

1 Thursday, 18 July 2019

2 (9.30 am)

3 LADY SMITH: Good morning. As I explained when we finished
4 on Tuesday, today we start another case study, and this
5 is the case study into the provision of residential care
6 for children by the Benedictines order, focusing
7 particularly on Carlekemp School and Fort Augustus Abbey
8 School.

9 As usual, we'll start the case study with my
10 inviting those who are here representing a number of
11 core participants, and of course inquiry counsel, to
12 address me with opening submissions, and we will then be
13 moving on to the first witness in the case study.

14 Mr MacAulay, when you're ready.

15 Opening submissions by MR MacAULAY

16 MR MacAULAY: Good morning, my Lady.

17 Before the other parties launch into their opening
18 statements, I would propose very briefly at the outset
19 to set the scene for this case study.

20 The focus of this case study in this part of
21 phase 4, as your Ladyship has just said, is the English
22 Benedictine Congregation in its role in the running of
23 two schools in Scotland: the Fort Augustus Abbey School,
24 and that's sometimes referred to as "the Abbey School",
25 and Carlekemp School, North Berwick, which was known as

1 "the Priory School" .

2 The Abbey School as we heard previously in the
3 evidence of Dom Yeo was established in 1923 and it
4 closed in 1993. Initially, the age range at the Abbey
5 School was of the order of from 12 to 18.
6 Fort Augustus Abbey first established a preparatory
7 school in Edinburgh in 1930 and that school transferred
8 to the premises of Carlekemp in 1945.

9 That school closed in 1977 and it was seen as
10 a preparatory school for the Abbey School, although
11 children did not invariably move from the Priory School
12 to the Abbey School. The ages of the children at the
13 Priory School was of the order from 7 or 8 to about 11
14 or 13.

15 When the Priory School closed, the age range of
16 children at the Abbey School expanded to incorporate
17 children who had been at Carlekemp prior to its closure.
18 That was the position at least for a period of time.

19 My Lady, there appears to be no record available of
20 the numbers of children accommodated at Carlekemp. But
21 a headcount of children in a school photograph, taken
22 in the 1950s, suggests that at least at that time there
23 were over 60 children at the school. The numbers at
24 Fort Augustus School seemed to have peaked in the 1980s
25 when there were over 130 pupils there.

1 As I mentioned, the inquiry has already heard
2 evidence from Dom Yeo, then Abbot President of the
3 English Benedictine Congregation, and in particular he
4 spoke to parts A and B responses to the section 21
5 notice that was served on the Congregation. Can I say,
6 my Lady, in leading the evidence of this particular case
7 study, the intention is to follow the pattern
8 established in previous case studies and therefore begin
9 with the evidence of applicants. Again, the plan is to
10 do that, insofar as possible, on a chronological basis.

11 My Lady, some applicants will have been at both
12 schools, for example the first witness went to both
13 schools, whereas the second witness today on the list
14 only went to Carlekemp School.

15 Chronologically, the furthest back we can go insofar
16 as Carlekemp is concerned is about the mid-1950s, and as
17 far as Fort Augustus is concerned, the late 1950s/early
18 1960s.

19 The intention is to lead orally as much evidence as
20 possible, but some applicants' evidence will need to be
21 read in.

22 My Lady, looking to the timescales, the intention is
23 to devote the next two days to leading applicants --
24 this is Thursday -- and also from Wednesday to Friday of
25 next week, because the inquiry is not sitting on

1 Tuesday.

2 There will then be a break throughout August and the
3 intention is to resume on Tuesday, 10 September, when
4 the taking of evidence from applicants will continue,
5 and that will certainly be the position for the first
6 week. That will also include other former pupils who
7 had positive experiences at, in particular,
8 Fort Augustus.

9 There will also be evidence, probably in the second
10 week, that will be dominated, but not exclusively, by
11 evidence from former staff members, including
12 representatives of the order.

13 There is then a break planned for the week beginning
14 Monday, 23 September and submissions are expected to be
15 dealt with on 1 and 2 October. So that is the plan. If
16 all goes to plan, then the next case study is due to
17 start the following day on 3 October.

18 That's all I propose to say in advance of the
19 evidence, my Lady.

20 LADY SMITH: That's very helpful, thank you very much,
21 Mr MacAulay.

22 I would now like to turn to representation for INCAS
23 and I see Mr Collins is here this morning for INCAS.

24 Opening submissions by MR COLLINS

25 MR COLLINS: Thank you, my Lady, these are the opening

1 statements for INCAS, prepared by John Scott, but which
2 I'll present on his behalf.

3 On behalf of INCAS, I wish to say only a few words
4 at the opening of the case study into the English
5 Benedictine Congregation. Many of the remarks I made
6 at the opening of the case study into the
7 Christian Brothers apply. As these were spoken so
8 recently, I will not repeat them all.

9 Hopefully, those involved in the order and who are
10 responsible for the order in these proceedings, or at
11 least their legal team, will have been following the
12 inquiry to date.

13 As before, in the next few weeks, in this case study
14 survivors are listening to hear full and appropriate
15 acceptance, acknowledgement and apology. Grudging
16 legalistic, technical or conditional non-apologies will
17 be recognised for what they are and called out in
18 closing remarks on behalf of INCAS.

19 Given the terms of the section 21 response of the
20 order, the extent of what is acknowledged during oral
21 evidence in the case study will be carefully noted.
22 It is to be hoped that the arrangements that were put in
23 place for the running of the Fort Augustus and Carlekemp
24 schools by the order will not be used as a technical
25 excuse to try and avoid responsibility. After all, the

1 precise nature of those arrangements was a matter for
2 the order, so it would hardly do to say, "We established
3 the arrangements for Carlekemp in North Berwick and
4 Fort Augustus Abbey School so that they had autonomy and
5 after that it was nothing to do with us".

6 We look forward to hearing about visitations, but
7 more than that, we look forward to hearing why it was
8 thought appropriate to set up establishments in the name
9 of the order using staff who had no relevant teaching
10 qualifications and no qualifications in residential
11 childcare.

12 Over many years it might be thought that the order
13 has benefited from having its name attached to these
14 establishments. To whatever extent credit was ever due,
15 responsibility for harm should now also be claimed.

16 Thank you, my Lady.

17 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much, Mr Collins.

18 Can I now turn to the Lord Advocate. Mr Richardson.

19 Opening submissions by MR RICHARDSON

20 MR RICHARDSON: Thank you, my Lady.

21 I'm grateful for the opportunity to make a brief
22 opening statement on behalf of the Lord Advocate. As
23 I indicated at the commencement of phase 4 of the
24 inquiry's hearings, the Lord Advocate's interest in this
25 phase stems from his responsibilities as head of the

1 system of criminal prosecution in Scotland and his
2 responsibility in that regard for Scotland's prosecution
3 service, the Crown Office and Procurator Fiscal Service,
4 COPFS. These are responsibilities which the
5 Lord Advocate exercises independently of any other
6 person.

7 As has been indicated in previous statements to the
8 inquiry, COPFS plays a pivotal role at the heart of the
9 criminal justice system and accordingly has important
10 responsibilities in relation to allegations of criminal
11 conduct involving the abuse of children in care in
12 Scotland.

13 During this particular case study, which will focus
14 on the residential establishments outlined by
15 Mr MacAulay, it is anticipated that the inquiry may hear
16 evidence about past and continuing COPFS involvement
17 in relation to allegations of the abuse of children at
18 those establishments.

19 In conclusion, may I once again repeat the
20 Lord Advocate's public commitment, first to supporting
21 the inquiry's work and to contributing positively and
22 constructively to that work where possible and,
23 secondly, to the effective, rigorous and fair
24 prosecution of crime in the public interest,
25 consistently and for all, including the most vulnerable

1 in our society.

2 That is all I have to say, my Lady.

3 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

4 Can I now turn to the representation for the Chief
5 Constable of Police Scotland. Ms van der Westhuizen,
6 when you're ready.

7 Opening submissions by MS van der WESTHUIZEN

8 MS VAN DER WESTHUIZEN: My Lady, I'm grateful for the
9 opportunity to make this opening statement on behalf of
10 Police Scotland.

11 Firstly, on behalf of Police Scotland, I would again
12 like to express continued sympathy to survivors who have
13 experienced abuse within establishments across Scotland.

14 Police Scotland remains committed to delivering its
15 response to the inquiry and ensuring it provides all
16 relevant information regarding police policies,
17 procedures and previous investigations into the abuse
18 and neglect of children in establishments falling under
19 the inquiry's remit.

20 With regard to this phase of the inquiry's hearings,
21 and specifically this case study, assessment has
22 identified material relating to previous police
23 investigations into the abuse and neglect of children
24 within the establishments at Carlekemp School,
25 North Berwick, and Fort Augustus Abbey School

1 Inverness-shire, during the time they were operated by
2 the Order of Benedictines.

3 Those investigations were conducted by both the
4 legacy Northern Constabulary and more recently by
5 Police Scotland. All material relating to those
6 previous investigations have been provided to the
7 inquiry.

8 As your Ladyship is aware, in addition to providing
9 relevant police documents to the inquiry,
10 Police Scotland is conducting a number of investigations
11 into the abuse and neglect of children within
12 institutions that meet the inquiry's terms of reference.
13 Both as a result of reviews of previous investigations
14 and in response to new reports from survivors.

15 Police Scotland continues to build its on its
16 engagement with adult survivors of childhood abuse,
17 seeking views and consulting with survivors, support
18 services and statutory partners in an effort to enhance
19 public confidence and improve service provision to adult
20 survivors.

21 Police Scotland also recognises the importance of
22 using organisational learning to ensure its staff have
23 the capabilities and skills required to effect
24 continuous improvement. As such, Police Scotland will
25 take into account any lessons to be learnt that may be

1 identified from this case study as part of its
2 commitment to developing and improving its practice,
3 policies and service provision.

4 Police Scotland is currently involved in significant
5 work with its partners, nationally and locally, to
6 deliver child protection and remains committed, both as
7 a single agency and in partnership, to make a positive
8 contribution to child protection improvement across
9 Scotland.

10 Unless I can be of further assistance, my Lady, that
11 is the opening statement for Police Scotland.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

13 Can I now turn to Scottish Ministers: I see
14 Mr Heaney is here for them this morning.

15 Opening submissions by MR HEANEY

16 MR HEANEY: Thank you, my Lady. I appear today on behalf of
17 the Scottish Ministers.

18 As the inquiry is aware, the Scottish Ministers also
19 represent at this inquiry those executive agencies which
20 form part of the Scottish Government and for which the
21 Scottish Ministers are directly responsible, including
22 Education Scotland, Disclosure Scotland and the Scottish
23 Prison Service. As the inquiry knows, the Crown Office
24 and Procurator Fiscal Service is separately represented.

25 The Scottish Ministers' involvement in this part of

1 phase 4 of the inquiry is, as it has been throughout, as
2 a core participant with a direct interest in all of the
3 issues being raised by witnesses, and in particular how
4 the responsibilities of the state in relation to the
5 inspection and regulation of the establishments, which
6 are the subject of case studies during this phase, were
7 discharged.

8 The Scottish Government Response Unit, established
9 for the purposes of the inquiry, has provided
10 information to the inquiry in response to section 21
11 notices served by the inquiry, and which sought
12 documentation relating to Carlekemp Priory School and
13 Fort Augustus Abbey School.

14 The Scottish Ministers will continue to listen to
15 the evidence of those giving evidence to the inquiry as
16 part of this phase and will continue to assist the
17 inquiry with the provision of information.

18 My Lady, that's the opening statement on behalf of
19 the ministers.

20 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

21 Could I now turn to representation for the
22 Bishops' Conference. Mr Anderson.

23 Opening submissions by MR ANDERSON

24 MR ANDERSON: Yes, thank you, my Lady.

25 I appear on behalf of the Bishops' Conference of

1 Scotland and I'm grateful for this opportunity to make
2 this opening statement.

3 As I have stated previously, my Lady, the
4 Bishops' Conference is a permanently constituted
5 assembly of the bishops of the eight Scottish dioceses
6 and archdioceses, which is coordinating the responses by
7 the individual dioceses and archdioceses in Scotland.

8 Relevant to the present case study, there are two
9 where a residential establishment for children run by
10 the English Benedictine Congregation was situated:
11 Fort Augustus Abbey School was located in the Diocese of
12 Aberdeen, and Carlekemp was located in the Archdiocese
13 of St Andrews and Edinburgh. These were served with
14 section 21 notices, which were responded to.

15 I have addressed my Lady previously on the
16 relationship between orders and the dioceses or
17 archdioceses within which they are located. I'm advised
18 that in the present matter, interaction between diocesan
19 priests and the Congregation might have been less
20 necessary in terms of priestly responsibilities,
21 standing that the brothers themselves were priests of
22 the Congregation, and therefore they could fulfil the
23 role that a diocesan priest might fulfil elsewhere,
24 saying Mass for example.

25 That said, my Lady, the Bishops' Conference is aware

1 that there is again an overlap of personnel between the
2 Order of Benedictines and at least the Diocese of
3 Aberdeen. A priest at Fort Augustus Abbey subsequently
4 became a diocesan priest and was later convicted of an
5 offence which took place during his time at the abbey.

6 The church's national safeguarding office has been
7 involved in the cases of other monks of the order.
8 Considering the information sought by the inquiry, these
9 issues and the materials produced, the
10 Bishops' Conference considered it appropriate that they
11 exercise their leave to appear in this case study.

12 The Bishops' Conference acknowledges, my Lady, that
13 abuse of children took place within the establishments
14 run by the Congregation of Benedictines. They do so on
15 the basis of the conviction referred to, but also on the
16 basis of materials which they have seen for this case
17 study and the disclosures made in the 2013 television
18 programme, which I think may be the subject of some
19 evidence to come. In 2013, the Bishop of Aberdeen,
20 Bishop Hugh Gilbert, recognised that abuse had happened
21 in his public statement on the matter.

22 The Bishops' Conference of Scotland are committed to
23 learning from the mistakes of the past and ensuring that
24 the highest safeguarding standards are met throughout
25 the church in Scotland and they see their participation

1 in inquiry proceedings as part of that objective.

2 That's the context in which I appear before the inquiry
3 on behalf of the Bishops' Conference.

4 As ever, those instructing me are grateful for this
5 opportunity to participate in the inquiry proceedings
6 and shall endeavour to assist in any way they can.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you very much.

8 Finally, can I turn to the representation for the
9 English Benedictine Congregation.

10 Opening submissions by MR REID

11 MR REID: Thank you, my Lady.

12 The Congregation is grateful for the opportunity to
13 participate in this case study. I do not propose to say
14 much on behalf of the Congregation at this point. At an
15 earlier stage, the inquiry has heard from the then Abbot
16 President, Dom Yeo; in the case of this case study the
17 inquiry will hear from Abbot Geoffrey, who is the first
18 assistant to the current Abbot President.

19 Abbot Geoffrey and Father Edmund, who is the
20 Procurator of the Congregation, are present today and
21 it is Abbot Geoffrey's intention to be present
22 throughout the evidence that will be led.

23 LADY SMITH: Can you remind me who the current Abbot
24 President is, because I think there have been some
25 changes, haven't there?

1 MR REID: Abbot Christopher, my Lady.

2 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

3 MR REID: It may be helpful to the inquiry if I draw
4 attention to just a couple of things at this point. The
5 Congregation accepts that abuse did take place at the
6 schools connected with Fort Augustus Abbey. The
7 Congregation deplores the acts of abuse that were
8 perpetrated and it sincerely regrets that the means for
9 exposing it were, at the time, clearly inadequate.

10 At the time Fort Augustus schools were open, they
11 were rarely reported on in any detail as part of the
12 four-year visitation of the abbey and instead reliance
13 was placed on the general school inspectorate regime to
14 report to the monasteries and school management. That
15 has now changed and Abbot Geoffrey is likely to give
16 evidence about the changes that have been made.

17 The second point, my Lady, is that the inquiry is
18 aware the Congregation now holds the residual assets of
19 Fort Augustus Abbey in a ring-fenced account, those
20 funds having been gifted to the Congregation's trust in
21 2010.

22 In a supplementary statement following his oral
23 evidence in July 2017, Dom Yeo informed the inquiry that
24 the Congregation were seeking the agreement of the
25 Charities Commission of England and Wales so as to apply

1 those funds for the benefit of those who had suffered
2 abuse at the schools run by the abbey. Having discussed
3 the point with the Charities Commission, the
4 Congregation have since satisfied themselves that the
5 funds which are held on trust can be used to meet claims
6 from pupils at those schools. As at the end of
7 June 2019, I have been advised that 13 claims have been
8 intimated to the Congregation and ten of those have been
9 settled with payments to the claimants.

10 The Congregation is committed to continuing to
11 honour what it considers to be a moral responsibility as
12 the custodians of the residual assets of the abbey to
13 apply those assets to meet the claims that would
14 otherwise would have been made against the abbey.

15 I thought in light of Dom Yeo's supplementary
16 evidence at the earlier stage, it would be helpful to
17 update the inquiry on that matter.

18 LADY SMITH: That's very helpful, thank you. We'll no doubt
19 hear more about that in due course, will we?

20 MR REID: We will, my Lady.

21 Otherwise, the Congregation and its advisers will
22 listen carefully to the evidence that will be presented
23 during this case study. They recognise that reading
24 accounts of what happened on the printed page is no
25 substitute for actually listening to the first-hand

1 account of the individuals that were involved and they
2 will do so carefully. They are not here to challenge
3 the truthfulness of any evidence the inquiry will hear
4 but to assist the work of the inquiry and will work with
5 Mr MacAulay and his team to that end.

6 LADY SMITH: I'm very pleased to hear that. You may be
7 aware in the last study there was a presence for the
8 Christian Brothers, from a very senior level, throughout
9 the case study hearings and actually seeing and hearing
10 the witnesses himself plainly had a profound effect,
11 which was recognised by them.

12 MR REID: And the Congregation will be present throughout
13 because they recognise the importance of that, my Lady.

14 Otherwise, unless anything I have said gives rise to
15 particular points my Lady wishes any clarification on,
16 those are the opening comments on behalf of the
17 Congregation.

18 LADY SMITH: That's all at the moment, thank you very much.

19 Mr MacAulay, do you want a short break while we get
20 organised for the first witness?

21 MR MacAULAY: I think that would be helpful.

22 (9.55 am)

23 (A short break)

24 (10.20 am)

25 LADY SMITH: Ms MacLeod.

1 MS MACLEOD: My Lady, the first witness who will give
2 evidence in this case study is an applicant who will use
3 the pseudonym "Harry".

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

5 "HARRY" (sworn)

6 LADY SMITH: Please sit down, Harry, and make yourself
7 comfortable.

8 That sounds as though you're in a good position for
9 the microphone. If you can make sure that we do hear
10 you through the sound system, that's very helpful.

11 I'm going to hand over to Ms MacLeod and she will
12 explain to you what happens next.

13 Questions from Ms MacLEOD

14 MS MACLEOD: Good morning, Harry.

15 A. Good morning.

16 Q. I don't need your date of birth, but were you born in
17 the year 1946?

18 A. I was.

19 Q. And are you now 73?

20 A. I am, yes.

21 Q. You've provided a statement for the inquiry and there's
22 a copy of that in the folder in front of you and parts
23 of it will also come on the screen on your desk. I'll
24 give the reference for the transcript: WIT.001.002.5841.

25 I wonder if you could begin by turning to the final

1 page of the statement for me. Have you signed the
2 statement?

3 A. I have, yes.

4 Q. In the very last paragraph do you say:

5 "I have no objection to my witness statement being
6 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry"?

7 A. I do say that, yes.

8 Q. Do you go on to say:

9 "I believe the facts stated in this witness
10 statement are true"?

11 A. I do.

12 Q. To begin with, I'll ask you a little about your family
13 background prior to you going to boarding school.

14 I think you tell us in your statement that you were born
15 in Aberdeenshire; is that right?

16 A. That's correct, yes.

17 Q. You tell us that you lived with your parents and an
18 older sister.

19 A. I did, and my paternal grandfather as well.

20 Q. Was that in the [REDACTED] area of Aberdeenshire?

21 A. That was in [REDACTED] in Aberdeenshire, yes.

22 Q. I think there came a point when your family moved to
23 Edinburgh.

24 A. That's correct, yes.

25 Q. Were you around 7?

- 1 A. I was 7, yes.
- 2 Q. You tell us, I think, that your family converted to
3 Catholicism at that time.
- 4 A. They did.
- 5 Q. And you tell us a little bit about your family. You say
6 that:
- 7 "Generally speaking, it was a very good home, very
8 kind, very caring and very structured."
- 9 A. That is correct, yes.
- 10 Q. In relation to your schooling, I think once in Edinburgh
11 you initially went to Scotus Academy.
- 12 A. I did.
- 13 Q. Was that run by the Christian Brothers?
- 14 A. Yes, I believe so.
- 15 Q. After some time, your family moved to Dundee?
- 16 A. They did, yes, that's correct.
- 17 Q. By that time, was your sister at boarding school?
- 18 A. She was at boarding school, yes.
- 19 Q. Was a decision taken that you should also go to boarding
20 school?
- 21 A. It was.
- 22 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about your own recollection
23 of that decision and how that came about?
- 24 A. Well, I can. I remember my parents discussing the
25 possibility of my being sent to boarding school. My

1 mother was extremely keen, as she had taken to
2 Catholicism with a zeal, all the zeal of the convert.
3 My father, who was a man who kept his pennies under
4 24-hour surveillance, was rather concerned about paying
5 the fees, so he wasn't so keen and I do remember them
6 arguing quite a bit.

7 My mother's argument was, " MMG is a delicate
8 boy", and she obviously thought that boarding school was
9 a more suitable place for a delicate boy than the local
10 schools around Dundee.

11 Q. I think you tell us in your statement that there was
12 discussion about Fort Augustus at that stage, but that
13 you were slightly too young for that?

14 A. Yes, it was really Carlekemp that was on the horizon
15 rather than Fort Augustus at that stage.

16 Q. When you were around 9, did you go to Carlekemp?

17 A. Yes, I was 9 and I went to Carlekemp, yes.

18 Q. Do you remember arriving at Carlekemp?

19 A. Not terribly clearly, to be honest.

20 Q. What is your first memory of being there, of the
21 building?

22 A. Well, the building was a very beautiful, mock
23 Elizabethan building. I do remember the building, the
24 environment. The lawns and the woods were very nice.
25 Internally it was also very beautiful, very fine.

1 I don't have any bad initial memories of Carlekemp; it
2 was quite a happy place to be, initially at least. It
3 was very tiny as a school, there were only I think about
4 60 boys there, so one got to know everybody very, very
5 quickly.

6 Q. I will put a photograph on the screen if that's okay:

7 INQ.001.004.1985.

8 A. Carlekemp, yes.

9 Q. Is that the front of the building?

10 A. That's the front of the building. We used to play
11 cricket on the lawn there.

12 Q. I'll put another one on at BEN.001.001.0216. Is that
13 a slightly different --

14 A. Yes, it's a different angle of the same building,
15 absolutely, yes.

16 Q. You tell us a little bit in your statement about the
17 inside of the building. You say there was a big study
18 hall and a prep hall. Can you give me a little bit of
19 an overview of when you went inside the building?

20 A. Yes. The study hall was a very fine galleried room. It
21 was to my eyes, as a young boy, very large and very
22 beautiful and had a gallery. When I was there, there
23 were rows of desks. This is where you did your prep,
24 which is the boarding school homework, of course. We
25 obviously didn't have homework so we had prep every

1 evening. Everybody had a desk in the study hall, myself
2 included. I sat next to a boy called [REDACTED],
3 who became a doctor in Australia, I think. That was
4 where we went every evening to do our preparation, which
5 was set work.

6 Q. I'll put a photograph on the screen which may be of that
7 area: WIT.003.001.4732.

8 A. That is the study hall at Carlekemp, without a doubt.

9 Q. I think we see there the rows of desks.

10 A. Yes, I can see exactly where my desk was. I can't
11 identify the monk, however.

12 Q. So you've mentioned --

13 LADY SMITH: Where was your desk?

14 A. My desk was close to the back of the hall. You'll
15 notice at the rear of the hall there are two pillars,
16 and if you see the pillar on the left, my desk was just
17 in front of that.

18 MS MACLEOD: You have mentioned there were about 60 boys at
19 the school.

20 A. I think that is how many there were, yes.

21 Q. What's your recollection of the age range of the boys?

22 A. They ranged from about 8 to about 13. By the time they
23 went on to secondary school, the boys were 12 or 13 and
24 I think some, when I got there were, a little younger
25 than I, so I think approximately -- possibly some were 7

1 even, 7 or 8 up to 13.

2 LADY SMITH: About 8 to 13 would have been the normal age
3 range for prep schools in Scotland and south of the
4 border at that time. How many academic years was that
5 divided into at Carlekemp?

6 A. I think there were five forms in the school. So fifth
7 form was the senior class. I think I started possibly
8 in second form if I remember.

9 LADY SMITH: If you were about 9 years old, that would fit
10 with your memory.

11 A. Yes, I think so.

12 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

13 MS MACLEOD: If I can ask you about the staff and monks who
14 were at Carlekemp when you were there. Who was [REDACTED]
15 [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] the school?

16 A. Well, there was a [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] who was Father
17 [REDACTED] MEX [REDACTED], that was his name.

18 Father [REDACTED] MEX [REDACTED] was [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED]. And then there
19 were other monks there: Father Aidan Duggan,
20 Father [REDACTED] MEZ [REDACTED], Father [REDACTED] MEW [REDACTED]; there was
21 a [REDACTED] teacher, Mr [REDACTED] MFB [REDACTED]; there was a matron,
22 Ms Kitty O'Donnell; there were one or two visiting
23 teachers as well.

24 I remember an unfortunate woman who had to teach us
25 how to dance came to the school. But they were

1 really -- those three monks and Father [REDACTED] MFC ,
2 who was a young monk who came when I was there, they
3 were pretty much the monks that I remember.

4 Q. Did they each have an individual role as far as you were
5 concerned? What was your perception of what their roles
6 were? If we take, for example, Father Aidan Duggan,
7 what was his role in the school?

8 A. He was a teacher and one of the ways in which Carlekemp
9 differed from Fort Augustus was that although there were
10 houses at Carlekemp -- there were three houses, Fidra,
11 Lamb and Craigleith, named after the islands off the
12 shore of North Berwick. I guess each house must have
13 had 20 boys in it and there were house captains but
14 there were no housemasters, whereas in Fort Augustus the
15 housemaster was a significant figure. The monks there,
16 apart from Father [REDACTED] MEX , who was obviously the [REDACTED] SNR
17 the other monks were essentially teachers in the school.
18 They taught different subjects. All the curriculum was
19 a subject-based curriculum.

20 Q. I think you mention in your statement that
21 a Father [REDACTED] MFC was quite a hero in the eyes
22 of some of the boys.

23 A. He was. He was young. I guess he was quite a young man
24 and the others were a bit older, so obviously young boys
25 are impressed with a dashing young man and, yes, he was

1 something of a hero.

2 Q. You mention also a Mrs Gilhooley.

3 A. Yes, that's right, yes, I'd forgotten about her. She
4 was a very nice lady. She actually got married,
5 I think, while I was at Carlekemp, Mrs Gilhooley.
6 I think her pre-marriage name was Inglehinny. She
7 obviously wanted a simpler name.

8 Q. What were the sleeping arrangements at Carlekemp?

9 A. There were dormitories. Unlike the ones at
10 Fort Augustus, the dormitories were essentially rooms.
11 They had maybe six or eight beds in them. They were
12 open, they weren't cubicles or anything like that. We
13 had a locker beside the bed where we kept our clothes
14 and they were just simple rooms.

15 Q. Were he this arranged by age or by the houses you have
16 mentioned or something else?

17 A. The dormitories had different names and I think they
18 were arranged by age as far as I remember, yes.

19 Q. In terms of the routine, the daily routine, could you
20 tell me just what that was in quite brief terms, when
21 you got up in the morning what you did?

22 A. Yes, as far as I can remember, it was not too dissimilar
23 from the routine at Fort Augustus: you got out of bed,
24 it wasn't long before you were in church for Mass,
25 virtually every day of the week. After Mass, there was

1 breakfast, after breakfast there were lessons to
2 lunchtime. The afternoons were usually structured in
3 some way, generally sport or whatever. And then in the
4 evening, there was I think some late afternoon classes
5 and after that there would be supper. After supper
6 there was a bit of free time, and I guess we probably
7 said some prayers and things like that. And then off to
8 bed, quite early.

9 I didn't mention actually, but we got up in the
10 morning, we had to make our own beds and learn how to do
11 hospital corners and things like that.

12 Q. Was that the routine Monday to Saturday?

13 A. Yes. I think it was pretty much although possibly on
14 Saturday there wouldn't have been any late afternoon
15 classes; it was a little bit more relaxed. I think they
16 showed films on Saturday night. Father **MEW** was a bit
17 of a projectionist and I think he showed films on
18 Saturday night.

19 Sunday there was more time, of course, spent in
20 church, normally in the morning, and later on in the
21 evening -- there wouldn't have been sport in the
22 afternoon on Sunday as well. Then in the evening we
23 wrote letters home, which had to be vetted by whoever
24 was in charge, usually one of the monks, and after that
25 a bit of free time and bed, I suppose.

1 Q. That's something you mention in your statement, the
2 letter writing and that those were censored.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You say that there were things that boys knew not to put
5 in the letters.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Can you tell me a little bit about that?

8 A. There was a sense in which you didn't tell everything
9 that went on. I certainly wouldn't have been
10 comfortable telling my parents if I had got into trouble
11 or something like that, not that I did all that much.
12 I also always signed my letter with the formal version
13 of my name, not my more abbreviated name that everybody
14 knew me by, because I didn't particularly want the
15 authorities to see my family name, if you like, so it
16 was all a little bit stiff and unnatural.

17 I think most of the other boys would have similarly
18 felt a little bit inhibited about being too open in
19 their letter writing, knowing that it was going to be
20 checked over.

21 LADY SMITH: How did you know your letters were going to be
22 checked?

23 A. Because you had to take them up to the teacher or the
24 monk supervising and the monk supervising read them
25 through. So before you were finished, the letter

1 writing, the letter was seen and approved.

2 LADY SMITH: I see.

3 MS MACLEOD: On the matter of your name and the name that
4 was used in the school, how did monks and staff address
5 you? Would they use your first name?

6 A. No, no, not at all. It was all surnames, very much so.

7 Q. How were you to address them?

8 A. Well, it was Father So-and-so or Mr So-and-so or
9 Mrs So-and-so.

10 Q. How would you describe the schooling that was on offer
11 at Carlekemp?

12 A. It should have been a very privileged schooling in the
13 sense that the classes were absolutely tiny. Of course,
14 I only ever went to Carlekemp and Fort Augustus, so
15 I don't have standards of comparison. We learnt a lot
16 of religious instruction of the Catholic variety,
17 inevitably. It was a very traditional type of
18 schooling. It was very much memory work. There was
19 lists of history dates and capes and bays and who wrote
20 this, that and the next novel, famous people, and very
21 fact based, very memory based. It was a very, to use an
22 educational term, very psychometric type of education
23 where information was poured in and you were expected
24 from time to time to regurgitate it in tests and things
25 like that, and on the strength of your good memory you

- 1 did quite well or not so well as the case may be.
- 2 Q. Did teachers come into your class or did you as a class
3 move around the school?
- 4 A. No, we didn't move. We had a classroom, a form
5 classroom, and the teachers came into the class to teach
6 the different subjects.
- 7 Q. You say the classes were small: do you recall roughly
8 the number of boys in your class?
- 9 A. I think when I was in fifth form there was only eight or
10 nine of us. It was very, very tiny.
- 11 Q. Was there a curriculum, do you remember?
- 12 A. Oh, well, that's a very good question. I didn't think
13 as a small boy of it as being a curriculum. I guess
14 there must have been of some kind. The extent to which
15 this was managed by the school or whether it was just
16 left up to individual teachers to more or less teach
17 what they thought was appropriate, I really don't know
18 the answer to that.
- 19 Q. What about the quality of the teaching itself?
- 20 A. That's a very subjective thing. I have known teachers
21 who were adjudged to be poor by some boys who were
22 adored by others. My view of it was that it was
23 a little bit mixed but probably sound enough for the
24 most part. I don't think of any of the teachers there
25 as being especially poor in my estimation. What they

1 taught, they seemed to be able to put across tolerably
2 well.

3 Q. Something you mention in your statement is that one of
4 the worrying things in respect of both the schools,
5 Carlekemp and Fort Augustus, was that most of the monks
6 had been pupils there themselves and had not taught at
7 other schools.

8 A. That is an important point and perhaps even more in
9 respect of Fort Augustus. It was not only
10 geographically remote and, of course, it had the lack of
11 transparency, if you like, that all institutions tend to
12 have, but the vast majority of the staff had only
13 Carlekemp or Fort Augustus as their own school
14 experience, so they had little or no experience of any
15 other education at all.

16 Q. To what extent was religious life and education part of
17 your day-to-day experience?

18 A. Well, I think it was enormously influential. We spent
19 a considerable amount of time in church and what seemed
20 like a considerable amount of time studying Catholic
21 doctrine of one kind or another, memorising catechisms,
22 and reading the lives of saints, and studying the
23 New Testament and so on and so forth. It was very, very
24 influential as a young lad, and I couldn't help forming
25 an affection for much of the language and many of the

1 images that we were taught about in the course of the
2 Carlekemp years and all the mysticism of Catholicism,
3 the statues, the incense and the chanting and so and so
4 forth. It was very influential and it permeated pretty
5 much all aspects of school life so, yes, it was
6 a Catholic education with a capital C, definitely.

7 Q. Sport is something you tell us about in your statement.

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. What role did sport play in life at Carlekemp?

10 A. Well, it certainly had a very exalted status at
11 Fort Augustus, and to some extent it did at Carlekemp as
12 well. If you were able to be a bit of a sports hero,
13 this made life easier at least to the extent that you
14 were able to wallow in the approbation of the school
15 authorities and so on. It was important, yes. I think
16 it was quite a big thing, sport, at both the schools,
17 especially Fort Augustus.

18 Q. What about recreation time more generally? Did you have
19 opportunities as a boy to go on trips out of school?

20 How did you spend your free time?

21 A. Well, we weren't taken to trips to any great extent that
22 I can remember. In fact, I can only remember one and
23 that was to the abbey at Nunraw, which was a bit of
24 a busman's holiday for us. But we did have freedom to
25 go around the school grounds, which were quite

1 extensive, and we did all the silly things that little
2 boys do and messed about. We were also able to play
3 golf on the golf links nearby. There was a 9-hole
4 course -- in fact, I had some instruction from a retired
5 golf professional and so on.

6 We were taken down to the shore in the summertime to
7 go swimming. We lived a very outdoor life. Much of the
8 time we were out of doors and we were getting a lot of
9 exercise and having a lot of company and all that was
10 quite a pleasant aspect of life. But we weren't really
11 allowed to go down into North Berwick. That was
12 something that was obviously out of bounds. So yes,
13 that's what we did.

14 Q. Do you recall any inspections of Carlekemp?

15 A. Only one, and that was when some priests or monks or --
16 well, I think priests of some kind, I don't really know
17 who they were -- came to test our religious knowledge.
18 I can't remember any other inspections at all, just one
19 religious knowledge inspection, which happened when
20 I was in fifth form. That's the only one I can recall.

21 Q. Having lived with your family until you were 9, how did
22 you find the experience of living away from home, living
23 in that kind of environment?

24 A. It wasn't in loco parentis in any sense. You very
25 quickly realised that you were on your own in Carlekemp

1 and perhaps even more so in Fort Augustus, that you had
2 to fall back on your own resources. There wasn't
3 a sense that there was somebody you could go to and you
4 could tell your worries to and say, "I'm not very happy
5 or I'm having problems with this", or whatever. So you
6 just got the sense that you'd come to a place where
7 things were going to be challenging and you just had to
8 match up to the challenge. Any call for help would be
9 seen as weakness and you didn't want to appear weak in
10 front of your peers, so you learnt to cope.

11 Q. What about contact with your family? Did you have
12 opportunities to see your family throughout the school
13 term?

14 A. Families would come at weekends -- I beg your pardon,
15 not weekends, not at all, but at half-term. Generally
16 there was a half-term holiday and I think classes were
17 perhaps suspended for a Friday or a Monday or something.
18 There was a long weekend maybe and parents would come if
19 they could.

20 In some cases they couldn't, of course. We had
21 a number of forces children at the school whose parents
22 were overseas, but generally speaking parents would come
23 and they'd take you out somewhere and you'd be able to
24 get away for a day or two. These were greatly
25 anticipated but generally they only happened -- and the

1 terms were fairly long and so were the holidays, so
2 it would be maybe six weeks or something, and the
3 half-term would occur, and then it would be another
4 six weeks until the holidays and we'd see our parents
5 then.

6 Q. Can I ask you then about discipline. How was discipline
7 managed at the school?

8 A. Well, it was managed in a less graduated and less formal
9 way than at Fort Augustus. Discipline was more
10 incidental at Carlekemp. I don't really remember people
11 queueing up to be given corporal punishment so much at
12 Carlekemp but certainly there was some physical
13 punishment. It tended to be incidental. It could be
14 a slap on the ears or it could be being hit over the
15 back of the knuckles with the edge of a ruler. This was
16 quite a not uncommon event. In fact, I do remember my
17 own skin being broken by that from time to time. I also
18 remember Father Aidan Duggan breaking the glass on my
19 watch when he was trying to do that on one occasion and
20 he had to take the watch away and get it repaired.
21 That's not the kind of thing I'd have told my parents
22 about.

23 Q. You tell us about that incident with the watch in your
24 statement. Can you tell me about the circumstances
25 surrounding that? What happened and what led to that?

1 A. Well, I don't exactly remember whether I had made a mess
2 of work or whether I'd said something cheeky, which is
3 quite possible because I could be quite cheeky at
4 times -- I didn't consider it cheeky, I considered it
5 witty, but I think they considered it cheeky. But
6 I annoyed him in some way. I really can't say what it
7 was, but something had got under his skin and he'd
8 become a little bit ill-tempered and when that happened
9 the ruler would quite often come out and boys would be
10 hit over the back of the knuckles and that happened to
11 me, yes.

12 Q. On this occasion --

13 LADY SMITH: Where would your hands be when Father Duggan
14 hit you on the back of your knuckles?

15 A. They'd be on the desk.

16 LADY SMITH: Against a hard surface?

17 A. Yes, it'd be on a hard surface, so it was quite
18 a painful experience and the skin was broken.

19 LADY SMITH: Did he have a single ruler in his hand?

20 A. Yes, I think he had a single ruler, yes.

21 LADY SMITH: And you say it was the edge of the ruler?

22 A. It was always with the edge. It wasn't with the flat of
23 the ruler, no, it was the edge of the ruler.

24 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

25 MS MACLEOD: Was it a wooden ruler?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. Was he somebody who could lose his temper, Father Aidan
3 Duggan?
- 4 A. I think most of them were. Father Aidan was not
5 particularly inclined to lose his temper, I have to say,
6 but sometimes he could and he could be very unpleasant
7 when he did, sometimes resorting to physical punishment
8 and sometimes just humiliation of whoever it was that
9 was on the receiving end of his ill-temper. He could be
10 very harsh in humiliating boys, including myself on one
11 or two occasions.
- 12 Q. Can you tell me a little bit more to get a sense of
13 that? How would he humiliate boys?
- 14 A. I remember having done something wrong on one
15 occasion -- I think I was late to arrive for something
16 and I was made to kneel on the floor in front of the
17 master's desk in the study hall, which was one of these
18 old-fashioned raised teacher's desks, and he gave me
19 a great haranguing in front of the whole school, which
20 reduced me to tears. I was probably only 8 or 9 or 10
21 at the time, so it was quite unpleasant for a little by
22 to be harangued in that way in front of everybody else.
- 23 Q. Something you mention paragraph 82 of your statement is
24 that you say that:
25 "Father Aidan Duggan was an exotic priest in some

1 ways."

2 I wonder if you could perhaps elaborate on that.

3 A. He was. There was something about him that was a little
4 different. He was always very well-groomed and rather
5 suave in his manner. I mention in my statement he would
6 drift along the corridor leaving a smell of aftershave
7 behind him. He would read us stories from a Spanish
8 text sometimes -- he would read them in English to us,
9 of course.

10 Yes, he was Australian, of course; I guess that gave
11 him a certain glamour to our eyes in those days. There
12 was something that did make him stand out, but it was
13 difficult to put your finger on it.

14 LADY SMITH: Can I just take you back to your memory of you
15 having to kneel on the floor in the study hall and being
16 harangued in front of everybody. Do you have a memory
17 of that happening to anybody else?

18 A. No, I don't, actually. I can only remember that being
19 my own experience. I don't remember anyone else having
20 that. So obviously he was not happy with me.

21 LADY SMITH: Have you any memories of any other boys being
22 humiliated in front of the rest of the school or the
23 rest of the class by him?

24 A. I have. They could be humiliated for academic work, for
25 example. There was one lad there that I remember that

1 wasn't so gifted academically and struggled a lot with
2 his work. I remember one of the masters reading out the
3 marks and of course he had the bottom mark and somebody
4 said, "Bad luck", and the master said, "It wasn't bad
5 luck, it was bad work". So that's one example, but
6 there were many others, yes.

7 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

8 MS MACLEOD: Did you get the sense that there was one monk
9 or a member of staff in charge of discipline?

10 A. No, there wasn't really. It was quite arbitrary and
11 different -- Aidan Duggan, for example, as far as
12 I remember, was the only one I remember using the edge
13 of the ruler to hit people with. Father **MEW** used
14 to clip boys around the ears. This was his favourite
15 punishment: to come up behind the boy and give him
16 a thick ear, basically, with the edge of his hand.

17 I remember being beaten up as well -- I think
18 "beaten up" is not too strong a term. When I was in
19 fifth form I made one of my witty remarks, what
20 I considered witty, in the presence of Father **MFC**
21 **MFC** who was notoriously ill-tempered and he
22 basically beat me up, really. Oddly enough, I'd
23 forgotten about it until I was speaking to one of my
24 classmates two or three years ago and he reminded me
25 about this particular incident. When I reflect on it,

1 he really did lay into me, absolutely.

2 Q. Can you tell me about that? What did he do to you?

3 A. Slapping and possibly even punching. I was only
4 a little boy. I was sitting at my desk, he came up
5 towering over me in his black robes and really laid into
6 me.

7 Q. Do you recall which part of your body he was hitting?

8 A. It was the head, really. I think a lot of it was on my
9 head. I had to sort of protect myself. Yes, it wasn't
10 just a slap, it was a right -- really quite an
11 uncontrolled attack. I would describe it as something
12 like that.

13 Q. You describe it in your statement also as "a flurry of
14 blows".

15 A. Yes, it was a flurry of blows. Yes, I think there might
16 have been some punches as well.

17 Q. Were you crying? What was your response?

18 A. I just shrugged it off. You learned to do that and you
19 didn't tell your parents, you just got on with life.

20 Q. Do you recall other occasions when Father **MFC**

21 **MFC** lost his temper?

22 A. Not very much. I know he did lose his temper quite
23 a lot. He was a young man. Maybe monastic life was
24 proving too much of a challenge for him or whatever, but
25 yes, he did have that reputation and he could become

1 very irascible at times. That was the only incident
2 where I was on the receiving end of his ill-temper.

3 Q. Did you see other boys at other times being on the
4 receiving end?

5 A. Not being beaten by Father [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED], but I saw
6 Aidan Duggan and some the other staff hitting boys from
7 time to time, yes, of course. The [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] used to
8 belt people from time to time. That wasn't terribly
9 common at Carlekemp, actually, but it did happen as
10 well.

11 Q. Do you recall if a belt was used?

12 A. Yes, only the [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] used the belt and you had to
13 go and get it from the [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED], so you had to go to
14 his study and be belted by the [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED]. But that
15 wasn't so common at Carlekemp, whereas it was an
16 everyday occurrence at Fort Augustus.

17 Q. At Carlekemp, what kind of thing could lead to that
18 happening?

19 A. Oh, well, if you threw a cricket ball through a window
20 or something like that or you were caught smoking in the
21 woods or something of that sort. That would probably,
22 yes, result in the belt from the [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED], I guess.

23 Q. Do you recall if you were given the belt by the
24 [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED]?

25 A. Oh yes, I was. I can't remember what for now, but

1 I was, once or twice, yes. Not all that often at
2 Carlekemp.

3 Q. You mention in your statement at paragraph 85 that
4 Father Aidan Duggan was fond of reading stories to
5 children at bedtime.

6 A. He was, yes. He was. This was something the boys
7 looked forward to of course, a story at bedtime. This
8 was apparently something that was in loco parentis in
9 a sense. What would happen was all the boys would
10 gather in one of the dormitories and Father Aidan would
11 be there sitting on a bed with a torch, because
12 generally they were ghost stories, very often they were
13 ghost stories, and therefore the lights were put out and
14 he read the story in the dark or the semi-dark and the
15 boys were sitting on the other beds or sitting on the
16 floor round about. That was quite a regular thing, yes.

17 Q. Do you recall if there would be any contact between him
18 and any of the boys while this was happening?

19 A. I think there was. Not with me, I have to say, but
20 I think that there was one boy in particular who he
21 seemed to always be close to, and I think there was
22 something. I think there was physical contact of some
23 kind. I think there was a bit of cuddling going on. As
24 a boy, you didn't really think about it so much, but
25 looking back on it, I believe there was a bit of

1 cuddling going on, maybe I'm wrong, but I don't think
2 I am. I think there was cuddling, yes.

3 Q. Something else you mention is you say:

4 "To my more mature eye, it seemed like Aidan Duggan
5 and MFC were people with very poor
6 emotional intelligence."

7 I think you mention that at paragraph 88.

8 A. Well, emotional intelligence is a modern invention, you
9 know, but yes, they do. As I look back, in many ways
10 they did seem to be undeveloped, unrounded personalities
11 who didn't have the emotional maturity always to deal
12 with small boys. No, I don't think they did.

13 Q. You go on to say that they blew hot and cold.

14 A. Yes, they did. They did. Small boys are demanding to
15 work with, of course, but the circumstances in which
16 they were working were extremely favourable. I mean
17 they had for the most part very well-behaved boys and
18 very, very tiny groups compared to the average state
19 school, where classes are three or four times the size
20 and some of the children are not quite as tractable, yet
21 even this seemed to be a challenge for them.

22 I do think I say it in my statement that it seemed
23 to me that some of this was grooming, that the technique
24 was to be the bad teacher, the angry teacher, the harsh
25 teacher, particularly in respect of certain individual

1 boys, and then later on they would be as nice as
2 ninepence and of course the boy would feel very relieved
3 about this, yes. I think there were some strategies of
4 that kind in action. That of course is only something
5 that I think of now, looking back as a mature person,
6 but at the time there were a lot of inconsistencies in
7 behaviour evident.

8 Q. You've mentioned Father [REDACTED] MEW [REDACTED].

9 A. Yes, Father [REDACTED] MEW [REDACTED] yes.

10 Q. What is your recollection of his interactions with boys?

11 A. Well, he was quite a short chap with a crew cut and
12 National Health glasses. I think he was [REDACTED]
13 actually -- he used to teach [REDACTED] mostly in the
14 school. He liked to -- he was quite a ... He was okay
15 most of the time, but he was inclined to slap boys
16 around the ears a lot and so on and so forth, yes. This
17 was his favourite strategy in disciplinary terms.
18 He was a great slapper, but you just accepted that if
19 he was around and there was a lot of talking or noise or
20 something like that, and you were doing it and he was
21 around, there was the likelihood that you'd suddenly be
22 slapped on the head.

23 Q. Did something happen on one occasion at the end of the
24 school term involving him? I think you mention this in
25 paragraph 96 of your statement.

1 A. Yes, that's right, yes. He used to say,
2 "End-of-term-itis is a slapping disease", when we were
3 making a racket in the changing rooms or something like
4 that and he was there and somebody was guilty of
5 chattering too much or shouting or something like that
6 and he would slap them round the head, saying,
7 "End-of-term-itis is a slapping disease". We accepted
8 that: this was just how it was.

9 Q. What are your recollections of interactions between the
10 boys themselves at the school?

11 A. Well, the boys got on fairly well. I mean, for the most
12 part, they were just boys. There was silly behaviour
13 and there was nonsense and there was jokes and there was
14 practical jokes, and sometimes boys can be quite
15 unpleasant to each other. There was some unpleasantness
16 and fights now and again as well. And in some ways I do
17 think the ethos of schools like Carlekemp and
18 Fort Augustus encouraged those who were in a position to
19 throw their weight around to throw their weight around.
20 But it was less so at Carlekemp than at Fort Augustus.

21 Generally speaking, I think the boys got on pretty
22 well. Actually, one of the nicer parts of the
23 experience was the companionship of friends that one had
24 at such a place.

25 Q. I think you say that, other than the boys themselves,

1 Carlekemp wasn't a supportive school. You have touched
2 on that already.

3 A. No, no, no, it wasn't particularly. It was quite a good
4 training ground for Fort Augustus in that sense, that
5 you did learn to fall back on your own resourcefulness
6 and so on, and be quite independent and quite insular
7 for your own protection.

8 Q. There came a time then when you were of an age to leave
9 Carlekemp and move on to Fort Augustus.

10 A. Yes, that's right.

11 Q. What do you recall about the anticipation of that move
12 and your preparation for it?

13 A. Well, of course the monks that were at Carlekemp were
14 also -- there were monks at Fort Augustus Abbey, so they
15 knew about the Abbey School -- we used to call it "the
16 Fort" when we were at Carlekemp -- and we used to ask
17 them about the Fort and the abiding response was that it
18 was terribly strict.

19 It's almost like a variation of Stockhausen syndrome
20 (sic). We came to admire strictness in a sense. It was
21 terribly strict and there were prefects at the Fort who
22 were terribly strict and there was an enormous amount of
23 work to do and if you didn't do it properly, that would
24 be terribly strict as well. So it was a pretty austere
25 image we got from questioning the monks about the Fort.

1 Q. You tell us in your statement that you were 13 when you
2 moved up to Fort Augustus.

3 A. I was, yes.

4 Q. And we can see from records that the inquiry has
5 recovered from the English Benedictine Congregation that
6 it was on [REDACTED] 1959 that you were admitted to
7 Fort Augustus when you would have been 13.

8 A. Yes, I didn't know that date. It's not a great date in
9 my life, but yes, that's true, it must be.

10 Q. First of all, had you visited Fort Augustus before you
11 went there?

12 A. No. No, I'd never been there.

13 Q. What was your initial impression then of the school?

14 A. Of course, I arrived there along with a number of boys
15 who had been at Carlekemp, so I wasn't completely alone
16 in the place, and the routines were not too dissimilar.
17 I remember being inducted into Fort Augustus by being
18 spoken to by the housemaster -- there were two houses in
19 Fort Augustus, Lovat and Vaughan, I was in Lovat
20 house -- and the housemaster was Father [REDACTED] MFE
21 and Father [REDACTED] MFE had me in and spoke to me in quite
22 an avuncular fashion and welcomed me and said, "You'll
23 know the ropes, you were at Carlekemp". And, yes,
24 I think our first impression as Carlekemp boys when we
25 looked at the timetable was the horror of the amount of

1 work we were supposed to do. It looked absolutely
2 unending. There was far longer preparation periods
3 in the evening at Fort Augustus than had been the case
4 at Carlekemp, which is reasonable enough, I suppose.

5 And yes, it just looked like a mountain of work.
6 That was the initial impression, and not a particularly
7 comforting environment.

8 Q. In terms of the location of Fort Augustus, it was quite
9 a different situation to Carlekemp. What was your
10 impression of the location?

11 A. I didn't mind it being up there in the Highlands. I'd
12 been up to the Highlands a lot as a boy and I liked that
13 part of the world a lot, so I was quite happy to go to
14 the middle of the Great Glen and so on and it wasn't
15 a problem for me.

16 Q. And unlike Carlekemp, you tell us in your statement that
17 there was a monastic community also at Fort Augustus.

18 A. Yes, there was, of course, yes, that's right. There was
19 a community of choir monks and brothers at
20 Fort Augustus.

21 Q. Some of these monks were involved in the school?

22 A. Some of them were, yes; not all of them.

23 Q. In relation to the ones that weren't involved in the
24 school, would you see these other monks from time to
25 time?

1 A. Well, we saw them at Masses and at religious ceremonies
2 and occasionally just in our free time walking around
3 we would bump into them. Some of them were very
4 distant. We knew who they were, but we didn't have
5 anything to do with them at all. Others were a little
6 more forthcoming and would stop and speak to us, but it
7 was mostly the ones working in the school we got to know
8 obviously.

9 Q. I'll put a photograph on the screen for you:
10 WIT.003.001.9435.

11 A. Yes, that is the place for sure, yes.

12 Q. Looking at that photograph -- it is actually also on the
13 screen behind you, Harry. I wonder if I could just --
14 first of all, looking at the photograph on the screen,
15 could you tell me which part is the school?

16 A. Yes. You can see the tower there with the doorway
17 at the base of the tower, and that was where we went in.
18 The buildings to the right of that were school
19 buildings. There was a new wing built on the school
20 when I was there in the 1960s. The money for it was put
21 up by somebody called Sir James Calder, about whom
22 I know absolutely nothing. I think this picture maybe
23 pre-dates that, I'm not sure. I can't see the new wing
24 anywhere.

25 Certainly, yes ... Well, that's from the loch side,

1 just a moment. Ah no, no, I realise we're looking at it
2 from a different angle. You see down to the right-hand
3 side of the picture, there's the boathouse down there.
4 The boathouse -- we were allowed to walk down to the
5 boathouse. But what you're seeing in front of -- sorry,
6 I've misled you.

7 What you are seeing there is -- that part of the
8 building is the monastery and the grass lawns in front
9 of it are parts of the monks' garden. To the right of
10 the picture, to the right of the building, you'll notice
11 another tower, and you might just be able to make out
12 the clock face in that tower. Can you see that?

13 LADY SMITH: Right at the back, the back right?

14 A. Yes. At the very right extremity of the building,
15 there's a tower -- I think there's possibly even
16 a flagpole on top and there's a clock face. That's the
17 clock tower, and it was at the base of the clock tower
18 that we entered the building. The school buildings are
19 actually on the far side of the clock tower from where
20 this photograph has been taken, on the village side of
21 the building. This is the loch side of the building and
22 that's the monastery you're looking at there.

23 MS MACLEOD: I might put another photograph on the screen to
24 try and get a different view: it's at INQ.001.004.1983.

25 A. Yes, okay. You can see the clock tower there, and the

1 school buildings are to the right of the clock tower --
2 and to the left, actually, I think those were school
3 buildings. We used to go in at the base of the clock
4 tower there.

5 Q. In the centre front of the photograph?

6 A. Yes, the centre front. Just behind, you can see part of
7 the cloisters and beyond the cloisters is the
8 chapterhouse and beyond the cloisters the big building
9 at the back is the church. In fact, the new wing is
10 here too. To the right front of the building you'll see
11 the flat roofed area: that was the new wing.

12 Q. Behind the trees?

13 A. Yes, behind those fir trees. That was the new wing that
14 was put on in my time there in the 1960s.

15 Q. Thank you.

16 You mentioned that Father Aidan Duggan transferred
17 to Fort Augustus more or less at the same time as
18 yourself.

19 A. He did, yes, that's correct.

20 Q. What was his role? Was he involved in the school or
21 not?

22 A. No, he wasn't. He transferred -- and I believe he was
23 the bursar -- I know he was the bursar in fact -- and
24 I think he may have also been the novice master, but
25 he wasn't involved in the school. No, not at

1 Fort Augustus.

2 Q. Who was [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED] at Fort Augustus when you
3 arrived?

4 A. When I arrived it was Father [REDACTED] MFF [REDACTED].

5 Q. And did that change?

6 A. It did. In my last year or two, he was replaced by
7 Father [REDACTED] MKT [REDACTED].

8 Q. You have mentioned already the two houses --

9 A. Yes, Lovat and Vaughan.

10 Q. And helpfully in your statement you provide some
11 background for us of where these names came from in
12 paragraph 113.

13 A. Yes. That's correct, yes.

14 Q. You've mentioned already that the housemasters were
15 significant figures --

16 A. Very much so, yes.

17 Q. -- at Fort Augustus. Can you tell me a little bit about
18 who the two housemasters were and what their role was?

19 A. Yes. Father [REDACTED] MFE [REDACTED] was the housemaster of
20 Vaughan and I had quite a lot to do with him. He had
21 been the housemaster of Vaughan for a very long time by
22 the time I got there.

23 The housemaster of -- I beg your pardon,
24 Father [REDACTED] MFE [REDACTED] had been the housemaster of Lovat
25 when I got there.

1 The housemaster of Vaughan was Father Celestine
2 Haworth initially but then he was replaced by Father
3 ██████████ MFG ██████████, because in fact Father Celestine
4 was made the abbot, so he left the school to become the
5 abbot and Father ██████████ MFG ██████████, who was a younger
6 monk, took his place.

7 Q. And Father ██████████ MFE ██████████ as the housemaster of Lovat,
8 what was his role?

9 A. Mostly it was to do with discipline and sport. He did
10 teach, but he only taught ██████████. If you've
11 read James Joyce's novel "Portrait of the Artist as
12 a Young Man", there is a Father Dolan in that novel who
13 is very similar to Father ██████████ MFE ██████████. He basically
14 looked after the discipline of the house, particularly,
15 although sometimes his disciplinary arm stretched to
16 boys who were in the other house as well. He taught
17 ██████████ and he was also very big in sport,
18 particularly in rugby.

19 Q. You say that the mix of people at Fort Augustus was
20 quite a funny mix -- I think you describe it in that
21 way -- that people came from very different backgrounds.

22 A. They did.

23 Q. Could you elaborate upon that?

24 A. Again, there were some forces children whose parents
25 moved around a lot and who decided to send their

1 children to a boarding school. There were some English
2 boys from English Catholic families, who had opted for
3 Fort Augustus in preference to maybe Ampleforth or one
4 of the English Catholic schools. There were quite a lot
5 of boys from Glasgow who often came from Italian
6 backgrounds and sometimes Polish backgrounds. There
7 were some boys also with Polish names, Polish
8 backgrounds.

9 There were a small number of people who could be
10 said to belong to the landed gentry, they'd be sons of
11 the landed gentry, and of course they did make an
12 enormous contrast with the sort of Irish Catholic boys
13 who were the sons of bookies and restaurant owners and
14 things like that in Glasgow. So it was quite a mix and
15 quite a cross-section of people, absolutely. Very
16 different.

17 Q. What's your recollection of the number of boys?

18 A. I think when I was there, the school was as big as it
19 had been for quite some time, and even then I think
20 there was only 120 boys in the school.

21 Q. And the age range?

22 A. Well, when you went to Fort Augustus from Carlekemp, you
23 went into second form, so the first form would have been
24 aged about 12 and you left at age 18. So it would be 12
25 to 18, basically.

1 Q. Which monks do you remember being involved in the school
2 at Fort Augustus?

3 A. Well, there was Father MFF who was SNR, and
4 the two housemasters were Father MFE and
5 mostly Father MFG for most of the time
6 I was there. Father MKT who eventually
7 replaced Father MFF as SNR
8 Father MKT taught . Father Celestine
9 Haworth, before he became abbot, also did teach maths as
10 well. There was a Father Philip who taught art.

11 There must have been a few others. Those are some
12 of the principal ones at any rate and then there were
13 some lay teachers as well.

14 Q. Do you recall there being a Father MEY at any
15 point?

16 A. Yes, Father MEY .
17 I don't remember him being in the school in my
18 time, but I think he was in later years. He was in the
19 monastic community, certainly.

20 Q. And what about Father MEV ?

21 A. Father MEV was in the monastic community
22 when I was there. Again, he was somebody that we
23 occasionally spoke to and we knew who he was, but we
24 didn't in my day have really anything much to do with
25 him, no.

1 Q. You mention a few [REDACTED] teachers who were in the school as
2 well.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. I think you mention a [REDACTED] MIH [REDACTED] who was a teacher.

5 A. That's right. He was a [REDACTED], [REDACTED] MIH [REDACTED].

6 He had qualified, as I understand, as a primary teacher
7 and been to [REDACTED] -- one of the very few teachers
8 actually who had any formal teaching qualification.

9 Most of them were university graduates but I don't think
10 they'd actually been through teacher training, although
11 whether teacher training helps or not is open to debate.

12 But [REDACTED] MIH [REDACTED] was a [REDACTED]. He was a
13 qualified primary teacher and he taught junior
14 classes -- [REDACTED] mostly, and [REDACTED] I think -- but
15 he was a very active [REDACTED] and he was very active in
16 [REDACTED]. He was pretty much the [REDACTED] as much as
17 anything else. He and [REDACTED] MFE [REDACTED] between them did
18 an enormous amount in the [REDACTED] dimension.

19 Q. What was the set-up with the dorms at Fort Augustus?

20 A. It was rather different at Fort Augustus. Most of my
21 time was spent in a traditional dormitory, which had
22 cubicles, so you had a little bit of privacy. There
23 wasn't much privacy at these schools, but you had your
24 own cubicle. It was open at the end, so obviously you
25 could see into the cubicle opposite. But yes, we had

- 1 cubicles. We had basically a bed. We had a locker
2 where we kept our clothes. That was pretty much it.
- 3 Q. I'm going to put a photograph on the screen now.
4 I don't know the date when this photograph was taken,
5 but we'll see if you recognise it: BEN.001.003.5161.
- 6 A. That's one of the dormitories in the new wing. That's
7 one of the new wing dormitories. There are no cubicles
8 there and you can tell by the shape and design of the
9 windows and the ceiling as well that that is the new
10 wing. Vaughan House were -- when the new wing was
11 opened, Vaughan House moved into the dormitories there,
12 so I was never in those. I was in the old dormitories
13 in the old part of the building which had big wooden
14 cubicles.
- 15 Q. I think you tell us that there was -- a part of the
16 school lore was that the new building may have been
17 haunted.
- 18 A. It wasn't the new building, it was the old building that
19 was haunted. The old building was reputedly haunted and
20 the new boys were told about the breather that you could
21 hear stalking the dormitories at different times. This
22 was one of the things that, yes, you did hear about.
- 23 Q. And in relation to the routine at Fort Augustus, could
24 you tell me briefly what that entailed, the daily
25 routine?

1 A. It wasn't so different from Carlekemp in some ways but
2 it was in others. We got up about 6.45 --
3 Father MFE slept in what was in my dormitory known
4 as the prep dormitory, I don't exactly know why. He
5 slept in one of the cubicles but he had the privilege of
6 a curtain over his cubicle. He slept there and he would
7 get up and ring a bell. He was dressed in his monk's
8 habit by this time -- of course, he'd obviously got up
9 earlier.

10 We said our morning prayers, we went down to the
11 basement, washed at the sinks, went back up to the house
12 meeting room. The housemaster would make any
13 announcements that needed to be made, another prayer
14 would be said I imagine. After that we processed
15 through the cloisters to the church, we attended Mass,
16 we came back to the main building, where we went to the
17 refectory.

18 We had breakfast in the refectory. Brother Adrian
19 was there dishing out enormous plates of lumpy porridge
20 and tea that tasted like tar. That would be about 8
21 o'clock in the morning. We were in class from 8.30 to
22 lunchtime with a short break somewhere in the middle.
23 Classes were generally, I think, 40 minutes long.

24 Lunchtime was, I think, about half past 12 or maybe
25 12.45, and then after lunch we had a little bit of spare

1 time and we had to go and look at the sports
2 noticeboards because very often there were different
3 things organised and we had to see if our name was on
4 the board and what kind of kit we had to get changed
5 into and so on and so forth. Most of the matches were
6 organised for about 2 o'clock. They went on until
7 approximately 3.30 or 4 o'clock, by which time we'd
8 showered and put on our ordinary clothes.

9 There was afternoon tea at 4 o'clock. After
10 afternoon tea at 4.15, or thereabouts, there were two
11 more classes, each 40 minutes long, lasting until the
12 back of 5 o'clock, something like 5.10 maybe, we had our
13 final class of the day.

14 There was a break after that, for maybe 20 minutes,
15 and then at 5.30 you had an hour and a half of prep and
16 you had to go to the study hall, just as in Carlekemp
17 there had been a study hall, so also in Fort Augustus
18 there was a study hall where you had a desk in the study
19 hall and you went to your study hall desk at 5.30.

20 The preps were very organised. On Monday it was
21 maybe, I don't know, Latin, English and geography, on
22 Tuesday it was maths, science and so on. And your
23 teachers would set you prep, so you had to do things.
24 So that went on until 7 o'clock.

25 At 7 o'clock you got up from prep and you went back

1 to the refectory, grace was said, and you had your
2 evening meal. After the evening meal, you had free time
3 until 8 o'clock, and then you went back to the study
4 hall for second preps at 8 o'clock. Second preps lasted
5 for an hour from 8 o'clock to 9 o'clock.

6 After second preps you were in bed quite soon
7 afterwards -- I don't remember whether there were more
8 prayers -- there were a lot of prayers, you know, you
9 spent a lot of time praying -- and then by round about
10 9.15 or 9.30, possibly, it was bedtime, and after that
11 lights out, no radios, no talking, go to sleep, which we
12 mostly did, of course.

13 Q. Thank you for that. It sounds a long and busy day.

14 A. Yes, it was.

15 Q. I'm going to put another photograph on the screen for
16 you: BEN.001.003.5155.

17 A. Yes. That is the new hall in the new building that was
18 constructed when I was there in the 1960s with money
19 donated by Sir James Calder. The building had an
20 assembly hall with a stage and so on and, yes, that's
21 what that is.

22 Q. So that's not the house meeting room?

23 A. No, that's not a house meeting room. That was the
24 assembly hall.

25 Q. Thank you.

1 A. If we had a whole school assembly, that's where we would
2 assemble, yes.

3 Q. You've mentioned lunch being served and in relation to
4 that, I'll put this photograph on the screen:

5 BEN.001.003.5157.

6 A. Yes, that's the refectory with the corbie, above the
7 fireplace. The corbie was the symbol of Fort Augustus,
8 because, if you don't know this, a crow is supposed to
9 have taken a piece of poisoned bread that St Benedict
10 was about to eat, so the corbie with the bit of bread in
11 its mouth was the symbol of Fort Augustus.

12 That's the refectory where we had our meals. The
13 **SNR** table was just under the high windows that
14 you see at the end there. Then at the end closest to
15 where the photograph has been taken, there were two
16 tables and housemasters sat at the end of each of these
17 tables. There was -- obviously the tables were in
18 houses, so there were Lovat and Vaughan tables.

19 Q. I think you tell us in your statement that there was
20 a certain tradition in relation to **SNR**
21 table.

22 A. Well, not during the days of Father **MFF**, but
23 I believe there had been a tradition that had existed
24 previously that was started again by Father **MKT**
25 **MKT** of having a boy at **SNR** table to have

1 lunch with him. An experience that was painful in the
2 extreme, I can assure you, in view of the whole school.
3 But we had to take turns to have lunch with Father
4 **MKT** or **MKT** as we called him, who was
5 a somewhat otherworldly figure.

6 But fortunately, I had translated one of Ovid's
7 poems into broad Scots and he was absolutely delighted
8 with that, so we talked about that. I don't know if
9 I hadn't done that, what we would have talked about.

10 Q. What do you recall about the washing and showering
11 routines at the school?

12 A. Ah, well, yes. We had down in the basements quite vast
13 wash-hand basins, ranks and ranks of wash-hand basins
14 and baths and showers. So generally speaking in the
15 morning you went down there and you took your towel and
16 your things -- just next to the washing area in the
17 basement there were also the two changing rooms, Lovat
18 and Vaughan changing rooms, where you had a locker where
19 you kept your sports kit basically. So we'd go down
20 there in the morning to basically wash and clean our
21 teeth and things like that.

22 One day a week, you had a bath. There was a bath
23 day and the baths were used by different groups on
24 different days of the week. Showers were mostly taken
25 after sport, after games, when we came in all muddied

1 from the rugby field and things like that.

2 Q. Do you recall if the showering and bathing was
3 supervised?

4 A. Yes. There was always somebody around, certainly the
5 showering was always supervised. The morning washing,
6 I don't think so much, but certainly showering was
7 always supervised. There was always a master there.

8 Q. Something you comment on in your statement, Harry, is
9 the lack of privacy. You say:

10 "The whole place was characterised by absolutely no
11 privacy."

12 Is that something that you felt at the time?

13 A. Yes. You learned to cope with it, you created your own
14 privacy, but it's true, there was no privacy. You
15 absolutely had no privacy. You were always seen by
16 other people. There was nowhere to go and be alone, not
17 really. No, it was not a private place at all.

18 LADY SMITH: Just going back to the supervision of
19 showering, where would the master be in relation to the
20 boys who were showering?

21 A. Usually fairly close. Not close enough to contact, but
22 within sight of, yes. Certainly standing close by.

23 LADY SMITH: Right. Were there individual showers?

24 A. No, no, it was just a great big row of open showers.

25 Interestingly enough, I don't know if I put this in my

1 account earlier or not, but the routine in respect of
2 showering originally was that Abbey boys wore a unique
3 garment for showering. This was known as a loiner,
4 which essentially consisted of two pieces of cloth tied
5 together with a cord. However, it was decided at some
6 time during my stay there that loiners were not going to
7 be used any more and showering was naked after that.

8 MS MACLEOD: Do you recall who supervised the showers?

9 A. Usually the master who had been supervising the rugby
10 match. Sometimes it was Father [REDACTED] MFG .
11 He took the rugby matches sometimes, sometimes it was
12 Father [REDACTED] MFE . I don't remember
13 [REDACTED] MIH the [REDACTED] teacher [REDACTED]
14 [REDACTED] doing it, but these two monks did quite a bit,
15 yes.

16 Q. What are your memories of the teaching at Fort Augustus?

17 A. Well, I think I found it very -- quite variable, and
18 like most young lads, I had teachers that I liked, some
19 more than others. We had some good teaching and some
20 teaching that I found harder to get to grips with, so
21 I think variable.

22 There were some things about it that have to be said
23 though. We were talking earlier about how insular
24 Fort Augustus was in many ways. A very good example of
25 this is in respect of the [REDACTED] curriculum. In the

1 1960s, the Scottish authorities decided to introduce
2 a new textbook for the [REDACTED] Higher, called "The
3 Approach to [REDACTED]", maybe some of you here remember it,
4 I don't know. The emphasis of this particular textbook
5 or the idea behind it was to introduce more civic
6 vocabulary into the [REDACTED] curriculum, so instead of
7 having your head filled with the vocabulary of wars,
8 cohorts and shields and spears and strategies and things
9 like that, you would have much more civic vocabulary.

10 LADY SMITH: Was this the textbook that succeeded the
11 [REDACTED] textbook?

12 A. I think it might have been. It was called "The Approach
13 to [REDACTED]". I don't know who the author was, but
14 I remember Father [REDACTED] MKT [REDACTED] rejecting it
15 completely: "We don't want to approach [REDACTED]", he said,
16 "we want to get there". And consequently we were
17 studying for the Higher [REDACTED] syllabus from the wrong
18 book. So when we arrived at the [REDACTED] exam, of course
19 the vocabulary was largely unknown to us. There was all
20 sorts of vocabulary there that we just hadn't
21 encountered. We were full of spears and shields and
22 strategies and military vocabulary and so obviously
23 Higher [REDACTED] was even more of a challenge than it might
24 otherwise have been. That was Fort Augustus: away in
25 a world of their own.

1 MS MACLEOD: Something you do say is that the brighter boys
2 that were emerging from Fort Augustus had a much poorer
3 collection of examination results than brighter pupils
4 who came from the state schools.

5 A. That was quite evident, yes. There were bright boys at
6 Fort Augustus, but when you looked at the collection of
7 Highers they amassed, they weren't nearly as good as
8 those from state schools.

9 Q. Why do you think that was?

10 A. Well, I think the teaching was out of touch.
11 I mentioned somewhere there that a Mr McKechan came from
12 state schools to Fort Augustus to teach French and he
13 was saying, "You're way behind your peers in the state
14 system in the level of French that you've reached". So
15 the bright boys got there, but I think obviously could
16 have done better with a different education.

17 Some individual teaching was very good. There was
18 some very good individual teaching.

19 Q. Just to set the scene for us a little bit more, I'll put
20 a photograph on the screen for you: BEN.001.003.5153.

21 A. Yes. A classroom, which I remember sitting in myself --
22 in fact, I remember Father MKT sitting at
23 that high table, trying to explain to us the difference
24 between [REDACTED]. So yes, a familiar
25 sight.

1 Q. Thank you.

2 A comparison you make in your statement -- this is
3 at paragraph 165 -- is between the boys you encountered
4 at Fort Augustus and those you met during school
5 holidays when you were at home. I think you say that it
6 was quite a revelation for you at the time to meet and
7 get to know those boys. I wondered if you could tell
8 me --

9 A. It was, absolutely. I was the delicate boy, too
10 delicate to mix with all these rough-and-tumble types
11 from the local schools. But when I actually did meet
12 them, I got on great with them. I found them very
13 welcoming and friendly. They didn't have any prejudice
14 against me because I went to a posh school or because
15 I was a Catholic. We played football and messed about
16 together and in many ways the kind of ambience and
17 relationships we had were much easier than those at
18 Fort Augustus, yes.

19 Q. We mentioned sport in passing. What role did sport have
20 in life at Fort Augustus?

21 A. Well, it had a very exalted role. There was no question
22 about it. There was enormous emphasis placed on sport
23 and sporting success, and if you were lucky enough to be
24 athletic and do well at sports, life was a little bit
25 easier for you. But for those boys who were really --

1 for whom sport was something distasteful and so on, they
2 did suffer terribly. It was very difficult for them.

3 Q. I think you say you played other schools as well as
4 interschool teams?

5 A. Yes, we did. We played other schools from Inverness and
6 Fort William and so on. Geography made it a little bit
7 difficult, but yes we did, yes.

8 Q. In relation to sports, something you say at
9 paragraph 169 is:

10 "You never got any applause for being honest or
11 decent or kind to the guys around you or for achieving
12 anything in the arts or whatever, it was always sports.
13 Sport was god."

14 A. Well, it's true, it was. Sport was acknowledged by the
15 school authorities. If somebody got their colours or
16 their half colours in a sport, there would be a great
17 deal of fuss made about this and a great deal of
18 attention and they'd be given an enormous amount of
19 applause for this. But that was the only thing that was
20 really recognised. Nothing else was. That was how it
21 was.

22 Q. "Three-weeklies" is something you tell us about in your
23 statement.

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Could you tell me what they are or what they were?

1 A. That's right. Well, the tradition was that every
2 three weeks there would be a day off, and this was on
3 a Monday, and you knew it would happen at 9 o'clock on
4 a Monday -- obviously you'd been counting and you could
5 anticipate which day would be likely to be
6 a three-weekly holiday. At 9 o'clock on a Monday, there
7 would be a double buzzer, the buzzer would go twice, and
8 this meant it was a three-weekly holiday, which meant
9 that there were no classes for the day and we were all
10 going to go out and spend time in the countryside.

11 It didn't happen every three weeks because religious
12 festivals happened quite often and they took the place
13 and disrupted the pattern of the three-weeklies, but it
14 did happen quite often, and for the younger forms they
15 used to go off in big groups to some location in the
16 countryside with sausages and sandwiches and tins and
17 stoves and things like that and your outdoor clothes.
18 The younger groups went off in class groups with
19 a teacher.

20 The older groups, from third form onwards, went in
21 groups of three and they had to leave a note with their
22 housemaster about where they were going and you had to
23 be back at about 4 in the afternoon. So the whole
24 school vanished into the countryside for the day and
25 just went out and enjoyed themselves in the fresh air.

- 1 Q. Were these happy times for you?
- 2 A. Yes, they were. For the most part they were happy times
3 and we enjoyed that, yes.
- 4 Q. Do you recall any inspections of Fort Augustus while you
5 were there?
- 6 A. Never.
- 7 Q. Did it feel to you at the time like it was very much on
8 its own, an isolated place, at the time?
- 9 A. Yes, it did. I think when we went home for the holidays
10 and so on, and we became aware of pop culture, if you
11 like, which was beginning to emerge at the time, we
12 realised just how remote we were and how insular we were
13 up there. It was like a bubble, really.
- 14 Q. You tell us in your statement that you yourself didn't
15 run away, but do you recall some boys absconding from
16 the school.
- 17 A. Yes, there were one or two attempts to run away, and
18 I don't know too much about them. The unfortunate boys
19 were generally brought back from somewhere like
20 Fort William, which was the usual destination, and I'm
21 not quite sure what happened to the boys who tried to
22 run away.
- 23 Q. You go to tell us in your statement about two specific
24 incidents that you recall from your time at the school.
25 The first of those you mention in paragraph 188 of your

1 statement and it relates to a fire that you recall.

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. Could you tell me about that?

4 A. Yes. We were awakened in the middle of the night with
5 the fire alarm going and the dormitory was full of
6 smoke. We were filed out of the building down to a
7 nearby -- there was a wooden gymnasium nearby which was
8 completely separate from the school and we went there
9 and spent the evening there while the building burnt,
10 basically. The abbey had -- the monks had a fire
11 brigade themselves and the local Fire Brigade came to
12 try and put the fire out, which they eventually did,
13 of course.

14 Q. I think you tell us you think this was in your second or
15 third year, so 1960 or 1961?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. What's your recollection of how the fire started? What
18 were you told about it?

19 A. I believe it was arson by one of the boys and the boy
20 was never seen again, of course. But this little lad
21 hadn't been happy. He'd evidently been saying to his
22 friends he was going to do it and the building went up.

23 It was potentially a very serious fire. It could
24 have killed a lot of people, actually, but fortunately
25 one of the monks was an insomniac and was wandering

1 around the cloisters in the middle of the night and
2 smelt the smoke and raised the alarm, so it wasn't as
3 bad as it might have been. It was bad enough though.

4 Q. The other thing you tell us about is in relation to the
5 death of a boy --

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. -- during your time.

8 A. Yes, we lost a boy whose name I remember well and I knew
9 well. He actually played the viola in the school string
10 quartet and the played the cello. This was on
11 a three-weekly holiday. The class had been taken to
12 Glendoe boathouse, which is on the south shore of
13 Loch Ness -- it's a very steep-sided loch, Loch Ness, of
14 course, and there's a burn that tumbles down the side of
15 the loch into Loch Ness at a place called Glendoe and
16 there's a boathouse there. This was the destination
17 where they had done to eat their sausages and mess about
18 in the fresh air and so forth and so on.

19 Q. Were you yourself on the trip?

20 A. I wasn't on the trip, no. So I can't really comment
21 with any authority about what happened, but I believe
22 that the body was seen floating in the loch. The boy in
23 question had been wearing a red rugby top and a local
24 man had seen something red in the water and when he'd
25 gone to investigate, he discovered it was the dead body

1 of my schoolmate.

2 It was very, very sad. This was a horrible thing,
3 but I don't know the circumstances under which he came
4 to fall into the water and be found in the loch.

5 I wasn't there myself.

6 Q. What do you remember hearing about it at the time?

7 A. Nothing that you can really put your finger on. It was
8 pretty much regarded as being an accident of some kind.
9 Knowing Glendoe and knowing the area, it's difficult to
10 understand, for example, how the lad could have fallen
11 off the banks of the burn, which are very, very steep.
12 You could fall off them, and if you did fall off them
13 you could come to harm when you hit the bottom of the
14 burn, but it's hard to imagine -- and the water could be
15 strong in the burn as well, but it's hard to imagine how
16 that could have happened and the body could have been
17 swept out into the loch without the other boys seeing
18 it -- there must have been 20 or 30 boys playing around
19 the banks.

20 So it was very mysterious and I don't know really
21 what happened. It was really the sadness of the thing
22 that struck me more than anything. It was an extremely
23 tragic event.

24 Q. Were you at the boy's funeral?

25 A. Yes, I was -- in fact, we all were, the whole school was

1 at the funeral. He was buried in the monks' burial
2 ground and I was actually a server at the mass.

3 MS MACLEOD: My Lady, I'm moving on to a slightly different
4 chapter.

5 LADY SMITH: Maybe we should take a short break at this
6 point. I always take a break at some stage in the
7 morning, Harry, to allow the witness a breather and also
8 to allow the stenographers a breather. I think we'll do
9 that now and start again once you're comfortable.

10 (11.42 am)

11 (A short break)

12 (11.58 am)

13 LADY SMITH: Harry, are you okay to carry on?

14 A. Yes, I'm fine, thank you.

15 LADY SMITH: Ms MacLeod.

16 MS MACLEOD: My Lady.

17 Harry, can I now move on to ask you about the
18 discipline regime at Fort Augustus. Was there somebody
19 in charge of discipline at Fort Augustus?

20 A. Yes. Discipline was quite different at Fort Augustus,
21 really. At Carlekemp it was more ad hoc and arbitrary
22 and so on, but at Fort Augustus it was much more formal
23 and graduated.

24 Really, the housemasters were the main supervisors
25 of discipline at the Abbey School. Discipline was

1 mostly corporal punishment, but there was some written
2 punishments as well.

3 The two housemasters -- the SNR was also
4 involved in administering corporal punishment, but the
5 difference was that, generally speaking, the SNR
6 only administered corporal punishment in respect of
7 perceived academic failure or weakness or laziness,
8 basically, whereas the housemasters dealt with all
9 disciplinary matters apart from that.

10 So the disciplinary arrangements depended on the
11 authoritarian structure of the school. The prefects,
12 known as "pots", basically acted on behalf of the school
13 authorities to find out who had transgressed the code of
14 petty rules.

15 Most of this related to tidiness, something at which
16 I wasn't particularly good. We had basement lockers
17 where we kept our sports kit, we had study hall desks
18 and we had dormitory lockers as well. And these were
19 inspected from time to time by the pots and they
20 essentially, if you were found to have or adjudged to
21 have an untidy locker or desk by the pots, you were
22 marked down for punishment by your housemaster.

23 An example of this would be in the study hall in the
24 middle of prep, you'd be doing your prep and a voice
25 from the back of the hall would say, "Keep your desks

1 closed". So you weren't allowed to open your desks.
2 Then the pots or the prefects would march down to the
3 front of the study hall and you'd have to open your desk
4 so that they could have a look inside. That was all
5 duly done and eventually they worked their way from the
6 front of the hall to the back of the hall. When they
7 got to the back of the hall and all the desks had been
8 inspected they would announce, "The following have got
9 the stick", it wasn't a stick, actually, I'll mention
10 what it is in a moment, "for an untidy study hall desk".
11 They wouldn't read out your names, everybody had
12 a number. I was [REDACTED] and I'd been [REDACTED] at Carlekemp as
13 well. Everybody had a number, so the numbers were all
14 read out.

15 If your number was read out, you knew that the next
16 day after lunch, you'd have to go to your housemaster to
17 get the stick, essentially. This also applied to
18 basement lockers and dormitory lockers as well and to
19 a number of other petty offences.

20 So getting the stick was a daily practice, a daily
21 thing that you witnessed -- I don't mean it was daily
22 for each individual person, but it was something that
23 happened virtually every day at Fort Augustus. I don't
24 think there were many days when somebody didn't get the
25 stick.

1 After lunch, after having gone through the evening
2 and the following morning's classes knowing that you
3 were going to get the stick, and eating your lunch
4 knowing you were going to get the stick, you all had to
5 go to the housemaster's office to get the stick.

6 The stick was not a stick, it was a leather belt --
7 it was a tawse in Scots terminology -- and it was given
8 in different doses. The most lenient punishment of the
9 tawse at Fort Augustus in the mythology of the school
10 was twice-two, which was two strokes on each hand, but
11 nobody ever got that. In practice the minimum was
12 twice-three. So the minimum punishment, corporal
13 punishment, of the disciplinary regime at Fort Augustus
14 was six strokes of the belt for the least serious
15 offences.

16 Twice-four, twice-five, and the most serious belting
17 was twice-six, 12 strokes of the belt. In the mythology
18 of the school there was also something called "double
19 twice-six", but I think that was pretty much mythology.
20 Then that was really the first level of corporal
21 punishment, the belting level.

22 Q. Was that done in the housemaster's room?

23 A. It was done in the housemaster's room, and in the case
24 of Lovat House, the housemaster's room was just opposite
25 the tuck shop. So on one side of the corridor you had

1 boys queueing up to buy sweets and on the other side of
2 the corridor you could hear the crack of the belt as the
3 unfortunates were being belted.

4 This was every day. I mean you got used to even the
5 rhythm of the twice-three, it was something you heard
6 every day -- and you got it yourself, of course, from
7 time to time as well.

8 Q. So would the boys be queueing up outside the room --

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. -- and then go in one by one?

11 A. Yes, they did. They queued up and went in. But the
12 door was always open so everybody could see this going
13 on. This happened all the time.

14 But punishment happened at other times too.
15 Sometimes if somebody had been adjudged to do something
16 wrong and deserved the belt, that was nothing to do --
17 maybe not an untidy locker or it hadn't been a referral
18 from a prefect but some other incident had arisen, they
19 could be taken to the housemaster's study and belted at
20 some other time of the day, and this wouldn't have been
21 seen by anybody else. But the routine twice-three
22 punishments went on pretty much every day, yes.

23 Q. And the regime of the prefects, or the pots, supervising
24 and looking at how things were, is this something that
25 went on throughout the day?

1 A. Yes. That's right. The prefects had duties to do,
2 mostly to do with discipline and enforcing the code of
3 behaviour and code of tidiness and so on and so forth.
4 They inspected your hands before you went into the
5 refectory to make sure they were clean. They did these
6 quiet and secret inspections when you weren't expecting
7 them of lockers and desks and so on and so forth. They
8 were always around.

9 They couldn't administer corporal punishment
10 themselves, they could give -- it wasn't actually lines
11 that they gave, they could make people copy out pages of
12 Latin grammar books and they always found the pages with
13 the smallest text that would take the longest to copy
14 out. So they could impose those written punishments.

15 In the summertime, quite amusingly in some ways,
16 they also prescribed a punishment called "rolling".
17 This was because on the cricket pitch in front of the
18 school there were enormous rollers. Rolling was done in
19 pairs, so the unfortunate pairs who had incurred the
20 punishment had to go out and drag a huge metal roller up
21 and down for half an hour -- it was always half an
22 hour's rolling -- and they had to roll the cricket pitch
23 for half an hour. This was a summer punishment that
24 went on.

25 Q. Did you have to do that yourself?

1 A. No, I never actually did rolling. I escaped rolling for
2 some reason. But it happened all the time. After lunch
3 you could see these figures moving slowly up and down
4 the cricket pitch pulling the roller behind them.

5 Q. Describing the relationship of the prefects, what you
6 say is:

7 "The senior boys lorded over the junior boys."

8 A. Very much so. The whole ethos of the school was
9 extremely authoritarian and any fraternisation between
10 the older senior boys and the junior boys was strongly
11 discouraged. The young boys -- the junior boys were
12 referred to as "the kids", and the prefects were
13 strongly discouraged by the monks and the school
14 authority from fraternising with the kids. Sometimes
15 Father [REDACTED] MFE used to call them "the scum of the
16 earth", the junior boys --

17 Q. In what context would he use that kind of phrase?

18 A. When he wanted to be disparaging about the junior boys
19 for some reason or other.

20 Q. Would that be to the older boys?

21 A. Yes, he would say that to the older boys about the
22 younger boys. There was no buddying or mentoring, the
23 sort of things that goes on in schools nowadays. The
24 idea of older boys being friendly with the younger boys
25 or even associating with them at all was strongly

- 1 discouraged, very much so.
- 2 LADY SMITH: But would there sometimes be brothers, who were
3 one younger, one older?
- 4 A. There were. This is true, there were brothers, but
5 nevertheless, any fraternisation between the different
6 ranks in the school was strongly discouraged. I suppose
7 it was seen as a threat to the authoritarian ethos of
8 the place. The concept of seniority was very, very
9 strong: the senior boys could tell you what to do and
10 you had to do it.
- 11 MS MACLEOD: Do you know how prefects were chosen from the
12 senior boys?
- 13 A. Well, not really. It was all rather mysterious. They
14 certainly didn't choose me, I was never one, but I don't
15 know how they were chosen really. Most of them were
16 sports gods. They were mostly successful in terms of
17 sport and sometimes academically as well, but I couldn't
18 really say.
- 19 Q. Another form of punishment you tell us about is
20 birching.
- 21 A. Yes. That was right, yes, there was the birch. Now,
22 when I suppose 12 strokes of the tawse wasn't painful
23 enough or whatever or grievous enough for a particular
24 offence, the next level up was the birch. The birch
25 could be wielded by either of the housemasters or the

1 SNR and it was a stick or cane of some kind.

2 It was administered for different things.

3 Occasionally by the housemasters for some kind of
4 transgression of the disciplinary code. It might have
5 been something like going down to the boathouse and
6 being caught smoking at the boathouse or something like
7 that, or possibly being out of bounds without
8 permission, something of that sort, or having a girlie
9 magazine, which occasionally happened.

10 This was considered too serious for the tawse and
11 was a birching offence. The second category for which
12 the birch was used was academic, poor academic
13 performance.

14 Q. So what did the birching involve? Where did it take
15 place? Who administered it?

16 A. The housemasters administered it mostly, as I've just
17 said. Generally, by the housemasters. It took place in
18 their room. Quite often it took place late at night
19 after bedtime, so that the boys would be instructed to
20 come down in their pyjamas and dressing gown to be
21 birched. Then when they went into the room, they had to
22 take off their dressing gown and kneel on a chair and
23 bend over the chair.

24 Quite often, they had to lower their pyjama
25 trousers, pyjama bottoms, as well. And yes, it was much

1 the same in the case of the SNR beatings, which
2 were nearly always for perceived academic performance.

3 In fact, during the time of Father MFF
4 who was called MFF, by the boys, there was a great
5 fear of being told by somebody, "You're wanted by
6 MFF", because he was a distant figure and a feared
7 figure. And being wanted by MFF would almost
8 inevitably sooner or later result in a birching of some
9 kind.

10 In the case of the housemasters for the various
11 offences, like smoking and girlie magazines or being out
12 of bounds, that sort of thing, that would be done in the
13 evening. Everybody else would be up in the dormitory
14 getting into bed and the unfortunate boy who was
15 downstairs in the housemaster's office would be birched
16 there.

17 Q. Would you know in advance that you were going to be
18 birched?

19 A. Yes, that's what I'm building up to. In the case of
20 Father MFF, SNR, he used to -- there used to
21 be weekly marks submitted every Monday and Father MFF
22 would scrutinise these and he decided that some boys
23 weren't basically working hard enough, I guess. It was
24 perceived laziness that he was basically getting at.
25 They would be summoned by him and given a warning.

1 Father MFF would warn the boys that if they didn't
2 improve their performance and they didn't get better
3 weekly marks, they would be basically beaten.

4 So inevitably some of them didn't manage to improve
5 their marks and they were summoned to Father MFF and it
6 was very often the case that they were summoned after
7 lunch and told that they would be beaten at bedtime. So
8 they had to go through the rest of the day knowing that
9 this was going to happen and they would go down to
10 Father MFF's office, which in some cases was quite
11 a long way away, because it was quite a large building,
12 and what happened in Father MFF's office was much the
13 same as what happened in the housemaster's office.
14 Basically they had to kneel on a chair and bend over and
15 very often remove their pyjama bottoms and they'd be
16 birched.

17 Again, the strokes of the birch could be anything
18 from four up to ten. They were birched black and blue.
19 I saw these boys -- it happened to me too, I have to
20 say. It happened to me too, but I saw these boys in the
21 showers and their buttocks were a mass of bruises with
22 sort of red or pinkish stripes across them. It was
23 vicious.

24 Q. Father MFF, did he use the birch on you?

25 A. No. No, he didn't. He seemed to focus on certain boys

1 who were presumably perceived as being lazy. I think he
2 decided I was a bit thick and that saved me from the
3 birch. I think he thought I was doing my best and it
4 wasn't great, but it was the best I could manage. But
5 he seemed to focus on certain boys who I imagine he
6 thought could do better but just weren't bothering
7 themselves and these boys were birched quite often to
8 make them work and to make them achieve better results.

9 There was no sense of helping them with this
10 difficulty that they were having, saying, "You're not
11 getting on terribly well in such-and-such a subject, can
12 we help you, can we give you some extra tuition, can
13 somebody sit down with you and explain the different
14 aspects of what you're studying that you're finding
15 difficult?" It always seemed to be to go to this
16 exterior motivator of the belt, that this would in some
17 way make them work better.

18 LADY SMITH: And did it?

19 A. I know in one case where a boy said to me, "Yes, it made
20 me work and I got better results", so he is perhaps
21 cruising through life grateful to Father MFF.

22 But in other cases, it always seemed to be these
23 boys that were hauled up for perceived academic
24 performance and being birched. I think any regime, any
25 regime of corporal punishment is extremely distasteful

1 to me, but a regime of corporal punishment where the
2 minimum punishment is six strokes of a leather belt and
3 the maximum punishment is ten strokes of a stick of some
4 kind on the bare backside -- to me that goes beyond
5 cruel. It's really barbaric.

6 Of course, it meant that the school was ruled by
7 hate and fear.

8 MS MACLEOD: The boys that you saw in the shower area after
9 they had been birched, do you know if they were -- if
10 any medical attention was available to them?

11 A. I don't know that. I believe that ultimately, the
12 practice was stopped because a boy had been birched and
13 the wounds became infected and of course he had to get
14 medical treatment and that must have been a huge
15 embarrassment to Fort Augustus authorities. I'm only
16 saying that on the basis of second-hand information. It
17 didn't happen during my time.

18 Q. One incident you mention in your statement is that on
19 a three-weekly, a group of lads managed to set fire to
20 a ruined house.

21 A. They did, yes.

22 Q. Can you tell me what you recall about the punishment
23 they received on that occasion?

24 A. Yes. I wasn't one of the group and I only have the
25 story and what was told to me. I don't exactly know

1 what they'd been doing. It was a ruined house, they'd
2 been messing about in it, and perhaps they'd been
3 lighting a fire to cook their sausages or something on
4 a three-weekly holiday. Anyway, they succeeded in
5 burning the house down and the landlord was a bit upset
6 about this and of course phoned the school and the
7 culprits were duly identified. I believe they all got
8 eight of the birch on the bare backside for that.

9 Q. Do you know who administered that on that occasion?

10 A. I think it might have -- I don't know, no. I'd be
11 speculating.

12 Q. In relation to the birching, did that tend to happen
13 in the evening when the boys were in their pyjamas and
14 would go down to --

15 A. It did, yes, frequently it did. Possibly not always,
16 but frequently, yes.

17 Q. I think something you say in your statement at
18 paragraph 212 is that:

19 "In retrospect, [you] think there was some sexual
20 gratification in that."

21 A. I do.

22 Q. Could you elaborate on that?

23 A. I do think that, because pyjama bottoms couldn't have
24 provided much protection against the severity of these
25 punishments, so why did they have to take their pyjama

1 bottoms down? To humiliate them? Possibly. Or because
2 the perpetrator enjoyed it? I am suspicious.

3 Q. You also mention in your statement a particular occasion
4 in a [REDACTED] class where Father [REDACTED] MFE
5 [REDACTED] MFE punished a boy for failing a test.

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Could you tell me about that?

8 A. This made a very firm impression on my mind. The boy in
9 question was about 16 years old, a very sporty lad,
10 a great athlete, a tough lad, a nice lad, a physically
11 strong boy, strong personality, and he'd upset
12 Father [REDACTED] MFE in some way. In this case it wasn't the
13 birch. He was taken into Father [REDACTED] MFE's room and
14 he was belted with the leather strap. I'm not exactly
15 sure how many strokes of the leather strap he was given,
16 but when he came out of the room -- I remember I just
17 happened to be walking along the corridor in the
18 opposite direction at the time -- and there he was in
19 front of me, the palms of his hands were thrust
20 underneath his elbows to bring some relief from the
21 pain, and his whole body, he was doubled up in pain, and
22 the tears were pouring down his face. I have never
23 forgotten that, and I thought, what did he do to deserve
24 that? What a shocking image.

25 Q. You tell us also about an occasion where you yourself

1 were the victim, something that happened at the end of
2 term.

3 A. That's true, yes. There had been -- at the end of term
4 there was a bit of excitement, of course, everybody was
5 delighted to escape from Fort Augustus for a little
6 time, and obviously this gave rise to behaviour that
7 wasn't always in line with the normal codes of
8 acceptable behaviour in Abbey School terms. So in my
9 dormitory, the prep dormitory, there was a bit of
10 a rumpus going on early in the morning.

11 Basically, without saying too much about it,
12 Father MFE stomped into the room, marched the whole
13 dormitory down to the house meeting room and birched the
14 whole dormitory. I don't know how many of us there was.
15 There must have been about 30 of us or something in the
16 dormitory and we were all birched and we all went home
17 black and blue because, yes, that ... Yes, that did
18 happen.

19 In a way, it shows that they would administer these
20 punishments with no compunction, no fear that we would
21 go home and complain to our parents, that he could do it
22 on the very last morning of term. And I don't think
23 anybody ever did. You know, Catholic mothers
24 particularly believed that monks and nuns can do no
25 wrong -- at least they used to in those days, maybe not

1 now.

2 Q. On that occasion were the boys birched in front of each
3 other?

4 A. Yes, they were.

5 Q. Could you maybe assist me to build a picture of that?
6 Did you say there were about 30 boys?

7 A. Yes. Well, yes, there would have been, yes,
8 approximately.

9 Q. And you were lined up?

10 A. We didn't really -- there was a long bench, so we all
11 knelt over the bench and he just moved along the row
12 whacking away.

13 Q. And how many times did he hit each boy?

14 A. Oh, four times. That was relatively light by our school
15 standards. Four of the birch was the sort of lowest
16 level of birching that you could get.

17 Q. Was that over your trousers on that occasion or did you
18 have to remove your trousers?

19 A. I was lucky -- I wasn't too lucky, but I was one of the
20 few boys who travelled to Inverness and down the east
21 coast -- nearly all of them travelled down the west
22 coast. All the east coasters had to get up early and so
23 by the time all this happened, I had my trousers on, but
24 the others were in their pyjamas because they were still
25 in bed or supposed to be in bed. But of course, if you

1 had your trousers on, he just hit you harder, so I was
2 still black and blue after it.

3 Q. Do you recall any other occasions at Fort Augustus when
4 there was that kind of communal punishment, if I can
5 call it that?

6 A. No, I don't really. To some extent the daily strappings
7 were communal because they were in the public eye and
8 there were other boys seeing them happen. But no,
9 I think that was a kind of one-off, that particular one.

10 Q. You tell us a little in your statement about bullying,
11 and you say that bullying was institutionalised. Are
12 you there describing what you were referring to earlier
13 about the older boys and the younger boys or is that
14 something you can develop for me?

15 A. It was institutionalised. The authoritarian and highly
16 structured nature of the place meant that -- and the
17 admiration for strictness meant that those who had power
18 were expected to use it. So the prefects were expected
19 to use it by the housemasters and they used it. And
20 then there was the discouragement of fraternisation with
21 the younger boys. So I think it was institutionalised.
22 It was also a place where there was constant pilfering
23 of your personal possessions by seniors mostly. If you
24 had something in your desk like maybe ping-pong balls or
25 something of that sort and a senior boy was running out

1 of ping-pong balls and he knew you had them, he would
2 just go and steal them from your desk and there was
3 nothing you could do about it. I think that's a fair
4 statement.

5 Q. Something else you mention is fagging, and that that was
6 in operation. Could you tell me how that operated?

7 A. That's correct. It wasn't called fagging, it was called
8 skivvying at the abbey. They called it skivvying,
9 that's right. A senior boy would be able to pay
10 a junior to do some of his little jobs, like wash his
11 shirts and things like that, and then he would have to
12 pay him an agreed amount at the end of the term. I seem
13 to recall 10 shillings being the rate for a skivvy at
14 one stage. So that did happen, yes. Nobody ever asked
15 me to be an skivvy. Just as well, I wouldn't very good
16 at it.

17 Q. I think you say that during your time at Fort Augustus
18 you weren't aware of any sexual goings-on; is that
19 right?

20 A. No, I wasn't, indeed. Physical and emotional abuse,
21 absolutely, a great deal of that. But not anything
22 sexual. It was the internet and reading the [REDACTED]
23 web [REDACTED] when this question of some sexual misdeeds
24 began to come up. I found that both horrifying and very
25 hard to believe at first, but of course I did have to

1 come to believe it, especially after the publicity in
2 Australia relating to Father Aidan Duggan and the crimes
3 that he committed there. This really consolidated my
4 belief that there were sexual misdeeds and of course
5 I've subsequently met some of the victims, so I know
6 without any doubt in my mind that these things did
7 happen. But I had no notion of that at the time, not at
8 all.

9 Q. Did you ever tell your parents how you were being
10 treated by the monks at Fort Augustus?

11 A. No. You just didn't. It was stiff upper lip, you know,
12 you just didn't do it. I don't think anybody did. My
13 mother would never have believed anything bad or
14 negative about the holy monks -- most Catholic mothers
15 of that time wouldn't have either. I have heard other
16 boys say exactly the same: "If I had told them about
17 this, they wouldn't have believed me".

18 Q. Did you ever tell anyone in any kind of authority at the
19 school about what was going on?

20 A. Oh good grief, I would have never dared to do that,
21 absolutely not. Not at all, no.

22 Q. If you had a concern when you were at Fort Augustus or
23 something you wanted to raise with an adult, was there
24 anybody to whom you could go?

25 A. I didn't feel there was, no, I didn't feel there was.

1 There would have been nobody that I would have felt
2 confident -- I would have felt that that would be a sign
3 of weakness to go to anybody and I don't think such
4 counselling or pastoring or whatever was really offered
5 to you. I think the expectation was that you would
6 simply cope with whatever was thrown at you and you'd
7 keep a stiff upper lip and be a good chap and so on and
8 so forth.

9 Q. At paragraph 236 of your statement, you mention the
10 educator and author AS Neill and a description that he's
11 given of Christian schools.

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. I think that's one you agree with. Can you tell me
14 about that?

15 A. Yes. I don't agree with everything AS Neill wrote or
16 thought. He said some quite interesting things, but
17 certainly I'm not a particular AS Neill fan, but I think
18 his description or his view of Christian schools, as
19 expressed there, as being "full of hate and fear",
20 I think that describes Fort Augustus extremely well.

21 Q. There came a time when you left Fort Augustus; I think
22 you were 18 --

23 A. Yes, I did, yes.

24 Q. -- when you left. And you tell us in your statement
25 a little bit about what you did after that. I think you

1 had various jobs to start off with before you went into
2 teaching; is that right?

3 A. That's correct, yes. I drifted around quite a bit.
4 I came out of Fort Augustus as a drifter rather than
5 a planner. Some boys were planners, they had good
6 academic credentials and went straight to university and
7 became dentists and doctors and lawyers and so on and so
8 forth. I didn't have the academic credentials for that
9 at the time and I drifted for a few years.

10 I think to some extent I was just re-orientating
11 myself to normality, and then eventually I went into
12 hospital administration and into retail management, both
13 of which -- I wasn't particularly well suited. I was
14 very unsuited to retail management, but then eventually
15 into teaching and I found my milieu in teaching. That
16 was what I wanted to do and did.

17 Q. You tell us you spent 34 years in primary education --

18 A. I did, yes.

19 Q. -- in Scotland. And latterly, I think you were [REDACTED]

20 [REDACTED] school here in central Edinburgh?

21 A. I was, yes.

22 Q. And you're now retired?

23 A. Yes, I am.

24 Q. You married and had two daughters you tell us.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And I think you also tell us that, tragically, you lost
2 your first wife.

3 A. I did, yes.

4 Q. And you're now remarried?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You do tell us in your statement about the impact you
7 think your time at Fort Augustus and Carlekemp has had
8 on you. You say you think it definitely has had an
9 impact on you. I wonder if you were able to just
10 summarise that for me. What do you think the impact has
11 been on your life?

12 A. Well, I think it left me enormously confused, basically.
13 It certainly made me a rather withdrawn person. Not
14 socially or whatever, but quite insular, quite able to
15 stand on my own two feet, not wanting to depend on
16 anyone else terribly much. I think I learnt that.
17 Maybe there are some good aspects of that. I never was
18 able to reconcile in my years at Carlekemp and
19 Fort Augustus the message of the Gentle Carpenter of
20 Nazareth on the one hand and all the belting and beating
21 and cruelty that went on on the other. I could never
22 sort that out.

23 You know, I think I was quite devout in my Catholic
24 belief during these years, but the contradiction of that
25 really left me in a state of considerable confusion and

1 so did some of the expectations and patterns of
2 behaviour that went on at the Abbey School. So it took
3 me a little while and I got away from the place and
4 I met people who were not from that kind of background
5 and began to find a new world and gradually found my
6 feet, I think.

7 Q. I think one thing you say is it has affected the
8 relationship you have with pupils that you teach.

9 I think you say that you tended to do just the opposite
10 of what had been done to you.

11 A. Yes, absolutely. I certainly abhor the ethos of the
12 Abbey School. The hostility and the cruelty and the
13 lack of recognition and not valuing of people as
14 individuals. I think every individual deserves to be
15 accorded some value. They're not just a number on
16 a list, which was the case at Fort Augustus. It was
17 very easy to become marginalised at Fort Augustus and to
18 feel quite anonymous there. Children should never, ever
19 be allowed to feel like that in a school.

20 Teachers should have much more care of how they
21 treat them than that. Every child needs to be valued
22 for whatever, just for being who they are even, and the
23 failure to value children means that they don't value
24 themselves. This causes problems in their lives for
25 them and these problems can lead to all sorts of damage

1 and unhappiness. So yes, to some extent, my years spent
2 in teaching were a mission to right the wrongs of
3 Fort Augustus and I hope I managed to do that, at least
4 to some extent.

5 Q. You say that you've had some post-traumatic effects, in
6 particular from the incident with [REDACTED] MFC
7 in the classroom; is that something that's --

8 A. Yes, I did have some troubles with night terrors, but
9 of course whether it was [REDACTED] MFC or some other
10 things is highly speculative. But I did have for many
11 years and perhaps still do, to some extent, occasional
12 problems with night terrors. But of course night
13 terrors are very, very common in the community at large.
14 Whether these came from a big man in black robes
15 terrorising me at night, whether it was [REDACTED] MFC
16 or something to do with Carlekemp or Fort Augustus,
17 I can't say with any certainty, as one can't usually
18 with these things.

19 Q. You do say that your wife discovered you'd been badly
20 beaten when you reacted when she touched your face.

21 A. Yes. Well, one had to be on one's guard at
22 Fort Augustus all the time, yes.

23 Q. We've touched on this before, but in relation to
24 reporting to anyone, you say that you've never spoken to
25 anyone other than your wife about your experiences at

1 Fort Augustus and Carlekemp.

2 A. That's true, yes, I haven't.

3 Q. You helpfully set out for us in your statement lessons
4 which you think could be learnt, potentially, and
5 I think you start that at paragraph 262. I think the
6 first thing you say is:

7 "Don't send your child to a boarding school."

8 A. Yes. I didn't send my children to a boarding school,
9 and possibly couldn't have afforded to do so, but if
10 I could have afforded to do so I wouldn't have done it.
11 I think my experiences put me off the idea of boarding
12 schools, particularly Catholic boarding schools. Yes,
13 I wouldn't have done that.

14 Q. You say that:

15 "If we are to have these schools, they need to be
16 subject to very stringent transparency from an outside
17 inspectorate."

18 A. Absolutely. There's no question they do need to be
19 subject to these. Even state schools in the middle of
20 cities are fairly impenetrable institutions to the
21 outside community in many respects. But boarding
22 schools, particularly those in remote locations, even
23 more so. There does need to be transparency and there
24 does have to be independent evaluation of what's going
25 on in these places for the protection of children

1 because at the Abbey they did seem to have licence to do
2 as they wished, really.

3 Q. And you go on to say that:

4 "It doesn't bear thinking about repeating the kind
5 of experiences that my classmates and myself had at
6 these places."

7 A. That's true -- and I escaped relatively lightly.

8 I wasn't subjected to any sexual harassment, thank
9 goodness, but obviously many of my classmates and
10 schoolmates were. It doesn't bear thinking about, no.

11 Q. In relation to your hopes for this inquiry, Harry, you
12 make some remarks in relation to that in paragraphs 265
13 onwards, the first one being that recognition should be
14 given to those who went through these experiences.

15 A. Yes, that is correct. It is a story that must be told
16 and recorded and acknowledged.

17 Q. And you feel it is important to safeguard future
18 generations to come?

19 A. Very, very important.

20 Q. One thing you say is that:

21 "It was all masked by saying that it was good for
22 you to be treated like that and that it will give you
23 character and make man of you, but that that was a lie."

24 A. It evidently was a lie. It didn't make a character out
25 of many boys; it made very unhappy adults out of them.

1 Q. You mention that you've written a memoir of your time at
2 the schools and I think those are something you're going
3 to share with the inquiry; is that right?

4 A. I can share it. It doesn't really contain much that
5 I haven't said here today, but I do have this written
6 down. I have my experiences written down at quite some
7 length. They don't all relate to the ethos of the
8 school or to abuse and things like that; some of them
9 relate to boyish escapades of one kind or another.
10 Books and that, I do have that, yes.

11 Q. Are these memoirs you've written in recent times or the
12 past?

13 A. They were probably written about 10 years ago or so.

14 Q. You mentioned a boy [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
15 [REDACTED], and that he went on to write a book --

16 A. He did, yes.

17 Q. -- [REDACTED] and I think you say that he
18 devotes a chapter or two to his experiences at
19 Fort Augustus and it's well worth a read.

20 A. Yes, absolutely. He does pretty much say it as it was
21 and it's a good account of the Fort Augustus experience.
22 Yes, I think so.

23 MS MACLEOD: Thank you for that. We do have a copy of that
24 book.

25 That's all I have to ask you today, Harry. I don't

1 have any more questions for you.

2 My Lady, I'm not aware of any other questions for
3 Harry.

4 LADY SMITH: Thank you. Are there any outstanding
5 applications for questions of Harry? No.

6 Harry, that does indeed complete the questions
7 we have for you. It just remains for me to thank you
8 very much for engaging with the inquiry, both in terms
9 of providing your written statement, which has so much
10 helpful detail in it, and coming along today to talk to
11 us about your experiences. I'm very grateful to you for
12 having done so and I'm now able to let you go.

13 A. Thank you very much. My pleasure to be here.

14 (The witness withdrew)

15 LADY SMITH: Before I turn to where we're going next with
16 evidence, I just want to mention very early on in his
17 evidence Harry did actually refer to his own first name.
18 Could I just remind everybody: he is an applicant who
19 has chosen to remain anonymous, which he is entitled to
20 do, and he can only be known as "Harry" outside this
21 room.

22 He also mentioned the name of another child quite
23 early on, but of course all children in care in Scotland
24 have the benefit of my general restriction order, as
25 finally do the people who have been alleged to have

1 perpetrated abuse at the schools about which we have
2 heard. People who are alleged abusers have the
3 protection of my general restriction order, so I'd ask
4 everybody to remember that, although in the usual way,
5 in this case study, as with previous ones, I will allow
6 these names to be used so as not to interrupt the flow
7 of evidence if that seems comfortable for the witness.

8 Now, Ms MacLeod.

9 MS MACLEOD: The next witness will be ready to start at
10 2 o'clock.

11 LADY SMITH: Very well. I will adjourn now until 2 o'clock.
12 (12.45 pm)

13 (The lunch adjournment)
14 (2.00 pm)

15 LADY SMITH: Good afternoon. There's one thing I want to
16 mention before I invite Mr MacAulay to call the next
17 witness: during the break, the extent to which
18 Aidan Duggan's name as an alleged abuser can be
19 mentioned, that is somebody who is alleged to have
20 abused children in residential care, was brought to my
21 attention.

22 Although Aidan Duggan, who is now dead, would be
23 covered by my general restriction order, I'm able to
24 relax that order if I'm satisfied it would be
25 appropriate to do so. In these circumstances, where his

1 name is so well-known, as I say, in association with
2 allegations of abuse, I am relaxing it in relation to
3 him.

4 So what I said before the lunch break about names of
5 alleged abusers not being mentioned outside this room
6 doesn't apply to Aidan Duggan and his name can be used
7 by anybody. It would seem unrealistic to expect that
8 not to be done when it has apparently become as
9 well-known as it has. I hope that's clear.

10 But in the usual way, if anyone has any doubts, and
11 in particular if any members of the press have any
12 queries, please don't hesitate to raise them with the
13 inquiry's representatives and we'll do all we can to
14 help you.

15 Mr MacAulay.

16 MR MacAULAY: The next witness is David Walls.

17 DAVID WALLS (sworn)

18 LADY SMITH: Please sit down and make yourself comfortable.

19 Can I just check, are you happy that I continue to call
20 you David?

21 A. Yes, my Lady, thank you.

22 LADY SMITH: Thank you, David. I think you're in a good
23 position for that microphone. As I tell all witnesses,
24 it is really important that we hear you through the
25 sound system, so if you can maintain that, that'd be

1 really helpful.

2 I'll hand over to Mr MacAulay and he will explain to
3 you what happens next.

4 Questions from MR MacAULAY

5 MR MacAULAY: Good afternoon, David.

6 A. Hello.

7 Q. In that red folder that you have in front of you, you'll
8 find a copy of your witness statements. There are two
9 of them.

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. For the purposes of the transcript, I'll give the
12 reference for the first of those and that's
13 WIT.001.001.5219. If you could turn to the last page of
14 that statement, the top number will be 5242.

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Can you confirm for me that you have signed the
17 statement?

18 A. Yes, I did.

19 Q. Do you tell us in the final paragraph that you have no
20 objection to your witness statement being published as
21 part of the evidence to the inquiry?

22 A. No objection.

23 Q. And I think you go on to say that you believe the facts
24 stated in this witness statement are true.

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. We'll leave the second and the supplementary witness
2 statements aside for the moment and we will look at that
3 later.

4 Can I say that I'll be asking you questions based on
5 the witness statement and if there's something I ask you
6 about and it's something you've forgotten, just say so.
7 On the other hand, if you remember something that
8 you haven't elaborated upon in the witness statement,
9 again feel free to tell us about that.

10 A. Right.

11 Q. Can you confirm that you were born on [REDACTED] 1945?

12 A. I was, yes.

13 Q. So that means that you're now 73.

14 A. 73, 74 [REDACTED]

15 Q. You tell us in the first paragraph of your statement
16 that you're one of [REDACTED] brothers; is that right?

17 A. Right.

18 Q. [REDACTED] younger, [REDACTED]

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. You also go on to tell us that, so far as your family
21 background is concerned, you were brought up in a loving
22 and caring family environment?

23 A. Absolutely, yes.

24 Q. You also tell us that your father was a Church of
25 Scotland minister.

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. But he had a form of transformation at some point;
3 is that correct?

4 A. Yes, he became a Catholic in 1948.

5 Q. I think, tragically, your mother was killed in a car
6 crash in 1975.

7 A. Yes, that's right.

8 Q. And after that, what did your father do?

9 A. He then went to Rome and trained as a priest. He was
10 ordained -- I've forgotten the year of his ordination --
11 about three or four years after my mother was killed.

12 Q. Did he continue then to live his life as a priest?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Was that something that was important to you in relation
15 to whether or not you could raise with him matters that
16 were of concern to you when you were at Carlekemp, which
17 we're going to look at?

18 A. Yes, he was always aware that we had had unhappy
19 experiences at Carlekemp and we were taken away from
20 Carlekemp. [REDACTED]
21 [REDACTED]

22 One of the things that I've never really understood the
23 reasons for is my father would never discuss that with
24 us, and [REDACTED] never discussed it with us. I can
25 only assume that there was a solid reason for that.

1 But that kind of meant that you didn't speak at home
2 about these issues. All we ever said was general things
3 like, "It's a terrible school, don't send your children
4 there". That was the kind of level of discussion and my
5 father would nod wisely and that would be it.

6 Q. Before we get to the Carlekemp years, did you first of
7 all go to school at Scotus Academy, which was run by the
8 Christian Brothers?

9 A. I was there for one year, yes, the year before. That
10 would be 1954 to 1955.

11 Q. And that was not a boarding school?

12 A. No, that was a day school.

13 Q. Coming on then to Carlekemp, I think it's correct to say
14 that you went to Carlekemp. [REDACTED]

15 [REDACTED]. Did your younger
16 brother go with you to Carlekemp?

17 A. Yes, we both went at the same time. [REDACTED]

18 [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED]
20 Q. What you tell us in your statement is you went to
21 Carlekemp for the term beginning 1955; is that right?

22 A. That's correct.

23 Q. So that would be either [REDACTED]?

24 A. It was [REDACTED], yes.

25 Q. You were there for three years?

1 A. Three years, yes.

2 Q. You left in the summer of 1958?

3 A. That's correct, yes.

4 Q. So when you went to Carlekemp in the [REDACTED] of 1955,
5 you had just turned 10; is that right?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Your younger brother, what age was he?

8 A. He was 18 months younger than me. His birthday is
9 [REDACTED], so he would have been 8, I think, if my brain
10 is working properly.

11 Q. But 18 months younger than you in any event. So he'd
12 have gone into a different class?

13 A. Yes, he was in the class below me.

14 Q. When you arrived at Carlekemp for the first time, did
15 your parents go with you?

16 A. Yes, they did -- well, they took us to the front door.

17 Q. Did you meet a particular monk?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Who did you meet at that time?

20 A. Father Aidan Duggan.

21 Q. Was there any interaction between yourselves, your
22 parents and Father Duggan at that time?

23 A. Oh yes. It was, you know, smiles and, "Don't worry, the
24 boys will be very happy here", and then another boy was
25 walking past, and he said, "Oh, [REDACTED], would you take

1 David and Christopher and show them their dormitories?"
2 We took our cases and [REDACTED], who was [REDACTED] --
3 I don't know if I'm allowed to say his name or not,
4 sorry.

5 Q. We can deal with that. Don't worry.

6 A. He took us up to the dormitories and then we went back
7 down, but my parents had gone.

8 Q. Was your understanding that it was thought best that you
9 wouldn't see your parents before they left?

10 A. My parents, as I understand it, had been told by Father
11 Aidan Duggan that it would be best if they left so as
12 not to upset us with a tearful goodbye or something, you
13 know. I don't know, but that's what happened.

14 Q. I think you do say in your statement that you did find
15 that rather hard that you didn't have the chance to say
16 goodbye.

17 A. Yes, that was pretty hard.

18 Q. Just looking at aspects of the set-up at the school,
19 you've mentioned Father Aidan Duggan and we'll come to
20 look at him again shortly. Who were the other
21 Benedictine monks at the school during your time?

22 A. When we arrived there, there was Father
23 [REDACTED] MEX who was the [REDACTED] SNR. There was
24 Father [REDACTED] MEZ -- sorry, I think I've got it
25 right in my statement. Father [REDACTED] MEZ, who was the

1 [REDACTED], the [REDACTED] master. There was Father
2 Aidan Duggan and there was Father [REDACTED] MEW . Then
3 the following -- I think it was the following year or
4 maybe about 18 months later, Father [REDACTED] MFC
5 arrived from Fort Augustus.

6 Q. We'll look at him also. Was he somebody that was known
7 to your family?

8 A. Not at that time, no.

9 Q. Did he become known to your family?

10 A. Oh yes, yes.

11 Q. Insofar as the number of boys at the school was
12 concerned when you arrived there, did you have any idea
13 in your head as to how many boys there were?

14 A. I think there was about 65, round about that figure.

15 Q. Just looking at some aspects of the routine, we --
16 needn't spend a lot of time looking at this -- were you
17 divided into groups according to your age for schooling
18 purposes?

19 A. For schooling purposes, yes, there was five forms.

20 First form was the wee ones and then upwards to fifth
21 form.

22 Q. Where did you come in when you got there?

23 A. I went into second form.

24 Q. The sleeping arrangements, can you tell me about that?

25 A. We were all in dormitories according to seniority. So

1 seniority was determined on where you came in the final
2 exams at the end of the year rather than alphabetical
3 order or anything like that.

4 Q. Were these open dormitories?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. With a number of beds in each?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. How many beds were there?

9 A. It depended on the dormitory. There were, as far as
10 I can recall, seven dormitories, four in what was called
11 the junior wing, and three in the senior wing. I think
12 that's correct, seven.

13 Q. Did you move then from the junior wing to the senior
14 wing once you reached that age?

15 A. That's correct, yes.

16 Q. At paragraph 10 of your statement -- and the statement
17 will come on the screen in front of you, sometimes it's
18 easier to read it off the screen -- you mention that
19 there was an obvious hierarchy within the school and, in
20 particular, there were prefects who had a particular
21 role to play; is that right?

22 A. Yes, that's right.

23 Q. Can you explain that to me?

24 A. The prefects, I suppose their job was to keep the
25 younger lot in order, and they seemed to have permission

1 to give you a slap round the head, because they did it
2 and if you complained, you were -- nothing was done.

3 Basically, they threw their weight around and
4 weren't very, you know -- well, it was rough justice,
5 shall we say.

6 Q. Did you become a prefect in your time?

7 A. No, no, I left the year before. I left at the end of
8 fourth form. Only fifth-formers were prefects.

9 Q. During your time, what was the set-up with regard to
10 bullying? Were you bullied?

11 A. Yes, I was bullied pretty regularly, yes. It wasn't
12 very pleasant. That was one of the most unpleasant
13 aspects of it, really, and it all started on day one.
14 I was set up. I was ridiculed in front of the class as
15 the new boy by Father Aidan Duggan. The whole class
16 were laughing at him basically making a fool of me in
17 front of the class.

18 Q. What was he saying?

19 A. Well, I hadn't experienced any sort of close proximity
20 to priests before and didn't realise that you called
21 them "father" , so I called him "sir". He said, "What's
22 your name?" and I said, "David". They didn't use
23 Christian names, they used surnames so, "David what?"
24 and I said, "Oh, David, sir", and he said, "Oh,
25 Sir David!" And the class guffawed and so on.

1 I was standing with -- literally the first day. It
2 was the day after I'd arrived and I was reduced to tears
3 in front of the class. The bullies just got on to that
4 and there were five or six of them in the class that
5 gave me quite a hard time for the first couple of years
6 until myself and another boy decided we'd had enough and
7 dealt with them ourselves one by one.

8 Q. When you say they gave you a hard time, can you just
9 describe that?

10 A. They would gather round and taunt you and jeer and laugh
11 and call you names, punch you. All sorts of things.
12 You couldn't defend yourself against it.

13 Q. So what extent was this known to the monks?

14 A. I would say it was part of daily life that they thought
15 would toughen you up. I don't know. I can't answer
16 that question but, yes, it happened in front of them.

17 On one occasion I was surrounded by a group of maybe
18 ten or 12 boys, mostly from my class, not all of them
19 involved, some of them just bystanders, and one of the
20 principal kids who were involved in the bullying,
21 he was -- well, he punched me straight in the face.

22 I then was hit on the back of the head and it was
23 at the bottom of a flight of stairs and this was
24 a priest coming down, Father MEW coming down
25 the stairs. He had seen me being punched and everyone

- 1 gathered round me, but he struck out at the first
2 person, I don't know what was in his mind, but --
- 3 Q. Where did he hit you?
- 4 A. On the back of the head with his fist. I never saw him
5 coming, I didn't know he was there.
- 6 Q. You mentioned the incident in the class when
7 Father Duggan sought to ridicule you by calling you
8 Sir David and you also said at that time you could only
9 use surnames; is that right?
- 10 A. It wasn't that you could only use -- I mean, most of us
11 had nicknames.
- 12 Q. But when you were addressed by brothers --
- 13 A. It was Walls. That was what they called you, Walls.
- 14 Q. I think you told us that when you arrived at the school
15 with your parents, you were addressed by your first
16 name?
- 17 A. Yes, he knew my name. Why he would want to make me
18 stand up and -- I don't know. I'm not going to surmise
19 what was in his mind, but he knew my name before he
20 asked the question.
- 21 Q. Let's just look a little bit at the set-up with regard
22 to the monks. You have mentioned the SNR as
23 Father MEX; is that correct?
- 24 A. Yes, Father MEX.
- 25 Q. I think you said it was MEX or it could have been

1 [REDACTED] MEX , but it doesn't really matter. Let's refer to
2 him as Father [REDACTED] MEX . You have also mentioned
3 Father [REDACTED] MEW ; what was his role at the school?

4 A. He taught ... I'm trying to remember what he taught us.
5 Gosh ... He certainly taught something. I think it was
6 [REDACTED] at one point. But his main role seemed to be
7 master of discipline. He was the one that patrolled
8 around after lights out.

9 Q. And I'll come and look at that with you. If we just
10 look at the roles. Father Aidan Duggan, you have
11 mentioned him. What was his position?

12 A. He taught Latin and geography and English, if I recall.
13 Yes, I remember him teaching us English in second form.
14 It depended what form you were in who taught you what.
15 None of them were qualified to teach.

16 Q. I was about to ask you that. You were aware of that?

17 A. Oh yes.

18 Q. You've mentioned Father [REDACTED] MFC , who I think
19 came after you arrived at the school; did he teach?

20 A. He taught [REDACTED].

21 Q. Was he a [REDACTED]

22 A. No, he knew no [REDACTED] when he first came and he more or
23 less admitted to me afterwards that I was always a page
24 ahead of him in the textbook. Because I loved [REDACTED] --
25 I'm a [REDACTED] you know -- and I really wanted to learn

- 1 [REDACTED], so I studied quite hard at it.
- 2 Q. Did you find that your own [REDACTED] was better than his at
3 that time?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. You've mentioned Aidan Duggan and you also talk in your
6 statement about a Father [REDACTED] MEY .
- 7 A. Yes, I never knew him.
- 8 Q. Had he been at Carlekemp?
- 9 A. I think he had been there, yes.
- 10 Q. You also mention a --
- 11 A. He may have gone there afterwards. Sorry, I don't know
12 his history other than he was [REDACTED] and
13 came to Scotland with Aidan Duggan from Australia.
- 14 Q. You also mention Father [REDACTED] MEV
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. But he was not --
- 17 A. No, I never knew him either. The three of them all came
18 from Australia, from the same monastery.
- 19 Q. How do you know that?
- 20 A. Just from the press and from proceedings in Australia.
- 21 Q. You go on to say that sport was an important aspect of
22 life.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. Was it important to be good at sports?
- 25 A. It was really important to be good at sports, yes.

- 1 Q. Can you explain that?
- 2 A. Well, it was very ... It was where you could shine. If
3 you were good at sports, you got lots of praise.
4 I thoroughly enjoyed every afternoon we were out playing
5 something, rugby or -- we didn't play football, that was
6 frowned on. But rugby, cricket and hockey were the
7 three sports. You know, it was a great escape, really.
- 8 Q. What about academically? How did you perform
9 academically?
- 10 A. I was top of my class every year I was there, in every
11 subject except maths, where I was second to a good pal.
- 12 Q. In your statement from paragraphs 16 through to 19, you
13 tell us about aspects of the routine, which we can read
14 for ourselves. One thing you do tell us at paragraph 19
15 is that once you went to bed, then you had to be silent.
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 Q. And I think that was called "the grand silence"?
- 18 A. The grand silence, yes.
- 19 Q. I think the other thing you say is your existence was
20 one that you describe as being monastic.
- 21 A. Pretty much, yes.
- 22 Q. Can you just explain that?
- 23 A. Well, bells rang and you had to respond to a very rigid
24 routine. Every day was the same, except Saturday and
25 Sunday were a bit different. The day started with Mass

1 and ended in the chapel as well.

2 Then at lunchtime there was, at 12 o'clock, the
3 Angelus, so you were in chapel three or four times
4 a day, which nobody objected to, it was part of the
5 routine, and I quite enjoyed that aspect of it.

6 Q. And inspection. Do you have any recollection of the
7 school being subject to any inspections during your time
8 there?

9 A. The only inspections I remember were every year we were
10 inspected by the diocesan representatives. There were
11 two of them. I can't remember both of their names, but
12 one of them was a Father Lawrence Glancy. He was the
13 more junior one. The senior one was ... I've tried to
14 remember his name, but I can't. But they used to come
15 and inspect us, mainly for the catechism, which you had
16 to learn by heart, and then they would ask general
17 questions about the faith and about this, that and the
18 next thing.

19 They went round -- you know, they were given a tour
20 of the school and so on and so forth.

21 LADY SMITH: The description you give, David, suggests that
22 there was a focus on inspecting religious observance.

23 A. Correct.

24 LADY SMITH: Is that all that they were there for?

25 A. As far as I'm aware, yes.

1 LADY SMITH: Thank you.

2 MR MacAULAY: Can I move on now to look at discipline and
3 punishment. In paragraph 23 of your statement you talk
4 about what you describe as "the stick".

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Can you just describe what that was, first of all?

7 A. It was a piece of solid, very solid black leather, about
8 that length (indicating), about a foot long. It was
9 perhaps 10 centimetres (sic) thick, half an inch -- not
10 as much as half an inch. Certainly 10 centimetres thick
11 and perhaps an inch wide. That was only administered by
12 Father MEX .

13 Q. SNR

14 A. SNR .

15 Q. And how would it come about --

16 LADY SMITH: I'm trying to pick up your measurements and I'm
17 entirely happy if you go back to feet and inches, but
18 I was puzzled by something that's 10 centimetres thick
19 because that would be about 4 inches.

20 A. Sorry, 10 millimetres, I beg your pardon, my Lady. My
21 brain is ...

22 LADY SMITH: I quite understand.

23 A. I am having trouble decimalising. I was going to say
24 half an inch, but it's less than half an inch.

25 LADY SMITH: Less than half an inch. I've got the picture,

1 thank you.

2 MR MacAULAY: Do I understand you to say it was only the
3 [REDACTED] SNR [REDACTED], Father [REDACTED] MEX [REDACTED], who would use the stick?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. How would it come about that a boy would require to get
6 the stick?

7 A. Well, generally, it would be for something like running
8 in the corridor or talking in the dormitory or whatever,
9 an infringement of one of the rules, and you'd be sent
10 by another member of staff to Father [REDACTED] MEX [REDACTED] and you
11 were then put in his diary and usually it was the next
12 day when you got your punishment, or maybe two or three
13 days later, depending if he was available or not.

14 Q. How did that impact upon you, that you had to wait?

15 A. Well, it was quite a frightening experience to get the
16 stick. It was not pleasant, it was extremely painful.
17 So yes, you worried about it.

18 Q. Can I then understand what getting the stick involved in
19 practice?

20 A. In practice, you had to hold out two hands like that
21 (indicating).

22 Q. Across each other?

23 A. Yes, sometimes just one, but normally it was two like
24 that (indicating), and the stick was brought down on
25 your hand, pretty hard.

- 1 Q. How many strokes?
- 2 A. That depended on the severity of the crime, but six on
3 each hand wasn't unheard of. I never had that, I'd had
4 as much as four, but whatever you got on one hand you
5 got on the other, so it was always two if you were sent
6 for one.
- 7 Q. If you got four, is that four on each hand, that's
8 eight?
- 9 A. Mm-hm.
- 10 Q. Did this cause injury?
- 11 A. Yes. You always came out with sort of red marks and, on
12 occasion, you know, people had marks up their arm, or if
13 you moved, then of course you were given another one.
14 Yes, it was a fairly substantial bit of leather.
15 Normally, you were lined up outside -- so you wouldn't
16 be the only one getting it, there would be a row of
17 boys -- so you could hear the stick being administered
18 to somebody first and then they came out, and of course
19 they all came out trying to pretend that they were tough
20 as nails and it hadn't hurt, but that was part of the
21 process that you had to come out and show you were too
22 tough to be bothered, you know.
- 23 Q. But would you see the other boys getting the stick?
- 24 A. No, no.
- 25 Q. You've mentioned already Father MEW. What

1 you say in your statement is he frequently used his
2 clenched fist.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. You've already given us one example of that, but was
5 that a more common occurrence?

6 A. Yes. That was pretty much -- maybe not daily, but
7 regular. Sometimes more than once a day you'd see him
8 hitting somebody or you'd get hit.

9 Q. What would the reasons for that be?

10 A. Pretty trivial stuff: talking when you shouldn't be,
11 maybe in study period, whispering to somebody beside
12 you. You weren't allowed to talk at all during study
13 periods. There was one after lunch and there was one in
14 the evening. He generally supervised that or one of the
15 other monks did, but when he did, he walked round and
16 periodically somebody would get either a slap or
17 a punch. If you were running in the corridor, you'd
18 definitely get a thump from him.

19 Q. Would it just be a thump or more than that?

20 A. A thump, yes. He never really spoke much, he just hit
21 you. I don't recall ever having a conversation with him
22 other than, you know, something to do with class or ...
23 He was in charge of giving out new jotters, for example,
24 for you to work in and he examined every jotter that you
25 handed in. If there was any spaces, you'd get a row for

1 that, and would be told to go away and fill them up.

2 Then he counted all the pages in the jotters and if
3 you'd taken a page out, you got into trouble for that.

4 Q. And "getting into trouble" meant what?

5 A. He might give you a slap or he'd give you a telling-off.

6 Then he also was in charge of showing the film on
7 a Sunday. He ran the projector, that was one of his
8 duties.

9 Q. One thing you tell us about him also -- and this may
10 have been when you were on the junior side -- is he used
11 to go around in his stocking soles.

12 A. Yes, that was the rumour. The thing is, we never heard
13 him coming at all. He was extremely silent. Everybody
14 said he walked around in his stocking soles and I have
15 no reason to believe that he didn't because I never,
16 ever heard him coming.

17 Q. So could he come from behind without you knowing?

18 A. No, he used to go up and down the corridors outside the
19 dormitories in the morning, especially on a Sunday
20 morning. We got a long lie of half an hour on a Sunday
21 morning, and in that kind of regime you waken up at the
22 same time for every day. So for half an hour you were
23 lying there not allowed to speak and, of course, kids do
24 so he would listen outside the dormitory and then come
25 in and normally he would say, "Who spoke?" and if

1 somebody owned up, they got it, but if they didn't, the
2 whole dormitory got it.

3 Q. Got what on these occasions?

4 A. The cane was what he usually brought with him. He had
5 quite a long garden cane and it was quite thick. It
6 wasn't one of the thin ones that you buy in a gardening
7 shop for propping up plants, it was a slightly more
8 substantial cane.

9 Q. If the whole dormitory were to be punished with the
10 cane, can you just explain what would happen?

11 A. You had to bend over the end of your bed and he went
12 round the dormitory and gave you one, two, three,
13 whatever.

14 Q. On your --

15 A. On your backside.

16 Q. Was this over your pyjamas?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Did that cause injury?

19 A. You certainly could feel a lump where the cane -- or two
20 or three lumps, yes. I would say it was -- at that time
21 it would have been ... Nowadays it would be called
22 physical assault and people would be charged for
23 inflicting that kind of injury on anyone.

24 Q. Was this the position really from the time you arrived
25 at the school?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. So in your dormitory, are we looking at boys aged 10?
- 3 A. 10, yes. And in the younger dormitories, there were
4 youngsters there aged 8. My brother was 8. I was
5 slightly older than the rest of my class.
- 6 Q. Do you know if this practice was used in connection with
7 the younger boys?
- 8 A. Oh yes. Everybody. Everybody on the junior wing. The
9 senior wing he didn't patrol, so I was really glad to
10 get out of the junior wing. I got out early because
11 I was top of the class so I moved to the senior wing
12 when I was in the third form. So I think I had a year
13 or a year and a bit in the junior wing.
- 14 Q. To your knowledge, how often or how regularly did this
15 wholesale caning of dormitories take place?
- 16 A. That's difficult to say because I just remember it as
17 a sort of general thing. You accepted it as happening
18 on a regular basis. I suppose sometimes you'd go for
19 several weeks without it happening and then there'd be
20 two or three incidents. I remember hearing, having been
21 caned, hearing him going to another dormitory and caning
22 that dormitory as well, because he'd been round, heard
23 people talking, and said, "Right, I'll go there next",
24 and that was the -- so yes, it happened regularly, but
25 I can't say how often.

- 1 Q. Would the children be upset?
- 2 A. Well, yes, but again you put a brave face on it, "I'm
3 too tough to be ..." I mean, if you showed any sign of
4 weakness, that's when the bullies pounced.
- 5 Q. I'm thinking of an 8-year-old who's been caned in that
6 way; would they be crying?
- 7 A. They might be, but they'd regret that afterwards because
8 people would make fun of them.
- 9 Q. So you tried not to show upset?
- 10 A. Oh definitely, yes, you struggled the tears back, yes.
- 11 Q. Just focusing on Father **MEW**, one thing you say in
12 your statement, paragraph 35, is you never actually had
13 a conversation with him.
- 14 A. Never. Not one, no, in three years.
- 15 Q. Did you ever see him having a conversation with another
16 boy?
- 17 A. Not really. No, he kept himself to himself very much.
18 He wasn't approachable.
- 19 Q. Can I go back then to Father Duggan, Father
20 Aidan Duggan. One thing you tell us about him in
21 paragraph 26 is that he had what you described as
22 a split personality.
- 23 A. Yes. Well -- did I say split personality?
- 24 Q. I think you say split. It's on the screen at
25 paragraph 26.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. You say:
- 3 "One minute he ingratiated himself to you and the
4 next occasion, he flew into a violent rage."
- 5 A. That's correct, yes.
- 6 Q. Let's leave the rages aside for the moment. You tell us
7 that he quite often would come into a dormitory at night
8 and read you a scary story.
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Can you tell us about that?
- 11 A. Well, yes, we all enjoyed that. He would lie on
12 somebody's bed, beside the boy who was in the bed.
13 Generally a couple of other youngsters would climb on to
14 the bed beside him, and he would read you a chapter out
15 of Dracula. So he'd come two or three nights in a week
16 until we finished the book. He never sat on my bed, so
17 I only have hearsay about what happened, which is why
18 I haven't mentioned that. But I used to really enjoy
19 that.
- 20 Q. What did you hear happened?
- 21 A. That he would fondle whoever was lying on the bed beside
22 him.
- 23 Q. Did you see on any occasion him making contact?
- 24 A. Oh, he would hold the child, you know, in his arm and
25 read the book, yes.

- 1 Q. You've mentioned the bullying on a number of occasions,
2 David, and I think what you tell us in paragraph 30
3 is that bullying really was endemic throughout the
4 school; is that right?
- 5 A. Yes, pretty much. Really, the only way to deal with it
6 was by standing up to the bully. There was a real
7 culture of not telling. That was one of the worst
8 crimes that you could commit among your peers, was
9 telling on somebody who'd done something or whatever.
10 You'd be called a clipe. And then the bullying got
11 worse. Cliping was probably the worst sin you could
12 commit.
- 13 Q. You give us an example of, I think, a Polish boy and an
14 incident that happened.
- 15 A. Yes, that was horrible.
- 16 Q. Can you tell us about that?
- 17 A. This poor young chap was -- there was obviously
18 something very wrong with him. We had no idea what.
19 That's really what made me angry and decide to do
20 something about the bullying that was happening to me.
21 They got hold of this poor chap and tied him to a tree
22 and one of them had a very realistic looking cowboy gun,
23 cap gun, and he had special caps that made a loud bang
24 and they were threatening to shoot him and the poor
25 young chap was absolutely at his wits' end, so we had to

1 put a stop to that.

2 Q. When you say "we", is that you and others, was it, or
3 was it the monks?

4 A. No, no, the monks weren't there. They let us out in the
5 evening, especially in summer, to run about and play.
6 I can't remember how long we got, maybe half an hour or
7 whatever. So a lot of the bullying would happen during
8 that period and there was no supervision of that. There
9 was woods all around and we ran away. We used to love
10 it. You'd get out and play games or you'd go up to one
11 of the playing fields with a ball and play, or go up to
12 the cricket nets and practice. There was lots of things
13 you could do. But that's mainly when the bullying
14 happened, that period of the day.

15 We got out as well for a while in the morning, just
16 for 15 or 20 minutes, and after lunch I think we got
17 a certain amount of time to run around. So that's the
18 kind of leisure routine, if you like, that we had. We
19 had a reasonable amount of time. There was a television
20 as well, and if it was raining, the television was
21 in the staff room, which was just a curtained-off room
22 beside the main study hall. It was their television,
23 but occasionally they'd bring it out and let you watch
24 something if it was bucketing with rain or if there was
25 a particular programme -- we always got to watch

1 Sergeant Bilko, I remember, which was great fun.

2 Yes, the bullying happened when we weren't
3 supervised, basically.

4 Q. You talk in your statement at paragraph 32 about a [REDACTED]
5 teacher, who you describe as someone who was also
6 involved in disciplining children; is that right?

7 A. Yes. He was in charge of the senior wing. He didn't do
8 the sort of prowling about that Father [REDACTED] MEW did,
9 but -- yes, Mr [REDACTED] MFB his name was.

10 Q. What would his punishments involve?

11 A. He used a cane, a much smaller cane, but it was pretty
12 nippy. I would say he was a bit more fair, he didn't
13 punish gratuitously. You felt you'd always done
14 something wrong. I stole his toothpaste one day. He
15 smoked a pipe and he used Eucryl toothpaste. He had his
16 own wee bathroom. We all had a long line of basins, but
17 his was round the corner. It had no door and I kept
18 going past saying, "I wonder what that toothpaste's
19 like", so one day I tried it out and of course he caught
20 me. So that's the kind of thing you got punished for.

21 Q. So there was a basis then for the punishment in that
22 you've committed some offence?

23 A. I'd say he was a lot fairer in that sense.

24 Q. What would the punishment involve?

25 A. Being taken into his room, bent over his bed, and caned

- 1 on the backside.
- 2 Q. Would you have your clothing on at that time?
- 3 A. Usually your pyjamas, yes. Occasionally if he caught
- 4 you during the day -- but this was mostly at night-time
- 5 or in the morning.
- 6 Q. You make this reference to him saying, "Tighter, boy".
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Can you explain that?
- 9 A. He would make you pull your pyjama trousers so they were
- 10 tight around your bottom. And he would say, "Tighter,
- 11 boy, tighter". That was a joke round the school, you
- 12 know, you'd say, "Tighter, boy, tighter".
- 13 Q. And do you know why he was asking you to do that?
- 14 A. One can only guess.
- 15 Q. What's your guess?
- 16 A. Well, I suspect that it gave him some sort of -- I'm not
- 17 going to guess. It would be wrong to suggest that he
- 18 got pleasure from it, but I suspect that he might have.
- 19 It's unusual, isn't it? Unusual behaviour. So yes,
- 20 there must have been a reason.
- 21 Q. You've already mentioned being humiliated in front of
- 22 other boys.
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 Q. You also indicate, I think, that, as you put it in
- 25 paragraph 34, "Public humiliation was a big thing". In

1 what way were boys humiliated publicly?

2 A. Well, I can think of a number of occasions. It was
3 normally in the refectory at a mealtime.

4 Father **MEX** sat at the head table and he had
5 a bell. He would ring the bell and speak -- it was kind
6 of like an assembly, if you like, after the meal or
7 before the meal. I can remember on one occasion,
8 a couple of boys had got quite badly burnt with
9 fireworks and there was a big -- they were humiliated
10 publicly in the refectory. I think one of them was
11 actually -- he didn't come back after that. He might
12 have been expelled, I don't know. We never knew any of
13 the things like that. There was a big public hoo-ha
14 about that.

15 If somebody had dropped a catch at cricket, that
16 might be referred to, in say a house match or in an away
17 ... playing against another school. If you didn't sort
18 of -- if you hadn't done too well -- it was mainly the
19 sports sort of side of things -- or you'd get praise for
20 ... "Oh, So-and-so got three wickets, fantastic".

21 Q. Was that by the monks?

22 A. This was Father **MEX**, yes.

23 Q. You also mentioned a matron as being part of this
24 scenario. What was her role?

25 A. Matron was supposed to be in charge of the junior wing.

1 Her room was next to the first form dormitory and there
2 was a wee sort of surgery that she had, where she
3 inspected your hair, or if a nurse or a doctor came to
4 take stitches out if somebody had cut themselves, that's
5 where that happened.

6 If you had a sore throat or something, you would go
7 and get a gargle or an aspirin. She didn't administer
8 medicines; mainly she made you gargle with whatever it
9 was.

10 Q. Was she involved in any form of humiliating practices?

11 A. Yes. I remember I hadn't been there very long, maybe
12 two or three weeks, and I was very sick during the
13 night. There was a toilet quite near her room but on
14 the other side of the passage. I didn't make it in time
15 and I was sick all over the floor. Well, she brought
16 a bucket and shouted at me and made me clean it up.
17 That was something that I felt really humiliated about.

18 But yes, my mother, when we were going to Carlekemp,
19 we were issued with a list of clothes that you had to --
20 or she was -- bring. Your name and number -- everybody
21 had a number -- it was stitched into every item of
22 clothing. One of the items of clothing was kilt trews.
23 My mother didn't know what kilt trews were and assumed
24 they were just dark underpants, but she couldn't get
25 dark underpants so she got myself and my young brother

1 what were girls' knickers. Matron used to hand our
2 clothes out to us -- every week, you got a change of
3 clothing for the week and you put your dirty laundry
4 in the laundry basket -- on certainly occasions you had
5 to wear a kilt and there would maybe be five or six
6 times a year when there was a prize-giving, for example,
7 and you had to wear your kilt, or the school photograph
8 or whatever.

9 She held up these -- of course, all the rest of the
10 kids are lined up behind you, and she held them up and
11 she'd say, "Look at what the Walls boys have got: girls'
12 panties", and of course you're going to get bullied for
13 that in that kind of -- looking back on it, it's quite
14 funny, but then it wasn't, it was ... But that was the
15 first year I was there. And my brother got it as well.

16 Q. We've already mentioned Father [REDACTED] MFC in
17 passing. If you look at paragraph 37 of your statement,
18 you mention there that [REDACTED] lived in Edinburgh in
19 [REDACTED] so [REDACTED] knew
20 each other; is that correct?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. He was a younger man?

23 A. Yes, he would have been probably -- he had only just
24 ordained when he came to Carlekemp, so I think
25 I provided a card of his ordination as part of the

1 evidence. So he would have been about 24, maybe 25,
2 about that age.

3 Q. And he came after you arrived at the school?

4 A. Oh yes. As I say, I can't remember whether I was in
5 third or fourth form, but I think it was probably at the
6 end of my third form. Maybe it was fourth form, I can't
7 remember. He was certainly there for the whole of my
8 last year.

9 Q. You tell us in your statement that you were one of his
10 favourites.

11 A. Oh yes.

12 Q. And did he used to give you presents?

13 A. He gave me quite a lot of presents, yes.

14 Q. Can you tell us about that?

15 A. I collected foreign coins at the time because I was
16 interested in the countries, and foreign stamps as well.
17 He showed an interest in that and then gave me what he
18 said was his collection of foreign coins. One of the
19 coins was actually a Roman coin, with, I think,
20 Constantine's head on it, so it was reasonably valuable.
21 He would give me a Christmas present every year, even
22 after I left the school. It was normally a book.

23 When I left the school, he gave me quite an
24 expensive missal and so on and so forth. Yes, he didn't
25 do that to anybody else as far as I know.

- 1 Q. You do tell us that there was a period at the school
2 where he did indulge in physical abuse.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Can you just help me with that?
- 5 A. Yes. He'd been there, I don't know, a while, and then
6 all of a sudden one day he was teaching us [REDACTED] and he
7 went round the class, testing people, and if they didn't
8 know the answer, they got a ruler across the top of the
9 head, the sharp side of a ruler, and strangely enough
10 I didn't know the answer, so I got one.
- 11 I tackled him about that afterwards. A good while
12 later after I'd left school. I was probably 16 or 17,
13 I don't know what age, I can't remember.
- 14 Q. So you met him again after you left school?
- 15 A. Yes, he used to come down and stay with his mother and
16 father during the school holidays. Myself, my brother
17 and another boy who was in the parish, we would go up
18 and serve at Mass in the morning. We'd see him probably
19 on a daily basis during the summer holidays -- maybe not
20 a daily basis, certainly two or three times a week.
21 Then he would play golf with us.
- 22 Q. You say you tackled him about why he had indulged in
23 this behaviour.
- 24 A. We certainly did, among other things. His answer was
25 that the other members of staff had put pressure on him

1 and had called him too soft and that he should be much
2 stricter and use some form of physical punishment, I'm
3 assuming they said to him. That only lasted -- I don't
4 remember that lasting very long, two or three weeks
5 maybe. He was pretty ... And I just got a sense that,
6 you know, something was wrong, he'd flipped. That was
7 my feeling: what on earth has gone wrong? I was
8 puzzled. Then he reverted to being his old friendly
9 self.

10 Q. Did you at the time when you were at the school raise
11 with him the fact that you were receiving these other
12 punishments from other monks?

13 A. Not when I was at the school, no. That was afterwards
14 and I didn't just raise the matter. What we said to
15 him ... I've already named the boy, I'll not name him
16 again. Myself, my brother and this other boy, who was
17 a year ahead of me, but we were really good friends, the
18 boy that had showed us round the school, I became really
19 friendly with him. Our families became very friendly as
20 well because they lived in Fairmilehead, just up the
21 road from Morningside.

22 We'd tackled him and said surely he knew what was
23 going on, and he more or less admitted that, yes, and we
24 said, why didn't you do something about it, and he sort
25 of said, "Yeah, well ..." I think his exact -- I can't

1 remember it exactly, but what sticks in my mind is that
2 he said, "Yes, that'll haunt me until the day I die".

3 So clearly, at that time, he was aware that things
4 were not right. I would have assumed that he would have
5 then taken that back and done something about it.

6 Q. Can I ask you: what age were you when you tackled him in
7 this way?

8 A. I'd left school and it was before -- I went to live in
9 Spain when I was 19, so it was -- I left school when
10 I was 15, the day I was 15. So it was between that
11 period. I was probably about 17, I would think.

12 Q. Where was Father [REDACTED] MFC [REDACTED] at that time? Was he
13 still at Carlekemp or had he moved?

14 A. He'd gone up to Fort Augustus I think, yes.

15 Q. I think you also raised this issue with him much later
16 on after he had moved to Canada?

17 A. Yes, that was probably in 1975 or 1976.

18 Q. Was that in a phone call?

19 A. No, no. Sorry, the phone call was much more recent.

20 Q. Was that in the course of the TV programme?

21 A. That was just before it was shown, yes. I raised the
22 matter -- he came to visit me when I lived -- I was
23 teaching in Edinburgh -- this is 1976 -- again, my
24 recollection is that [REDACTED] was there and we
25 challenged him again, more or less along the same

1 lines: why did you do this, why didn't you take the
2 matter up about what was going on at Carlekemp?

3 At that time I couldn't speak for Fort Augustus, but
4 he seemed very aware that things were amiss.

5 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, that's 3 o'clock. We normally have
6 a break at this point.

7 LADY SMITH: Would that be a good place to pause?

8 MR MacAULAY: Yes.

9 LADY SMITH: We'll take the afternoon break just now and sit
10 again when you're ready.

11 (3.00 pm)

12 (A short break)

13 (3.15 pm)

14 LADY SMITH: David, are you ready for us to continue?

15 A. Yes.

16 LADY SMITH: Mr MacAulay.

17 MR MacAULAY: In passing, you mentioned a TV programme. Is
18 it the case that you participated in a TV programme
19 called "Sins of Our Fathers" that was produced by the
20 BBC?

21 A. I did, yes.

22 Q. Was it before that took place that you sought to contact
23 MFC?

24 A. Yes. I had been approached indirectly, but not
25 directly, by the BBC, approached indirectly by another

1 former pupil who said that the BBC would be interested
2 to talk to me. So I spoke with my brother, we had
3 a long discussion -- my father at this point had just
4 died -- I'm trying to remember the dates -- but we had
5 a long discussion about whether or not we should go
6 ahead with that.

7 What we decided was that I would speak to the
8 reporters -- well, the producer and the reporter
9 involved and try to assess what their motives were in
10 going ahead with that because what we didn't want was
11 just a cheap sensationalising of a smutty story. I met
12 with the producer and the investigative reporter and was
13 very impressed with what they said to me. I spoke to
14 them again and we decided to go ahead. My brother came
15 up to stay with me and they spent the day at my house
16 filming part of the programme.

17 Q. But I think at about this time, and I needn't be too
18 concerned about the dates, you did make contact with
19 Father MFC.

20 A. Sorry, I'd forgotten the question. I beg your pardon.

21 At that time my feeling about Father MFC was that
22 he had been very friendly towards me at Carlekemp and
23 that I was aware that he might be asked some questions.
24 I had also spoken with another old boy of Fort Augustus,
25 who had kept in touch with him, and I decided that out

1 of friendship -- I hadn't spoken to him for many
2 years -- since 1976, actually -- and I thought, well,
3 I'll get in touch and tell him that the BBC might be on
4 his case.

5 What I said to him was, "I expect that you would be
6 honest", and I reminded him about the two conversations
7 we'd had when he had admitted to at least knowing what
8 was going on and not having done anything about it. He
9 said, "Oh, that was all a long time ago, I can't
10 remember any of that".

11 Q. Did you contact him by telephone?

12 A. Yes, by telephone.

13 Q. Where was he at this time?

14 A. In Canada.

15 Q. You tell us in your statement that he was now about 80.

16 A. Yes, I think he'd just celebrated his 80th birthday in
17 the parish that he was working in.

18 Q. In any event, when you told him about the potential
19 programme, you say his response was that it was all
20 a long time ago?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. At that time had you been told that there were
23 allegations of sexual abuse being made against him?

24 A. No, I learnt that afterwards.

25 Q. If we go back to your statement, you also make mention

1 at paragraph 38 of the [REDACTED] teacher, Father [REDACTED] MEZ

2 [REDACTED] MEZ .

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What you say is that he had a number of pets --

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. -- or pet boys.

7 A. That's right.

8 Q. How did that manifest itself?

9 A. Invariably, when there was groups of kids round --

10 he was a great [REDACTED] he used to come in and play

11 the [REDACTED] and so on. He was very touchy-feely with

12 certain pupils, always cuddling and holding them or

13 sitting them on his -- well, I don't remember them

14 actually sitting on his knee, but being very close to

15 him.

16 The thing is -- I mean, when that kind of thing

17 happened to me, it was a relief. You felt, oh gosh,

18 they actually like me, instead of hitting me round the

19 head all the time. I suppose other kids felt that as

20 well. So it was very welcome, really, when you were

21 hugged by a member of staff. But certainly, he only

22 hugged certain boys.

23 Q. Were they the younger boys?

24 A. There was one family in particular where there was three

25 boys, so they would be all up the school. One of them

1 was in the year above me, so, no, not necessarily.

2 Q. Can I go back to Father Duggan and your experiences of
3 him. I think you told us earlier that physically he was
4 quite violent towards you; is that right?

5 A. Yes. For the first couple of years, yes. Funnily
6 enough, the violence you could almost sort of take.
7 That sounds odd, but you just got kind of used to it and
8 accepted it as part of the routine. What I found most
9 difficult was the kind of -- the way he would treat you.
10 It was almost, you know, as if he enjoyed upsetting you
11 or setting you up for bullying, that kind of thing.
12 That went on for a good couple of years.

13 One of the big things that bothered me at the time
14 was he'd given me a punishment exercise of 20 pages of
15 geography and what that meant was that you had to copy
16 from the geography textbook, which was quite
17 a substantial tome, 20 pages in your best handwriting
18 and all the rest of it. You never got time to do that
19 kind of punishment. You maybe got 20 lines or something
20 normally, but 20 pages was just unheard of.

21 I never, ever managed to finish that. Eventually,
22 once I'd got into fourth form, he seemed to forget all
23 about it and he started being nice to me.

24 Q. I'll come to that. Before we get to that stage, so far
25 as the physical punishments would be concerned, what

1 sort of punishments would he inflict on you, for
2 example?

3 A. Well, it would be a ruler or blackboard duster thrown at
4 you. I don't actually remember him using his hand on me
5 or seeing that. He would generally have some sort of
6 weapon --

7 LADY SMITH: Were the blackboard dusters that he used the
8 once that had a wooden back?

9 A. Yes.

10 LADY SMITH: Not a soft cleaning duster?

11 A. No. If they hit you -- I don't recall ever being hit
12 with one, but it would have hurt.

13 MR MacAULAY: You mention in your statement at paragraph 41
14 he might use what you referred to as a girdle, which was
15 worn round the waist by these particular monks.

16 A. Yes -- well, let me just correct that. They didn't wear
17 that as a matter of course. This is one of the
18 vestments for saying Mass. The girdle is a stout rope.
19 If you have seen the Franciscans with their girdle, it's
20 probably of that ... Maybe, shall we say, 8 or
21 10 millimetres in diameter. It's worn round the waist
22 and it has quite a substantial tassel on the end of it.
23 I know how they're made because we had to put the
24 vestments out when we served Mass for the priest.

25 Inside the tassel is a lump of wood, probably the

1 size of an old curtain rail, maybe about that size
2 (indicating). He, certainly on one occasion, came into
3 our classroom -- it was a Latin lesson -- and he
4 mercilessly beat the boy on the desk next to mine round
5 the classroom with this.

6 Why he would use that particular instrument, I don't
7 know, and it's very strange that he would bring
8 something that he'd used to celebrate Mass in as
9 a punishment.

10 Q. Was this particular boy hurt?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did you know why this punishment was being inflicted?

13 A. He wouldn't have been able to decline mensa or something
14 like that.

15 Ironically, the girdle -- each of the vestments
16 symbolises something and the girdle is supposed to be
17 a symbol of chastity. When the priest puts on each of
18 the vestments, there's a specific prayer that they say
19 attached to that item of clothing. The prayer goes
20 something like, "I gird myself with chastity", as they
21 put on the girdle.

22 Q. You had gone on to say, David, that after you had
23 struggled with this geography punishment, it was
24 forgotten about and Father Duggan's attitude towards you
25 changed.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. In what way?
- 3 A. Well, he'd start cuddling me and being very nice to me,
4 basically. At that time also I had begun to ... The
5 Catholics in the school learned to serve Mass -- you
6 didn't start learning to serve Mass until third form.
7 Then once you'd learned to serve Mass, you served the
8 individual Masses, which weren't public, it was just you
9 and the priest in one of the side chapels. There were
10 two other chapels, one of them was in the cellars; we
11 called it the catacombs. That's where Aidan Duggan said
12 his Mass and I was assigned to serve his Mass.
- 13 Q. Was this at the time when he had started to change his
14 behaviour towards you?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Can you just tell me what happened? What happened
17 during the Mass?
- 18 A. The Mass went ahead. Normally it was quite short, in
19 maybe 15/20 minutes, they'd rattle through it -- it was
20 all in Latin in those days. You went to the sacristy,
21 you put on the soutane and the cassock, and you went
22 down -- the night before you had to put the vestments
23 on, so the priest could pick them up in order. There
24 was a special way of setting them out. That was one of
25 your jobs. You went down, you had to kneel down. The

1 priest then would bless himself and pick up the chalice,
2 go to the altar.

3 It was quite a small room, you know, probably no
4 wider than the distance between you and me. Then when
5 Mass was over, you'd genuflect with the priest, the
6 priest went back to the cupboard where the vestments
7 were, turned round, and you had to kneel down and get
8 a blessing. Invariably, you'd get a cuddle as well.

9 Q. Can you explain what sort of cuddle you got?

10 A. You were on your knee, so you were pulled in towards
11 what was at head height.

12 Q. Can you be specific?

13 A. The genital area. And hugged close like that
14 (indicating). Again, you went up and people laughed
15 about that, you know, "Oh, did you get a cuddle?"

16 Q. Was it well-known that that could happen?

17 A. Oh yes, yes.

18 Q. Was there any kissing?

19 A. On the top of your head, you'd occasionally get a kiss,
20 yes.

21 Q. What age were you when this started?

22 A. I was in third -- sorry, not third form. I was in
23 fourth form.

24 Q. So you were about, what, 12, 13?

25 A. I wasn't 13 yet, no. 12, yes.

- 1 Q. How often did this happen?
- 2 A. As often as you served his Mass, which wasn't every
3 week. There was a rota. Out of 60 kids, there was
4 only -- well, it was fourth form that served those
5 Masses and it was only 8 or 9, I think, in my class. So
6 we had a rota of serving Father [REDACTED] MFC 's,
7 Father Duggan's and Father [REDACTED] MEZ 's and Father [REDACTED] MEW 's
8 Mass, because Father [REDACTED] MEX said the main Mass.
9 There were four priests and eight of us so you were on
10 every two or three weeks.
- 11 Q. Did you consider at that time that this was sexually
12 orientated?
- 13 A. I hadn't a clue about it. I was pretty naive.
- 14 Q. You also tell us about an incident -- I think you would
15 play the recorder; is that right?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Did Father Duggan also play the recorder?
- 18 A. Yes. Actually, I was mentioning outside in the witness
19 room, there was a lot about Carlekemp that I thoroughly
20 enjoyed. I loved music. I used to have quite a good
21 singing voice and I was learning to play the fiddle, and
22 Father Aidan it was who said, "Let's all get recorders",
23 so they got the whole class recorders and we all learned
24 the recorder together. Well, I took to it like --
25 I play the bagpipes now, so I was really keen to learn

1 to play the recorder and I learned to play it pretty
2 well quite quickly.

3 Father Aidan used to come and play with us down
4 in the classroom when we were practising. Most of the
5 other kids sort of fell away and lost interest, but
6 there were a couple of us kept it going, and
7 Father Aidan asked me to go up to his room to practice
8 a duet with him. I still remember the duet, I can still
9 play it on the recorder.

10 It was a nice -- it must have been the summer term
11 because the nets were up and I can remember sitting --
12 he made me sit on his bed and put the music on a chair.
13 And I can remember looking out at the nets, thinking
14 that's where I would rather be, and I wanted to go up to
15 the nets, I didn't want to go up to his room.

16 Q. Was it unusual for a boy to go to one of the monks'
17 rooms?

18 A. Yes, that was just never heard of.

19 Q. What happened?

20 A. I don't know. I have a -- I remember very vividly
21 sitting on his bed.

22 Q. Where was he?

23 A. He was standing to my left and my vague memory is that
24 he sat down beside me and I remember nothing more other
25 than coming along the corridor, going away from his

1 room. I don't know what happened. That's one of
2 the ...

3 (Pause)

4 Sorry, there's something about what happened that
5 I just can't explain. I don't know what happened. So
6 it would be wrong for me to say that anything did
7 happen. But ... Sorry.

8 LADY SMITH: David, there's absolutely no need to apologise.
9 Do you want a break? Just say if it would help.

10 A. No, I'll be fine in a sec. Honestly, I will, I'll be
11 fine.

12 (Pause)

13 Right. I have no idea what happened. But you can
14 see that it has an effect on me. So that's all I can
15 say.

16 MR MacAULAY: Can I ask you this, David: what age were you
17 at this time?

18 A. I was in fourth form.

19 Q. So you were still 12?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You also give us some information about how
22 Father Aidan Duggan behaved at the dining table.

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Can you tell me about that?

25 A. Well, the procedure was that each year sat at a specific

1 table. Not each year, but each group in seniority.
2 There was six tables, so there were five years, so
3 you ... But you moved around the table and at the head
4 of each table there was a member of staff, except for
5 one table, which had a prefect at it because there was
6 only, I think, four or five members of staff. So there
7 was one table or two with prefects. And matron sat at
8 one -- or did she sit at the head table? I can't
9 remember. Anyway -- no, she was at a table, she sat
10 at the junior table.

11 So you moved around every week, you moved one place
12 round the table. The joke was that when you sat beside
13 Father Aidan, you had to watch because his hand went up
14 your trouser leg. Everybody treated it as a joke, but
15 it isn't a joke, you know. Remember, we're talking
16 about kids who had no idea about anything, we were all
17 pretty young.

18 Q. And you'd be wearing short trousers?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Did that happen to you?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. What did happen?

23 A. You got a hand up your trouser leg, moving towards your
24 groin area. He never reached my penis or anything. But
25 his hand definitely went up your trouser leg. He would

1 squeeze your knee and tickle your knee as well. You
2 kind of laughed it off, you know.

3 LADY SMITH: You say trousers. At this stage, were you
4 wearing long trousers?

5 A. Everybody wore shorts, we weren't allowed to wear long
6 trousers.

7 MR MacAULAY: I think you say this practice was well-known
8 among the boys; is that right?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. What about the other monks? Do you know if they were
11 aware of this practice?

12 A. I couldn't say.

13 Q. Looking back on Father Aidan Duggan's behaviour towards
14 you, what is your conclusion now as to what he was
15 doing?

16 A. Well, I spent a lifetime in education and I've studied
17 psychology and all the rest of it. I can't get my head
18 round some of the actions of some of the staff at
19 Carlekemp. But it would be naive to suggest that
20 he wasn't grooming me specifically by making my life
21 very miserable for a while and then doing good cop/bad
22 cop, or bad cop/good cop. I distinctly remember the
23 feeling of total relief when he started hugging me and
24 feeling, oh -- actually feeling affection for the man,
25 you know, which sounds difficult to understand, but yes,

1 just a real feeling of gratitude that that misery was
2 over.

3 And by that time, I'd managed to deal with the
4 bullies and was beginning to enjoy life in the school.
5 I've often said that school could have been an idyllic
6 place for youngsters to live and learn, and in a lot of
7 ways it was, we had great fun, you established really
8 good friendships that have lasted down through the
9 years. You did, you had great fun.

10 Q. In the next part of your statement, David, you go on to
11 talk about the reporting of abuse and we've already
12 looked at your discussions with [REDACTED] MFC and
13 what his response was.

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15 Q. I think you've also had contact with other boys who went
16 to Carlekemp, and indeed Fort Augustus, and some of
17 those have told you that they were abused.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Was it in particular Father Duggan who was being
20 pinpointed?

21 A. Father Duggan, Father [REDACTED] MFC -- funnily enough, quite
22 a few of them have said that Father [REDACTED] MEW, when he was
23 sent back to Fort Augustus, seemed to be one of the
24 approachable sort of good guys. So maybe he was awkward
25 with young children and preferred older boys. I don't

1 mean that in any sinister way. But people seemed to
2 like him at Fort Augustus, the ones I've spoken to. But
3 yes, Father [REDACTED] MFC and Father Duggan, of the ones
4 that I know that have been mentioned to me, but others
5 have been mentioned as well, like Father [REDACTED] MEV
6 [REDACTED] MEV

7 Q. You also tell us that you've had some contact with
8 Father Richard Yeo, who was the abbot.

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. I'll look at that in a moment. You've already touched
11 on this, and this is at paragraph 57, because what you
12 tell us is:

13 "After three years at Carlekemp, I was suddenly
14 removed."

15 You and your brother were removed from Carlekemp by
16 your father?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. [REDACTED]

19 [REDACTED]
20 A. [REDACTED]

21 Q. Have you now been told what the reasons for that were?

22 A. No, never. My father wouldn't discuss it, [REDACTED]
23 [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED]
25 [REDACTED]

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25



Q. At paragraphs 58 onwards, you provide us with some information about your life after Carlekemp. We can pick that up for ourselves.

After you left school, and you left school at 15, you spent some time working on a farm. But then I think you wanted to train as a priest and indeed you took steps to do that.

A. Yes, I did.

Q. What you tell us is that after you'd spent some time in Spain -- this is paragraph 62 -- you spent some time at the senior seminary at Drygrange.

A. Yes, that's correct.

Q. That's a seminary that would train boys of 18 and over for the priesthood?

A. That's correct.

Q. You decided that that was not to be the life for you, and I think you went back to university and you took a degree?

A. Yes. I never actually decided that it wasn't the life for me; I decided that Drygrange wasn't the place for me. I didn't feel happy or comfortable there. There was something going on that involved a clique of the more senior students there, including Keith O'Brien. I just felt unhealthy and I was kind of reliving the

1 panics that Carlekemp had sort of inspired in me.

2 Actually, at that point, I went to see my doctor
3 because I was having trouble breathing, and he said to
4 me that that was just anxiety, what's bothering you, and
5 that made me start thinking it was not the place for me.

6 Q. How long did you spend at Drygrange?

7 A. I spent not quite a year there. I left just before
8 Easter, having spent two terms, shall we say, there.

9 Q. I'd moved on to look at your university position. You
10 took a degree in Hispanic studies, I think.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. You mentioned earlier you're a linguist and you speak
13 several languages.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. You give us information about your personal life in
16 paragraph 63. In paragraph 64 you tell us that you
17 trained as a teacher and you taught at various schools,
18 including a senior secondary in Edinburgh.

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. I think at the moment -- this might be completed --
21 you're doing a part-time PhD at Edinburgh; is that
22 correct?

23 A. That's correct.

24 Q. Is that still on the go?

25 A. Yes. I'm supposed to have had the draft of my thesis

1 finished by the end of June, but I'm a little bit behind
2 with that.

3 LADY SMITH: I don't think you'll be the first PhD student
4 that confesses to that!

5 A. Thank you, my Lady. That's a great comfort.

6 LADY SMITH: Extra time can add quality.

7 A. Yes, I'm hoping!

8 MR MacAULAY: One of the things you do touch upon in your
9 statement in paragraph 65 is what you consider the
10 impact of what your life had been like at Carlekemp
11 might have had on your life generally. Can you
12 summarise what your feelings on that are?

13 A. Initially, I escaped to farms and just standing in the
14 middle of a field on your own, scything thistles,
15 I found that really therapeutic. I very much lived in
16 isolation until I went to Spain, which was an
17 eye-opener. I would have gone anywhere.

18 The archbishop had told me to take a year out before
19 he would let me go to Drygrange and that I should do
20 something useful during that period of time. So I wrote
21 to various countries and strangely got a job -- I had no
22 qualification -- teaching English in Córdoba in Spain.

23 But I was also very keen to playing the guitar.
24 I played the guitar pretty well and wanted to learn more
25 about that, Spanish guitar and flamenco and that kind of

1 thing -- I've forgotten what question you asked me,
2 sorry.

3 Q. I was asking you about impact --

4 A. Yes, that's right.

5 So that made -- I suppose I got some of my own life
6 back at that point because I got involved with people
7 and realised that I could do a lot more than I thought
8 I could than just scything thistles.

9 I suppose the impact in the longer term was that
10 I grew a bit of backbone and learned to stand up to
11 authority and actually ... For a long time I quite
12 enjoyed causing trouble -- you know, not causing
13 trouble, but standing up for what I saw was wrong.

14 So that became quite a feature in my life throughout
15 my professional career. I would say I was a bit of
16 a campaigner in that regard. I owe that to the
17 experience more than anything, and a determination to do
18 things that were sort of worthwhile.

19 Q. One might say these are positive reactions.

20 A. Absolutely. One example is the first school I taught
21 in, during the interview, I said that I would hope that
22 the school would abolish the belt. Funnily enough, the
23 teacher, the headteacher, had taught me at Holy Cross,
24 he was a very inspiring gentleman, and he agreed that he
25 would work with his staff to abolish the belt. Some of

1 them were still using the belt quite a lot. I was there
2 for two years and by the end of the two years, the belt
3 had been abolished. That was the kind of thing that
4 I wanted -- I wanted to achieve something and make
5 a difference.

6 Q. Perhaps looking on the negative side, what you tell us
7 in your statement is that you did find it difficult to
8 socialise normally --

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. -- and also to show particular fondness and affection to
11 your children. That's the negative side?

12 A. Yes, there were quite a lot of negatives. Once
13 I started teaching secondary, in my third year as
14 a qualified teacher, I went to teach at a Catholic
15 school in Edinburgh and I was quite quickly promoted to
16 principal teacher of guidance, which involved working
17 with all sorts of problems. I found that a lot of --
18 not a lot, sorry, but quite a few youngsters would come
19 to me and disclose abuse of one sort or another.

20 I seemed to attract that kind -- I don't know why,
21 maybe it was my experience, but I found that when we
22 started getting involved with social work and the
23 reporter and so on, I occasionally would find that quite
24 suffocating and would have panic attacks when I would
25 hear in a hearing, for example, what had actually

1 happened. I had not yet come to real terms with
2 anything, and I probably still haven't, but you learn to
3 live -- you know, there's a cupboard you put it in and
4 you get on with it. It's always something on your
5 shoulder though.

6 Q. There's a section of your statement I would like to look
7 at, David, and that's at paragraphs 75 and 76 onwards.
8 It's headed "Other useful information".

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. It's paragraph 75 in particular. You talk about someone
11 who had been with you at Carlekemp and who also trained
12 with you at Drygrange as a priest; is that right?

13 A. That's correct, yes.

14 Q. This is a person who did speak to you about what abuse
15 he had suffered at Carlekemp?

16 A. Correct.

17 Q. And had he been abused at Carlekemp?

18 A. Yes. To the best -- yes, I believe what he said, yes.

19 Q. Was that sexual abuse?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Did that involve Father Duggan?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. You also tell us at paragraph 77 that you have been in
24 touch with John Ellis, who in fact sued the
25 Catholic Church because of abuse he said he suffered

1 at the hands of Father Duggan?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I think, to cut a long story short, Father Aidan Duggan
4 went back to Australia at a point in time.

5 A. Correct. It's important to note that he went back
6 before the closure of the monastery. So it's unusual
7 for a monk to move elsewhere, especially out of the
8 community.

9 Q. I think you mention that in your supplementary
10 statement.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. But you can rest assured that the inquiry will look
13 at the detail of all of that.

14 There are parts of your main statement that
15 we haven't looked at because I think you do cover that
16 in your supplementary statement, and it's to that I want
17 to turn. That's the second statement in your red
18 folder. The reference for the transcript is
19 WIT.001.002.4595.

20 If we turn to the last page, 4600, can you confirm
21 you've signed that?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And do you tell us that you signed the statement?

24 A. I signed it, yes.

25 Q. And that you have no objection to the statement being

1 published as part of the evidence to the inquiry?

2 A. None at all.

3 Q. Indeed you go on to confirm that the facts stated in the
4 witness statement are true.

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Can I then go back to the beginning of the statement,
7 the first page of the statement; that's at 4595.

8 I think it is dated 11 March 2019; is that correct?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. This is a document that you have put together
11 yourself --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- in contrast to the other statement, which went
14 through the inquiry process?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. What was your purpose in putting this document together?

17 A. Well, out of curiosity, I read some of the statements
18 that had been published from the English commission of
19 inquiry and then Dom Richard Yeo's statement to both
20 inquiries. I was struck that there were inaccuracies,
21 or at least I considered them inaccuracies, in his
22 statement.

23 So I was moved to look into the issues a little
24 further and, in particular, to look at the dates that he
25 had given and look into reasons why these dates might

1 not be correct.

2 Q. Why were you focusing on dates?

3 A. Because he informed the inquiry -- this is from
4 memory -- that he had had no knowledge of any
5 accusations prior to 2013. That's obviously incorrect
6 because my brother and I went to see him in 2010. Those
7 dates are from memory, but I think that's right.

8 Q. We'll look at the documents in a moment. The date 2013,
9 are you looking to this inquiry's evidence or to the
10 English inquiry's evidence?

11 A. I think I say in this which one it is, but I could be
12 wrong.

13 Q. What you say at 1 is that:

14 "He had received no communications about allegations
15 until 2013, which is not correct."

16 A. Yes. That's the Scottish commission of inquiry.

17 Q. That's us.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. If that's how his evidence is to be taken, your point
20 is that that cannot be correct, because you have
21 documents to show that you had made contact with him in
22 2010?

23 A. Yes. Not only that, but I have submitted documents that
24 show that he was approached by the lawyer for
25 Archbishop Pell, who was an archbishop then -- he was

1 made a cardinal subsequently, in Australia -- in the
2 John Ellis case. I think as early as 2004 he would have
3 been made aware of allegations against Aidan Duggan.

4 As part of that inquiry, my brother and I gave
5 evidence or submitted evidence via another old boy,
6 because we wanted to remain anonymous at that point. So
7 that was all there.

8 There was also dialogue among old boys on the Corbie
9 website, which is the old boys' website, pre-dating
10 that, about abuse, and again I've given copies of that
11 to the inquiry.

12 Q. Can we look at this document, first of all. This is
13 WIT.003.002.1573.

14 We're looking at a letter -- as is often the case
15 with the documents that we have, bits that can be
16 important are blacked out.

17 A. Sure, yes.

18 LADY SMITH: You understand, David, why we have to do that.

19 A. Yes.

20 MR MacAULAY: This is headed "English Benedictine
21 Congregation", and the address is given. If we look at
22 the date, it's 5 October 2004, and it's addressed to the
23 Chancery Office, Archdiocese of Sydney. Was it you who
24 made this document available to the inquiry?

25 A. Yes, unless others have also done so.

1 Q. You'll remember the heading then relates to the Reverend
2 Aidan Duggan. That's been blacked out.

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. I can read it:

5 "I received a letter from Messrs Corrs, Chambers,
6 Westgarth, lawyers, [and we are given the address] in
7 which they inform me that they act for the Archbishop of
8 Sydney and the trustees of the archdiocese in civil
9 legal proceedings involving allegations against
10 Father Aidan Duggan who was formerly a monk of
11 Fort Augustus Abbey of the English Benedictine
12 Congregation."

13 And the letter goes on to say:

14 "The lawyers ask me to confirm that there are no
15 reported allegations or complaints of a sexual or
16 violent nature against Father Aidan Duggan."

17 And so on.

18 I think the letter says that Father Duggan at that
19 time was now in the advanced stages of Alzheimer's
20 disease.

21 if we go on to the second page of the letter at
22 1574, we're on the second page. If we move down
23 a little bit to the bottom of the page, the signature is
24 blacked out, but it has been signed by Dom Yeo, and
25 you'll remember that.

1 Without looking with you at the detail of the
2 letter, it would appear that Dom Yeo has made certain
3 investigations and is able to confirm to the Sydney
4 diocese that there were no allegations of a sexual
5 nature made against Father Duggan. Is that your
6 understanding of this correspondence?

7 A. It's my understanding that that's what Dom Richard Yeo
8 says, yes.

9 Q. Was this the letter you had in mind earlier when you
10 mentioned correspondence --

11 A. That he would be aware of allegations, yes, because
12 obviously John Ellis was making allegations. There's
13 more to the wording of that perhaps than meets the eye.

14 Q. What do you mean by that, David?

15 A. I mean that when a priest is accused of solicitation or
16 of a sexual crime or whatever, that is then under canon
17 law referred to a process, which is overseen by the
18 local bishop. That process is entirely secret and would
19 never be revealed to anybody, even another priest or
20 whatever. So had there been any allegations against
21 Aidan Duggan or anyone else, that would have been dealt
22 with by an entirely secret process.

23 Revealing anything that happens or the whole process
24 is governed by what is called the pontifical secrecy.
25 I'm sure that you'll investigate the canon law

1 implications of that.

2 Q. Yes, we've already had some evidence on canon law and it
3 will be something that we will look at.

4 Can I then look at some of your own correspondence
5 with Dom Yeo and put this document on the screen for
6 you: it's BEN.001.003.6302.

7 Again, there are sections of this that have been
8 blacked out, but if we go to the very top do we read
9 that this is a note of a meeting between yourself and
10 your brother and Abbot Richard Yeo?

11 A. Yes, I can see that. I don't recall this document
12 though.

13 Q. We see the date is 16 September and it's 2010.

14 A. Right.

15 Q. Do you remember having a meeting then with Dom Yeo?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. I think you mentioned earlier in 2010 you had
18 correspondence with him about your time at Carlekemp.

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Was this the beginning of that correspondence, around
21 September 2010?

22 A. Yes. I don't recall this.

23 Q. You may not have seen this document because we've
24 recovered this from the Benedictines.

25 A. Oh, I see.

1 Q. It bears to be a note of a meeting that is said to have
2 taken place with yourself, Dom Yeo and your brother on
3 16 September 2010.

4 A. Mm-hm.

5 Q. Do you recall having such a meeting?

6 A. Absolutely, yes.

7 Q. What this does is narrate Dom Yeo's understanding of
8 what was just discussed at the meeting.

9 A. I see.

10 Q. For example, if we look at the first paragraph, can we
11 read:

12 "They are brothers who attended
13 Carlekemp Priory School, which was operated by the monks
14 of Fort Augustus Abbey, between 1955 and 1958."

15 Do you see that?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. I think that's correct.

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. There's then --

20 A. My mother was suffering from agoraphobia --

21 Q. Indeed.

22 A. -- but that isn't the main reason we were sent to that
23 school.

24 Q. We needn't dwell on that.

25 A. Okay.

1 Q. Then there's a paragraph dealing with the monks that
2 were mentioned in the course of the discussion. Then if
3 you turn on to page 6303, the next page.

4 (Pause)

5 I can perhaps read out what I was going to refer to.
6 When we come to the second page of the document, what's
7 been noted is this:

8 "The brothers [that's yourself and your brother] say
9 that the school was a brutal place. Corporal punishment
10 was frequent and harsh."

11 Was that part of your discussions with Dom Yeo?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. He goes on to note:

14 "The general impression was of a school
15 incompetently run and the harshness was the only way
16 that the teachers knew how to run it."

17 Again, was that part of the discussion?

18 A. Yes, I think so, pretty much.

19 Q. There's then a paragraph that reads in this way -- this
20 is referring to your brother:

21 "Christopher said that Father Aidan had first
22 appeared as strict and harsh as the others and then
23 suddenly he changed and became friendly. This was
24 a great relief to the boy. It was followed by
25 Father Aidan befriending him and then abusing him

1 sexually."

2 Did your brother complain to Dom Yeo that he had
3 been abused sexually?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. "He spoke of him fondling him on many occasions and on
6 one occasion something worse."

7 Was that discussed at the meeting?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Towards the bottom of the page:

10 "They said that other boys had been abused by
11 Father Aidan."

12 And it goes on to say that you were unwilling to say
13 anything so long as your father was alive.

14 A. Correct.

15 Q. So this is a note by Dom Yeo after your meeting
16 in September 2010 where your point is that the
17 allegations you were making were ventilated to him at
18 that time?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. Was that the first time that you and your brother had
21 made these complaints to him?

22 A. My brother had been -- had communicated with him on the
23 phone prior to that meeting. So he would have said
24 something on the phone. But from the point of view of
25 both of us making a more formal statement to him, yes,

1 that would be the first time.

2 Q. Thereafter, was there correspondence between yourself
3 and Dom Yeo?

4 A. Yes. Over the next 18 months or two years, pretty much.
5 I think 2013 was the last communication from
6 Richard Yeo, or 2014 -- no, 2013, I think it was.

7 Q. If I can put this letter to you. This is at
8 WIT.003.002.0182. This is a letter that's dated
9 18 January 2012 from the English Benedictine
10 Congregation.

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And it's from Dom Yeo.

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And you recognise this letter?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Is this a letter that essentially is drawing a line
17 under your dealings with him?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. For example, does he put forward the point that
20 Carlekemp was a dependant house of Fort Augustus Abbey
21 and that they were a separate Benedictine community?

22 A. He makes that point, yes.

23 Q. He goes on to say towards the bottom that:

24 "Neither Carlekemp nor Fort Augustus are any longer
25 in existence and that therefore no abuse could happen

1 there now."

2 He goes on to say towards the bottom:

3 "On the other hand, the community which ran the
4 schools is also no longer in existence and that means it
5 cannot be held to account for any wrongdoing which may
6 have taken place at its schools."

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. And I think that's the message you received at that
9 time?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. What was your attitude to that?

12 A. Well, we didn't accept that, but there was no point in
13 litigating and persisting. He'd obviously made his mind
14 up on where responsibility lay with a defunct monastery.

15 His statement in that letter had only just become
16 true because in fact the charitable trust, I discovered
17 only quite recently when I was composing this, held the
18 assets for Fort Augustus was not closed -- sorry, I've
19 forgotten the date -- until just before that letter was
20 written. But he had said to us in 2010 that there was
21 nobody who could be held responsible, so he'd made that
22 statement already to us in 2010. But in actual fact,
23 the trust would have been responsible.

24 Q. I think the point you make in your supplementary
25 statement is that in 2010 the trust was in existence.

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. And your argument would be that it could have been held
3 accountable?
- 4 A. It could have been, yes.
- 5 Q. But by the time this letter is sent to you, it's no
6 longer in existence?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. You also sent a detailed letter to Archbishop Cushley;
9 is that correct?
- 10 A. Correct.
- 11 Q. Could we look quickly at that? WIT.003.001.4858.
12 If we move down the page, is this -- I think it's by way
13 of email now, an email that you sent to the archbishop
14 on 14 January 2014.
- 15 A. Mm-hm.
- 16 Q. Is that right?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. It's a lengthy document where you set out information
19 in relation to the abuse that had become apparent had
20 been carried out by people associated with the
21 Catholic Church.
- 22 A. Mm-hm.
- 23 Q. Was that the essence of what the message was?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. If we turn to the second last page, 4860, if we move

1 towards the bottom of the page, the paragraph beginning:

2 "At the moment ..."

3 I think this does sum up the message you're
4 conveying:

5 "At the moment, all people can see is a church
6 that is squirming in discomfort under the weight and
7 validity of the accusations but doing little to remedy
8 the problem, other than make weak, evasive excuses and
9 empty apologies."

10 Was that the message you were seeking to convey to
11 the archbishop?

12 A. Absolutely, and I would say the same to him again;
13 I feel that quite strongly.

14 Q. If we go back to page 4858 --

15 A. I think if I may just say, the last sentence there is
16 very important as well, that:

17 "I feel desperately sorry. I live beside a
18 monastery full of the most committed and holy men that
19 I've ever met."

20 I feel dreadfully sorry that when you talk to people
21 round about, that they feel that the whole church is
22 like this and it isn't. People get tarred with the same
23 brush and I think that's terribly sad.

24 Q. And that's what you say in that last sentence --

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. -- that you've drawn attention to. What you're saying
2 is there are many good priests, monks and nuns.

3 A. Absolutely.

4 Q. If we look then at the archbishop's response, that's on
5 page 4858. I think it's a fairly short response towards
6 the top of the page, dated 18 January. Does it say very
7 much?

8 A. Mm ... No, it doesn't say very much, does it?

9 Q. I think he does make himself available for meetings and
10 so on.

11 A. Yes; he never did.

12 Q. But he at least suggested he would be available?

13 A. Well, yes. He had the opportunity to meet with me just
14 the other day, but never appeared. I won't go into
15 that. No, he has not subsequently shown a great deal of
16 interest, and I've been to see other bishops in the
17 interim as well, and they all say more or less the same
18 thing.

19 Q. What is the message you're getting from the bishops?

20 A. That they're doing something about it, that they have
21 safeguarding in place, that ... you know, that's it.

22 MR MacAULAY: My Lady, if the stenographers could bear with
23 me perhaps for another 10 minutes.

24 LADY SMITH: Can I check: is that all right?

25 (Pause)

1 MR MacAULAY: Can I go back to your supplementary statement
2 again. We'll get it back on the screen.

3 LADY SMITH: I think I've got the date you were struggling
4 to remember when you were being asked about the letter
5 to you of January 2012 from Dom Yeo. Is it the date
6 that is stated as being -- the ceased date on the
7 screenshot from the OSCR website that you've provided,
8 the ceased date for the trust is 2 June 2012. That
9 would have been six months after --

10 A. Yes, sorry.

11 LADY SMITH: Is that the date you were thinking of?

12 A. Yes, that's correct. Memory isn't one of my strong
13 points.

14 LADY SMITH: I think all of us would struggle to hold all
15 these dates clear in our minds. It is not safe just to
16 rely on memory.

17 A. No. Thank you for pointing that out, my Lady.

18 MR MacAULAY: If we go back then to the supplementary
19 statement, which we have on the screen, and we've
20 covered some of this material by looking at the
21 correspondence.

22 For example, if we turn to page 4596, on this
23 particular page you discuss the positions of the [REDACTED]
24 [REDACTED], Aidan Duggan and [REDACTED] MEY, and also
25 Father [REDACTED] MEV, and they had all been novices in the

1 same monastery in Australia prior to coming to Scotland.

2 A. That's correct.

3 Q. That was something you learned?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. The point you make in the next paragraph is that:

6 "Under normal circumstances it would be most unusual
7 for a monk to be moved from their mother monastery to
8 a different location for any more innocent reason,
9 especially a monastery with falling numbers of monks, as
10 was the case with Fort Augustus."

11 What's the point you are making there? Was that in
12 connection with the movement back to Australia of
13 Father Aidan Duggan?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. What is the point there?

16 A. The point is that monastic -- a monk, when they take
17 their final profession, takes a vow of obedience to the
18 abbot of the monastery to commit themselves to that
19 monastery for the rest of their lives. They would only
20 ever be moved -- this is absolutely the case -- they
21 would only ever be moved were they, for example, to be
22 made abbot of another monastery or if the numbers in the
23 monastery justified setting up a priory, then some of
24 them would move to that priory to set up a new
25 establishment, which may or may not become a monastery

1 in its own right. Or in the case of one of the monks at
2 Nunraw, where I live, who was moved to a failing
3 monastery to try to help it by giving them practical
4 help, spiritual guidance, that sort of thing.

5 So there would be specific reasons for a monk to be
6 moved from their mother house. And in the case of
7 someone moved to another house to help that house, their
8 own house would always be their monastery, their abbot
9 would always be their abbot. That's the way things are.

10 On the other hand, if a monk is moved and no reason
11 is given, then I would suggest that there is another
12 reason that is not disclosed, and also that that reason
13 could not be disclosed because of the pontifical
14 secrecy. So there may have been a process of --
15 a juridical process under canon law that would make it
16 impossible, really, for anyone to disclose why that monk
17 had been moved, and Dom Richard would not know of any
18 allegations because that process is handled by the local
19 bishop.

20 Q. You've mentioned the canon law before and you do give us
21 an insight into aspects of canon law in this
22 supplementary statement. Perhaps if I take you to
23 page 4599. You're focusing there on what you've already
24 mentioned, I think the crimen sollicitationis, where
25 the -- which is the source for the secrecy you talk

- 1 about. Is that correct?
- 2 A. The source is the 1917 revision of canon law.
- 3 Q. But that is the -- how shall I put this -- that is the
- 4 instruction --
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. -- that, at least in principle, was given to the local
- 7 bishops --
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. -- if there was to be, for example, allegations made of
- 10 child abuse?
- 11 A. Yes. That document, incidentally, was a confidential
- 12 document that was leaked by, obviously,
- 13 a public-spirited bishop somewhere and was put on the
- 14 Internet. It was originally issued in 1922, following
- 15 the revision, and reissued in 1962. Am I remembering
- 16 the dates rightly? I think so. And a revision of it,
- 17 I've also provided you with a copy of that, was issued
- 18 in 2002, I think.
- 19 Q. Yes. The revision is quite a significant one because
- 20 that really changed the scene quite dramatically and in
- 21 particular that, as we now know, dioceses have to have
- 22 safeguarding procedures and the first port of call with
- 23 any allegation should be the police.
- 24 A. Correct.
- 25 Q. One point you are seeking to make here, I think, David,

1 relates to the notion of autonomy.

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Can you just help me with what your thinking is on that
4 front?

5 A. Language can be used to confuse as much as to clarify,
6 and sometimes quite deliberately. The word "autonomy",
7 when it refers to a religious establishment, a monastery
8 for example, means that -- well, in order to become an
9 abbey with an abbot, a monastery has to be both
10 spiritually and financially viable, without further
11 assistance from the mother house. That is what is meant
12 by autonomy.

13 It is still under the jurisdiction of the Abbot
14 General and the mother house. There is a seniority of
15 monastery, shall we say. That hierarchical structure is
16 absolutely essentially intrinsic for the Catholic Church
17 and the way it operates. The whole church believes that
18 it is one and catholic and apostolic, in other words the
19 chain of command goes all the way back to the
20 beginnings.

21 That chain is maintained through the pontifical
22 structure, the hierarchical structure of bishops,
23 primarily. They are the key element in the
24 Catholic Church. They ordain priests to act on their
25 behalf. The bishop essentially is the priest that

1 ordains ministers who act on his behalf.

2 Monasteries are no different. The priests in
3 monasteries are ordained by the bishop, not by the
4 abbot. The bishop has jurisdiction over a monastery.
5 A bishop can close a monastery in his diocese if he has
6 a reason to do so, or he can give instructions to the
7 abbot to do whatever he thinks the abbot ought to do.
8 If a monk, for example, wants to leave a monastery and
9 be laicized, that process goes through the bishop.

10 Q. So if I can read that sentence where you make reference
11 to autonomy, because I think this might be your summary
12 of your understanding. And that is just before
13 number 5:

14 "The word 'autonomy', therefore, is used out of
15 context to be deliberately misleading, in my view, and
16 does not relate to corporate legal responsibility within
17 the church."

18 A. Yes, I believe that.

19 Q. You say, as you have said, "The church is one".

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. And ultimately then responsibility ultimately lies with
22 the Holy See?

23 A. Absolutely, absolutely. I think if the question is put
24 to anyone in the church, "Is the church one?" the answer
25 has to be yes. It can't be shilly-shallying about

1 whether or not a particular group is autonomous. The
2 word "autonomous" is meaningless in that context; it
3 relates to the viability of a monastery.

4 MR MacAULAY: Well, David, thank you for these interesting
5 thoughts. As I indicated, these aspects of canon law
6 clearly are aspects of canon law that the inquiry will
7 have to grapple with, but thank you for your input on
8 that.

9 A. I'm glad to be able to do that.

10 MR MacAULAY: And indeed thank you for coming today to give
11 your evidence.

12 My Lady, I haven't received any questions to put to
13 David.

14 LADY SMITH: Are there any outstanding applications for
15 questions of David? No.

16 David, that does complete all the questions we have
17 for you. It simply remains for me to thank you so much
18 for engaging with us in providing your written
19 statement, in providing your own additional piece of
20 work, which casts light on other matters not covered in
21 your statement. It's very helpful.

22 Thank you, of course, for coming today to talk to us
23 about your experiences. I'm very grateful to you for
24 doing that. I can see it's --

25 A. I'm grateful to the commission, my Lady.

1 LADY SMITH: I can see it's not an easy thing to do, but
2 it's of great value to me in the work I have to do here,
3 so thank you for that. I can now let you go.

4 A. Thank you.

5 (The witness withdrew)

6 LADY SMITH: That's us until tomorrow morning at 10 o'clock,
7 is it?

8 MR MacAULAY: With my apologies to the stenographers, that's
9 it for today. Tomorrow we have three witnesses to give
10 oral evidence.

11 LADY SMITH: Thank you. I'll adjourn now until tomorrow
12 morning.

13 (4.30 pm)

14 (The inquiry adjourned until 10.00 am on
15 Friday, 19 July 2019)

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I N D E X

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Opening submissions by MR MacAULAY1

Opening submissions by MR COLLINS4

Opening submissions by MR RICHARDSON6

Opening submissions by MS van der8

WESTHUIZEN

Opening submissions by MR HEANEY10

Opening submissions by MR ANDERSON11

Opening submissions by MR REID14

"HARRY" (sworn)18

Questions from Ms MacLEOD18

DAVID WALLS (sworn)104

Questions from MR MacAULAY105

- 1
- 2
- 3
- 4