

Wednesday, 20 August 2025

(10.00 am)

LADY SMITH: Good morning and welcome back to Phase 9 of our case study hearings.

Now, this morning we will be moving on to evidence from two women who will be sitting in a panel to help us with evidence about the provision of residential care for children, both at St Vincent's and at St Joseph's.

But before I invite Ms Innes to introduce and call the witnesses, one or two things I want to say about today that will be just a little bit different.

We're taking evidence from these two witnesses, as I've said, in relation to St Vincent's School for the Deaf and Blind and also a school called St Joseph's that the Order, of which they are part, was responsible for.

We'll hear oral evidence from Sister Eileen Glancy and Sister Ellen Flynn and some evidence from written statements will be read in later in the day. We have two British Sign Language interpreters in the premises and they will be providing translation from English to British Sign Language for any members of the public who are deaf, so that they can follow proceedings and their positioning will be in the public gallery.

Anybody participating in the proceedings should just carry on in their usual way, speak in their normal way

1 and at normal speed. We may have some pauses at times
2 to allow for interpretation.

3 So, any BSL interpreter today will be available in
4 the public gallery and if anybody wants to speak to
5 a member of the team using BSL -- a member of the
6 Inquiry team using BSL, please just let us know and we
7 can arrange that.

8 So, Ms Innes.

9 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

10 As your Ladyship has said, this morning we have
11 evidence from Sister Eileen Glancy and
12 Sister Ellen Flynn, both from the Daughters of Charity.
13 As your Ladyship has said, the Daughters of Charity
14 provided services at St Vincent's School for the Deaf
15 and Blind in Glasgow and at St Joseph's Rosewell.

16 We heard evidence in relation to St Joseph's earlier
17 in this case study, but have not yet heard from the
18 witnesses nominated by the Daughters of Charity.
19 Accordingly, both institutions will be covered in their
20 evidence today, beginning with St Vincent's and then
21 moving to St Joseph's.

22 Sister Eileen is the safeguarding representative of
23 the Order and Sister Ellen is the previous Provincial,
24 that is the senior representative of the Order in
25 Britain, but she has been delegated responsibility to

1 provide evidence in this case study as a result of her
2 involvement with the Inquiry over the time that she was
3 Provincial.

4 Both Sisters gave evidence to the Inquiry on Day 8,
5 that was 13 June 2017; and Day 44, 24 January 2018 in
6 relation to other establishments run by the Order.

7 LADY SMITH: Indeed. Thank you.

8 Sister Eileen Glancy (sworn)

9 Sister Ellen Flynn (sworn)

10 LADY SMITH: I've said welcome back, but of course we're in
11 different premises now from when we last met.

12 The system to which we work though is largely the
13 same. My desire to do what I can to make you as
14 comfortable as possible when you're giving your evidence
15 remains the same. You've got the written responses that
16 the Order has provided in the red folder in front of you
17 and we also use the screen to assist you to direct you
18 to what we're talking about at any particular time.

19 Now, as you will appreciate, we're not going to go
20 through everything you've given us in writing, word for
21 word. There are particular aspects that we're
22 interested in talking to you about and it's possible
23 that we may want to know more than has just been put in
24 writing. Well, we will want to know more than has been
25 put in writing, both in relation to St Vincent's and

1 St Joseph's.

2 The timing to which I work is the same as it was all
3 these years ago. Normally break about 11.30 in the
4 morning. But if you want a break at any other time,
5 either of you, please just say and if you've got any
6 queries at any time, please just speak up so that
7 together we can get the best picture we can insofar as
8 you can help us with the way these two institutions were
9 run.

10 Does that all make sense?

11 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, thank you very much.

12 LADY SMITH: If you're ready, I'll hand over to Ms Innes and
13 she'll take it from there. Ms Innes.

14 Questions by Ms Innes

15 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

16 Sister Eileen, I wonder if I can begin with you.

17 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah.

18 MS INNES: You have given the Inquiry a note of your
19 background and experience and we note from that that you
20 have a teaching qualification?

21 SISTER EILEEN: I have, that's correct.

22 MS INNES: And in terms of material particularly relevant to
23 this case study, I see that you taught at a school which
24 was called St John's School for the Hearing Impaired
25 between 1978 and 1987 in Wetherby, I think?

1 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct, yeah.

2 MS INNES: And in 2016, you became the named safeguarding
3 representative for the Daughters of Charity?

4 SISTER EILEEN: That's right.

5 MS INNES: And in terms of any changes since you last gave
6 evidence to the Inquiry, I see that since 2024, you've
7 been running the centre at Provincial House in Mill Hill
8 in London, which I think is the headquarters of the
9 Daughters of Charity in Britain?

10 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct, yeah.

11 MS INNES: Sister Ellen, I understand that you also have
12 a teaching qualification.

13 SISTER ELLEN: I do.

14 MS INNES: And, from 2015 until 2024, you were the
15 Provincial of the Daughters of Charity, which I would
16 understand to be the senior representative of the Order
17 in Britain; is that --

18 SISTER ELLEN: That's correct.

19 MS INNES: And although you are no longer in that role,
20 I understand that, due to your involvement in responding
21 to the Inquiry over that period, you have been
22 authorised to continue to speak for the Order on the
23 matters to be covered in your evidence today?

24 SISTER ELLEN: That's correct. Thank you.

25 MS INNES: And you know that we are going to speak today

1 about St Vincent's School for the Deaf and Blind and
2 St Joseph's Rosewell and my understanding is that,
3 Sister Eileen, you're going to deal with St Vincent's;
4 is that correct?
5 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.
6 MS INNES: And Sister Ellen, you're going to deal with
7 St Joseph's; is that correct?
8 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
9 MS INNES: Thank you.
10 Turning first of all to St Vincent's and if we can
11 look at the response given to the Inquiry's notice in
12 respect of this, DSV.001.001.0127, this is what we would
13 call the Part A response to a questionnaire sent to the
14 Order by the Inquiry.
15 If we can go on to page 2 first of all.
16 We see in response to the first question on that
17 page that the Order, I think, was founded in 1633 for
18 the direct service of those who are poor; is that
19 correct?
20 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct, yes.
21 MS INNES: And in terms of the Order's involvement in
22 residential care in Scotland, in relation to the second
23 question, it says that the Daughters of Charity seek out
24 and care for those who are poor and in need of care,
25 education, nursing and employment, and was that the

1 purpose, if you like, of the Order throughout the time
2 that it was involved with St Vincent's.

3 SISTER EILEEN: Absolutely, yes.

4 MS INNES: And if we go on to page 3, we can see at question
5 (v) there's a list of various organisations or
6 establishments run by the Order and at point 4 we see
7 that St Vincent's School was run by the Order from 1911
8 until 1986?

9 SISTER EILEEN: That's right.

10 MS INNES: And just while we're looking at this, we also see
11 that St Joseph's is mentioned there, St Joseph's
12 Hospital, it was run by the Order from 1924 to 1999; is
13 that correct?

14 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.

15 MS INNES: If we can move on, please, to page 5 and there's
16 a section there at the top of the page in relation to
17 St Vincent's and we can see that you tell us that in
18 1911, it was built as a boarding school, managed as
19 a specialist institute for children with special needs
20 and deaf -- and blind and deaf education, who had been
21 living at Smyllum Park?

22 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

23 MS INNES: So that was the original purpose of the
24 establishment?

25 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

1 MS INNES: And at that time, it was wholly run by the Order;
2 is that correct?
3 SISTER EILEEN: It was, yeah.
4 MS INNES: Then in 1925, it says that the school came under
5 the Education Board and it says at this time the
6 property was extended with money from the Daughters of
7 Charity and then there was a later extension in 1965 by
8 the Glasgow Education Authority?
9 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah.
10 MS INNES: And then it notes that when the Sisters withdrew
11 from the service in 1985, the residential block was
12 demolished and the school became a day school only?
13 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.
14 MS INNES: So whilst it continued thereafter, the Order no
15 longer had any involvement with the school?
16 SISTER EILEEN: No, we had one or two Sisters who came in
17 daily to teach, but we did not run the school by then,
18 yeah.
19 MS INNES: And it stopped being a residential establishment.
20 SISTER EILEEN: It had stopped completely, yeah.
21 MS INNES: And between 1925 and 1985, have you been able to
22 establish what the relationship, if you like, between
23 the local authority and the Order was in terms of the
24 responsibility for running St Vincent's?
25 SISTER EILEEN: With regard to the school, it always came

1 under the Education Authority. That changed from
2 Lanarkshire to Glasgow to Strathclyde, then back to
3 Glasgow, I think, again. As for the residential side,
4 that's still unclear. We've not been able to establish
5 who actually employed the residential staff or who paid
6 the salaries. There's nothing in our archives that has
7 any indication as to whether we did or -- or not. We've
8 got no record of any salaries being paid or any
9 employment records of anybody, so that's a bit unclear.

10 MS INNES: We'll come back to that a bit further as we go
11 through this response.

12 SISTER EILEEN: Okay.

13 MS INNES: On page 6, again under St Vincent's, there's
14 reference to the Daughters of Charity withdrawing in
15 1986 as they no longer had personnel to continue?

16 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.

17 MS INNES: So is that what you've established from the
18 archives?

19 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, yes.

20 MS INNES: Now, if we look further down on this page,
21 there's reference to the interaction of the Order with
22 the Roman Catholic hierarchy and I know you've given
23 evidence about this already, but just because we're
24 looking at -- it's a long time since you gave evidence,
25 perhaps if you can just again tell us about how, if at

1 all, the Daughters of Charity interacts with the
2 hierarchy?

3 SISTER EILEEN: In general or --

4 MS INNES: In general.

5 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah, I was going to say we don't but that's
6 not exactly true. They don't -- the hierarchy of the
7 Catholic Church do not have any authority over us as
8 such, as some religious orders do, because when we were
9 founded way back in the 1600s, St Vincent de Paul made
10 it very clear that the Daughters of Charity would have
11 complete -- they would have -- the authority would come
12 from the Superioress General of the Daughters of Charity
13 and the Superior General of the Congregation of the
14 Mission, which is the Vincentian Priests Order. So we
15 go down that route, as opposed to the hierarchy of the
16 Catholic Church, so the Bishop, as such, would have no
17 authority over us in any diocese.

18 MS INNES: Is there anything that you want to add to that,
19 Sister Ellen?

20 SISTER ELLEN: The underpinning point really is that at the
21 time we were founded, Vincent wanted us to be totally
22 free to be on mission for the purposes we've already
23 said earlier in the document and a lot of congregations
24 were enclosed, and, you know, the -- being not attached
25 to the hierarchy gave us much more freedom to be out on

1 mission and we are, strictly speaking, not a religious
2 order. I don't want to get into canon law, but we are
3 much freer than most religious orders would be, to be
4 actually focused totally always on mission and so the
5 authority line goes in a different direction.

6 MS INNES: Thank you.

7 Then if we can move on, please, to page 7 of this
8 response. So this response refers to, I think, all of
9 the different residential establishments that the Order
10 was running, so there's reference to a Local Superior in
11 care homes, and then it says:

12 'The headteacher at St Vincent's Tollcross and the
13 matron in St Joseph's Rosewell had full autonomy for the
14 day-to-day management of the establishment.'

15 Then it goes on:

16 'Sisters had the responsibility for running
17 individual groups of children and this was monitored by
18 the Local Superior.'

19 So do I understand first of all in relation to
20 St Vincent's that the headteacher essentially was in
21 charge of the establishment and then she reported to the
22 Local Superior?

23 SISTER EILEEN: She was responsible for the running of the
24 whole school, including the residential side. She
25 would -- the Local Superior would be over in the

1 residential side all of the time and therefore there
2 would be a lot of communication between the two of them,
3 but with regard to the children being in St Vincent's,
4 the headteacher overall was responsible.

5 MS INNES: Just while we're looking at this in terms of
6 St Joseph's, there's reference to the matron at
7 St Joseph's and again, Sister Ellen, I would take from
8 what's said here that the matron would have
9 responsibility for the running of St Joseph's.

10 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

11 MS INNES: Then she would report to the Local Superior; is
12 that correct?

13 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm, yes.

14 MS INNES: And then the Local Superior would be accountable
15 to the Provincial?

16 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

17 SISTER ELLEN: The Provincial always had a council and one
18 of those councillors would be really the next in -- the
19 person that would keep most in touch.

20 MS INNES: Okay. So we understand that the council was
21 a group of people with specialisms in particular areas;
22 is that correct?

23 SISTER ELLEN: At that time, they -- yes.

24 MS INNES: And so one of the councillors would have had
25 particular responsibility for overseeing what was going

1 on at that time?

2 SISTER ELLEN: Strictly speaking, it's the Provincial, but

3 she would delegate that responsibility, because there

4 was so much, to the councillor to keep in touch, much

5 closer touch than she was able to, and to therefore

6 provide information back to her and the rest of the

7 council every month.

8 MS INNES: Okay. Thank you.

9 If we look down to the bottom of page 7 and to the

10 question of funding, you note there that in about 1910,

11 the organisation was donated eight acres of land in the

12 east end of Glasgow on which to build St Vincent's.

13 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

14 MS INNES: So that provided the location?

15 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

16 MS INNES: And then you've also noted that in 1912, there

17 was a further donation of 4,000 to build a specialist

18 unit to enhance the teaching required for the children;

19 and then going on over the page, it's noted that until

20 1925, as you've said, the funding of the organisation

21 was from the Daughters of Charity?

22 SISTER EILEEN: It was, yeah.

23 MS INNES: After 1925, if we scroll down on page 8, you say

24 that the Glasgow Education Board funded St Vincent's?

25 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.

1 MS INNES: Do you have any clarity as to the extent to which
2 the Order continued to fund the work at St Vincent's?
3 SISTER EILEEN: No. Basically, we don't. My understanding
4 is that the Order always contributed and enhanced the
5 funding that Glasgow gave, especially for the
6 residential side with regard to, say, furniture and that
7 kind of thing, you know, but there's nothing in writing.
8 MS INNES: Then if we go on to page 12, if we look down
9 towards the bottom of that page, at question (iii)
10 there's an answer which says:
11 'As a residential school, St Vincent's was inspected
12 at least annually with regard to the standard of
13 teaching for both deaf and blind children.'
14 Do you know who carried out these inspections?
15 SISTER EILEEN: I presume HMIs or Glasgow Education
16 Authority themselves. That's a presumption on my part.
17 MS INNES: Oh, I see.
18 LADY SMITH: But am I to take it from your answer that
19 there's something in your archive that indicates there
20 were regular inspections?
21 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, it does say that the school was
22 inspected, but it doesn't actually give a clear
23 indication as to who was that inspector.
24 LADY SMITH: I see. And the archives don't include
25 inspection reports --

1 SISTER EILEEN: No.

2 LADY SMITH: -- from these earlier days?

3 SISTER EILEEN: No.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 MS INNES: There's reference in the next paragraph to

6 inspection by Glasgow Education Authority. It says:

7 'Although the school was inspected by Glasgow

8 Education Authority, none of the Sisters who worked in

9 the residential part of the school have any memory of

10 inspections in relation to care facilities or

11 practices.'

12 SISTER EILEEN: Correct. I have asked any Sister who is

13 still alive who worked in the residential side and none

14 of them have any memory of any inspection taking place

15 in the residential side.

16 MS INNES: Is it possible from this answer that the

17 inspections that took place annually were from the local

18 authority as opposed to from HMIE?

19 SISTER EILEEN: Probably, maybe.

20 MS INNES: If we go on again on page 13, there's reference

21 to Glasgow Education Authority at the bottom of the

22 page. So there's a question about the nature and extent

23 of responsibility at question (iv), and the answer is:

24 'Glasgow Education Authority made payments towards

25 the maintenance and education of the children and made

1 regular unannounced inspections.'

2 I wondered how you knew that they were unannounced.

3 Where did you get that information from?

4 SISTER EILEEN: That was orally through speaking to people.

5 MS INNES: Now, if we move on to the next page, page 14, at

6 the bottom of the page we see reference to the ethos in

7 terms of residential care. So I think this may be the

8 general ethos in terms of the provision of residential

9 care by the Order.

10 It notes that the function, it says:

11 'The organisation saw this as being the providers of

12 a safe haven for all children deprived of adequate care

13 at home.'

14 Would that have been the function in relation to

15 St Vincent's or --

16 SISTER EILEEN: Not particularly. Not St Vincent's, because

17 it wasn't a care home, it was a residential school. So

18 most of these children would have had more than adequate

19 care at home but because of their handicap, because of

20 their deafness, then they needed this residential

21 placement. So it wasn't because of inadequate care.

22 MS INNES: Then you note that the ethos was Catholic, as the

23 establishments were primarily opened to care for

24 Catholic children. I think we see later on in time that

25 the school accepted children who were not from

1 a Catholic background; is that correct?

2 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, that's correct.

3 MS INNES: But I assume that the way in which the school

4 operated would have still been from a Catholic ethos?

5 SISTER EILEEN: It would be, yeah.

6 MS INNES: Now, if we go on to page 15, and at the top of

7 the page, there's a line there which says:

8 'Its mission was to nurture, educate and care for

9 the children in its care.'

10 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

11 MS INNES: And would you say that was the mission that was

12 applicable to the work carried out at St Vincent's?

13 SISTER EILEEN: Absolutely, yes.

14 MS INNES: And then, if we scroll down on this page, at

15 question (iii), there's an answer which is more specific

16 to St Vincent's which notes that the function was:

17 'To give the children a safe and secure place in

18 which to live, grow and flourish, whilst providing

19 specialist education for deaf and blind.'

20 SISTER EILEEN: Correct, yeah.

21 MS INNES: You note the ethos was based on Christian values,

22 and then the mission again says there:

23 'To nurture, accommodate, educate and provide for

24 the physical, social and spiritual wellbeing of the

25 children.'

1 So is that the mission of St Vincent's as far as the
2 Order were concerned?

3 SISTER EILEEN: Absolutely, yes.

4 MS INNES: And then if we move on to page 16, there's
5 a question about -- so we're at question (vi), which is
6 about changes to function, ethos and mission, and it
7 notes that the ethos and mission always remained the
8 same. It says:
9 'The function of caring for deaf and blind children
10 also remained, however, the quality of service that the
11 establishment provided was constantly being upgraded
12 according to the needs of the times, progress in the
13 understanding of sensory deprivation and legislative
14 requirements...'

15 So these are the changes that took place over time,
16 and I think if we go on to the next -- the answer to the
17 next question, we see that the changes referred to are,
18 for example, upgrading the accommodation, reducing group
19 numbers and upgrading equipment and suchlike?

20 SISTER EILEEN: Correct, yes.

21 MS INNES: And again, from your review of the archives, are
22 these things that you've noted that happened over the
23 time?

24 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, and with speaking to people as well.

25 MS INNES: I wonder if I can take you to a document. It's

1 at SGV-001033467.

2 I'll just make this slightly bigger. So we can see,
3 I think, that this is a visit to the school. It's on
4 another page, but it was in 1956, and if we go back to
5 the -- if we look at the first page, and we see in the
6 first paragraph that there's reference to a visit to the
7 school and if we go down to the third paragraph, the
8 writer says:

9 'There is no doubt in my mind, and this conclusion
10 would seem to have the support of all previous
11 investigators, that as the school is at present, it is
12 definitely overcrowded.'

13 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah.

14 Q. 'Indeed I would go so far as to say that some of the
15 regulations concerning dormitory accommodation, lavatory
16 facilities, recreation and classroom space are being
17 broken.'

18 And then there's reference to the numbers of
19 children at the school at that time and there's a total
20 of 190 pupils at the school.

21 If we go below the table, it says:

22 'The total number of pupils is 190. Of these about
23 21 are day pupils and the rest are in residence.'

24 And then scrolling down more towards the bottom of
25 the page, there's a list of -- it says:

1 'It may be helpful to consider the signs of
2 overcrowding which I discovered.'

3 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

4 MS INNES: And in point 1, there's reference to the
5 dormitories being overcrowded and very large and
6 institutional in design. It says in the large
7 dormitories, six beds were above the maximum that would
8 now be approved for a new school, and then it continues
9 from there noting that there are other issues with the
10 accommodation.

11 And do you understand that action was taken after
12 this to improve the accommodation?

13 SISTER EILEEN: Do we have a date for this?

14 MS INNES: 1956.

15 SISTER EILEEN: 1956, yeah -- yeah.

16 MS INNES: Do you -- are you aware if action was taken after
17 this to improve the accommodation?

18 SISTER EILEEN: Well, not exactly straight after that, but
19 certainly over the years it was improved and I presume
20 it was the Education Authority who placed the children
21 in St Vincent's.

22 MS INNES: Yes. So I think you said a moment ago in your --
23 under reference to your response to the Inquiry's
24 questionnaire, that there was an extension in the 1960s?

25 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, that was the school side. That was --

1 so more of the classrooms were taken away from the
2 residential block and put into -- the new extension was
3 completely school for deaf pupils and so that meant that
4 the children didn't have to be accommodated in the old,
5 big building for education, that the education was in
6 the new part.

7 LADY SMITH: But -- I'm sorry if I may not be following you,
8 Sister Eileen, this document is referring very
9 specifically to the residential accommodation --

10 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, yes.

11 LADY SMITH: -- in the part we were reading, and you said
12 you presumed it was the Education Authority who placed
13 the children in St Vincent's and I'm not sure I follow
14 what point you were making in saying that.

15 SISTER EILEEN: Well, I presume that they would know the
16 numbers that they were placing in the school, that was
17 my query on that one.

18 LADY SMITH: But so would the Order?

19 SISTER EILEEN: Absolutely, yes. Yeah, absolutely.

20 LADY SMITH: And it must have been possible for the Order to
21 say at any point to the Education Authority that they
22 could not take any more children.

23 SISTER EILEEN: Probably, yes, yeah.

24 LADY SMITH: Particularly if it was going to cause
25 overcrowding.

1 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah, and since then the whole -- the new
2 school was built in the 60s but much later than 1957 --
3 LADY SMITH: 1956, this is.
4 SISTER EILEEN: 1956, yeah.
5 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.
6 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.
7 If we go on to -- another page of this document that
8 might assist with this, on page 4 there's a note about
9 a discussion between various people, including an HMI
10 inspector and people from Glasgow Education Authority,
11 and at point 1, it says:
12 'The building which is owned by the Sisterhood of
13 St Vincent de Paul is not exclusively a school but
14 provides some other residential accommodation. The
15 Glasgow Education Authority leased the school from the
16 sisterhood in 1948 for a period of 10 years. The
17 Education Authority run it as one of their own schools;
18 it is staffed by them and they have provided all the
19 movable equipment. They also arrange for the admission
20 of pupils from other areas and for the collection of
21 fees from other areas, but it's not known on what basis
22 the fees are charged; the amount is certainly very
23 modest in relation to the fees charged from other
24 schools. It was evident from what was said by
25 Dr Mackintosh that the supervision of the school by the

1 Education Authority is not very close.'

2 So Dr Mackintosh seemed to be from the

3 Education Authority.

4 Then there's an issue about blind pupils at point 2,

5 and then at point 3, it's said:

6 'It was agreed that we should write to the

7 sisterhood and suggest to them that they should take up

8 with the Education Authority the question of the

9 accommodation needed for the school. They should also

10 discuss with the Education Authority the future

11 administration of the school.'

12 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

13 MS INNES: So it appears from that, that there's concern

14 about the building and the accommodation --

15 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

16 MS INNES: -- as you say, but the suggestion is that the

17 sisterhood and the Education Authority have to sort it

18 out?

19 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah, yeah.

20 LADY SMITH: Is there possible confusion or conflation there

21 as well in that there are references to the school and

22 accommodation for the school, which you might think is

23 just relating to the education side, but we've read that

24 there's a real problem in the accommodation side?

25 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, yeah.

1 LADY SMITH: And the reader might think: oh, actually it's
2 all going to be sorted out between the two of them, both
3 the authority and the Order will talk about both the
4 place where the children are schooled and the parts of
5 the accommodation where they live?

6 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, yeah.

7 LADY SMITH: But that might not have been the case?

8 SISTER EILEEN: It may not have been. We've got no archival
9 evidence of any communication between the Daughters of
10 Charity and the Education Authority. It's very hard for
11 us to know what resulted -- what came as a result of
12 this.

13 LADY SMITH: And there's a reference a little earlier in
14 that document I think I noticed to the local authority
15 providing -- staffed by the local authority.

16 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

17 LADY SMITH: 'They run it as one of their own schools'.
18 That is a school.
19 'It is staffed by them and they provided all the
20 movable equipment.'
21 That all sounds as though it's the school side not
22 the residential side?

23 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, yeah.

24 LADY SMITH: So you've got that as a given, but you don't
25 know what's happening with the residential side, so far

1 as employment and provision of facilities is concerned?

2 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah, we just do not have any documentation

3 which gives clarity on that at all.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

6 If we can go back now to the Part A response at

7 DSV.001.001.0127 and page 17. We see there's a question

8 in relation to the services provided and in the final

9 paragraph of the answer to question (i) it says:

10 'As St Vincent's Tollcross was a residential school

11 term time only, the children returned home at weekends

12 and at the end of each term.'

13 SISTER EILEEN: Mm-hmm, correct.

14 MS INNES: Are you aware from anecdotal evidence as to

15 whether any children remained there over the weekends?

16 SISTER EILEEN: Not that I can find, no. The -- if there

17 was, it would only be one or two children, but as far as

18 I know they all went home at weekends and certainly at

19 the end of each term. There was nobody in the school,

20 you know, out of term time.

21 MS INNES: And then if we look down to the bottom of the

22 page, to question (vii) there's a question about offsite

23 activities. You say:

24 'Offsite activities were educational in nature and

25 were undertaken during school hours; classes visited

1 theatres, museums, the zoo, had summer outings to Ayr
2 and other seaside towns.'

3 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

4 MS INNES: Is that information that you've received from
5 anecdotal evidence or do you see that in the archives?

6 SISTER EILEEN: No, I don't see that in the archives but
7 I do see it -- I've heard it from people who worked
8 there, and also we do have some photographs.

9 MS INNES: Of?

10 SISTER EILEEN: Of children going out to see -- to Ayr or to
11 the zoo or something like that, you know.

12 MS INNES: Okay. Do you know if, for example, after school
13 -- after the school day had finished, children might go
14 to, for example, a swimming club or something like that?

15 SISTER EILEEN: Swimming club, I'm not sure. There was
16 activities within the school building itself. There was
17 football and different things like that, but I do not
18 think they were actually taken out of the school grounds
19 after school, you know.

20 MS INNES: And that's your understanding from people that
21 you've spoken to?

22 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, correct.

23 MS INNES: Now, if we can look on to page 20, please, and
24 you're asked at question (b) (i) about the numbers of
25 children in the establishment and you say that the

1 Sisters that you spoke to said that approximately
2 80 children were resident at any given time, that
3 excludes the day pupils?

4 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah.

5 MS INNES: So obviously we saw a much higher number in --

6 SISTER EILEEN: In the 50s, yes.

7 MS INNES: In the 1950s.

8 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

9 MS INNES: But I assume that the people that you spoke to
10 were talking about more recent times.

11 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah, absolutely, yeah.

12 MS INNES: Then, going on to page 21, you address a question
13 at question (v) about the number of children in each
14 dormitory and again you say that you were told that:
15 'From the 1960s onwards children slept in rooms of
16 three children.'

17 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

18 MS INNES: And it says up to dormitories --

19 SISTER EILEEN: Up to dormitories of ten, mm-hmm.
20 (Pause).

21 LADY SMITH: You may remember I explained this before, we're
22 making a running transcript and the stenographers can't
23 note two people speaking at the same time. It's very
24 easily done. We all do it. Thank you. Ms Innes.

25 MS INNES: Thank you. If we can just go back to this

1 answer, so it says:

2 'The children slept in rooms of three children up to

3 dormitories of ten children.'

4 So do you mean that they were in rooms of between

5 three and ten?

6 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

7 MS INNES: If we can move on, please, to page 23, in the

8 answer at the top of this page, we see it says:

9 'With regard to St Vincent's Tollcross children

10 remained until they had completed their secondary

11 education.'

12 So they were there -- once they came to

13 St Vincent's, they stayed for the rest of their

14 education?

15 SISTER EILEEN: The majority, I think, did, yes, as far as

16 I know. Some may have moved because of circumstances or

17 their family moving away from the city, but as far as

18 I know, they had the ability to stay from primary right

19 through to the end of secondary.

20 LADY SMITH: So can you tell in general what age that was,

21 that they left St Vincent's?

22 SISTER EILEEN: No, no, I'm just saying there's

23 a possibility that -- I'm not saying that all children

24 stayed their whole education, but some may have moved.

25 LADY SMITH: No, no, I understand that. I'm just thinking

1 of the school leaving age --

2 SISTER EILEEN: Oh, right.

3 LADY SMITH: -- of course wouldn't have been up to 18.

4 It's not even 18 -- as high as 18 now.

5 SISTER EILEEN: No.

6 LADY SMITH: I wondered whether separately you could tell

7 how long St Vincent's would keep a child. Would they

8 keep them up to 18? Would it be 15? Would it be 16?

9 SISTER EILEEN: It would have been the normal school leaving

10 age.

11 LADY SMITH: School leaving age of the time.

12 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, of the time.

13 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

14 MS INNES: If we go on to page 24, there's reference at the

15 top of the page to phone calls that would be made

16 between children and their parents, and at question

17 (xvi) it says:

18 'There is no documented evidence in relation to

19 sharing of information but Sisters who worked in

20 St Vincent's state that phone calls were made to and

21 from the parents on a regular basis but as the majority

22 of children were deaf these messages had to be relayed

23 through a member of staff.'

24 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

25 MS INNES: So a member of staff would either have had to

1 take a message from the child or be with the child when
2 they were wanting to phone home?

3 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

4 LADY SMITH: Is there any indication in your records of what
5 the staff would do if the parents were hearing impaired
6 in any way?

7 SISTER EILEEN: Well, obviously there would be no phone
8 calls, so they would have to have visited the school.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 MS INNES: I think you note at -- if we go back up to the
11 top of the page, you say there:

12 'Often parents accompanied the children back to the
13 school after the weekend and had the opportunity to
14 speak with all care staff and visit the children's
15 bedrooms and sitting rooms.'

16 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

17 MS INNES: So I suppose that might have been an opportunity
18 for parents to discuss with staff if they could
19 communicate with them?

20 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

21 MS INNES: Now, if we move on to page 26, please, at the
22 bottom of the page, there's a question about the numbers
23 of staff and you don't have records of the numbers of
24 staff, but you again understand from anecdotal evidence
25 that the total number of staff was between 50 and 60.

1 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

2 MS INNES: And that's all staff, teachers, care staff,
3 domestic staff?

4 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

5 MS INNES: And if we go on over the page, to page 27, at
6 question (ii), your understanding is that about -- from
7 -- again, from anecdotal evidence, that there were about
8 20 of those staff employed in childcare?

9 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

10 LADY SMITH: Sorry, Sister Eileen, can I just take you back
11 to page 26 and answer (b) (i). You're answering the
12 question: how many persons were employed in some
13 capacity at the establishment, and amongst the people
14 employed, you include childcare workers, and then the
15 last line tells me:
16 'All staff were employed by Glasgow Education
17 Authority.'
18 Is that right?

19 SISTER EILEEN: That is our understanding, but we have
20 nothing to prove that, Lady Smith.

21 LADY SMITH: Oh, I see. So when it came to childcare
22 workers, you think that was the case but you can't --

23 SISTER EILEEN: We can't -- we can't say for certain, but we
24 think they were employed by Glasgow.

25 LADY SMITH: What makes you think that?

1 SISTER EILEEN: What makes us think? Because I don't think
2 the Daughters of Charity could have, out of their own
3 money, paid for such a number of staff.
4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
5 MS INNES: If members of the Order were working as childcare
6 staff how would they -- in other places, for example
7 a care home, Smyllum for example, would they have been
8 paid by the Order for doing that?
9 SISTER EILEEN: No.
10 MS INNES: That would have been part of their service?
11 SISTER EILEEN: Part of the service, yes.
12 MS INNES: So I suppose it's possible that if Sisters were
13 providing service at St Vincent's then they wouldn't
14 have been paid, in fact, by anyone?
15 SISTER EILEEN: Probably not. Yeah.
16 MS INNES: But I think you're saying that paid staff you
17 think would have been paid by the Glasgow Education
18 Authority?
19 SISTER EILEEN: It's the conclusion that we've come to, but
20 we do not have any evidence one way or the other.
21 LADY SMITH: Equally, Sister Eileen, is it possible that the
22 authority provided funds to the Order that were enough
23 to cover the salaries payable to the childcare workers?
24 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, that's very possible.
25 LADY SMITH: But it was the Order that employed those

1 childcare workers?

2 SISTER EILEEN: That's possible as well, yes.

3 LADY SMITH: But I don't suppose you still have accounts

4 from these earlier periods --

5 SISTER EILEEN: No.

6 LADY SMITH: -- that tell you that. Thank you.

7 MS INNES: If we go on to page 27 and if we look down to

8 question (v), there's a question there about the ratio

9 of childcare staff to children and your understanding is

10 that it was about one childcare staff member to five

11 children.

12 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

13 MS INNES: And you were asked about the gender balance of

14 childcare workers. The majority were female but there

15 were some male staff --

16 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

17 MS INNES: -- who worked in the boys' childcare groups?

18 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

19 MS INNES: And again, did you obtain that information from

20 anecdotal evidence?

21 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

22 MS INNES: Now, if we can move on to page 28, at question

23 (v), we see a question in relation to accountability and

24 oversight, and this is something that you've already

25 referred to in your evidence, that the -- in terms of

1 the Order, the Sisters in St Vincent's School were
2 accountable to a Sister who was a Provincial councillor,
3 experienced in childcare and education, who was, in
4 turn, accountable to the Provincial.

5 And it says:

6 'And her Provincial council.'

7 So one of the council was accountable to the council
8 and the Provincial; is that correct?

9 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

10 MS INNES: Then it's noted that the Provincial councillor,
11 as you've said, the specific person, would visit the
12 school on a regular basis, with the Provincial visiting
13 annually.

14 And if we go on over the page, at page 29, what
15 was the purpose of those visits, in the first -- so it
16 says:

17 'The visits were two-fold, one to support the
18 Sisters in community life and secondly to ensure
19 efficient management of the establishment and wellbeing
20 of the children.'

21 So to what extent was the Provincial councillor or
22 the Provincial involved in speaking with the children or
23 monitoring what they were doing or looking at their
24 accommodation; do you know?

25 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah. Her visit would include speaking to

1 the Sisters obviously but also then looking round the
2 residential block, going into the school and just
3 speaking to the children and just observing the
4 day-to-day running.

5 MS INNES: Then if we look down to question (x), there's
6 a question about whether establishment staff would be
7 present when children were interviewed or spoken to and
8 it says:

9 'No, not always. However, children who were deaf
10 often needed a member of staff.'

11 With them to ensure that they could communicate with
12 any visitors?

13 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

14 MS INNES: Then if we move, please, on to page 32, and to
15 a question about how the establishment was managed and
16 led. So, it says there:

17 'The Local Superior of the Order had overall
18 management of the residential department of St Vincent's
19 School with other Sisters responsible for the groups of
20 children. The Local Superior was accountable to the
21 headteacher with regard to the wellbeing of the
22 children.'

23 So I think this goes back to what you said earlier
24 in your evidence, that your understanding is that it
25 was the headteacher who had responsibility for both care

1 and education?

2 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

3 MS INNES: So although there was a Local Superior there, she

4 was actually reporting to the headteacher?

5 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, as far as I know.

6 MS INNES: And the Local Superior's role was essentially to

7 be in charge of the care side?

8 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

9 MS INNES: And then if we scroll down on this page, we see

10 a list of the Sisters who were in charge of the

11 residential side, so this is -- these are

12 Local Superiors?

13 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

14 MS INNES: Then, I think -- oh yes, at the bottom of the

15 page, it notes that the Local Superior lived on site,

16 she was living in the residential accommodation, was

17 she?

18 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

19 MS INNES: Then if we go on to page 34, there's a question

20 at the top of the page:

21 'What was the structure of the establishment?'

22 So it says:

23 'The local community of Sisters living and working

24 in the establishment were accountable to the

25 Local Superior, who was responsible for the smooth

1 running of the residential side of the establishment.'

2 Then it notes that the Local Superior was also

3 accountable to the headteacher. The headteacher

4 reported to the Education Authority, and then it says:

5 'The Local Superior and the headteacher were

6 accountable to the Provincial councillor...'

7 Who we've already talked about.

8 So it looks from this as though the headteacher had

9 a dual accountability, so one to the Order, as it were,

10 and one to the local authority?

11 SISTER EILEEN: Correct, yes.

12 MS INNES: If we can look, please, at a document provided by

13 Glasgow City Council, so it's at GLA-000003445 and at

14 page 11.

15 If we scroll down to the bottom part of that page,

16 we see a table providing names of headteachers, and we

17 can see between 1930 to 1950 it was Theresa McGinnes,

18 from 1950 to 1969 it was Sister Angela, and was

19 Sister Angela a member of the Order?

20 SISTER EILEEN: She was, yes.

21 MS INNES: Then the next Sister mentioned from 1970 onwards,

22 Sister Esther, was she a member of the Order?

23 SISTER EILEEN: She was.

24 MS INNES: And then there's reference to a Sister Bridget

25 and then at 1985 there's reference to

1 a Sister Josephine Raw. Was she a member of the Order?

2 SISTER EILEEN: She was.

3 MS INNES: And it looks from this table that she was acting

4 head in 1985 and that was it. Is that your

5 understanding of the position or not?

6 SISTER EILEEN: No. My understanding is that

7 Sister Josephine Raw was headteacher from 1978 to 1985.

8 MS INNES: Then did Sister Bridget come after her, do you

9 know?

10 SISTER EILEEN: No. No, Sister Bridget who was not a member

11 of the Daughters of Charity, I think she -- she must

12 maybe just have covered. She's -- certainly on our list

13 of headteachers she's not accounted as a headteacher.

14 I know there was a few -- there was a section of time

15 between 1977 and 1978, that Sister Marie hadn't taken

16 over as headteacher, but Sister Esther had left and so

17 there was a period of months that there was an acting

18 head and I would presume maybe Sister Bridget was acting

19 head then.

20 MS INNES: Okay. You said Sister Marie in your evidence

21 there and I think --

22 SISTER EILEEN: Sorry --

23 MS INNES: I think you meant between Sister Esther and

24 Sister Josephine there was a bit of a gap and perhaps

25 Sister Bridget was acting head then?

1 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

2 MS INNES: But as you said, she wasn't a member of the
3 Order?

4 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

5 MS INNES: Now, if we can go on -- I'm not going to go back
6 to your Part A response, I'm going to move on to another
7 document that you've provided in response to the
8 Inquiry's questions. This is DSV.001.001.0628.

9 If we can look on to page 6 and towards the bottom
10 of the page or at the bottom of the page, there's
11 a question in relation to admissions and it notes that
12 the organisation has no written policies or procedures
13 in relation to admissions, and then if we go on, over
14 the page, it refers back to the original purpose of the
15 organisation and then it notes how Glasgow Education
16 Authority became involved, and then the final sentence
17 there notes that:

18 'Day pupils attended from 1965 onwards.'

19 So that looks as though something new started in
20 1965 and is --

21 SISTER EILEEN: The new school was built.

22 MS INNES: And is that why day pupils then started
23 attending?

24 SISTER EILEEN: I presume so, yes. There would be more
25 space for more pupils to go.

1 MS INNES: Now, if we can look on, please, to page 10 of
2 this document. There's a question about policies and
3 procedures in relation to the day-to-day running of the
4 establishment and you say there's no archival evidence
5 of this and the Sisters who worked there confirmed that
6 there were no written policies and procedures?

7 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

8 MS INNES: So you talk a number of times in your response
9 about unwritten policies and procedures and I assume
10 that's something that you've gathered from the anecdotal
11 evidence?

12 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

13 MS INNES: Now, if we can move on to page 11, please.
14 Towards the -- well, in the middle of the page, there's
15 a section about schooling and education, and in the
16 second paragraph there it says:
17 'It is known that the children followed the proper
18 curriculum and were taught in classes of fewer than ten
19 children.'

20 So how was it known that that was the position?

21 SISTER EILEEN: Well, I've spoken to teachers who taught
22 there.

23 MS INNES: Then you say:
24 'Specialist equipment was used in the classrooms and
25 most teachers had an extra qualification for the

1 education of hearing or visually impaired children.'

2 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

3 MS INNES: But not all teachers?

4 SISTER EILEEN: No, not all, but the majority had.

5 MS INNES: Again, is that from the anecdotal evidence?

6 SISTER EILEEN: Correct, yes.

7 MS INNES: Then there's a heading:

8 'Discipline.'

9 And the final sentence on the page begins:

10 'From the spoken evidence of Sisters who worked in

11 the residential side of St Vincent's School, it is clear

12 that all matters regarding discipline out of school

13 hours resided within the group for which the Sisters

14 were responsible. Depriving a child of watching TV or

15 playing outside were common methods of discipline if

16 needed. On rare occasions, when matters required it,

17 the Local Superior would become involved.'

18 So do you mean there that when the children weren't

19 at school it was the Sisters who were in charge of the

20 residential part who were also in charge of

21 administering any sanctions?

22 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

23 MS INNES: Then, if we look down to the bottom of this page,

24 at the bottom of the page, there's reference to:

25 'The number of children in each residential group

1 reduced significantly over time as it did in the
2 classroom setting also.'

3 Do you know why that was?

4 SISTER EILEEN: I think some children, hearing impaired
5 children, then began to go into mainstream education,
6 especially partially hearing children with good hearing
7 aids, strong, powerful hearing aids, could cope in
8 mainstream education.

9 MS INNES: The next sentence says:

10 'Also the ratio of children to staff reduced and
11 there was a significant rise in the number of
12 volunteers.'

13 Do you know why there was a significant rise in the
14 number of volunteers?

15 SISTER EILEEN: No, to be honest, I don't know.

16 MS INNES: Do you know what these volunteers were doing?
17 What was their role in the school?

18 SISTER EILEEN: I'm presuming this is in residential.

19 MS INNES: Okay.

20 SISTER EILEEN: And it would be to, you know, occupy the
21 children or play with the children or to be -- accompany
22 the children in their activities out of school.

23 MS INNES: If we move on to page 15, in relation to
24 safeguarding, so this is asking about policies or
25 procedures in relation to safeguarding, and you say:

1 'Although there is no archival evidence of written
2 policies or procedures, it is evident from speaking with
3 surviving Sisters that everything possible was done
4 during the day-to-day to ensure that the children were
5 kept safe whilst at St Vincent's.'

6 So what sort of things were they doing to keep
7 children safe?

8 SISTER EILEEN: Sorry, I'm not really understanding the
9 question. What kind of things were they doing?

10 MS INNES: It says:

11 'Everything possible was done during the day-to-day
12 to ensure that children were kept safe...'

13 SISTER EILEEN: Making the environment safe, making sure
14 that the children had a pleasant, safe environment in
15 which to live and to play.

16 MS INNES: And do you know how they went about that?

17 SISTER EILEEN: Having a good ratio of staff and volunteers
18 to the number of children and to provide activities that
19 were safe for them.

20 MS INNES: Then if we scroll down to the bottom of this
21 page, there's a question about children's emotional and
22 mental wellbeing and you note there that:

23 'Sisters speak of trying to give the children as
24 near to home experience during their time at
25 St Vincent's.'

1 So when they were there residentially, that's what
2 the Sisters told you?

3 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

4 MS INNES: They were trying to achieve that sort of
5 environment?

6 SISTER EILEEN: Correct, yes.

7 MS INNES: If we can move on, please, to page 19, and to
8 question (ii), this is a question in relation to the
9 employment of staff and it says:

10 'The unwritten aim was to employ staff of good
11 character that appeared enthusiastic and suitable to
12 care for children who were either visually or hearing
13 impaired. Often these young women were recommended by
14 parish priests, colleagues or Sisters living or working
15 pastorally in other places. On many occasions the
16 Local Superior met with the parents of the young women
17 before confirming the employment.'

18 So is this in relation to childcare staff?

19 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

20 MS INNES: So this does seem to suggest that the Order was
21 involved in employing --

22 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

23 MS INNES: -- these people, and did you again receive this
24 information from speaking to Sisters?

25 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

1 MS INNES: Then at the bottom of the page, in relation to
2 induction, it says that:
3 'The Sisters who worked in the residential side of
4 St Vincent's state that they inducted new members of
5 staff on the job within their own groups. The new
6 member of staff shadowed the Sister responsible for the
7 group of children for the first few weeks of employment
8 in order to gain an understanding of the daily routine
9 and the personal needs of each child within the group.'
10 So it doesn't appear that there was formal training;
11 there was shadowing?
12 SISTER EILEEN: Correct, yes.
13 MS INNES: If we can move on, please, to page 28, there's
14 a section there dealing with volunteers and in the first
15 question it says again there were no written policies or
16 procedures:
17 'However, the Sisters do speak of many volunteers
18 coming to St Vincent's to help with the out of school
19 activities within the residential side.'
20 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, correct.
21 MS INNES: And it notes that the intention, in the next
22 answer:
23 'The intention of having people volunteering was in
24 order to give the children more one-to-one attention
25 after school hours when engaged in more social and play

1 activities.'

2 Was that --

3 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.

4 MS INNES: And do you know if there was any method of

5 checking on the suitability of these volunteers or --

6 SISTER EILEEN: I think, as it's said, I think this was the

7 days before PVGs and I think -- as I said in an earlier

8 answer, I think it was through maybe parents in those

9 days or headteachers, because I know some of these

10 volunteers came from secondary schools.

11 MS INNES: So when you say secondary schools, I think we

12 will hear evidence that there were volunteers from --

13 girls from St Mungo's who came to help?

14 SISTER EILEEN: Possibly, yeah.

15 MS INNES: Then if we go on to page 30 and the bottom of the

16 page, you talk about complaints and reporting and you

17 note that the Education Authority would have had -- or

18 could have had its own written policies, however the

19 Order doesn't have any, again, written policies.

20 And if we go on to page 31, there's reference to

21 surviving Sisters say that if a complaint had been made

22 it would have been dealt with in a particular way,

23 essentially going up the accountability chain.

24 SISTER EILEEN: Mm-hmm.

25 MS INNES: However, I think you go on to tell us, at

1 page 33, that the surviving Sisters did not recollect
2 any complaints having been made?
3 SISTER EILEEN: That's to my knowledge, yes.
4 MS INNES: So their views in relation to what would have
5 happened is their supposition about what might have
6 happened --
7 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.
8 MS INNES: -- had a complaint been made? Now, if we can
9 move on, please, to DSV.001.001.3821.
10 This is a response to more questions posed by the
11 Inquiry, and if we look on to page 2 under the first
12 question, question 5, there's a note:
13 'The organisation knows of no abuse, nor allegations
14 of alleged abuse, relating to St Vincent's School...'
15 So obviously this was completed some time ago now.
16 Has that position changed since this was completed?
17 SISTER EILEEN: Only from reading the material that was sent
18 through the Inquiry.
19 MS INNES: So other than material that's been shared with
20 you by the Inquiry, the Order's not aware of any other
21 allegations?
22 SISTER EILEEN: No.
23 MS INNES: No civil claims have been raised?
24 SISTER EILEEN: No -- with regard to Tollcross?
25 MS INNES: Yes.

1 SISTER EILEEN: No.

2 MS INNES: You're not aware of any police investigations?

3 SISTER EILEEN: No.

4 MS INNES: Are the Daughters of Charity involved in the

5 Redress Scheme?

6 SISTER EILEEN: We are.

7 MS INNES: Do you obtain any information from the

8 Redress Scheme about payments that have been made out

9 for particular institutions?

10 SISTER EILEEN: We are asked to verify whether somebody has

11 been in a particular care setting.

12 MS INNES: And have there been any Redress claims in

13 relation to St Vincent's?

14 SISTER EILEEN: I believe so.

15 MS INNES: So you say that you are asked to verify whether

16 a particular person was at the institution?

17 SISTER EILEEN: We are, yeah, but with regard to

18 St Vincent's, we can't verify that, because we don't

19 have any records.

20 MS INNES: But you would know how many people have said to

21 Redress that they have been at St Vincent's?

22 SISTER EILEEN: Correct.

23 MS INNES: And do you know roughly how many people have made

24 a Redress claim?

25 SISTER EILEEN: I don't have that number here, no.

1 MS INNES: Is that something that you could provide the
2 Inquiry with?

3 SISTER EILEEN: I could, yes, yeah. I'd say it would be
4 a handful.

5 MS INNES: Now, you were asked to look at some documents by
6 the Inquiry and if we could look first of all at
7 JUS-000000208.

8 This is an extract conviction of a person called
9 Colin Macdonald who was convicted in 2008 in respect of
10 various sexual offences. If we scroll down, we can see
11 he was convicted of ten sexual offences.

12 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

13 MS INNES: And he was sentenced, I think it's over the page,
14 to a period of 12 years' imprisonment. And if we could
15 go on to JUS-000000209. We can see -- these are the
16 original charges that he faced, which includes some of
17 which he was not convicted, but if we look, for example,
18 on page 3 of this document, charge 13 relates to
19 an applicant to the Inquiry with the pseudonym 'Allan'
20 and it's a sexual offence which took place between 1975
21 and 1976 on the Isle of Rum and we can see, for example,
22 if we scroll down, charge 15 also relates to offences
23 that took place at or near Glencoe and the Isle of Rum
24 and goes on from there.

25 Since being provided with this information by the

1 Inquiry, have you carried out some investigations to see
2 what you can establish in relation to Mr Macdonald and
3 his connection with St Vincent's?

4 SISTER EILEEN: I have and I can't find anything definite at
5 all. There is no indication that this gentleman was
6 employed by St Vincent's in any way or even was
7 a volunteer in St Vincent's. My conclusion is that he
8 was a deaf person himself and it looks as if he was like
9 an Outward Bound instructor and perhaps he was
10 employed -- maybe not employed, but a group of children
11 from St Vincent's went on Outward Bound experiences as
12 many schools did and sadly it was during one of these
13 experiences or more than one of these Outward Bound
14 courses that the abuse took place.

15 And I also looked into the person himself who was
16 abused, and from his writing, from his statement,
17 I think he says that perhaps when this started, this
18 abuse started, he was a day pupil at St Vincent's and,
19 so very sadly it happened and I'm certainly not trying
20 to be defensive here, but it doesn't appear to have any
21 link with St Vincent's as a school, as a residential
22 school. It would appear that perhaps this occurred
23 during one of these Outward Bound experiences.

24 LADY SMITH: Do you know whether St Vincent's was in the
25 habit of organising attendance on these Outward Bound

1 courses for children?

2 SISTER EILEEN: I don't, Lady Smith, I'm sorry.

3 LADY SMITH: It wouldn't be unusual for a school to do so?

4 SISTER EILEEN: No. No.

5 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes.

6 MS INNES: Thank you.

7 And I assume you don't know, if the school were

8 organising such an event, you know, what checks they

9 would have carried out on the people going with the

10 pupils from the school?

11 SISTER EILEEN: I have no idea.

12 MS INNES: Another document is at JUS-000000332 and we can

13 see that this is a document from Glasgow High Court,

14 dated 15 November 2023, in which, if we scroll down into

15 the body of the text, it says it was an examination of

16 facts hearing. And it says:

17 'The court having considered the evidence led and

18 being satisfied beyond reasonable doubt found that the

19 accused William Maley committed the acts libeled and

20 that on a balance of probabilities that there are no

21 grounds for acquitting him.'

22 And then if we go on to the next page, we can see

23 again some sexual offences, charges 2 and 3, in relation

24 to an applicant who has the pseudonym 'Gordon' and we

25 can see that -- the court's finding in relation to those

1 charges and I think you know that the applicant was
2 a pupil at the school?

3 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

4 MS INNES: We can see, for example at charge 2, that there's
5 reference to some of the sexual offences taking place at
6 the school?

7 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

8 MS INNES: And were you not aware of this until information
9 was given to you by the Inquiry?

10 SISTER EILEEN: I was not, no.

11 MS INNES: If we can go back, please, to DSV.001.001.0127
12 and to page 40, we see there that the Order was asked
13 several questions in relation to acknowledgement of
14 abuse.

15 And the first question is:

16 'Does the Order accept that between 1930 and
17 17 December 2014 some children cared for at the
18 establishment were abused?'

19 So what's the Order's answer to that question now?

20 SISTER EILEEN: Well, obviously the answer would be
21 different now.

22 MS INNES: And what is -- what is the answer now?

23 SISTER EILEEN: Well, we'd have to accept that some children
24 were abused.

25 MS INNES: And the basis of that assessment is from the

1 information given to you by the Inquiry?

2 SISTER EILEEN: Absolutely.

3 MS INNES: Then in relation to the second question on this

4 page at the bottom of the page:

5 'Does the Order accept that its systems failed to

6 protect children cared for at the establishment between

7 1930 and 17 December 2014 from abuse?'

8 And what's the Order's answer to that question now?

9 SISTER EILEEN: We do accept that our systems failed.

10 MS INNES: And are you able to give us any insight into your

11 thinking as to what the systemic failures were?

12 SISTER EILEEN: Well, certainly with regard to this

13 alleged -- not alleged, this abuse that you have just

14 put up on the screen, that the children obviously

15 weren't as supervised as they should have been in the

16 residential side.

17 MS INNES: Then at page 41, at question 3.3, there's

18 a question about:

19 'Does the organisation accept that there were

20 failures or deficiencies in its response to abuse and

21 allegations of abuse of children over the relevant

22 period?' And the answer to that at the time was:

23 'Because of a lack of awareness the question isn't

24 applicable.' Obviously the position has changed, so

25 again what is the Order's answer to that question now?

1 SISTER EILEEN: Well, the answer would be yes, we do accept
2 there are deficiencies, because if a child comes to
3 somebody and says they were abused, then obviously that
4 should have been taken as fact and investigations should
5 have been undertaken to establish the facts around that
6 allegation of abuse and taken extremely seriously.

7 MS INNES: My Lady, I'm going to move on to St Joseph's now
8 so it might be a good time for a break.

9 LADY SMITH: Yes. I promised you a morning break and
10 I think we can take that now and I'll sit again in
11 quarter of an hour or so. Thank you.

12 (11.28 am)

13 (A short break)

14 (11.48 am)

15 LADY SMITH: Sister Ellen, Sister Eileen, welcome back.
16 Before I invite Ms Innes to carry on, can I just
17 check one thing with you, Sister Eileen?

18 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah.

19 LADY SMITH: On a number of occasions you explained that the
20 information you were giving us was based on what you'd
21 been told by other Sisters.

22 Did you keep a note of how many Sisters you got
23 information from and who they were?

24 SISTER EILEEN: Yes, yes. I know exactly who they were.

25 LADY SMITH: And you've got a note of that?

1 SISTER EILEEN: Not written down here, but I could certainly
2 provide that.

3 LADY SMITH: You've got it. I think we probably ought to
4 have that so we can see what the number of people were
5 that were involved and perhaps also the periods to which
6 they could reliably refer to --

7 SISTER EILEEN: I'll do that.

8 LADY SMITH: -- would that be all right?

9 SISTER EILEEN: Of course, certainly.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. Ms Innes.

11 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

12 Now, as I said before the break, we're going to turn
13 to St Joseph's and to Sister Ellen.

14 I wonder if we can begin by looking at
15 DSV.001.001.0391.

16 And if we look at page 3 and if we scroll down
17 a little, we see the list of institutions again and we
18 see, as we've already said in evidence, that St Joseph's
19 Hospital was run by the Order between 1924 and 1999; is
20 that correct?

21 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

22 MS INNES: If we move on to page 4 and towards the bottom
23 part of that page, in the middle of the page, there's
24 text in relation to St Joseph's and it says there that
25 it was opened in 1924 initially for the education of

1 children with profound learning disabilities, often
2 combined with physical disabilities.

3 So it seems that the main aim originally was in
4 relation to education rather than care?

5 SISTER ELLEN: Correct. The emphasis actually was never
6 care, as you see, it was a hospital model. I'm sure
7 you'll come onto that, but education was its primary
8 combined with the need to care for physical
9 disabilities.

10 MS INNES: Okay.

11 SISTER ELLEN: And the fact that there wasn't any provision
12 at the time.

13 MS INNES: Yes, so it refers to there being a lack of
14 educational provision in Scotland at the time for
15 children who had a learning disability.

16 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

17 MS INNES: And then it says that many health boards referred
18 children to St Joseph's.

19 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

20 MS INNES: And then it says that after the 1940 Act,
21 St Joseph's was also established as a hospital for
22 people with learning disabilities. So that's when the
23 hospital came into being.

24 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah, that's when it was recognised by the
25 authorities as a specialist provision.

1 LADY SMITH: Sorry, Sister Ellen, are you saying that there
2 was provision that the Sisters by then had been
3 providing for 16 years --
4 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
5 LADY SMITH: -- that was formally recognised by the State?
6 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.
8 MS INNES: And then it says in 1942 that there was the
9 establishment of a training school for nurses for what
10 was then called the Mental Handicap Register.
11 SISTER ELLEN: Correct.
12 MS INNES: And that was established at St Joseph's for the
13 training of nurses?
14 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
15 MS INNES: And then it goes on to say:
16 'By the late 1970s local authorities were placing
17 younger children with learning disability in schools
18 nearer to their own homes and over the years the number
19 of children in St Joseph's reduced in number.'
20 SISTER ELLEN: Correct.
21 MS INNES: And then in 1998 the school closed, a year before
22 the closure of the hospital, which was in 1999?
23 SISTER ELLEN: Yep.
24 MS INNES: If we go on to page 6, there's reference at the
25 top of the page to the reason why the hospital closed

1 and it says that this was due to a greater understanding
2 of learning disability?

3 SISTER ELLEN: And the Community Care Act. It was
4 a response to that and the fact that the -- the greater
5 understanding of society, but also of the Sisters of the
6 community, was the more independent the people could be,
7 the better. So the model changed at that point from the
8 need for a hospital model -- and you'll see from
9 Sister Catherine's evidence that that changed to more of
10 a social work model, was -- well it happened in the
11 previous ten years, by degrees.

12 MS INNES: And it says this led to the remaining people from
13 St Joseph's being transferred to houses in the local
14 community.

15 SISTER ELLEN: Exactly.

16 MS INNES: And from what has been said here particularly,
17 would I be right in saying that adults were cared for at
18 St Joseph's as well as children?

19 SISTER ELLEN: Correct.

20 MS INNES: And was that the same for the whole time that
21 St Joseph's was in operation?

22 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, although I believe the very original
23 occupants in 1924 were actually children.

24 MS INNES: Okay. But ultimately did these children continue
25 to stay at St Joseph's into adulthood?

1 SISTER ELLEN: Many of them did.

2 MS INNES: If we move on to page 7, there's reference there

3 to -- towards the bottom of the page in relation to

4 funding and it says:

5 'In the early years the Daughters of Charity

6 provided the funding, enhanced by donations from

7 benefactors and the St Vincent de Paul Society.'

8 And then it says that health boards and local

9 authorities also contributed to the funding. This

10 funding increased over the years but the Daughters of

11 Charity always supplemented it in order to provide extra

12 benefits for the children.

13 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm.

14 MS INNES: So is that your understanding from archival

15 evidence?

16 SISTER ELLEN: And that -- you know, there's a bigger story

17 behind that, that we have got in our evidence. I mean,

18 I'm anxious just to answer your question, but -- that's

19 fundamentally our understanding, but the key moment

20 really was when the -- St Joseph's was recognised by the

21 Health Board, and that was in 1947, they came under the

22 NHS Act and then actually much more statutory funding

23 was supplied.

24 Prior to that, there was a per capita payment by the

25 local authority that sent the child into the facility.

1 Or the adult.

2 MS INNES: Then you were asked:

3 'Was the funding adequate to care for children?'

4 And the answer to that at the top of page 8 is 'yes'.

5 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

6 MS INNES: And how have you formed that view?

7 SISTER ELLEN: I would form the view because there are many,

8 many, many documents that compliment the care coming

9 from outside, not from the Sisters, but coming from the

10 people who were accessing St Joseph's, statutory and

11 otherwise, there are many comments about the standard of

12 care at St Joseph's, going right back. But I would also

13 qualify it by saying that clearly at the opening and in

14 the early years, when the Sisters were fully funding it

15 themselves in a building that was not then completely

16 functioning or fit -- not fit for purpose but, you know,

17 not purposely designed, that clearly, you know, like --

18 there was struggles that went on and the improvements

19 happened gradually over the 100 years or so it was open.

20 LADY SMITH: Sister Ellen, you said there are many, many

21 documents that compliment the care; what sort of

22 documents?

23 SISTER ELLEN: The documents that you have provided,

24 Lady Smith. Many of them are commenting on the

25 excellence of the care.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MS INNES: I think you're possibly referring to visits or
3 reports of visits by people from the Mental Welfare
4 Commission, for example.

5 SISTER ELLEN: Yes. Psychologists, doctors, and the health
6 boards, yeah.

7 MS INNES: And at page 12, if we move on to there, there's
8 reference at question (ii) to the way in which people
9 were referred to St Joseph's. As you said, initially it
10 was by local authorities primarily for education but
11 also for nursing care as many had complex needs. In the
12 early 1940s it had developed into a hospital, as you've
13 said, and then it became the hospital and the school.

14 Then if we look down to question (iii) you note that
15 it was inspected on a very regular basis by health
16 boards and local authorities as well as visited on
17 a weekly basis by medical professionals.

18 So in terms of health boards and local authorities,
19 do you know if they were looking at the hospital in
20 respect of patients that they had referred or were they
21 looking at it more generally?

22 SISTER ELLEN: It feels like they were looking at it more
23 generally when you read the documentation. It would be
24 hard for them just to pinpoint, you know, specific
25 individuals, but I'm sure that their accountability was

1 towards the children that they had placed there or the
2 adults that they placed there.

3 MS INNES: Then you say it was visited on a weekly basis by
4 medical professionals. Do you know if there were any
5 medical professionals other than -- nursing staff may be
6 said to be medical professionals obviously --

7 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

8 MS INNES: -- but were there any other psychiatrists or
9 doctors or psychologists based within the hospital as
10 far as you know?

11 SISTER ELLEN: Not as far as I know, although clearly they
12 must have been involved when the training school came
13 into play and they were placing students for placements
14 in the hospital. There must have been involvement of
15 those professions at that time.

16 MS INNES: But from what you're saying here, there were
17 people who were perhaps specialists in given fields
18 coming into the hospital to deal with medical needs?

19 SISTER ELLEN: Yes. I mean, again that is dotted throughout
20 the documentation.

21 MS INNES: If we move on, please, to page 16, if we look
22 down again to the question (vi) in relation to function,
23 ethos or mission; and in terms of function, it says
24 there:

25 'The function of caring for, nursing and educating

1 learning disabled children in St Joseph's also remained,
2 however, the quality of service that the establishment
3 provided was constantly being upgraded according to the
4 needs of the times, developments and the understanding
5 of learning disability and legislative requirements.'

6 So is that your understanding from the archival
7 material, that there were changes made over time to
8 the --

9 SISTER ELLEN: Absolutely.

10 MS INNES: Then you go on to refer in the next answer to
11 some of the changes. So, for example, reducing the
12 number of children taught together. And you also say
13 from the late 1960s children were placed residentially
14 in smaller groups:

15 'This was in contrast to the large wards of earlier
16 years.'

17 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm.

18 MS INNES: So where did you get that information from, that
19 the wards went and that smaller units were put in place?

20 SISTER ELLEN: It's -- it's very much there in the story.

21 Yeah, I can't quote the documents, but it is clear in
22 the documents that that happened and it was partly as
23 the result of the building improvements and partly -- or
24 primarily because that was, as it says there, the trend
25 and the method in the education of children with special

1 needs, would have demanded that, you know, the numbers
2 reduced and that the groupings they were in were more
3 homely than -- so, in other words, the social care
4 element started to creep in, in the 60s, 70s, 80s and it
5 became -- in feel, it became less of a hospital and more
6 conducive to people being at home.

7 MS INNES: At the bottom of this page and going on to the
8 next page, you refer to the 1974 Act, which placed
9 an obligation on local authorities to provide education
10 for children who had previously been deemed uneducable
11 and you say there was a surge in admissions to
12 St Joseph's School of severely mentally handicapped
13 children as day pupils?

14 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

15 MS INNES: So, prior to that, do you know if the school had
16 accepted day pupils as well as educating --

17 SISTER ELLEN: I don't think they did.

18 MS INNES: But they started taking day pupils from about
19 that time?

20 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah, because the education became available
21 in the wider community.

22 MS INNES: And then you refer in the next paragraphs to what
23 you've already alluded to in your evidence, that there
24 was then a decrease in children coming to the -- to
25 St Joseph's over time as a result of them remaining at

1 home or remaining closer to home; is that right?

2 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm. Yes.

3 MS INNES: Now, if we move on to page 21, please, and to the

4 question (b) and (i):

5 'How many children did the establishment accommodate

6 at a time?' You say that it accommodated approximately

7 70 children at any given time.

8 SISTER ELLEN: Yes. Again, it was movable across the years.

9 I mean, at the very beginning, when the building wasn't

10 really ready, there were about eight and it climbed to

11 20. You can trace that quite carefully. But by 19 --

12 where is it now? In the 1940s somewhere, it had risen

13 to over 250. So it would depend what period you were

14 talking about. It kind of came up and down according to

15 trends and according to the building availability.

16 MS INNES: And then I think again on this page, at question

17 (v), you say that approximately 20 children were

18 accommodated in the children's wards in approximately --

19 until approximately 1970, when they were replaced with

20 smaller bedrooms accommodating three to four children.

21 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, mm-hmm.

22 MS INNES: So that seems to have been when the change took

23 place?

24 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

25 MS INNES: And if we go on over the page to page 22, in

1 relation to 1.7(i) you note that all of the children at
2 St Joseph's had a learning disability?

3 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, although there are bits of stories in
4 the evidence that suggest that there was often confusion
5 between a mental health condition and a learning
6 disability, which had to get sorted out, and there
7 was the odd time that the local authority asked the
8 Sisters to take other groupings for short periods of
9 time, but fundamentally this was a facility for people
10 with learning disabilities.

11 MS INNES: Then if we go on to page 23 and question (ix),
12 you're asked about how long did children typically
13 remain in the care of the organisation and you say it
14 obviously always depended on individual circumstances:

15 'We have evidence in some of the admission registers
16 that it could be anything from a couple of weeks to
17 several years.'

18 So you've already said in your evidence that some
19 children came maybe when it began in 1924 and then
20 remained there into adulthood.

21 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, and some for most -- all of their lives,
22 so it just varied. I mean, the question says
23 'typically' so it's kind of difficult to give a typical
24 thing because it was very varied.

25 MS INNES: And did that change over time as well with people

1 staying in the hospital for their whole lives?

2 SISTER ELLEN: No, it depended on the level of their

3 disability and their own needs, you know.

4 MS INNES: If we move on, please, to page 26, and towards

5 the bottom of the page, just above the question --

6 there's a heading:

7 'Present.'

8 The paragraph just above that says that:

9 'In St Joseph's the matron was always a registered

10 nurse with the additional qualification in learning

11 disability. The Local Superior in St Joseph's was often

12 a registered nurse also.'

13 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

14 MS INNES: Although I think perhaps not always, I think

15 Sister Catherine came from a different background, for

16 example, and she has already given evidence about her

17 role at the hospital.

18 SISTER ELLEN: Absolutely. She has given evidence herself

19 on that, how that happened.

20 MS INNES: But maybe prior to her it, I think, had always

21 been somebody who was a registered nurse who was in

22 charge?

23 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

24 MS INNES: Now, if we can go on, please, to page 27, when

25 you're asked about staffing, and I don't think you've

1 got documentation in relation to this, but Sisters who
2 worked there recall that there were approximately
3 200 staff at any given time, and that would be all
4 staff, nursing staff, auxiliary staff, domestic staff
5 and suchlike?

6 SISTER ELLEN: I believe so.

7 MS INNES: Then if we look down on page 27, towards the
8 bottom of the page, you're asked about childcare worker
9 and child numbers ratio and you say:

10 'The ratio of nurses and auxiliary nurses to
11 children differed greatly. Some children with severe
12 disabilities had one-to-one attention at all times
13 whilst others had a ratio of one staff to five
14 children.'

15 And where did that information come from?

16 SISTER ELLEN: I'd have to refer to my colleague on that
17 one, where that information came from.

18 SISTER EILEEN: I think that was more anecdotal evidence.

19 MS INNES: Just bear with me a moment.

20 (Pause).

21 So you've also mentioned the school which was
22 established and in fact you said that the original
23 purpose was for education.

24 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm.

25 MS INNES: I wonder if we could look, please, at a document.

1 It's SGV-001033536. And if we look, please, at page 185
2 just to put this in context. So this is a report to the
3 Inquiry by Education Scotland.

4 At page 185 it starts referring to St Joseph's
5 Hospital, and if we go on to page 186, we see first of
6 all reference to a note in August 1958 where, if we look
7 into the body of the text, it says that there was
8 an arrangement that the department would investigate the
9 educational side of institutions for mental defectives,
10 and then there's reference to SED asking the
11 HM Inspectors to visit St Joseph's and it says
12 HM Inspectors were not expected to carry out anything in
13 the nature of a formal inspection but to provide general
14 counsel and advice to the nurses.

15 It was explained that these establishments could not
16 obtain the services of certifiable teachers and had to
17 depend on nurses providing the education work.

18 Is that your understanding of what was happening?
19 SISTER ELLEN: No, not entirely. I mean, it might be what
20 they said. I understand what they're saying, but it
21 wasn't entirely the whole picture. Clearly this was
22 before the school.

23 We have got evidence that from almost the beginning,
24 there was a Sister who was qualified as a teacher and
25 a number of qualified occupational therapists, and

1 certainly from the little blue history book, two Sisters
2 went, trained into St Joseph's deliberately in 1937. So
3 I think there were always attempts to make sure that the
4 education, whatever form it was taking, had its correct
5 professional backing.

6 MS INNES: Then the next entry on this page, at
7 17 March 1969, so this is correspondence within
8 government, so between the Home and Health Department
9 and the Scottish Education Department and it says that
10 HMI inspectors had reported that the Edinburgh
11 Education Authority are 'mildly perturbed' that children
12 were being sent to St Joseph's in the belief that there
13 was a school there and the Education Department said
14 there was no school at St Joseph's. Was that a correct
15 assumption?

16 SISTER ELLEN: Well, the school opened in 1969.

17 MS INNES: Then if we go on over the page, it continues on
18 the same memo and it says:

19 'In subsequent correspondence from the Education
20 Department to the Mental Welfare Commission ... SED
21 officials expressed concern that educable children were
22 still being sent to St Joseph's. SED consider that the
23 school was more in nature of an occupation centre that
24 would not cater for educable children. They advised
25 that it was "no longer the policy for educable children

1 who require residential accommodation to be sent to
2 mental deficiency hospitals" and request further
3 information about the policy for transfer of children to
4 St Joseph's.'

5 Again, is it your understanding that this is
6 correct, that the school wasn't providing for educable
7 children?

8 SISTER ELLEN: No, that's not my understanding at all.

9 LADY SMITH: Have you any idea where this came from?

10 SISTER ELLEN: Well, this documentation obviously isn't from
11 our archives, it's from --

12 LADY SMITH: No, I see that. But the Scottish Education
13 Department, a Government department --

14 SISTER ELLEN: I have no idea, Lady Smith, but it certainly
15 doesn't seem to bear out in other forms of the
16 documentation that -- because there was clearly
17 a split -- I mean, I don't think St Joseph's ever really
18 believed in the split between uneducable and educable.
19 It depends on how you define 'education'. But there
20 was -- there always seemed to be a split. You know, in
21 the olden days, they talked about higher grade and lower
22 grade and that type of language, which we don't use
23 anymore. But the children who were capable of
24 schooling, in terms of the way we would all understand
25 it, actually did go to the school and were provided with

1 professional teaching.

2 The children who -- I mean, this is obviously across
3 the years -- the children who were in the hospital
4 during the day would have received life skills training
5 and other types of education. I think the fundamental
6 principle, particularly when the groups became smaller,
7 was around maximising the potential for independence.
8 So that type of education took place in the hospital.

9 LADY SMITH: But somewhere along the line this general
10 understanding had grown up in the minds of officials in
11 the Education Department and they were telling the
12 Mental Welfare Commission that was how things worked.

13 SISTER ELLEN: Well, maybe the explanation possibly, Lady
14 Smith, is that this was 21 March 1969, immediately after
15 the school had opened, so maybe some of the philosophy
16 around this hadn't been embedded at this point. That's
17 a guess on my part.

18 LADY SMITH: When did the school open?

19 SISTER ELLEN: 1969. What month? I don't know. But this
20 is only March so it can't have been open that long.

21 LADY SMITH: No. Thank you. Ms Innes.

22 MS INNES: Thank you, my Lady.

23 If we could go back now, please, to DSV.001.001.0391
24 and to page 28, and moving on to the governing body at
25 St Joseph's, at question 2, it talks about the

1 governing -- how were members of the governing body
2 selected? And I think, if we look back to the question
3 above that, that is speaking about the local community
4 and how it was accountable to the Provincial
5 councillors.

6 SISTER ELLEN: Uh-huh.

7 MS INNES: So I don't think that this is talking about sort
8 of Board of Management of St Joseph's itself; is that
9 correct? If we scroll down, sorry.

10 SISTER ELLEN: Can you please scroll down, thank you. The
11 members of the governing body -- it doesn't specify
12 which governing body, but there was a local management
13 body, which had three external professionals on it.
14 Sister Eileen, can you shed any light on this one?
15 Because the process of consultation among the Sisters --

16 SISTER EILEEN: Yeah, I think that is referring to the
17 governing body of the Daughters of Charity as opposed to
18 the governing body of St Joseph's.

19 LADY SMITH: Well, I certainly read it as that and I could
20 understand it as that.

21 SISTER ELLEN: Meaning the Provincial council?

22 SISTER EILEEN: Yes.

23 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah, okay. Well -- yes, the Sisters are all
24 consulted about that team.

25 MS INNES: So separately in relation to St Joseph's, there

1 was a governing body, as you've mentioned, who had,
2 I think, three professionals on it.

3 SISTER ELLEN: Uh-huh.

4 MS INNES: I think Sister Catherine has given evidence that
5 there was maybe a solicitor, an accountant and
6 a surveyor on that body?

7 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

8 MS INNES: If we can move on, please, to page 29, you talk
9 there about the visits of the Provincial councillor to
10 the hospital and if we look down to question (ix),
11 there's the question about:

12 'Were children interviewed or spoken to by members
13 of the governing body?' And it's noted that children
14 who possessed the ability to communicate engaged in
15 informal conversation with the Provincial councillor.

16 And then in the next question, it says:

17 'As these conversations were informal and thus
18 occurred in the sitting room, dining room or out in the
19 playground, staff were present on some occasions, but
20 not all.'

21 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

22 MS INNES: And does this information about these visits come
23 from anecdotal evidence?

24 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

25 MS INNES: Then if we can move on, please, to page 31, and

1 at question (iii), in the second paragraph, it says:
2 'With regard to St Joseph's one of the Sisters who
3 was a director of nursing in the late 1970s was highly
4 regarded nationally for her creativity and innovation in
5 the field of residential care for children and adults
6 with learning disability. She lectured throughout
7 Scotland on this and the children and adults in
8 St Joseph's benefited greatly from her leadership.'
9 I'm not sure if you're able to tell us who that was.
10 SISTER ELLEN: Sister Patricia Gallagher, was it?
11 SISTER EILEEN: Gallagher, yep.
12 MS INNES: Sister Patricia Gallagher?
13 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
14 MS INNES: Thank you. Then if we can move on to another --
15 to page 38 just for completeness here. In terms of the
16 accountability structure, again, it says the
17 Local Superior and the matron were accountable to the
18 Provincial councillor responsible for nursing care
19 throughout the province.
20 So here it was the matron who was in charge of the
21 hospital accountable to the Local Superior who was then
22 in turn accountable to the Provincial councillor?
23 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.
24 MS INNES: Now, if we can move on, please, to
25 DSV.001.001.0533.

1 If we can look, please, at page 7. In terms of
2 admissions, the second paragraph on that page notes
3 that:

4 'There's archival evidence from 1937 of an agreement
5 between the organisation and the General Board of
6 Control for Scotland for the reception, accommodation,
7 education and maintenance of defective children of the
8 Roman Catholic religion not exceeding 16 years of age.'

9 So this was obviously at the time before the NHS had
10 come into being?

11 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

12 MS INNES: Then if we move on to page 8, and to question
13 (vii), it says that:

14 'From the surviving Sisters, it's evident that the
15 health boards worked closely with the nursing officer in
16 St Joseph's over many years and thus the practice has
17 adapted over time. For example, children of all
18 religions and none were admitted as well as adults.'

19 SISTER ELLEN: Correct.

20 MS INNES: So that changed over time?

21 SISTER ELLEN: Absolutely.

22 MS INNES: And then if we look on to page 10, under the
23 heading:

24 'Day-to-day care.'

25 Question (i), the first paragraph says:

1 'There's much archival evidence from management
2 boards minutes, correspondence with health boards,
3 reports from the mental health boards' annual
4 inspections ...'

5 So I think that would be the Mental Welfare
6 Commission perhaps:

7 '... to indicate that the establishment provided
8 a high standard of nursing care but no archival evidence
9 with regard to the actual procedures in relation to the
10 day-to-day running of the establishment.'

11 So are these the sorts of documents that you were
12 referring to that tell you about the standard of care?

13 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

14 MS INNES: Then it's said that the surviving Sister states
15 that:

16 'The overall day-to-day running of St Joseph's
17 was the responsibility of the matron in conjunction with
18 the Local Superior, but each Sister working on the wards
19 was responsible for the smooth day-to-day running of her
20 own group of children, from receiving the handover from
21 the night staff, medically assessing the children each
22 morning, getting the children up in the morning if well
23 enough to do so, having meals, times of play and
24 recreation and putting children to bed at night.'.

25 And then:

1 'While some of the children were at school, the
2 Sisters along with other members of staff cared for
3 children who were not well enough to attend school.'
4 So in terms of each ward or room of children or
5 group of children, that sounds like there was a Sister
6 in charge of each of those?
7 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
8 MS INNES: Do you know if all of those Sisters were
9 qualified nurses?
10 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, I believe so, yes.
11 MS INNES: And do you know if they had the additional
12 qualification in mental deficiency?
13 SISTER ELLEN: I can't say all of them did, but it was very
14 likely that they did. What year are we in? We're not
15 in any particular year, are we? I mean, certainly,
16 after the training school opened, they would have all
17 been qualified either in -- RNs or SCNs or auxiliary
18 nursing.
19 MS INNES: How do you know that all of them had just
20 a general nursing qualification?
21 SISTER ELLEN: Again, it's anecdotal, and, I mean, some of
22 this, of course, is in our living memory, so certainly
23 while I've been in the community they would have all
24 been qualified.
25 MS INNES: In terms of the anecdotal memory, obviously we

1 know that Sister Catherine has already given evidence to
2 the Inquiry, was there anybody else that was spoken to
3 when this response was prepared?

4 SISTER EILEEN: All the Sisters living who had worked in
5 St Joseph's would have been consulted.

6 MS INNES: Again, perhaps if you're providing evidence to
7 the Inquiry about the people that you spoke to in
8 relation to St Vincent's and when those Sisters were
9 there, it might be helpful to have the same material for
10 St Joseph's as well.

11 SISTER EILEEN: Certainly.

12 MS INNES: Thank you. If we move on to page 12, there's
13 reference there to a heading:
14 'Discipline.'
15 And it says:
16 'There were no written policies or procedures but
17 from evidence of the surviving Sisters, discipline was
18 not an issue with children at St Joseph's because most
19 behaviours were related to their disability and treated
20 as such.'

21 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

22 MS INNES: So when you say 'and treated as such', what do
23 you mean?

24 SISTER ELLEN: Meaning that they wouldn't have been punished
25 for things that they couldn't help, that were related to

1 their condition.

2 MS INNES: Then if we scroll down the same page, when
3 there's a question at the bottom of the page in relation
4 to review or changes in policies and procedures, and it
5 says obviously nursing and teaching methods evolved in
6 relation to children with learning disability and
7 St Joseph's adapted accordingly and was often at the
8 forefront of innovation. Why do you say that it was at
9 the forefront of innovation?

10 SISTER ELLEN: Because of the feeling that it became
11 a frontrunner in many ways, a lot to do with the
12 training school and the ability to offer placements to
13 people and the fact that it was so highly regarded in
14 the general -- in Scotland in general as the
15 understanding of learning disability and these methods
16 increased, and certainly the leadership in education and
17 nursing would both imply, as you read, that these things
18 were studied and trends were followed.

19 I mean, you know, the end of the story is the
20 closure of a hospital and the removal into much more
21 family-like groupings in the community. That's a long
22 story and I think it kind of tells its own tale.

23 MS INNES: If we move on to page 15 and to the bottom of the
24 page, you were asked about safeguarding and again it
25 notes that:

1 'There were no written policies and procedures but
2 it's evident from speaking with surviving Sisters that
3 everything possible was done during the day-to-day to
4 ensure that children were kept safe and lived as normal
5 a life as possible within the setting of a hospital for
6 children and adults with a learning disability. Also
7 the Sisters who worked there speak of following all
8 policies and procedures as laid out by Lothian
9 Health Board and the Education Authority.'

10 So they seem to refer to a connection between
11 St Joseph's and the local health board?

12 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, I think that connection again is very
13 evident in the documentation that there was a real
14 partnership very often between St Joseph's and what was
15 trying to be achieved in the greater environment within
16 this field and I've no doubt that those policies and
17 procedures that were laid out by the State would have
18 been followed to the letter and in Sister Catherine's
19 evidence she said many things were in place and she
20 listed the policies that she put in place when she got
21 there herself.

22 MS INNES: And why do you say that you have no doubt that
23 the legislative and regulatory requirements would have
24 been --

25 SISTER ELLEN: Because all the reporting indicates that and

1 the -- you know, the relationship -- just even just one
2 relationship between Dr Heti and the establishment. The
3 sense of partnership that runs through is very strong
4 and I can't believe that it wouldn't have been pointed
5 out if things weren't being followed.

6 MS INNES: So I think you're referring there to a Dr Heti
7 Davies who I think was perhaps a psychiatrist working at
8 the hospital.

9 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, correct.

10 MS INNES: If we look on to page 17, please, and to the
11 middle of the page, question (x), in the second
12 paragraph there it says:

13 'From the early 1960s the number of children in the
14 wards gradually reduced from 25 to 30 to 12 to 18 while
15 at the same time the number of nurses increased
16 steadily. On a ward of very severely disabled children
17 in the 1980s there were approximately 15 staff for
18 18 children.'

19 So again does that indicate the trends that you've
20 spoken about in terms of the move towards smaller
21 numbers of children being in a group and higher staff
22 numbers?

23 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, and the fact that by this time, very
24 slowly, children that were able to were being
25 accommodated somewhere else and that therefore the

1 people that remained in St Joseph's were those with the
2 most complex needs.

3 MS INNES: Then if we move on to page 20, and towards the
4 bottom of the page, where you're talking about staffing,
5 with a heading:

6 'Induction.'

7 It says:

8 'From the earlier years there is no archival
9 evidence of induction. However, from the staff
10 handbook, mentioned above ...'

11 So you'd found, I think, a staff handbook and within
12 that there was an induction programme outlined and
13 surviving Sisters recall induction being given to new
14 staff on the job.

15 Then it says:

16 'Many of the nurses obtained employment directly
17 from the on-site nurses training school and thus knew
18 St Joseph's well prior to becoming employees.'

19 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.

20 MS INNES: So do you know if nurses who were at the training
21 school, if they were doing practical training -- there
22 must have been theoretical and practical training, was
23 all of that practical training carried out within
24 St Joseph's Hospital itself?

25 SISTER ELLEN: I can't say for sure that they wouldn't have

1 been sent on placement to other places, but the
2 impression in the documents is that certainly those that
3 remained had done their practice in St Joseph's, but
4 they weren't all going to work in St Joseph's and so
5 I'm not sure, you know, it could have been both and ...
6 MS INNES: If we move on to page 32, there's reference to
7 complaints in the middle of the page and again it's
8 noted that none of the surviving Sisters can recall
9 a complaint being made during their time and there's no
10 recorded evidence of any complaints.
11 So sorry, it's at question (i) under:
12 'Past.'
13 If we scroll up.
14 SISTER ELLEN: Thank you.
15 MS INNES: So none of the surviving Sisters can recall
16 a complaint being made during their time and there is no
17 recorded evidence of any complaint.
18 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah, Sister Eileen can verify that.
19 SISTER EILEEN: That's correct.
20 MS INNES: I wonder if I can ask you, please, to look at
21 some other documents. So a document at DSV-000000355,
22 which is a Register of Restraint and Seclusion provided
23 by the Order and I think this spans from 1946 to 1964.
24 If we could have a look at an example of one of the
25 pages. If we look at page 5, for example, we can see

1 a number of entries. So just looking at the very first
2 entry, 6 July 1954, there's reference to the form of
3 restraint being sleeves and then the reasons for the
4 restraint or seclusion is said to be protection of
5 self-harm and then it's dated and then 'Remarks', it
6 says 'daily' which might suggest that this individual
7 was being restrained in this way on a daily basis.

8 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

9 MS INNES: And we can see on the page, there's reference to
10 other patients having been restrained by the use of
11 sleeves. Do you have any reflection on that particular
12 practice at St Joseph's?

13 SISTER ELLEN: I think from looking in detail at this
14 document, you've taken a bit like in the middle of it,
15 we have concluded that these -- there were -- on this
16 particular page, there would have been largely the same
17 names repeated over and over again, four or five.

18 At the introduction of the single rooms and the
19 sleeves, it wasn't there consistently throughout the
20 document. Our conclusion is really: why? So the
21 protection of self and others was almost consistent
22 throughout.

23 The use of sleeves was a standard practice, though
24 not very pleasant, and it was -- our conclusion really
25 is that these -- because there were so few, they were

1 people who had really severe disabilities and that it
2 was a positive necessity.

3 We didn't really find any evidence that this was in
4 any form punitive, that it was a necessity for safety,
5 that people were protected from themselves and others
6 were protected from them. And the other indication is
7 that there's no indication of the age of the people.

8 I don't know if that helps but ...

9 MS INNES: So there's no indication of the age because there
10 were children and adults there at the time?

11 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

12 MS INNES: And you said it was a practice at the time.

13 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm.

14 MS INNES: What's your reflection on the appropriateness of
15 that practice, you know, applying, as you've said, to
16 severely learning disabled people?

17 SISTER ELLEN: Well, in any of these sorts of
18 establishments, I mean that's a bit of a generalisation
19 but -- and I'm making assumptions and personal opinions
20 a little, that the safety has to be paramount and if
21 a person is in danger of harming themselves or other
22 people, because of the nature of their disability, then
23 something has to be done to help the situation.

24 And this was at a time when people were in larger
25 groupings, so the risk was higher. By the time we get

1 to 1985, when Sister Catherine was there, there was no
2 incidents of this whatsoever, but I do also think that
3 the practice will have changed over the years and the
4 ability to find other methods of dealing with these
5 sorts of difficult behaviours.

6 I mean, I'm stumbling a little because I'm not
7 a professional and I've never done this, but, you know,
8 having reflected on it quite a lot, I would believe that
9 it was necessary and it wasn't an easy way out and
10 particularly because the incidences were so repetitive
11 and the numbers so small in comparison to the numbers of
12 -- in the place.

13 But, you know, I don't have professional knowledge
14 of this and I wasn't there.

15 LADY SMITH: What did you understand to be meant by the term
16 'sleeves'?

17 SISTER ELLEN: Something that kind of immobilised them.

18 LADY SMITH: Like a straitjacket?

19 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

21 MS INNES: Also on that page, we see reference to seclusion,
22 so single room?

23 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

24 MS INNES: For example, the third entry down, form of
25 seclusion, single room, aggression and destruction and

1 then the remarks are 1.30 pm to 7 pm.

2 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

3 MS INNES: Then if we look down to the bottom of the page,

4 10 December 1954, form of seclusion, single room,

5 reason, excitement and then the time of seclusion is

6 10.30 am to 7 pm.

7 Again, do you have any reflections on the

8 appropriateness of that treatment of people?

9 SISTER ELLEN: Well, again, I'm not a professional, but my

10 unprofessional opinion or feeling around this is that

11 aggression and excitement are more like moods as opposed

12 to a physical disability that's permanent and so it's

13 more appropriate that the single room method would be

14 used and that the time would be limited because the mood

15 will pass and I can only equate it to the time when

16 I was teaching when -- in an ordinary school, when

17 sometimes students had to be asked to go and be in

18 another room because of their behaviour.

19 MS INNES: I mean, some these -- one of them is from 10.30

20 in the morning to 7 o'clock at night. That seems a very

21 long time.

22 SISTER ELLEN: It does, yes.

23 MS INNES: I'm going to move on to another document,

24 MIC.001.001.0001.

25 And this is a document which was provided to the

1 Inquiry by Midlothian Council.

2 If we look on to page 13 and point (vi), there's
3 reference there to a discussion during the 1980s and
4 a discussion with Sister Patricia, who referred to
5 shortage of staff as being a reason for paperwork
6 requested by the Council not being forthcoming.

7 Now, from -- other than from this document, did you
8 have knowledge that there were staff shortages during
9 this period?

10 SISTER ELLEN: No.

11 MS INNES: Then if we scroll down, there's reference to
12 other material -- or references to St Joseph's Hospital,
13 where, for example, in the final paragraph, at paragraph
14 (vii), it says in the 1972 report, it stated there are
15 no hospitals for children in the County of Midlothian
16 despite St Joseph's being there, so it appears that the
17 local authority seemed to be overlooking St Joseph's?

18 SISTER ELLEN: Seems a bit strange.

19 MS INNES: Then at paragraph (viii) it says:

20 'Anecdotal memory of a senior social work colleague
21 in Midlothian who grew up in the village of Rosewell
22 during the 60s and 70s is that children from St Joseph's
23 were rarely seen. The very rare occasions when they
24 were seen in public in the village and the memory stands
25 out because sightings were so rare is of seeing about

1 11 or 12 children who appeared to have some type of
2 complex needs in the local park with staff or nuns.'

3 Now, from speaking to Sisters who were involved at
4 St Joseph's and also the records, is this a description
5 that you would recognise or have any comment on?

6 SISTER ELLEN: One can only speculate, I'm afraid. It has
7 a very long driveway, almost a mile long, down to the
8 village and then it would be even further to the park.
9 I mean, the park just is a thing that happens to be
10 mentioned here. Transport actually was provided in
11 later years to get them -- people up and down. They had
12 their own play facilities because they had to have
13 specially adapted equipment and integration was still
14 an issue in society at this time, though it was very
15 near the beginning of the period where this began to
16 change and the attitudes of people began to change, but,
17 I mean, I'm speculating, I'm sorry.

18 We don't have documentation that talks about
19 outings, as far as I can recall, during this period, in
20 the way that we have it in later periods.

21 MS INNES: If I could ask you, please, to look at another
22 document now, this is SGV-001033310 and if we can look
23 at page 31. This is a letter from the Mental Welfare
24 Commission to the Home and Health Department, dated
25 26 October 1978.

1 If we look at the text we can see:

2 'I have pleasure in enclosing my report following

3 the annual visit of inspection under the 1960 Act to

4 St Joseph's Hospital.'

5 And it says:

6 'I would be grateful if the attention of

7 Dr Ratcliffe could be drawn to the following.'

8 Point 2, a paragraph in relation to general comments

9 and it says:

10 'In view of the present problem and the situation in

11 which patients, Sister Rosalie and the nursing staff are

12 placed at St Joseph's I consider that some action is now

13 urgently required in this case.'

14 So this is what the medical officer is saying.

15 SISTER ELLEN: Mm-hmm.

16 MS INNES: If we go on to page 32, at the top of the page we

17 see the annual visit of inspection was paid to

18 St Joseph's on 28 September 1978.

19 If we look down to the age range of the patients in

20 St Joseph's Hospital, it says that at that time there

21 were children who were under 16, 41 children; and then

22 the next age category was 16 to 49, there were 127. So

23 that's the numbers at the time.

24 Then if we look on, please, to page 34 and it says

25 there:

1 'In discussion, Dr Davies and Sister Rosalie
2 expressed concern regarding difficulties in the
3 continued management in St Joseph's Hospital of those
4 hyperactive acting out mentally handicapped children who
5 become big or strong, aggressive, hyperactive and
6 outwith control adolescents, in particular the
7 physically strong males. Cultural, environmental and
8 staff factors contribute to this problem. Also the
9 presence of the physically handicapped together with
10 an increasing number of high dependency cases in the
11 graduate population. Six patients were presented in
12 discussion, some of whom are giving rise to very grave
13 concern on account of their disturbed and aggressive
14 behaviour towards themselves and other people. Patients
15 and staff are at risk in this present situation and
16 Dr Davies was of the opinion that these patients both
17 male and female recorded facilities appropriate to their
18 management needs.'

19 So this seems to be the urgent issue that required
20 to be addressed and it appears that there was
21 a particular concern about the ability of the hospital
22 to cope with some children.

23 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah, which is understandable with those
24 sorts of numbers. I've forgotten what year you said
25 this was.

1 MS INNES: 1978.

2 SISTER ELLEN: Okay, because in 1971 there was a new unit
3 for people with very special complex needs. So clearly
4 it was oversubscribed and more needed to be done, but
5 beyond that I can't really comment. I'm not surprised,
6 but I don't know what happened next. I can't remember.

7 MS INNES: Certainly there's mention of a risk to other
8 patients and also to staff.

9 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah, my-hmm.

10 MS INNES: And if we can look on to another page of this,
11 page 64, this was in 1969 and this was in respect of
12 an inspection, again by the Mental Welfare Commission,
13 on 17 November 1969 and we can see, for reference, in
14 the next paragraph it says:
15 'Since the date of the last visit of inspection the
16 new hospital school has been opened.'
17 So that confirms that it was in 1969, although not
18 the date.

19 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

20 MS INNES: And if we scroll down, there's a paragraph
21 beginning:
22 'There are at present 254 patients on the registers,
23 130 male and 124 female.'
24 Then it talks about discharges and admissions and
25 there's a sentence beginning:

1 'During the year, one patient sustained a serious
2 accident. The patient concerned, a blind spastic child
3 aged 9, fell out of a window and sustained a fractured
4 femur; he was transferred for surgical treatment to the
5 Royal Hospital for Sick Children and has made good
6 progress and is now back at St Joseph's. This accident
7 is considered by the staff to provide an example of the
8 possible consequences of the very unsatisfactory nature
9 of the present accommodation for the physically infirm
10 and handicapped children, and it is not considered
11 feasible to effect any material improvement without
12 further building.'

13 So that seems to indicate that there was a concern
14 about the building -- the residential building at that
15 time.

16 SISTER ELLEN: Yeah.

17 MS INNES: Do you know if that was then --

18 SISTER ELLEN: Well, it's after that that the new unit was
19 set up and a lift was put in. You know, like there was
20 quite a lot of building work after that, and somewhere
21 else it says that there was a planned programme already
22 in train during this time, but I'd just like to say that
23 no child should ever fall out of a window and it was
24 a very traumatic, regrettable thing to happen.

25 MS INNES: Now, if I can look to another document given to

1 us by the Order. It's at DSV.001.001.1200 and if we can
2 look, please, at I think, again, page 2. In relation to
3 question 5, it's noted that the organisation knows of no
4 abuse nor allegations of alleged abuse relating to
5 St Joseph's Hospital; does that remain the position?
6 SISTER ELLEN: Yes.
7 MS INNES: Are you aware of any civil claims being raised in
8 relation to St Joseph's?
9 SISTER EILEEN: No.
10 MS INNES: Are you aware of any criminal proceedings in
11 relation to St Joseph's?
12 SISTER EILEEN: No.
13 MS INNES: And in terms of Redress, are you aware of any
14 Redress claims being made in relation to St Joseph's?
15 SISTER EILEEN: None, no.
16 MS INNES: If we can look, please, back to your Part B
17 response, it's at DSV.001.001.0391 and page 41, and if
18 we look at question 3.1, so the question there is:
19 'Does the Order accept that between 1930 and
20 17 December 2014 some children cared for at the
21 establishment were abused?'
22 And the answer previously was that the organisation
23 is unaware of any instances of abuse of children. Has
24 the Order's position in relation to the answer to that
25 question changed or not?

1 SISTER ELLEN: No.

2 MS INNES: And then in relation to question 3.3 -- 3.2, at
3 the bottom of this page, it notes that -- well, the
4 question is:
5 'Does the organisation accept that its systems
6 failed to protect children cared for at the
7 establishment from abuse?'

8 And again it's said that:
9 'The Order's unaware of any allegations of abuse,
10 however, if they have been made and are proven, it is
11 axiomatic these systems were not in place to ensure
12 a safe environment for the children.'

13 And does that remain the Order's position or has
14 that changed?

15 SISTER ELLEN: That's the same.

16 MS INNES: We've heard some evidence in relation to systems.
17 So, for example, the evidence that we've just looked at
18 in relation to the accommodation of children with
19 complex needs and the potential -- or risk of -- to
20 other children, for example. Do you have any comment in
21 relation to that -- any systemic failings in relation to
22 that issue?

23 SISTER ELLEN: I wouldn't know how to comment on that.

24 MS INNES: I suppose there could be issues about the
25 appropriateness of placement of some children in the

1 hospital?

2 SISTER ELLEN: There could be, but given that the most --

3 the -- St Joseph's would have been a place where people

4 with the most complex needs would have been accepted,

5 and the numbers that were involved, you know, it's

6 difficult, isn't it? I mean, again, I'm just trying to

7 put myself in that position and imagine what it was

8 like. Systems with regard to children falling out of

9 windows, you know, is a different matter and there were

10 obviously health and safety issues with the building and

11 so on. So, yes, clearly there were faults in the

12 building and the surroundings at that time.

13 If you read on in the story, you can see that the

14 partnership was such with the health boards and the

15 professionals that every effort was made to try to spend

16 money on the building so that it would improve and

17 improve and improve, until it closed.

18 MS INNES: I suppose there might also be issues with

19 supervision or -- supervision by staff or the numbers of

20 staff. As we've seen, there's brief reference to

21 Sister Patricia saying that there were staff shortages?

22 SISTER ELLEN: Yes, absolutely.

23 MS INNES: Thank you, Sister Ellen, I don't have any more

24 questions for you.

25 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

1 Sister Ellen, Sister Eileen, I have nothing further
2 for either of you. I just want to thank you again for
3 coming along this morning and bearing with us as we
4 prodded and probed for various answers. It's been
5 really helpful to hear from you directly and thank you
6 for undertaking to give us the further information we've
7 asked for.

8 SISTER ELLEN: Thank you very much, Lady Smith.

9 LADY SMITH: I'm now able to let you go and I hope the rest
10 of the day is less stressful than this morning.

11 SISTER ELLEN: Thank you.

12 (The witnesses withdrew)

13 LADY SMITH: Before I stop for the lunch break, I think we
14 may have mentioned the [REDACTED] whose identity
15 is protected by my General Restriction Order and that
16 was [REDACTED] She's not to be identified as
17 referred to in our evidence outside this room.

18 So that's it until 2 o'clock, when we move to
19 a witness in person -- no, sorry -- we were to move to
20 the witness in person, but we're reading in a statement.

21 MS INNES: We have various statements that we will read in,
22 in the time available.

23 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. Until 2 o'clock.

24 (12.58 pm).

25 (The luncheon adjournment)

1 (2.00 pm)

2 LADY SMITH: Good afternoon.

3 Now, we turn to read-ins, Ms McMillan.

4 MS MCMILLAN: Yes, thank you, my Lady.

5 The first read-in that we will be starting with this
6 afternoon is the read-in in respect of the applicant
7 whose pseudonym is 'Gordon'.

8 'Gordon' (read)

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

10 MS MCMILLAN: The reference for 'Gordon's' statement is
11 WIT-1-000001013.

12 'Gordon' was born in 1949 and in his statement, he
13 talks about his experience at St Vincent's School.
14 'Gordon' says in his statement that he went to
15 St Vincent's when he was around 2-and-a-half years old
16 and left when he was 15.

17 In paragraphs 2 to 7 of his statement, he talks
18 about his life before going into care. He was one of
19 eight children and lived with his mother and father.

20 He tells us that his mother was Catholic and his dad
21 was Protestant which caused tension with his extended
22 family when he was born. At around 6 months old, the
23 doctors started to suspect he was profoundly deaf and
24 'Gordon' tells us that this brought the extended family
25 closer together again.

1 As he got older, it was hoped that he would go to
2 a local Catholic primary school but unfortunately they
3 would only accept hearing children.

4 His mother was told to try another school which
5 accommodated for deaf children but they would only
6 accept Protestant children. His mother was then
7 referred on to St Vincent's.

8 'Gordon' talks about how he ended up at St Vincent's
9 and his experience there.

10 Starting from paragraph 6 of his statement at
11 page 2, he says:

12 'A school gave my mother the address of St Vincent's
13 School in Tollcross, Glasgow, but we needed to take two
14 buses to get to that school from where we stayed. That
15 was the reason I ended up boarding at the school during
16 the week.

17 'I was 2-and-a-half then and these are all things
18 I didn't know about what I was younger.

19 'St Vincent's School had no hearing children, it was
20 just deaf, deaf-blind and disabled children. There was
21 segregation between the deaf and deaf-blind and disabled
22 children in the classrooms.

23 'I didn't know who was paying for me to be at
24 St Vincent's. I think there was a sponsor or a donor of
25 some description, because somebody gave the building to

1 the church or to the Sisters. I remember a picture of
2 a wealthy gentleman that hung in the school. I don't
3 know his name but he was the owner of the land that the
4 school sat on. He donated it for the cause of deaf
5 children. Over time, the number of deaf children
6 attending school increased so much that the school had
7 to build a new wing. There wasn't enough space to house
8 all the children so they made the new wing. Since then
9 St Vincent's has closed.

10 'As you walk into St Vincent's School the girls'
11 side was on the left and the boys' section was on the
12 right. It was like that in every room. Upstairs
13 was the bedrooms so the girls' rooms were on the left
14 and the boys' were on the right. In essence the whole
15 school was split in half and there was a demarcation
16 line in some rooms, like the dining room for example.

17 'All the kids' rooms were upstairs and the kids were
18 put in rooms according to their age. There was a baby
19 room off to the left upstairs which had about 12 to 15
20 kids. Then on the right, the boys' side, there were
21 about 22 younger kids in a room, about 30 middle aged
22 kids in a room and about 40 more adult kids in a room.
23 I think it was the same for the girls who were all to
24 the left upstairs. There were two rooms for adults
25 upstairs as well.

1 'There was an old coal burner that heated up the
2 building but the pipes were never warm in the dorms and
3 the building was always cold. I remember it being very
4 damp and cold and I remember I told my mum about that.
5 The school was always cold, yet the church was always
6 warm. Myself and other kids used to wonder why the
7 church was always warm and the school was always cold.
8 That was something we just accepted but it was a very
9 cruel thing to do to children.

10 'I was in the older kids' section from about the age
11 of 10 to 15-and-a-half when I left the school.

12 'I remember all the nuns used to wear these big
13 hats. I found that very intimidating. I didn't
14 understand what was going on and that carried on for
15 quite a while.

16 'The Sisters I remember are Sister KTA, who was
17 and I think she the school. there was
18 Sister Margaret who was and worked in the
19 boys' side. Sister PCA was on the boys' side and
20 worked supporting the deaf, deaf-blind and disabled
21 kids, she was small and wore glasses and was
22 particularly cruel and vicious. Sister KXD was
23 also very cruel and vicious. She was in the boys' side
24 and she was also a teacher. Sister KYA was very cruel.
25 She was one of the first Sisters I met and she looked

1 after the kids aged from 2-and-a-half. Sister KUA
2 looked after the younger and older boys. She was a big
3 woman and had a body like a man. She came to
4 St Vincent's when I was older. I think she replaced one
5 of the other Sisters. All the deaf kids were terrified
6 of her. I also remember Sister LXH who worked on the
7 girls' side of the school. She was nice.

8 'I was with other deaf and deaf-blind children at
9 St Vincent's School. We would use the deaf-blind manual
10 to communicate and I would make sure other children were
11 okay.

12 'I remember going to school on my very first day.
13 I was sitting with my mum and I asked her: what's
14 happening? What was going on? I saw the Sisters for
15 the first time on that first day at school and it was
16 very unnerving for me.

17 'I remember looking back and seeing my mother crying
18 and I could see my father was upset as well. I was
19 crying too. My parents and the Sisters had discussions
20 that day which lasted about 60 or 90 minutes and then
21 I was taken away.

22 'I remember I was in floods of tears because my
23 mother and father left me. I was taken into the school
24 and I remember I just cried and cried all day that first
25 day. A member of staff put a dummy in my mouth because

1 I was crying non-stop. I remember being in my bed and
2 there were just rows and rows of other beds with other
3 kids in them. It was like being in an army barracks.
4 All I remember is crying. I was crying for my mum.
5 I wanted my mum and all I remember is constantly being
6 told to stop crying.

7 'I remember waking up the next morning and having
8 a walk around before I was taken to school. In essence
9 I started school when I was 2-and-a-half.

10 'We were arisen at 6 o'clock in the morning because
11 we had to go to chapel at 6.30. I couldn't understand
12 why we had to go to the chapel at that time of day. At
13 8 o'clock we had breakfast and then we got changed into
14 our school gear. We never had access to any clean
15 clothes. I do remember the clothes were always smelly.

16 'School would begin at 9 o'clock and then we would
17 have the school day. We had a break from school at
18 10.30 when we had a glass of milk. That was it, a glass
19 of freezing cold milk, even in the cold weather, so we
20 never had access to anything warm.

21 'Lunch was at half past 12 and the food that was
22 provided was disgusting. We were back in school after
23 lunch and that was more or less school life. In the
24 evenings after tea we would be sent up to our dorms and
25 we would have nothing to do. There was no stimulation

1 for us. Between 6 and 8 o'clock we would be sitting
2 there with nothing for us to do before going to bed.
3 Then we would go to bed, sleep, get up in the morning.
4 It was awful. That's what happened every day, Monday to
5 Friday.

6 'I remember other kids saying that they were bored
7 and they wanted Friday to come along so they could go
8 home and spend time with their parents.

9 'I remember one of Sister PCA's jobs was to walk
10 through the bedrooms at nighttime to make sure all the
11 kids were sleeping. She would then turn the light off.
12 If I needed the toilet during the night I would get
13 taken down to use the toilet facilities and then come
14 back up. Sometimes I used to go over and talk to the
15 deaf-blind children at night when it was really dark.
16 I would use the deaf-blind manual to ask them if they
17 needed the toilet. If they said yes I would take them
18 down to the toilet in the middle of the night.
19 I remember these old metal pipes that ran along the
20 inside of the building and I used to tell the deaf-blind
21 kids to do the toilet there. We had to feel our way
22 about the building.

23 'The older children had access to a toilet at night
24 because their door was open. The younger kids didn't
25 have the same access because their dorm door was closed.

1 I think the reason for that was to stop the older kids
2 coming into the younger kids' dorm. The younger kids
3 would also be in bed earlier so it stopped the older
4 kids interrupting us. It was like a one-way system so
5 was no alternative way round.

6 'The Sisters were upstairs sometimes with the key.
7 Eventually the Sisters figured out what was going on
8 because they got a plumber out and the plumber said
9 there was a smell of urine in the corner of the pipes.
10 The Sisters asked who was responsible but nobody said
11 anything and they never got to the bottom of that.

12 'We had our dinner in this big hall with boys on one
13 side and girls on the other side. We were segregated
14 from girls at dinner. In fact, we were segregated all
15 the time. That was my entire school experience.

16 'I don't know what I was eating. The food was
17 disgusting. I remember the mince. It was horrible and
18 was never properly cooked. In essence, it was kind of
19 raw and you couldn't chew it. It was swimming in greasy
20 water. I used to go home and my mum would make mince
21 and I would have to tell her I couldn't eat it because
22 that was what they forced us to eat at school. That
23 always stuck with my mum, the fact I'd had such
24 a reaction towards mince.

25 'We had sausages, mashed potato, beans, bread,

1 basically the same food all the time. You could tell
2 nothing was cooked properly and when the food was
3 presented to us it wasn't even hot. Some children were
4 so hungry they just ate it. Sometimes I had some of my
5 food and gave the rest to another child because I knew
6 they were so hungry they would eat it regardless.

7 'I didn't like the food at all and if you didn't
8 like it the nuns would force you to eat it with a spoon.
9 Myself and other deaf children would say we didn't want
10 to eat it, but we were grabbed by the nuns and forced to
11 eat it. Sometimes the Sisters would just grab the
12 plates of food and shove them right into the faces of
13 the children. I remember a bottle of milk being pushed
14 into my mouth when I was younger. All the deaf children
15 were treated that way.

16 'We didn't get anything to drink other than water.
17 We didn't have soda or soft drinks and didn't get any
18 treats. I would only ever get things like that when
19 I was at home.

20 'When I was 2-and-a-half, it was a Sister who washed
21 me. Then when I was 4 and no longer in nappies, I was
22 expected to do it on my own. We all were. We only had
23 access to a sink, not a bath, so we only got to wash our
24 hands and face. We couldn't wash from head to toe in
25 a bath. I was moved to the adult dorms when I was 10

1 and there were shower cubicles installed there when
2 I was 11. We could shower whenever we wanted after
3 that.

4 'Sister KUA showed us how to operate the
5 showers and left us to get on with it. After the
6 showers, she would usher us up to our dorms. We would
7 change back into the same dirty clothes or pyjamas that
8 we had been wearing before the shower. Some kids didn't
9 use the shower because they were so used to using
10 a basin to wash and clean themselves.

11 'We didn't have access to clean water or to soap and
12 I seldom got to wash my hair. The soap they gave us was
13 a big green bar and was the stuff that was appropriate
14 for cleaning floors. That was the kind of soap we all
15 had access to. We used to see the cleaners using it to
16 clean the floors. That was the same soap that was given
17 to us.

18 'I once challenged that and said we were getting the
19 soap that was used to clean the floors and I remember
20 some of the staff just pointing upstairs as if to
21 indicate that's what they'd decided upstairs was the
22 soap we were to use.

23 'I remember occasions when I didn't wash my hair for
24 four or five days and I remember my mum constantly
25 saying to me -- consistently saying to me when I was

1 coming home that I was really smelly.

2 'I seem to remember Sister KTA being challenged
3 by my mum about why there was no provision for the
4 children to remain clean. I'm not sure what happened,
5 but there was no change afterwards, that I remember.

6 'At St Vincent's the school clothing was a grey
7 jumper, a white shirt, a green and black tie, grey
8 shorts and I remember wearing the same underwear for
9 five days. You had one of everything, including just
10 one set of underwear. We had to wear everything for
11 five days we were at St Vincent's and the clothes would
12 be washed when we went home at the weekend.

13 'We never had access to any new clothes, so we wore
14 exactly the same clothes in the playground after school
15 and in the evenings. The clothes that we had were
16 soiled, dirty and absolutely stinking. When I got home
17 on a Friday my mum would give me a cuddle as soon as
18 I walked in the door and the first thing she would then
19 do was bath me.

20 'There were kids who travelled to school on a daily
21 basis and they were okay because they had access to
22 clean clothes. We didn't have access to any clean
23 alternative clothing. Some kids were really fortunate
24 because the parents were told to provide alternative
25 clothing by the Sisters and could afford to do that for

1 their kids. A lot of the parents back then didn't have
2 the money for alternative clothing though, so we just
3 had to wear the same clothes every day.

4 'Another thing is that the Sisters would check our
5 underwear and if anybody had soiled themselves or had
6 dirty underwear they would be chastised and reprimanded
7 and then told to go and clean their underwear. We would
8 have to hand wash our own underwear in the toilet area.
9 That happened to me and all the deaf children and it
10 happened most of the way through school. I once took my
11 underwear home and started to clean it and my mother
12 questioned that. I told her that's what we had to do at
13 school. She told me to leave it and she did it for me.

14 'The punishment we received would be to get hit with
15 a wooden ruler or a brush handle for having dirty
16 underwear. I once saw a deaf kid who had poo'd himself
17 and on the floor, being hit with the brush handle for
18 doing that. That was by Sister KUA but it could
19 occasionally be the other Sisters as well.

20 'We didn't have access to anything else and the
21 Sisters knew that. I remember trying to wash my
22 clothes, other kids did that as well, but the pipes in
23 the dorm were never on so we were putting our underwear
24 on cold pipes to dry off. We would put our underwear on
25 in the morning and they would be cold, wet and damp.

1 'There was a playground with a set of swings and we
2 would get a football to kick around. That was the only
3 two activities we had. There was absolutely nothing for
4 any of the children to use and nothing in term of
5 stimulation. There was no television, no books, no
6 cards or games and nothing for us to read. All we would
7 do is sit and chat until lights out at 9 o'clock. It
8 was the same monotony every single day and we were
9 segregated from the girls so we couldn't even see them.

10 'St Vincent's did have a deaf football team. They
11 weren't particularly good and I didn't really get
12 involved in that. I wasn't cut out for football.
13 I just remember spending a lot of time mulling around.

14 'In the playground there was boys on one side and
15 girls on the other and if we said hello or waved to the
16 girls, Sister KUA would push us and tell us not to
17 look at the girls. I remember not understanding that
18 and wondering what was going on.

19 'We were never taken on any trips but we did go out
20 and take swimming lessons, that was all.

21 'The school at St Vincent's was quite a big school.
22 We were segregated all the time with boys on one side of
23 the room and girls on the other. There was a line
24 segregating us from girls and we weren't allowed to
25 cross that line. My first teacher at St Vincent's was

1 Miss Russell. I remember she asked where I was from and
2 she said that she knew where that was and she would keep
3 in touch with my parents and let them know how I was
4 getting on. She never made any contact with my family.

5 'I remember the teacher put out toys for me to play
6 with and there were other boys and girls there and we
7 were all in a big group. I have a memory of crying and
8 the teacher picking me up. Miss Russell used to write
9 stuff down and show it to the children. The children
10 were then expected to learn in that fashion.

11 'Something they gave us was a hearing aid that was
12 a big box that hung around our neck and was battery
13 operated. I first starting using that when I was about
14 8 which was far too late for someone that started school
15 as young as I did and was of no use to me anyway as
16 I was profoundly deaf. It would vibrate and was very
17 heavy. It was so frustrating to use and was of no
18 benefit to me. I told my mum and she told
19 Sister Margaret it was of no use so I was then allowed
20 not to use it.

21 'As I moved up through the school, I got moved into
22 different rooms. I remember getting to the age of 7 and
23 things changed through the school. I changed teachers
24 to Sister KXD who was a teacher and a Sister. We
25 did exercises and written work with her and she would

1 punish children who got things wrong. I was with her
2 from about -- from the age of about 7 to 11.

3 'None of the Sisters really communicated with the
4 deaf children in sign language. We were spoken to in
5 English so much of the time we didn't know what it
6 was the teachers were talking to us about. We would all
7 sit confused most of the time. They did use it a little
8 bit but most of the education took place on the
9 blackboard. It was just written in English on the board
10 and we were meant to deduce what was being said and
11 meant. They certainly weren't fluent signers, far from
12 it.

13 'There was an Irish teacher who used to spend time
14 trying to teach us a bit of sign language. He passed
15 away, so that only lasted a short time. That was really
16 unfortunate for us, but aside from him St Vincent's
17 wasn't geared up to teach deaf and blind kids.

18 'We really learned sign from other older deaf
19 children at St Vincent's. We basically learned from our
20 peers. We would use the time in the evening when there
21 was nothing to do as time to solidify and improve our
22 own sign language.

23 'Another teacher I remember is Miss Carsey, who was
24 lovely but couldn't sign either. She helped me with my
25 workings if they were incorrect. She supported me and

1 helped me. Then I changed room and went to the higher
2 school at St Vincent's. Mr LXL was another good
3 teacher. He was a technical teacher and I remember him
4 fondly.

5 'In the high school I had Sister KUA who
6 arrived when I was maybe 8 years of age. I remember she
7 was a big woman with a stern face and would have been
8 about 25 to 30 years of age. She watched after the
9 children. She didn't teach at the school. She just
10 supervised children. If they were cheeky at all, she
11 would hit them. She frequently hit kids and she was
12 doing that within a week of arriving. She once hit
13 a boy but he hit her back and then they started hitting
14 each other. She was such a bully and really wicked.
15 After that he wasn't treated as badly.

16 'There were three Irish boys at the school. They
17 were singled out and given worse treatment than other
18 children. I don't know why that was and I don't know
19 why they were even at our school as there was a school
20 for deaf children in Dublin. The three of them were
21 about my age. I'm not sure how long they were there.
22 They maybe arrived when I was about 6. They have all
23 passed away now.

24 'None of the Sisters were deaf. They were all
25 hearing. So they didn't understand the experience of

1 being deaf. It's night and day to what it's like now.
2 For kids these days it's fantastic. They have access to
3 a teacher who speaks their first language.

4 'In essence, we didn't get access to a standard
5 education. We didn't sit O-Levels or anything like
6 that. Our school existence pretty much consisted of
7 nodding your head and saying yes.

8 'I don't remember seeing a doctor or a dentist. My
9 teeth were generally okay, but if anyone needed it, they
10 would get access to dentistry. I do remember getting
11 some kind of check at the school, where I stuck my
12 tongue out and got checked over.

13 'I do know decisions were made outside of my mum and
14 dad being consulted. My mum always checked my teeth and
15 one day she asked how one of my teeth had been removed.
16 She disagreed with what had been done because she hadn't
17 been consulted and didn't think I needed to have the
18 tooth removed so that was all quite upsetting. I didn't
19 even have toothache. It wasn't hurting. I was just
20 taken to the dentist and the tooth was removed.
21 I remember it was bleeding and there was blood on my
22 pillow the next morning.

23 'I also remember an occasion when I was about 7 or 8
24 when I had a problem with my throat and I was taken to
25 the hospital. I remember being driven there. No one

1 explained to me what was going on and I was put under
2 general anaesthetic. I had this gas mask put on my face
3 and no one was explaining anything, so I was struggling
4 before I fell asleep and that was very distressing.
5 I wasn't pre-warned or told anything about what was
6 going to happen. That was to have my tonsils removed.

7 'I remember going home after that and telling my mum
8 what had happened. She was beside herself because she
9 hadn't been consulted at any time about what was going
10 to take place. I was in hospital for about a week and
11 my mum hadn't been consulted and didn't know I had been
12 in hospital. I didn't have any visitors at all but I do
13 remember the nurses coming round and speaking to me.
14 I didn't know what they were saying to me.

15 'I think a few of my brothers and sisters had their
16 tonsils removed and my mother was always consulted about
17 that. But in my instance, that wasn't the case.

18 'I remember going to chapel at 6.30 in the morning
19 every single day. I never understood why we did that.
20 I don't know what was being said by any of the priests
21 as they spoke English. There was no interpreter at all.
22 All the other kids were the same as me. We would look
23 at each other and none of us had a clue what was being
24 said.

25 'Kids were always falling asleep in the chapel.

1 I did that as did many others. Sister KUA would
2 sit behind us and if you fell asleep she would punch you
3 and tell you to wake up. It was awful. The nuns would
4 push us to the floor, get us to kneel on the floor and
5 we didn't have a clue what was being said in the Mass.
6 I remember getting up and my knees were red raw. It was
7 that kind of cruelty.

8 'I remember telling my mum that I didn't want to go
9 to the chapel at home because I was getting next to no
10 benefit because I couldn't hear what was being said.
11 She understood that as when it came to going to chapel
12 on a Sunday at home there was nobody that could sign for
13 me separately at Mass so she said I didn't need to go.

14 'When we were back at St Vincent's the nuns would
15 ask who all went to Mass on Sunday and the kids would
16 all say they had gone and I had to say I didn't go. The
17 Sisters would then call me a bad child for not going to
18 Mass.

19 'I had my holy communion at St Vincent's when I was
20 about 11. My parents weren't there and I can remember
21 thinking where's my mum? My mum should be here. We got
22 books afterwards which I took home to my mum and she
23 told me no one at the school had told her about me
24 making my holy communion and having my confirmation. My
25 parents should have been there for that. That should

1 have been a family celebration. I remember my sister
2 and my brother both having parties after their holy
3 communions and all the family were there. Photos were
4 taken at our holy communion at St Vincent's but it was
5 just all the children. There were no other parents
6 informed about it so there were no parents there at all.
7 I look at that photo now and there is no one still
8 living other than me.

9 'The priest at St Vincent's was Father Gavigan. He
10 was in his 50s and had grey hair and I'm not sure if
11 he's still alive. At confession we would write out our
12 sins, hand them over to Father Gavigan through
13 an opening in the confession and he would tell us what
14 our penance was in broken sign language.

15 'I remember one occasion when we were lined up for
16 confession and a boy, who was about 11, was giving his
17 confession. Father Gavigan suddenly jumped out the
18 confession box and shouted out what this boy had written
19 down was wrong. It was the speed and ferocity that
20 Father Gavigan leapt out that made us all turn and
21 notice him. I remember another teacher was there as
22 well.

23 'The boy told us later he had written on his bit of
24 paper that the nuns were hitting us at St Vincent's and
25 that's why Father Gavigan reacted the way he had.

1 'We didn't get anything from the school at Christmas
2 or for birthdays. I got things from my family but never
3 from the school.

4 'What they did do is remove the wall that segregated
5 the boys and girls for a day. They took it down and we
6 could see the girls and talk to them and then the
7 following day the wall went back up.

8 'The school did have a Christmas tree, but there was
9 no celebrations in the school. I would go home for
10 Christmas for a period of about three weeks.

11 'We had no personal possessions or pocket money and
12 we never got any kind of treats. I never had chocolate,
13 cakes or sweets, nothing like that. It was bread,
14 butter and jam and that was it.

15 'There was no potty training at St Vincent's. We
16 were just given nappies when I first went there.
17 I think I was about 3 when we were given potties. We
18 were probably toilet trained from about that age.

19 'Sister PCA would check the bedsheets in the
20 morning to make sure no one had toileted their bed.
21 I remember one morning I saw one of the
22 deaf-blind children being assaulted, being hit with
23 something because they had wet their bed. That happened
24 to me because I wet the bed up to about the age of 5.
25 I saw it happen to other deaf children as well.

1 'It was usually Sister PCA and she would then
2 take the bedsheets off other children's beds, including
3 mine, to see if anyone had soiled the bed or not. If
4 they had, she would hit them. I didn't understand what
5 was going on. That was happening to
6 deaf-blind children. The bedsheet and pillowcase would
7 be changed over the weekend but sometimes the blanket
8 wasn't replaced. We would have to wear the same pyjamas
9 Monday to Friday without being washed, but sometimes
10 they wouldn't be washed over the weekend and would just
11 be sitting in a pile on the Monday.

12 'There was big industrial-sized washing machines
13 with the Sisters' clothing piled up beside them. You
14 would rarely see any children's clothes piled up at all.
15 The sheet that went over the alter would be washed daily
16 and ironed and cleaned, yet none of our clothing was
17 washed that way. The only thing that was ever ironed
18 that belonged to us was our school shirts.

19 'I remember telling Sister PCA to stop hitting
20 children for wetting the bed and to leave the kids alone
21 because they were deaf and blind and that it wasn't
22 fair. In response she hit me with a hard wooden brush
23 on my hands. My hands were bruised from that. I told
24 my mum about it and she spoke to the school but they
25 refused to believe it. I also remember that for

1 children that were constipated and couldn't poo there
2 was a pump thing that the sisters would insert into your
3 anus to help induce a bowel movement. That happened to
4 me and I went home and told my mum.

5 'My mum never actually came into the school to see
6 me. There was a hall area and that was as much as she
7 would ever see in or around the school. She would pick
8 me up on a Friday and drop me back at the school on
9 a Sunday night. As I was older from about the age of 10
10 or 11, I did that on my own. I knew the buses to take
11 and it was a straightforward journey.

12 'I never ran away from the school. We were
13 essentially locked inside the school gates. As far as
14 I remember, the gates were always locked when I was
15 there and we were all stuck there and couldn't get
16 access out of the walls around the school. There were
17 gates but there was one person, Mr Connor, who stood at
18 the gates and he would chase you if you got too near
19 them. It felt like you were in prison.

20 'I do remember one occasion when a child ran away.
21 I forgot who it was. The police found that boy and
22 brought him back to the school. He told his mum and dad
23 about what was happening at the school and I remember
24 seeing his mum and dad arguing with someone from the
25 school. His parents took him away from the school and

1 I never saw that boy again after that.

2 'There was a shop round the corner and my mum used
3 to give me pennies so I could go and buy something, but
4 we were locked in and couldn't go to the shop to buy
5 anything. We used to get a deaf boy's brother to go and
6 get sweets from the shop for us. That's what it was
7 like for us for about 15 years.

8 'There were never any inspections that I'm aware of.
9 I do remember being asked by deaf adults how I was
10 getting on at school. I couldn't tell you who they
11 were. I think that could have been after I left the
12 school.

13 'We were all good friends at St Vincent's. Once
14 Willie Malley left the school, we all grew up together
15 and there was a sense of cohesion in the group. There
16 was never any incidents of anyone being bullied or
17 abused. The experience after he left was definitely
18 more positive.

19 'We did have food withheld from us. We were
20 sometimes punished by not getting access to our dinner.
21 Sister KXD would also discipline children by using
22 this long, leather rubber strap thing. It wasn't quite
23 a belt, but it was like one. She would use that but
24 kids would take their hands away just as the Sister was
25 swinging it. I used to do that as well.

1 'Sister KYA was very cruel to me as a young kid.
2 When I first went to St Vincent's she used to gag me
3 until I got to sleep at night when I was crying all the
4 time.

5 'There were also occasions where I soiled my nappy
6 and the staff just left me. They didn't clean me.
7 Sometimes staff would even consciously put a hand over
8 my mouth and tell me to stop crying. I've spoken about
9 some abuse and some punishment the Sisters administered.
10 When children were found wearing dirty underwear, it was
11 usually Sister PCA that dealt with them. She would
12 hit children with a wooden ruler or a long, hard wooden
13 comb. She treated all the children the same. She would
14 get them to hold their hands palm down and hit the back
15 of their hands. We had bruises on our hands. There was
16 redness as well. It was very painful.

17 'Sister PCA also used her hairbrush. I remember
18 seeing her grey hairs in the brush when she hit my hands
19 with it.

20 'I remember being hit on the back of my hand by
21 Sister PCA and the palm of my hand by
22 Sister KXD and being upset about it and crying
23 because it was very painful. I remember asking my
24 teacher why I was being hit by Sister PCA and she
25 would ask what I had done. I would tell her it was

1 because I wet the bed and she wouldn't do anything.

2 'I remember an occasion when my mum was visiting me
3 and took me out. I had a nappy on and one of the pins
4 that had been used to keep the nappy on me had pierced
5 my skin. I was constantly crying because of that and my
6 mum picked me up to see what was wrong. She put her
7 hands on my abdomen to see what was happening and there
8 was blood all over the place.

9 'My mum erupted at that. She took me home, spoke to
10 my dad and I think I stayed at home for a week after
11 that. Sister **KYA** apologised to my parents. What
12 happened was one of the pins had penetrated the skin and
13 caused a lot of bleeding. I believe my mum and dad
14 spoke to St Vincent's about alternative schools but
15 there were no alternative schools so I was taken back.

16 'When we were awoken at 6 o'clock in the morning, if
17 kids didn't get out their beds, they would get hit with
18 the handle of the brush that was used for cleaning the
19 floor. That was in order to get the children up and it
20 was Sister **KUA** who was particularly nasty that did
21 that. Sister **KUA** would hit us with a stick if we
22 didn't get out of bed quick enough.

23 'I learnt to automatically get up when Sisters
24 walked into the room and turned the lights on. That
25 was the cue to get up. If you didn't get up then you

1 would be hit with a broomstick while you were in bed.
2 I was never hit with the broom. I was always up in
3 time. My bed was near the light, but I felt really bad
4 for those kids.

5 'I was sexually abused on three occasions by
6 Willie Malley, twice at St Vincent's and then once again
7 after I had left the school. Willie Malley was a deaf
8 pupil at St Vincent's. He was older than me and was in
9 the older kids' dorm. I was in the younger kids' dorm
10 at the time he abused me. The first time, I was 9 and
11 he was 14 and the second time, I was 10 and he was 15.'

12 Pausing there, my Lady, it might be helpful to have
13 a look at the court proceedings in respect of
14 Willie Malley.

15 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

16 MS MCMILLAN: The reference is JUS-000000332. I think we
17 might have touched upon this in this morning's evidence,
18 but looking at page 2 of that, the convictions relate to
19 charges 2 and 3 and this was an examination of facts and
20 the facts were found to be established in respect of the
21 charges on the indictment.

22 LADY SMITH: Because by this time, William Malley was -- in
23 2023, he was in his early 70s; is that right?

24 MS MCMILLAN: Yes.

25 LADY SMITH: Actually probably a little bit older than that.

1 The complainer was early 70s in 2023 and
2 William Malley's a few years older than him, six years
3 older than him, so he'd be late 70s.

4 MS MCMILLAN: I think the date of birth might be at the
5 top --

6 LADY SMITH: Can we just go back to the top, it should have
7 his date of birth. Yes, he's a 1944 date of birth.
8 That's right.

9 MS MCMILLAN: And turning to the first page of that
10 document, your Ladyship will be able to see the outcome
11 of that.

12 LADY SMITH: Yes.

13 MS MCMILLAN: Turning then back to 'Gordon's' statement,
14 carrying on from paragraph 104, it's where 'Gordon'
15 begins to talk about the abuse. He says:

16 'The first time was about 7 or 8 o'clock at night
17 and the Sisters were all away to the chapel. I remember
18 I was in the toilets when it happened. The lights went
19 out and Willie Malley grabbed me. I believed I was
20 targeted by him. I was screaming during it, but there
21 was no one around to hear me.

22 'After it happened, I saw Sister KUA. I was
23 in a dishevelled state and I was dirty and she could see
24 something was wrong. She said I was smelly. I told her
25 that Willie Malley had just sexually assaulted me and

1 was responsible for the state I was in. I had his sperm
2 on me. She called me a dirty boy and started hitting
3 me. She thought I had been playing with myself.
4 I couldn't understand why she was hitting me, because
5 I was the one who had been assaulted. No one ever did
6 anything about that. It was just swept under the rug.
7 'The second time there was no one around again and
8 I had gone to the toilet. I was standing doing a pee
9 and Willie Malley came in and grabbed me. I was
10 screaming at the top of my voice but he knew the time
11 and that the Sisters would be in church and no one would
12 be around. He did the same to me on the second
13 occasion.
14 'After that second time, I saw a girl called
15 Margaret Walker who was a cleaner and used to look after
16 me. I told her Willie Malley had attacked me again and
17 she went and spoke to one of the Sisters. I was told
18 I was a bad boy and I was lying and nothing was done
19 about it on that occasion either. I think all the staff
20 were scared of Willie Malley because of an incident
21 where he had wrestled Sister KUA . I couldn't
22 understand why I was the one who was being singled out.
23 I didn't know if any other boys were being sexually
24 abused by Willie Malley.
25 'I would actively hide from Willie Malley at school.

1 Nothing ever happened to him for what he did and he left
2 St Vincent's when he was 15-and-a-half.

3 'The third time Willie Malley abused me was when
4 I was 16 and I was back home. It wasn't long after
5 I had left St Vincent's. There was a knock at our door
6 and he was there and I couldn't believe it was
7 Willie Malley. What really shocked me was that someone
8 had given him my address. He asked me to go for a pint
9 and I said no, but my mum was telling me to just go. My
10 mum thought he was a deaf friend from school. I was in
11 a situation where I felt like I had to go, so I did and
12 that was the third time he abused me.

13 'Willie took me away in his small, white van and fed
14 me cans of Harp lager. He drove me to the moors, tried
15 to take my clothes off and tried to put his hands on me
16 again and he sexually assaulted me. He then dropped me
17 back at the house afterwards.

18 'When I got home my mum told me I was looking
19 dishevelled and smelly and I told her then who
20 Willie Malley was and that he was the man who had abused
21 me previously at St Vincent's and that he had just
22 abused me again. My mum erupted and got really upset.
23 Willie Malley had driven off and I never saw him again.
24 That was reported to the police. A police officer came
25 to the house and took all the details. I never heard

1 anything more about that.

2 'There was another deaf boy at St Vincent's who
3 attacked Willie Malley. He was the same age as
4 Willie Malley and he approached me once and asked me
5 what had happened with Willie Malley. He took matters
6 into his own hands and spoke to Willie Malley. I was
7 about 9 or 10 when that happened. Sadly he has since
8 passed but I remember him fondly as he helped me and was
9 a good guy.

10 'One of my teachers, Sister KXD, used to
11 punish me for getting my exercises wrong. She was
12 trying to explain what the word "against" meant and I
13 wasn't understanding her. She then pulled my head back
14 and battered it against the wall and against the table
15 as an example of what it meant. She would give the same
16 treatment to other children who got their work wrong as
17 well. All the children were terrified of her.

18 'Sister KXD also used to use a ruler to hit
19 the children. The physical abuse always used to shock
20 me because these were supposed to be Christians,
21 compassionate people. This was a Sister and I just
22 couldn't understand it. I just used to get so upset.
23 We just lived with fear and intimidation all the time at
24 St Vincent's. The Sisters would actually use their
25 fists on the children.

1 'I told my mum about Sister KUA being cruel
2 and assaulting me and my mum then approached the school.
3 After that, Sister KUA came to tell me and told me
4 what my mum had said and she then assaulted me again for
5 reporting her. She punched me and assaulted me and when
6 I got home on the Friday, I told my mum again. My mum
7 then contacted the police and reported it but nothing
8 ever happened.

9 'I remember being out the back of the playground
10 where there was an area I would go to do the toilet.
11 One the Sisters was standing there, watching me as I did
12 the toilet. She was in the loft at a window, which was
13 the Sisters' sleeping area and gave her a higher vantage
14 point. They sometimes watched the kids from up there to
15 try and catch the kids smoking. She stood and watched
16 me peeing and I wondered why she was doing that.
17 I ended up going somewhere else for privacy.

18 KSH-LXM were both teachers at
19 St Vincent's. She was a generic teacher and he was
20 a woodwork techy teacher and they were both awful and
21 very cruel. They both used to hit all the children. If
22 we signed to a peer within the classroom, just lifted
23 our hands to start to sign, she would hit us with this
24 foot-long ruler. She would tell us not to sign and call
25 it a no-signing classroom. The other teachers wouldn't

1 bother, but she used to always chastise us in the
2 classroom for using sign language to one another. The
3 thing is we would only be asking each other how to do
4 things.

5 'We used to do homework classes with KSH-LXM's
6 every Tuesday evening and he had this tube which was
7 like the leg of the table he used to hit -- he used to
8 hit the children. He would hit us in the back with the
9 tube and it was sore, it was painful. We were all
10 terrified of him.

11 'I remember once when I was 14, there were four of
12 us in the class and we all refused to take part in
13 an activity. We had tolerated enough of his bullying
14 and collectively decided to take action. Mr KSH went
15 to hit us but the four of us turned the tables on him
16 and attacked him instead. Then we all ran off and hid
17 so we couldn't be found. I am the last one of those
18 four. The other three have all since passed.

19 'Later on, Sister KUA approached me and told
20 me what she had heard we had done. I told her that it
21 was correct and that we had hit Mr KSH back. I told
22 her I was just doing it to him, what all the Sisters did
23 to us. I remember I walked into my dorm after that and
24 all the other deaf kids were applauding me for what we'd
25 done. It was a really good spirit and a good vibe from

1 that.

2 'I was then told I was to be seen the next morning
3 at 9 o'clock and I wasn't getting any food that night.
4 That was me and the other three boys. I refused to go
5 to the chapel as well.

6 'When the four of us went down the next morning we
7 were met by Sister KTA who was with these two big
8 men. The men were teachers, Mr KXX and Mr Connor,
9 who was the housekeeper at St Vincent's. They will have
10 passed now. Sister KTA told us we were going to get
11 whipped and I said that was fine, but let's also get the
12 police to tell them about it. I also threatened to get
13 my mum and I think they all backed down as the two men
14 left and there was no whipping. I did tell
15 Sister KTA how Mr KSH had been bullying us and at
16 that point she stopped everything and nothing happened.
17 That tells you all you need to know about that
18 situation.

19 'By the time I was 3, I was telling my mum about the
20 way we were being treated at St Vincent's. I would go
21 home at weekends and she was picking me up and telling
22 me I was stinking and smelly. She was asking why we
23 weren't getting washed and wearing clean clothes. That
24 carried on from the ages of 2, 3, 4 and 5.

25 'When I was about 5 or 6, I told our teacher

1 Miss Russell that the Sisters were hitting the children
2 because they were wetting their beds. She just shrugged
3 her shoulders. I think she felt there wasn't anything
4 she could do about it, that she was powerless to do
5 anything.

6 'I went on to tell my mum that they were very cruel
7 at St Vincent's and they were hitting me, they were
8 hitting children that wet the bed and they were locking
9 the toilet door at night. I told her Sister KXD ,
10 this holy person, was hitting us. I told her I wanted
11 to leave the school and I didn't want to go back.

12 'My mum then spoke to Sister KTA and challenged
13 her about the treatment of children. They had a big
14 set-to but I don't know what was said. I know
15 Sister KTA told my mum that type of thing didn't
16 happen and that it wasn't true. Sister KTA denied
17 I had ever been hit and said I'd been a bad boy.

18 'My mum did say she was going to come back to the
19 school and check to make sure everything was okay. It
20 was after that I was assaulted by Sister KUA and
21 my mum ended up reporting that to the police. I would
22 have been about 11 or 12 then. The police did approach
23 the school and Sister KTA told them nothing had
24 happened and that was it, nothing else happened. I was
25 never spoken to by the police.

1 'I told Sister KUA and Margaret Walker about
2 Willie Malley sexually abusing me and nothing was done.
3 As time went on, I also told my teacher about what had
4 happened and she spoke to the Sisters but once again
5 nothing happened. I'm not sure which teacher that was
6 but I think it could have been Miss Carsey, who will
7 have passed away by now. She was elderly but was really
8 nice. She did approach the Sisters about it but nothing
9 ever happened about it afterwards.

10 'I also told Sister KXD who was my teacher as
11 well but she just said it was me.

12 'I told my mother about Willie Malley sexually
13 abusing me as well. I remember she approached
14 Sister KTA and spoke to her about that. The whole
15 thing was disputed and I remember my mum asking her who
16 Willie Malley was. Sister KTA said they would speak
17 to him. We never heard anything subsequent to that.

18 'I also told my mum about the incident with
19 Mr KSH. She told me I had done well, because we knew
20 that the Sisters were doing -- she told me I had done
21 well because we knew what the Sisters were doing was
22 wrong. From that time on, Mr and Mrs KSH-LXM
23 Sister KUA and all the other Sisters and teachers
24 seemed to take a step back from me.

25 'The way they all behaved towards me changed. They

1 were all such hypocrites. I think Sister KTA must
2 have told them to leave me alone because I had stood up
3 for myself. The way they were treating
4 deaf-blind children was just awful. I used to say to
5 other deaf kids that they needed to go home and report
6 what was happening to their mums but they were just too
7 scared to do that. I told my mum everything that was
8 going on.

9 'When I was 15-and-a-half my mum told me that she
10 thought it was about time I left the school so that's
11 when I left St Vincent's.

12 'My younger brother, who [REDACTED] deaf too, he attended
13 St Vincent's after I had been there. I remember telling
14 him to watch himself when he was there. Every day I saw
15 him when he came back from school I would ask him how he
16 was getting on. He always came back and told me it was
17 great, that he loved it and the school was great. He
18 told me the boys and girls all mixed and they had
19 a great time. His experiences absolutely perplexed me
20 but by then the Sisters had left and were replaced by
21 teachers and the whole school had moved on. The old
22 school had also been brought down and a new building and
23 chapel had been built on the grounds of the old school.
24 Everything was on the ground floor and all the
25 facilities were better. My experience was very

1 different to that of my brother and I was very happy for
2 him.'

3 'Gordon' then goes on to talk about his life after
4 care. He tells us that his family were poor and as soon
5 as he left St Vincent's, he got a job picking fruit and
6 would help to pay the bills.

7 He then went on to get another job manufacturing
8 cardboard boxes as they were an employer of deaf people.
9 He went on to work in shipbuilding, but when the company
10 he worked for was taken over by another company, he was
11 told at age 32 that he was too old to work. He tells us
12 that he hasn't worked since because it was also
13 a barrier to his employment.

14 He applied for many jobs but a lot of places he
15 applied to wouldn't give him a job because of his
16 deafness.

17 'Gordon' goes on to tell us that he got married at
18 21 and had two sons and a daughter. He also has
19 a daughter from his second marriage when he married
20 again at 46.

21 'Gordon' then discusses the impact of his time in
22 care from paragraph 142. He tells us that he was
23 contacted by another former pupil of St Vincent's
24 recently who asked him about the abuse by Willie Malley.
25 He says:

1 'Willie Malley had his hands on me at the ages of 9
2 and 10, then again at the age of 16. It still bothers
3 me how he managed to find out my mum and dad's address,
4 who gave him that address? That's something that lives
5 with me now, 60 years on. I had managed to bury it at
6 the back of my mind and then one day last year, a former
7 pupil contacted me and asked me if I had been abused by
8 Willie Malley from years ago.'

9 As a result of speaking to this former pupil and
10 then the police, 'Gordon' tells us now that he's been
11 having flashbacks and he's been to see his GP. He tells
12 us that his relationships have been affected and he
13 would often be grumpy and quite quick-tempered.

14 At paragraph 147 he says:

15 'I definitely experienced anxiety when I was at
16 school. I never felt free. There was never any sense
17 of freedom. I kind of felt like I was constantly in
18 a prison as we were behind these 15-feet high walls. We
19 were all stuck behind these gates and couldn't see
20 beyond them, so I felt hemmed in and that experience was
21 anxiety-provoking. I always described it as being at
22 a prison to my mum. I always asked her to go to another
23 school but I couldn't because there were just no other
24 deaf schools for me to go to. That saddened me and
25 I just had to grin and bear that period of fear at

1 St Vincent's School.

2 'I don't think the education or teaching at
3 St Vincent's was up to much at all. I would describe
4 myself as stupid from the education I had there.
5 I don't think the teachers, particularly the Sisters
6 that taught, were even qualified. I couldn't imagine
7 Sister KXD having any qualifications. She was
8 just so cruel to the children so that would surprise me.
9 I would be sceptical about that being the case.

10 'Being in St Vincent's and being treated the way
11 myself and the other deaf children were by Sisters, who
12 were meant to be these holy people, has definitely
13 affected my attitude towards religion. It's the same
14 with priests. They were cruel to us as well.'

15 'Gordon' then goes on to tell us his sisters are
16 both aware of what was going on at St Vincent's after he
17 reported the abuse. He says that his sisters would
18 remember the priest coming round with gifts like a bike
19 and money for him and 'Gordon' says that felt like
20 a bribe.

21 'Gordon' goes on to tell us that he now has a deaf
22 grandson and his daughter is paranoid about her son
23 having the same experience 'Gordon' did. He's tried to
24 reassure her that things are not like they once were.

25 From paragraph 161 he tells us about his hopes for

1 the Inquiry. He says:

2 'There was so much cruelty at St Vincent's and none
3 of us children could understand that. These Sisters
4 were supposed to be holy and caring but they were so
5 cruel. I don't think that's particular to St Vincent's
6 Deaf School though, I think it's quite common with other
7 institutions that are run by the Catholic Church as
8 well. I would say that for me the schooling at
9 St Vincent's was a period of suffering. I would say
10 that applied to all deaf children of my generation. We
11 all suffered and we were all terrified, which is why
12 I feel I need to speak out. I don't want those
13 individuals to get off with what they did scot-free.
14 That said, I think Sister KUA might be the only
15 one who's still alive. The priest, Father Gavigan,
16 might also be alive.

17 'I would like to see charges brought against the
18 people who are responsible and improvements to the
19 system. I would also like to see Willie Malley served
20 justice. I still have all these childhood memories of
21 the treatment from the Sisters and Willie Malley at
22 St Vincent's School.'

23 LADY SMITH: Of course this statement was signed in 2022.

24 The conviction -- or not the conviction, the examination
25 of facts and finding, that on a balance of probabilities

1 the offences have been committed, was 2023.

2 MS MCMILLAN: Yes, my Lady, that is correct, so this

3 statement was given prior to the examination of facts:

4 'I would like to see ...'

5 So he then goes on:

6 'They need to stop the cruelty, the beatings, being
7 forced to eat food, the punishments dished out by people
8 who were meant to be looking after us and the sexual
9 abuse. I was challenging the Sisters and telling them
10 they are treating us cruelly then telling my mum about
11 Sisters and why I didn't want to go to school. But the
12 Sisters then beat me because my mum had challenged them
13 after what I told my mum. Things like that have to
14 stop. I never understood why I was being beaten, why
15 were other kids being beaten? That continued daily and
16 that still lives with me today.

17 'There was no communication support at all. The
18 deaf children never knew what was being said. We never
19 knew what to do or how to behave. We basically never
20 had a clue what was going on.'

21 And 'Gordon' says that he has no objection to his
22 witness statement being published as part of the
23 evidence to the Inquiry and he believes the facts stated
24 in his statement are true.

25 And it is signed, as your Ladyship pointed out, it

1 was in June 2022.

2 In addition to that, my Lady, at reference
3 WIT-1-000001638, your Ladyship will note that this was
4 a declaration that accompanies 'Gordon's' statement
5 indicating that the statement was provided to the
6 Inquiry with the assistance of a British Sign Language
7 interpreter, who interpreted his statement for him on
8 14 June, when it was signed.

9 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much. Thank you.

10 I think we should break there for the afternoon
11 break and then on to more read-ins after that, yes?
12 Thank you.

13 (2.56 pm)

14 (A short break)

15 (3.08 pm)

16 LADY SMITH: Ms Innes, what's next?

17 'Anthony' (read)

18 MS INNES: The next statement is from an applicant who is
19 anonymous and will be known as 'Anthony'. The reference
20 for 'Anthony's' statement is WIT-1-000001560.

21 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

22 MS INNES: 'Anthony' was born in 1960. In his statement, he
23 says that he went to St Vincent's School when he was
24 3 years old in 1963 and left, when he was 12, in 1972.

25 'Anthony' lived with his mother and father and five

1 siblings before going into care.

2 Beginning at paragraph 3, he says:

3 'I don't have many memories of family life before
4 I went to St Vincent's at the age of 3. I wasn't born
5 deaf. Initially my mum was told I was fine but after
6 a year to a year-and-a-half the diagnosis confirmed that
7 I was deaf.

8 'At the time my mum and dad were deciding which
9 school would be best for me, my mum happened to meet
10 a nun from St Vincent's who told her about the school.
11 My mum and dad took me for a visit. I don't remember
12 it, but I know they took me. There was a primary school
13 very close to our family home and it would have been
14 easy to go there, but my parents thought that
15 St Vincent's would be the best education for me.
16 I attended St Vincent's School between 1963 and 1972
17 from the age of 3 to 12.

18 'St Vincent's school was a Roman Catholic
19 co-educational residential school for the deaf, blind
20 and deaf-blind in Glasgow. It was an old, brown
21 sandstone building, linked to a more modern part of the
22 school built in the late 1960s, early 1970s. It was run
23 by the Daughters of Charity, but we just called them the
24 nuns.

25 'The school was for children from the age of 3 up to

1 16 or 17. There were also non-residential day pupils
2 who attended. I would say there was a 50/50 split
3 between residential and non-residential pupils.
4 I couldn't say exactly how many children were in the
5 school, but I wouldn't be surprised if it were 150 to
6 200.

7 'One concern I have in speaking to the Inquiry is
8 that I don't have many memories on my time at
9 St Vincent's at all. I remember a couple of specific
10 events but not much before or after them. I have also
11 been told various things by other former pupils. I have
12 a few photographs of me while I was at school. Other
13 people may use photographs and things like that to help
14 their memories come back to them. I don't find that
15 happens for me. I just don't retain the information.

16 'My earliest memory of St Vincent's is of a special
17 celebration day for St Mary. I think that it happened
18 in May each year. We wore special outfits and someone
19 carried a crown which was placed on the head of the
20 St Mary statue. I have a photograph of me in my special
21 outfit. That's why I remember it. I was carrying the
22 crown and wearing a silvery blue suit.

23 'I attended St Vincent's on a residential basis from
24 Monday to Friday each week. I went home at the weekend
25 and during the holidays.

1 'The staff at St Vincent's were a mixture of nuns
2 and teachers. I would say that there were around ten
3 staff on the residential side and maybe two-thirds were
4 residential staff and one-third were nuns, I think.
5 I couldn't tell you the names of many of the staff and
6 the nuns changed their names from time to time. I don't
7 know if that was a traditional thing within the Order.

8 'The only names I know of from my time at the school
9 are Sister KTA and Sister LXH. I understand that
10 Sister LXH changed her name while I was there but
11 I don't though what she changed it to. Sister KTA
12 was SNR and it was Sister LXH.
13 I don't remember that, but I got that information from
14 speaking to friends after I left.

15 'I couldn't tell you what Sister KTA and
16 Sister LXH were like, but I do remember people
17 telling me stories about them. From what I've heard,
18 Sister KTA was a good nun.

19 'The nuns always wore their formal habits. They had
20 massive hats which went up at the sides. Their hats
21 then changed to ones which were more straight across
22 their temples and down the sides of their head. Our
23 signs for the nuns mimicked the shape of their hats.
24 I don't know where the nuns lived. I always assumed
25 they lived in the school somewhere and as far as I know

1 it was only the nuns, not the lay people, who lived at
2 the school.

3 'Residential pupils slept in dormitories. There
4 were no individual bedrooms. The dormitories would have
5 around six to eight beds in each. When you walked down
6 the corridor, there was a half wall with a half window
7 on top. There were six to eight beds on one side and
8 six to eight beds on the other. I can't remember if
9 I always slept in the same dormitory or if it changed
10 over the years.

11 'There were separate residential areas for girls and
12 boys. I think we were all in the same building just
13 different areas, possibly different floors.

14 'I don't know if I had my own clothes from home at
15 St Vincent's or if clothes were provided on site. I do
16 have a photograph of me in a green jacket, shirt and
17 tie, so presumably there was a uniform.

18 'We showered at St Vincent's every Sunday evening.
19 I think it was just once a week. I remember there being
20 a shower cubicle with curtains. Sometimes we had
21 privacy, but sometimes the nuns would just pull the
22 curtains open, presumably to check we were washing
23 properly.

24 'We would all go to the dining room to eat.
25 I remember the dining room being split with a wooden

1 partition to separate the boys and girls. The deaf
2 children mixed with the blind children during mealtimes,
3 boys with boys and girls with girls.

4 'I have a feeling that we had to line up to be
5 served and we would take our food back to our tables on
6 a tray. Some of the blind kids were partially sighted.
7 Others were assisted by staff. I've heard stories that
8 some of the deaf kids would mock the blind kids. They
9 would put their unwanted food on the blind kids' plates.
10 I don't remember that happening but I've been told it
11 did.

12 'I have no memory of what the food was like or of
13 kids ever being force-fed. At home, my family were
14 decidedly working class so you ate what you were given.
15 I think it was like for most of us at St Vincent's.

16 'I don't recall what we did during leisure time.
17 I assume there was a TV and I know from visiting the
18 school after I left there was a big playground outside
19 and two red ash football pitches.

20 'I don't remember much about the standard of
21 education at St Vincent's. Other former pupils
22 I've spoken to have said that there were some good
23 teachers and some bad. Some they praise, others they
24 don't. I don't think children who went to St Vincent's
25 achieved much in the way of exam success.

1 'My mother told me that I didn't sign at all before
2 going to St Vincent's. She said I tried to speak.
3 There was a machine you could use to learn how to speak.
4 There were other deaf kids I knew and we all shared this
5 machine. I also used to wear body-worn hearing aids.

6 'We were never really taught sign language at
7 St Vincent's. You just kind of picked it up from other
8 kids. I'm not sure the teachers knew or used much sign
9 language and there was no specific signing teacher.
10 A lot of the teachers for the deaf were not good signers
11 and were not qualified to sign. There were five schools
12 for the deaf back then, all of which would have had
13 their own variation of sign language. All five schools
14 have now closed.

15 'I'm not sure how healthcare was dealt with overall
16 and I don't remember anything about dentistry. There
17 was an audiologist who came to the school from time to
18 time to check and irrigate our ears.

19 'My mum and dad were Catholic and I believe all the
20 children who went to St Vincent's were Catholic. We
21 used to go to Mass at school. From what I've been told,
22 there was an emphasis on religion, as you would expect,
23 but it became less and less over time.

24 'I think most kids at St Vincent's were frightened
25 of the nuns and teachers. I was a good boy. I tried to

1 stay out of mischief and I did as I was asked, so I was
2 never in trouble. That wasn't the case for everyone.
3 I did witness nuns and teachers use physical punishment.
4 'Mr KXZ was someone I had seen at St Vincent's.
5 I don't know if he was a housefather, a volunteer or
6 a non-religious worker. He used to come into the school
7 in the evenings. He married a woman who was
8 a residential worker at St Vincent's. She worked under
9 a lady called Margaret Walker. Margaret was
10 a housemother.
11 'When I was around 11, we went on a trip to
12 Rowardennan Youth Hostel. I don't know if we were away
13 for the week or just a weekend. We slept in
14 an open-plan dormitory with bunk beds. I was in a top
15 bunk.
16 'During the night, I felt someone putting their hand
17 under my cover and touching me down there. It was dark,
18 but straightaway, I saw it was a man with a beard and
19 I recognised him as Mr KXZ. I can vocalise when
20 I want to, so I screamed loudly and pushed him away.
21 After that, I remember tucking my sheets around me very
22 tightly and I didn't sleep the rest of the night because
23 I was so scared. The next morning, Mr KXZ came to me
24 and I remember him telling me that I must have had a bad
25 dream. At the time, I was a bit confused at him telling

1 me I had had a bad dream, but it wasn't a dream.
2 I don't know if anything more happened during that night
3 before or after I woke up. It is possible I blanked
4 certain things from my memory.

5 'Ever since then I always tuck my sheets in under my
6 body-weight around my bottom and my legs because of what
7 happened. As soon as someone touches me, when
8 I'm asleep, I'm immediately awake and instantly alert.
9 I didn't hear or see of Mr KXZ doing anything to any
10 other child but I didn't discuss what had happened to me
11 with anyone.

12 'Mr KXX was a teacher at St Vincent's.
13 I remember he always used to wear a jacket when I was in
14 his class. He targeted a boy in the class. I was
15 around 11 at the time. So [this boy] would have been
16 around 13 or 14. I witnessed Mr KXX remove a belt
17 from his jacket. He told him to place his hands on
18 a table. Mr KXX drew the belt back over his
19 shoulder and hit him on the hands with it. I don't know
20 if it was a belt for corporal punishment or if it was
21 a trouser belt and I can't remember how many times the
22 boy was hit. I also can't recall what led up to it, if
23 he had done something or not.

24 'I only witnessed Mr KXX behave in that way
25 once, but I've heard from other former pupils that it

1 happened more than once and not just to that boy. Some
2 children from St Vincent's ended up with mental health
3 problems later in life.

4 'I used to work with a company who supported deaf
5 adults with mental health conditions. The boy
6 I've mentioned was one of the service users at the unit
7 I worked in. I remember a period when his health
8 deteriorated and he was transferred to a hospital.
9 I visited him at the hospital. He was very ill and it
10 was very sad. There was a newly qualified BSL (British
11 Sign Language) interpreter there when I visited.
12 I should point out that there are different variations
13 of BSL. For example, there were signs specific to those
14 who went to St Vincent's. There were also
15 Roman Catholic signs and Protestant signs. The
16 interpreter present was not familiar with the
17 St Vincent's signing tradition.

18 'During my visit, others who were present were
19 asking him questions. They kept talking to him about
20 keep-fit. People are given sign names which usually
21 relate to an aspect of their appearance or personality.
22 The sign for fitness and the sign that we used at
23 St Vincent's for Mr KXX were the same. So they
24 thought that he was signing fitness, but he was actually
25 signing over and over again about Mr KXX.

1 'I had to point it out and explain that he came from
2 the St Vincent's signing tradition. Unless the
3 interpreter was from the same signing tradition, he
4 wouldn't have known. I find it very sad that for months
5 he had been repeating "KXX [REDACTED], bad" over and over
6 again and it hadn't been picked up on.

7 'I also witnessed another incident involving a nun
8 and a pupil. I don't know the name of the nun involved.

9 'I remember seeing this pupil standing in front of
10 the lockers in the school. One of the nuns asked him to
11 put his hands out in front of him. She then hit him two
12 or three times across the hands with a wooden coat
13 hanger. The nun hitting him was getting angry because
14 he wasn't reacting. She told him to take his trousers,
15 not pants, down and she hit him on the thigh with her
16 hand. He started crying and this seemed to satisfy the
17 nun.

18 'I would have been about 11-and-a-half or 12 when
19 this happened, so he would have been about 13. He was
20 an adolescent boy and he was told to take his trousers
21 down in front of everyone, including girls. The girls
22 and boys both had lockers in that area, just in two
23 different sections.

24 'I have no idea what he had done to warrant this and
25 I can't describe the nun. I think she was part of the

1 residential team, but I can't be sure.

2 'On a Sunday evening when I came back from my
3 parents' house, everyone went for a shower. After the
4 shower, we were all lined up naked. The nuns would slap
5 any boy they deemed to be dirty and demand they got back
6 in the shower. I always remember this because while we
7 were lined up, the nuns would use a steel nit comb on us
8 and drag it through our hair. Once I remember seeing
9 blood coming from the top of the boy's head who was
10 standing next to me. They were very rough. This
11 happened every Sunday night and right up until I stopped
12 going to the school on a residential basis.

13 'There were a lot of boys at St Vincent's who came
14 from very different backgrounds, some poor. I was in
15 a position where I could go home every weekend but not
16 everyone was in the same position. I always tried to be
17 a good boy at school. I was never hit but from what
18 I saw and what I've heard from others, it was not
19 uncommon.

20 'I left St Vincent's in 1972 when I was 12 years
21 old. Shortly before I left, I stopped the residential
22 component of it and started to travel to the school each
23 day. My mum and dad travelled with me until I got used
24 to using the buses. I got two buses to school which
25 took around an hour-and-a-half. There was also a blind

1 girl who went to St Vincent's. Sometimes I got a lift
2 to school with her and her parents.

3 'Soon after I started attending as a day pupil, my
4 mum and dad received some sort of advertisement for
5 another school. I'm sure my mum had a sixth sense, as
6 mothers do, that something wasn't right at St Vincent's.
7 They took me to visit this school and I sat an entrance
8 exam. I was offered a residential place and I believe
9 that there was a funding arrangement made.'

10 'Anthony' then goes on to tell us about life after
11 St Vincent's. He went to another school until he was
12 17. He applied for a job in [REDACTED] when he left,
13 but was rejected because he was deaf.

14 He then went back to St Vincent's, aged 18, to study
15 English and arithmetic before applying to [REDACTED]
16 again. He worked there for ten years before moving into
17 the care sector.

18 He held various roles in the care sector supporting
19 deaf adults, deaf children and those with additional
20 needs.

21 At the time of his statement, he was working in the
22 NHS. He met his wife, who is also deaf, at a deaf club.
23 They have two sons [REDACTED]

24 'Anthony' tells us that he only recently opened up
25 to his family about the abuse he had suffered and notes

1 that they have been a great support.

2 At paragraph 56 of his statement he says that he
3 never told his parents. He felt that his children had
4 a lot on their plate with six children.

5 Moving to page 13 and paragraph 57, he says:

6 'I've kept everything that happened at St Vincent's
7 inside for 53 years. I didn't want to think about it,
8 let alone talk about it. I don't know what changed
9 six months ago when I told my wife. It was after that
10 that I decided to contact the Inquiry. Since then
11 I have been having flashbacks of the sexual abuse by
12 Mr KXZ .'

13 Moving on to page 14 and paragraph 60:

14 'I know you can't change the past, but as one of my
15 sons said to me about the sexual abuse, it happened once
16 and once was too much. It shouldn't have happened at
17 all.

18 'As a [REDACTED], I try to support people
19 who are having a negative mental health experience.
20 I don't know if the same support is offered in
21 residential schools. I think it is important to have
22 peer role models that children can go to for support and
23 advice. I think it is also important for deaf children
24 to have easy access to interpreters, as teachers, even
25 nowadays, are not always good signers.

1 'There should be deaf awareness training for all
2 staff involved with deaf children. Bringing in more
3 deaf adults to work with deaf children would make
4 a difference as I think it's important for deaf children
5 to have deaf adult role models. It would be helpful for
6 deaf children to see deaf adults achieving and to be
7 able to speak to them in their own first language.

8 'My motivation for coming forward is to tie things
9 up for myself. I wanted to open up in a professional
10 setting in the hope that something might be done about
11 it and it doesn't happen again. It's important for
12 people in the deaf community to know what's going on and
13 that there's support there if they ask for it. I hope
14 that there are more deaf people who are prepared to come
15 forward to talk about their experiences.

16 'I have no objection to my witness statement being
17 published as part of the evidence to the Inquiry.
18 I believe the facts stated in this witness statement are
19 true.'

20 And 'Anthony' signed his statement and it's dated
21 3 February 2025.

22 And again for reference, WIT-1-000001639 is
23 a declaration which accompanies 'Anthony's' statement
24 indicating that the statement was provided to the
25 Inquiry with the assistance of a British Sign Language

1 interpreter, who interpreted his statement. He read
2 through his statement before signing it.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

4 MS INNES: So I think we have time for another read-in.

5 LADY SMITH: Let's do that. Whenever you're ready Ms
6 McMillan.

7 MS MCMILLAN: The next read-in will be for another applicant
8 who again wishes to remain anonymous and she is known as
9 'Anne'.

10 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

11 'Anne' (read)

12 MS MCMILLAN: The reference for 'Anne's' statement is
13 WIT-1-000001163.

14 'Anne' was born in 1966. In her statement, she
15 talks about her experience again at St Vincent's and
16 says in her statement that she went to St Vincent's when
17 she was around 3 or 4 years old and left when she was
18 about 10 or 11.

19 In her statement, at paragraphs 2 to 5, she talks
20 about her life before going into care. She says that
21 she lived with her mother and brother. She has some
22 memories of her father and tells us that, at age 16, her
23 mother told her that her father was already married when
24 they met.

25 'Anne' then talks about how she ended up at

1 St Vincent's and her experience there. Starting from
2 paragraph 6 on page 2 she says:

3 'I was born deaf and my mum couldn't use sign
4 language. She would just make letters with her hands to
5 try and explain things to me. I was put into
6 a residential school for deaf and blind kids when I was
7 about 3 or 4 years old and would stay there Mondays to
8 Fridays. I would still come home at weekends.

9 'I remember my mum going through the process of
10 preparing for me to go away for school. I remember her
11 knitting me cardigans to take with me because she was
12 very poor and had no money to buy my clothes. I don't
13 think she would have paid any fees for me to go to the
14 school.

15 'I was 3 or 4 years old when I was put into
16 St Vincent's School.

17 'It was a big, massive building. The doorway at the
18 front was very posh and fancy but to get into the
19 residential part, you had to go through a gate and walk
20 up to the left-hand side of the building and go up some
21 stairs to a door to get in. I remember my mum holding
22 my hand and taking me into the residential school and
23 telling me I was going to stay there and then leaving.

24 'My mum would come and collect me on a Friday from
25 near Glasgow Cross, which was where the bus stopped for

1 me to get off, and she would give me a really big hug.
2 Then we would go home for the weekend. I remember my
3 mum always dropping me off at the side door on Sundays
4 after that. We would go up the side and up some stairs
5 to get in. I would take my coat off and my mum would
6 say goodbye.

7 'St Vincent's was a school for boys and girls. Most
8 of the kids were deaf and a few were deaf and blind.
9 I think the age went up to about 15. Boys and girls
10 were kept completely separate in different parts of the
11 building and even played separately when we were
12 outside. The only time we were together was for
13 mealtimes.

14 'Not all the kids at the school were residential.
15 Some just came in to attend school and then went home
16 every day. They wore their own shoes and clothes, which
17 were much nicer than what the residential kids wore.
18 They were always more confident and would answer back to
19 the nuns, while the residential kids did as they were
20 told. I never felt as confident as those other kids.

21 'When you went in through the side door, you were
22 faced with a brown room with lockers where you put your
23 coat and bag in your own wee locker. To the left and
24 right were long corridors with marble flooring. There
25 were doors coming off the corridors. On the left side

1 corridor there was a door on the left which was the
2 laundry room and further down the corridor on the
3 right-hand side there was a door where we did crafts and
4 things.

5 'After the craft room, you could turn right before
6 the dining room into another narrow corridor, which you
7 could walk through to the other side of the building,
8 which took you to where the right-hand side corridor
9 with the marble flooring from the lockers led. When you
10 walked past the narrow corridor there was a dining room
11 entrance on the right-hand side. The kitchen to wash
12 the dishes was on the left side, not far across from the
13 craft room. On the right-hand side corridor from the
14 lockers there was a room which was used for prayers and
15 rosaries after school. There was a set of double doors
16 after the dining room, which was the boys' side and the
17 girls were not allowed in that area.

18 'The residential part where the girls all slept was
19 upstairs. We slept in dormitories. I think there were
20 two but I'm not sure. I was in a room near the end of
21 the corridor. There were about six beds in the room
22 that I was in and I was the youngest.

23 'Where I slept there were six beds and a single
24 wardrobe each. There were white wood dividers with
25 frosted glass on the top at my side of the bed which did

1 not reach to the top of the ceiling so sometimes you
2 could see nuns' habits as they were walking along.
3 There were no doors in between dividers.

4 'There was a bathroom right at the end with a kind
5 of greenish, yellowish marble inside, I think. The
6 sinks were small and low.

7 'There was a gate you had to walk through to walk up
8 to the building. Visitors would go in the posh door.
9 The front door was beautiful. When you go in the front
10 door and turn right, that area was for deaf and blind
11 people. The school building was further down along from
12 there.

13 'The place was run by nuns and they all wore blue
14 and white habits. Sister LXH was SNR of the
15 school and was [REDACTED]. There was Sister PQF,
16 Sister KTA and Sister PBF, who [REDACTED] the
17 residential part of the school.

18 'Some staff took activities in the evenings, like
19 crafts. I remember a very tall, thin woman who did the
20 laundry, whose surname began with W, but I can't
21 remember how to spell her surname. I will refer to her
22 as Miss W. There was a cleaner woman called Marianne
23 who had white, greyish, curly, short hair, glasses and
24 always wore a purple wrapped overall. She was always
25 a grumpy woman.

1 'None of the nuns used sign language to communicate
2 and we were not allowed to use sign language in school.
3 We had to speak and be oral.

4 'We were woken up early by a nun. We got up, had to
5 make the bed perfectly with the corners all tucked in.
6 We got washed and dressed into our school uniforms and
7 had to stand by the bed while the nun would come and
8 check that everything was perfect. If it wasn't, you
9 were made to do ten Hail Marys as a punishment.

10 'We went to school from 9 am until 3 pm and we
11 stopped for lunch. After school, at 3 pm, we went
12 downstairs into a room to do rosaries and pray with
13 Sister PBF. After prayers, we would go to our
14 dormitories to get changed out of our uniforms and into
15 our normal clothes and then we would go to the dining
16 room to have dinner.

17 'There was an evening room where we would sit in the
18 evenings to do activities like crafts and sewing.

19 'On Thursdays, we had girl time and watched Top of
20 the Pops and we would sign to each other during that
21 time as well, because no nuns would be around. We would
22 also play Miss World, when we would dress up and walk
23 around like Miss World. That was a good experience.

24 'Bedtime was at 7 pm. The nuns would come and check
25 on us. When they left, the girls would sign to each

1 other.

2 'I shared a room with six girls. I remember a girl
3 whose bed was on my left. She was near the window and
4 was always sucking her thumb. I also remember another
5 girl whose bed was on the left-hand side in the middle
6 of the back wall. I remember again another girl and
7 a black girl whose bed was facing opposite me. We used
8 to carry on at bedtime and we would sign to each other.
9 We took turns to keep an eye out to see if we could see
10 a nun coming by looking through the frosted glass part
11 on the corridor divider. We would sign "stop! stop! nun
12 coming" and quickly get into bed because we knew if we
13 got caught we would get into trouble but at the same
14 time it was funny because we never got caught.

15 'There was a tall girl in the dormitory behind me
16 who looked after me and made sure I was okay when
17 I needed comfort after getting into trouble with the
18 nuns. The older girls were nice to me I think because
19 I was only tiny. This tall girl was more like a mum
20 than the nuns were.

21 'On a Friday, we all went to chapel. We had to say
22 the prayers and weren't allowed to sign. The nuns would
23 be standing around staring at everything we did and
24 making sure we didn't use sign language. Even if we
25 signed a little bit, we would be in big trouble.

1 'We had breakfast, lunch and dinner. The dinner
2 just always looked wet and soggy and wasn't great.

3 'You had to finish what was on your plate, even if
4 you didn't like it. The nuns were very strict about
5 this. If we weren't eating it, the nuns would threaten
6 to hit us or send us to the washing room or laundry room
7 to work, which we didn't want to do so we would just eat
8 it.

9 'If a girl didn't want to eat her food at our table,
10 we would whisper, signing under the table and pass her
11 plate sneakily along to each other and someone else
12 would eat it so that her plate would be cleared. There
13 was a girl who would help make bread with jam and sugar
14 or butter and we would pass it on under the table to the
15 girl so that she could have something to eat instead.
16 [She] was like the boss of our table and would help us
17 all with clearing our plates and getting our bread with
18 jam and sugar. This happened all the time.

19 'I remember the bathroom being really big with
20 a marble floor and lots of sinks. It seemed really
21 dark. There was a routine we had to follow to get
22 washed in the morning. The nuns came with us and
23 watched. They would make sure one person had finished
24 and then the next person would go in and so on.
25 I always knew when it was my turn.

1 'Sister PBF always lifted my skirt to look at
2 my pants. She would see that they were girls' pants and
3 shout at me to take them off and would give me boys'
4 pants to wear, which were too big for me. She would hit
5 me with rosary beads or smack me with her hands if
6 I tried to refuse.

7 'We wore school uniforms during the day at school.
8 The kids who weren't residential always seemed to look
9 better dressed than the rest of us.

10 'We changed into normal clothes after school.
11 I don't remember if my clothes came from home or if the
12 nuns gave them to me. I just remember the cardigans
13 that my mum knitted with buttons and my shoes were my
14 own from home. I only ever had a bag with my school
15 books in them, so the clothes must have come from
16 St Vincent's.

17 'I remember Sister PBF making me wear boys'
18 pants that were too big for me, boys' school shoes and
19 socks to wear. I had to go to an outside mainstream
20 hearing school for a while wearing these and the other
21 kids would laugh at me because I looked different.

22 'The teachers weren't nuns and they came from
23 outside to teach. None of them were deaf and none of
24 them used sign language and we weren't allowed to sign
25 either. This made it really difficult to learn. Our

1 hands had to be by our sides at all times.

2 'I remember being in a small class of about six or
3 seven kids and sitting with hearing equipment and
4 microphones. The teacher would hold things up to your
5 throat and see if you could learn through the vibrations
6 and try to teach you that way. We would reciprocate by
7 feeling their throat to feel the vibrations.

8 'I remember a few teachers from my time there.
9 I remember Mrs Orr and Mrs LXM, who was a short, fat
10 lady. Mrs Fitzpatrick took music and was a bit hard of
11 hearing.

12 'I remember a younger teacher as well, who was
13 really pretty and a bit of a hippy. She helped out with
14 our art and I remember sitting in front of her while she
15 drew a picture on my face. I remember a young woman in
16 class as well as a teacher. I think she might have been
17 a teaching assistant.

18 'There was a man who took PE and taught sports to
19 the boys. I remember there was another man as well who
20 was quite young but I don't think they taught the girls.

21 'I remember being made to go and do hearing tests on
22 a Friday during the school day. I would be taken out of
23 the classroom and along the hall to get this done.

24 I wasn't told why and I wasn't told what to do.

25 Sister LXH would be there and there was no

1 communication. This was when I was about 7 or 8 years
2 old. I had to go to these tests every week. Later on,
3 when I was about 9 or 10, I remember my mum being at the
4 hearing test with me. Sister LXH explained that they
5 were doing it to see if my hearing was good enough for
6 me to go to a mainstream school. I remember wanting to
7 do well and make Sister LXH happy but I was never
8 able to.

9 'When I was about 7 or 8 years old and still staying
10 in St Vincent's, I was put into mainstream school to
11 help me learn to speak. It was up the hill from
12 St Vincent's. I don't remember what it was called.
13 I remember not wanting to go and crying but
14 Sister PBF dragged me up the hill and made me go.
15 She would walk me there and pick me up after school and
16 walk me back.

17 'I had to talk all the time and wasn't allowed to
18 sign at the mainstream school. It was awful. I didn't
19 learn anything because I couldn't hear. The teachers
20 didn't have a clue how to teach me. I had no deaf
21 friends to support me. I hated it and never wanted to
22 be there. It really affected my confidence.

23 'I don't feel like I got any education while I was
24 at St Vincent's and thought I was thick. I felt the
25 same at all the schools I went to.

1 'There were swings, a roundabout and a see-saw in
2 the garden that you could play on outside. The nuns
3 were always watching us to make sure we weren't signing.
4 We still signed to each other in a sneaky way when we
5 could.

6 'My mum was a Catholic and so was St Vincent's
7 School. The nuns made us pray all the time.

8 'We had to go to a prayer room at 3 pm after school
9 to pray. We had to kneel down and do rosaries and
10 Hail Marys and on and on. PBF was really strict
11 in that room. My friend would sometimes faint in there
12 and the nuns would just leave her and we all had to
13 carry on praying while she just lay there. It was
14 cruel.

15 'Prayer was used as a punishment as well. We would
16 be made to do ten Hail Marys if the nuns thought we had
17 been bad.

18 'We all went to chapel on a Friday morning. The
19 nuns would be stood at the sides watching us all. We
20 would get into trouble if we giggled or moved. We had
21 to sit still and quiet, facing forward and behave.
22 I never understood any of religious stuff because it all
23 went over my head but we were just made to do it anyway.

24 'I remember doing a pantomime at school and then we
25 would all go home afterwards so I spent Christmas Day at

1 home with my family.

2 'If your birthday was during the week, then you

3 would just be at St Vincent's. No chance did the nuns

4 do anything special for anyone's birthday. All they did

5 was pray.

6 'I went home at weekends so my mum never visited me

7 when I was there through the week. I don't remember

8 anybody else visiting either.

9 'I don't remember a medical room or anything.

10 I don't remember seeing a doctor or dentist while I was

11 at St Vincent's.

12 'We had to make our beds perfectly, making sure it

13 was smooth and square with all the corners tucked in.

14 We were also made to work in the laundry or washing-up

15 room but that used more -- that was used more as

16 a punishment.

17 'One girl always wet the bed. She was made to have

18 a rubber sheet on her bed with a white sheet on top of

19 it. If she wet the bed, she would have to take the

20 white sheet off her bed so we would all know she would

21 get in trouble when the nun came in and saw the rubber

22 sheet. The nun would then grab hold of her and drag her

23 out of the bedroom. It wasn't nice. She would come

24 back crying and then we would all cry because she was

25 upset.

1 'I remember wetting the bed once and having to put
2 my hand up in the morning to say I had wet the bed.
3 I was really panicking that I would be in trouble. The
4 nun came over and went mad.

5 'We got punished if the nuns thought we were
6 misbehaving and that included using sign language, which
7 wasn't allowed at all. Sometimes girls would sign to
8 each other when they were playing outside. The nuns
9 would be watching and if they caught anyone signing,
10 they would tell you to stop and tell you that you
11 weren't allowed to do that. The punishment was being
12 made to do Hail Marys or being made to work in the
13 laundry and washing-up room.

14 'You had to help in the laundry room as punishment
15 sometimes. It was a really dark room with lots of
16 cupboards. I gave clean washing like sheets, clothes,
17 towels to Miss W when she's on the ladder to put inside
18 the cupboards. I would have to fold them and put them
19 in piles. The laundry woman was okay to me.

20 'One Sunday, when I was about 6 years old, my mum
21 dropped me off after I had been home for the weekend.
22 When my mum left, Sister zPQF asked if I had finished
23 my homework and I said no. She got really angry. She
24 started shaking me and slapping my face. She damaged
25 the beautiful cardigan my mum had made me, while shaking

1 me. That was the first time she was physical with me.

2 'I remember my mum buying me some nice wedge shoes
3 when I was about 8 or 9 years old that were like my
4 mum's, but the school wouldn't let me wear them. After
5 my mum dropped me off, Sister [REDACTED] told me to take them
6 off and gave me flat shoes to wear. I didn't want to
7 and refused so she was pulling them off my feet as I was
8 crying and struggling and I got smacked and she took
9 them off my feet and gave me flat shoes to wear.

10 'Sister [REDACTED] would look me up and down all the time
11 and find something wrong with me. She would say
12 I hadn't polished my shoes and then smack me for that.
13 She was an awful, cruel woman. She was really tall, big
14 lady with a big face. I couldn't see her face properly
15 because she wore the habit and the nuns all looked the
16 same, but with different builds.

17 'One time in the cloakroom, there was a boy there
18 and I was shocked to see him. He asked me if I would be
19 his girlfriend and I was like "awwww yeah" and he gave
20 me a ring. We were just having a laugh and it was
21 something different and interesting because we never saw
22 the boys. Sister [REDACTED] came and saw and she grabbed me,
23 dragged me back along -- dragged me back and along into
24 a room. Once in the room she slapped me across the face
25 and was shaking me and kept slapping me. She was

1 horrible.

2 'One time I was outside and was signing to a boy who
3 was in the football area. Boys and girls weren't
4 allowed to mix at all or allowed to sign. One of the
5 nuns saw me and came marching straight up to me and she
6 looked really angry. I was really frightened so I ran
7 away from the nun into the playground and she was
8 chasing me. I was trying to get away from her and ran
9 into the swing and smacked my face on it. I think it
10 was my friend who had been on the swing. I remember
11 that hurt.

12 'I remember me and my friend being sent to the
13 washing-up room to wash and dry the dishes a few times
14 because the nuns thought we had been naughty. My friend
15 was washing and I was drying the dishes.
16 Sister PBF and Sister ZPQF would watch us to make
17 sure we did it perfectly and really quick. They would
18 be standing, hitting us with rosary beads if they didn't
19 think we were doing it properly or fast enough. I was
20 quite small so the beads would hit me down the
21 right-hand side of my face. I don't know if it ever
22 left a mark.

23 'I had another friend who was really thin and weak.
24 One day, when we were in the prayer room kneeling and
25 doing rosaries, she fell forward. I jumped forward to

1 grab her and Sister PBF smacked me with the
2 rosaries. I was shocked because I was just trying to
3 help. I tried to help her a few times but I would
4 always get hit with the rosaries when I did so I learned
5 that I had to just leave her when she fainted and fell
6 over. The Sisters would just leave her lying on the
7 floor and would carry on praying.

8 'Sister PBF was always hitting me with
9 rosaries or something for every little thing, like
10 crying, not wanting to wear boys' pants and socks, or
11 when she was taking me up to the mainstream school.
12 Sister PBF would also smack me on the legs with
13 a coat hanger if I hadn't polished my shoes properly.

14 'I remember me and my two friends getting hit.
15 I don't remember other girls getting hit. The nuns just
16 never seemed to be happy with me. I never ran away
17 because I was too scared to do it but I do remember
18 hiding from the nuns so I wouldn't get hit.

19 'Sister LXH wasn't very nice and her face sticks
20 in my mind. She never hit me but she wasn't very nice.
21 For a while on Fridays, I had to go to hearing tests.
22 This started when I was about 7 or 8 years old. One
23 day, I was just standing outside the classroom in the
24 hall waiting to be told what to do because I didn't know
25 what was going on. The next thing I know, Sister LXH

1 is pulling and dragging me by my ear. I remember
2 feeling the pain in my head. She had her face right in
3 mine and was screaming in my face. She looked really
4 angry. She looked like the devil. I had no idea what
5 was going on and I was shaking. It was something to do
6 with the hearing test and something I should have been
7 doing but I hadn't been told what. The communication
8 was really bad. This happened every week with her
9 screaming in my face. It was horrible. My mum came to
10 the school for the hearing test once and Sister LXH
11 never shouted at me or hurt me in front of my mum.

12 'LXH would stand and watch us going for our lunch
13 and if anyone ran, she would scream in people's faces.
14 She was horrible.

15 'Sister KTA was more verbally abusive. I don't
16 remember her hitting me, but she would always be telling
17 me to do things and to do it quickly. I don't remember
18 what she looked like.

19 'zPQF, PBF, LXH and KTA have ruined my
20 life.

21 'One day, I went home with my mum at the weekend.
22 She asked me what had happened to my cardigan. I tried
23 to explain but I couldn't really communicate with her.

24 'School affected me so I was hiding things when
25 I went home. One time my mum saw me hiding my pants and

1 my mum noticed and would keep asking me why I was hiding
2 things, but I couldn't explain.

3 'I left St Vincent's when I was about 10 or 11 years
4 old.'

5 'Anne' then talks about her life after care. She
6 tells us that it was difficult at home because her
7 mother and brother did not sign, but her brother would
8 always try to stick up for her.

9 She then went to a mainstream school and she
10 remembers a nun coming to the school once a week to
11 teach her how to speak and learn English and this
12 continued until she was in high school.

13 They tried to lipread but that was difficult. When
14 she was still at school, two girls took her to the deaf
15 club. Everyone was signing there and then that was when
16 she realised that she belonged somewhere.

17 'Anne' tells us that she left school before she
18 turned 16. She started on a youth training scheme and
19 then she worked in a factory before she began teaching
20 sign language.

21 She met her husband, a hearing man, at a deaf club
22 when he was learning sign language and she now has three
23 children who all sign.

24 'Anne' then tells us about the impact of her time in
25 care and beginning at paragraph 92 on page 17, she says:

1 'Not being allowed to sign at St Vincent's impacted
2 me in later life. It made me feel stupid. They made us
3 talk instead of signing but talking is not my language,
4 signing was my language. Whenever I tried to talk to
5 hearing people in the outside world, they would laugh at
6 me because I sounded funny and it really affected my
7 confidence. It affected my identity and who I was.
8 I still don't feel comfortable using my voice because
9 I think people are making fun of me. I can only talk
10 with my husband but nobody else.

11 'I didn't learn anything at St Vincent's because
12 they didn't allow the use of sign language. It made me
13 feel thick then and I still feel it now. It affected my
14 education, confidence, and the jobs that I was able to
15 do. I still see the faces of the nuns and the looks on
16 their faces as they screamed in my face and dragged me
17 around and hit me. I tried to push it down and not
18 think about it, but that didn't work. It was on my mind
19 all the time. I knew what happened wasn't normal and
20 that I needed to talk about it. I felt that if I told
21 my story, it might stop going around in my mind forever.

22 'I have always felt frightened whenever I see a nun.
23 I feel my barriers go up as soon as I see one and
24 freeze. They spark memories in my head and it makes me
25 emotional. I find it hard to sleep thinking about it

1 too.

2 'I never told anyone about what went on at
3 St Vincent's. It was only after watching a film about
4 nuns with my husband that I opened up to him a little
5 about what went on at St Vincent's but I only told him
6 little bits. Even when I have met up with my friends
7 from St Vincent's, we don't talk about the abuse even to
8 each other. We have just tried to move on but it is
9 still there in my head. I have always kept it to myself
10 until now. This is the first time I have told anyone
11 about it all.

12 'About five years ago, I saw something saying the
13 deaf children who went to St Vincent's could report any
14 abuse they suffered. I wrote an email but then
15 I changed my mind and didn't send it. Two years after
16 that, I thought to try again, but I wasn't ready. It
17 took me three attempts to finally be able to talk.'

18 'Anne' then goes on at paragraph 100:

19 'Teachers and carers need to notice and care about
20 children. If it seems that a child is holding something
21 back, they need to ask questions. This can be basic
22 questions like just asking the child how they are.

23 'Nuns should not be looking after or teaching
24 children. Children should be looked after and taught by
25 people who are properly qualified. There should be more

1 research into the background into people who work with
2 kids because too many people lie and cheat on their CVs
3 and in interviews.

4 'Deaf children are implanted with hearing aids from
5 a young age now so they don't have a choice on whether
6 to wear one or not. They are then sent to mainstream
7 schools and have supporters and sign language teachers
8 to help them. I feel that confuses them about their
9 identity on whether they are a deaf person or a hearing
10 person, whether they should speak or sign. I feel
11 children should be left to decide themselves whether
12 they want an implant or not when they are 16 years old.

13 And says that she has no objection to her witness
14 statement being published as part of the evidence to the
15 Inquiry and believes the facts stated in it are true.

16 And she has signed her statement and it's dated
17 6 January 2023.

18 And the reference WIT-1-000001641 is again
19 a declaration which accompanies 'Anne's' statement
20 indicating that her statement was provided to the
21 Inquiry with the assistance of a British Sign Language
22 interpreter and 'Anne' was able to read her statement
23 prior to signing it.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

25 Now, in the course of the read-ins of statements

1 this afternoon, we've used a number of names of people
2 whose identities are protected by my General Restriction
3 Order and they are not to be referred to as covered in
4 our evidence outside this room and the list is:
5 Sister KTA , Sister KUA , Sister PQF ,
6 Sister KXD , Sister KYA , a Mr LXL ,
7 Sister PCA , Mr KXX , Mr KXZ , Sister LXH ,
8 a Mrs LXM and Sister PBF and I think that covers
9 everybody that we've mentioned.

10 So thank you very much, and I'll now rise until
11 10 o'clock tomorrow morning when we'll resume evidence,
12 thank you.

13 (3.55 pm)

14 (The Inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am
15 on Thursday, 21 August 2025)

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1	I N D E X	
2	Sister Eileen Glancy (sworn)	3
3	Sister Ellen Flynn (sworn)	3
4	Questions by Ms Innes	4
5	'Gordon' (read)	99
6	'Anthony' (read)	141
7	'Anne' (read)	156
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

