

Statement by Andrew R Nicoll

General

1. What is your full name and date of birth?

My full name is Andrew Ramsay Nicoll, and my date of birth is [REDACTED] 1978.

2. Please provide a brief summary of your professional background.

I studied at the University of Dundee, gaining an MA (Hons) in History and MPhil in History in 2000 and 2002 respectively. I continued studies and undertook a postgraduate Diploma in Archives and Records Management at University College London, completing in June 2003.

From July 2003 until November 2012, I was Keeper of the Scottish Catholic Archives and Administrator of Columba House. From 2013, I have worked at the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historic Monuments for Scotland, and subsequently Historic Environment Scotland (upon merger in October 2015), as an Outreach Officer, Development Manager, and since January 2017 as Deputy Head of Archives.

I have been a member of the Archives and Records Association (being the Society of Archivists until 2010) since 2003, becoming a registered member in 2006. I have served as a Trustee, Director and Board member of the Archives and Records Association (UK and Ireland) and its predecessor body the Society of Archivists between 2008 and 2012, holding the Board portfolio of Professional and International Engagement. Between 2008 and 2012, I was also joint Secretary of the Section for Professional Associations of the International Council on Archives. In 2010 I was a member of the Steering Group which undertook a survey of religious archives in the UK, a partnership between The National Archives, the Archives and Records Association and the Religious Archives Group.

Scottish Catholic Archives - background

3. When did you commence and end employment at the Scottish Catholic Archives (the "SCA")?

My employment commenced in June 2003 and ended in November 2012.

4. What position(s) did you hold at the SCA?

I held the position of Keeper of the Scottish Catholic Archives and Administrator of Columba House.

5. What did your role as Keeper of the Archives involve?

I was responsible for Archives and Records Management to the Bishops' Conference of Scotland, for the management of the Historic Collections, dating from 1177 until 1878; the diocesan archives of Aberdeen, Argyll and the Isles, Dunkeld, St Andrews and Edinburgh, Galloway and Motherwell; the records of the Bishops' Conference of Scotland, and its agencies and commissions; I provided support to the administrations of the Royal Scots College in Salamanca, Spain and the Pontifical Scots College in Rome for their historic archives and libraries, and modern administrative records.

I also provided advice on occasion to other Catholic organisations, including the Order of Preachers (the Dominican) [male religious order], the Helpers of the Holy Souls [female religious order] and the RC Bishopric of the Forces.

6. Please describe the nature and extent of the holdings at the SCA when you worked there.

- *The pre-reformation Catholic Church in Scotland (Pre 1560)*
- *The Scots Mission (1560-1878)*
- *The Lowland District Vicariate (1727-1827)*
- *The Highland District Vicariate (1727-1827)*
- *The Eastern District Vicariate (1827-1878)*
- *The Northern District Vicariate (1827-1878)*
- *The Western District Vicariate (1827-1878)*
- *The Hierarchy of Scotland (1878-)*
- *The Bishops' Conference of Scotland, its General Secretariat, Commissions and Agencies (20th century-)*
- *The Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh (1878-)*
- *The Diocese of Aberdeen (1878-)*
- *The Diocese of Argyll and the Isles (1878-)*
- *The Diocese of Dunkeld (1878-)*
- *The Diocese of Galloway (1878-)*
- *The Diocese of Motherwell (1947-)*

- *Records of the Scots Colleges: Paris, Douai, Rome, Madrid (15th century-)*
- *Records of the Seminaries: Scalan, Aquhorties, Blairs, Drygrange, Gillis, Scotus (18th century-)*

- *Records of the Scots Benedictine Abbeys, Germany (1177-19th century)*
- *Records of St Benedict's Abbey, Fort Augustus (16th century – 1998)*
- *Records of the Ursulines of Jesus, St Margaret's Convent, Edinburgh (19th-20th century)*

- *Records of Missions and parishes*
- *Records of Individuals*
- *Records of Families*
- *Records of Estates*
- *Records of Businesses*
- *Records of Organisations*
- *Records of Clubs and societies*

The holdings of the Scottish Catholic Archives amounted to approximately 0.5km of archives and records relating to the history of the Church. The oldest material concerned the Scots Benedictine Monasteries in Germany, particularly Regensburg in Bavaria, but generally the archives dated from the 17th century and concerned the administration of the Scots Mission, until a diocesan hierarchy was restored in Scotland in 1878. Also held at the Scottish Catholic Archives were the records of the Ursuline's of Jesus, St Margaret's Convent, Edinburgh, and the records of the English Benedictine Congregation from Fort Augustus Abbey.

The records consisted of canonical documents originating in Rome, correspondence, financial and legal administrative papers, educational records, sacramental records (baptisms, marriages and burials), and records relating to individuals and societies connected with the Catholic Church in Scotland.

7. Where was this archival material held and in what form was it held (e.g. paper/electronic)?

The material was held until 2013 at Columba House, 16 Drummond Place, Edinburgh EH3 6PL, and also in an outstore in George Square, Edinburgh in premises owned by the Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh. I believe in 2013, the Historic Collections of the Church were removed to the University of Aberdeen, and it is possible that other collections were also removed – but I have no accurate knowledge of this.

The archival material was formatted on parchment, paper, microfilm and digital.

8. Why did you leave your role as Keeper of Archives?

Due to the Archive being split, with some material moving to the University of Aberdeen and the remainder intended for the new headquarters of the Bishops' Conference of Scotland being formed in Glasgow, I left my employment with the Bishops' Conference at the Scottish Catholic Archives by mutual consent in November 2012.

Report

9. During your time at SCA, did you prepare a report entitled: "Catholic Child Migration to Australia from Scotland and Northern Ireland 1946-1950" (the "report")?

Yes.

10. Was the report finalised in April 2010?

Yes.

11. What were the circumstances that led to the commissioning, research and production of this report?

As I recall, in the months previous to the report being completed, a request had been received by the Chief Executive of the St Andrews Children's Society, based in Edinburgh. The request had come from an Australian who I think had been migrated as part of a Church sponsored scheme and s/he was looking for records of this. The Society did not hold any information relating to this person, and forwarded the request to Cardinal O'Brien. The Society had previously operated from the Diocesan Offices, and the query was whether the Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh held any records. Cardinal O'Brien contacted myself to initiate a search of the Archives. An initial search concluded that no personal records related to child migration were extant, but in conversation I outlined that there were some references to the scheme in general. Cardinal O'Brien asked if I would look into this and report back to him.

12. Who instructed this report to be prepared and for what purpose?

Cardinal O'Brien as Archbishop of St Andrews and Edinburgh asked for this report to be prepared to increase his understanding of the scheme, which would

assist in his response to the original enquirer and further assist understanding of potential future enquiries.

13. Why was the period 1946 to 1950 chosen?

As far as I recall, the covering dates attached to the report related to the time period for which records of child migration were extant in the Archdiocesan Archives. It was not an indication of the time period that the scheme was operated.

14. Were there any records suggesting involvement by the Scottish Catholic Church in child migration prior to 1946 (e.g. to Canada)?

I recall there were materials relating to emigration to Canada in the Archives from before 1946. From memory I could not be sure whether there was any particular scheme of child migration. Records relating to general emigration were located in the Archives of Argyll and the Isles, and also in the Archives of Fort Augustus Abbey. It is possible that references in the Archives of Fort Augustus Abbey which related to the migration scheme to Alberta, promoted and operated by Fr Andrew MacDonell OSB in the early 20th century, contained references to child migration, however I could not be sure of this from memory.

A general source list relating to Scottish Catholic migration from about 1770 to around 1890 to Canada was compiled for historical research purposes, and this can be found at [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] but does not include references to the material found in the Archives of Fort Augustus Abbey.

15. Were drafts considered/edited by others in advance of finalisation of the report?
If so, by whom?

I alone drafted the report, and likely it was read by the Assistant Archivist at the Scottish Catholic Archives for the purposes of clarity and proofing.

16. If changes were made/instructed to be to the report made by others, what was the nature of any changes and what were your views of these changes?

No changes were made or instructed to be made.

17. Who approved the report in its final version?

The final report was completed by myself and passed to Cardinal O'Brien. There was no anticipated process for review or approval.

18. With whom was the final report shared?

As I recall, Cardinal O'Brien shared the report with his fellow bishops as members of the Bishops' Conference of Scotland.

19. What was their reaction to the report?

I recall that after the report had been provided to Cardinal O'Brien, my line manager Fr Paul Conroy, General Secretary of the Bishops' Conference brought up reference to the report in a meeting held between us. He stated that the (then) Archbishop of Glasgow, Mario Conti, was unhappy that I had written the report. I had no other feedback from the Bishops' Conference on the matter.

20. Do you have any views on reactions of others to the report?

The report wasn't shared elsewhere by myself. I do not know if it was shared elsewhere or any reactions to it.

21. Time has passed since the finalisation of your report and other investigations/inquiries have been carried out (e.g. Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse - Child Migration programmes case study and report). What is your view of your report now?

I have nothing further to add to the report. It was based solely on the very small amount of information that was extant at the Scottish Catholic Archives at the time.

It seems from my limited following of other inquiries that the overall situation in Scotland is similar to what I have read about the scheme in England and Wales.

Other Inquiries etc.

22. Have you played a role in any other inquiries/commissions in relation to child migration?

No.

23. Did you give evidence and if so, what was the nature of your evidence?

n/a.

24. Have you done any further work in relation to the involvement of the Scottish Catholic Church in child migration? If so, when was that work carried out, for whom and what was the nature of the work?

No.

Preparation of report

25. Did you have full access to the relevant content of the SCA when preparing the report?

Yes, I had full access to everything held at the Scottish Catholic Archives whilst employed there.

26. It appears from para 8.4 on page 13 of your report that you attempted to locate other relevant records held in other certain archives but without success. Please identify any other archives (with which you did not make contact) which may hold records relating to the involvement of the Scottish Catholic Church in child migration.

I was only able to search archives which had online catalogues available at the time. I did not search further with the St Andrews Children's Society (although they indicated they had nothing at the start of this process); the St Margaret's Children's Society, Glasgow; the Archdiocese of Glasgow Archives; the Diocese of Paisley Archives, or the relevant diocesan authorities in Northern Ireland which equally may have had some records of the scheme, since the office in Edinburgh was responsible for the operation of the scheme in Scotland and Northern Ireland.

27. At para 8.1 on page 11 of your report, you state that "the records and archives of the migration scheme located at the Scottish Catholic Archives are minimal in extent". In particular (per para 1.6, pg 3) you say that the records of the

activities of the Catholic Council for British Overseas Settlement for Scotland and Northern Ireland “are sparse and limited in extent”.

What was/is the policy of the Scottish Catholic Church concerning the retention and/or destruction/disposal of records it holds (with particular reference to the care of children)?

No record retention schedules existed for the Scottish Catholic Archives when I was appointed Keeper, and no guidance had been prepared for the Archives on any management areas. I authored a management policy which was presented to the Bishops' Conference. I was led to believe that this had been approved, although I never had notification of this in writing if I recall correctly. It was published on the website of the Scottish Catholic Archives, and now appears to be available via the Internet Archive only:

<https://web.archive.org/web/20120704040416/http://www.scottishcatholicarchives.org.uk/Portals/0/archive%20management%20policy.pdf>

Section 3.9 deals with de-accessioning of archives generally, and nothing in detail referring to records relating to the care of children.

From my recollection, in the past some records were destroyed from St Mary's College, Blairs, and these were records which had suffered from damp or water damage. The records were in the main government circulars and had not been of a personal nature. A note had been made by a previous keeper in the catalogue to that effect.

The Scottish Catholic Archives did not generally hold records relating to children in institutional care, however some records of 'case-file' nature were to be found in the Archives of the Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh Child Guidance Clinic from the pre-war period. These detailed psychological reports relating to individual children, created through the 'social work' function of the Catholic Enquiry Office, seemed to have survived. The Scottish Catholic Child Migration Scheme occupied the same offices, but no major records survived from this scheme, and I was not ever able to reconcile a reason for this.

Other records relating to children in care in the Archdiocese did survive – the Catholic Working Boys Home for example. Located in Edinburgh and functioning before and after the war. Administrative records and ledgers relating to those who stayed there survived and are found in the Archives of the Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh. An unofficial visit to the Working Boys Home is referenced in the Minutes of the Archdiocesan Social Services Committee on page 15 of the report.

28. If there is such a policy, how long has it (or similar) been in place?

During the time I worked at the Scottish Catholic Archives, I began work on retention schedules for the Catholic Church. These schedules would have related to records not yet transferred to the Archives, and would not have been applied to the material already held.

29. In your experience as former Keeper of the Archives, has any such policy been followed and implementation of it checked/monitored?

Generally I do not think any policies had been implemented before I took up my post. The Archive was often reactive to bringing records in, usually upon the prompting of creators in various offices. I believe since leaving, the Archivist and Records Manager to the Bishops' Conference has authored retention schedules, but I do not know the nature of those.

30. Is all material relevant to involvement of the Scottish Catholic Church in child migration and held within the SCA cited in your report?

Yes, to the best of my knowledge.

31. Was any other form of research carried out in order to prepare your report e.g. interviews? If so, what was the nature of this other research, who carried it out and when?

If I recall correctly, I did generally ask Archdiocesan staff at the Gillis Centre (the Archdiocesan Pastoral Centre and Diocesan offices) if they were aware of any records stored in the building which could have been classed as 'archives', and on a number of occasions before I had scoured the building for any material which should have likely been transferred to the Archives, but nothing relevant to child migration was found.

I recall asking the former Diocesan Secretary who would have had responsibility for removing records and papers from one diocesan office to the next (from Victoria Street, to George Square, to Whitehouse Loan and finally the Gillis Centre, all in Edinburgh), and he had no recollection of anything in particular relating to records of the child migration scheme and could not offer any suggestion as to the reasons for the lack thereof.

32. Did you take notes during your research for the report? If so, where are these notes held?

I will have taken working notes at the time. I am unsure what will have happened to those, but they would have been left in the Scottish Catholic Archives after my employment ended. I cannot comment on whether they still exist.

33. Are you in possession of material that may be relevant to the Scottish Child Abuse Inquiry (the "Inquiry")? Would you be prepared to share any such material with the Inquiry?

I do not hold any archival or research information which would be relevant.

I do possess some copies of the Scottish Catholic Directory from the 1960s to the 1980s, which may provide some useful information and context on organisations and institutions of the Church in this period. I can make those available to the Inquiry if helpful.

Particular questions regarding archival material

34. Does the archival material in the SCA contain details of the membership of the Catholic Council for British Overseas Settlement for Scotland and Northern Ireland/Australian Catholic Immigration Committee, Scotland and Northern Ireland?

If I recall, the only names found were included in reports, correspondence or other papers. I do not see any reference in my report to membership lists.

35. From the archival material examined, what information was there in relation to the process of selection of children suitable for child migration?

There would appear to be a few items which relate to the selection of children, and these can be found detailed in references 3, 4, 5 and 6 on page 4 of the report. In particular reference is made to medical examinations and intelligence tests following on selection from four categories of potential migrants.

Further references can be found in the catalogue in the report (page 12) to DE/132/9 give indication of 'correspondence between Rev P Quille and Brother Conlon regarding children from Smyllum suitable for the emigration scheme', but I have no recollection of what that correspondence may have detailed.

36. From the archival material examined, did any records disclose any awareness of the abuse of children who had been migrated abroad? If so, which records were these?

I can only comment from the material found in the report, and from the archival material referenced, there does not appear to be any awareness of the abuse of children.

There is a reference to the 'chaos resulting from Bro Conlon's handling of the situation', (page 5), but I cannot comment on the nature of that.

37. From the archival material examined was there any discussion or concern about the conditions of homes to which the children were being sent to abroad? If so, what was the nature of these discussions?

I can only comment from the material found in the report, and there does not appear to be any specific discussion or concern about the conditions of homes to which the children were being sent to abroad. However, in the minutes of the Archdiocesan Social Services Committee for 1946, there is reference given to the 'provisions made by the Australian Hierarchy and Govt and by Card Griffin for their [the children] spiritual and temporal well being' (page 15 of the report).

38. From archival material examined was there any discussion as to how the care of the children was to be monitored once they had been migrated? If so, what was the nature of these discussions?

I can only comment from the material found in the report, and there does not appear to be any discussion or concern about the how the care of the children was to be monitored. There is reference to reports and memoranda on the migration of children to Australia in the Archdiocesan Archives. I cannot now comment on the content of those. However, in the minutes of the Archdiocesan Social Services Committee for 1946, there is reference given to the 'provisions made by the Australian Hierarchy and Govt and by Card Griffin for their [the children] spiritual and temporal well being'.

39. From the archival material examined, did there appear to be an awareness of Fr Stinson (Director of CEMWA - Catholic Episcopal Migration and Welfare Association/Federal Catholic Immigration Committee of Australia), Rev Nicol (Director of the Federal Catholic Immigration Committee of Australia), Brother Conlon (Christian Brothers, Perth, WA) and/or Monsignor Crennan (Director of

the Federal Catholic Immigration Committee of Australia) being involved in the direct recruitment of children from the UK (and Scotland in particular)?

The names of Rev Nicol, and Bro Conlon figure in the records found in the Archives. The minutes of the Archdiocesan Social Services Committee indicate that Brother Conlon was in direct contact with religious orders and also burgh and county councils and Fr Quille of the Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh seems to have undertaken a co-ordinating role to assist Bro Conlon and Rev Nicol in their work.

40. From the archival material considered, what is your impression of the relationship between (Arch)dioceses and the religious orders running residential institutions for children? For example, was there any division of labour between the two (e.g. with diocesan officials tending to liaise with Public Assistance authorities on funding matters)? Was there any indication that diocesan officials or other clergy who placed children in these residential institutions had any continued responsibilities for them in loco parentis?

From the archive material in the report there is nothing found generally regarding the relationship between the (arch)dioceses and the religious orders running residential schools for children. There will be further information regarding this to be found in the (arch)diocesan and religious order archives.

From the archive material consulted regarding the relationship between the (arch)dioceses and the religious orders with specific reference to child migration, it is found that Rev Quille, an official of the Archdiocese of St Andrews and Edinburgh was appointed secretary for the Catholic Council for British Overseas Settlement for Scotland and Northern Ireland by the hierarchy of Scotland and the authorities in Ireland, for the purposes of co-ordinating and liaising with the various religious orders and homes in Scotland in particular for the purposes of child migration.

Different approaches seem to have been made with regard to PAs, with instructions being given by Fr Quille to religious superiors on how and where to proceed with various issues - by taking issues up directly with Bro Conlon or government (British/Australian) directly.

There does not seem to be any indication from the archives found in the report that clergy were operating in loco parentis, and in the context of child migration. It is possible that other material relating to this exists in (arch)diocesan or religious order archives.

41. It appears from some Catholic archival material that there is a lack of clarity around organisational identities/roles. For example, in LEM3 forms (child migration forms) names of sponsoring organisations are given which don't actually exist; children being emigrated from Scotland with the Catholic Child Welfare Council (CCWC) named as their sponsoring organisation (although the CCWC's remit only appeared to cover England and Wales); and Norah Menaldo/Rev Quille signing LEM3 forms on behalf of the CCWC despite not appearing to have any formal role with that organisation, etc.

We are aware that governance structures generally within the Catholic Church can be complex, but what are your views as to why there seems to be a flexible approach/lack of clarity in relation to organisational identities and boundaries within and between these various Catholic bodies in this context?

There is reference to 'the possibility of some 30 children emigrating under the English scheme', (page 16 of the report), and this might show a flexibility in approach of migrating Scottish children through an ENglish organisation/scheme, but this would not explain why Norah Menaldo or Rev Quille signed forms in some cases.

There are multiple governance structures in the Catholic Church, vis-a-vis, committees, offices, dioceses, religious orders and the hierarchy. However, these structures all have a common point of authority – the bishops of the Scottish dioceses.

The flexibility of the approach perhaps comes from the fact that despite multiple governance structures, all organisations generally operated within the same common purpose and broad boundaries of the Catholic Church, as governed by bishops.

42. From the archival material considered, what is your understanding of the relationship between the Catholic Council for British Overseas Settlement for Scotland and Northern Ireland/Australian Catholic Immigration Committee, Scotland and Northern Ireland and the CCWC?

From the archival material considered, I cannot offer any comment of the relationship between the Catholic Council for British Overseas Settlement for Scotland and Northern Ireland/Australian Catholic Immigration Committee, Scotland and Northern Ireland and the CCWC, other than there were obvious links both in terms of finances and close working personnel. The exact nature of those links is not apparent in the archival material consulted.

43. From the archival material considered, did it appear that the CCWC were involved in the migration of children from Scottish institutions?

From the archival material considered, it is not possible to say whether the CCWC was involved in the migration of children from Scottish institutions – apart from ‘the possibility of some 30 children emigrating under the English scheme’ (page 16 of the report). Local administration/management in Scotland Northern Ireland does seem to have been the responsibility for the Catholic Council for British Overseas Settlement for Scotland and Northern Ireland which, it would seem likely, had some sort of affiliation with the CCWC.

Final

44. Please provide an overview based on your archival research on the approach of the Catholic Church in Scotland to child migration in general.

From the archival material extant, it would seem that the Catholic Church in Scotland was following a model linked to that found in England and Wales. The approach in setting up an office within the Catholic Enquiry Office in Edinburgh to manage the scheme on a national basis (with Northern Ireland included), would indicate that this scheme was sanctioned by the Scottish Hierarchy.

It would be fair to note from the comments made in the archives that the administration and management of the scheme was not easy – words such as chaotic are used, and the resulting archives do not give a full picture of the numbers of children who were migrated.

The lack of archival material for the migration scheme is puzzling. I was never able to fully ascertain what records were originally created, nor why they were not maintained – especially when other functions were contiguously carried out in the Catholic Enquiry Office in Edinburgh, and records of those functions did survive.

45. Focussing on Scottish child migrants or other matters relevant to the Inquiry’s terms of reference (<https://www.childabuseinquiry.scot/about-us/terms-of-reference/>), do you have any other information to share with the Inquiry? If so, please provide details.

My only other observation would be to consider the role of the Catholic Child Care Committee of the Scottish Hierarchy and whether it had any role in child migration or other matters relevant to the Inquiry’s terms of reference. Reference to the ‘spiritual and temporal well being’ of children on page 15 of

the report, in reference to the obligations of the Australian Government and Hierarchy, chimes with a recollection I have of seeing this phrase used in the constitution of the Catholic Child Care Committee. If I recall correctly, a copy of this document (or a draft) can be found in the archives of the Diocese of Motherwell.



Signed: Andrew R Nicoll

23 August 2019