them to the fileshare, and doing any other research required.
51. The last Section 21 notice we received requested a list of the Brothers and their roles and responsibilities. There was also a request for a list of staff from 1950 to 1983. I had provided these lists for the period 1970-83 previously but for this notice, I went right back to 1950 and included roles and responsibilities of each individual if this information was found in the records.
52. For each Section 21 notice we receive, I check through it and work out what is required and respond accordingly. The exception to this was the large Section 21 notice for which Parts A & B were due in March 2017 and Parts C & D were due in April 2017. I did not compile the responses to the questions in that notice.
53. Michael Madigan who is now a former Brother, came in to write the responses to Parts A-D in 2017. I took out the archival material for him to look at, and answered any questions he had. He was responsible for the content, and I helped him with formatting the final response. I copied and pasted his responses under the relevant questions asked in the notice.
54. I have only been asked to investigate St Ninian's, Falkland for the Scottish Inquiry. The Brothers had a school in Edinburgh, but that was a day school, so that would not come within the terms of reference of this Inquiry.

St Ninian's records

55. There is a book of Annals kept for each Community of Brothers. The Superior of the Community should record significant events in the life of the Brothers living in the Community in the house Annals. Very often this included events happening in the school or schools connected with the Brothers' community. Events were usually recorded regularly in chronological order. Annals were kept for St Ninian's, but they were not kept very well or regularly. They were supposed to be updated daily or weekly, but I have seen a reference to the Annals not being updated for a period of

20 or 30 years. So a Brother that had been in St Ninian's for a long time had to write them from memory and using information from the available log books.

The Log Books

56. Log books were kept at St Ninian's from 1951 up until 1976, and they were kept reasonably well. The Superior was responsible for the Annals, and kept two of the log books that are in existence 1951-68 and 1969-76. The log for 1951-61 seems to have been kept mainly by the headmasters. The day schools did not keep log books. The log books record the numbers in the school and contain references to events relating to the school, the residents, visitors and the Brothers. Examples of events include the arrival of new boys, visits by the Children's Officers or the HMI Inspectors, Christmas or Halloween parties, names of those who absconded, some records of punishments were recorded in the earlier years, camping holidays or trips abroad, the dates of panel hearings and the dates residents left the school were also recorded. Occasionally references were made to staff arrival and departures. The books were kept in chronological order. As referred to in paragraphs 19 and 31-41 above there are 3 log books available for St Ninian's 1951-68, 1951-61 and 1969-76. There is some overlap, as two of the books (book 1951-61 and book 1951-68) both cover the 1950s. The book 1951-61 appears to have been written mainly by the headmasters and the 1951-68 book was written by the Superiors.
57. The log book from 10 July 1976 onwards is either missing or was not written. I cannot conclude which. It is not clear if any log books are actually missing. It/they may have simply not been written at all. The last entry in the log book covering the period 1968-1976 is 9th July 1976. There is no entry in the book after that date even though there are plenty of blank pages which could have been used. It is not clear if another log book was begun at any stage during the period July 1976 up until the school closed in 1983. See paragraph 19 and paragraphs 31-41. In relation to searches made, the focus has initially been on who wrote the handwritten list referred to in paragraphs 37-39 and shown in photographs 38(a-f). Searches have also been made in the full St. Mary's Province England archive just in case a log book for St Ninian's was placed with a collection for a different school. No further log

book for St Ninian's has been found. A request for a search to be made in Hill Dickinson's Solicitors, who borrowed the collection in 1998, was recently sent, see paragraph 40. We have yet to hear of any results of that search. The Scottish Police were searching for a log book for the period 1976-83 in 2014 see paragraph 35. The Brothers' houses which were used as the Provincialate and where the archives would have been situated between 1983 and 1992 in Bath and Liverpool are no longer occupied by the Christian Brothers. I have not seen any document containing a list of documents being destroyed, or any such information.

58. Towards the end of 2018, we provided copies of St Ninian's complainants' files to the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry. While copying the files, I came across a letter from the Brothers' solicitors in England. This letter is referred to in paragraph 40 above and can be seen in photo 39. In 1998, there was some kind of investigation involving the police. Brother ^{LNC} [REDACTED] was interviewed at that stage. The St Ninian's records were loaned to Hill Dickinson solicitors at that time. Photo 39 is the letter from Hill Dickinson solicitors saying what was returned to the Brothers. See paragraph 40 for further detail.
59. I was talking to Brother ^{LNC} [REDACTED] about Liberia and the school the Brothers had there in September 2018. I asked him about the log books for Falkland, and he remembered quite clearly that when he was interviewed in 1998, that there were three log books. The same three log books referred to in paragraph 19 above. When members of An Garda Siochana visited the archive in 2014, Detective Scott said that the Scottish Police had a reference from 2000 to seeing a log book covering the period post 1976. I referred to this in my notes on this visit which have been made available to the Inquiry. See also paragraph 35 above. I do not know what document, if any, the Scottish Police might have in relation to this sighting of a later log book. The St Ninian's collection was loaned to Hill Dickinson solicitors as referred to in paragraphs 40 and 58 above but I don't know if the collection was loaned to the police at any stage around that time (1998-2000). The collection is the St Ninian's collection from the St Mary's England archive, contained in boxes C01L, C01R and 1 box of photographs. The same collection listed in photos 6 and 7 and referred to in photo 39. It is hard to know if there was another log book written after July 1976. The

last log book entry was in July 1976 but there is a reference in the Visitation Report of November 1977 to SNR [REDACTED] keeping a log. The reference is as follows: 'No Annals were submitted. SNR [REDACTED] keeps a log'. The Visitation Report was provided to the Inquiry in 2018. That was all that was recorded in the Visitation Report about the log, it does not say that the log was submitted to the visitor and there is no description of it. The reference only suggests that a log was kept by SNR [REDACTED] who would have been Brother LNA [REDACTED] in [REDACTED]. Perhaps the SNR [REDACTED] said to the visitor casually that SNR [REDACTED] kept a log when in reality SNR [REDACTED] should have been keeping a log. I had always assumed that it was the SNR [REDACTED] who kept the log. When Brother BHD [REDACTED] was SNR [REDACTED] he kept the log book from [REDACTED]. He was also the SNR [REDACTED] at that time. Brother MHJ [REDACTED] took over as SNR [REDACTED] from Brother BHD [REDACTED] in [REDACTED] and continued the log book up until [REDACTED]. Brother LNA [REDACTED] was the SNR [REDACTED] in [REDACTED] and continued as SNR [REDACTED] up to [REDACTED]. When I spoke to Brother MHG [REDACTED] who was at Falkland between [REDACTED] he believed that the SNR [REDACTED] not the SNR [REDACTED] would have been the one who kept a log book. He said this was because at that time the SNR [REDACTED] was more involved with the residents than the SNR [REDACTED]. See also paragraph 41 and photo 40 which shows that the SNR [REDACTED] from [REDACTED] was Brother LNA [REDACTED] and from [REDACTED] was [REDACTED]. The visitation report of November [REDACTED] suggests that Brother LNA [REDACTED] kept a log but if you read the visitation reports for the period he was in the school which outline the amount of work he was involved in from early morning to late in the evening, it could have been the case that he was too busy to regularly keep a log. If he did write a log book, I would ask why he didn't continue to write it in the existing book. As mentioned in paragraph 41, John Farrell is the only individual still alive on the list of SNR [REDACTED] from 1976-83. He may know if a log was kept for that period.

Keeping of records

60. In the earlier days of the school, at times during the 1950s to the 1970s, the Superior could also have been the Headmaster of the school. From 1974 onwards, one man was the Superior, and another man was the Headmaster.

61. Most of the correspondence in the St Ninian's collection would have been kept at the Provincialate, the residence where members of the Provincial Council lived, had offices and usually held their meetings. The records and archives of the Provincial Council were held in the Provincialate which moved from Bath to Liverpool in 1986 and to Woodeaves in Manchester in 1992. There are also some pieces of correspondence that have come from St Ninian's itself with the Annals, the register and the log books. There is a List of Staff from 1982 and there are some timetables and letters to the Brothers at the time of the closure of the school. Anything else is very scant for St Ninian's. It appears that when the school closed in 1983, some material was disposed of, most likely the accounts. The Visitation Report mentions the Bursar coming in to do the accounts, but the account records have not survived. We do not know exactly what was disposed of when the school closed, only that certainly some accounts were. There are no documents that provide any information on what may have been disposed of before or after the school closed.
62. In the late 1970s, there was a reference to Brother Lovelady coming in to take charge of the accounts and to divide the House and School accounts which suggests that up until then they were kept as one account. Those accounts should have been sent to the Provincialate when the school closed but it would appear that they were not. It seems that accounts were often disposed of as they were thought of as having less value than records such as registers of pupils. If any accounts are kept there is then greater value in the records that are available. For example, a cheque payment book would say where the school bought supplies but it might also show payments for staff wages for the nurse, the cook, or the doctor. Unfortunately no such account books have survived for St Ninian's.
63. At St Ninian's, Mr ^{BHB} was not a registered teacher, so he was most likely paid through the cheque payments book.
64. Artane Industrial School, in Dublin, had forty lay staff, so they kept wages books for staff for many years. The smaller schools did not keep wages books. If they had a handful of lay staff, they were just paid through the cheque payments books. We don't have any of the cheque payment books for St Ninian's. The only accounts we

have for St Ninian's are the returns sent to the Provincialate, from 1978 to 1981 and some financial correspondence from 1946-58. It is hard to know if the accounts were actually kept in St Ninian's and then disposed of gradually over the years, or if all accounts were disposed of when the school closed. It is hard to know what form the accounts were even kept in.

65. When St Ninian's school closed, there was no one particularly in charge of its archives other than the SNR [REDACTED] and perhaps the SNR [REDACTED], Brother MBS [REDACTED] and former Brother Farrell, as there was no professional archivist employed by the Province at that time. The Provincial or a member of the Council may have given some direction regarding the retention of records at the time. There were two Brothers in Ireland in the 1980s, working in the archives, but there is no mention of anyone working in them in the English Provincialate at that time, where the St Ninian's records were transferred. It is possible that someone could have been working in the English archives, but I have not seen any mention of it.
66. Now, if the Brothers are closing a house, I go to check if any records are in the house, and go through wardrobes and bookshelves etc. looking for any records or archives. If a school is closing or amalgamating with another school I may be asked to visit the school and transfer the records from that school to the archives.
67. Correspondence from the Local Authority would have been directed to the Superior in St Ninian's. Later, towards the late 1970s and early 1980s it was most likely addressed to the headmaster.
68. Correspondence towards the closure of St Ninian's includes some letters from the Local Authorities (Tayside, Lothian and Strathclyde) who placed the children in St Ninian's expressing dissatisfaction that the school was closing. These were addressed to the Headmaster, Brother Farrell. He copied them and sent them to the Provincial. These are letters from social workers in the local authorities who were disappointed that St Ninian's was to close as there did not seem to be any other suitable school for the kind of boy admitted to St Ninian's. The social workers did not

wish for these boys to be admitted to reformatory type schools. These letters have been provided to the Inquiry.

69. I am not aware of how the finance from the Local Authority to St Ninian's was provided or who the financial correspondence was sent to. It may have come to the Superior or Headmaster, and they then may have given it to the Bursar.
70. There are many references in the log books to Children's Officers visiting, but no reference to correspondence arranging the visits.
71. In the admission register some of the dates of birth of the children admitted are wrong. This has become apparent when requests for information have come in from former residents, and I have gone to check the records.
72. It is possible that there may not have been official documents provided by the local authorities to the Brothers containing the child's date of birth. That information may have been passed along verbally from someone reading a handwritten note and reading 27 instead of 21, for example. Also names of the children are often recorded inaccurately with misspelled Christian names or wrong or alternative surnames. This implies that there was not proper documentation provided to the Brothers for the children coming in, as I would have expected such documentation to include correct dates of birth and correct spelling of names. Again this information may have been given over the phone or in person when a boy was admitted.
73. In the records for the Irish Industrial schools run by the Brothers there are accurate dates of birth and names and information relating to parents for boys who were admitted to the schools by a court order, but these details are not so good for those who came in through the Local Authorities or health boards. Records for those admitted through local authorities in Ireland have far less information in the records than those admitted by the courts. This is also true of the St Ninian's records, there is very little information, very often I find inaccuracies in the register and parents' names and any other details are rarely recorded. This makes me wonder what information was given to the school by the local authorities involved in sending

children to St Ninian's, if any, and how. It is my understanding that boys were admitted to St Ninian's by the local authorities and not through the court system. Had the boys been admitted through the court system, the information in the register might have been more accurate and fuller in content. If any documentation was provided by the local authorities to the school, I don't know if they would have taken any documents back after a child had left or was transferred from St Ninian's.

Children's records

74. The only sources we have for former pupils are the register, the log books, the newsletters and the general correspondence files. The latter contains very little reference to pupils. There are no individual pupil files for St Ninian's in the archive. I don't know if individual or separate children's files were kept at St Ninian's at all. As mentioned, it is hard to know what documentation the Brothers received from the local authorities in relation to individual pupils. As mentioned in paragraphs 47 and 48 above I was not surprised that there are no individual files for residents of St Ninian's especially for the decades 1950s -1970s. Had there been any admission correspondence or reports in St Ninian's relating to individual residents in later years, it has not survived. It is hard to know if any such documentation, if it was provided to the Brothers was disposed of when a pupil left the school or when the school closed. I don't know if there were Visitor Books at St Ninian's. We have not come across any such record, nor any reference to them in the records that we do have. The log books do refer to visitors.

Punishment books

75. The early log books do record punishments, for example, if a few boys absconded their names were recorded in the log book and it was also recorded that they got four slaps, or I think the phrase used was strokes.

76. There is no separate punishment book for St Ninian's and no reference to any such books. I am not aware if the legislation required there to be a separate punishment book.

Admission/Discharge Register

77. There is one admission/discharge register from 1951 to 1983, which covers the whole period the school was in operation, until it closed in June 1983. There were some errors regarding names and dates of birth, but the record was kept reasonably well.
78. I am not aware of copies of returns to the Home Office being kept. I have not seen anything like that. I have no idea if any such record was kept, but not retained after closure of the school.

Visitations

79. Visitations would have been made by members of the Provincial Council who would visit the school for three or four days, and then write a report to the General Council.
80. The visitation reports were sent to the General Council which was in Dublin up to 1966. The reports were filed in the Generalate archives which were in Rome from 1966-2015, they are now back in Dublin. Copies were not kept at St Ninian's at the time. All of the reports were returned from Rome, and we had access to them at the time of the relevant Section 21 notice from the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry. All of the St Ninian's visitation reports have been provided to the Inquiry.

Local Authority inspections or Reports

81. I don't think there were any inspections by the Local Authority. I don't recall seeing any reference to such inspections or reports. There are references in the log books

to visits by the Children's Officers but there is no sign of any report issued after such visits.

82. There are two blue boxes in Saint Mary's England archives containing everything we have from St Ninian's, Falkland. There is also one box of photographs.
83. In the log books, there are a number of references to visits by HMI inspectors, but no reports of the inspections or copy reports.
84. Everything that relates to St Ninian's and all documents which have been requested by the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry have been provided to the Inquiry. I have been responsible for the later notices from the Inquiry from about October 2018 to date, as they mostly involved providing documentation.
85. The complainants' files are not held in the archive. They are held in the legal office, which is in the administration part of the building, with one drawer of a filing cabinet for Scotland.

Menus of food

86. I don't remember seeing anything about menus in St Ninian's, unless they were referred to in a visitation report perhaps. For some schools, they did make reference to menus, but I can't recall anything like that for St Ninian's.

Redaction of records

87. Clyde & Co. solicitors said that they would deal with redaction themselves for all of the documentation to be sent to the Inquiry. For individual complainants, for example in responding to a request for records for a legal action, I would have redacted the names of other residents in the documents. So copies of documents on complainants' files have been redacted to remove other residents' names, but the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry has a copy of the full register of all the residents.

88. I have not redacted any of the general correspondence. I don't know if Clyde & Co Solicitors have.

Individual children's records

89. I don't know if individual children's records were kept in St Ninian's. There are no such individual files for residents of St Ninian's in the archive. As mentioned, the only sources we have for former residents are the admission register, the log books, the newsletters and the general correspondence. I don't know if progress reports, for example to put before a Children's Panel were created. I don't know if any documentation was provided by the Children's Panel to the school. I would not have expected there to be individual files for residents during the 1950s to 1970s. I would have expected record keeping practices to be similar to how they were in Ireland at the time. I don't know if there was a file for each individual child at St Ninian's, in the later years (late 1970s and early 1980s). No such files are contained in the St Ninian's collection transferred from Woodeaves to Marino in 2008. All available records for residents of St Ninian's have been provided to the Inquiry. When individual children's records were requested by the Inquiry all I could do was extract individual entries from the available records such as the admission register, the log books, the newsletters and correspondence and place them in a folder for each individual on the fileshare. This was to make it easier for the Inquiry to access the records they had already been provided with in their entirety.
90. One thing that struck me when reading over the statement made by LNC [REDACTED] in 1998 was that he referred to a file or documents relating to [REDACTED] who died in 1960. It makes me think that they must have kept some records for pupils at the school. LNC [REDACTED] says in his statement that when he looked for [REDACTED] medical records after he died, that they had been taken by the Children's Officer. It would seem that there might have been some medical file for [REDACTED] who had a serious heart condition but perhaps this was not the case for other residents.

91. I think the Children's Officers were from the Local Authorities. Some names of the Children's Officers are mentioned in the log books. They came to St Ninian's every few months to visit certain children from their area. If there were individual children's records at St Ninian's, I don't know if they went with the child when they moved to another school or not. If there were any individual records or files in St Ninian's, I would suggest that they are more likely to have existed or been better in the years just before the school closed in 1983, as opposed to any records kept in the 1950s to 1970s.
92. I don't know if medical records were kept at the school. I think the children went out to the local doctor in Falkland. There was no infirmary at St Ninian's, if someone was sick, I get the impression that they would have just stayed in their own bed. They wouldn't have been moved to a separate infirmary like they were in Irish Industrial schools. I don't know if residents were registered with the local G.P.

Educational records

93. The archive does not hold any educational records from St Ninian's. There are no school roll books for example. I don't know what the normal practice in Scotland was, but in Ireland, the roll books had to be kept in primary schools. If there were any state records such as roll books in St Ninian's, they might have gone to the National Archive after the school closed. The residents in St Ninian's were over primary school age, about 14 or 15 years of age on average, so I do not know if there was a requirement to keep roll books for secondary school aged children in Scotland at the time.
94. If there were roll books of all boys in classes at St Ninian's, I don't see how one Local Authority could have claimed them. I would think if they were transferred anywhere it would have been to the National Archives.

Correspondence and financial records

95. The correspondence files are mostly of correspondence between the Superior at St Ninian's and the Provincial Council.
96. There are three years of audited end of year accounts, but they were sent to the Provincial Council, they were not kept in the school.
97. I am aware that there was a Bursar in the school who must have kept some financial records, but it seems that these were not transferred to the Provinciate when the school closed in 1983.

Employees

98. There is one list of employees from 1982, when the school was going to close. This was possibly created to calculate redundancy payments due, so we have the names, dates of birth, and dates of employment for the staff, at that time. Other than that, we have to search through other records for any reference to any other lay staff. A list of lay staff found in the available records from 1950-83 has been provided to the Inquiry. There are no wages books or contracts of employment for employees of St Ninian's in the archives.
99. There is one timetable, which lists teachers and other supervisory staff. This information has been included in the list of lay staff for 1950-83. When compiling the list of lay staff I went through all available documentation for references to teachers, for example Mr BHB appears quite often. I also checked through the log books, and found references to when a particular cook had started at the school, references like that. Any reference to lay staff found in the log books, Annals, correspondence, newsletters or on any document has been included in the list of lay staff provided to the Inquiry.
100. For some years it can be very difficult to know who the lay teaching staff were, and when exactly they were working in St Ninian's. For schools in Ireland there was an annual list of staff held centrally, so it is quite easy to check these matters. In

England and Scotland, it seems to have been left to the individual schools to maintain these records.

Policies

101. As far as I know there were not any written policy documents specific to St Ninian's, Falkland. The first page of the 1951-61 logbook refers to the type of boy to be admitted to St Ninian's. That may have changed over the years. There was a booklet, a kind of prospectus used in later years. That was likely to have been given to Local Authorities, to inform them about the school. That booklet has been provided to the Inquiry.

Discipline policy

102. There was no written discipline policy document specifically for St Ninian's as far as I know. The relevant editions of the Constitutions of the Christian Brothers which include guidance on discipline were supplied to the Inquiry in 2017. The Congregations Directory of Rules, also called 'the green book' which was written in 1929 was also supplied in 2017. I have checked the circular letters from St Mary's England for references to a punishment policy. A circular letter dating from 1961 from the Provincial Brother Curran which included regulations on the use of corporal punishment in schools by Brothers and lay staff was sent to the Inquiry in May 2019.
103. I don't know what arrangements were made for recovering and preserving records when St Ninian's closed. I would think that it would have been the SNR (Brother MBS or SNR that would have brought any documents down to the Provincialate in Bath. Usually when a house or school closed down, Brothers would be sent to various other houses and the Superior was generally the last one left in the house.
104. I get the impression that it would have been at the discretion of the Superior as to which records were kept, and different Superiors may have had different opinions

about what was important to retain. I don't know if anyone from the Provincial Council would have gone up to St Ninian's at the time of the closure or if any direction was given with regards to what records were to be retained.

105. St Ninian's closed in June 1983. As the school closed the Brothers were all transferred to different houses. The St Ninian's records would have been kept in the Provincialate in Bath until 1986 and then they were transferred to Liverpool as that became the next location of the Provincialate. They were transferred to Woodeaves in 1992 which was the location of the Provincialate up to 2007. The Provincial Council was responsible for the St Ninian's records during those years.
106. There is a possibility that not everything was moved on to Bath, or Liverpool, or Woodeaves, but we presume that what left St Ninian's was all transferred each time. The houses in Bath and Liverpool where records were stored are now closed. I have checked with the other Brothers' houses in Liverpool, in case anything had been separated from what we have in the archive. No records relating to St Ninian's have been found in these houses. The accounts records for St Ninian's, Falkland, may have been kept separately, given the absence of any such records amongst what we have.
107. John Farrell who was the Headmaster from 1981-1983, might have kept some kind of a log book while he was in St Ninian's, I am not sure. He is the only surviving individual who acted as Headmaster or Superior for St Ninian's. There is a possibility also that the police may have borrowed documentation in the course of their investigations in 1998 or 2000.

Section 21 Notices

108. The initial large Section 21 Notice came to us early in 2017 from the Inquiry. The response was provided in 2 parts A & B and C & D. My role in relation to that Notice was to show the St Ninian's records Michael Madigan, now a former Brother. He wrote the substance of the response, and I helped with formatting it. I was responsible for providing the photographs and other documentation regarding the

establishment of St Ninian's to the Inquiry around that time. In 2016 the Inquiry asked for some statistical information on St Ninian's, I did research and gathered information for part of that response.

109. We have had a number of Section 21 Notices since then, in 2018 and 2019. We have provided all of the information requested. My role in those has been to provide copies of documents and to carry out research by using the finding aids and by physically going through boxes and documents in the archive.
110. There are two boxes of written documents for St Ninian's, and one box of photographs. These are from the St Mary's Province England archive collection, the blue boxes transferred from Woodeaves in 2008. The visitation reports for St Ninian's are from the Generalate Archive, as is the correspondence between the Provincial Council and the General Council. The Provincial Council minutes were also produced, in so far as they related to St Ninian's, Falkland.
111. I was responsible for responding to the Section 21 Notice of 21 January 2019, regarding case histories or individual children's records. I explained that we do not have documents such as case histories or individual files for former residents of St Ninian's. The only sources we have for former residents are the register, any references in the log books or the newsletters or correspondence. All I could do for the Section 21 notice was to extract the individual entries for each individual and place them together in a folder, this was to aid the Inquiry in accessing the records that they had already been provided with. We just don't have the other documentation requested such as case histories, social workers reports, what you might find on an individual file. As mentioned already, it has been my experience that such individual files with reports and case histories were not in use in the Brothers residential schools during the decades 1950s, 1960s or 1970s. They began to come into use in two schools that remained in operation in the late 1980s and 1990s. If there were files used in St Ninian's for individual residents at any stage they have not survived.

112. The Section 21 Notice of 12 February 2019, asked for a supplementary report for Part D originally provided in 2017. That was responded to by Friday 29 March 2019. I did make the additions to Part D for this notice.
113. The Section 21 Notice of 14 February 2019, I responded to all of that. The list of Brothers and the list of staff had gone into the Inquiry in 2018 covering the years 1970-83 but now the Inquiry wanted the lists to cover the period 1950-83 and the inclusion of any details of the roles and responsibilities of the staff. I went back through the Archives and added that information. I also carried out research for the report on the deaths of three named children and the report on contemporaneous allegations. There was one contemporaneous allegation in 1962 which was referred to in the report on Brother MCE and there was also a suggestion of a possible allegation in relation to John Farrell in South Africa in 1972. This was also included in the report.
114. The Section 21 Notice of 21 February 2019 was not issued to us until March 2019. This has been responded to by me in the same manner as the previous Section 21 Notice in relation to individual children's records.

Further information

115. I wish there was more information for residents. When they ask us for information, there is very little available, so it can be disappointing and also because sometimes the references are not complimentary. For example there are references in the log books to boys stealing and misbehaving although there are also some positive references such as sporting achievements.
116. There is no record in the log books regarding any complaints or allegations against staff, made at the time that St Ninian's Falkland was in operation. Paragraph 113 above refers to the report on contemporaneous allegations.
117. There was a Brother, who wrote a reference about himself being too harsh or severe when punishing a boy. I believe that would have been Brother BHD The

person making the entry didn't refer to himself by name, but referred to the act being carried out by the ^{SNR} [REDACTED] which Brother ^{BHD} [REDACTED] was at the time. The entry is also written in an apologetic way, as if the author had some feeling of remorse. This refers to entries in the log book of [REDACTED] 1972.

118. There was also a reference to an incidence of indecent exposure in the grounds of the school, but it was done by a person unconnected with the school, and it appears that this was witnessed by four of the children at the school. This entry is in the log book on [REDACTED] 1975. On [REDACTED] 1972 in the log book there is a reference to a letter received which included 'nasty allegations', the reference doesn't specify any member of staff and the actual letter is not now available.

Additional Questions

Records

119. The Generalate archives may be referred to as the Rome archives as they were in Rome from 1966-2015 and then they returned to Dublin. The visitation reports for St Ninian's came from the Generalate or Rome archives, so did the references to Falkland found in the Generalate correspondence with St Mary's Province, England, the Generalate correspondence with South Africa and Generalate Brothers files. All of the above has been made available to the Inquiry. See also paragraphs 43-46 and 110.

Staff

120. Dates of transfer of Brothers are available for every Brother on their register pages. John Farrell's register page has been made available to the Inquiry. The reasons for transfer were not recorded on the register pages. Reasons for transfer were not recorded in any single book or document.
121. In 2019 I carried out a search of documentation in order to respond to the Section 21 Notice from the Inquiry which requested a report on contemporaneous allegations. This included a section on a possible allegation from 1972 concerning John Mark

Farrell. All documentation found and referred to in that report has been provided to the Inquiry. In 2013 former Brother Farrell was one of five individuals that the police requested some basic information on in relation to their time on staff in St Ninian's. The correspondence between the Brothers and the Police at that time has been provided to the Inquiry. I helped with the response to the Police at that time but mainly in respect of information requested on some former residents. Copies of archival material from St Ninian's such as the register, the Annals and log books were then provided through the Brothers' Solicitors.

Re. Brother Mark Farrell

122. Searches I made in the correspondence this year resulted in the report in response to the Section 21 notice of 14 February 2019. All documentation referred to in that report has been made available to the Inquiry. The Police investigation in 2013/14 resulted in the conviction of John Mark Farrell and Paul Kelly in 2016. My notes of the visit to the archive by members of An Garda Siochana on behalf of the Scottish Police in 2014 has already been provided to the Inquiry.
123. I have no objection to my witness statement being published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry. I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are true.

Signed..... 

Dated..... 19/06/2019